| TRIAL- Dece | ember 1, 20 | 16 (Vol. XVII) | Florida v. Georgia |
|---|----------------|--|---|
| | | | 4287 |
| | | | <u>EXHIBITS</u> (Continued) |
| | | | (|
| 4285 | | <u>Number</u> | <u>Page Referenced</u> |
| SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES | | G X - 4 5 9 | 4370 |
| No. 142, Original | | GX-486 | 4361 |
| | | G X - 491 | 4304 |
| STATE OF FLORIDA,) | | G X - 496 | 4295 |
| Plaintiff,) | | G X - 5 0 0 G X - 5 0 1 | 4295 4296 |
| V.) <u>VOLUME XVII</u> | | GX-568 | 4296, 4305, 4325 |
| STATE OF GEORGIA) | | G X - 6 4 9 | 4306 |
| Defendants.) | | G X - 7 4 1 | 4306 |
| TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS | | G X - 7 5 2 G X - 7 7 0 | 4308 4301 |
| The above-entitled matter came on for HEARING | | GX 770 | 4300 |
| before SPECIAL MASTER RALPH I. LANCASTER, held in the | | G X - 779 | 4301 |
| U. S. Bankruptcy Court, at 537 Congress Street, | | G X - 782 | 4301 |
| Portland, Maine, on December 1, 2016, commencing at | | G X - 7 8 9 G X - 7 9 9 | 4298, 4329 4308 |
| 8:40 a.m., before Claudette G. Mason, RMR, CRR, a | | GX-1018 | 4303 |
| Notary Public in and for the State of Maine. | | G X - 1 1 4 8 | 4300 |
| APPEARANCES: | | G X - 1338 | 4303 |
| For the State of Florida: PHILIP J. PERRY, ESQ. JAMIE L. WINE, ESQ. | | GX-1339 | 4304, 4362 |
| ABID R. QURESHI, ESQ. NATALIE HARDWICK RAO, ESQ. | | G X - 1340 | 4308 |
| | | GX-1270-127 | 76 4343 |
| For the State of Georgia: CRAIG S. PRIMIS, ESQ. EMILY K. MERKI, ESQ. | | G X - 1 2 8 0 - 1 2 8 | 34 4343 |
| JOSH MAHONEY, ESQ. BARACK S. ECHOLS, ESQ. | | CV 1245 121 | 7 4247 |
| CHRISTIAN REIGSTAD, ESQ. | | GX-1345-135 | 5/ 434/ |
| Also Present: JOSHUA D. DUNLAP, ESQ. | | | |
| | | | |
| THE REPORTING GROUP | | | |
| Mason & Lockhart | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| 4286 INDEX | | | 4288 |
| | 1 | p ı | ROCEEDINGS |
| <u>Witness</u> <u>Direct Cross Redirect Recross</u> | 2 | | |
| William Pine, Ph.D. 4295 | | | CIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning, |
| Karl E. Havens, Ph.D. 4303 | 3 | counsel. | |
| Romuald Lipcius, Ph.D. 4313 4314 4372, 4423 441 | 4 | MR. | PERRY: Good morning, your Honor. |
| | 5 | SPE | CIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you |
| Robert Stavins, Ph.D. 4435 4436 4504 4530 | 6 | all, agair | n, for the rain. It's not only |
| EVILLE TO | 7 | | |
| <u>EXHIBITS</u> | | | an the drought, but I'm sure by now |
| <u>Number</u> <u>Page Referenced</u> | 8 | you have | e been here long enough that you're |
| JX-21 4495 | 9 | fam iliar | with the Maine Farmers Almanac, |
| JX-45 4448 JX-47 4487 | 10 | which pr | edicted rain for today and most of |
| JX-47 4487 JX-50 4458 | 11 | | th. And having lived here all of my |
| JX-65 4539 JX-77 4358 | | | - |
| JX-91 4297, 4372 | 12 | life, I ca | n tell you it's a lot better than |
| JX-154 4468, 4482 JX-167 4299, 4308, 4366 | 13 | snow. | |
| JX-169 4462 | 14 | MR. | PERRY: Thank you, your Honor. |
| FX-53 4485 | 15 | Toda | ay might be our last day. And |
| FX-56 4482 | | | |
| FX-231 4487 FX-232 4487 | 16 | | nat might be true in part because it |
| FX-412 4365, 4405 | 17 | will be o | ur proposal, whenever Georgia is |
| FX-413 4369, 4422 FX-686 4458 | 18 | fin is hed, | to submit our proposed rebuttal in |
| FX-874 4457 | 19 | w ritin a . | mostly deposition designations with |
| FX-875 4339 FX-886 4458 | 20 | | ner things. But we will give Georgia |
| | 20 | a rew Oll | |
| FX-921 4493 | ۱ | | tunity to see what that is. And I |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 | 21 | an oppo | tainty to see what that is. And i |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 | 21 22 | | hat will not require any live |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 | | believe t | · |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 FX-953 4354 | 22 23 | believe t | hat will not require any live testimony. So I believe we might |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 FX-953 4354 FX-955 4415 FX-956 4357 | 22 23 24 | believe t witness | hat will not require any live testimony. So I believe we might day or perhaps tomorrow morning. |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 FX-953 4354 FX-955 4415 FX-956 4357 FX-957 4417 | 22 23 | believe t witness | hat will not require any live testimony. So I believe we might |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 FX-953 4354 FX-955 4415 FX-956 4357 FX-957 4417 FX-960 4438 | 22 23 24 | believe t witness finish too That's m | hat will not require any live testimony. So I believe we might day or perhaps tomorrow morning. |
| FX-921 4493 FX-925 4479 FX-927 4474 FX-928 4478 FX-949 4464 FX-951 4356 FX-953 4354 FX-955 4415 FX-956 4357 FX-957 4417 | 22 23 24 | believe t witness finish too That's m | hat will not require any live testimony. So I believe we might day or perhaps tomorrow morning. y first item for this morning. |

- 1 And then, second, if I might, your
- 2 Honor, I would like to introduce the backbone
- of our Florida legal team today, June
- Elliott.
- 5 MS. ELLIOTT: Your Honor.
- 6 MR. PERRY: And our -- we could not be
- here without June Elliott. She has been 7
- essential, as has Mr. Walton, who is not
- 9 currently here, but whom you have seen every
- day. Aldo Camacho -- I think he just stepped 10
- 11 out; but I can't emphasize enough how
- 12 important they have been to us, and we want
- 13 to thank them.
- The third issue this morning, your 14
- 15 Honor, relates to one of the deposition
- 16 designations that Georgia is going to play
- 17 this morning, and in particular to an
- allegation they have made about a member of 18
- 19 the Florida legal team. They made it in
- 20 their opening statement and in their pretrial
- 21 brief. It relates to an individual who
- 22 hasn't been before you in this trial, a
- 23 person from Tallahassee. And that person
- 24 wishes to identify his strong objection to
- 25 the allegation.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4290

- The allegation is that he tried to 2 persuade one of the University of Florida
- 3 professors not to publish. Of course, they
- did publish. And we will in our rebuttal
- **5** case submit designations of deposition
- testimony rebutting that particular 6
- 7 allegation.

1

- 8 I'm not sure if those designations will
- 9 be played today. Some of them may not, but
- we're certainly happy to submit them as part 10
- 11 of our rebuttal case.
- 12 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you.
- 13 MR. PERRY: Thank you.
- MR. PRIMIS: Good morning, your Honor. 14
- 15 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning.
- MR. PRIMIS: I have a few housekeeping 16
- 17 matters as well. First, in response to what
- Mr. Perry just said, I am aware we do have an 18
- agreement to submit some deposition testimony 19
- 20 from a Dr. Douglass, who is one of their
- 21 experts, in lieu of having his expert
- 22 testimony -- in lieu of having him come in
- 23 and testify live in rebuttal.
- I'm not aware of what the other assorted 24
- 25 materials are. I just learned about that a

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- minute ago. So we'll have to take a look at
- 2 it and see if we have an objection. But we
- did agree on Dr. Douglass.
- 4 Second, with regard to the two videos we
- plan to play this morning, one is Dr. Bill
- 6 Pine of the University of Florida; and the
- 7 other is Dr. Karl Havens. And my colleagues,
- Emily Merki and Josh Mahoney, will walk the 8
- 9 Court through those.
- With regard to the statement Mr. Perry 10
- 11 just made, all Georgia has ever done is
- 12 represent what is in the written
- 13 documentation from Dr. Pine and, as you will
- 14 see in a few moments, in his sworn testimony.
- 15 There is no sworn testimony denying that
- 16 this ever happened, certainly not from
- 17 Mr. Kise or anybody else. And Mr. Kise has
- not put forward sworn testimony that's ever 18
- 19 been tested. So I view that as merely a
- lawyer statement. It is not evidence, and we 20
- 21 object to it.
- Finally, we have some additional 22
- 23 exhibits that I need to put on the record at
- some point. And the first day of trial 24
- before we had all of our systems worked out 25

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4292

- with our team, a few documents were
 - 2 referenced in court without exhibit numbers
 - on cross-examination. And it's long delayed, 3
 - but we do need to put those on the record. 4
 - 5 We do not need your Honor to sit here
 - while I read that if you wish not to be. And 6
 - 7 I certainly don't mean to take the Court's
 - time, but maybe at the lunch break I could 8
 - 9 stay with Mr. Dunlap and Claudette and put
 - 10 those on the record.
 - 11 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Fine.
 - 12 MR. PRIMIS: And the last thing that we
 - 13 are going to add to the record is we have
 - used some videos during the course of the 14
 - 15 case -- Georgia has -- both for impeachment
 - purposes and also during the testimony. And 16
 - 17 we are going to provide the written
 - 18 transcript with an exhibit number of that
 - impeachment material and of the video 19
 - 20 material because the court reporter does not
 - 21 record that, and we want that to be
 - 22 memorialized for the record.
 - 23 Once again, that will take me about five
 - minutes of air time; and the Special Master 24
 - 25 need not be present for that.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

| | I RIAL - December | 1, 2016 (V | , |
|----------|--|------------|--|
| 1 | 4293 | 4 | 4295 MS. MERKI: Your Honor this first set of |
| | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. | 1 | |
| 2 | MR. PRIMIS: So Mr. Perry is right; | 2 | clips relates to Dr. Pine's education and |
| 3 | there is a chance that we could finish today. | 3 | background as well as to his role on the |
| 4 | We have our two videos prepared and ready to | 4 | University of Florida oyster recovery task |
| 5 | go. We'll proceed with those now. | 5 | force. There are no documents being |
| 6 | We also have Dr. Lipcius, our oyster | 6 | discussed in this first clip. |
| 7 | expert, here. I think he's in the courtroom | 7 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 8 | now; or if not, he will be soon. And also, | 8 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, now if you would |
| 9 | Dr. Stavins was able to make himself | 9 | please turn to tab 1 of the binder. And |
| 10 | available today. So if we get that far, we | 10 | under this tab is an e-mail from Dr. Pine to |
| 11 | can get him over here and proceed with him as | 11 | Karl Havens on November 14, 2012. |
| 12 | well. | 12 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 13 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. | 13 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn to |
| 14 | MR. PRIMIS: Thank you, your Honor. | 14 | tab 2 of the binder. And this is this |
| 15 | MR. PERRY: I might be inclined to | 15 | document is Georgia Exhibit 496. And it's |
| 16 | respond to one of the things that Mr. Primis | 16 | another e-mail between Dr. Pine and |
| 17 | said, but I think I would hold it for our | 17 | Dr. Havens dated December 3, 2012. |
| 18 | rebuttal submission, your Honor. | 18 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 19 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. | 19 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we'll now be |
| 20 | MS. MERKI: Good morning, your Honor. | 20 | turning to tab 3 of the binder, which is |
| 21 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning. | 21 | Georgia Exhibit 500 under tab 3. And |
| 22 | MS. MERKI: My name in Emily Merki from | 22 | Dr. Pine will answer questions related to the |
| 23 | Kirkland & Ellis on behalf of Georgia. And | 23 | highlighted portions on the first page of the |
| 24 | you may have seen me at counsel table during | 24 | e-mail under tab 3. |
| 25 | the trial. | 25 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | 4294 | | 4296 |
| 1 | Before we call our next live witness, | 1 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we'll now turn |
| 2 | Dr. Lipcius, Georgia would like to play some | 2 | to tab 4 of the binder, Georgia Exhibit 501. |
| 3 | excerpts, as my colleague said, from two | 3 | And this is a PowerPoint presentation by |
| 4 | University of Florida professors, Bill Pine | 4 | Dr. Pine on behalf of the University of |
| 5 | and Karl Havens, who have done work for the | 5 | Florida oyster recovery team environmental |
| 6 | State of Florida on the oyster fishery | 6 | work group. And Dr. Pine will be answering |
| 7 | collapse. | 7 | questions related to slide 13, which is on |
| 8 | And as you will see, my colleague, | 8 | page 13 of the document. And we have marked |
| 9 | Mr. Mahoney, has just passed out binders | 9 | it with a blue flag in your binder. |
| 10 | which we created for the Court to make it | 10 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 11 | easier to follow along with the video. And | 11 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn now |
| 12 | in the front of the binder we have provided | 12 | to tab 5 of the binder, Georgia Exhibit 568, |
| 13 | the written testimony in the order that it | 13 | which is the Apalachicola Bay Oyster |
| 14 | will be played in the video and, after that, | 14 | Situation Report produced by the oyster |
| 15 | the documents that are being discussed in | 15 | recovery task force. And the first set of |
| 16 | these video clips under numbered tabs. And several of these documents do not | 16 | questions Dr. Pine will be answering relates |
| 17 | | 17 | to page 3 of the document, which is just |
| 18 | have page numbers. So to make it easier for | 18 19 | behind the first page of this document. (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 19 20 | the Court, we have highlighted the relevant excerpts of the documents and also flagged | 20 | (Whereupon the video was played.) MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we're going to |
| 21 | the pages that will be discussed. | 21 | stay in tab 5; but the next part of the |
| 22 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. | 22 | discussion relates to page 10 of this |
| | SI LOIAL MASTER LANCASTER. HIGHK YOU. | 23 | document, which is marked with a blue flag. |
| | MS MERKI: With the Court's normission | | |
| 23 | MS. MERKI: With the Court's permission, | | |
| 24 | we'll begin the video. | 24 | So we'll be turning to that page. |
| | we'll begin the video. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. | | So we'll be turning to that page. (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 24 | we'll begin the video. | 24 | So we'll be turning to that page. |

| _ | TRIAL- December | 1, 2016 (Vo | , |
|----------------------------|--|----------------------------|--|
| | 4297 | | 4299 |
| 1 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we're still | 1 | page. |
| 2 | under tab 5. The next set of questions | 2 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 3 | relates to a section called Statistical | 3 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn to |
| 4 | Catch-At-Age Model on page 14 of this | 4 | tab 8 of the binder, which is Florida's |
| 5 | document. And on page 14 we'll be looking | 5 | complaint in this matter. And the next part |
| 6 | specifically at the last sentence of the | 6 | of the discussion will relate to paragraph 54 |
| 7 | first full paragraph on that page, which is | 7 | of the complaint, which is at the top of |
| 8 | highlighted in your binder. | 8 | page 19. And we have marked this page with |
| 9 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 9 | another blue flag in your binder. |
| 10 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, if you would | 10 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 11 | just turn to the next page of the same | 11 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn to |
| 12 | document, page 15, Dr. Pine will now answer | 12 | tab 9 of the binder, which is marked as Joint |
| 13 | questions about the left-hand column of the | 13 | Exhibit 167. Dr. Pine will first answer some |
| 14 | page under the title Restoration Actions, | 14 | general questions about this paper. And |
| 15 | Caution, and Future Work. | 15 | then, again, there are no page numbers; but |
| 16 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 16 | he will also answer questions related to the |
| 17 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, the last set of | 17 | fourth page of the document, which we have |
| 18 | questions on this document relates to page 29 | 18 | marked with a blue flag. |
| 19 | of the document under a section titled | 19 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 20 | Research. | 20 | MS. MERKI: And, your Honor, again, |
| 21 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 21 | there are no page numbers for this document; |
| 22 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we're now moving | 22 | but if you would please turn to the next blue |
| 23 | on to tab 6 of the binder, which is marked as | 23 | flag in the binder, the discussion will |
| 24 | Joint Exhibit 91. And this document is the | 24 | relate to the highlighted portion of that |
| 25 | Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation | 25 | page. |
| | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | 4298 | | 4300 |
| 1 | Commission Oyster Disaster Report dated May | 1 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 2 | 2013 which was submitted to NOAA as part of | 2 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we'll turn now |
| 3 | the disaster request, and if you would please | 3 | to tab 10 of the binder, which is Georgia |
| 4 | turn to the blue flag on page 5 of the | 4 | Exhibit 1148. And this is an unpublished |
| 5 | document. | 5 | manuscript titled A Complex Relationship |
| 6 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 6 | Between Freshwater Discharge and Oyster |
| 7 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we're still | 7 | Fisheries CPUE in Apalachicola Bay, Florida, |
| 8 | under tab 6, but we'll be turning the page to | 8 | authored by Dr. Pine and Nicholas Fisch. And |
| 9 | page 6 of this document. And the next clip | 9 | this paper is currently under review for |
| 10 | relates to the highlighted portion of this | 10 | publication in the Marine and Coastal |
| 11 | page. | 11 | Fisheries Journal. |
| 12 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 12 | Dr. Pine will answer some general |
| 13 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, the next | 13 | questions about the paper and then will |
| 14 | discussion relates to tab 7 of your binder, | 14 | answer questions related to the second page |
| 15 | which is marked as Georgia Exhibit 789. | 15 | of the document. And we have highlighted the |
| 16 | Dr. Pine will first answer some general | 16 | relevant portions. |
| 17 | questions about this paper. | 17 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 18 | (14) | 18 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn now |
| | (Whereupon the video was played.) | | |
| 19 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document | 19 | to tab 11 of the binder, Georgia Exhibit 778, |
| 20 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part | 20 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to |
| | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab | | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will |
| 20 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab that we have put in your binder under a | 20 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will answer a series of questions about several |
| 20 21 22 23 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab that we have put in your binder under a section titled Discussions. And the | 20 21 22 23 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will answer a series of questions about several statements in this e-mail, starting with the |
| 20 21 22 23 24 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab that we have put in your binder under a section titled Discussions. And the questions relate specifically to the second | 20 21 22 23 24 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will answer a series of questions about several statements in this e-mail, starting with the first sentence of the e-mail. |
| 20 21 22 23 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab that we have put in your binder under a section titled Discussions. And the questions relate specifically to the second full paragraph on the second column of this | 20 21 22 23 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will answer a series of questions about several statements in this e-mail, starting with the first sentence of the e-mail. (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 20 21 22 23 24 | MS. MERKI: Your Honor, this document does not have page numbers, but the next part of the discussion relates to the blue tab that we have put in your binder under a section titled Discussions. And the questions relate specifically to the second | 20 21 22 23 24 | which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to three of his colleagues. Dr. Pine will answer a series of questions about several statements in this e-mail, starting with the first sentence of the e-mail. |

4303 1 MS. MERKI: Your Honor, we'll turn now 1 previous video designations, the parties 2 to tab 12 of your binder, which is marked as 2 have conferred about which portions of 3 Georgia Exhibit 779. And this is a chain of 3 Dr. Havens's deposition will be played and in 4 e-mails between Dr. Pine and Jack Payne from 4 which order. 5 December 20 and 21, 2014, following the And we have also handed you a binder, as 6 previous e-mail. And the questions on this 6 we have done with our previous witnesses. I 7 document will focus on the third e-mail from 7 will direct the Court, as my colleague 8 the top, which we have highlighted. 8 Ms. Merki did, to certain sections of the 9 (Whereupon the video was played.) 9 documents as they come up in the video. 10 MS. MERKI: Your Honor, please turn to 10 So with the Court's permission, we will 11 tab 14 of the binder, Georgia Exhibit 770, 11 begin. 12 which is an e-mail sent from Dr. Pine to Eric 12 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 13 Hellgren on November 25, 2014. And, again, 13 MR. MAHONEY: Thank you, your Honor. 14 we'll be focusing on the highlighted portion 14 (Whereupon the video was played.) 15 of this document. 15 MR. MAHONEY: And, I should have said 16 I'm sorry, that was an error on my part. this at the beginning, your Honor, but this 16 17 I skipped over tab 13, which will be the next 17 is tab 1 obviously; and the exhibit number is 18 tab that we'll be discussing. And it's 18 GX-1018. And we're now just going to page 2 19 Georgia Exhibit 782. 19 of the same exhibit. 20 (Whereupon the video was played.) 20 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. 21 MS. MERKI: Your Honor, now we'll be 21 (Whereupon the video was played.) 22 22 MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, we'll now move turning to tab 14 of the binder and, again, 23 focusing on the highlighted portion of this 23 to tab 2 in the binder, which is GX-1338. 24 document, which is Georgia Exhibit 770. 24 It's a series of e-mails with Dr. Pine and 25 (Whereupon the video was played.) 25 Dr. Havens. The focus of the video pertains THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4302 4304 1 MS. MERKI: Your Honor, the final video 1 to the paragraph in the middle of the first 2 2 segment that we'll play for Dr. Pine contains page of the document. 3 clips that Florida has requested. And that 3 (Whereupon the video was played.) 4 will be the last video segment. 4 MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, we'll now go 5 (Whereupon the video was played.) 5 to tab 3 of the binder, which is GX-491. 6 MS. MERKI: Thank you, your Honor. That 6 It's another series of e-mails between 7 concludes the video designations for 7 Dr. Havens and colleagues. 8 Dr. Pine. 8 For this clip, we'll start on page 4 of 9 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. 9 the e-mail set and work backwards, as we do. 10 But the first set of clips is related to the MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, we're now going 10 11 to play some video designations from the 11 highlighted text on page 4 of GX-491. 12 deposition of Dr. Havens. And my colleague, 12 (Whereupon the video was played.) 13 Josh Mahoney, will walk the Court through 13 MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, we're staying 14 those. 14 with the same document; but we're moving back 15 MR. MAHONEY: Good morning, your Honor. 15 to page 2 at the top, which is an e-mail 16 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning. 16 exchange between Dr. Havens and Dr. Pine as 17 MR. MAHONEY: My name is Josh Mahoney 17 well as Dr. Pine's response to Dr. Havens as from Kirkland & Ellis. I represent the State 18 18 the response in the sequence. 19 of Georgia. 19 (Whereupon the video was played.) 20 As my colleague Craig Primis just said, MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, we'll now go 20 21 Georgia will now play excerpts from the 21 to tab 4 in the binder, which is GX-1339. 22 videotaped deposition of another current 22 It's another series of e-mails among 23 University of Florida professor and 23 Dr. Havens and his colleagues. And the 24 scientist, Dr. Karl Havens. 24 discussion in the video will center on 25 And as with the State of Georgia's 25 Dr. Havens's e-mail in the middle of the THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

| | TRIAL- December | 1, ∠∪10 (VC | · · · |
|----------|---|-------------|---|
| | 4305 | | 4307 |
| 1 | page. | 1 | were just played. In particular, page 171, |
| 2 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 2 | line 17 through 173 excuse me, 172, 16 was |
| 3 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, we'll now | 3 | actually designated by Georgia; and then the |
| 4 | we'll next move to tab 15 of the binder, | 4 | remainder of that clip in red was Florida's |
| 5 | which is a familiar document to the Court. | 5 | counter-designation. So I didn't want you to |
| 6 | It is GX-568, the 2013 University of Florida | 6 | have the impression that Florida had |
| 7 | Apalachicola Bay Oyster Situation Report. | 7 | designated that entire portion. |
| 8 | The first series of clips discusses the | 8 | So |
| 9 | report in general. | 9 | MR. PERRY: Your Honor, might we suggest |
| 10 11 | (Whereupon the video was played.) MR. MAHONEY: Staying with the same | 10 11 | that a break would be appropriate given that it's about 10:30? |
| 12 | document, your Honor, if you will turn to the | 12 | I don't mean to interrupt counsel for |
| 13 | first blue tab. It's on page 13. And the | 13 | Georgia, but I also want to be cognizant that |
| 14 | discussion here pertains to the penultimate | 14 | we have been sitting here for a couple of |
| 15 | sentence in that paragraph on the left column | 15 | hours. |
| 16 | of page 13. | 16 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Sure. We'll |
| 17 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 17 | take a brief break. |
| 18 | MR. MAHONEY: If you will turn one page | 18 | (Time Noted: 10:35 a.m.) |
| 19 | further into the document now, on page 15 the | 19 | (Recess Called) |
| 20 | discussion continues. And it focuses on the | 20 | (Time Noted: 10:47 a.m.) |
| 21 | section that begins, restoration actions. | 21 | MR. MAHONEY: Thank you, your Honor. |
| 22 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 22 | We will continue now with the video |
| 23 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, the last | 23 | designations of Dr. Havens. |
| 24 | series of clips related to this document is | 24 | The next set of clips pertains to tab 8 |
| 25 | on page 29, which we have marked with the | 25 | in the binder. And the exhibit number is |
| | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | 4306 | | 4308 |
| 1 | blue tab. And it's under the second bullet | 1 | GX-752. And it is an e-mail exchange among |
| 2 | of the section called Research. | 2 | Dr. Havens and his colleagues. And you will |
| 3 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 3 | see the highlighted text in the document. |
| 4 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, if you will | 4 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 5 | please turn to page or to excuse me, if | 5 | MR. MAHONEY: Next, we'll look at tab 9 |
| 6 | you will turn to tab 6 in the binder for the | 6 | of the binder. The exhibit number is GX-799. |
| 7 | next series of clips. It relates to GX-649, | 7 | This is an e-mail from Dr. Havens to a NOAA |
| 8 | and in particular, at the bottom of the | 8 | official in 2015. |
| 9 | second page of the e-mail correspondence | 9 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 10 | between Dr. Havens and a man named John | 10 | MR. MAHONEY: The next document that the |
| 11 | Cirino, along with several other individuals | 11 | video clips will be discussing is in tab 10 |
| 12 | being copied. | 12 | of the binder. And it's Exhibit No. GX-1340. |
| 13 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 13 | This is an e-mail from Dr. Havens to several |
| 14 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, the next | 14 | individuals, fall 2014. And they will be |
| 15 | series of clips is in tab 7 of your binder. | 15 | the video will be in reference to the fourth |
| 16 | And it's GX-741 is the document. The | 16 | paragraph of that e-mail. |
| 17 | discussion in the video focuses on page 4, | 17 | (Whereupon the video was played.) |
| 18 | which we have marked with a blue tab. And we | 18 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, the last |
| 19 | have also highlighted the text that is being | 19 | series of Georgia's clips are or discuss |
| 20 | discussed. (Whereupon the video was played.) | 20 | the document that's in tab 11 of the binder, |
| 21 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 21 | which we have already seen earlier this morning. It's JX-167 written by Edward Camp |
| 22 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, before we move on, I just want to note for the record that | 22 23 | and colleagues. It's a journal article |
| 23 24 | there appears to be a mix-up in what was | 23 | called Collapse of a Historic Oyster Fishery: |
| 25 | designated by each party for the clips that | 25 | Diagnosing Causes and Identifying Paths |
| -3 | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | i | |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |

| | TRIAL- Decemb | per 1, 2016 (V | |
|----------|--|----------------|--|
| | 4309 | | 4311 |
| 1 | Toward Increased Resilience. | 1 | to refer the Court, if I could, to a set of |
| 2 | Dr. Havens will be answering a set of | 2 | textual comments by Mr. Pine Dr. Pine, |
| 3 | questions about the abstract of the paper at | 3 | excuse me, and Dr. Havens that were read by |
| 4 | the top of the first page. | 4 | Mr. Prins from Florida's team. They are in |
| 5 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 5 | tab 11, JX-167. The pages are unnumbered, |
| 6 | MR. MAHONEY: Your Honor, that concludes | 6 | but I believe it's the sixth page. It's the |
| 7 | the set of designations that Georgia has | 7 | first paragraph under Discussion. |
| 8 | selected to play for the Court. | 8 | Mr. Prinz read that, and I just wanted |
| 9 | The final video that we will show now is | 9 | to point out where it appears because it |
| 10 | additional designations that Florida has | 10 | didn't appear on the screen when the clip was |
| 11 | requested. And this will be the final set of | 11 | played. |
| 12 | clips. | 12 | Thank you, your Honor. |
| 13 | (Whereupon the video was played.) | 13 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Mr. Primis, |
| 14 | MR. MAHONEY: Thank you, your Honor. | 14 | do you have any problem with the request for |
| 15 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Counsel, | 15 | the redaction? |
| 16 | before you leave, I'm sure that this is of no | 16 | MR. PRIMIS: No, of course, not, your |
| 17 | importance to anyone except me and that | 17 | Honor. It was inadvertent. It just hadn't |
| 18 | probably I'm the only one who noticed it. We | 18 | come up between the parties previously. So |
| 19 | have had dozens of experts with degrees up | 19 | we'll do that and submit a redacted copy to |
| 20 | the wazoo here testifying in writing, orally, | 20 | the Court. |
| 21 | and video; and not one of them understood | 21 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. |
| 22 | that when you're dealing with three or more | 22 | MR. PRIMIS: Thank you. |
| 23 | matters, you should use the word among and | 23 | My colleague, Mr. Echols, has returned |
| 24 | not between. | 24 | in light of the oysters being discussed. |
| 25 | But I heard you today do it, and I | 25 | And we'll now hand it over to him and |
| | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | 4310 | | 4312 |
| 1 | wanted the record to reflect that. Thank | 1 | Dr. Lipcius. |
| 2 | you. | 2 | MR. ECHOLS: Good morning, your Honor. |
| 3 | MR. MAHONEY: Thank you, your Honor. | 3 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning. |
| 4 | MR. PERRY: Your Honor, I just have a | 4 | MR. ECHOLS: Barack Echols from Kirkland |
| 5 | ministerial issue, if I might. We have a | 5 | & Ellis on behalf of the State of Georgia. |
| 6 | confidentiality order in this case that | 6 | And at this point, the State would call |
| 7 | requests that both parties redact e-mail | 7 | our oyster expert, Dr. Romuald Lipcius, who |
| 8 | addresses. And I would like to request that | 8 | is the fisheries management and marine |
| 9 | Georgia do that with respect to some of the | 9 | ecology professor at the Virginia Institute |
| 10 | exhibits here. | 10 | of Marine Science for the College of William |
| 11 | One is in the tab set we just looked at, | 11 | & Mary and will be available to answer every |
| 12 | GX-649. There are quite a number of personal | 12 | and any question you have regarding oysters. |
| 13 | e-mail addresses that, for various reasons, I | 13 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. |
| 14 | think should be redacted. | 14 | THE CLERK: Please raise your right |
| 15 | There was at least one of those | 15 | hand. |
| 16 | occurrences regarding a document from 2014 | 16 | Do you solemnly swear that the testimony |
| 17 | that involved lawyers who were involved for | 17 | you shall give in the cause now in hearing |
| 18 | Florida back in 2014 at that time. They had | 18 | shall be the truth, the whole truth, and |
| 19 | a couple e-mail addresses for those lawyers. | 19 | nothing but the truth, so help you God? |
| 20 | I would like to ask that those be redacted. | 20 | THE WITNESS: I do. |
| 21 | And then, finally, with respect to the | 21 | THE CLERK: Please be seated. |
| 22 | clips that were just played that were | 22 | Pull yourself right up to the microphone |
| 23 | attributed to Florida, I'm not sure I tracked | 23 | and please state your name and spell your |
| 1 | | 24 | last name. |
| 24 | all those; but there was a lack of text | | idot fidific. |
| 24 25 | all those; but there was a lack of text showing on the screen. And so I would like | 25 | |
| | all those; but there was a lack of text showing on the screen. And so I would like THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE WITNESS: Thank you. My full name THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | showing on the screen. And so I would like | | THE WITNESS: Thank you. My full name |

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4315 1 is Romuald Nelson Lipcius, R O M U A L D, 1 whether there was scientific evidence that low 2 NELSON, LIPCIUS. 2 flows from the Apalachicola River otherwise 3 MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, may I approach? 3 reduced biological productivity in the bay. 4 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 4 Is that right? DIRECT EXAMINATION 5 A. Yes. BY MR. ECHOLS: 6 **Q.** In paragraph 8(c) on page 2 you conclude that 7 7 Q. Professor Lipcius, I have handed you what is the there is no scientific evidence that oyster 8 direct testimony you have submitted in this case. 8 mortality in Apalachicola Bay was abnormally high 9 Would you please take a look at that and confirm 9 prior to or during the oyster collapse. Is that 10 if it is a true and accurate copy of your direct 10 11 testimony? 11 A. That is correct. I was referring to natural A. Yes, it is. 12 12 mortality, yes. 13 Q. And do you, sir, adopt this as your sworn direct 13 **Q.** And then on paragraph 8(d), which starts on 14 testimony for purposes of this case? 14 page 2 and carries over to page 3, you conclude 15 A. I do. 15 that there is no evidence that an abnormal Q. Thank you. 16 16 increase in the level of predation of oysters by 17 17 MR. ECHOLS: I now tender the witness. rock snails that prefer conditions of high salinities could have caused the collapse. Is 18 THE WITNESS: Am I being heard without 18 19 equipment? 19 that correct? A. Yes. 20 MR. ECHOLS: Sure. 20 21 MR. QURESHI: Good morning, your Honor. 21 **Q.** Paragraph 9(a), page 3, you conclude that the 22 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good morning. 22 hypothesis that low Apalachicola River flow was 23 MR. QURESHI: Before I begin, I would 23 the cause of the oyster fishery collapse is 24 24 contrary to all available scientific evidence. like to introduce my colleague who is 25 25 assisting me with today's examination, Is that correct? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4316 4314 A. Yes. 1 Ms. Natalie Rao of Latham & Watkins. 2 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Welcome. 2 **Q.** Okay. Sir, I want to review some of the things 3 MS. RAO: Thank you. 3 that you did to inform the conclusions in your 4 MR. QURESHI: With your permission, your 4 expert report that you prepared in this 5 5 Honor, I would like to distribute the litigation. I also want to review some of the 6 cross-examination binders. 6 things that you did not do to inform your expert 7 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. 7 report. 8 **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 8 You did not conduct any field experiments. 9 BY MR. QURESHI: 9 Correct? Q. Good morning, Dr. Lipcius. 10 A. Not in Apalachicola Bay, no. But I did in 10 11 11 A. Good morning, Mr. Qureshi. Chesapeake Bay. 12 **Q.** Sir, I would like to begin by reviewing the 12 Q. And I'm talking about Apalachicola Bay, the 13 principal conclusions that you have reached in 13 subject of this lawsuit, sir. 14 your direct testimony. I would like you to 14 15 confirm for me that I am reading those 15 **Q.** You did not conduct any laboratory experiments? A. I did not. 16 accurately. 16 17 A. Yes. 17 **Q.** You did not do any independent data collection? **Q.** You will find that direct testimony behind tab 1 18 18 A. If you mean by going out in the field and 19 of the binder I provided you. And it was also 19 collecting data, no. But I was collecting in the 20 provided to you by Georgia's counsel. 20 sense of integrating a number of data sources 21 21 that had not been examined previously. Sir, in paragraph 3 on page 1 you state that 22 you were retained by the State of Georgia to 22 Q. Sir, you relied on data that had been collected 23 analyze two issues, whether Georgia's water 23 by others. Correct?

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Apalachicola Bay oyster fishery in 2012 and, two,

consumption caused the collapse of the

24

25

Page 4313 to 4316 of 4589

24

25

A. Correct.

Q. You did not run a population model with data from

THE REPORTING GROUP

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4317 4319 1 Apalachicola Bay? 1 And, again, my question you should keep in A. I did not. 2 2 mind is when you met Captain Shiver, you did not **Q.** And before you were hired by an expert -- I'm 3 inform him that you were working as an expert on sorry. Before you were hired as an expert by the behalf of the State of Georgia in connection with 4 5 State of Georgia in March 2015, you had not this litigation? 6 visited Apalachicola Bay to conduct scientific A. Correct. As I said, I didn't recall doing that. 7 research; is that correct? 7 Q. Understood. And now you do recall? 8 A. No, I had not. 8 A. No. I'm saying I don't recall doing that. I --9 **Q.** But before you submitted your expert report in 9 that's what I said in my deposition. And I don't 10 this case, you did visit Apalachicola Bay in --10 recall whether I said that to him at the time. I 11 on one occasion; is that right? 11 didn't -- I wasn't really thinking about that. A. Yes. 12 12 **Q.** Do you recall that during your boat tour, you 13 **Q.** That was in --13 visited four different locations in the bay? 14 A. Well --14 A. Approximately. Yes. 15 Q. -- late April or early May 2016. Correct? 15 **Q.** One location was a spot at the Cat Point oyster A. Yes. And I had also visited it while I was at 16 bar. Correct? 16 17 A. Yes. Florida State University. 17 Q. Right. But not to conduct scientific --Q. And another location was at the East Hole oyster 18 18 19 A. No. 19 har? Q. -- research, sir? 20 A. Yes. 20 21 A. No. 21 **Q.** And the other two locations you were unable to 22 Q. That's what I asked. 22 identify in your deposition. Do you have any 23 A. Correct. 23 recollection of them now? A. I don't know what their actual names were, but 24 **Q.** The one visit you did make in late April or early 24 25 May, 2016, was approximately half a day? 25 they were in the northern part of Apalachicola THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4318 4320 A. Yes, it was. 1 Bay on the west side of the bridge. And so they **Q.** And during that trip, the lawyers for the State 2 2 were, I would say, closer to north -- the 3 of Georgia arranged a boat trip for you? 3 Norman's north site, Lighthouse site; but I A. Correct. don't -- I don't recall their exact names, no. 4 4 **Q.** That boat trip lasted about two to three hours? 5 5 **Q.** And you -- during this three-hour tour, you stayed on the boat? You didn't dive into the 6 A. Approximately. 6 7 Q. And during that three-hour tour, you spoke to the 7 water. Correct? 8 captain of the boat, a gentleman named Captain 8 No. No, it was too cold. 9 Coy Shiver? 9 **Q.** No, you did not dive into the water? A. I did. 10 A. I did not dive into the water. 10 11 11 **Q.** And when you met Captain Shiver, you did not **Q.** And you did not speak to any oystermen other than 12 inform him that you were working as an expert on 12 Captain Shiver during this trip; correct? 13 behalf of the State of Georgia for this 13 A. Well, not in terms of the context of the oyster 14 litigation? 14 resource. I did stop at some seafood markets 15 A. That I don't recall. 15 where there were oystermen there. 16 **Q.** Perhaps I can show you your deposition; and that 16 Q. Yes. And we're going to talk about that. My 17 might refresh your recollection, sir. 17 question was when you were on the boat, you 18 18 A. Okay. didn't talk to any oyster fishermen? 19 MR. QURESHI: Your Honor, may I approach 19 A. No, I did not. Q. But you did go to two different seafood markets, 20 Dr. Lipcius? 20 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 21 and you spoke to some people there? 21 BY MR. QURESHI: 22 22 A. That's correct. Q. Sir, I'll request that you turn to page 99 of 23 **Q.** And you asked -- you met two different people at 23 24 your deposition. And in particular, look at line 24 these two different seafood stores? 25 24 and read through line 11 on page 100. 25 A. Right. The ones behind the counter, yes. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 Q. And you asked them how are things going?
- 2 A. Yes, I did.
- **Q.** And one of the fellows that you met, he enjoyed
- 4 meeting you so much that he gave you a bottle of
- 5 crab dip. Right?
- 6 A. He did, yes.
- **7 Q.** And you also spoke to a woman who owned a hotel
- **8** that you were staying at. Is that correct?
- 9 A. I did.
- 10 Q. And these discussions that you had with all of
- these individuals were general conversations
- about the hardship caused by the collapse of the
- oyster fishery in Apalachicola Bay, sir?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. But the boat trip and these discussions,
- 16 they did not inform the expert report that you
- **17** prepared in this matter?
- 18 A. No. They did not.
- 19 Q. Okay. I want to talk now about the work that you
- did that you performed that did inform your
- 21 conclusions. You testified that you reached your
- conclusions based on your experience and by
- 23 analyzing different types of information
- available to you at paragraphs 5 and 7 of your
- direct testimony, sir, on pages 1 and 2, sir?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4322

- 1 A. Yes.
- **Q.** You also reviewed data and information from the
- 3 State of Florida as well as federal agencies; is
- 4 that correct?
- 5 It's on paragraph 5, page 1.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. You also reviewed the testimony of Florida state
- **8** officials responsible for fishery management?
- 9 A. Yes. I did.
- **10 Q.** You also reviewed testimony from oyster
- 11 biologists at the University of Florida who
- researched the decline of the Apalachicola Bay
- 13 oyster population?
- 14 A. Yes, I did.
- **15 Q.** You saw some of that this morning. Right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And at the time of your deposition, you also
- reviewed certain deposition transcripts?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 Q. Okay. Some you had read in their entirety, but
- 21 for others you had read only portions?
- 22 A. Yes. Correct.
- **Q.** You also reviewed other documents and exhibits
- that were produced during discovery in this case?
- 25 A. Yes.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- 1 Q. And, sir, did you explain in your direct
- testimony at paragraph 163 on page 49 that
- 3 contemporaneous observations by those in the
- 4 field and from state officials are commonly
 - considered by marine scientists. Is that right?
- 6 A. Yes. They are considered. Certainly.
- **7 Q.** And you note that reports that are made
- 8 contemporaneously reflect knowledge from people
- **9** who have the most interaction with the resource
- and the fishery?
- 11 A. Correct.
- **12 Q.** But you do warn that these contemporaneous
 - discussions need to be read with caution?
- 14 A. Correct.

13

16

24

5

- **15 Q.** And one of the sources of contemporaneous
 - information you reviewed are reports prepared by
- 17 Mr. Mark Berrigan; isn't that right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- **19 Q.** And you believe he's a reliable source of
- 20 information on the status of the oyster resource
- and what is going on in Apalachicola Bay?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Sir, now I would like to talk about some
 - principles of agreement or some basic principles
- about oyster ecology. You agree that the eastern

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4324

- 1 oyster has an optimal salinity range?
- 2 A. It does have an optimal salinity range, yes.
- **Q.** And the optimal salinity range for the eastern
- **4** oyster in Apalachicola Bay, according to you, is
 - about 12 or 14 to about 22 or 23 parts per
- 6 thousand?
- 7 A. Approximately, yes.
- 8 Q. You also agree that the amount and timing of
- **9** freshwater flow are critical to the long-term
- survival of an oyster community?
- 11 A. Yes, I would agree.
- **12 Q.** Sir, you also agree that high salinity conditions
- can cause localized mortality events?
- 14 A. Yes.
- **15 Q.** One example of how high salinity can result in
- 16 localized mortality events is that it may lead to
- **17** an increase in predation?
- 18 A. Yes.
- **19 Q.** And one of the predators you may see an increase
- in would be snails. Correct?
- 21 A. That's correct.
- Q. High salinity can also impact the physiology ofthe organism itself. Right?
- 24 A. Yes.
- **Q.** High salinity can lead to localized

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4327 4325 1 disease-related mortality? 1 going into the bay, yes. 2 Q. Did you review a letter by USGS from earlier this 2 A. It can at extreme levels, yes. **Q.** And you would agree that while it generally 3 vear, sir? depends on the size or age of the oyster, oyster A. I'm not sure. 4 5 disease is more prevalent at high salinity Q. Okay. We can come back to that. 6 conditions? A. Okav. 7 A. Yes. Certainly for dermo. 7 Q. I now want to talk about one of the possible 8 **Q.** Sir, I'm now going to talk about one of the 8 adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and 9 documents that we spent some time looking at 9 that is oyster disease. 10 particular excerpts from. And that is behind 10 A. Okay. 11 tab 2 of your binder. 11 **Q.** In early 2015 you determined that disease was 12 You're familiar with this document, sir? 12 eliminated as a cause of the oyster collapse by 13 A. I am. 13 other investigators. Isn't that right? 14 Q. Okay. This is the Apalachicola Bay Oyster 14 A. I did. Yes. 15 Situation Report designated as GX-568. You're 15 Q. And in making that determination, you relied in 16 aware, sir, that in 2012 the scientists who 16 part on the document behind tab 2, the 17 17 prepared the Apalachicola Bay Oyster Situation Apalachicola Bay Oyster Situation Report --A. I did. 18 Report determined that low river flows and low 18 **Q.** -- GX-568? 19 rainfall caused high salinity in Apalachicola 19 20 Bay. Correct? 20 A. Yes. 21 A. Yes. 21 Q. Okay. Can you please turn with me to page 14 of 22 22 Q. Okay. And that particular finding is the second this document, sir. In particular, I would like 23 bullet on page 4. Do you see it, sir? 23 you to read the second full paragraph in the 24 A. Yes, I do. 24 right column that begins, the main findings. 25 **Q.** And you analyzed river flow in 2012; didn't you? 25 Please read that to yourself. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4326 4328 1 A. I did. A. Certainly. The main findings from the stock 2 assessment model --2 **Q.** And you don't quarrel with the observation that 3 the years 2011 and 2012 witnessed low flow from Q. Sorry, Dr. Lipcius. It's efficient if you read 3 the Apalachicola River into Apalachicola Bay? it to yourself. 4 4 5 A. Yes. 5 A. Oh, sorry. 6 **Q.** Yes, you do not quarrel with that? 6 I have read it. 7 A. Yes, I do not quarrel with it. 7 Q. And you had reviewed this finding when you Q. In fact, you plot river flow against oyster 8 submitted your expert report in this case? 8 9 landings on page 18 of your direct testimony? 9 A. I did. A. Yes. 10 10 Q. And can you also turn to page 22, sir. And here, 11 Q. And in preparing that plot, you relied on data 11 I would like you to read the last bullet point 12 from the Sumatra Gage; is that correct? 12 that begins, dermo infections may be higher. 13 A. That's correct. 13 A. I have. 14 **Q.** The Sumatra Gage is a USGS gage, sir? 14 **Q.** Okay. Do you see the reference to the oyster 15 A. Yes. 15 sentinel program? 16 **Q.** And you know where that's located in the 16 Α. 17 Apalachicola River system? 17 Q. And you're familiar with the oyster sentinel 18 A. Yes. It's -- it's down near the lower reaches of 18 program. Right? 19 19 the river shortly before it enters the bay. A. Well, I'm familiar with the mussel sentinel 20 20 **Q.** Have you ever heard of any measurement issues program, which also includes oysters. But I'm 21 21 associated with the Sumatra Gage? not familiar in-depth with that program, no. 22 A. I have heard at times that there's some minor 22 Q. Do you know that one of your colleagues at the

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart 11 of 107 sheets

measurement issues. I don't recall exactly what

they are. But they generally reflect, as far as

I have read, the conditions -- well, the flow

23

24

25

A. That's correct, yes. THE REPORTING GROUP

oyster sentinel program?

Virginia Institute of Marine Sciences is on the

Mason & Lockhart

23

24

| | | I RIAL- December | 1, 20 | 0 (10 | · |
|--|----------------|---|--|----------------------|---|
| | | 4329 | | | 4331 |
| 1 | Q. | Roger Mann. Right? | 1 | | I do. |
| 2 | A. | Yes. | 2 | Q. | Okay. And you focus on rock snails. Did you |
| 3 | Q. | And you had reviewed this particular bullet point | 3 | | consider conchs as well? |
| 4 | | when you had prepared your direct testimony in | 4 | A. | I did not consider the conchs because those are |
| 5 | | this case, sir? | 5 | | not as prevalent as the rock snails. And, also, |
| 6 | A. | I had; but I mainly relied on the levels of | 6 | | mainly because the State of Florida had |
| 7 | | weighted prevalence of dermo, of the disease, | 7 | | identified rock snails and stone crabs as the two |
| 8 | | that were presented in this document by | 8 | | predators that were most important to the |
| 9 | | Dr. Petes. | 9 | | collapse and predation. |
| 10 | Q. | We will certainly look at the report and memo by | 10 | Q. | Had you ever heard anyone associated with the |
| 11 | | Dr. Petes. But let's turn first to another | 11 | | State of Florida talking about conchs being a |
| 12 | | document you relied on when you said that other | 12 | | predator of oysters in 2012? |
| 13 | | investigators had eliminated disease as a cause | 13 | Α. | I had in some cases. |
| 14 | | of the collapse. And that document is behind | 14 | _ | Did that factor at all into your analysis? |
| 15 | | tab 3. | 15 | _ | No. Again, because they're not as prevalent. |
| 16 | Δ | Yes. | 16 | Q. | |
| 17 | Q. | | 17 | Œ. | , , |
| | Q. | , | | | testified that if there were marine predators |
| 18 | | document before, sir? | 18 19 | | that were responsible for the crash of the |
| 19 | _ | Yes, I have. | | | Apalachicola Bay oyster population, then you |
| 20 | Q. | This is a document authored by several | 20 | | would expect to see a significant density of dead |
| 21 | | individuals, including Dr. Pine. Correct? | 21 | | oyster shells. Isn't that right? |
| 22 | | Correct. | 22 | _ | Correct. |
| 23 | | You cite this document in your direct testimony? | 23 | Q. | And when you say you would expect to see, you're |
| 24 | Α. | Yes. | 24 | | referring to the oyster surveys that were done by |
| 25 | Q. | Now, there's no page numbers on this, as we | 25 | | the Florida Department of Agriculture and |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4330 | | | 4332 |
| 4 | | | | | |
| 1 | | discovered earlier this morning. But if you turn | 1 | | Consumer Services. You would expect to see the |
| 2 | | discovered earlier this morning. But if you turn to the sixth page with me. | 1 2 | | Consumer Services. You would expect to see the dead shells in those surveys. Correct? |
| | A. | | | A. | |
| 2 | _ | to the sixth page with me. | 2 | _ | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? |
| 3 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. | 2 | _ | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. |
| 2 3 4 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, | 2 3 4 | _ | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. |
| 2 3 4 5 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm | 2 3 4 5 | _ | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting |
| 2 3 4 5 6 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence | 2 3 4 5 6 | _ | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that | 2 3 4 5 6 7 | Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | _ | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. A. Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 | Q. A. Q. Q. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. A. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that there is no evidence that there was an abnormal | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? I have. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that there is no evidence that there was an abnormal increase in the level of predation of oysters by | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? I have. And do you recall him saying that we did not |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that there is no evidence that there was an abnormal increase in the level of predation of oysters by rock snails that could have caused this the | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? I have. And do you recall him saying that we did not that the Florida Department of Agriculture and |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that there is no evidence that there was an abnormal increase in the level of predation of oysters by rock snails that could have caused this the collapse. Correct? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? I have. And do you recall him saying that we did not that the Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services did not survey bars where they |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | to the sixth page with me. I'm there. If you could read the paragraph that begins with, overall the key results. And what I'm particularly interested in is the last sentence here that says, there are multiple factors that could lead to low recruitment. And then I'm interested in factor No. 3. So if you might read that to yourself. Yes. And you were aware of this factor, sir, when you submitted your expert report in this case? Yes. And you were aware of it when you submitted your direct testimony? I was. I also want to talk about one of the other possible adverse effects of high salinity conditions, and those are oyster predators. You conclude in your direct testimony, sir, that there is no evidence that there was an abnormal increase in the level of predation of oysters by rock snails that could have caused this the | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | dead shells in those surveys. Correct? Both those and in Dr. Kimbro's surveys, yes. Okay. Let's talk about the Florida data first. You understand that the purpose of collecting the or the purpose of undertaking the surveys was to provide a predictive index of the oyster population? A relative index, yes. Okay. And so you know that Florida would not sample areas where there were no live oysters? Are you aware of that? No, I don't think that's that's true. Where they sampled the oyster bars where they expected to see oysters. And there might or might not be oysters where they sampled depending on harvest rates, mortality, and so on. Sir, were you in court for Mr. Mark Berrigan's testimony? No, I was not. Have you read his trial transcript? I have. And do you recall him saying that we did not that the Florida Department of Agriculture and |

4333 4335 1 did not expect to find live oysters? Mr. Berrigan's deposition transcript. And you 2 2 A. I don't recall that; but that's not your -- the reviewed this before you submitted your expert 3 typical protocol here. They would sample all the 3 report; didn't you? 4 oyster bars from what I read about the A. I reviewed it. I scanned parts where I don't 5 description of the survey. You go to each of the 5 recall as much, and then there were certain other 6 different oyster bars, and you sample them to 6 parts where I read them in-depth. Yes. 7 assess whether or not they can support fishing 7 Okay. Because when you wanted to inform this 8 8 pressure. Court that there was no evidence of predation by 9 Q. All right. And I'm talking about specifically 9 rock snails, you wanted to make sure that you 10 what the Florida Department of Agriculture and 10 considered the different areas of evidence. 11 Consumer Services did according to Mr. Mark 11 Right? 12 Berrigan. Are you aware of what they did? 12 So the different hard data, yes. 13 A. Well, what I'm saying is, is that when I read the 13 All right. And you, as you explained in your 14 FDACS reports which were done by Mark --14 prefiled direct, consider contemporaneous 15 Mr. Berrigan, their goal and the goal in most 15 observation by state officials to be the types of 16 16 oyster fisheries when you have surveys, you data that marine experts consider? 17 survey all the different oyster bars to assess 17 A. Correct. 18 density at the bars. You -- how can you know if 18 **Q.** Correct? 19 there are no oysters there without surveying 19 Α. Correct. 20 20 them? Q. Let's turn to page 160. Starting at line 1, 21 21 So you have to survey them to assess how many that's where the question starts. The answer 22 22 begins on line 4 of 160. It actually runs all oysters are on the bars. 23 Q. 23 But you don't recall reading Mr. Berrigan's trial the way to page 165. 24 24 A. I'm on that page. And you want me to read -testimony --25 That --25 Α. You're welcome to read it. The part I want to THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4334 4336 **Q.** -- that's inconsistent with what you just said? 1 highlight for you, sir, is at the bottom of page 2 A. I'm sorry. I did not recall that particular 2 161 at line 13. And while we typically don't 3 sentence. And that makes no sense in terms of an 3 read documents out loud, with the Court's 4 oyster survey. 4 permission, I would like to read this short 5 5 **Q.** And when you concluded that there was no evidence excerpt. 6 6 of conch predators in Apalachicola Bay, you were Mr. Berrigan testified under oath, sir, 7 7 familiar with Mr. Berrigan's deposition quote, after I looked -- after I saw these 8 testimony, sir? 8 reports, I went back out there with a crew. And 9 A. I was familiar with very specific parts. And I 9 we started in the Miles. And we came all the way 10 should say that some refer to the rock snail --10 through for a few days. And the mortality in 11 11 it's referred to as oyster drill. It's also these outer bars was substantial, if not 100 12 referred to as conch. So you have to be pretty 12 percent. I have never seen natural mortality 13 13 clear on what you mean by conch. like that. These conchs were more abundant than 14 Q. Okay. And when you said in your direct testimony 14 you can imagine. It's almost like a science 15 15 to this Court that there was no evidence that fiction movie how many conchs there were out 16 16 there. Conch eggs. And these animals are going predation by rock snails had occurred, did you 17 17 through their entire life cycle in that inquire as to what Mr. Berrigan meant in his 18 deposition when he used the term conch? 18 environment, which is not good for oysters, 19 A. No, because I was looking at hard data on this. 19 because they will eat them. Every one. Every 20 And at the time I just did not recall that 20 21 particular part. 21 Mr. Berrigan then goes on for several other 22 22 Q. Okay. Perhaps we can refresh your recollection, pages. And if you would like to, sir, you're 23 23 sir. welcome just to read that. But my question for you is you were aware of this testimony when you 24 Α. Okay. 24 25 submitted your prefiled direct to this Court? 25 Can you turn to tab 4. Here, you will find THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

| | | I RIAL- December | 1, 201 | 0 (00 | · |
|----|----|---|--------|-------|---|
| | | 4337 | | | 4339 |
| 1 | A. | I had I had not scanned this in-depth until we | 1 | | predation caused the collapse, you didn't read |
| 2 | | had my deposition. And that's where we discussed | 2 | | the transcript; and you didn't watch the video. |
| 3 | _ | this. | 3 | | Correct? |
| 4 | Q. | , , , , , , | 4 | Α. | Not the two that you're speaking about, but I did |
| 5 | | submitted your direct testimony to this Court, | 5 | _ | read this. Yes. |
| 6 | | you were aware of this excerpt? | 6 | Q. | Okay. Well, let's look at portions of the |
| 7 | Α. | I would say that, no, when I submitted my | 7 | | transcript from Mr. Berrigan's presentation to |
| 8 | | original expert report, I hadn't looked at this | 8 | | the Apalachicola Bay community behind tab 5. |
| 9 | _ | in-depth. | 9 | Α. | Right. |
| 10 | Q. | Actually, Dr. Lipcius, I want to pause you | 10 | | May I add some context to the statement made |
| 11 | | because I think we're talking past each other. | 11 | | by Mr. Berrigan here? |
| 12 | Α. | Okay. | 12 | Q. | Dr. Lipcius, when you submitted your direct |
| 13 | Q. | The expert report that you submitted earlier in | 13 | | testimony, that was your opportunity to provide |
| 14 | | the summer in May, that's separate from your | 14 | | context. After I finish, counsel for Georgia |
| 15 | | direct testimony | 15 | | will question you |
| 16 | A. | Correct. | 16 | A. | Okay. |
| 17 | Q. | that Georgia counsel handed you. | 17 | Q. | on redirect; and you will, again, have an |
| 18 | | Correct. | 18 | | opportunity to provide context. |
| 19 | Q. | That direct testimony was submitted on | 19 | A. | Thank you. |
| 20 | | October 26. | 20 | Q. | But right now, I need you to answer my questions. |
| 21 | A. | Yes. | 21 | | Behind tab 5, sir, there's a transcript of |
| 22 | Q. | So my question, again, is when you submitted your | 22 | | Mr. Berrigan's presentation to Apalachicola Bay. |
| 23 | | direct testimony to this Court, you knew about | 23 | | That's designated as FX-875. |
| 24 | | the excerpt that I just read? | 24 | A. | Yes. |
| 25 | A. | Yes, of course. | 25 | Q. | Sir, I'll ask you to refer to page 2 and read the |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4338 | | | 4340 |
| 1 | Q. | And you also knew that Mr. Berrigan had spoken | 1 | | last paragraph that begins, the bay thrives on |
| 2 | | publicly about the oyster collapse when it | 2 | | fresh water. |
| 3 | | occurred? | 3 | | I'm sorry. You said |
| 4 | Α. | I was aware that he had spoken publicly, yes. | 4 | Q. | I'm sorry. I gave you the wrong page. |
| 5 | Q. | In fact, he had made a presentation to the | 5 | | If you go to page 2 and read the last |
| 6 | | community of Apalachicola Bay as well as the | 6 | | paragraph starting with, going into the western |
| 7 | | Board of County Commissioners in September 2012. | 7 | | portion of the Apalachicola Bay, and read the |
| 8 | | Right? | 8 | | entirety of that paragraph on this page. |
| 9 | Α. | Yes. | 9 | | I have read it. |
| 10 | Q. | , , , | 10 | Q. | And, sir, can I request that you look to page 3 |
| 11 | | a copy of that video was provided to Georgia in | 11 | | and read the paragraph at the bottom that begins, |
| 12 | _ | this litigation. Right? | 12 | _ | this bay thrives on fresh water. |
| 13 | _ | I assume so. | 13 | | I have read it. |
| 14 | Q. | You don't cite to that video in your expert | 14 | Q. | Okay. Did you see the portion that states |
| 15 | _ | report; do you? | 15 | | where Mr. Berrigan states, predation is |
| 16 | | I don't believe so. | 16 | _ | unbelievable. Do you see that? |
| 17 | Q. | And you don't cite to it in your direct | 17 | | I did. |
| 18 | _ | testimony; do you? | 18 | _ | Sir, do you know who Mr. Tommy Ward is? |
| 19 | | No, I don't. | 19 | | I do. |
| 20 | _ | Have you watched the video in its entirety, sir? | 20 | | Who is he? |
| 21 | Α. | No, I have not. | 21 | | He is an oysterman and a seafood processor. |
| 22 | _ | Have you read the transcript? | 22 | Q. | Okay. You never mention him in your direct |
| 23 | | No, I have not. | 23 | _ | testimony. Correct? |
| 24 | Q. | Okay. So before you submitted to this Court your | 24 | | I don't believe so. |
| 25 | | statements that there is no evidence that | 25 | Q. | Okay. And you never mention him in your expert |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |

| | | 4341 | 1, 2010 (10 | 4343 |
|----------|----|---|----------------|---|
| 1 | | report; do you? | 1 | Complaint in the litigation captioned State |
| 2 | A. | No, I did not. | 2 | of Alabama and State of Florida versus United |
| 3 | Q. | Okay. In fact, in your expert report when you | 3 | States Army Corps of Engineers. The case |
| 4 | | list the depositions that you read either fully | 4 | number is 90-1331 in the Northern District of |
| 5 | | or partially, you don't mention Mr. Ward's | 5 | Alabama. This complaint is ECF Docket No. |
| 6 | | deposition; did you? | 6 | 339 and was used with Mr. Hoehn. It has been |
| 7 | Α. | I don't believe so. | 7 | marked as GX-1270 and was tab No. 4 in the |
| 8 | | Okay. You know that he has private oyster leases | 8 | Hoehn cross documents binder that was handed |
| 9 | | in Apalachicola Bay? | 9 | out in court. |
| 10 | Δ | Yes, I do. | 10 | The next document we have marked as |
| 11 | | Okay. Did you know that he testified that before | 11 | GX-1271. It's titled Declaration of Theodore |
| 12 | Œ. | the oyster collapse, he witnessed a ratio of 1 | 12 | S. Hoehn Supporting State of Florida's Motion |
| 13 | | | 13 | |
| | | conch to 100 oysters on his leased oyster bars? | | For Preliminary Injunction in the same case I |
| 14 | | Did you know that? | 14 | just identified. The docket number on the |
| 15 | Α. | I'm not I don't recall that. | 15 | ECF for the Hoehn declaration is 384-1. And |
| 16 | | Of course, when you say conch, you mean rock | 16 | it was tab 5 in the Hoehn cross-examination |
| 17 | _ | snail? | 17 | binder used in court. |
| 18 | Q. | j , | 18 | The next document is GX-1280. It was a |
| 19 | | testified that the ratio flipped to 100 conchs | 19 | deposition transcript of Mr. Hoehn from the |
| 20 | | for 1 oyster? Do you recall that? | 20 | same State of Alabama and State of Florida |
| 21 | | Yes, I do believe I recall that. | 21 | versus United States Army Corps of Engineers |
| 22 | Q. | Okay. | 22 | case. The docket number for Mr. Hoehn's |
| 23 | | MR. QURESHI: Your Honor, I have a | 23 | deposition transcript was 414-1. The |
| 24 | | breaking point now. I think I have perhaps | 24 | transcript is dated February 14, 2006, and |
| 25 | | 20 minutes more. I'm happy to do whatever | 25 | was filed on the docket in the Alabama |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4342 | | 4344 |
| 1 | | you like, if we should break for lunch or if | 1 | litigation on March 10, 2006. The document |
| 2 | | we should continue. | 2 | was not in the binder, but was handed to |
| 3 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Can you give | 3 | Mr. Hoehn on the stand. |
| 4 | | me an estimate of redirect? | 4 | The next document is GX-1272. It was |
| 5 | | MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, I would | 5 | the document behind tab 7 in the Hoehn |
| 6 | | anticipate 40 minutes. | 6 | cross-examination binder. It's a July 18, |
| 7 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: We'll take a | 7 | 2006, e-mail from Ted Hoehn to Gary Warren |
| 8 | | break. | 8 | with a subject line: Swift Slough letter. |
| 9 | | MR. QURESHI: Thank you, your Honor. | 9 | That e-mail and its attachments have a |
| 10 | | (Discussion off the record.) | 10 | Bates range of FL-ACF-03671820 through |
| 11 | | MR. PRIMIS: Thank you, madam court | 11 | FL-ACF-03671829. It was behind tab 2 of the |
| 12 | | reporter. | 12 | Dr. Allan cross-examination binder. |
| 13 | | For the record, I'm just going to | 13 | GX-1273 was behind tab 8 in the Hoehn |
| 14 | | identify certain exhibits that have been used | 14 | cross-examination binder. It is captioned |
| 15 | | in the trial or exhibits that would reflect | 15 | Declaration of Theodore S. Hoehn from the |
| 16 | | the video portions that were played that were | 16 | Tri-State water rights litigation case in the |
| 17 | | not transcribed. | 17 | Middle District of Florida. The declaration |
| 18 | | With regard to certain documents that | 18 | was signed on November 1, 2007, by Mr. Hoehn |
| 19 | | were used early in the trial before our | 19 | and has Bates stamps FL-ACF-03638114 through |
| 20 | | exhibit marking convention was established, | 20 | FL-ACF-03638141. And, again, that's GX-1273. |
| 21 | | , | | TI 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 |
| | | I'm going to identify the following, I think | 21 | The next document is GX-1274. It was |
| 22 | | | 21 22 | behind tab 9 in the Hoehn cross-examination |
| 22 23 | | I'm going to identify the following, I think | | |
| | | I'm going to identify the following, I think primarily from the testimony of Mr. Hoehn and | 22 | behind tab 9 in the Hoehn cross-examination |
| 23 | | I'm going to identify the following, I think primarily from the testimony of Mr. Hoehn and perhaps Dr. Allan. | 22 23 | behind tab 9 in the Hoehn cross-examination binder. It is titled State of Florida and |
| 23 24 | | I'm going to identify the following, I think primarily from the testimony of Mr. Hoehn and perhaps Dr. Allan. There's a document titled State of | 22 23 24 | behind tab 9 in the Hoehn cross-examination binder. It is titled State of Florida and City of Apalachicola's Joint Motion and |

- 1 Summary Judgment on Phase 2 Claims filed in
- 2 the Tri-State water rights litigation case in
- 3 the Middle District of Florida. It has ECF
- 4 Docket No. 309 in the Tri-States water
- 5 litigation. It was also behind tab 7 in
- Dr. Allan's cross document binder.

7 The next document is GX-1275. It is

- behind tab 10 in the Hoehn cross-examination 8
- 9 binder. It is titled Factual Appendix in
- Support of the State of Florida and City of 10
- 11 Apalachicola's Joint Motion For Summary
- 12 Judgment on Phase 2 Claims. This document
- was also filed in the Tri-State water rights
- litigation case before the Middle District of 14
- 15 Florida and bears ECF Docket No. 310.
- So the next document is GX-1276. It was 16
- 17 behind tab 11 in the Hoehn cross-examination
- binder. It is the Declaration of Douglas E. 18
- Barr in the Tri-State water rights litigation 19
- case in the Middle District of Florida and 20
- 21 has ECF Docket No. 311-4 and was filed on
- 22 December 9, 2009, in that case.
- The next document is GX-1281. It is the 23
- 24 Supplemental Declaration of Theodore S. Hoehn
 - Supporting Florida's Motion For Preliminary

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4346

- 1 Injunction on Endangered Species Act Claims
- 2 filed in the case captioned State of Alabama
- 3 and State of Florida versus United States
- 4 Army Corps of Engineers in the Northern
- 5 District of Alabama. The document was filed
- 6 in that court on April 10, 2006, and has ECF
- 7 Docket No. 437 in that case.
- The next document is GX-1282. This 8
- 9 document is titled Joint Agreement Extending
- Time to Agree Upon an Equitable Apportionment 10
- 11 of the Surface Waters of the
- 12 Apalachicola-Chattahoochee-Flint River Basin.
- 13 It was provided to Mr. Struhs during his
- 14 cross-examination.
- 15 The next document is GX-1283. It was
- behind tab 4 in the cross-examination binder
- 17 used with Dr. Allan. It is titled Complaint
- 18 For Declaratory and Injunctive Relief in the
- 19 State of Florida versus United States Fish
- 20 and Wildlife Service, case No. 06-CV-410 in
- 21 the Northern District of Florida. The
- 22 document was filed in that court on
- 23 September 6, 2006.
- The last document from the first two 24
- 25 days of trial that we want to mark is

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- GX-1284. It was behind tab 11 in the
- cross-examination binder used with Dr. Allan.
- It is the November 11, 2008, letter from Mike
- Sole, to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
- and the Army Corps. It bears Bates No.
- FL-ACF-02427204 through 206.
- 7 The next set of documents I want to
- identify for the record are deposition 8
- 9 excerpts that reflect impeachment material
- 10 that was used in court but was played by
- video and, therefore, was not transcribed on 11
- the record. We also have created exhibits 12
- for deposition testimony that were submitted 13
- by video and will provide an exhibit number 14
- 15 for those as well.

16

We have highlighted in yellow the actual

- 17 specific questions and answers that were used
- as impeachment and will provide that to the 18
- Court as part of the exhibit set. 19

20 The first is Exhibit GX-1345. It's the

- impeachment material for Dr. Allan and 21
- 22 contains excerpts from the June 2 and June 3,
- 2016, deposition transcript of Dr. Allan that 23
- 24 were used as impeachment during his
- 25 examination.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

GX-1346 contains excerpts from the 1

- February 24, 2016, deposition transcript of
- 3 Rob Beaton, B E A T O N, that were used as
- 4 impeachment during his examination.
- 5 Exhibit GX-1347 is the impeachment from
- Dr. Glibert. This contains excerpts from the 6
- 7 June 1 and June 2, 2016, deposition
- transcript of Patricia Glibert that were used 8
- 9 as impeachment during her examination.
- 10 GX-1348 is the Greenblatt impeachment 11 and contains the excerpts from the May 19,
- 2016, deposition transcript of Marcia 12
- 13 Greenblatt that were used as impeachment
- during her examination in court. 14
- 15 Exhibit GX-1349 contains the excerpts of
- the December 1, 2015, deposition transcript 16
- 17 of Karl Havens that were played in court on
- 18 December 1.
- 19 GX-1350 is the Hoehn impeachment and
- contains the excerpts from the February 18, 20
- 21 2016, deposition transcript of Theodore Hoehn
- 22 that were used as impeachment during his
- 23 examination in court.
- GX-1351 is the Hornberger impeachment. 24
- 25 This exhibit contains excerpts from the

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Page 4345 to 4348 of 4589

4351 1 May 11, August 4, and August 5, 2016, 1 MR. PRIMIS: Yes. Our understanding is 2 2 deposition transcripts of George Hornbergerer objections are reserved to the exhibit list, 3 that were used as video impeachment during 3 and the Court will deal with those in due 4 his examination in court. course. 5 GX-1352 contains the excerpts from the 5 MR. FAWAL: Absolutely. Just so we have 6 May 24 and 25, 2016, deposition transcript of 6 the opportunity to object to new exhibits. 7 Kenneth Jenkins that was played as video 7 MR. PRIMIS: Thank you. 8 during the examination of Patricia Glibert. 8 MR. FAWAL: Thanks. 9 GX-1353 is the Kondolf impeachment and 9 (Time Noted: 12:12 p.m.) 10 contains the excerpts from the June 21, 2016, 10 (Recess Called) 11 deposition transcript of G. Mathias Kondolf 11 (Time Noted: 12:50 p.m.) 12 that were used as video impeachment during 12 MR. QURESHI: Good afternoon, your 13 his deposition. 13 Honor. 14 GX-1354 is the Leitman deposition 14 BY MR. QURESHI: 15 designations and contains the excerpts of the 15 **Q.** Good afternoon, Dr. Lipcius. 16 February 3, 2016, deposition transcript of 16 A. Good afternoon, Mr. Qureshi. 17 Steve Leitman that were played by video in 17 **Q.** Sir, I would now like to talk about the 18 court. 18 relationship between flow and oyster mortality as 19 GX-1355 is the Pine video deposition and 19 you evaluated it in your direct testimony. 20 20 contains the excerpts of the November 10, Paragraph 60 and 61 of your direct testimony 21 21 2015, deposition transcript of William Pine on page 19, sir, you conclude that there was no 22 22 that were played in court on December 1. relationship between river flow and natural 23 GX-1356 is the Sunding impeachment and 23 mortality; is that correct? 24 contains the excerpts from the June 9 and 10, 24 A. I'm sorry. You said on page -- oh, paragraph. 25 2016, deposition of -- transcript of David 25 Q. Yes, sir. Paragraph 60 and 61. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4350 4352 1 Sunding that were used as video impeachment A. Yes, sir. 2 during his examination in Court. **Q.** On page 19. 3 GX-1357 contains the excerpts of the 3 A. I'm sorry. I thought you said page. 4 video played in court from the September 6, 4 Yes. 5 2012, Franklin County Commissioner's meeting 5 Q. And your conclusion was based on your analysis of 6 where Mark Berrigan spoke. And those were 6 the same data as Dr. Pine used in the Curious 7 7 Case paper we looked at parts of earlier this the excerpts played by Georgia. 8 8 These exhibits have been provided morning? 9 electronically to Florida, and we will 9 A. Yes. 10 10 include them in the supplemental exhibit **Q.** That paper is actually behind tab 3 of your 11 binders that we intend to provide the Court 11 binder, sir. 12 when both sides finalize and clean up their 12 A. If you don't mind, I need to just make sure it's 13 13 clear what I did is I analyzed the same data, not respective exhibit lists. 14 Thank you. 14 his dataset. So I downloaded the landings data 15 MR. FAWAL: I'll just note one thing for 15 from the FWC website, and I downloaded the 16 the record that I think the parties have 16 Sumatra Gage data from the USGS website. 17 agreed to handle observations at a later time 17 Q. I understand that, sir. And, again, your 18 for any new exhibits. 18 opportunity to provide context was in your direct 19 MR. PRIMIS: Yes. 19 testimony; and you'll have another opportunity to 20 20 MR. FAWAL: But we just want the do that. I'm focused on getting answers to my 21 21 opportunity to object to some of the use of questions. 22 impeachment testimony that was used with a 22 A. That wasn't context. I was just trying to make 23 different deponent to the extent that 23 sure that I was saying the truth. 24 constitutes hearsay. 24 **Q.** It's important for you to have said the truth now 25 That's all. 25 and in your direct testimony. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4353

- 1 MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, I object.
- 2 Dr. Lipcius was simply trying to explain the
- data, and I object to the additional
- 4 commentary by counsel.
- MR. QURESHI: Your Honor, I'm ready tomove on.
- 7 BY MR. QURESHI:
- **8 Q.** Dr. Lipcius, your evaluation of the Curious Case
- **9** publication behind tab 3, did you understand at
- 10 the time you submitted your direct testimony that
- the authors of that document had not studied or
- reached any conclusions about the effect of water
- withdrawals on the Apalachicola Bay or the oyster
- 14 population? Did you know that?
- 15 A. I did.
- **16 Q.** And in particular, you were familiar with the
- 17 language on the second page in the paragraph that
- begins, note that we did not study? You had
- **19** reviewed that, sir?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. But you looked at the data that you
- described, the data from Dr. Pine, as well as the
- **23** FWC data that you downloaded; and you did make
- 24 certain conclusions. Correct?
- 25 A. I did make certain conclusions, yes.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4354

- **1 Q.** And those conclusions were that there is no
- 2 correlation between oyster landings and river
- **3** flow; is that right?
- 4 A. Correct.
- **5 Q.** And that conclusion is on paragraph 56 that's on
- 6 page 17 of your direct testimony, sir?
- 7 A. Yes.
- **8 Q.** Your testimony -- your direct testimony does not
- **9** advise the Court that there was a scholar who did
- find a correlation between landings and river
- 11 flow; that's right?
- 12 A. Correct. For a different time period.
- 13 Q. Right. And that different time period was the14 time period before the time period you looked at.
- 15 Right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And that study is behind tab 14 of your binder,
- sir. It's FX-953. And the study was the
- 19 analysis undertaken by Dr. Dara Wilber entitled
- 20 Associations Between Freshwater Inflows and
- 21 Oyster Productivity in Apalachicola Bay, Florida.
- You're familiar with this article. Right?
- 23 A. I am.
- **Q.** Okay. The article at FX-953 relies on landings
- 25 data, sir?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 A. Yes, it does.
- 2 Q. And it relies on landings data from a period of
 - time when there was voluntary reporting of
- 4 landings data. Right?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- **6 Q.** And the period of time that you examined involved
- 7 mandatory reporting of landings data. Right?
- 8 A. Correct.
- **9 Q.** And the landings data we're talking about are in
- your field generally referred to as
- **11** fishery-dependent data. Right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And fishery-dependent data is not collected by
- 14 scientists. Right?
- 15 A. Not usually. In most cases, not.
- **16 Q.** And in another portion of your direct testimony,
- you rely on another fishery-dependent metric.
 - That metric is CPUE, catch per unit effort.
- 19 Correct?

18

- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 Q. And you explained that catch per unit effort is a
- 22 measure of fishing efficiency calculated as
- oyster landings harvested per one fishing trip?
- 24 A. Correct.
- **Q.** And you agree that there are potential biases

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4356

- 1 with fishery-dependent data. Right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- **Q.** And fishery-dependent data can be influenced by
- 4 other factors such as size and bag limits, season
- **5** closures, or socioeconomic factors. Right?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. Can you please turn to tab 19 in your
- 8 binder, sir. And there you will find a document
- **9** designated as FX-951. This is an article
- 10 entitled Current and Future Trends in Fisheries
- 11 Stock Assessment and Management. It's by R.
- 12 Hilborn.
- 13 You're familiar with Ray Hilborn. Correct?
- 14 A. Very much so.
- **15 Q.** In fact, you cite some of his work in your expert
- 16 report?
- 17 A. Yes.
- **18 Q.** Can you please turn to page 979.
- 19 A. I'm there.
- 20 Q. And I want you to read to yourself the
- 21 paragraph on fishery-dependent versus
- fishery-independent data that starts on the
- bottom of 979 and continues onto page 980.
- 24 A. Okay.
- **25 Q.** When you submitted your direct testimony, were

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

3

- 1 you aware of this provision that provided that
- 2 many stock assessment biologists were suspicious
- 3 of fishery-dependent data and preferred to rely
- 4 on fishery-independent data? Were you aware of
- 5
- 6 A. Yes. Of the opinion as far as fishery-dependent 7 data as a measure of stock abundance, yes.
- 8 **Q.** And you also knew about the almost unanimous
- 9 agreement that fishery-independent data is
- 10 superior to fishery-dependent data? Were you
- 11 aware that this study found that as well?
- A. Yes. 12
- 13 Q. Can you now please turn to tab 20, FX-956. This
- 14 is an article entitled Interpreting Catch Per
- 15 Unit Effort Data to Assess the Status of
- 16 Individual Stocks and Communities.
- 17 Have you seen this article before, sir?
- A. I have. 18
- 19 Q. Okay. Do you know the author?
- 20 A. I don't know him personally, but I know of him.
- 21 **Q.** All right. Do you know any of the individuals
- 22 listed at the top as authors?
- 23 A. I know of John Sibert, but that's it. I don't 24 know them personally.
- 25 **Q.** Sir, can you please read the abstract that's on THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 I will represent to you that is what you wrote.

2 In fact, you cite JX-50 and JX-77 in your

testimony when you discussed harvesting pressure;

- is that correct?
- A. Yes, I did.
- 6 Q. Let's take a look at JX-50, the document behind
- 7 tab 6. Can you please turn to page 4, sir.
- A. Okav. 8
- 9 **Q.** I would like you to read the first paragraph to
- 10 yourself under Fishery Trends in Apalachicola
- 11 Bay.

16

24

- A. Okay. 12
- 13 Q. All right. Now, if you could kindly turn to
- 14 tab 7. This tab is JX-77. And it contains the
- 15 2012 oyster assessment report. But that appears
 - not on the -- not until the fourth page.
- 17 So if you could turn to page 3 of the 2012
- 18 oyster resource assessment report and read to
- 19 yourself the bottom of page 3 that begins, the
- 20 Dry Bar and St. Vincent Bar, and continues onto
- 21 the top of page 4.
- A. Yes. 22
- 23 Q. Okay. When you had submitted your direct
 - testimony, you were aware of these statements in
- 25 the August 2012 oyster assessment report?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4358

- 1 the first page of FX-956.
- A. Okay. 2
- 3 **Q.** Sir, when you submitted your direct testimony,
- 4 were you aware that certain scholars had
- 5 characterized CPUE, catch per unit effort, data,
- 6 as, quote, notoriously problematic? Did you know
- 7 that?
- 8 A. Yes. I would say most scholars felt that way,
- 9 including myself, to estimate abundance.
- **Q.** I would like to now talk about documents that you 10
- 11 relied on in forming your conclusions that are
- 12 behind tab 6 and 7 of your binder. These are the
- 13 2011 and 2012 oyster assessment reports. You're
- 14 familiar with these documents, sir?
- 15 A. Yes, I am.
- 16 **Q.** In fact, in your direct testimony, you explained
- 17 that the types of reports embodied in tab 6 and
- 18 7, JX-50 and JX-77, reflect contemporaneous
- 19 knowledge and they, quote, capture critical
- information that is not otherwise reflected in 20
- 21 abundance surveys. Do you recall writing that?
- 22 A. I don't recall exactly, but I trust you in that 23
- 24 **Q.** Okay. I can certainly refer you to paragraph 167 25 of your direct testimony on pages 49 and 50. But

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- A. Yes, I was.
- 2 **Q.** Now, on the next page, page 5, in a section
- 3 entitled Prolonged Drought and Elevated Salinity,
- 4 may I request that you read those -- that -- that
- 5 you read that section to yourself.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 **Q.** Sir, when you wrote in your direct testimony that
- 8 all scientific evidence proves that low river
- 9 flow did not cause the oyster collapse, you were
- 10 aware of these sections?
- 11 A. I was.
- 12 Q. Now, can you turn to the next section entitled
- 13 Natural Mortality and Predation and review that
- 14 to yourself -- read that to yourself.
- 15 A. Okay.
- 16 **Q.** Sir, in your direct testimony when you write that
- 17 there was no evidence of increased mortality due
- 18 to predation, you were aware of this section of
- 19 the August 2012 oyster assessment report? MR. ECHOLS: Objection, your Honor.
- 21 That mischaracterizes what his direct
- 22 testimony states. It states leading to the
 - collapse.
- 24 BY MR. QURESHI:
- Q. Can you answer my question?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

20

A. Sir, I would like to, if we can, refer to my 2 statement because I believe I said abnormal 3 mortality.

- **Q.** Why don't you look at the table of contents.
- A. I'm sorry?
- Q. Look at the table of contents --
- A. Yes.
- **Q.** -- of your direct testimony.
- A. Oh, sure.
- 10 **Q.** Roman numeral IID that begins on page 19, no 11 evidence of increased mortality due to predation.
- 12 Did I read that correctly, sir?
- 13 A. Okay. Yes.
- 14 **Q.** I did read it correctly?

Dr. Bill Pine.

- 15 A. You did read it correctly. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. Let's now go to tab 8. Tab 8 is an e-mail 17 that you cite portions of in your direct 18 testimony. It's designated as GX-486. And it's 19 an e-mail exchange with Dr. David Kimbro and
- 21 You're familiar with these individuals; 22 right, sir?
- 23 A. Yes.

20

Q. I would like to turn you to the e-mail on the 24 25 second page from Dr. Kimbro to Dr. Pine that's THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4362

- 1 dated Thursday, October 25, 2012, at 10:02 p.m. 2 It's a relatively short e-mail, so I would ask 3 you to read it to yourself, sir.
- 4 A. Okay.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 5 **Q.** Sir, when you write in your direct testimony that 6 there was no evidence of increased mortality due 7 to predation, you were familiar with Dr. Kimbro's 8 observations about the subtidal and intertidal 9 reefs being infested with a carnivorous snail?
- 10 A. Yes, I was aware he made that statement.
- 11 Q. Okay. Sir, now, I'm going to ask you to look at an e-mail on your screen in front of you. 12

Everyone else will have this in a binder, because it was passed out this morning. It was the Havens binder. And tab 4 in the Havens binder -- we'll put it up on the screen -- it's GX-1339.

MR. QURESHI: And the version that will be in everyone's binder will have particular language from Dr. Havens highlighted in yellow, but not all of it.

- 22 BY MR. QURESHI:
- 23 Q. And I would like to ask you to read to yourself 24 the language that's not highlighted in yellow.
- 25 So if you could scroll up a little bit, and the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 section I want you to focus on is where
- 2 Dr. Havens says, here is what I think the answer
- 3 is. And, Bill, you can correct if this is wrong.
- A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Sir, you cite to Dr. Havens's deposition
- 6 testimony; but you don't cite to this particular
- 7 e-mail. Were you aware of it?
- A. I'm not sure. 8
- 9 Q. Sir, you're based in the Virginia area and do a
- 10 lot of work in Chesapeake Bay; is that right?
- 11 A. I do.
- Q. Okay. I want to switch topics a little bit and 12
- 13 talk a little bit about that work in connection
- 14 with your opinion that all scientific evidence
- 15 proves that low river flow from the Apalachicola
- 16 River did not cause the oyster collapse in the
- 17 bay. In connection with that opinion, you write
- 18 in paragraph 30 on page 8 of your direct
- 19 testimony that there's no instance in the
- 20 scientific literature of drought-induced high
- 21 salinity in an estuary having caused a
- 22 population-wide collapse of an entire eastern
- 23 oyster fishery.
- 24 A. I'm sorry. Could you refer me to a paragraph?
- 25 Q. Sure. Paragraph 30.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4364

A. 30.

7

- **Q.** Page 8.
- A. Okay. 3
- 4 Q. Okay. And in connection with your work on the
- 5 Chesapeake Bay, have you come across the article
- 6 that's behind tab 9 and marked FX-949?
 - The title of this article is Unusual
- 8 Intensification of Chesapeake Bay Oyster Disease
- 9 During Recent Drought Conditions.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 **Q.** Can you take a moment to read the abstract to 12 vourself.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 **Q.** Okay. Sir, you were familiar with this article 15
 - when you submitted your direct testimony, sir?
- A. I was familiar with the work and probably came 16 17 across the article as well, I believe.
- 18 Q. We talked about Dr. Petes earlier today. And I
- 19 said we would come back to her, and now is the
- 20 right time. Do you know Dr. Petes?
- 21 A. Not personally, no.
- 22 Q. Okay. You're aware that she works at the -- or 23
 - she did work at the NOAA climate program office?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. Do you know what she's doing currently?

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

12

1 A. I do not.

2 **Q.** All right. So you don't know that she currently 3 works at the White House in part of the Climate

and Ecosystems Science and Technology Policy 4

- 5 Center?
- 6 A. No.

7 **Q.** You don't cite her work in your direct testimony; 8

- 9 A. I don't believe so.
- 10 **Q.** Let's look at tab 8, a document that is 11 designated as GX-4 -- I'm sorry, tab 10. I apologize, Dr. Lipcius. It's tab 10, FX-412. 12
- 13 A. Okay.

14 **Q.** This is an e-mail from NOAA personnel that contained both a memo from Dr. Petes as well as 15 16 an article that she wrote.

Let's start with the memo. And I'll ask you to turn to page 8 of the memo FX-412, and read the second to last paragraph to yourself, the one that begins however.

21 A. Okay.

17

18

19

20

- 22 **Q.** So when you wrote in your direct testimony that 23 all scientific evidence proves that low river 24 flow did not cause the oyster collapse, you were
- 25 aware of Dr. Petes's memo?

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4366

1 A. Yes.

Q. And if you advance several pages on FX-412, you

will see Dr. Petes's article entitled Impacts of 3

Upstream Drought and Water Withdrawals on the 4

5 Health and Survival of Downstream Estuarine

Oyster Populations. You have seen this before; 6

- haven't you?
- 8 A. Yes, I have.
- 9 **Q.** And so, again, when you wrote in your direct
- 10 testimony that all scientific evidence proves 11 that low river flow did not cause the oyster
- 12 collapse, you were aware of Dr. Petes's article?
- 13 A. Yes.

7

- 14 **Q.** Let's look at another article that we looked 15 at -- we saw a videotape about earlier today. 16 That's behind tab 13. Are you there?
- 17 A. Yes.
- **Q.** Okay. This is an article designated as JX-167 18 19 and entitled Collapse of a historic oyster 20 fishery: Diagnosing causes and identifying paths 21 toward increased resilience.

22 Now, you cited this document in your expert 23 report, but it's not cited in your direct

24 testimony? A. Correct.

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Q. And you had reviewed the entirety of this article

2 before submitting your direct testimony?

A. Yes, I had. 3

4 **Q.** Okay. One of the parts of the article that was 5 not displayed on the screen this morning was on 6 page 6 underneath the discussion section. It's 7 the first paragraph under the section that is 8 titled Changes in Stressors to the Apalachicola

9 Bay System.

10 Can you take a moment to read that to 11 yourself. If you're familiar with it, I can just

- ask the question. A. I'm familiar with it, yes. 13
- **Q.** So when you wrote in your direct testimony that 14 15 all scientific evidence proves that low river 16 flow did not cause the oyster collapse, you were 17 aware of this article?
- A. Very much. 18
- 19 **Q.** Okay. Now, this article actually references 20 other studies as well on page 6, further down 21 from the paragraph I asked you to look at; isn't 22 that right?
- 23 A. It does reference other publications, yes.
- 24 **Q.** And one of those publications is a publication by 25 Dr. Petes in 2012?

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4368

1 A. Yes.

Q. And it references a study by Menzel in 1966,

3 which the article explains documented increased

4 abundance of oyster predators on higher salinity

5 bars in Apalachicola Bay during drought

conditions, 1955 through 1957. Right? 6

- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 **Q.** And there's a reference to a 1997 Livingston 9 study discussing noted widespread changes in 10 trophic structure in Apalachicola Bay resulting 11 from low river flow.

12 Now, trophic structure means feeding and 13 nutrition, sir?

- A. No. It means the food web basically. The 14 15 different levels in the food web, that's the 16 trophic structure.
- 17 Q. Okay. And there's also references to the 18 Livingston studies in 2002 and 2015 that discuss 19 reductions of freshwater flow. Correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 **Q.** And, again, when you wrote your direct testimony 22 and stated that all scientific evidence proves

23 that low river flow did not cause the collapse,

- 24 you were aware of all of these?
- 25 A. Very much.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

| | | TRIAL- December | 1, 201 | 0 (.0 | I. XVII) Florida v. Georgi |
|--|----------------|---|--|-------------------------|---|
| | | 4369 | | | 4371 |
| 1 | Q. | Sir, are you familiar with the Magnuson-Stevens | 1 | | observations that excess harvesting in |
| 2 | | Fishery Conservation and Management Act? | 2 | | Apalachicola Bay caused that fishery to collapse. |
| 3 | Α. | Yes. | 3 | | Right? |
| 4 | | Are you also familiar with the | 4 | Δ | Yes. |
| | Œ. | | | _ | |
| 5 | | InterJurisdictional Fisheries Act? | 5 | Q. | Okay. And if you turn to the second page of the |
| 6 | | Yes. | 6 | | e-mail, you will see a reference to Chaires |
| 7 | Q. | And so you know that the requirements | 7 | _ | Creek. Right? |
| 8 | | necessary to receive federal disaster funds for a | 8 | | Yes. |
| 9 | | commercial fishery, you're familiar with those | 9 | Q. | And in this e-mail, which is from Harvey Kent at |
| 10 | | requirements? | 10 | | Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation |
| 11 | Α. | Yes. | 11 | | Commission, to a gentleman named Captain Rob |
| 12 | Q. | And you're aware that the State of Florida did in | 12 | | Beaton, there is a complaint about night |
| 13 | | fact receive federal disaster funds for the | 13 | | oystering arrests. Right? |
| 14 | | disaster in 2012? | 14 | A. | Yes. |
| 15 | A. | Yes, I am. | 15 | Q. | And, sir, when you cited this in your direct |
| 16 | Q. | Okay. Please turn with me to I think it's | 16 | | testimony, you knew that Chaires Creek was not in |
| 17 | | tab tab 12, sir, the document designated as | 17 | | Apalachicola Bay. Right? |
| 18 | | FX-413. | 18 | Α. | Yes. |
| 19 | Α. | Okay. | 19 | | It was in Ochlockonee Bay, not Apalachicola? |
| 20 | _ | And you will see that there's an e-mail in the | 20 | | Right. |
| 21 | ۷. | first couple of pages; but then on I think | 21 | ۸. | MR. QURESHI: I have nothing further, |
| 22 | | | 22 | | |
| | | it's the fourth page you get to a NOAA memo. | | | your Honor. |
| 23 | | Have you seen this memo before, sir? | 23 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. |
| 24 | | Yes. | 24 | | Redirect? |
| 25 | Q. | Okay. I'll ask you to read to yourself, sir, the | 25 | | MR. ECHOLS: May I proceed, your Honor? |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 1072 | | | |
| | | 4370 | | | 4372 |
| 1 | | 4370 paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 | 1 | | 4372 REDIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 1 2 | | | 1 2 | BY I | |
| | Α. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 | | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 2 | _ | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. | 2 | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: |
| 2 | _ | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. | 2 | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense |
| 2 3 4 | _ | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct | 2 3 4 | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related |
| 2 3 4 5 | _ | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low | 2 3 4 5 | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 | Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 | Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. A. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | A. Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | A. Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. Certainly. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. Okay. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | A. Q. A. Q. A. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. Certainly. Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. Okay. The second paragraph, if you would take a look, |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | A. Q. A. Q. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. Certainly. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. Okay. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | A. Q. A. Q. A. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. Certainly. Yes. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. Okay. The second paragraph, if you would take a look, |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | A. Q. A. Q. A. | paragraph on the second paragraph on page 3 that begins with, the DACS report acknowledges. Yes. Okay. And when you wrote in your direct testimony that all scientific evidence proves low river flow did not cause the collapse, you were aware of this particular statement in this study? Yes. Sir, the last thing I want to cover with you relates to opinions you make about overharvesting. You, in your direct testimony, point to specific contemporaneous documents that you believe reveal observations that harvest caused the Apalachicola Bay fisheries to collapse in 2012; is that right? Okay. Yes. Can you please turn to tab 15. There is a document that's designated as GX-459. And it's an e-mail. Do you recognize this e-mail, sir? If I could just take a quick look at it. Certainly. Yes. Okay. And you cite this e-mail in your direct | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. | REDIRECT EXAMINATION MR. ECHOLS: Professor Lipcius, I would just like to dispense with a couple of things right off the bat related to counsel for Florida's questioning. Now, there was as lot of discussion of the conch. Do you recall questions relating to conchs? Yes. And that what is another name for conch, as far as the type of species that is referenced? Another name for conch is commonly used to refer to rock snail. And is that also used to refer to oyster drill? Yes. And when you actually, if we could look at tab 7 of your binder that counsel provided you, JX-77. Okay. And if I could direct you, please, sir, back to the August 2012 DACS report on page 6. This is a page that counsel asked you some questions about. Okay. The second paragraph, if you would take a look, do you see at the end of that paragraph |

4373 4375 1 snails, open paren, oyster drills? 1 outer portions of the bay at the Miles and 2 2 Α. proceeding inward. Do you recall that? 3 **Q.** Are those also, as you testified a moment ago, 3 A. Yes, I do. Q. And you had wanted to explain what your 4 commonly known as conchs? 4 5 A. Yes. 5 understanding of that testimony was to which you 6 **Q.** And if you go down further to the bottom 6 had already explained once to counsel for Florida 7 paragraph there, there is a sentence that begins, 7 in your deposition, but didn't have the 8 observations and sampling confirm the presence 8 opportunity to. Would you please explain to the 9 and abundance of the Florida rock snail. 9 Court what Mr. Berrigan was referring to there to 10 And it has the Latin name for the species. 10 your understanding. 11 Do you see that? 11 If you could just rephrase that question, please. 12 A. Yes. 12 Q. Sure. Do you recall the testimony that you were 13 **Q.** And that also is commonly known as a conch? 13 referred to by Mr. Berrigan about the conchs 14 A. That's correct. 14 coming in from out at the Miles and proceeding 15 Q. When Mr. Berrigan was testifying about the 15 inward --16 A. Right. 16 prevalence of conchs, did you understand him to 17 be referring to oyster drills, these rock snails? 17 Q. -- in great abundances? A. Yes. 18 18 And you had intended to explain, you know, 19 Q. When Mr. Ward was testifying as to the prevalence 19 what that meant based on your understanding of 20 20 of conchs, did you similarly understand him to be the environmental circumstances and the predators 21 21 referring to the presence of oyster drills or at that point. 22 22 rock snails? A. Right. So there are actually two parts to that. 23 A. Yes. Because he also showed pictures of the 23 One is the fact that the Miles are very close to the entrance to Apalachicola Bay from the west, 24 24 oyster drill. 25 Q. And -- exactly. And Florida's expert -- oyster 25 from the Gulf of Mexico. So that's where you THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4374 4376 1 expert in this case, Dr. Kimbro, when he pointed 1 have the highest salinities. That's where you 2 2 to what he claimed was the primary predator in would expect localized increases in the abundance 3 Apalachicola Bay of oysters, what species was 3 of rock snails and relatively high mortality at that? 4 1 times. 5 5 A. That was the rock snail. The other reference pertains to the fact that **Q.** And similarly Dr. White, the other oyster expert 6 6 Mr. Berrigan was talking about the depletion of 7 for the State of Florida who did a model, the IPM 7 oyster reefs, of the oyster bars. And the way 8 model, what was the species that Dr. White used 8 that I understood his testimony or deposition 9 as the indicator of predation in his model? 9 statements is that the fishery had depleted the 10 A. It was the rock snail as well. 10 oyster bars to the degree where there were very 11 **Q.** So would it be accurate to suggest in any respect 11 few oysters, very little structure out there. 12 12 It's almost like having a football field that's that there's some other conch species out there 13 13 that you entirely ignored from your analysis -just flat. And then you have very few oysters; 14 A. No. 14 and then -- then you would have the rock snails 15 Q. -- as far as being the predator that was 15 that are killing what few oysters remain after 16 referenced in Apalachicola Bay? 16 the intensive harvest. 17 A. No. 17 **Q.** And is that consistent, sir, with your conclusion 18 **Q.** In fact, it would be fairly quite misleading to 18 that overharvesting, unsustainable harvesting was 19 leave the Court with that impression, would it 19 the cause of the collapse? 20 not, based on everything you know about the 20 Yes, it is. 21 21 record? All right. I would like to just flip now back to 22 22 A. That's correct. the beginning here. Could you please tell the 23 23 **Q.** At one point in your cross-examination there was Court where you currently work. 24 24 I'm at the Virginia Institute of Marine Science a reference to some testimony by Mr. Berrigan 25 where he describes the conchs coming in from the 25 of the College of William & Mary. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4377 Q. And what position do you hold there? Order to restore 20 tributaries -- restore the 2 2 A. I'm a professor of marine science. eastern oyster in 20 tributaries in the bay by **Q.** And does that include marine ecology? 3 2020. A. Yes. We have made some great strides in that Q. Could you explain to the Court, please, what regard. My role has been to conduct scientific 6 marine ecology is. 6 studies to support the restoration effort as well 7 A. So marine ecology deals with -- in marine 7 as to advise federal, state, and nongovernmental 8 systems, the relationships between the 8 agencies such as the Nature Conservancy on 9 environment and species. That's in the broadest 9 restoration efforts. 10 10 Q. And how has that restoration effort been 11 And in the broadest sense, the environment 11 proceeding? 12 means all elements of the environment, whether it 12 Α. We are now at a point where we feel that we're 13 includes anthropogenic, human cause factors, or 13 on the cusp of restoring the Chesapeake Bay's 14 natural factors. 14 oyster population. In one of the tributaries --15 **Q.** And what types of species would be included in 15 it's called the Great Wicomico River -- we 16 the category of marine ecology that you 16 initiated -- we, I mean federal agencies, state, 17 specialize? 17 and the like, initiated a restoration effort that 18 A. The species would include things like crabs, 18 led to the most successful oyster -- native 19 lobsters, marine fish, oysters, clams, queen 19 oyster restoration anywhere in the world. We 20 20 were able to restore 200 million -- a population conch, and the like. 21 21 **Q.** And, sir, are you also a professor in fisheries of about 200 million oysters by a major 22 22 restoration effort, meaning reshell, shelling management? 23 23 A. I'm formerly a professor in marine science; but the prime oyster bars in good locations. And 24 24 one of my specializations is fishery management. that -- and I have been monitoring that effort 25 25 Q. And would you please explain to the Court what since 2006. And it remains as a successful THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4378 4380 1 fishery management is. 1 restoration effort except for in a couple places 2 A. So fishery management is simply the management of 2 where the oyster reefs have been poached. But, 3 3 exploited or harvested species, how to manage otherwise, it remains as really the gold standard 4 them. Generally you want to manage them so that 4 in my view of oyster restoration. 5 5 Q. And overall, sir, how long have you personally they're sustainably harvested over the long term. 6 Q. And would that also include management of an 6 been studying and working with respect to issues 7 7 oyster fishery? related to the eastern oyster? 8 A. Of course. 8 A. I actually initiated that when I was at Florida 9 Q. Now you, sir, have done work related to the 9 State University pursuing my Ph.D. and off and 10 10 on, but since 2004 that's been a major focus of Chesapeake Bay; is that correct? 11 11 A. Extensively, yes. my research. 12 12 Q. Q. And is it the case that the Chesapeake Bay oyster And you received your Ph.D. in what year? 13 13 fishery experienced a collapse? Α. 1984. 14 A. Yes. It has. 14 **Q.** I'm sorry. So this is over three decades now? 15 **Q.** Would you please describe for the Court what your 15 Α. Yes. 16 involvement has been with respect to the 16 Q. Let's turn to the conclusion that you were asked 17 restoration of the Chesapeake Bay oyster fishery. 17 about. And as a -- you have in your written 18 A. Well, as the Court may not know, the Chesapeake 18 direct testimony that low flows did not cause the 19 Bay oyster fishery basically collapsed in the 19 2012 Apalachicola Bay oyster collapse. Now, sir, 20 early to mid-1900's. It is now at about 1 20 did low flows cause the collapse? 21 percent of its historical abundance. And there 21 Α. No. Most definitely not. 22 are major efforts underway to restore the eastern 22 Q. I would like to walk briefly through a couple of 23 23 oyster population, the native oyster in the the analyses that you did to explain to the Court 24 24 Chesapeake Bay. how you reached that determination. And if I 25 In fact, President Obama signed an Executive 25 could refer in your written direct, please -- and THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

the Court -- to page 12 of the written direct
 testimony. And there is a demonstrative number 3
 there.

And, now, you were here when Dr. White, the expert for the State of Florida, testified; were you not?

7 A. Yes, I was.

4

5

6

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

8 Q. And so you probably recall that I put this up on
9 the screen and asked him some questions about it.
10 Does this reflect one of the analyses you did to
11 reach the conclusion that low flows did not cause
12 the collapse of the oyster fishery?

13 A. Yes, it was.

14 Q. Would you please explain to the Court what is the
15 analysis that you conducted underlying this
16 demonstrative and how it supports your
17 conclusion.

A. Certainly. So the approach I took was a basic scientific method, which is that you pose alternative hypotheses. It's not unlike the causal analysis that was referred to earlier by Dr. Menzie. Effectively what you do is you set up multiple working hypotheses, positions about the cause. And then from each of those, predictions stem. And you assess whether or not

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4382

the available evidence, the data, supports them. And it allows you then to go one by one to the different hypotheses, whether it's low flow, predation, overharvest, and so on.

And so one of the key predictions from the hypothesis that low flow and high salinity caused high predation or triggered high predation and/or disease is that you would have a bay-wide decline. And so what I did is I looked at the fishery-independent data provided by FDACS to the State of Florida's main survey agency. And I looked at the bars that were heavily fished. And those are indicated in red in this particular graph. And I looked at the bars that were lightly fished or were -- had been reshelled. And I looked at two periods. I looked at the time period from 2008 through 2012 as prior to the collapse, and the time period from October 2012 to August 2014 as the period after the collapse.

And what I would have expected to see across these nine bars is I would have expected to see the same pattern; that is, a major decline in abundance of oysters on all the oyster bars.

As an aside, I need to add that these were

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

not arbitrarily selected. I selected the bars that had the data available to perform an analysis on the heavily-fished and on the lightly-fished bars. And that's why the time periods were selected and why those bars were

As you can see, for each of the graphs that you see there, either in red or blue, the bar on the left is what was the oyster abundance on the bar prior to the collapse. And the bar on the right is what was there after the collapse.

12 Q. I just want to make sure that we keep the Court
13 with us here. So is it correct then what you
14 were referring to here is we have East Hole, for
15 instance, which is in red. And that's one of the
16 more commercially-harvested bars; is that right?

17 A. That's correct.

selected.

18 Q. And so then this bar on the left-hand side that
19 says pre, this is a measure of the abundance
20 before the collapse took place?

21 A. Correct.

Q. And then the smaller bar shows that there werefewer oysters after the collapse; is that right?

24 A. That's correct.

Q. Then, similarly, we have got another oyster bar THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1. here, Hotel, in blue, which is relatively close

to East Hole. And this is one of the, you said,

3 lightly harvested or reshelled bars?

4 A. Yes.

Q. And then if you just explain to the Court then
why is there -- what the contrast is here with
the pre and the post, how that relates to your
conclusion.

9 A. Okay. So as I said, what I expected to see, had
10 there been a bay-wide collapse due to low river
11 flow and high salinity and predation, all those
12 bars should have looked like the red bars; but
13 they didn't. The five that were lightly fished
14 or reshelled didn't show that. In fact, some of
15 them actually increased in abundance.

So this is the legal-size oysters. I saw exactly the same pattern for sub-legal-size oysters.

And one of the interesting points about this, a point that was raised by Dr. White and Dr. Kimbro, they felt that there may be a confounding factor; that is, that maybe there were different environmental conditions at the red bars than the blue bars, and in particular, salinity. And that's not the case. I did the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4385 4387 1 statistical analyses of it, and there is no 1 landings until about two years later. 2 2 relationship between salinity and the change in So what I did is I conducted a number of 3 abundance. 3 different analyses, different time lags, 4 And, in fact, Hotel Bar has probably the different time periods of flow. And they all --5 highest salinity of any of the bars there. And 5 all came up with the same result, whether it's 6 Hotel Bar is the one on the lower right; it's one 6 average annual flow or any of the other 7 of the blue ones. And as you can see, that 7 variables, that there is absolutely no 8 actually showed an increase in abundance. 8 statistical relationship between river flow and 9 So, to me, this was fully inconsistent with 9 landings. 10 the position that low river flow, high salinity, 10 And I did this because Dr. Pine had conducted 11 and predation or disease caused bay-wide decline, 11 a similar analysis; and I wanted to validate for 12 bay-wide collapse of the oyster population. This 12 myself with the data that there was no 13 data alone allows me to reject that absolutely. 13 relationship -- no relationship between landings 14 Q. And, Professor, is this data that you used for 14 and river flow. 15 that analysis fishery-dependent or 15 Q. Now, Professor Lipcius, this covers the entire 16 16 fishery-independent data? period from 1986 through 2014. But even if you 17 A. This is fishery-independent data. So this is 17 were to look only at, say, 2002 to 2014, would it 18 18 data collected by Mr. Berrigan and the staff at still be your conclusion that there is not a 19 FDACS. 19 correlation relationship between the river flow 20 20 Q. I would like to turn to another analysis that you and landings? 21 21 A. There would be, because the data were so did that relied on fishery-dependent data. If I 22 22 could refer you and the Court, please, in your uncorrelated that it pertains to the full time 23 23 written direct to page 18. And there is a period or subsets of it. 24 24 Q. demonstrative No. 6 there. Changing topics then, sir, so now you conducted 25 25 Are you there, sir? your analysis and concluded that low river flows THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4386 4388 A. Yes. 1 did not cause the collapse. Were you able to 2 2 Q. Okay. And, now, this demonstrative refers to reach a conclusion to a reasonable degree of 3 3 annual oyster landings and mean daily river flow. scientific certainty with respect to what did 4 Oyster landings there, is that fishery-dependent 4 cause the collapse of the fishery? A. Yes. I certainly did. And it's what has caused 5 5 or independent data? 6 6 A. That is fishery-dependent data. That is the data collapse in oyster fisheries across the country, 7 actually collected and downloaded by me from that 7 throughout the Atlantic coast, and worldwide as 8 8 FWC website. to native oysters; and that is that it was 9 Q. Could you explain to the Court, please, what is 9 unsustainable harvest, which includes both 10 10 harvest of the live animals as well as a lack of the analysis that you did here that led then to 11 11 your conclusion that there -- that low flows did or degradation of the habitat, the resource, the 12 12 substrate, or shell that oysters require. not cause the oyster collapse? 13 13 A. Well, one of the other potential predictions from And that's because, if I could just go --14 the position that low flow and high salinity 14 oysters are unique in that in order to manage 15 caused the collapse would be that there would be 15 them correctly, that you have to consider both 16 some relationship -- some statistical 16 the live animal as well as the habitat, the shell 17 relationship between flow, as indicated in the 17 resource on which it lives. 18 blue line. And that's fishery-independent data 18 Q. And is one set of the data that you looked at 19 from the USGS Sumatra Gage -- that there would be 19 to reach the conclusion there was unsustainable 20 some relationship between flow and landings. And 20 harvest, the landings data we referred to 21 it could be at a time period, a lag of one, two, 21 before? 22 22 A. Yes. It was. three years. 23 23 What that simply means is that the flow in a MR. ECHOLS: And I would like to -- we

given year, if it were to affect the spat, their survival, then you wouldn't see that in the

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

24

25

hand out, if the Court would permit. THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

have got some demonstratives I would like to

24

4389 4391 BY MR. ECHOLS: 1 harvest. And that's because you need to put back 2 2 Q. Now, Professor Lipcius, what I have put up here some of the habitat that you have extracted by 3 and provided to you as demonstrative No. 1, this 3 taking out all the live animals. 4 is a chart that the Court has seen a number of And to sort of set a reference for the blue 5 times before that we used with the Florida bars, the amount of reshelling that was done 6 witnesses, which sets out the official FWC oyster 6 after the collapse of the oyster fishery after 7 landings over the period of time from 1988 to 7 Hurricane Elena was between 200 and, I believe, 8 8 over almost 400 acres; whereas here, immediately 2015. What, if any, information can you draw or 9 did you draw from this landings data that relates 9 prior to and during the collapse, it was a fairly 10 to your conclusion that it was unsustainable 10 small, 35 acres you see for 2012, 16 acres for 11 harvest? 11 2013. 12 A. Well, one of the elements of my analysis was to 12 So it was in my view from the contemporary 13 examine fishing pressure on the resource. And 13 record, a negligible amount of reshelling when 14 one of the measures of fishing pressure is, of 14 you're extracting so much of the live animals 15 course, landings. There are other measures such 15 and, therefore, the habitat, the shell. 16 Q. Now, if we could turn to the next demonstrative, 16 as effort, such as the number of trips taken, and 17 so on. 17 Professor Lipcius, you asked if we could provide 18 And what I noted is that the landings in 18 the Court something other than a bar or line 19 2012, 2011 were the highest on record since the 19 graph. And, therefore, I have selected these two 20 20 contemporary reporting -- mandatory reporting photographs here of a live and shell. Would you 21 21 period. And this indicated to me that there was please explain why did you want the Court to see 22 22 massive extraction of the live organisms as well this? 23 23 as the shell from those organisms in that time A. Yes. So -- you know, when you see bar graphs, 24 24 frame. line graphs, or so on, for technical folks, like 25 **Q.** And you had mentioned that the other side of 25 myself, those are adequate. But I think for your THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4390 4392 1 unsustainable harvest is not only the removal of 1 Honor and for the audience to really grasp what's 2 the oysters, but also the need to reshell; is 2 going on, you want to actually see it. 3 3 that correct? So on the left side is a live large mature 4 A. That's correct. 4 oyster, well over legal-size. You can't see it, 5 5 **Q.** If we could look at the next demonstrative, what however, because it's covered by spat. So that's 6 we have done there is we have just combined two 6 the natural state of things. You have live 7 7 demonstratives that the Court has seen organisms, live oysters. They serve as habitat, 8 previously. So on the landings side, we turned 8 as the home, for the spat. 9 9 this into a line. And then we have the shelling And in fact, on that one single live oyster 10 10 information from before, which is an exhibit there are probably around 10 spat or so. 11 11 that's been used multiple times. **Q.** And the spat are baby oysters? 12 12 Would you please explain to the Court what is A. The spat are baby oysters. 13 13 the significance, if any, of the relationship On the right side, you have a shell. So no 14 between the shell planting and the landings 14 longer a live oyster, just one-half of the oyster 15 15 during this period? shell. And, similarly, you see on that -- and 16 A. Okay. So, first of all, just to orient you, the 16 you can see it's on someone's hand. It gives you 17 landings is on the right Y axis, vertical axis; 17 a sense of size. You can also see there are 18 and that's the red line. The landings is just 18 about 10 or more spat there. 19 what was just previously shown, 2.81 million, 19 So when you remove those live oysters on the 20 3.04 million. So that's the harvest rate. 20 left, you have to put back the substrate, the 21 And the blue bars indicate the level of 21 reshelling, and sufficiently to provide a home, 22 reshelling. That's an activity that's been 22 to provide habitat for the baby oysters. 23 23 conducted for more than a century. It's Otherwise they swim in the currents and are lost 24 recognized by all oyster fisheries and management 24 in the system or die. They only have a week's 25 agencies and such as a requisite for sustainable 25 window when they can actually find habitat and THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4395 1 settle. If they don't settle on that habitat, if 1 population abundance on the bars was not 2 2 they don't do that in that time period, they're increasing. So what this meant is that the CPUE 3 gone. They're dead. 3 drop was happening because there was equal Q. I would like to turn back to your written direct, abundance of oysters; but the effort, the if we could, please. pressure on the oyster resource had increased 6 MR. ECHOLS: And I direct the Court up 6 significantly. 7 to page 36, the demonstrative No. 12. 7 And, again, as I mentioned, this alone is a 8 BY MR. ECHOLS: 8 caution; it's a symptom that there may be a 9 Q. Okay. Are you there, sir? 9 collapse underway. This has happened with many 10 A. Yes. 10 fisheries that have collapsed. You see this 11 Q. Now, this, sir, this demonstrative No. 12, is 11 decline in CPUE. 12 this another part of the analysis you conducted 12 And I need to also address the fact that this 13 to determine that there was unsustainable harvest 13 is how I used it. I used it as a measure of 14 leading to the collapse of the oyster fishery? 14 fishing performance, fishing effort, not of 15 A. Yes, it is. 15 population abundance. 16 16 **Q.** And just a moment or so ago, Mr. Qureshi **Q.** And in laymen's terms, so a trip is -- correct me 17 17 mentioned CPUE, which is referenced here. if this is wrong -- is the oysterman going out on 18 18 A. Correct. their boat to harvest that particular day? 19 **Q.** Would you please explain to the Court what this 19 A. One day's fishing trip, yes. 20 20 **Q.** And if the CPUE is going down, there are more analysis consisted of? 21 21 A. Okay. So as I mentioned before, we use in trips, but fewer oysters per trip being 22 22 harvested? fishery management these two types of data. We 23 23 use the fishery-dependent; that is, landings data A. That's correct. 24 and the like. Fishery-independent data, surveys. 24 **Q.** And, now, there is another analysis you did on 25 25 This is fishery-dependent data. And on the the topic -- a subject called exploitation rate? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4394 4396 1 left side, and which is the bars, those -- that's A. Yes. 2 the number of fishing trips. That's a measure of Q. If we could turn in your written direct to 3 the effort exerted by the fishery. The other 3 page 37, the next page, would you explain to the 4 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

measure, of course, is the landings. The CPUE is simply the landings divided by the number of fishing trips. And we use this as a measure of fishing effort and fishing -- actually fishing performance or efficiency.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And what it shows you is that starting at around 2009, there was decline in CPUE. If you look at that purplish rectangle and you look at the CPUE, you look; and it had dropped below the levels last seen since 1992. And it continued to drop.

This is a warning sign. This is a clear warning sign for fishery management that you need to examine this much more carefully. What's going on with CPUE? Why is it that you're getting such a lower catch? Is it because the population is lower, and you had the same number of fishers; or is it because you have the same population abundance, but fishing effort has increased dramatically?

And so what we -- what I got from this is two things. No. 1, the fishing -- sorry. The

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

Court, please, what is exploitation rate.

A. Okay. So in fishery management, in stock assessment, we have what are called reference points, meaning these are the measures that we use to assess the status of the fishery. And there are two key ones. One is abundance or biomass; how much oysters are out there as you can detect from population surveys. The second one is what fraction of the population is being taken out by the fishery. And this is what this is.

Annual exploitation rate simply says that it's on a scale from zero to one. And, for instance, if you look at the horizontal dotted line, that's almost at .4. And what that is saying is if the exploitation rate is .4, that means that every year the fishery is taking out 40 percent of all the oysters out there.

So, again, it's a measure of the effort and the landings that are being brought back and the mortality due to the fishery.

So I analyzed this to see had the

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4399 1 exploitation rate remained constant or so. And 1 the fishery collapsed. Most of the oysters were 2 2 what I did was I looked at Dr. Pine's -- I used killed either because of too much fresh water, 3 Dr. Pine's data from this; and I calculated the 3 low salinity -- they're called freshets in the 4 annual exploit -- he had monthly exploitation oyster literature -- or siltation, basically just 5 rates. I calculated the annual exploitation covering the oysters. And so the fishery 6 rates from those. And that's what you see 6 collapsed. And the response of the State of 7 graphed here. 7 Florida was quite effective. They reshelled, as 8 8 I said, at record levels. They imposed Now, the exploitation rates, again, were at 9 the highest level; so the fraction that's being 9 management actions, restrictions. And so with those two items, that allowed the 10 extracted is at the highest levels. And it's at 10 11 a time, especially in 2012-2013, when the 11 oyster population to basically recover from the 12 population is down. So what that means is that 12 resource and have the sufficient habitat for the 13 they're taking out a higher fraction of the 13 spat to settle on. 14 oysters just when the population is in decline. 14 Q. Do you have an opinion, sir, whether the oyster 15 And that is definitely one of the elements of 15 fishery would have recovered more by today, by 16 16 extraction that -- of the population that can 2016, had the levels of reshelling been done at 17 lead to collapse. 17 the same amount as Hurricane Elena, if in 2013 18 **Q.** What, if any, relationship does the need for 18 and 2014 Florida had reshelled to that extent? 19 reshelling have to do with exploitation rate? 19 Α. Most definitely. I'm convinced that given what 20 20 A. Well, as I mentioned, what -- to maintain a we have seen in other oyster fisheries, that's 21 21 sustainable fishery, if you're taking out more exactly what happened in the Great Wicomico River 22 22 that I mentioned. We didn't put out live oysters, more of those live animals that provide 23 23 substrate for the spat, you have to put back oysters. All we did was reshell on that system. more. So you have to reshell at higher levels. 24 24 And there were sources of larvae; that is, the 25 And the problem is -- and that's actually what 25 spat that settled on there in record numbers. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4398 4400 1 the State of Florida did, as I believe you will 1 And they just needed the substrate. 2 see in a bit, after Hurricane Elena. They 2 Same thing here. There are sources of 3 3 reshelled at record levels, and the population larvae, sources of the spat, the baby oysters, 4 recovered. just like we see after Hurricane Elena. So had 5 5 Here, in contrast, they were extracting at there been sufficient substrate and effective 6 record levels, but reshelling at some of the 6 management actions, there clearly would have 7 7 lowest levels in the record. been, I think, an almost immediate recovery in 8 **Q.** Let's actually turn to that so that the Court can 8 2014 and '15 because oysters are fecund. That 9 9 look at the specific numbers. is, they put out a lot, a lot of larvae. And one 10 10 oyster can release a couple million larvae, a MR. ECHOLS: If we go to the 11 11 single oyster. demonstratives, your Honor. And this would 12 be demonstrative -- is it 5 -- 4, 12 And they are out there. They're looking for 13 13 demonstrative 4. the habitat. When you don't have it, that's it. 14 BY MR. ECHOLS: 14 You're going to collapse. 15 Q. And here, we have graphed your -- based on the 15 **Q.** You mentioned a couple of other management 16 joint exhibits of the states, the amount of 16 actions that the State of Florida took after 17 reshelling that was done by the State of Florida 17 Hurricane Elena. 18 during this period. 18 MR. ECHOLS: If we could have the next 19 And would you explain to the Court what you 19 demonstrative, please. 20 were just referring to there with the 20 BY MR. ECHOLS: 21 post-Hurricane Elena reshelling activity? 21 **Q.** You already touched on the habitat restoration. 22 22 A. Sure. What I was referring to is that this is a But would you mind just briefly describing for 23 23 really good example of an effective response to the Court what these other management actions 24 a -- in this case a natural disturbance. And 24 25 after the passage of Hurricane Elena, basically 25 Right. So they actually covered three of the key THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4403 1 parts. If you look at Hurricane Elena, the first 1 were during the collapse? 2 part, it prohibited all harvesting in the bay for 2 Α. Well, it's -- in my view, it's quite unfortunate. 3 eight months. They were allowing it to sort of 3 MR. ECHOLS: If we can put up the next 4 refresh itself. demonstrative here, that may assist. They added the habitat; that's in the second 5 A. So this is a -- a view -- a map of the bay. And 6 part. They reshelled, as I said, at record 6 Tommy Ward's leases are in that westernmost part 7 levels, 345 and 220 acres. 7 of the bay. You have them circled in red. And 8 Thirdly, they also wanted to make sure that 8 they're only about, I believe, four leases; and 9 people weren't harvesting illegally. So they 9 they're all in that area. In other oyster 10 established check stations to monitor and ensure 10 fisheries, you have leases throughout the system. 11 compliance. And this is essential, because 11 But, in any case, as I mentioned earlier, 12 worldwide, one of the biggest problems to manage 12 the -- that part of Apalachicola Bay is -- has 13 oysters is, in fact, illegal activity. And, of 13 some of the highest salinities. And so what I 14 course, they prohibited all sub-legal oyster 14 would expect is that -- as I mentioned, you 15 harvest. 15 expect localized mortality in certain places. 16 And contrast that to what happened after 16 And if I were to predict where you're going to 17 the -- during and after the 2012-'13 collapse, 17 have the highest levels of mortality, it would be 18 the bay was never fully closed. Restore --18 exactly in those areas in the high salinity 19 restoration was only 16 acres in 2013. And then 19 areas. And that was really an unfortunate issue. 20 it did increase to 100, 135. However, they need 20 And then that was compounded by the fact that 21 21 more. They're -- that needs to be more Mr. Ward did not just harvest from there. In 22 reshelling to provide the habitat. There were no 22 fact, I believe from his numbers, he would get 23 23 check stations in place. approximately 10 percent of his product. The 24 24 rest of it he would buy from -- from the And though this isn't quantitative, 25 25 oystermen throughout the bay. And that's what fishery-independent data, there were many reports THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4402 4404 1 of unsustainable harvest and overharvesting of 1 actually works in many oyster fisheries is they 2 illegal and sub-legal oysters, including oysters 2 have a diverse portfolio. They have leases in 3 as small as 1 inch. The legal size is 3 low salinity, moderate salinity, and high 4 approximately 3 inches. And you're seeing these 4 salinity areas. 5 5 tiny oysters out there. This is, for instance, the way the State of 6 6 Louisiana's oystermen worked. I have talked to THE WITNESS: Most of which are males, 7 7 by the way, your Honor. them directly about that. They have that because 8 BY MR. ECHOLS: 8 there are some years when you have too much fresh 9 **Q.** I'll let the Court ask you that at the end there, 9 water coming into the bay. And the oysters that 10 Professor. 10 are close to the river mouth will die, but the 11 11 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. ones that are at moderate salinity or high 12 salinity will do very well. And that's what they 12 BY MR. ECHOLS: 13 13 **Q.** Changing topics, you were here a couple of weeks harvest. ago, sir, were you not, when Mr. Tommy Ward 14 14 And in years of very high salinity, you're 15 testified? 15 going to have localized mortality in the high 16 16 salinity areas. So there, they get their product A. Yes, I was. 17 Q. And you understand that Mr. Ward had -- has a 17 from moderate and low salinity areas. 18 couple of private leases that are not publicly 18 And that's what Mr. Ward had, sort of that 19 harvested? 19 portfolio that he had prior to the collapse. 20 A. Correct. 20 After the collapse, then he no longer had a 21 Q. Could you -- and could you explain to the Court, 21 source from the rest of the bay; plus his leases 22 you know, why is it, given that these were 22 are in those high salinity areas that are prone 23 23 private leases that he controlled the level of to higher mortality.

24

25

24

25

harvesting, why were Tommy Ward's leases harmed,

you know, if -- to the extent he says that they

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

So in my view it was just an unfortunate

situation. Were he to have leases in lower

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4407 1 salinity areas, he would have done -- sorry --1 talking past each other, at least with counsel 2 2 yes, in lower salinity areas, he would have done 3 3 Α. Right. So I -- I do not disagree with the fact MR. ECHOLS: We can take that down. that higher -- in higher salinities, you're going BY MR. ECHOLS: 5 5 to have an increase in the abundance of marine 6 Q. If I could refer you, changing topics here, sir, 6 predators such as the rock snail. And they are 7 to the tab 10 of the binder that counsel for 7 going to have higher -- exert a higher effect in 8 8 terms of mortality on oysters. But that's very Florida gave you. This was the Laura Petes memo, 9 FX-412. 9 different than collapse. That is simply one of 10 And, sir, you're familiar with this document? 10 the factors that changes naturally in the system, 11 A. Yes, I am. 11 in an estuarine ecosystem. 12 Q. And if I could ask you to turn to page 7 of the 12 The estuary is a dynamic system where you 13 memo in the section that says, Conclusions and 13 have different factors affecting it at different 14 looking to the future. 14 times. And you naturally see changes. You 15 A. Yes. 15 naturally see increases or declines in the Q. And if you look at the very bottom of that page, 16 16 populations in the system. But that's very 17 please, now, a number of Florida witnesses have 17 different than -- or is fundamentally different 18 18 testified that the Petes memo, this particular from a collapse where you see the population 19 document, supports the conclusion that 19 decline to such low levels that it's no longer 20 20 overharvesting was not a cause of the collapse. economically viable. 21 21 Q. Is that how you read this, sir? And, sir, based on all of your experience, your 22 22 A. No. Not at all. I read this as saying that over 30 years of studying oysters and fisheries, 23 overharvesting was -- her -- according to 23 have you ever identified an instance where predation has caused a fishery-wide collapse of 24 24 Dr. Petes, that she believes that overharvesting 25 had a major effect or significant effect on the 25 an oyster fishery? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4406 4408 1 population in the bay. 1 A. No. Never. It hasn't been the -- the only 2 2 **Q.** Now, one thing I think that is probably important causes that I have identified from the literature 3 3 are two main ones. One is unsustainable harvest. for the Court to understand, when you have That has happened all along the Atlantic coast; 4 testified earlier and in your written direct 4 5 5 testimony that predation did not cause the and, unfortunately, now may have happened in the 6 collapse, what are you using as the definition of 6 Gulf. 7 7 collapse there? And the second one is from massive 8 A. Right. So the definition of collapse is when you 8 disturbances -- environmental natural 9 have a substantial reduction in the population. 9 disturbances. And the two that have been 10 It's not going to be a 20 percent reduction, a 10 10 typically documented are hurricanes and what are 11 11 percent; it's going to be generally an 80 to 95 called freshets. So hurricanes -- you know what 12 12 percent reduction in the population. And, a hurricane is, a massive storm increases silt, 13 13 therefore, it can no longer support an sediment, covers the oysters, suffocates them. 14 economically viable fishery. 14 Or you can have a massive river flow, for 15 15 And as I mentioned, Chesapeake Bay, whatever reason, storm or otherwise; and that 16 throughout most of the bay the population is down 16 causes what we call freshets, very low salinities 17 to 1 percent. That's why it's still considered 17 that come in and literally decimate -- can decimate a bay-wide population. 18 collapsed. So --18 19 **Q.** Are you -- are you offering, sir, the opinion 19 **Q.** But as far as drought, increased salinity, 20 20 that increased predation did not cause any predation, has there ever been an instance where 21 21 additional oyster mortality? that has caused a fishery-wide collapse? 22 22 A. No, I'm not. Not at all. That -- that would be No. Never a bay-wide, fishery-wide collapse 23 23 biologically unsound, yes. other than in local areas such as in Mr. Ward's 24 **Q.** If you could just explain very briefly the 24 lease, yes. 25 difference for the Court. It seemed like we were 25 **Q.** All right. The second to last brief topic here. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

2

3

5

6

13

- 2 also evaluated the expert opinions offered by
- 3 Drs. Kimbro and White; is that correct?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. And in your direct testimony -- and we don't need

Now, sir, as part of your work, do you -- you

- 6 to go into detail -- you identify a number of
- 7 flaws that you found in those analyses. Just at
- 8 the highest level, do you recall that Dr. Kimbro
- 9 said that the methodology included his
- 10 observations, experts, and then the mathematical
- 11 modeling that Dr. White did?
- 12 A. Yes.

14

1

9

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

- 13 Q. And let's look, if we could, please, at -- in
 - Dr. White's written direct. And if I could refer
- 15 you and the Court, please, to page 50 and
- 16 paragraph 153. The paragraph 153 starts on page
- 17 49, and then the figure is on page 50 there.
- 18 Now, sir, you understand Dr. White used an 19 IPM model?
- A. Yes. 20
- 21 Q. And are you familiar with IPM models?
- 22 A. I'm quite familiar with it. I'm a co-author on 23 an IPM model for the Pacific oyster, yes.
- 24 **Q.** Could you explain to the Court, please, what is
- 25 the conclusion that is reflected here in

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4410

21

1

2

3

What percent of variation would you expect to find? Α. I would have expected to see no less than 50, 60,

Q. And what percent would you expect to have found

if the lower flows had caused a collapse?

experiences in the environment just due to all

- 7 8 80 percent or so. It definitely would have been
- 9 an order of magnitude -- well, I would have

different sources of mortality.

- 10 expected to have good evidence that I would have
- 11 seen something around 80 percent, a little
- 12 higher, a little lower. And, instead, I saw 1
 - percent. So --
- 14 **Q.** Finally, Professor Lipcius, now, we had
- 15 Mr. Berrigan here on behalf of the State of
- 16 Florida and Mr. Sutton a couple of weeks ago.
- 17 And I know you saw part of that testimony.
- 18 Correct?
- 19 A. Yes, I did.
- 20 **Q.** And those -- both Mr. Berrigan and Mr. Sutton
 - testified that they believed that it was an
- 22 inevitable consequence that all the oysters were
- 23 going to die from predation or disease and that,
- therefore, it made sense for the fishery to allow 24
- 25 the oystermen to continue harvesting.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

Dr. White's analysis based on his IPM model?

- 2 A. You will have to excuse me. I'm laughing
- 3 because when I first saw this, I had already
- read Dr. Kimbro's conclusions and then 4
- 5 Dr. White's. And then I saw the graph, and I
- 6 had to do a double-take. And I say that because
- 7 the maximum difference in the population that you
- 8 see here under the remedy scenario -- so instead

of the normal conditions, the drought conditions

- 10 that we have, one of the remedy scenarios
- 11 requested by the State of Florida, the maximum
- 12 difference in the population would be
- 13 approximately 1.1 percent, around 1 percent,
- 14 meaning that there would be a 1 percent, not
- 15 90 percent, not 80 percent decline in the
- 16 population, basically a 1 percent decline
- 17 difference between the two.

And that, to me, actually supports the position that river flow did not -- low river flow did not cause the collapse. It's just the opposite. And, literally, I had to look at this two or three times to make sure that I was reading it because it was so surprising.

So a 1 percent -- 1.1 percent difference is negligible. It's what the oyster routinely

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Now, is it your opinion that it was an inevitable consequence that the oysters were going to die from predation or disease in 2012?

A. No. That -- that was an absurd statement. 4 5 Basically the oyster has evolved with these 6 organisms, with the drought conditions, and so 7 on. And, yes, you might see a slight dip; but it 8 has never caused a collapse. And that -- that is 9 just a ridiculous statement to make.

10 **Q.** And having reviewed the DACS reports with the 11 independent fishery data, are you aware or did 12 you find any instance in any contemporaneous 13 document of the State of Florida where it was 14 indicated that they believed all the oysters were 15 going to die anyway; and so the fishery allowed 16 them to be harvested?

17 Α. No. Never did.

> And if I might add one other thing that -- I think something that wasn't cleared up, the disease element of -- during the drought conditions. And this is one of the reasons why I didn't focus as much on Dr. Petes's work, as her work came up with a similar result as the University of Florida report, is that the disease levels were -- for dermo were at about 1 to 1.5.

> > THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 That is on a scale that has been specifically set **Q.** Okay. You were talking about the restoration 2 2 up for dermo disease; and it ranges from zero to project you were involved in, and you mentioned 3 5. And the level at which you begin to see 3 that one of the things that is considered is 4 4 oyster mortality is around 3. And what they saw whether they're good spots for restoration. And 5 at that time was somewhere around 1 to 1.5. by good spots, you meant identifying locations 6 Oysters live with that. They have evolved to 6 that are suitable for restoration. Is that 7 live with that amount of prevalence of dermo. So 7 correct? 8 that's why I basically felt that the disease 8 A. Correct. 9 element was not an issue whatsoever. 9 Q. And one of the ways you do that is by using 10 **Q.** And, actually, you reminded me, sir, of a couple 10 something called a habitat suitability index, 11 other things or one other thing I should clear 11 sir? A. Yes. 12 up. Now, when you went and visited Apalachicola 12 13 Bay and went on the boat with Captain Coy Shiver, 13 **Q.** Okay. You have written an article on the habitat 14 did you lie to him or mislead him about what your 14 suitability index. Right? 15 purpose was for the visit? 15 A. Yes, I have. A. No. No. 16 Q. And if you turn with me to tab 24 of your binder, 16 17 **Q.** Was there any lawyer from the State of Georgia on 17 sir, I would ask you if that's the article you the boat with you and Captain Shiver? 18 have written. 18 19 A. Yes. You were. 19 A. Yes, it is. Q. I was? 20 20 Q. Okay. And if you turn to page 2 of tab 24, which 21 A. Yes. 21 is FX-955, there's a table, actually, on that. 22 22 A. Yes. Q. And, finally, having reviewed all the 23 materials, heard the testimony of Dr. White 23 **Q.** It's actually on page 3. 24 and Dr. Kimbro, and the NOAA memos, have you seen A. Oh, page 3. Yes. 24 25 anything that would lead you to revise your 25 **Q.** Yes. There's a table listing the various factors THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4414 4416 1 conclusion that unsustainable harvest caused the 1 that are considered in the habitat suitability 2 2 fishery collapse? index; is that correct? A. No. Not at all. 3 3 A. Correct. 4 MR. ECHOLS: Thank you, your Honor. Q. And there's X's in difference boxes under 11 4 5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Recross? 5 columns. And those 11 columns represent RECROSS-EXAMINATION 6 6 different models that are used to evaluate 7 BY MR. QURESHI: 7 habitat -- or for different habitat suitability 8 8 Q. Dr. Lipcius, true or false. Apalachicola Bay, models? 9 2012, no evidence of increased predation -- I'm 9 A. They represent whether or not each of the 11 10 10 sorry, no evidence of increased mortality due to published models had used any of the different 11 11 predation. Do you agree with that statement or variables along -- in the first column, yes. 12 12 **Q.** And what's the first variable that's considered? did you disagree with it? 13 A. I'm just thinking about it for a second. 13 A. Average salinity. 14 No, that's false. 14 Q. Okav. And do all 11 use that --15 Q. Sir, you talked about Chesapeake Bay. In the 15 A. Yes. 16 last 50 years, have any of the states that 16 Q. -- variable? 17 administer portions of Chesapeake Bay allowed 17 Including the model that you described in 18 mechanical dredges to harvest oysters in the 18 this article; is that correct? 19 Chesapeake Bay? 19 A. Yes. Definitely. 20 A. Yes, they have. 20 **Q.** Okay. Sir, you talked about the resource 21 21 **Q.** And in the last 50 years, has the State of management of the oyster reefs by the State of 22 22 Florida allowed mechanical dredges of --Florida. And would you agree that the oyster 23 23 managing entity, Fish and Wildlife Conservation mechanical dredges to harvest oysters on public 24 reefs? 24 Commission, does a highly effective job of 25 A. No. 25 managing the resource? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4417 4419 1 A. It would depend on the time period. A. Okay. I'm -- I'm not seeing -- oh, recovery of 2 2 stocks of concern? 3 A. At that time, no, I don't. 3 Q. That's correct. It says Florida-low concern, as the title of the table we're looking at? Q. Okay. Can you turn with me to tab 23, sir. There you will see a document designated as 5 A. Oh, yes. Thank you. 6 FX-957. And it's a report by Seafood Watch for 6 Q. Okay. And where it says Florida, tong, if you 7 the Gulf coast region. Do you see that? 7 read across the row, under management strategy 8 A. Yes, I do. 8 and implementation, Florida is given highly 9 Q. And have you seen this before? 9 effective status. Do you see that? 10 A. I'm sorry? 10 A. I do. 11 **Q.** Have you seen this before? 11 **Q.** And what other Gulf state is given that status? 12 A. No. I'm aware of the program Seafood Watch, but 12 A. It doesn't look like any other. 13 I haven't seen this particular document. 13 And under enforcement, what is Florida's status? 14 Q. Okay. And you see that it's dated October 23, 14 Α. Highly effective. 15 2012? 15 Q. Okay. You talked a little bit, sir, about your A. Yes. 16 16 analysis of oyster abundance; and we looked at 17 17 Q. Can you see on the first page there's a the graph displaying the public -- or the major 18 18 reefs, as you described them, and the minor disclaimer that says, Seafood Watch strives to 19 ensure that all of our seafood reports and the 19 reefs. Do you recall that? 20 20 A. Yes. recommendations contained therein are accurate 21 21 **Q.** And you conclude that the oyster abundance did and reflect the most up-to-date evidence 22 22 available at time of publication. not decline throughout the entirety of 23 23 Apalachicola Bay either during or after the Do you see that? A. Yes. 24 24 collapse. Right? 25 **Q.** Okay. Sir, now, if you turn with me to the first 25 Α. Right. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4418 4420 1 page, you will see the various Gulf states 1 **Q.** And to make that determination, you analyzed the 2 2 ranked. Do you see there is a ranking associated abundance of legal and sub-legal oysters at nine different oyster bars throughout the bay from 3 with the State of Florida, sir? 3 2008 through 2014? 4 A. It's on page 2? 4 5 **Q.** Yes. There's a chart with green and yellow on 5 A. Correct. 6 6 **Q.** And based on that analysis, you concluded that 7 A. Yes. I see it. 7 substantial declines had occurred only on the 8 **Q.** And which state is assigned the highest 8 major fished bars, and that the other bars 9 9 remained healthy or actually increased in oyster recommendation score by Seafood Watch? 10 10 A. Looks like Florida, tong. abundance. Right? 11 **Q.** Florida. And tong there, you understand refers 11 Right. Α. 12 to the method of harvest allowed in the state? 12 Q. Okay. And you talked about Dr. White's criticism 13 A. Yes. 13 of that analysis where he alleges you confounded 14 Q. Okay. Now, turn with me to page 24, sir, of 14 the distance from the mouth of the river and, 15 FX-957. 15 therefore, confused the amount of salinity that 16 A. Okav. 16 would impact each respective oyster reef. 17 Q. Do you see there's a table there entitled 17 Α. Yes. 18 Management of Fishing Impacts on Retained 18 Q. Do you recall that? 19 Species. Florida, dash, low concern. All other 19 Yes, I do. 20 states, dash, moderate concern. 20 And you disagree with that; don't you? 21 Do you see that? 21 Α. 22 Q. And, in fact, you performed an analysis to A. I'm sorry. You're looking where? 23 evaluate salinity at these different oyster bars; 23 **Q.** At the table on page 24. A. Where it says factor 3.1? 24 is that correct?

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Q. That's correct.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

A. I did.

4423 1 Q. And you present that analysis in your prefiled 1 resource disaster in Apalachicola Bay in 2012. 2 direct testimony on page 15 in a table. Right? 2 A. That's correct. 3 A. Yes. 3 **Q.** So is it your testimony that you agree with this? A. No. I agreed with the conclusion to approve the 4 Q. And the salinity that you display there you 5 obtained from -- is it Dr. McAnally? disaster relief declaration. That's what I 6 A. Correct. 6 agreed with. 7 Q. And you actually averaged the salinities over 7 Q. But you disagree that these three factors 8 different months, and you provide one figure for 8 identified by NOAA were the cause of the oyster 9 each season; is that right? 9 fishery collapse? 10 A. That's correct. 10 A. Yes. 11 **Q.** And then you take all the major bars, and you 11 Q. Okay. Do they have scientists at NOAA, sir? 12 group them together. And you take all the minor 12 A. Yes, there are. 13 bars, and you group them all together. Isn't 13 Q. Okay. Thank you. 14 that right? 14 MR. QURESHI: I have nothing further. 15 A. Yes. You separate them out that way, yes. Yes. 15 MR. ECHOLS: Very briefly, judge, if I **Q.** You have the major and minor. All major bars are 16 16 could. 17 considered --17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION A. Yes. 18 BY MR. ECHOLS: 18 19 Q. -- collectively? 19 **Q.** I would like to -- staying on exactly the same 20 20 A. Yes. document and the page there, could you explain, 21 Q. And all minor bars are considered collectively --21 please, to the Court why you disagree with the 22 A. Yes. 22 conclusion here of the NOAA disaster declaration? 23 **Q.** -- is that right? 23 A. Well, I specifically disagreed with the -- those 24 24 three points because NOAA did not conduct any Okay. And then if you noticed, in the summer 25 months for 2010 and 2011 and 2012, the summer 25 further analyses of any of the data. And they THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4422 4424 1 salinities for each of those years is lower than 1 certainly -- I conducted much more -- many more 2 the salinities for the winter and spring period 2 extensive analyses of the data that basically and the fall period; is that right? 3 3 disproved that. NOAA relied upon the existing documents, the 4 A. Yes. 4 5 Q. Okay. And you were aware, sir, that in 5 statements made by Florida scientists and 6 6 Apalachicola Bay the summers tend to have lower managers and such. So they didn't do -- in order 7 flows and higher salinities than the other 7 to reach this declaration, they didn't conduct 8 8 seasons? any new analyses. 9 A. They tend to, yes. 9 And then the other part of this is -- why I 10 10 Q. Okay. Dr. Lipcius, you talked about the NOAA said that it's not unreasonable that NOAA reached 11 this decision to approve the request is that the determination of the oyster fishery collapse in 11 12 2012. 12 disaster relief is meant to help those in most 13 A. Yes. 13 need, which are the fishing community, the 14 Q. And you're familiar with NOAA's findings and 14 oystermen, the industry that they support, and 15 conclusions. Right? 15 the like. And so that's a socioeconomic issue. 16 A. Yes, I am. 16 And if you're not absolutely certain of the 17 **Q.** And you disagree with them? 17 cause, which is what NOAA was, then you tend to 18 A. No. I -- it's not -- it was not an unreasonable 18 be liberal in trying to help out these fishing 19 conclusion to reach. I don't. 19 communities. 20 Q. Okay. So if you look with me to tab 12, 20 These are hard-working people, most -- the 21 page 4 -- page 4 of the memo, the NOAA memo, 21 majority, as I know from Chesapeake Bay, are 22 sir, FX-413. 22 honest, hard-working individuals; and they A. Yes. 23 deserve some relief when a collapse like this 23 24 **Q.** There is a recommendation and a listing of three 24 occurs. So --25 factors that NOAA determined caused the fishery 25 **Q.** Do you, sir, have personal experience of having THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

| | | TRIAL- December | 1, 2016 (VC | |
|----------------------|----|--|----------------------|--|
| | | 4425 | | CDECIAL MACTER LANGACTER, What would |
| 1 | | worked with NOAA scientists in connection with | 1 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: What would |
| 2 | | other disaster declarations? | 2 | happen if the meander bends were disengaged |
| 3 | Α. | I do. I worked directly with them. We had a | 3 | or closed off? |
| 4 | | blue crab fishery disaster declaration in 2008. | 4 | THE WITNESS: You mean as far as getting |
| 5 | | I was part of that. I was funded to work to | 5 | water from the meander bends? |
| 6 | | provide jobs for the in Chesapeake Bay the | 6 | If they were permanently closed off, and |
| 7 | | fishers are called watermen. I worked with them | 7 | given that the amount of rainfall that falls |
| 8 | | to conduct surveys to help in the recovery and so | 8 | on the surface and then comes in outside of |
| 9 | | on. | 9 | the meander bends, the Gulf of the |
| 10 | | So yes, I was directly involved with that. | 10 | Apalachicola Bay probably would over time |
| 11 | Q. | Lastly, sir, if I could ask you to please just | 11 | become a marine system. |
| 12 | | open your written direct testimony to the very, | 12 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Become what? |
| 13 | | very first page that has the little Roman | 13 | THE WITNESS: A marine system, meaning |
| 14 | | numeral i at the bottom Roman i. | 14 | the salinity would be much higher. And as |
| 15 | A. | Yes. | 15 | Dr. Livingston has suggested, that if that |
| 16 | Q. | And would you mind, please, reading into the | 16 | were to happen, then you would have a more, |
| 17 | | record what the top of this page says in the | 17 | what we call diverse community. It would |
| 18 | | three bolded words up there? | 18 | become a marine community, which has more |
| 19 | A. | Table of contents? | 19 | species of fish and other organisms. |
| 20 | Q. | Yes, table of contents. And then below the table | 20 | Certain species would be eliminated; |
| 21 | | of contents, are these items listed here | 21 | other species would come into the system, be |
| 22 | | typically things that we might call as headers of | 22 | more prevalent. |
| 23 | | various sections? | 23 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: As I have |
| 24 | A. | Yes. | 24 | gone along, my vocabulary has increased. My |
| 25 | Q. | Now, did you have any intention for the Court to | 25 | pronunciation of words has gotten worse. |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4426 | | 4428 |
| 1 | | reach for the Court to understand your | 1 | So if I ask you what a LOESS curve is |
| 2 | | conclusions your scientific conclusions and | 2 | LOESS |
| 3 | | analysis to be limited to the headers in the | 3 | THE WITNESS: Right. |
| 4 | | table of contents? | 4 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: what is a |
| 5 | A. | No. Not not at all. | 5 | LOESS curve? |
| 6 | Q. | Thank you. | 6 | THE WITNESS: All that is is it's an |
| 7 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Further | 7 | average that for a particular point in |
| 8 | | recross? | 8 | time let's look at it in time. If you |
| 9 | | MR. QURESHI: No, your Honor. | 9 | have a data point for 1989 and then you have |
| 10 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Doctor, do | 10 | another one for 1988, 1987, and if you want |
| 11 | | you know what I mean by a meander bend? | 11 | to come up with an average for 1988, then |
| 12 | | THE WITNESS: Yes, I do, your Honor. | 12 | instead of simply taking the value to look at |
| 13 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Are you | 13 | the long-term trend, you take the averages of |
| 14 | | familiar with meander bends on these rivers? | 14 | multiple data points. So for 1988, you would |
| 15 | | THE WITNESS: Yes. I know that they are | 15 | take 1988 and then '89, '87, and do that. |
| 16 | | there, yes. | 16 | And you can do that with different numbers of |
| 17 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Do you know | 17 | data points. So instead of '87, '88, '89, |
| 18 | | where they are? | 18 | you might take '86, '87, '88, '89, '90. And |
| 19 | | THE WITNESS: Not exactly. | 19 | that's a statistically sound way in what we |
| • | | | 20 | call time-series analysis of looking at a |
| 20 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Approximately? | 20 | can anne contec analysis or recining at a |
| 20 21 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Approximately? THE WITNESS: All along the river. | 21 | long-term trend in the data. |
| | | | | - |
| 21 | | THE WITNESS: All along the river. | 21 | long-term trend in the data. |
| 21 22 | | THE WITNESS: All along the river. That's what I along the Apalachicola | 21 22 | long-term trend in the data. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Is use of a |
| 21 22 23 | | THE WITNESS: All along the river. That's what I along the Apalachicola River? | 21 22 23 | long-term trend in the data. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Is use of a LOESS curve a form of statistical analysis? |
| 21 22 23 24 | | THE WITNESS: All along the river. That's what I along the Apalachicola River? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Yes. | 21 22 23 24 | long-term trend in the data. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Is use of a LOESS curve a form of statistical analysis? THE WITNESS: Yes. It's an objective |

4429

8

16

21

1

analysis, yes.

2 And the reason we like it so much is that we -- the only thing we do is to chose 3 the extent of the time series and how those

points are averaged; but then we let the

analysis tell us what the pattern is. We

don't force an analysis. We don't force a

pattern into the data. The data tells us

9 what the pattern is.

10

11

12

13

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: You probably can't answer this question, but I'm going to ask it anyway. And I don't know whether you were here when I asked another witness.

But there are models and there are 14 15 models. And if you take a certain model and 16 put certain information into it, whether you create the model or you use someone else's 17 model, you're going to get a certain result? 18

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Now, the 20 21 question which I'm having trouble with is why 22 is it that almost uniformly in this case

every time a Georgia witness or a Florida 23 24 witness used a particular model and put the

25 same information in, they got a result that

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4430

1 favored their state?

THE WITNESS: Well, typically they 2 3 didn't put the same information in. So from

some of the examples that I can recall --

5 it's just like when you're cooking. You have

a stove. You put certain ingredients in; you 6

7 get something out. You put different

ingredients in; you're going to get something 8

9 very different out.

10 So in my experience of looking at some 11 of the differences in results, it's not the model per se. It's what you put into the model that gives you the different results. 13

And I mentioned that in -- when you were 14 15 talking about the LOESS curve. I think in part of the reshelling program, to me it was 17 inappropriate to put in 2014 reshelling. It drove the curve up. But without that, it remained low, below the average. That's it.

20 So it's really what you put into the model. 21 And in the extreme, we say garbage in, garbage out. But it's really what's being 23 put into the model that determines what comes out of it. 24 25

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I'm an expert THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

on microwaves, but not on ovens; so I can't

2 comment on that.

My assumption was that they were putting 3 the same information into the same model.

And if that assumption were correct, then why would they all come out favoring a client who

7 hired them?

THE WITNESS: I think if that were

correct, I would expect to see -- if you're

correct that we're using the same model, the 10

same information, then we would see the same 11

12 results. And --

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: You would 13

14 expect the same results?

THE WITNESS: You would expect that. 15

And you also expect the conclusion to be

17 substantiated. I think that's another

18 difference that you can also just say, oh,

hey, this is this way. But you would have to 19

20 substantiate why you're concluding something.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I'm sure you

22 have been warned that I'm going to ask this

23 question, but I have read in the materials

24 that male oysters become female oysters.

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4432 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: How is that

possible? 2

3 THE WITNESS: It's actually -- well,

they're born with both types of physiology, 4

5 both organs. And what they do is they first

become a male when they're small. And then 6

7 they switch over to female.

And there's actually a fairly simple 8

9 reason why they do that. A small oyster can

10 have a lot of sperm, but a small oyster can't

11 have a lot of eggs. And so through

12 evolution, they have become adapted to the

13 point where there are enough sperm in the

small males; and for there to be sufficient 14

15 eggs for those sperm to fertilize, you want

to have the big oysters. And that's 16

17 generally why they shift.

18 And, in fact, even more interesting is

job of a male is to be a sperm. That's it. 20

21 They go; they fertilize the egg, and the

22 sperm dies. And then the female, the egg,

23 develops into the organism.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Am I correct 24

that there are certain species where the only

25 that sometimes the females become males?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

16

19

| | I RIAL - December | 1, 201 | 10 (00 | , |
|--|---|--|----------------------|---|
| | 4433 | _ | | 4435 |
| 1 | THE WITNESS: That's been suggested, | 1 | | opportunity to thank your Honor, to thank |
| 2 | yes. Some of the females will revert back to | 2 | | Mr. Andrews, and Mr. Dunlap I'm sorry, |
| 3 | males. And that part we don't understand as | 3 | | Mr. Richards, Mr. Dunlap, and our court |
| 4 | much. It there's also not as much | 4 | | reporter for your hospitality and for making |
| 5 | evidence for that. | 5 | | this court available to us. I also want to |
| 6 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. | 6 | | thank Judge Cary and the Bankruptcy Court. |
| 7 | MR. ECHOLS: No questions, your Honor. | 7 | | We sincerely appreciate it. |
| 8 | MR. QURESHI: Nothing further, your | 8 | DV | DIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 9 | Honor. | 9 | _ | Mr. PRIMIS: |
| 10 11 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor. | 10 11 | Q. | Mr. Stavins Dr. Stavins, do you have your |
| 12 | MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, Georgia is | 12 | ٨ | written testimony in front of you? Yes, I do. |
| 13 | prepared to call Dr. Stavins. He's here in | 13 | _ | And, sir, would you please take a look at that |
| 14 | the courtroom. And we are also prepared to | 14 | Œ. | and tell us if you would adopt that as your sworn |
| 15 | make a concerted effort to finish today. | 15 | | testimony in this case? |
| 16 | That said, we usually do take a short | 16 | Δ | Yes, I will. |
| 17 | break at this time; and it might be an | 17 | Α. | MR. PRIMIS: Okay. We'll tender the |
| 18 | appropriate time. | 18 | | witness; and I'll hand out the testimony. |
| 19 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Short is the | 19 | | MR. PERRY: Good afternoon, your Honor. |
| 20 | important word. | 20 | | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good |
| 21 | MR. PRIMIS: Five minutes. | 21 | | afternoon, Mr. Perry. |
| 22 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Sure. | 22 | | MR. PERRY: I would like to extend the |
| 23 | MR. PRIMIS: And obviously I can't | 23 | | same thank you that Mr. Primis just did. |
| 24 | control Mr. Perry's cross-examination, but | 24 | | And we will be prepared at an opportune |
| 25 | would it be possible to stay a little later | 25 | | time to respond to the comment on restaurants |
| | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | | | |
| | 4434 | | | 4436 |
| 1 | 4434 than 4:30? | 1 | | |
| 1 2 | | 1 2 | | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. |
| | than 4:30? | | | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, |
| 2 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. | 2 | BY | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. |
| 2 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. | 2 | | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION |
| 2 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. | 2 3 4 | Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: |
| 2 3 4 5 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) | 2 3 4 5 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) | 2 3 4 5 6 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) | 2 3 4 5 6 7 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | than 4:30? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | special Master Lancaster: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | special Master Lancaster: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | special Master Lancaster: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, and my last name is spelled S T A V I N S. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. BY Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University of Georgia's Agricultural Extension Service? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | special Master Lancaster: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, and my last name is spelled S T A V I N S. MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, before I begin | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. BY Q. A. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University of Georgia's Agricultural Extension Service? I am aware of the existence of it, certainly. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, and my last name is spelled S T A V I N S. MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, before I begin with Dr. Stavins, since he's the last | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. BY Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University of Georgia's Agricultural Extension Service? I am aware of the existence of it, certainly. Can you describe what it does? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, and my last name is spelled S T A V I N S. MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, before I begin with Dr. Stavins, since he's the last witness, I just wanted to take the | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. BY Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University of Georgia's Agricultural Extension Service? I am aware of the existence of it, certainly. Can you describe what it does? So in general an Agricultural Extension Service |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Absolutely. MR. PRIMIS: Okay. Then we can do this. MR. PERRY: Okay. (Time Noted: 2:43 p.m.) (Recess Called) (Time Noted: 2:50 p.m.) MR. PRIMIS: The State of Georgia will call its final witness, Dr. Robert Stavins. THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear that the testimony you shall give in the cause now in hearing shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you God? THE WITNESS: I do. THE CLERK: Please be seated. Pull yourself right up to the microphone and please state your name and spell your last name. THE WITNESS: My name in Robert Stavins, and my last name is spelled S T A V I N S. MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, before I begin with Dr. Stavins, since he's the last | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. BY Q. A. Q. | and hotels. We really enjoyed our time here, and we have had some terrific experiences. CROSS-EXAMINATION MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, it's nice to see you again. Nice to see you. Thank you so much. I have prepositioned the binders. I hope to go through as few of the documents as I can with those binders. I have another binder; but, hopefully, we won't need to get through all of it, sir. MR. PERRY: Your Honor, actually I would like to introduce Laura Glickman, if I might. And she's terrific. I would like to have her recognized on the record, if I could. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly. MS. GLICKMAN: Good afternoon, your Honor. MR. PERRY: Dr. Stavins, are you familiar with the University of Georgia's Agricultural Extension Service? I am aware of the existence of it, certainly. Can you describe what it does? |

4440

...-

2

3

6

7

8

9

10

19

1

A. Yes, I see that.

A. Yes. I see that.

A. Yes, I read it.

- 1 is typically -- is affiliated with the Land Grant
- 2 colleges in their respective states and carries
- 3 out activities of giving advice and sometimes
- 4 doing analysis as well of farming within the
- 5 respective states.
- **6 Q.** And do you know a Dr. John Beasley affiliated
- **7** with the University of Georgia's Extension
- 8 Service?
- 9 A. So as I sit here now, to be honest, that name
- 10 does not ring a bell.
- **11 Q.** He's a professor of crop and soil science at UGA.
- 12 You don't know him?
- 13 A. I don't believe so.
- Q. Do you know a Dr. Scott Tubbs, also a professorof crop and soil sciences at UGA?
- 16 A. Again, as I sit here now, I don't remember the17 name.
- **18 Q.** Are you familiar with a study involving those two
- 19 individuals with Harvard University and
- 20 University of Florida on rotations and how they
- 21 can save water?
- 22 A. No. I haven't heard about that.
- 23 Q. Can you describe for the Court what a sod-based24 rotation is, please?
- 25 A. Well, I would be speculating if I did that.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

11 A. I couldn't say beyond what's stated here.

the contents of page 44 of FX-960.

12 Q. Cotton and peanuts, would that make sense to you13 given your experience with agriculture?

Q. Could you turn with me, please, now to page 44 of

Q. And now, on that page, could you read to yourself

Q. Would you know what other crops are meant to be

rotated in the sod-based rotation being studied

this same presentation, again, FX-960.

- 13 given your experience with agriculture?14 A. Well, given my experience and my review of the
- 15 materials in this case, I would anticipate that
- 16 if it's within the Lower River Flint Basin, it
- 17 might well be cotton and peanuts.
- **18 Q.** You have never seen any study that anticipates
 - that a sod-based rotation could save 70 to 80
- 20 percent of irrigation water used on cotton and
- 21 peanuts?
- A. Including grazing and variable rate irrigation and the others that are listed here?
- 24 Q. Sure. You're aware, aren't you, that there are a
- 25 number of farmers in the Flint River Basin that

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4438

- **1 Q.** Okay. Could you open your binder to tab 1,
- **2** please.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And, sir, for the first part of my exam today I
- 5 would like to understand what you did to prepare
- 6 your analyses in your prefiled direct and,
- 7 indeed, in your expert opinion. So let's start
- 8 with this document, if we might, please. Have
- **9** you ever seen this document before?
- 10 A. No. I don't believe I have.
- 11 Q. And you don't know what, if any, role Georgia
- **12** Extension Services had in the preparation of this
- document?
- 14 A. No. The -- just to be clear, the document I'm
 15 looking at says University of Florida.
- **16 Q.** Sir, are sure you don't know of a joint study by
- 17 University of Georgia in Auburn and University of
- 18 Florida as to ways to save water in the Flint
- 19 River Basin?
- 20 A. I don't recall having reviewed such a study.
- **21 Q.** Sir, I invite your attention in this document,
- tab 1, which is FX-960, to page 5, please.
- 23 A. Yes, sir.
- **Q.** And do you see there it says, sod-based tri-state
- **25** project, Georgia, Florida, and Alabama?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- have farm ponds and also cattle. Right?
- 2 A. So I'm certainly -- I'm aware of farm ponds. I
- 3 haven't been looking at anything with livestock.
- 4 Q. You're not familiar with the practices of raising
- 5 livestock in connection with farming various
- **6** crops in the Flint River Basin?
- 7 A. No. I can't say that I am.
- **8 Q.** So you don't know how many farmers do or don't
- **9** have livestock operations?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- **11 Q.** Okay. So, sir, if you could look now at page 45
- **12** of --
- 13 A. Yes.

15

- **14 Q.** -- this particular document. And there, do you
 - see the word Bainbridge on the title of the
- 16 slide?
- 17 A. Yes, I do.
- **18 Q.** You know Bainbridge is in the Flint River Basin;
- don't you?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And you know there's a gage that measures the
- 22 flow of the Flint River at Bainbridge. Right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. All right. And it doesn't include all of the
- flows in the Flint River Basin; does it?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4441 4443 1 A. No. No. A. The first line of which segment? 2 2 **Q.** Bainbridge is on the Flint River, but there are There are five. 3 other creeks and tributaries that empty into Lake 3 Q. Yes, fair question. It's the top left set of Seminole from the Flint River Basin. Right? lines under conventional three-year cotton, 4 5 A. That empty in directly. 5 cotton, peanut rotation. Do you see that, sir? 6 Q. They empty in --6 A. Yes. A. Directly, yes. 7 Q. And do you see the profit at 20,000 in the total 8 **Q.** Now, have you seen this chart on page 45 before? 8 profit line item there? 9 A. You know, I don't recall as I look at it. But to 9 A. 20,793 you're referring to? 10 be honest, I have seen so many graphics of flow 10 Q. Yes. 11 rates that it's possible, but I don't recall it. 11 Now, if you will follow with me down to the 12 **Q.** And do you remember during your deposition we 12 bottom of the page, do you see after a series of 13 talked about the amount of water that might be 13 different years, year four, full sod-based 14 saved at Bainbridge by reducing agricultural 14 rotation? 15 irrigation? 15 A. Yes. I see that. A. I certainly remember discussing the amount of 16 **Q.** And do you see the profit at the bottom of the 16 17 17 water passing at Bainbridge. page, 125,270? 18 18 **Q.** And you recognize that a thousand cfs is a A. Yes. The last two years the profit jumps up. 19 significant amount of water flowing down the 19 Livestock are added. 20 20 Flint at Bainbridge; isn't it? In fact, the last three years there is the 21 A. A thousand cfs in the context of this case is 21 addition of livestock bringing the bulk of the 22 significant. 22 profit, it appears. 23 Q. Yes. And do you see here on this chart the 23 **Q.** Well, do you see that cotton and peanut profits 24 24 difference between flows at various levels, and on year four are both higher than cotton and 25 do you see also that it exceeds 1,000 cfs in July 25 peanut profits in the first year in the top line? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4442 4444 1 and August? A. In year four --2 A. I'm trying to -- I don't actually know what the **Q.** To the conventional on the top line. 3 meaning is of the different numbers. There are a 3 A. Yes. Yes. Less in year three and less in year lot of lines that are also color-coded. 4 4 two; but, yes, you're right, more in year four. 5 5 **Q.** All right, sir. There's a table on this chart; Q. You didn't analyze this in your report or in your 6 but in the interest of time and that you're the 6 prefiled direct testimony; did you? 7 last witness in our five-week trial --7 Α. No. I was essentially basing my work upon Dr. Sundig's work. And he didn't look at such A. Yes. 8 8 9 $\boldsymbol{Q.} \;\; \boldsymbol{\text{--}} \;\; I'm$ going to move to a different page. 9 rotations, so I didn't. 10 10 A. Yes. Q. All right, sir. So you didn't look at what 11 11 amounts of water might be saved from changing **Q.** Could you please turn to page 47. 12 A. Yes. I'm there. 12 rotations or using lower water crops; did you? 13 **Q.** And do you see there a chart of different 13 A. No. I focused on exactly the set of measures 14 rotational crops along with acres, costs, 14 that Dr. Sundig proposes in various combinations,

16 A. So three-year rotation of these three crops and 17 then so on and so forth down the page? **Q.** It appears that there's at least a three-year and

revenue, and profit from different rotations?

- 18 19 perhaps a four-year rotation.
- 20 A. Yes.

15

- 21 **Q.** Do you see that?
- 22 A. The bottom one is a four year.
- 23 **Q.** And could you follow with me, please, looking at
- 24 profit with the cotton/peanut rotation on the
- 25 first line there. Do you see that, sir?

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

21 From forcing farmers to change the type of crops? 22 Q. Change their rotation or types of crops, you

identifies what, if any, economic impact there

were from forcing farmers to change the types of

23

and this was not one of them.

Q. So if -- if we were to look through your prefiled

direct, we wouldn't find a section that

didn't do that; did you?

crops they use. Right?

24 Α.

25 Okay. Sir, can you turn with me, please, to

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

15

16

17

18

19

4447 1 tab 3 of your binder. And there you will find a 1 crop choice. 2 Q. There is no restriction at all in the amount of 2 press release from yesterday. 3 A. Yes. 3 irrigation water they can apply to a particular Q. By Governor Deal of Georgia? acre of crop land; is there? A. Uh-huh. No. What I was referring to is permitting. **Q.** Have you seen this before? **Q.** All right. So they have to have permits; right? A. I don't believe so, no. Correct. 8 Q. Could you read the second and third paragraphs of 8 **Q.** And there are thousands of permits that have been 9 this story, please. 9 granted in the Flint River Basin. Right? 10 I called it a press release. I was mistaken. 10 A. That's fair to say. 11 It's actually a story about a press conference. 11 **Q.** Right. And the grandfathered permits in 12 A. Do you mind if I read from the beginning just so 12 particular have very few, if any, limitations on 13 I understand the context? 13 any aspect of irrigation; do they? 14 Q. Yes, please. Sir, anytime you want to do that, 14 A. Right. And the most recent permits are defined 15 you're welcome to. 15 in accordance with different areas of 16 16 A. Thank you. connectivity and impact on the river. 17 Okay. I'm not going to read the entire thing 17 Q. And there are about 30 of those? 18 A. There are a very small number; it may well be 30. 18 unless you want me to. 19 **Q.** No. Actually, I'm going to focus with you, if I 19 I don't recall the exact number that are in the 20 20 can, on the second and third paragraphs of this most critical area of the three types of areas, 21 document. And in particular in the second 21 the ones with greatest connectivity. And then --22 22 paragraph where it says, Deal set limits on water Q. Well, there are certainly many --23 use could be a disaster that could force farmers 23 A. -- there are --24 to change the types of crops by restricting 24 **Q.** I'm sorry to interrupt you. 25 irrigation. Do you see that, sir? 25 A. I was going to say there are more permits in the THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4446 4448 A. Yes. 1 areas that do not have significant impact on the 2 2 **Q.** All right. You didn't do any analysis of that river. 3 3 **Q.** Even in the sensitive -- particularly sensitive possibility; did you? A. No. I -- but I looked at this analogous to what areas, there are far, far, far more grandfathered 4 4 5 5 Dr. Sundig did. I looked at reductions in yields permits than new permits with limitations. of existing crops. 6 Right? 6 7 Q. Now, sir, do you see the next line where the --7 A. That's right. 8 the next paragraph where in the second sentence 8 **Q.** Okay. Now, I want to focus for a moment on an 9 9 artificial process, the phrase that I called out there's a reference to, quote, an artificial 10 10 process that would be imposed on farmers? a minute ago from the second paragraph we were 11 A. I see that, sir. 11 reading, third paragraph of this document. 12 **Q.** And then the line before that, there's an 12 You're aware, aren't you, that there is, indeed, 13 13 an artificial limit on the amount of water that indication that farmers should be allowed to make 14 the calls about what they do on their own, basing 14 can be used in Florida's part of the ACF basis by 15 that on market prices and the commodities they 15 farmers. Right? 16 produce. Do you see that, sir? 16 So I'm aware -- I have become aware of the 17 A. I do, except it doesn't say should. It just says 17 permitting system there. 18 farmers are allowed. 18 **Q.** Oh, you have become aware. Is that since your 19 **Q.** Oh, fair enough. Farmers are allowed. They are 19 prefiled direct testimony? 20 20 allowed under Georgia law to make all those No. It's actually since you and I spoke at my 21 21 choices right now without any restrictions. deposition. 22 22 Q. Okay. So you are aware of that. Right? 23 A. Well, there are certainly restrictions they face 23 Let's turn, if we could, to JX-45, which is 24 in terms of, as you know, irrigation water and 24 at tab 2, please. 25 other things, but I don't believe in terms of 25 A. Yes. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

| | | TRIAL- December | r 1, 20° | 6 (VC | ol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia |
|--|----|--|--|-------|--|
| | | 4449 | | | 4451 |
| 1 | Q. | Now, sir, you have seen this document before; | 1 | Α. | Well, it rings a bell; but I would have to see it |
| 2 | | haven't you? | 2 | | in front of me, and maybe I would be able to be |
| 3 | Α. | Well, let me look at the cover to make sure what | 3 | | definitive. |
| 4 | | that is. | 4 | Q. | Well, maybe we'll do that if we have time, sir. |
| 5 | | Yes. | 5 | A. | Okay. |
| 6 | Q. | It's titled Georgia's Water Conservation | 6 | Q. | So let's just focus back on page 45 |
| 7 | | Implementation Plan from 2010? | 7 | A. | Yes, sir. |
| 8 | A. | Yes. | 8 | Q. | if we might. Do you see there it says under |
| 9 | Q. | About seven years ago? | 9 | | goal No. 4, farmers should minimize water loss |
| 10 | A. | Uh-huh. | 10 | | from farm ponds? |
| 11 | Q. | Okay. Could you turn with me, please, to page 11 | 11 | A. | Yes. |
| 12 | | and 12 of this document. | 12 | Q. | And if you could, I just ask you to scan down the |
| 13 | A. | Yes. | 13 | | next paragraph and look for the word evaporation |
| 14 | Q. | Now, you see the section titled Acknowledgment on | 14 | | and seepage. |
| 15 | | page 11. I just want to very briefly identify | 15 | A. | Just one second, please. |
| 16 | | for you some of the participants in composing | 16 | | Yes. |
| 17 | | this document, because they testified here in | 17 | Q. | Do you see the word evaporation? |
| 18 | | this case. On page 11, do you see Mark Master | 18 | A. | Yes, I do. |
| 19 | | I'm sorry, page 12, do you see Mark Masters | 19 | Q. | Losses from farm ponds, and then later it says, |
| 20 | | listed? | 20 | | evaporation and seepage? |
| 21 | A. | Yes, I do. | 21 | A. | Right. |
| 22 | Q. | And you know Mr. or Dr. Masters; don't you? | 22 | Q. | Right. Now, benchmark 4B is what I'm |
| 23 | A. | I can't say that I know Mr. Masters, but I have | 23 | | particularly interested in here. Goal 4, |
| 24 | | read material. | 24 | | benchmark 4B. By January 15, farmers should |
| 25 | Q. | And he has some expertise in agricultural | 25 | | implement one or more practices to reduce water |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4450 | | | 4452 |
| 1 | | matters; doesn't he? | 1 | | loss from 50 percent of all farm ponds used in |
| 2 | A. | That's my understanding. | 2 | | irrigation. |
| 3 | Q. | Of course. He testified about that in this | 3 | | Were you familiar with that benchmark, sir? |
| 4 | | trial. | 4 | A. | I don't think I was familiar with the benchmark. |
| 5 | | And I would invite your attention to page 41 | 5 | | These are goals and benchmarks, not requirements, |
| 6 | | of this same document, please, sir. | 6 | | as I understand it. |
| 7 | A. | Yes. | 7 | Q. | So, sir, did you do any analysis on what, if any, |
| 8 | Q. | So, sir, are you familiar with these goals and | 8 | | impact some type of requirement similar to that |
| 9 | | benchmarks that the State of Georgia issued in | 9 | | benchmark would involve? |
| 10 | | 2010 for agricultural irrigation? | 10 | A. | Well, I did, not to this specific benchmark, but |
| 11 | A. | I can't say that I'm familiar with them, no. | 11 | | the fact that Dr. Sundig in one of his more |
| 12 | Q. | All right. Well, let's just look at a couple. I | 12 | | recent analyses in fact, it may have been his |
| 13 | | won't drag you through the entire 12-page section | 13 | | direct testimony commented on additional |
| | | | | | |
| 14 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but | 14 | | savings that would be achieved from farm ponds. |
| 14 15 | | | 14 15 | | savings that would be achieved from farm ponds. And so I did take a look at that. |
| | A. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but | | Q. | And so I did take a look at that. |
| 15 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? | 15 | Q. | And so I did take a look at that. |
| 15 16 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? | 15 16 | | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in |
| 15 16 17 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. | 15 16 17 | | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. |
| 15 16 17 18 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony | 15 16 17 18 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. |
| 15 16 17 18 19 | | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? | 15 16 17 18 19 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? | 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to page 44. And, again, we're moving quickly. |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? No. I just arrived today. | 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to page 44. And, again, we're moving quickly. There are many, many benchmarks and so forth in |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? No. I just arrived today. And well, thank you for coming up. | 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to page 44. And, again, we're moving quickly. There are many, many benchmarks and so forth in this document. But here, particularly I'm |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? No. I just arrived today. And well, thank you for coming up. Are you aware of the UIF report by Georgia | 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to page 44. And, again, we're moving quickly. There are many, many benchmarks and so forth in this document. But here, particularly I'm interested in goal 3, farmers should consider |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. | of benchmarks, goals, and requirements; but let's let's look first at page 45. Could we? 45? Yes, please. Now, sir, were you here for the testimony over the last several days about losses from evaporation from farm ponds? No. I just arrived today. And well, thank you for coming up. Are you aware of the UIF report by Georgia Water Resources Institute and its discussion of | 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Α. | And so I did take a look at that. But you didn't look at a 50 percent cut in evaporation from farm ponds; did you? I did not look at this specific benchmark, no. Okay. Now, if I can invite your attention now to page 44. And, again, we're moving quickly. There are many, many benchmarks and so forth in this document. But here, particularly I'm interested in goal 3, farmers should consider crop varieties, cropping systems, and irrigation |

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4455 1 A. Yes, I do. A. I'm aware of variable-rate irrigation and other 2 2 **Q.** And then if you scan that first paragraph there, practices that we have discussed in the past, 3 do you see an indication that farmers can 3 including those that Dr. Sunding and I both 4 significantly reduce the amount of water needed 4 5 by planting water-efficient crop varieties? 5 Q. Thank you, sir. I'm sorry for mentioning that 6 A. I'm sorry. Would you tell me again where that 6 before. 7 7 So on variable-rate irrigation, you're aware, 8 **Q.** Sure. I'm very happy to. The first paragraph of 8 aren't you, that Dr. Irmak, who is not going to 9 text -- not the title, but the first paragraph of 9 testify in this trial who was an agricultural 10 text under goal 3. 10 expert for Georgia, opined that it's possible 11 A. Oh. 11 that variable-rate irrigation could lead to 12 **Q.** It says, while goal 2; and then it moves on from 12 savings of more than 15 percent in water use. 13 13 Right? 14 A. Yes, I see it now. 14 A. So I don't -- I'm not aware of that specific. Is 15 **Q.** And did you see the language I read just a moment 15 that from the text here? 16 **Q.** It's from his report. 16 17 A. Yes. By planting water-efficient crop varieties. 17 A. Oh. Q. Now, sir, you didn't do any analysis on the 18 **Q.** And, sir, it's -- in particular, it's from 18 19 economic impact of planting water-efficient crop 19 page 77 of his report. 20 20 varieties; did you? Now, you're aware that he also evaluated 21 A. No. Again, I -- I followed on what Dr. Sundig 21 intelligent irrigation scheduling. Can you 22 22 had done. And since, you know, farmers are describe for the Court what that is. 23 trying to make a living, indeed, to probably 23 Α. Scheduling irrigation so that the water is going 24 maximize their profits. And the water costs 24 on when the needs of the crop are greatest so it 25 something, so I'm assuming that given the 25 will go into production of plant material. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4454 4456 1 benefits and costs they face, that they would 1 Q. And you're aware that Dr. Irmak described pilot 2 tend to be planting relatively efficient 2 programs and projects that looked at the 3 3 varieties. potential and, indeed, demonstrated the potential Q. And we're talking about Dr. Sunding. Right? of saving an additional 30 or 20 percent of water 4 4 5 5 A. Oh, did I say -used through irrigation -- through intelligent 6 Q. You said Sundig, but --6 irrigation scheduling? 7 A. Oh, I apologize. 7 A. Again, without seeing the document, I apologize, **Q.** No, I know. We have been through this before. 8 8 I don't want to validate the specific numbers. 9 So I am sorry to correct you, but I won't do it 9 Q. All right. Well, we covered some of these issues 10 10 again. So thank you. with Dr. Masters; so I won't go through them in 11 detail. Now, there are water-efficient varieties of 11 A. Okay. 12 12 corn, for instance; right? 13 They have been bred to use less water? 13 **Q.** Sir, are you aware of Georgia's Environmental 14 A. So there's -- there's been breeding of varieties 14 Protection Division at any point in time 15 of all of these crops, some to be more resistant 15 considering implementing a 15-inch cap on the 16 to insects, some to be more resistant from 16 amount of irrigation water that can be used in 17 competitive vegetation, and some to perhaps 17 the Flint River Basin per acre? 18 require less water. 18 A. My only recollection of the discussion of a cap 19 19 **Q.** Now, you're aware, in addition to using was with you in deposition, I believe. 20 20 water-efficient crops or choosing different Q. And you recall, don't you, that at -- in 1999 21 21 rotations or different water -- more that Georgia's Environmental Protection Division 22 22 water-efficient crops, that there are a whole believed that imposing a 15-inch cap of

25 irrigation. Right? THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

range of practices that can be adopted to use

less irrigation water, like variable-rate

25 Again, I don't have recollection of that specific THE REPORTING GROUP

manage water, unquote?

irrigation per acre was, quote, the best way to

Mason & Lockhart

23

24

23

| | | TRIAL- December | 1, 201 | ნ (Vo | , |
|----------------------------|----|---|----------------------|----------|--|
| | | 4457 | | | 4459 |
| 1 | | language from a document. | 1 | | these are. |
| 2 | Q. | All right, sir. Can you turn with me, please, to | 2 | | Are you with me? |
| 3 | | Exhibit 6 I'm sorry, tab 6, Exhibit FX-874. | 3 | A. | Yes. |
| 4 | | And in the interest of time, I'll refer you | 4 | Q. | All right. Do you see the word NESPAL |
| 5 | | directly to the next to last page at the bottom. | 5 | _ | Yes. |
| 6 | Α. | Yes, sir. | 6 | Q. | under Dr. Jim Hook? |
| 7 | | And this is a little bit tricky to read because | 7 | | I think I just read what that acronym meant. |
| 8 | | the text for item 6 at the bottom of that page | 8 | | And do you recognize NESPAL now? |
| 9 | | carries over to the next page. And so I think | 9 | Δ | Yes. |
| 10 | | the word for each of these different vertical | 10 | | Okay. And do you see the water planning regions |
| | | | | Q. | , |
| 11 | | columns is cell. And if you read for example, | 11 | | here? |
| 12 | | it says pass a bill allowing the EPD to you | 12 | | Yes. I do. |
| 13 | | have to turn to the next page to read the rest of | 13 | | And the Lower Flint-Ochlockonee on the map? |
| 14 | _ | this sentence. | 14 | | Yes, I do. |
| 15 | | Yes. | 15 | Q. | Okay. If you just turn a couple pages into this |
| 16 | Q. | And if I could ask you, please, sir, to focus on | 16 | | tab, you will find FX-886. |
| 17 | | that sentence, both on the next to last page and | 17 | A. | Yes. |
| 18 | | the last page of FX-874, and just read it to the | 18 | Q. | And this, sir, is a list of monthly irrigation |
| 19 | | end, please. | 19 | | amounts for individual crops. And it's a range |
| 20 | A. | Pass a bill allowing? | 20 | | created by NESPAL from the University of Georgia |
| 21 | Q. | Yes. And if you could just to yourself read that | 21 | | for very wet years and very dry years. Do you |
| 22 | | text down to the end. | 22 | | see that, sir? |
| 23 | A. | Yes. | 23 | A. | Yes. I do. |
| 24 | Q. | All right. Do you see the reference there to 15 | 24 | Q. | And do you see that there are counties listed in |
| 25 | | inches per acre per year? | 25 | | each of the various sets of data on FX-886? |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4458 | | | 4460 |
| 1 | Δ | Yes. | 1 | Δ | Yes. |
| | _ | | | _ | |
| 2 | Q. | All right. Now, if we could turn to the prior | 2 | Q. | And do you see there under P 90, which is |
| 3 | | page and do the same thing with the next column | 3 | | very dry years, a total number per county per |
| 4 | | to the right, best way to manage water. | 4 | | crop? |
| 5 | Α. | Uh-huh. | 5 | Α. | Yes, I do. |
| 6 | Q. | You see you have to turn the page to get that. | 6 | Q. | So, for example, for Mitchell County for the |
| 7 | | Does this refresh your recollection of our | 7 | | crop corn, the very dry year number is 14.7. |
| 8 | | discussion during your deposition, sir? | 8 | | That's inches of irrigation water per year. |
| 9 | A. | Yes. We discussed precisely this. | 9 | | Right? |
| 10 | Q. | Okay. And you didn't analyze what the economic | 10 | A. | This is average or total across |
| 11 | | impacts would be of a cap on irrigation water | 11 | Q. | For a very dry year. |
| 12 | | applied at 15 inches per year per acre; did you? | 12 | A. | But what are I don't know what the rows are in |
| 13 | A. | No. So my economic analysis, like Dr. Sunding's, | 13 | | this that lead to that total. |
| 14 | | focuses on the economic cost of particular | 14 | Q. | Okay. Well, there are indications of how severe |
| 15 | | changes in cfs impacts of different measures. | 15 | | a drought year would be. So P 10 would be not |
| 16 | Q. | All right, sir. Are you familiar with the | 16 | | a severe drought, and P 90 would be severe |
| 17 | ٠ | National Environmentally Sound Production | 17 | | drought. |
| 18 | | Agriculture Laboratory at the University of | 18 | A. | I understand that that's the columns. I don't |
| 1 - | | | 19 | | understand what the rows are, approximately 10, |
| 19 | | Georgia? | 1 | | |
| 19 20 | Δ | Georgia? I'm aware of it. | 20 | | that lead to LW total 14.70. |
| 20 | _ | I'm aware of it. | 20 21 | 0 | Okay Those are months |
| 20 21 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, | 21 | | Okay. Those are months. |
| 20 21 22 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, which is FX-686. And it's also FX-886. I'm | 21 22 | A. | Okay. Those are months. Those are the months of the year? |
| 20 21 22 23 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, which is FX-686. And it's also FX-886. I'm sorry. | 21 22 23 | A. | Okay. Those are months. Those are the months of the year? That's right. The months of the irrigation |
| 20 21 22 23 24 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, which is FX-686. And it's also FX-886. I'm sorry. There's two documents here. And it will be | 21 22 23 24 | A. Q. | Okay. Those are months. Those are the months of the year? That's right. The months of the irrigation season. |
| 20 21 22 23 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, which is FX-686. And it's also FX-886. I'm sorry. There's two documents here. And it will be just a momentary time until we describe what | 21 22 23 | A. Q. | Okay. Those are months. Those are the months of the year? That's right. The months of the irrigation season. Right. |
| 20 21 22 23 24 | _ | I'm aware of it. All right. Could you turn, please, to tab 7, which is FX-686. And it's also FX-886. I'm sorry. There's two documents here. And it will be | 21 22 23 24 | A. Q. | Okay. Those are months. Those are the months of the year? That's right. The months of the irrigation season. |

| | | TRIAL- December | 1, 201 | 16 (Vo | ol. XVII) Florida v. Georgi |
|----|----|---|--------|--------|---|
| | | 4461 | | | 4463 |
| 1 | Q. | And in some cases the year. | 1 | A. | Yes, sir. |
| 2 | | But corn has a longer season, of course, than | 2 | Q. | So when you used this data, you used sprinkler |
| 3 | | some other crops. | 3 | | 100 percent and compared it to nonirrigated; |
| 4 | A. | Uh-huh. | 4 | | didn't you? |
| 5 | Q. | So there's irrigation earlier in the year. | 5 | Α. | Yes. That's correct. |
| 6 | | But do you see that there is corn, and then | 6 | Q. | All right. And you didn't analyze the economic |
| 7 | | there's Mitchell County peanuts and Miller County | 7 | | impact of requiring irrigation at a level equal |
| 8 | | corn, and so forth throughout this exhibit? | 8 | | to sprinkler 66 percent for peanuts; did you? |
| 9 | Α. | Yes, I see it. | 9 | Α. | |
| 10 | | And then there are totals for irrigation amounts. | 10 | | that I thought were feasible of carrying out |
| 11 | | Do you see those? | 11 | | Dr. Sunding's deficit irrigation method. And |
| 12 | Δ | Yes. | 12 | | that led me to the thinking that it would need to |
| 13 | _ | For the for a very dry P 90 year? | 13 | | be withdrawing acres from your irrigation. |
| | | Yes. | 14 | Q. | |
| 14 | | | | Q. | · |
| 15 | Q. | Now, you haven't done any analysis of the | 15 | | you mentioned it for just a moment. We have used |
| 16 | | economic impact of imposing caps at these levels | 16 | | a couple words in the course of this case for |
| 17 | | on these crops in these counties; have you? | 17 | | limiting the amount of irrigation applied. One |
| 18 | | No. Again, I followed Dr. Sunding's approach. | 18 | | has been deficit irrigation, and another has been |
| 19 | Q. | Okay. So you did, however, spend some time | 19 | | limited irrigation. Do you understand both those |
| 20 | | analyzing what I think you called the net the | 20 | | terms? |
| 21 | | Shellman Farm study. Is that right? | 21 | A. | Well, deficit irrigation, at this point in time, |
| 22 | Α. | Well, I used data from the Shellman experimental | 22 | | I associate with Dr. Sunding's proposal. |
| 23 | | farm. | 23 | Q. | And by deficit irrigation, he meant two things; |
| 24 | Q. | And the Shellman experimental farm is the | 24 | | didn't he? |
| 25 | | National Peanut Research Laboratory; is that | 25 | | He meant eliminating excessive water use, but |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | 4462 | | | 4464 |
| 1 | | right? | 1 | | he also meant reducing the amount of water that |
| 2 | A. | That's correct, of USDA. | 2 | | is applied to a crop where irrigation occurs. |
| 3 | Q. | And and this has been the subject of | 3 | | Right? |
| 4 | | Dr. Masters's testimony earlier in this trial. | 4 | A. | Well, my definition I mean, when I hear |
| 5 | | Do you know that? | 5 | | deficit irrigation, what I think he meant was |
| 6 | A. | I I read his report; and I believe I saw parts | 6 | | reducing irrigation amounts on different plots of |
| 7 | | of his examination in court. | 7 | | land in a way that is perfectly cost effective |
| 8 | Q. | All right, sir. Could you turn with me to tab 8, | 8 | | taking into account all of the different |
| 9 | | please, which is JX-169. | 9 | | variables that affect that. |
| 10 | | And I'll be very brief about this. I have | 10 | Q. | Okay. But you would agree with me, won't you, |
| 11 | | really one point to make. | 11 | | that it might be most effective and most |
| 12 | | This is a modified exhibit that was used with | 12 | | economical to reduce irrigation by one-third |
| 13 | | Mark Masters in his testimony. But do you see | 13 | | rather than cutting irrigation entirely. Right? |
| | | , , | 14 | ^ | |
| 14 | | here where it says Shellman Farm Cotton Yield at | | Α. | Yes. As a hypothetical, if it were feasible to |
| 15 | Λ | the top of this first page? | 15 | 0 | do that. |
| 16 | A. | The first one for me is peanut yield, but I can | 16 | | All right. Well |
| 17 | _ | find cotton yield. | 17 | | I'm |
| 18 | | Okay. Well, I have peanut yield, too. | 18 | Q. | let's look and see how feasible it actually |
| 19 | A. | So should I stay with the Shellman Farm peanut | 19 | | was. So can you turn with me to tab 9, please, |
| 20 | _ | yield? | 20 | | which is FX-929. |
| 21 | | We can go with peanut yield. | 21 | | Yes. |
| 22 | A. | Okay. | 22 | Q. | And here we have just taken the data I think |
| 23 | Q. | And do you see sprinkler 100 percent, 66 percent, | 23 | | you may remember this from your deposition. We |
| 24 | | 33 percent, and then nonirrigated in the column | 24 | | just have taken the data for cotton at 66 percent |
| 25 | | headings? | 25 | | and cotton for 33 percent sprinkler, and we have |
| | | | 1 | | THE DEPORTING ORGUD |
| 1 | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |

4467 1 done the same thing for peanuts 66 percent and 1 met a number of needs? 2 2 peanuts 33 percent. We have a row for dry years He wasn't trying to eliminate in his deficit 3 and a row for all years. 3 irrigation approach all irrigation; was he? 4 And this is all drawn from the same data you A. 4 So I think what you said is right. I would 5 used from the Shellman study. Right? 5 change the words a little bit, and that is what 6 A. That's correct. 6 he was attempting to do was to identify a 7 Q. Okay. And you would agree -- and I think you did 7 perfectly perfect cost-effective allocation of 8 in your deposition -- that these are fair 8 irrigation reductions to get the most you could 9 representations of what the results were at these 9 get with the least possible cost. 10 levels of irrigation. Right? 10 And I just didn't consider the instrument --11 A. Again, I'm willing to -- we don't want to take 11 the policy instrument that would be feasible to 12 time to go back to the original data. I'm 12 accomplish that, which is why I --13 willing to stipulate that this represents the 13 Q. I think you did and would agree with me that it's 14 original data. 14 possible to run an auction; you just thought that 15 **Q.** So you see 87 percent for cotton at 66 percent 15 the way he was doing it was a little too complex. 16 16 sprinkler; and, likewise, for peanuts at 66 Is that right? 17 percent sprinkler, 95 percent yield in dry years? 17 Α. My opinion is that an auction, because of the 18 A. Yes, I see that. 18 issue of connectivity, would not accomplish that 19 Q. Okay. And there's, you know, plenty of data 19 cost-effective allocation. 20 20 to be reviewed there; but the point I want to Remember, the cost effectiveness is in terms 21 21 make, if I can ask you to turn back to tab 8, of cfs, not in terms of water not applied. 22 22 please --Q. You remember our deposition; don't you? 23 A. Yes. 23 And I asked you if it was possible to conduct 24 Q. -- is that when you did your analysis, you didn't 24 an auction in the Flint River Basin. Right? 25 look at sprinkler 66 percent; you didn't look 25 A. And I probably said it is possible. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4466 4468 1 at sprinkler 33 percent. You just compared 1 Q. Okay. 2 2 sprinkler 100 percent to no irrigation at No, I'm saying but it wouldn't achieve his 3 all? 3 cost-effective allocation because it wouldn't A. The reason that I did that is that I wanted 4 take account of connectivity because the farmers 4 5 5 aren't going to be economically sensitive to to focus on what were the costs of achieving 6 Dr. Sunding's proposed remedy. He was assessing 6 that. 7 the cost. And it seemed to me that the method 7 Q. But you -- just to be clear, I think we're 8 8 he used, which was perfectly cost-effective probably on the same page, sir; but I just 9 allocation across four or five variables, 9 want to be incredibly clear. You didn't look 10 10 something like 2,000 different combinations of to see what would happen if those farmers were 11 them, I couldn't see that being achieved. And, 11 required to irrigate less than they currently 12 therefore, I sought to identify a means in which 12 do. Right? 13 one could strive to achieve those reductions in 13 A. So as I sit here now, I don't recall that I 14 applications of irrigation water. And that 14 looked at that alternative, what the economics 15 included -- rather than the 10 percent increments 15 would be. 16 that he used, it was essentially equivalent to an 16 **Q.** All right, sir. There are several other measures 17 irrigation buy-back, which --17 that we have talked about in this trial that 18 **Q.** Okay. So you just assumed that people wouldn't 18 Georgia could undertake. And to organize our 19 19 irrigate at all? discussion of those measures, I would like you to 20 20 A. I assumed that those would be the requirements turn to tab 10 where you will find JX-154. 21 21 that this -- that an entity such as the State or Α. Yes. 22 whoever could or would put in place. 22 Q. And, sir, I don't recall if you have seen this 23 23 **Q.** But you understand, don't you, that Dr. Sunding document before; but just for a minute, if you 24 was attempting to limit irrigation to a perfectly 24 could to yourself -- and I won't burden you with 25 rational economic and environmental level that 25 much more reading, but just the last paragraph THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4471 1 on the -- on page 1 and the first paragraph of 1 comment on that. 2 2 Q. Okay. We'll get back to that because I think page 2, and then the bullets in the middle of 3 page 2. 3 it's an important question when you figure how A. So it starts, Director Turner? 4 much would it really cost the State. **Q.** It starts, Director Turner. Exactly right. 5 And we're talking about the State paying A. You want me to read that paragraph? 6 here; we're not talking about farmers incurring Q. Yes. 7 costs. Right? 8 A. Yes. 8 The State would pay them not to apply 9 Q. Two paragraphs, plus I'm going to invite your 9 irrigation water; isn't that right? 10 attention to the middle of the second page where 10 A. That's right. I would say as an economist, the 11 there are a number of bullets there. Do you see 11 way I look at this -- and I think any economist 12 those, sir? 12 would -- mainstream economics is that a cost is 13 A. Yes. Should I read those now? 13 still a cost. If I'm doing a benefit-cost 14 Q. Yes. We'll walk through them, so you don't have 14 analysis, I'm looking at the costs in aggregate, 15 to read them all at once. 15 whether they're paid by farmers, they're paid by the state government, or they're paid by the 16 16 But I'll start with the fourth of the five, 17 17 if I could, sir, acquiring easements for federal government. 18 18 permanent removal from irrigation. You did **Q.** Well, that's fair; but you also have part of your 19 analyze that; didn't you? 19 analysis that looks at distributional impacts; 20 20 A. Yes. Well, in the sense of -- in two ways. don't you? 21 One was in terms of the deficit irrigation 21 A. That's correct. 22 22 **Q.** And so if the State -- the entire State is paying modifications, I certainly did. And then also, 23 when I looked at Dr. Sunding's hedonic analysis. 23 farmers for a right to prevent them from 24 I'm assuming that easements are the same as 24 irrigating, that's not necessarily the same as if 25 buy-backs. 25 farmers are just prohibited from irrigating in THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4470 4472 **Q.** Hedonic analysis is kind of an arcane word. That 1 the Lower Flint. Right? 2 just means the amount of money that you would pay 2 A. So if the State were paying them, it would not be 3 in order to grant or to obtain an easement. Is 3 the same. But the state revenues to pay them 4 that basically how it would apply in this 4 have to come from somewhere. It's either tax 5 context? 5 dollars, cutting education programs, cutting 6 A. It was his attempt to estimate what would be the 6 other programs for farmers. I don't know. 7 cost to the State to --7 **Q.** Okay. But then you would look at how much money 8 8 **Q.** So we're talking about the State acquiring rights the State would pay and compare that to a 9 to remove people from their permitted amount of 9 different denominator than you would if you were 10 10 irrigation. Is that right? looking at impacts on farmers in the Lower Flint. 11 11 A. That's correct. Is that right? 12 **Q.** Okay. So somebody who is permitted and had a 12 A. I'm sorry. I didn't understand about the 13 13 grandfathered permit that wasn't restricted in denominator. 14 any way might be bought out of the right to 14 **Q.** This will just be a short departure from our 15 irrigate. They could still use the land for 15 document, but you have in your analysis a 16 farming; they just wouldn't irrigate. Is that 16 concept, gross regional product; don't you? 17 17 A. That's correct, sir. 18 A. Yes. Under the proposal here, they would be able 18 Q. Like the gross national product, but it's 19 19 to have dry-land agriculture. regional? 20 20 **Q.** Okay. Have you looked to see at all if the State Α. Precisely. 21 21 of Georgia has the right to suspend irrigation on **Q.** And for the ACF Basin in the State of Georgia, 22 22 a grandfathered permit? it's about \$282 billion; isn't it? 23 A. Yes. That's my recollection, something like 23 A. You mean legally has the right? **Q.** Legally has the right. 24 24 A. So I'm an economist; I'm not a lawyer. I won't 25 **Q.** And for all of the production of row crops in the THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4475 1 ACF Basin in Georgia, it's about \$1.3 billion per 1 you? 2 year roughly; is that right? 2 A. I'm not sure if I have seen the USDA data, but I 3 A. That's about -- that's correct. 3 would say that's what I was estimating and what Q. Okay. Dr. Sunding was trying to estimate when we were A. Approximately. 5 looking at the foregone profits if you didn't 6 Q. And if you were looking at an ACF Basin-wide 6 have irrigated acreage. 7 comparison, not thinking about how much you're 7 Okay. Let's just look at these two purchase 8 8 prices I talked about for a minute. And let's go actually impacting farming activity, but just 9 looking at those two totals, you're talking about 9 to tab 11, FX-927; could we, please. 10 1.3 billion versus 282 billion. So less than 10 A. Yes. 11 half a percent. Right? 11 **Q.** And here we have a USDA National Agricultural 12 A. No, that's correct. That comparison is a half 12 Statistic Service publication. I have -- we have 13 a percent. But, you know, what strikes me, if 13 got several in the binder here. We'll skip many 14 we are talking about distributional matters, 14 of them. 15 the way you characterized it, then I think about 15 Α. Okay. 16 16 the fact that the agricultural row crops in **Q.** But this one is a summary publication where the 17 terms of the direct value within the area of 17 first graph or table -- I should say table looks 18 18 the Lower Flint, we're going to be looking at at farmland average values per acre. Do you see 19 something like 5 percent of the overall output 19 that, sir? 20 20 of the area. So --A. I see that, yes. 21 **Q.** Okay. Sir, if you were restricting farmers and 21 Q. And this is, of course, for the Southeast; so 22 22 just cutting them off with no compensation at they have Georgia and Florida and Alabama and 23 all, that's what you're talking about when you 23 South Carolina. Do you see those, sir? A. Yes, I do. 24 say 5 percent of the local area impact. Right? 24 25 A. No. I meant that the cost, again, whether or not 25 Q. So I'm looking at the first table. And I would THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4474 4476 1 it's the cost to the farmers or it's the cost to 1 invite you to follow me along across from Georgia 2 2 the government that's distributed to others. as you get to irrigated crop land average value 3 You were talking about denominators. And I 3 for 2016. Do you see that, sir? 4 A. Yes. was saying if, instead, I used the denominator of 4 5 5 looking at the Lower Flint Basin, then I'm **Q.** \$4,000 per ache; isn't that right? 6 6 A. I'm sorry. I'm not seeing the 4,000. I'm seeing talking about 5 percent. 7 7 3410. **Q.** I'm just talking about easements for a moment 8 8 paid for by the State. So let's focus on that, All crop land, you said, or irrigated? 9 if I could. 9 Q. Irrigated. 10 You know that USDA throughout the United 10 A. Irrigated 2016, yes. 11 States looks at the value of irrigated farmland 11 Q. Okay. And you make a fair point. All crop land 12 12 is 3410. Irrigated is 4,000. And nonirrigated and compares it every year with the value of 13 13 is 3200. unirrigated farmland; don't you? 14 A. Compares the values. 14 A. I see that. 15 **Q.** Compares the values, right. 15 Q. And let me just pause here. That's an \$800 16 So that would mean that you gather a lot of 16 difference: isn't it? 17 data -- the USDA does -- and then they would look 17 A. Yes. 18 at what an appropriate purchase price for 18 Now, keep in mind, again, I would have to 19 irrigated farmland with irrigation equipment 19 review this part of the census of agriculture to 20 versus unirrigated farmland with no irrigation 20 know because census -- USDA census of agriculture 21 equipment. Right? 21 treats farms as -- I believe they're defined as 22 22 A. To look at what the appropriate purchase price having annual revenues greater than a thousand 23 23 would be, what would come out of an auction if dollars. So we have very, very small, 24 24 essentially nonprofessional operations, hobby you carried one out? 25 Q. Right. And you have seen that USDA data; haven't 25 farms, farms where people are supplementing their THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4477 4479 1 income in other ways. But --Q. Yes. 2 Q. Well, luckily, sir, Dr. Sunding looked at a whole 2 Α. Well, again, I think these include many, many, 3 range of farms --3 many extremely small farms that were probably not 4 A. Yes. even participating in the auctions. I don't 5 Q. -- you know, at actual prices. He gathered data 5 6 from all the sources you would need to, and his 6 Q. Sir, there's actually a couple studies we can 7 number for the cost of an easement matches very 7 look at in Georgia where -- where this was 8 8 evaluated, just like Dr. Sunding did. So if you closely what you got here in the delta between 9 irrigated and nonirrigated farms on the USDA 9 could turn, please, to tab 14, FX-928. 10 10 A. Yes. 11 So this shows a difference of \$800 where 11 Q. And I think you probably have seen these studies 12 Dr. Sunding has \$864. Is that right? 12 before. Here is the first one. It's called 13 A. Something else you might wish to look at would be 13 Estimating the Value of Irrigation Water in 14 when actual auctions were carried out, since they 14 Georgia. And, you know, this one does two 15 weren't carried out. And if you do the 15 things. One, it polls real estate agents to 16 16 arithmetic with those, then you're going to find understand the difference in the value of an 17 not a difference of \$800; but you will find that 17 irrigated versus an unirrigated acre. And this 18 18 the buy-back for those two years, 20 -is a little bit old, but it's just about \$800, 19 **Q.** 2001? 19 800 to a thousand; isn't it? 20 20 A. 2001, 2002. I'm just trying to save a little time. Have 21 21 **Q.** That's a one-year buy-back. Right? you seen this before? 22 22 Each of those is a one-year buy-back? A. I don't know if I have seen this one. 23 Yes, but I'm going to convert. I'm going to do 23 Α. I flipped ahead; and I have seen the next 24 the mathematics. 24 one, if you would like to --25 Q. Okay. 25 Q. Okay. And then \$913 per acre is their value of THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4478 4480 A. I'm going to convert it to an ongoing buy-back. 1 irrigation water? 2 Instead of 854, we're going to get about 2,000 to 2 Α. Are you referring to Petrie and Taylor? 3 \$2,500. 3 **Q.** I'm referring right now to Spurgeon, Q. You know, don't you, that USDA also looks at the SPURGEON, and Mullin, MULLIN. 4 4 5 5 one-year rental value, right, when it reconciles So I'll turn the page with you; and we'll go 6 6 all these things? to tab 15, FX-925, Real Estate Analysis and --7 A. Uh-huh. 7 analysis. And you would agree with me in this 8 **Q.** And it looks at both the one-year data type of 8 article, which you have seen before -- the 9 9 thing you just referred to and to the purchase article is titled Estimating the Value of Water 10 price per acre. You know it does that; right? 10 Use Permits -- the information they got from real 11 11 A. Yes. All that I'm saying, counselor, is that if estate agents is that the difference between an 12 12 you look at the actual empirical experience of irrigated acre and a nonirrigated acre is about 13 13 when in the -- in that part of Georgia auctions five to \$700. Right? 14 were carried out, what the prices were at the 14 Α. So I did review this because Dr. Sunding referred 15 15 to it, and I referred to it as well. This has auctions, and then you do the -- essentially the 16 reverse of the discounting in order to get a 16 in common something quite important with 17 present value to find out what the ease -- what 17 Dr. Sunding's hedonic analysis is that given the 18 that implies the permanent easement would have 18 method he uses, he's not estimating the value of 19 been, then you find a -- my recollection is about 19 irrigation. He and Petrie and Taylor are 20 \$2,500 instead of 854. 20 valuing -- are looking at the value of the option 21 21 **Q.** You wouldn't take the position ever, would you, to irrigate. And they're quite different. 22 22 Q. that the cost of obtaining this legal right, an Well, you know -- I'm sorry, sir. I don't mean 23 23 easement, is greater than the actual cost of the to interrupt you; but you know, don't you, that 24 24 acre itself. Right? USDA, when it calculates the value of an acre of 25 25 irrigated land, it includes the irrigation Well -- you mean, you're looking at these?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4483 1 equipment plus the -- whatever right you have to 1 to deeper aguifers. Do you see that, sir? 2 irrigate. Right? 2 Α. Yes, I do. 3 A. So I'm not referring -- I understand what you're 3 Q. All right. Could you turn with me to tab 20, referring to; and I'm referring to the fact that 4 please. 5 the option value is going to be substantially A. Yes. 6 less than what the value of the irrigation is All right. Have you seen at tab 20 FX-56 before? 7 itself. 7 I don't recognize it, but it's possible at some 8 Q. Well, let's look at what you have and what all 8 9 these other sources show. So if you could turn 9 Q. Well, Dr. Cowie and I believe Director Turner 10 10 both testified about this. And I'm certain to tab 17 with me, please. 11 A. Yes. 11 Dr. Cowie did. She prepared this for Director 12 **Q.** And this is our demonstrative comparing how you 12 Turner. 13 calculated the cost of acquiring an acre with how 13 And if I could ask you to turn with me, 14 USDA data evaluates it and how Dr. Sunding. And 14 please, to page 10 of this document. 15 you will see here that your numbers are 9 to 10 15 Α. 16 times as high; aren't they? 16 Q. And do you see where it says option 2B? 17 A. So when you refer to Stavins's first estimate, 17 Α. Yes. 18 you're -- you calculated this number, which I 18 Q. Actions to support flows for endangered species 19 don't -- I don't recognize. You calculated this 19 and basin contributions to state line flows? 20 from my February report or from --20 Α. Yes. 21 21 Q. You know, don't you, that Dr. Cowie and Director **Q.** From your prefiled direct, demonstrative 17. 22 A. Prefiled direct. 22 Turner were both affiliated with Georgia's 23 23 So what I would tell you is that the approach Environmental Protection Division. Right? A. Yes. 24 that's used here, as you probably know, is to 24 25 look at the lost agricultural productivity. If 25 Q. Okay. So do you remember now seeing this THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4482 4484 1 you use Dr. Sunding's analysis, you will get a 1 document before? 2 number which is smaller than this, but quite 2 A. I apologize. I don't. But, you know, I have 3 close to it. 3 looked at hundreds, if not more, documents. **Q.** And there are quite a number of documents in this 4 I'm talking about his February report, the 4 5 5 one I'm most familiar with. case. 6 Q. His February report in appendix B says \$864; 6 If you could turn to page 12, you will find a 7 7 Georgia EPD estimate of the cost of moving doesn't it? 8 A. No. He didn't -- what I'm talking about is if 8 farmers from the Upper Floridan Aquifer in the 9 9 Lower Flint Basin to lower aquifers. Do you see you use the method that I used here, which is 10 looking at lost agricultural productivity, and 10 that? 11 Which of the -- there are three parts to the you look at where he does that as well, which 11 Α. 12 12 is his deficit irrigation calculation, and then table. 13 13 Q. There's three options. The one I was referring you do the division, you will get the result 14 that is not that far from mine. I carried that 14 to is the last option on page 12. 15 out. 15 Groundwater and surface water withdrawals? Α. 16 **Q.** Sir, your numbers here to acquire an easement on 16 Q. Yes. 17 land are more than twice the cost of the actual 17 A. In 4-mile corridor? 18 land; isn't that right? 18 Q. Yes. You're aware, aren't you, that 19 A. So I would have to look further to be able to 19 Dr. Sunding's estimates for transfer of 20 make that -- you know that judgment. 20 farmers in the Lower Flint to lower aquifers 21 Q. Okay. Let's go back to tab 10, which is Joint 21 are consistent with these numbers on this Georgia 22 22 Exhibit 154, again. And we're going to pick back EPD document; aren't you? 23 23 up with the bullet points, if we could. A. Well, I can't -- I can't validate that. 24 24 And I would like to go now to the first of The reason why I didn't explore this 25 those bullets, which is transferring water users 25 particular measure of the many measures that were THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4487 1 proposed was that my understanding is that 1 So if I could, sir, let me focus just a bit 2 2 Georgia is still engaged in examining the on the Flint River Drought Protection Act. 3 feasibility of this because of the rate of 3 During your deposition you weren't particularly 4 replenishment, of recharge of those particular familiar with that; were you? 5 aquifers, and whether or not it would be a 5 A. But you piqued my interest, so I have become more 6 sustainable practice. 6 familiar, counselor. 7 Q. Well, this document is from 2012. But you know 7 Okay. Good. Okay. So you're aware that 8 they have been studying this same issue for many 8 multiple documents in this case explain how you 9 years before 2012. Right? 9 can predict drought effectively; aren't you? 10 A. It's an important issue. 10 A. I have seen discussions of that. 11 Q. Okay. Now, could you go with me back to tab 10, 11 Okay. So is it your position that it's 12 Exhibit JX-154; and we'll quickly cover the other 12 impossible to predict drought? 13 items here and move along. 13 A. It's my understanding from the experts in the 14 The next item is augmenting streamflow from 14 case who are, you know, hydrologists, so other --15 groundwater. Do you see that, sir? 15 either other witnesses, whether they're experts 16 16 A. I do see that. or fact witnesses, that it is difficult to 17 Q. Now, you didn't look at that; did you? 17 predict droughts in advance. Not --18 18 A. So this is a proposal to use groundwater aquifers **Q.** Okay. Well, sir, let me just see if you have 19 as essentially storage batteries and then to pump 19 seen a couple of these documents before. 20 20 And you weren't here for the testimony of it back up. 21 Q. At tab -- as an underground reservoir more or 21 Director Reheis; were you? 22 22 less Α. No, I was not. 23 23 Q. Okay. So at tab 26, can you quickly look at At tab 23, do you find FX-53, which is an analysis -- I'm sorry if I did that -- an 24 24 FX-231 from October 2011 from the state's 25 analysis from 2010 of exactly that type of 25 geologist and tell me if you have seen that THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4486 4488 1 activity. Do you see that, sir? 1 before. 2 A. Yes, I do see it now. 2 A. I don't recall seeing this, unless perhaps you Q. Have you ever seen this document before? 3 3 showed it to me at deposition. Q. Okay. At tab 27 can you quickly look at FX-232 4 A. I don't believe so. 4 5 Q. Okay. And you have never analyzed this issue 5 and tell me if you have seen it before? 6 6 before; have you? A. So I have seen materials that were developed for 7 7 the ACF Stakeholders Group. I don't recall if A. No, I did not analyze that alternative. 8 Q. So you don't have a cost listed or, indeed, a 8 this is one that I had an opportunity to see. 9 benefit to share with the Court on that; do you? 9 Q. All right, sir. Let's, if we could, turn to tab 31 which is Joint Exhibit 47. 10 A. I do not. 10 11 Q. Okay. So can you look at the next item on that 11 Α. Yes. 12 12 list was aquifer storage and recovery. **Q.** And can you describe what that is, please. 13 13 A. I'm sorry. Can you direct me back to which tab A. That is the U.S. Environmental Protection 14 it is? 14 Agency's Guidelines For Preparing Economic 15 **Q.** I'm sorry. I'm going fast. 15 Analysis, December 2010, updated May 2014. 16 And it's tab 10, JX-154. It might be even 16 Q. Now, sir, you did in your prefiled direct and in 17 easier if you took it out of your binder so you 17 your report perform an analysis of costs and 18 can keep it handy. 18 benefits or benefits and costs, as you say; isn't 19 But aquifer storage and recovery, that's not 19 that right? 20 something you analyzed either; is it? 20 Α. That's correct, sir. 21 21 A. That's actually what I thought we were referring Q. All right. Can you turn in this Guidelines For 22 22 to before. So, no, I did not examine that. Preparing Economic Analysis, JX-47, to page 5-9, 23 23 Q. Okay. Now, we have already talked about the last please. 24 bullet, which was the only remaining one, 24 Yes, sir. 25 temporary removal of land for irrigation. 25 And there, do you see section 5.4.1 titled Full THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4489 1 Compliance? 1 were doing your analysis today, you would have to 2 2 A. Yes, sir. understand whether or not these were truly in 3 **Q.** So the next series of questions are going to 3 compliance, Right? 4 4 relate to your analysis of valuating benefits and Well, you know, as an economist, the first thing 5 costs or costs and benefits from reducing 5 I would say is that I'll recognize that there is 6 irrigation in the Flint River Basin and elsewhere 6 disagreement between Florida and Georgia 7 in the ACF. 7 regarding how much acreage is permitted or not. 8 So here, I invite you to read the first 8 From an economic perspective, the right 9 paragraph under 5.4.1, full compliance, please. 9 economic analysis is going to take account of the 10 A. Silently? 10 cost of reducing the irrigation water whether 11 Q. Silently, please. 11 that acreage is permitted or not because either 12 A. Yes. 12 way, it's a cost. So it would not actually 13 Q. Now, do you see where it says, analysts should 13 change my economic analysis of the benefits and 14 develop baseline and policy scenarios that assume 14 costs of the proposed remedies. 15 full compliance with existing and newly-enacted 15 Don't you think that the State of Georgia ought 16 16 regulations? to enforce its laws? 17 A. Yes. 17 You know, as a matter of -- I have no expertise 18 Q. When you were doing your cost-benefit analysis, 18 to say who should do what. 19 you were essentially performing the same type of 19 Q. Okay. But you have expertise in evaluating costs 20 20 regulatory analysis that EPA does when it and benefits. And at least as a general matter, 21 21 evaluates new regulations. Right? you would want to understand what compliance with 22 22 A. In basic terms. And I would note, if I might, Georgia law actually means. Right? 23 that the sentence begins, as a general rule. 23 A. Yes. I'm simply saying as a matter of economics, 24 And the very next section, 5.4.2, is titled 24 for a good benefit-cost analysis, I would not 25 Under-Compliance and specifies at length the 25 be giving due credit to the proposals from THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4490 4492 1 conditions under which one would use an 1 Dr. Sunding if I were to ignore this. So I 2 2 under-compliance baseline. take -- I would, nevertheless, take into account 3 **Q.** Let's just focus on the general rule for now, if 3 what are the real costs, whether it's permitted 4 we could. Could you turn with me to page --4 or not. 5 5 please, tab 32, which is the direct testimony of If you were to press me to say -- in the 6 Director Judson Turner. 6 interest of time here, to press me to say -- to 7 A. Yes, sir. 7 hypothesize about eliminating the costs, then my 8 8 **Q.** And have you seen this before? response would be then what we would need to do 9 A. I don't believe that I have, no. 9 is to eliminate the cfs impacts as well. 10 Q. Now, sir, I would invite your attention to 10 Q. Well, if you enforce the law and it reduces the 11 11 pages 37 and 38. cfs impact, that's a benefit to the State of 12 A. Yes. 12 Florida; isn't it? 13 Q. If, sir, you're not familiar with this topic, I 13 A. No. They would both come out, because you're 14 would invite you to read paragraphs 125 and 127 14 putting into it the baseline. 15 on page 37, please. 15 A fundamental principle, counselor, of 16 A. Not -- just 125 and 127? 16 benefit-cost analysis is we use the same baseline 17 Q. You can read it all, if you like; but I'm trying 17 on the benefit side and the cost side. 18 to save you a little time. 18 Otherwise, all sorts of mischief can be done. 19 A. Yes. 19 Q. Well, let's just focus on one sentence, if we 20 20 Q. All right, sir. Were you aware of this special could, sir. It says in paragraph 27, the initial 21 21 task force to investigate roughly 90,000 stages of the task force's activities will focus 22 22 illegally-irrigated acres? on those acres that have the greatest impact on A. I had heard about the task force. It was 23 streamflow. 23 24 recently established; correct. 24 Do you see that, sir? 25 Q. And you agree with me, wouldn't you, that if you 25 A. I'm sorry. I was pouring myself some water. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4493 4495 1 Q. Oh, yes. Please do. 1 agricultural engineering are the two that stand I'm in the third --2 2 out at the moment to me. 3 A. Yes. 3 Q. Do you know if any of these individuals have any Q. -- sentence. experience at all with compliance or enforcement A. I see the sentence. Thank you. of Georgia law? **Q.** And you don't know exactly what the task force is A. I don't have any way of speculating about that. 7 doing at this point; do you? 7 Do you see the name Gerald Long, president of 8 A. I don't know about their activities right now, 8 Georgia Farm Bureau in there? 9 9 A. Yes. I do. 10 **Q.** You don't even know how the task force is 10 Q. Do you know that the Georgia Farm Bureau has 11 composed; do you? 11 filed an amicus brief in this case taking a 12 A. I don't believe I do. I don't remember. 12 position on whether or not Florida should get 13 **Q.** Do you think the task force is likely composed of 13 more water? 14 enforcement personnel that have experience 14 A. No. I don't know anything about any of the 15 enforcing Georgia law? 15 amicus briefs. 16 **Q.** There is a nice dream sequence portrayed in it. 16 A. I won't speculate. I don't know who would be on 17 the task force. It might be speculators --17 Have you seen that amicus brief? Α. pardon me. It might be stakeholders. 18 No. 18 Q. You haven't seen that? 19 **Q.** I hope not. 19 20 20 A. A. I didn't mean speculator. As you would say, No. 21 21 Q. Okay. You have looked at regulations and have strike that. Q. I have on occasion said that. 22 22 assessed baselines with compliance and 23 A. Yes. 23 noncompliance in law in the past; haven't you? A. I mean, in different -- I want to answer 24 So it might be stakeholders. I don't know 24 25 25 who is on the task force, sir. accurately. In different analyses that I have THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4494 4496 Q. Well, let's see who is on the task force; and 1 done, I have sometimes assumed compliance and 2 2 then we can evaluate whether it's likely they sometimes assumed noncompliance, particularly 3 will actually enforce the law. 3 because some regulatory proposals or policy A. Yes. proposals are specifically intended to target a 4 4 5 5 Q. So let's turn to tab 35, FX-921. situation in which there's previously been 6 A. Yes, sir. 6 noncompliance. So you don't want to assume full 7 **Q.** And I would invite you to just read through this 7 compliance for that. document, if you could. It begins with, whereas, Q. All right. Let's talk a little bit further about 8 8 9 the agricultural permitting task force was 9 compliance, but let's move to tab 36 to do that. 10 established. 10 And it's Joint Exhibit 21. Do you see that, sir? 11 A. Uh-huh. 11 A. Yes, sir. 12 Q. Do you see that? 12 **Q.** And I'm not going to spend a huge amount of time 13 A. Yes. 13 on this document because we have spent a lot of 14 Q. And just go ahead and read it. It's called a 14 time in this case on this document. So I'm only 15 compliance task force. 15 going to look at a couple very specific things. 16 A. Yes. 16 And I invite your attention to page 38, if I 17 Q. All right, sir. Do you notice that there are 17 might, first. 18 quite a number of farming interests on this list 18 A. Yes, sir. 19 of members of the task force -- on the compliance 19 Q. Now, do you see there where it says -- there's a 20 20 task force? reference to the Groundwater Use Act about midway 21 21 A. Yes. It seems to be a mix of farmers or farm down the page? 22 22 Α. representatives, government agencies, and 23 23 And then it says, the Regional Water Development academics, several professors. **Q.** Several professors of agriculture? 24 and Conservation Plan. Do you see that? A. Of water resource management and policy and of 25 A. In bold. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

| | | TRIAL- December | 1, 20 | 16 (VC | I. XVII) Florida v. Georgi |
|--|----------------------|---|--|----------------------|--|
| | | 4497 | | | 4499 |
| 1 | Q. | Yes. And then it says, such plan shall include | 1 | | payments, crop insurance for yield loss and crop |
| 2 | | water development conservation and sustainable | 2 | | insurance for crop loss. Right? |
| 3 | | use. Do you see that, sir? | 3 | A. | So this is very similar to something we were |
| 4 | A. | Yes, I do. | 4 | | discussing a few moments ago. If it is |
| 5 | Q. | And then after that in the next sentence, upon | 5 | | subsidized, the money is coming from somewhere. |
| 6 | | adoption of a regional plan, all permits issued | 6 | | It is still a cost. In this case, it might be a |
| 7 | | by the Division shall be consistent with that | 7 | | cost to the federal government. And if it |
| 8 | | plan. Do you see that, sir? | 8 | Q. | It might be a cost to me and you; right? |
| 9 | Α. | Yes, I do. | 9 | Α. | Exactly. It comes out of tax revenues. |
| 10 | Q. | Do you remember during your deposition we focused | 10 | Q. | Right. |
| 11 | | on the sustainable use criteria in the Upper | 11 | Α. | So it's still a cost. |
| 12 | | Flint and the Lower Flint Basin. Right? | 12 | Q. | Have you taken the time to go back and look and |
| 13 | _ | The two tables we looked at? | 13 | | see how much the federal government subsidizes |
| 14 | _ | The two tables. Right. | 14 | | farming in the State of Georgia? |
| 15 | Α. | I do recall that. | 15 | A. | Do you mean empirically to look historically at |
| 16 | Q. | But when you did your economic analysis, you | 16 | _ | what the actual payments have been? |
| 17 | | didn't assume compliance with those sustainable | 17 | Q. | Well, how about the payments for last year? |
| 18 | | use criteria; did you? | 18 | Α. | For the last year, no; I haven't done that. |
| 19 | | You assumed noncompliance? | 19 | Q. | Would it surprise you to learn that more than a |
| 20 | Α. | So my understanding is that those were a modeling | 20 | | quarter billion dollars has been provided to |
| 21 | | exercise and are not specifically requirements. | 21 | | farmers of crops in Georgia by the federal |
| 22 | | So for those and other reasons, I didn't look at | 22 | | government |
| 23 | _ | them. | 23 | _ | Well |
| 24 | Q. | All right. Well, we looked at the Groundwater | 24 | Q. | last year? |
| 25 | | Use Act. Let's shift now to page 12 in your | 25 | A. | it would neither surprise me or not surprise |
| | | THE REPORTING GROUP | | | THE REPORTING GROUP |
| | | Mason & Lockhart | | | Mason & Lockhart |
| | | macon a comman | 1 | | Mason & Lockhait |
| | | 4498 | | | 4500 |
| 1 | | 4498 prefiled direct, if we might. | 1 | | |
| 1 2 | A. | 4498 prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. | 1 2 | Q. | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the |
| | A. Q. | 4498 prefiled direct, if we might. | | Q. | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. |
| 2 | _ | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? | 2 | Q. | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of |
| 2 3 4 5 | Q. A. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. | 2 3 4 5 | Q. | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from |
| 2 3 4 5 6 | Q. A. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? | 2 3 4 5 6 | | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. |
| 2 3 4 5 | Q. A. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 | | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | | 4500 me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 | Α. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 | | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 | Α. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | A. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | A. Q. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take into account the cost, and certainly not the | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | A. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. But can you turn with me to page 56 of your |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take into account the cost, and certainly not the payments. | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | A. Q. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. But can you turn with me to page 56 of your prefiled direct testimony, and in particular |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take into account the cost, and certainly not the payments. All right, sir. You realize that farmers can | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | A. Q. A. Q. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. But can you turn with me to page 56 of your prefiled direct testimony, and in particular Stavins demo 19. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take into account the cost, and certainly not the payments. All right, sir. You realize that farmers can get, with a federal subsidy to their premium | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | A. Q. A. Q. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. But can you turn with me to page 56 of your prefiled direct testimony, and in particular Stavins demo 19. Yes, sir. |
| 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. | prefiled direct, if we might. Yes. And there I would like to look at what is called Stavins demo 5. Do you see that, sir? Yes, I do. And this seems peculiar to me, at least. Maybe to others. But do you see under peanuts there, the return per acre is almost always negative? Yes, I do. And that's because this graph here, Stavins demo 5, doesn't take into account federal subsidies or price support for peanuts; does it? That's correct. I state that in my footnote. Well, it's more than just peanuts; isn't it? You didn't take into account price or other financial aid from the federal government to farmers for any crop; do you? That's correct. All right. And, in fact, you don't take into account crop insurance of any kind; do you? Right. Neither the I don't believe I take into account the cost, and certainly not the payments. All right, sir. You realize that farmers can | 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | A. Q. A. Q. | me because I don't have a basis for comparing it. Isn't it relevant when you're talking about the loss that might be incurred by farmers from reducing irrigation to think about the impacts of all these federal payments? Let me distinguish. This is an important point. If we're looking at comparing the benefits to the costs, which is the overall thrust of my work, then that subsidy ought to be included because it it's coming from somewhere. And it's a wash. It's going to be a cost to you, and then maybe it's a benefit to the farmers. If we were looking at it in distributional terms, then it could matter; but I would still have to trace through where that money from the federal government is you know, is coming from. Well, sure. And I would invite you to do that. The last day of trial it would be kind of hard now. Yes. But can you turn with me to page 56 of your prefiled direct testimony, and in particular Stavins demo 19. |

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4503 1 **Q.** And there you will find a chart titled Comparison 1 specific numbers? 2 of Conservation Scenarios Costs and Streamflows. 2 A. Actually, I can explain it. These numbers come 3 Do you see that, sir? 3 out of the simulations that I was doing having 4 A. That's -- yes. made what I thought were appropriate adjustments 5 Q. Now, where did you get your information about 5 to Dr. Sunding's analysis. 6 streamflow? 6 Q. Okay. And those simulations didn't include all 7 A. So the -- it depends on which ones you're looking 7 of the information that, and we talked about 8 at. The streamflow for Sunding's are from 8 earlier, that you didn't analyze. Right? 9 Sunding's testimony from his February, his May, 9 A. In terms of other measures, this particular one 10 and his prefiled direct, I believe. The ones 10 is only looking at full deficit irrigation. 11 from my own are from the analysis that I have 11 Correct. 12 carried out. 12 Q. Okay. Thank you, sir. 13 So, for example, the one that you may well 13 There is one issue -- one very short issue 14 remember, just to trigger, you know, the memory, 14 that I just want to approach; and it has to do 15 if you look at the second of mine where it 15 with outdoor water use --16 A. Correct. 16 says, full deficit irrigation, row crops only, 17 the 678 was -- that was the point at which in my 17 Q. -- in metro Atlanta. And I believe you estimated 18 analysis -- do you recall the table -- actually 18 that there would be a huge cost associated with 19 ran out of available land. 19 cutting outdoor water use by, say, greater than 20 20 Q. I remember your tables. So --50 percent or 75 percent in a severe drought; is 21 21 A. That's where that comes from, sir. that right? 22 22 **Q.** But you're not the hydrologist that did this A. So it turns -- that cost turns up tremendously 23 23 analysis? You're not a groundwater hydrologist? between 50 percent and 75 percent; and you see 24 24 the result in this table. A. No. I drew -- I drew on the experts in hydrology 25 25 for the input to that, yes. Q. Here is my question. You know, putting the THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4502 4504 Q. So which expert did you get your cfs modeling 1 difficult parts of your calculations aside for a 2 information from? 2 moment, how much do you really think a homeowner 3 3 A. So the cfs, the impacts were -- were drawing on would pay per month to irrigate a lawn during a 4 Sunding's work and then modifying the acreage 4 drought? 5 5 that would apply. That was, I believe, from A. So, you know, I'm not going to speculate on that. 6 6 This is not only about, you know, irrigating Dr. Panday. 7 Q. And did you use Dr. Panday's and Dr. Bedient's 7 lawns. This is all outdoor water use. 8 numbers about surface and groundwater? 8 Right. But the vast majority of what Sunding --9 A. For connectivity? 9 Dr. Sunding focused on was irrigating lawns. 10 Q. Yes. 10 A. Yes. 11 11 **Q.** So do you think that -- and I'm thinking about A. For the connectivity I believe I was using maybe 12 12 the same as Sunding's. The difference ways in your number. Do you think that there are many of 13 13 terms of the seasonal impact factor, I believe. your neighbors that would pay two or \$3,000 a Q. Well, let me ask you this. There is an analysis 14 14 month to keep their lawn green during the summer? 15 15 that I'm sure you had to employ about how much A. I don't want to speculate. 16 water would flow down the Apalachicola. 16 Okay. Thank you, sir. 17 And these are your numbers. Right? 17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 18 A. Yes. 18 BY MR. PRIMIS: 19 **Q.** 616, 678 --19 Q. Good afternoon, Dr. Stavins. 20 THE REPORTER: Okay. Wait a minute. 20 Good afternoon. BY MR. PERRY: 21 21 **Q.** I would like to take one large step back, and can 22 22 **Q.** -- 682, and 855. you just introduce yourself to the Special Master 23 23 I'm looking at the clock. I'm almost done. and explain your educational background and what

55 of 107 sheets

24

25

24

25

you do for a living.

Sure. So I'm Robert Stavins. I'm the Albert

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

Sir, did you rely on Dr. Bedient's analysis

in his running of ResSim to get these very

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

1 **Pratt Professor of Business and Government at the**

2 John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard

3 University. I direct the Harvard environmental

4 economics program. All of my research is on

environmental and natural resource economics,

6 agricultural economics, and water resource 7 economics being a subset of that.

8 Q. And, Dr. Stavins, in connection with your work in

9 natural resource economics, have you worked with

10 government entities?

5

13

16

3

7

8

20

23

11 A. I have worked with government entities in a

12 variety of capacities. One of them was that I

was appointed by Carol Browner, the administrator

14 of the Environmental Protection Agency in the

15 Clinton administration and reappointed by

Christine Todd Whitman, the administrator of EPA

17 in the George W. Bush administration to be

18 chairman of the Environmental Economics Advisory

19 Committee at the Environmental Protection Agency.

20 **Q.** How long did you hold that position for?

21 A. I believe -- I was on the committee for probably

22 15 years and held the position for perhaps seven 23 or eight until I hit a statutory limit.

24 Q. Dr. Stavins, can you describe what you do as a

25 natural resource economist. What is the field?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

Q. Now, in connection with your work in this case,

2 did you study the economic activity in the ACF

3 Georgia portion of the basin?

A. Yes, I did.

5 Q. And we can --

6 MR. PRIMIS: We have prepared some

7 demonstratives, your Honor, that -- if you 8 want to flip through these, it will move it

9 along

13

16

18

2

7

13

18

19

20

10 BY MR. PRIMIS:

11 Q. Can you turn to demonstrative tab 1 in your book,

12 Mr. Stavins.

Did Mr. Reigstad --

14 A. I did not get a book.

15 Thank you.

MR. PRIMIS: I was supposed to hand out

17 the books out. I'm sorry.

The record should be clear that was not

19 Mr. Reigstad's fault.

20 BY MR. PRIMIS:

21 **Q.** So now turning to the substance, on demonstrative

22 tab 1 could you tell us, sir, what you depict

23 there.

24 A. So I'm looking at industries in the upper

25 Chattahoochee region, so the region of

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

4506

A. So the field of -- I'll say broader,

2 environmental and natural resource economics is

to carry out economic analysis of environmental

4 and natural resource phenomenon, in particular

5 proposed public policies and regulations with 6 particular attention whether or not those

proposed policies or regulations or remedies will

be efficient, meaning a comparison of the

9 benefits and the costs.

10 Q. And Mr. Perry asked you some very specific,

11 narrowly-focused questions. What was your task

12 in this case?

13 Getting kind of out of the weeds, what was

14 the task?

15 A. So my broad task was to examine economic issues

16 that bear upon the fundamentals of the case,

17 i.e., the equitable apportionment of water

18 between the two states and to give particular

19 attention to Dr. Sunding's analysis and

Dr. Daniel Phaneuf's analysis.

21 Q. You mentioned Dr. Phaneuf. We haven't really

22 heard that name, I think, other than maybe in my

opening. Who is that?

24 A. So he had submitted an expert report in February,

25 but I believe he has not been called to testify.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 metropolitan Atlanta essentially, that are

particularly dependent upon access to water. So

3 I looked at the top 10 manufacturing industries,

4 where I'm characterizing the top 10 as the most

5 water intensive; but I'm simply defining as

6 spending the most on water. And you can see that

for them, their total output per year is

8 approximately 29 or \$30 billion, total employees

9 over 35,000.

10 There are also what we call green industries.

11 These are industries that may not be water

12 intensive themselves; they're not using water,

but their business is associated with people who 14 use water. Prime example, of course, would be

15 landscaping services. And if we look at that, we

16 find an additional \$964 million of output per

17 year, 14,000 employees.

> So the total of these two categories in the upper Chattahoochee is about \$31 billion of annual output and close to 50,000 employees.

21 **Q.** Did you study the extent of agricultural economic

22 activity in the -- just to be clear, this is

23 M & I water use --

24 That's correct.

25 Q. -- in the metro Atlanta area?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 A. Yes. This is exclusively M & I water use in the 1 greatest experience is, it's core to activities 2 2 Atlanta metropolitan area. in the following sense. So all regulations that 3 Q. So let's turn to tab 2 and look at economic 3 are above a threshold cost of \$100 million per 4 output and activity in the agricultural sector year are required to carry out what is called a 5 that uses water. Can you tell the Court what you regulatory impact analysis and submit it to the 6 found when you looked there? 6 U.S. Office of Management and Budget, Office of 7 So when we looked at the commercial value of 7 Information and Regulatory Affairs for approval. 8 agriculture within the ACF region of Georgia, 8 To guide that effort OMB has developed Circular 9 if we first look at row and forage crops, we 9 A-4 which provides the framework to be used. 10 see \$1.3 billion in commercial value per year. 10 The other highlight I would mention would be 11 And then if we extend that to look at all 11 at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. 12 agricultural commodities -- so I repeat the 12 There, we also already saw -- and counselor 13 1.3 billion in the second set, so we can add 13 referred to them -- the economic analysis 14 them up -- see that grand total comes to close 14 guidelines. Those are in my opinion the best 15 to \$5 billion annually of commercial value. 15 guidelines that exist now in the federal 16 **Q.** Dr. Stavins, the term benefit-cost analysis came 16 government in any of the departments and agencies 17 up several times on your cross-examination. Do 17 of how to do a regulatory impact or benefit-cost 18 18 you recall that? analysis. 19 A. Yes, I do. 19 Q. Dr. Stavins, one thing we discussed with 20 20 Dr. Sunding is whether it's appropriate to value MR. PRIMIS: And Mr. Perry, like me, 21 21 alleged ecological benefits. How do you approach knows that when you talk to Dr. Stavins, you 22 22 that situation? call it a benefit-cost analysis, not a 23 23 cost-benefit analysis. Well, so it is not always easy; but it is fully 24 BY MR. PRIMIS: 24 appropriate. Indeed, there is a very large 25 **Q.** Is that correct? 25 literature in academia, and I would estimate THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4510 4512 A. That's correct, yes. 1 thousands of articles, maybe tens of thousands of 2 **Q.** So I'll stick with your term. articles of developing methodologies and applying 3 3 A. Thank you. methodologies for estimating the benefits 4 **Q.** Can you explain what you mean by a benefit-cost associated with ecological impacts. 5 5 Q. Did -- have you -- you have reviewed the Florida analysis? 6 6 A. So a benefit-cost analysis, which is absolutely expert work on economics in the case. Right? 7 7 central to economics broadly, and as well to Yes, I have. 8 environmental and natural resource and 8 **Q.** Have any of Florida's experts, whether they 9 9 agricultural economics, is an assessment of the submitted testimony or were not put forward to 10 10 economic value of the benefits of a proposed submit testimony -- did any of them conduct a 11 11 policy compared with the cost of the proposed benefit-cost analysis of Dr. Sunding's proposed 12 12 policy. In order to look at the benefits and the conservation measures? 13 13 costs, we have to look at a change in both cases. Α. No. I don't believe that I have seen a 14 Typically, a change from the status quo or 14 benefit-cost analysis in any case. 15 15 **Q.** Is that significant to you in this case? business as usual to what the world will be like 16 if the policy goes into effect, both on the 16 Well, I was very surprised by it, to be, you 17 17 know, honest. The first thing I thought I would benefit side and the cost side. Q. Is this an accepted methodology in your field? 18 18 see from Florida would be a comparison of 19 A. Absolutely. The literature goes back 75 years. 19 benefits and costs. 20 20 It's the core central of economics. Q. Did you perform a benefit-cost analysis in the 21 21 **Q.** How about government literature? Anything from case? 22 22 the government supporting this idea of a Yes, I did. 23 23 benefit-cost analysis when looking at changed Can you turn to demonstrative 3. 24 environmental policies or proposals? 24 Α. 25 25 So certainly in the federal government where my Does this reflect your benefit-cost analysis? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4513 4515 1 A. Yes. It does. 1 And when you look at that on an annualized 2 2 Q. Can you describe what's depicted here on basis, it comes out to \$40,000 per year, having 3 demonstrative 3? 3 adjusted it for one of the Sunding remedies. A. So what I'm illustrating here are the costs in 4 Q. Now, Dr. Stavins, Florida alleges harm to a the red bar, and then I'll take you to the number of species other than oysters and blue 6 benefits in a moment. 6 crabs. And I think you said that you assumed or 7 At the very first part of the bar, these 7 believed that the value of that other alleged 8 8 are three of the remedies, the measures that harm is de minimis. Correct? 9 Dr. Sunding had proposed. I estimated that the 9 Α. So the reason why I do not include those benefits here is that no estimates that I could 10 row crop irrigation reduction, which he tends to 10 11 refer to as deficit irrigation, would cost 11 translate were provided by Florida. And in my 12 annually \$335 million. That's in terms of lost 12 communications and my reliance upon other 13 profitability to agriculture. 13 experts, it -- they demonstrated that the impacts 14 And for outdoor water use reduction, I 14 in biophysical terms were trivial or in the 15 estimated that the cost of a 50 percent 15 language, de minimis. And, therefore, I 16 16 reduction, which is one of the remedies of three interpret that quite directly as the economic 17 different ones that I believe Dr. Sunding has 17 benefits would be de minimus. 18 looked at, it would be a \$445 million cost. That 18 **Q.** Dr. Stavins, what, if any, conclusions did you 19 is not a simple financial cost. That is 19 reach based on the benefit-cost analysis you have 20 20 something which is just as meaningful, which is a laid out here in demonstrative No. 3? 21 21 Α. welfare cost, a welfare impact. Again, Well, the conclusion I reached, the inescapable 22 22 mainstream economics. conclusion, is a more dramatic one than one 23 23 And then the last, the \$34 million, is the normally sees in a benefit-cost analysis; that 24 24 cost of leak abatement. And this is more in is, that it's not even close, that the annual 25 25 terms of the technologies that are required in cost of the proposed remedy of this particular THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4514 4516 1 the practices. 1 scenario -- but we have seen it from other 2 Q. And what does that total up to about? 2 scenarios -- are over \$800 million a year and 3 3 A. So that comes out to a bit more than \$800 million benefits that, I think it's fair to say, are de 4 4 minimis. 5 5 **Q.** And, Dr. Stavins, you have a line for benefits to That means that the net benefits, the 6 6 Florida. But you said that no one on the Florida benefits minus the cost, would be on the order of 7 side calculated that. Right? 7 negative \$800 million a year. In other words, 8 A. So they didn't do the calculation and certainly 8 the proposed remedy would be making society worse 9 9 didn't compare benefits to costs; but some of the 10 10 Q. Dr. Stavins, I want to come back to this point Florida experts on -- in the biophysical side of 11 11 things as well as Georgia experts did make about the ability to value environmental 12 12 estimates. And although the Florida experts did resources. I'm going to read from Dr. Sunding's 13 13 not provide estimates of most things, one that I testimony. It's paragraph 95. 14 could work with, and so did, was Dr. Jenkins's 14 And you have read that. Right? 15 15 estimates of what would be the impact, not of one A. I probably have. 16 of the proposed Sunding remedies but, rather, of 16 He says, it is beyond the bounds of mainstream 17 17 eliminating all use of water whatsoever by the economic science to estimate the monetary value of the purple bankclimber mussel or salinity 18 State of Georgia. And he then predicted from 18 19 that what would be the increase in the biomass of 19 gradients in Apalachicola Bay or disrupting of --20 oysters and blue crab? 20 or disruption of longstanding cultural and social 21 I then, through a series of what I think are 21 relationships in oystering communities, let alone 22 22 quite conservative assumptions, priced that out. to monetize the value of changes in these 23 23 What did that translate into in terms of resources, as Dr. Stavins would have us do. 24 increased profitability to the people who are 24 Do you recall him saying that? 25 25 A. Yes. gathering the oysters and the crab? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4519 1 Q. And what's your view on that? My recollection is that it's 50 years. 2 2 A. Well, I was very, very surprised to read that. And did Dr. Phaneuf actually annualize that 3 There are entire literatures in environmental 3 value? A. Yes. Dr. Phaneuf took a similar approach, which 4 economics, again, going back 50 years or more 5 looking at methods that can be used and have been 5 I critiqued previously. And he estimated that 6 used repeatedly in published, refereed journal 6 the annual amount was \$25 million. 7 articles and documented in dozens of books for 7 Q. And how does that \$25 million per year figure 8 valuing in economic terms the benefits that would 8 compare to the cost that you have estimated that 9 be forthcoming from ecological services in 9 would accrue to Georgia from Dr. Sunding's remedy 10 general ecologies. So I found it very, very 10 11 surprising. 11 Well, whether or not we call it de minimis, we 12 Q. Dr. Sunding also testified at the trial that 12 would certainly call it vastly smaller than the 13 Florida has spent something like almost half a 13 \$800 million. 14 billion dollars to preserve the Apalachicola 14 Q. Now, Dr. Stavins, Dr. Sunding presented a chart. 15 River and Bay, and that that's an indicator of 15 And I don't know if Mr. Smith can call it up. 16 16 the value of the resources there. Do you recall It's table 4 of his direct at 44. 17 17 that testimony? I don't want to take the time to pass it 18 18 A. I do recall that. around, but we have got it on the screen. 19 **Q.** Do you agree that these expenditures that Florida 19 Α. Yes. 20 20 has made to purchase land in the Apalachicola Bay **Q.** And do you see that for a number of proposed 21 21 region are an indicator of value for the conservation measures, he has an incremental 22 22 Apalachicola River and Bay? fiscal cost per year of zero? 23 23 A. No. I strongly disagree with that. A. Yes, I see that. ${f Q.}$ And this is from his 2,000 cfs scenario. 24 24 Indeed, in the environmental economics course 25 that I have been teaching at Harvard for about 25 25 Correct? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4518 4520 1 years now, actually there is a segment in one of A. Correct. 2 my lectures which is dedicated to explaining why 2 Do you believe that undertaking these scenarios 3 looking at such costs are not an adequate measure 3 would have zero cost to Georgia? 4 A. No. I don't believe that. And for some of them, of the benefits. Indeed, they are an example of 4 5 5 what I think it's fair to say is committing the in his previous materials submitted as part of 6 most egregious error in a benefit-cost analysis; 6 his case, he actually did have positive costs, as 7 7 it's confusing the costs and the benefits. I recall. 8 8 **Q.** Were they significant positive costs that Those are the costs of preserving the land. 9 9 Dr. Sunding previously estimated? They are not the benefits of preserving the land. A. Yes. 10 Q. Does -- even taking Dr. Sunding at his word that 10 11 it's half a billion dollars in value, did he 11 **Q.** And Dr. Sunding testified that it was appropriate 12 12 estimate the change in value based on any conduct to assign zero cost to these because such costs 13 13 are associated with implementation of Georgia's by Georgia? 14 A. So even if that were a correct measure of 14 own existing policies. 15 benefits, which it categorically is not, one has 15 I think Mr. Perry asked you about this, but 16 to look at what is the change in the value of 16 I'm not sure you had a chance to fully explain 17 that land as a result of one of the remedies, 17 your view on that. 18 because it's not as if the land is going to 18 Α. So I think it's an important point that we 19 totally disappear and then is preserved as a 19 previously discussed that whether or not there is 20 result of the remedy. So you have to look at the 20 a policy to do something, there is still a cost 21 21 impact. associated with it. If one wishes to remove it

Mason & Lockhart

Q. And what's the time frame for Dr. Sunding's

estimate of almost half a billion dollars?

THE REPORTING GROUP

from the baseline on the cost side, then we have

I would think the best thing to do is to keep

to take out the cfs numbers that are there as

Q. Did anybody do that?

22

23

24

25

A. No.

22

23

24

25

well.

4523 1 it in place for both. To have the cfs numbers, 1 irrigation specified an ideal, a remarkable 2 2 which would be on the potential benefits if they ideal, which would be a cost-effective allocation 3 were properly monetized, and also to have the 3 across 2,000 different combinations of 4 proper cost numbers. connectivity, soil type, 10 percent increments of 5 Q. Okay. Let's shift gears now, and I want to 5 reducing irrigation, and crop type. 6 discuss irrigation in Georgia and ask you did you 6 I don't see that the government could achieve 7 analyze the yield impact on crop yields if you 7 that for reasons we can discuss. And, therefore, 8 eliminate irrigation on various crops in the ACF 8 I wanted to -- in order to estimate cost, to 9 Basin? 9 estimate what are sensible costs of what it 10 A. Yes, sir. 10 would actually -- of what is a remedy that 11 Q. Can you turn to demonstrative No. 4. 11 could be used and the one that was closest to 12 A. Yes. 12 Dr. Sunding's, because I wanted to stick close to 13 Q. What does demonstrative 4 show? 13 what he was doing, was one in which it would be 14 A. So this is looking at the impact of irrigation 14 what is now being discussed in terms of 15 within ACF Georgia on the yields of three -- the 15 irrigation buy-back, although we were talking on 16 three principal crops, cotton, peanuts, and corn. 16 an annual basis. In other words, land being 17 And you can see that in the case of cotton, for 17 either irrigated or nonirrigated. And so I 18 18 looked at that in terms of these differences in example, with irrigation in a dry year, the 19 anticipated yield from experimental farm data --19 yield. 20 20 this is empirical data, not modeling -- is 1500 Q. Now, Dr. Stavins, did you also look at the 21 21 bushels -- pardon me, pounds approximately. It percentage of crop production in terms of 22 22 drops to 329 pounds, again, from empirical irrigated acres in the ACF Basin? 23 23 experimental data, if there is lack of Yes, I did. 24 24 Q. Because there's been a lot of debate and irrigation. 25 25 discussion about whether irrigation is necessary And then similarly for peanuts, 5,050 drops THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4522 4524 1 to 2,471. And in the case of corn, it's even 1 or discretionary and its relative value. How did 2 more dramatic going from 183 bushels now down to 2 you try and get at that issue? 3 13 bushels. 3 A. Well, I'll tell you, counselor, I had never 4 So the percentage differences for cotton, 4 before in an economic analysis heard this word 5 5 discretionary used. Almost every input to peanuts, and corn are respectively 78 percent 6 6 production for most goods and services is drop, 51 percent drop, and 93 percent drop. 7 7 **Q.** In this chart, which comes from your direct ultimately discretionary. The key issue is if I 8 8 testimony at page 11, you're comparing irrigation don't have that input or I reduce the amount of 9 versus dry-land farming. Correct? 9 that input I use, what does that do to benefits? 10 What does that do to costs? 10 A. That's correct. 11 Q. So that's no irrigation? 11 So I didn't see in the first place that 12 A. That's correct. 12 pointing out that there were some -- there was 13 Q. Just looking -- leaving it to rain? 13 some acreage that didn't use irrigation was 14 A. That's correct. 14 telling me that it's, therefore, discretionary. 15 Q. And Mr. Perry asked you about 66 percent and 15 Q. Can you turn to demonstrative 5, please. 16 33 percent and whether you had looked at those. 16 Α. Yes. 17 Do you recall that? 17 Q. And explain what you have shown there. 18 A. Yes, I do. 18 So looking -- even if we think that making these 19 **Q.** And I think you were trying to make a point about 19 kinds of comparisons says something about whether 20 whether that's feasible or not. And he told you 20 it's discretionary or not, looking at either the 21 you could wait for me to come up. 21 number of farms or the number of acres is 22 22 So I'm here. What were you trying to say potentially very misleading. What I want to look 23 23 about the feasibility? at is what percentage of the production of those 24 A. So what I wanted to explain was that 24 crops is coming from an irrigated acre as opposed 25 Dr. Sunding's approach under his deficit 25 to a nonirrigated acre. So that's what I have THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4525 1 done. 1 said -- that's the point of the irrigation that 2 2 And here you see, therefore, that from the brings about the maximum yield; and anything 3 empirical data from ACF Georgia, that 94 percent 3 above that he called overwatering -- then it 4 of the corn was coming from irrigated production, 4 follows arithmetically from that that for the 5 77 percent of the cotton, and 63 percent of the 5 years 2008 to 2013 there was underwatering by ACF 6 peanut production. 6 Georgia farmers that varied from almost 70 7 Q. What does that tell you as an economist? 7 percent to close to 90 percent, as you can see in 8 A. So that tells me that irrigation plays an 8 this bar chart. 9 exceptionally important role. We would have a 9 Okay. Now, the last issue, Dr. Stavins. I want 10 very large falloff of production and 10 to ask you to explain the comparison you did 11 profitability and huge impacts to agriculture 11 between the productivity of the water use on the 12 and, indeed, to consumers because prices would be 12 Georgia side and the amount of water that Georgia 13 13 uses as a percentage of the basin. And did you 14 Q. Okay. Dr. Stavins, just two more short topics; 14 prepare a demonstrative or two on that? 15 and I'll be done. 15 Yes, I did. 16 16 I now want to talk about the extent to which Q. Okay. Let's go to demonstrative No. 7 behind 17 Georgia irrigators underwater. Have you seen 17 tab 7. 18 Dr. Sunding's testimony about -- he's taken the 18 Α. So even if we put aside for the moment the very 19 position in this case that there are a number of 19 important comparison of benefits and costs, the 20 20 benefit-cost analysis, we can compare ACF Georgia Georgia farmers whose irrigation practices waste 21 21 water. Right? and ACF Florida in a variety of relevant ways. 22 22 A. Yes. The upper left-hand corner, the first comparison, 23 Q. And do you know how Dr. Sunding reached that 23 is in terms of land area, the square miles. And 24 24 conclusion, and have you seen any evidence that what you can see here is that the land area of 25 many Georgia farmers in fact underwater? 25 ACF Georgia is five times the land area of ACF THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4526 4528 1 A. And usually, as economists, we don't use the word 1 Florida. 2 2 waste. So that was a little surprising to me, I Moving directly to the right, we find that 3 3 suppose. the population of ACF Georgia is fully 56 times 4 The way he reached that conclusion was 4 the population of ACF Florida. 5 5 through a rather complex method of looking at Down at the lower left, employment, there are 6 6 agricultural metering data and then matching that 80 times as many jobs on an annual basis in ACF 7 7 up, matching two different data sources through a Georgia as in ACF Florida. 8 geographical information systems, matching them 8 And, finally, what's in some sense putting 9 9 up to estimate the amount of water that was being this together is looking at gross regional 10 10 used in specific areas; and then he contrasted product, so economic activity as traditionally 11 11 that -- and there are errors in that by the way. measured. And we find that the gross regional 12 12 product of ACF Georgia is 129 times that of ACF And then he contrasted that with what, from 13 13 yield curves -- synthesized yield curves, he Florida. Q. Dr. Stavins, with that information as a backdrop, 14 considered to be the maximum -- the amount of 14 15 water that would bring about the maximum yield. 15 did you then look to see, relatively speaking, 16 Q. Now, when you dug into Dr. Sunding's data, did 16 how much water is used and how much -- in 17 you actually see evidence that there were many 17 comparison to how much flows down to Florida in 18 farmers that underwatered? 18 an aggregate basis? 19 A. Well --19 Yes, I did. 20 **Q.** Even using his analysis. 20 Can you go to demonstrative No. 8. 21 A. If we take his analysis as given -- and I think 21 So what we see here is a comparison of the water 22 22 that there is -- is there a -that is consumptively used by ACF Georgia and the 23 23 **Q.** Yes. Let's go to tab 6, demonstrative No. 6. amount of water which is available at the border 24 flowing into ACF Florida. And I do it for two A. If you take his analysis as given, that there is 24 25 this one, single defined point, which is what he 25 different measures here. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

1

The one on the left is the 10-year average over the years 2004 to 2013. And you can see that 4 percent of the water -- in green at the top -- 4 percent of the water was used consumptively by ACF Georgia, and 96 percent of the water was available on average over those 10 years to Florida.

If we look at a dry year -- indeed, an extremely dry year -- 2011, the numbers are still quite dramatic; and, namely, that in terms of consumptive use, Georgia used 8 percent of the available water, leaving 92 percent of the available water to flow going into Florida in the year 2011.

15 Q. Dr. Stavins, what conclusions do you reach based 16 on the last two charts we just looked at about 17 the current allocation of water in the ACF Basin?

A. Well, you know, comparing these two bar columns here of the amount of water used by Georgia and the amount of water that's available to Florida and comparing that to the size of the economies, the populations, the employment, the land area, they're completely reversed. And it seems to me, therefore, that to put it in general language, Florida is currently getting a very good deal.

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

border for Florida.

2 **Q.** So what happens in the summer in the Flint Basin 3 for agriculture? Is there a lot of irrigation in the summer?

5 A. Well, in years in which it's a dry year and 6 there's less precipitation, then there's -- then 7 there's substantial irrigation, yes.

8 Q. All right. So what we did, sir, was we took both 9 the summer consumption numbers from Dr. Zeng --10 Zeng -- do you know him?

11 A. Yes.

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

Q. All right. And we also took the consumption numbers for Dr. Lettenmaier and Dr. Hornberger, the Florida experts. And we plotted them on a graph against the flow of the Apalachicola River in the summer of 2012. So I would like to --

17 MR. PERRY: Your Honor, if I may 18 approach to hand that out.

19 Α. Thank you.

> Q. Now, sir, on the demonstrative I just supplied you, the numbers with green bars are the numbers we got from the prefiled direct testimony of Dr. Zeng. And those are plotted against the actual flow at the Apalachicola Gage, which I think is what you were trying to represent at THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4530

tab 8. Right?

The percent of --

A. Yes. 3

Q. -- total flow? 4

> So this is a summer chart. And then, as you know, Florida's experts used a different model, a rainfall runoff model, which is the type of model recommended by Georgia Water Resources Institute, Dr. Georgakakos. And using that model, we got a higher number than Dr. Zeng got using his ResSim model and Dr. Bedient's.

12 And you see these numbers on this chart are 13 quite a bit higher than 4 or 8 percent; aren't 14 thev?

15 No. I believe, if I understand what you're Α. 16 saying -- and I won't get into debates among

17 hydrologists. But if I understand what you're 18 saying, this is for 2012, dry year, and the June,

19 July, August was what I said was 24 percent. And 20 that looks to me like that averages out to about

21 24 percent used consumptively by Georgia.

22 **Q.** Sir --

23 A. Am I missing something perhaps?

24 Yes. If the rainfall runoff model were to be 25 a better selection of model than ResSim using

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Q. Thank you, Dr. Stavins.

2 MR. PRIMIS: No further questions.

RECROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. PERRY: 4

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3

7

8

9

5 Q. All right, sir. Not much longer. Not much 6 longer for any of us.

Sir, let me just start with the figure you were just talking about. And you did an analysis of what the percentage would be in the summer of

10 a drought year; didn't you?

11 A. And you're saying relative to this very last 12 figure that was --

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. The comparison?

15 **Q.** Yes. You have got some very small numbers on 16 here.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. But you separately looked at what the summer 19 would be; didn't you?

20 A. So I also looked at -- instead of the dry year of 21 2011, if we look at the three driest months of 22 2011, I believe June, July, and August.

23 **Q.** And that wasn't 4 percent or 8 percent; was it?

24 A. No. There, the ratio was 24 percent used by 25 Georgia ACF and 76 percent available at the

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) 4535 1 the flood UIF's, then, of course, these numbers 1 Apalachicola Basin; did he? 2 2 would mark a very, very significant percentage of A. Well, he looked at -- I think -- my understanding 3 the actual flows of the Apalachicola; wouldn't 3 is that what he was trying to do was to look at 4 they? it in an economic -- from an economic perspective 5 A. I'm sorry. I don't actually -- this sounds like 5 what the impacts were on Florida ecology. And he 6 a -- forgive me -- a hydrological issue. I'm not 6 used a variety of methods to do that. 7 following the difference. 7 Q. But he -- he explicitly said in the first 8 Q. No, I understand, sir. I thought your testimony 8 paragraph of his report that he was not 9 was that you looked at the percentage of flows 9 attempting to assign value to all of the nonuse 10 that you thought that Georgia was consuming as a 10 values, the intrinsic values, the natural values 11 percentage of all the flows, that as an 11 of the basin. Right? 12 economist, you thought that those numbers were 12 A. So I'm willing to stipulate that. I don't recall 13 13 the first sentence of the report. 14 Well, what I'm suggesting here, Dr. Stavins, 14 **Q.** Okay. And he looked at some things, but he 15 is that if you look at it as a hydrologist, it's 15 didn't look at everything. That's what you're 16 16 quite a bit higher potentially using a particular stipulating. Right? 17 type of model? 17 A. That's correct. A. So I'll leave that to the hydrologist's approach. 18 Q. Okay. Now, Dr. Sunding testified at length about 18 19 I mean, my approach to look at this is to think 19 nonuse values and, in particular, the concern of 20 20 about the amount of water that's being, you know, he and his colleagues at University of 21 21 used by Georgia for M & I and agriculture California, Berkeley about the method of 22 22 combined, versus the amount that's available to contingent valuation, which is essentially what 23 23 you're recommending as a method here. Right? Florida at the border. 24 24 Q. Sir, may I invite your attention to tab 3 of the A. Well, I'm not recommending. It's far be it for 25 binder that Mr. Primis gave you. And I would 25 me to recommend to Georgia what kind of analysis THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4534 4536 1 like to talk to you about your benefit-cost 1 they should do. One of the two major methods for 2 2 analysis, if I could. Now -valuing nonuse value is contingent valuation; the 3 3 A. Tab 3? other being conjoined analysis. 4 **Q.** Let's talk about the contingent valuation part. Q. Yes, I think it's tab 3. It's got a red bar on 4 5 5 one side and nothing on the other. That is essentially a poll; right? 6 6 Taking a poll of people who aren't A. My -- unless I'm wrong, my tab 3 is Nathan Deal. 7 Q. I'm asking you about the binder that Georgia gave 7 particularly knowledgeable about the 8 8 you. circumstances to see, when they're telephoned, 9 A. Oh, I'm sorry. 9 what they think the value of the resource is. 10 10 MR. PRIMIS: Also to help you out, Right. 11 11 Mr. Perry, we put it on the screen. A. So I wouldn't refer to it as simply a poll. That 12 MR. PERRY: Thank you. 12 makes it sound very, very naive. That's how 13 BY MR. PERRY: 13 horrible work would be done. And typically, 14 Q. Now, sir, you talked about a methodology that 14 they're not done by a telephone because of the 15 economists use to value something, which I think 15 bias and other problems that would introduce. 16 you would refer to as nonuse value. Right? 16 **Q.** There are -- there are a number, including the 17 A. So it's both. There are use values and nonuse 17 faculty at University of California, Berkeley --18 values. The use values would be things such as 18 but there are a number of other highly reputable 19 the financial impacts on oysters and also 19 economists that believe that contingent valuation 20 recreational being a use value, but also nonuse 20 is hopeless; isn't that right? 21 21 values, yes. A. So I would -- a number. There are -- there may 22 22 Q. Now, before I get into the way in which you be -- apparently Dr. Sunding is among them, and 23 23 did that, let me just ask you; you know that maybe other colleagues. 24 Dr. Phaneuf, who wasn't called, did not try to What I can tell you, sir, is that although I 24 25 25 have not done a survey of all the economics value all the nonuse or use values of the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL- December 1, 2016 (Vol. XVII) Florida v. Georgia 4539 1 community, is that it is my opinion that the vast Q. Well, sir, the Obama administration recognized, 2 2 majority of environmental and natural resource did it not, in its amendment to Executive Order 3 economics participate in -- you know, in this 3 12866 that nonuse, in other words, the natural 4 literature; and they subscribe to the methods. value of the resources, can't always be 5 These methods are central to environmental quantified because it can be priceless and not 6 economics. They're not the fringe whatsoever. 6 subject to analysis through a poll? 7 And they're taught at universities from Maine to 7 A. So I think, you know, look, if you were talking 8 California, and as well as at my own institution 8 about, you know, my children, I'll agree with 9 at Harvard. 9 priceless. But when we're talking about these 10 **Q.** Did you take a poll here to do a contingent 10 natural resources for which there are true 11 valuation? 11 opportunity costs, I don't agree with the word 12 A. No, I didn't take a poll; but I did look at --12 priceless. 13 and consulted what other universities and faculty 13 And what I would agree with is that sometimes 14 members that I hold in high regard are doing. 14 it's very difficult to measure them; but it is 15 **Q.** Now, just to be a little more precise, what 15 not impossible. And, counselor, it is done every 16 16 you're espousing is a process where a bank of day. It's done by government. It's done in 17 telephone callers call individuals and read them 17 litigation. And it's done in academic studies. 18 18 a statement; and they answer from, likely, among That's the reality. That's the simple fact. 19 some multiple choice alternatives. And you 19 MR. PERRY: Well, may I approach to pass 20 20 out one last -prefer that to any type of other analysis that 21 21 A. Thank you. might take into account what the state does to 22 22 value the property, what purchases they have Q. All right, sir. Looking now at JX-65 that I just 23 made, and so forth. Right? 23 passed out, who is the author, Jerry Hausman? A. Yes. 24 A. So if a true revealed preference approach were 24 25 available for the environmental amenity we wished 25 Q. I'm sorry. Who is the author? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4538 4540 1 to investigate, I would probably prefer the A. Jerry Hausman. 2 revealed preference approach. 2 And can you describe his background and his 3 The approach you just mentioned of looking at 3 current position? 4 A. So Professor Houseman is an economist. He may how much the State spends is really making that 4 5 5 egregious error that is looking at a cost and now be Professor Emeritus since this was written, 6 6 pretending that that's a benefit. but was for a long time a professor in the 7 **Q.** And your position there is that the 7 economics department at MIT. His expertise is 8 8 representatives of the state, the people of the econometrics. He's not an environmental or 9 9 state and the state legislature, when they voice resource economist. 10 10 Q. Now, when you -- on tab 3 of the binder their views and allot budget to buying land, 11 11 Mr. Primis gave you -- that's the small binder -which Secretary Steverson testified about --12 A. Yes. 12 when you said the benefits of restricting 13 Q. -- in his prefiled direct, that's completely 13 irrigation upstream were zero, that's basically a 14 irrelevant to the value of the resource. And, 14 determination there's nothing to be gained from 15 instead, you ought to take a poll? 15 more water flowing downstream. Right? 16 A. My position, sir, is that if that \$500 million 16 A. I didn't say there was nothing to be gained. 17 was coming out of the pockets of the legislators, 17 What I said was that I can estimate the impacts

that would be a revealed preference method and would demonstrate the benefits to them. That's -- but when it's someone else's money that's being spent through a political process, that's turning benefit-cost analysis on its head. That would eliminate the role for WIRA at OMB. Anything the government does has got to be big benefits because they spent a lot of money. THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

on the oysters based upon Dr. Jenkins's work, the Florida witness, and that my understanding from other experts in the case from Georgia was that the biophysical impacts of the remedies were trivial or, as you say, de minimus; so, therefore, I interpret that as being the benefits were de minimis. Now, Dr. Jenkins didn't testify here; did he? THE REPORTING GROUP

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

4541 4543 A. Pardon me? 1 it would, therefore, take it to a much lower 2 2 Q. Dr. Jenkins didn't testify here? A. No. I was using his -- I believe it was his 3 Q. And that's because you didn't look at the expert report. possibility you might just reduce rather than 5 Q. And he did not look at the entirety of the ACF 5 eliminate irrigation? 6 Basin even in the expert report that was not 6 That's because I looked at what I consider to be 7 submitted. Right? 7 a feasible policy approach, yes. 8 A. So I looked at -- I based it upon his, and 8 Q. And that means that you don't consider it 9 attempted to monetize what he did. 9 feasible for the State of Georgia to just 10 Q. All right. So you took a sliver of what might be 10 restrict the amount of irrigation inches that can 11 the value of the ACF Basin based on a witness 11 be applied? 12 that hasn't testified; is that right? 12 No. I didn't consider feasible what Dr. Sunding 13 A. I don't want to agree with sliver, because we 13 used to estimate costs, which was this perfect 14 would have to look at that quantitatively. 14 cost-effective allocation of cuts in irrigation 15 **Q.** All right, sir. Now, you mentioned a couple 15 water across 2,000 combinations of, you know, the 16 16 other topics. And I'll be very brief since we're four variables that we have been talking about. 17 about at 5 o'clock. 17 Q. Now, sir, about 44 percent of land in the Flint 18 18 A. I'm sorry. Did you want to do anything with River Basin is irrigated -- farmland is 19 the --19 irrigated. Right? 20 20 **Q.** No. I just wanted to identify who he was. A. I believe that. 21 21 Q. All right. And you haven't gone through, using A. Okay. 22 22 Q. Now, you didn't value or attempt to value the Georgia's databases, to figure out what the yield 23 23 percentages are acre by acre of nonirrigated benefits of keeping sloughs open or preserving 24 24 the floodplain in the Apalachicola River; did versus irrigated land; have you? 25 25 No. What I did -- you know, each of us took a you? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 4542 4544 A. No. 1 different approach, Dr. Sunding and myself. What 2 2 **Q.** All right. Now, on tab 2 of the document that he did was this matching and in a sense 3 3 Mr. Primis gave you, you will see there's row and simulating through what I think is complex 4 forage crops? modeling that has a lot of room for error. And 5 5 A. Yes. what I did was to go to experimental farm data 6 Q. And agricultural commodities? 6 from United States Department of Agriculture and 7 7 A. Yes. use that. 8 **Q.** Now, part of the number you testified about there 8 Q. And that was for those 1-acre plots that you 9 9 is poultry and eggs. talked about earlier. Right? 10 10 A. Yes. A. The -- the experiments are carried out in 1-acre 11 11 **Q.** Are we seeking in this case a relief regarding plots within a much larger experimental farm. 12 12 poultry and eggs? MR. PERRY: Thank you, your Honor. 13 13 A. No. I simply wanted to put in to put in context, SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. frankly, the row crops, that that was 1.3 14 14 MR. PERRY: Thank you, Dr. Stavins. 15 billion, and to put that in the context of all 15 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 16 the other crops there are. So I thought I had to 16 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Mr. Primis? 17 be somewhat, you know, representative to include 17 MR. PRIMIS: No further questions. 18 them. That's all. 18 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: No questions. 19 **Q.** And, in fact, the remedies that Dr. Sunding talks 19 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm disappointed. 20 about, including depths of irrigation, reducing 20 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: And if you're 21 the amount of irrigation, that wouldn't eliminate 21 disappointed, that's very dangerous. 22 22 yield on the cotton, peanuts, corn, or other row Thank you. 23 23 and forage crops; would it? THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you. 24 A. It wouldn't eliminate yield. In my estimate, SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Are we 24 25 what it would do if you would limit irrigation, 25 finished? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

13

20

4545

1 MR. PRIMIS: Your Honor, Georgia has no 2 further witnesses to call.

MR. PERRY: Your Honor, we will shortlysupply a binder with our proposed rebuttal,

5 which I'm sure Georgia will have an

6 opportunity to object to, if they so desire.

7 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you.

8 Anything else?

9 MR. PERRY: No, your Honor.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Well, let me

11 say that I'm immodest enough to think that

12 the fact that we're finishing so early is

because you wanted to relieve me of the

14 burden tomorrow and not because you want to

15 catch a plane out of here.

16

17

Now, if I'm wrong, either way, let me do a few housekeeping things. First of all,

briefs, two weeks; reply weeks two weeksafter that. I can assure you that we will

20 then turn promptly to our report. And

21 although my wife won't be happy to hear me

say this, over Christmas we will get it outto you just as soon as we possibly can.

Now, a few other housekeeping details; and then we're done.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4546

Do you remember that I requested asurvey on restaurants asking you to look at

3 that list and, either anonymously or by

4 identification, without checking with other

5 tell me which ones you thought were pretty

6 good and why. And after you rate them, send

7 them in to me with copies to the others.

8 Mr. Chapman, are you here?

9 MR. CHAPMAN: Yes, sir.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Youunderstand why I declined your request for a

12 profile?

This case is not about me; it's about

14 water.

For the record, I would like you to tell your managing editor that your reporting has

17 been as good as any I have seen in this case.

18 Thank you very much for that.

Now, I have to say again, for the

record, that I have been very impressed withthe caliber of the people both representing

22 Florida and Georgia. And I'm not just

23 talking about you, Mr. Perry, and you,

24 Mr. Primis. I'm talking about all the people

25 involved. Mr. Walton, Mr. Smith, I don't

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1 know how you kept up with these birds and got

2 things on the screen so quickly; but you did.

3 I'm sorry if I didn't meet some others

4 of you, but I really am impressed with the

5 teams. And I want that to be on the record.

The depth of your representation has beenextraordinary, and I mean that.

8 There is one national representative of

9 one of the parties who keeps mentioning the

10 amount of the cost for lawyers. I would

appreciate it if you would tell him that he's

getting more than his money's worth.

You know who I mean, I think. If you

don't, you can ask me; and I'll tell you.

Frankly, I'm going to miss you all. I'm not going to miss this case, but I am going

to miss the people. I really think you're

not only multi-talented, but you're very,

19 very nice.

I hope that you will come back to Maine sometime in the spring, summer, or fall when

sometime in the spring, summer, or fall we're not having a deluge and we're not

23 freezing. If you want to come back, look up

24 Pierce Atwood. And if there's anything I can

do to help you, just call me and let me know,

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

4548

1 because I really would like to be able to do

2 that.

3 And, finally -- and you won't be

4 surprised to know what I'm about to say --

5 please settle this blasted thing. I can

6 guarantee you that at least one of you is

7 going to be unhappy with my recommendation,

8 and perhaps both of you. You can't both be

9 winners. You can both be losers. So,

10 please, please, open negotiations again and

11 let me know.12 With that, I think we're done. And

thank you, again, very much.MR. PERRY: Thank you so much, your

15 Honor.

MR. PRIMIS: Thank you, your Honor.

17 (Time Noted: 5:02 p.m.) 18 (Proceeding Concluded.)

19 - - - - -

THE REPORTING GROUP
Mason & Lockhart

Page 4545 to 4548 of 4589

20

21

22

23

24



4549 **CERTIFICATE** 1 2 I, Claudette G. Mason, a Notary Public 3 in and for the State of Maine, hereby certify 4 that the foregoing pages are a correct 5 transcript of my stenographic notes of the 6 Proceedings. 7 I further certify that I am a 8 disinterested person in the event or outcome of the above-named cause of action. 9 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I subscribe my hand 10 this 15th day of December, 2016. 11 12 13 14 /s/ Claudette G. Mason 15 Claudette G. Mason, RMR, CRR Court Reporter 16 My Commission Expires June 9, 2019. 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

67 of 107 sheets

| \$ | 4410:14, 4410:16, | 4490:16 | 1957 [1] - 4368:6 | 4449:7, 4450:10, |
|---|--|---|--|---|
| • | 4410:24, 4411:12, | 125,270 [1] - 4443:17 | 1966 [1] - 4368:2 | 4485:25, 4488:15 |
| \$100 [1] - 4511:3 | 4412:25, 4413:5, | 127 [2] - 4490:14, | 1984 [1] - 4380:13 | 2011 [9] - 4326:3, |
| \$2,500 [2] - 4478:3, | 4438:1, 4438:22, | 4490:16 | 1986 [1] - 4387:16 | 4358:13, 4389:19, |
| 4478:20 | 4469:1, 4507:11, | 12866 [1] - 4539:3 | 1987 [1] - 4428:10 | 4421:25, 4487:24, |
| \$25 [2] - 4519:6, | 4507:22 | 129 [1] - 4528:12 | 1988 [5] - 4389:7, | 4529:9, 4529:14, |
| 4519:7 | 1,000 [1] - 4441:25 | 12:12 [1] - 4351:9 | 4428:10, 4428:11, | 4530:21, 4530:22 |
| \$282 [1] - 4472:22 | 1-acre [2] - 4544:8, | 12:50 [1] - 4351:11 | 4428:14, 4428:15 | 2012 [35] - 4295:11, |
| \$3,000 [1] - 4504:13 | 4544:10 | 13 [8] - 4296:7, | 1989 [1] - 4428:9 | 4295:17, 4314:25, |
| \$30 [1] - 4508:8 \$31 [1] - 4508:19 | 1.1 [2] - 4410:13, | 4296:8, 4301:17, | 1992 [1] - 4394:13 | 4325:16, 4325:25, |
| \$31 [1] - 4506.19 \$335 [1] - 4513:12 | 4410:24 | 4305:13, 4305:16, | 1997 [1] - 4368:8 | 4326:3, 4331:12, |
| \$33 [1] - 4513:12 | 1.3 [5] - 4473:1, 4473:10, 4509:10, | 4336:2, 4366:16, | 1999 [1] - 4456:20 | 4338:7, 4350:5, 4358:13, 4359:15, |
| \$4,000 [1] - 4476:5 | 4509:13, 4542:14 | 4522:3 | | 4359:17, 4359:25, |
| \$40,000 [1] - 4515:2 | 1.5 [2] - 4412:25, | 135 [1] - 4401:20 | 2 | 4360:19, 4362:1, |
| \$445 [1] - 4513:18 | 4413:5 | 14 [10] - 4295:11, 4297:4, 4297:5, | 2 [24] - 4295:14, | 4367:25, 4369:14, |
| \$500 [1] - 4538:16 | 10 [28] - 4296:22, | 4301:11, 4301:22, | 4303:18, 4303:23, | 4370:15, 4372:20, |
| \$700 [1] - 4480:13 | 4300:3, 4308:11, | 4324:5, 4327:21, | 4304:15, 4315:6, | 4380:19, 4382:17, |
| \$800 [8] - 4476:15, | 4344:1, 4345:8, | 4343:24, 4354:17, | 4315:14, 4321:25, | 4382:19, 4389:19, |
| 4477:11, 4477:17, | 4346:6, 4349:20, | 4479:9 | 4325:11, 4327:16, | 4391:10, 4412:3, |
| 4479:18, 4514:3, | 4349:24, 4365:11, | 14,000 [1] - 4508:17 | 4339:25, 4340:5, | 4414:9, 4417:2, |
| 4516:2, 4516:7, | 4365:12, 4392:10, | 14.7 [1] - 4460:7 | 4344:11, 4345:1, | 4417:15, 4421:25, |
| 4519:13 | 4392:18, 4403:23, | 14.70 [1] - 4460:20 | 4345:12, 4347:22, | 4422:12, 4423:1, |
| \$864 [2] - 4477:12, | 4405:7, 4406:10, | 142 [1] - 4285:1 | 4348:7, 4415:20, | 4485:7, 4485:9, |
| 4482:6 | 4460:15, 4460:19, | 15 [11] - 4297:12, | 4418:4, 4448:24, | 4531:16, 4532:18 |
| \$913 [1] - 4479:25 | 4466:15, 4468:20, | 4305:4, 4305:19, | 4453:12, 4469:2, | 2012-'13 [1] - 4401:17 |
| \$964 [1] - 4508:16 | 4481:15, 4482:21, | 4370:17, 4421:2, | 4469:3, 4509:3, 4542:2 | 2012-2013 [1] - |
| | 4483:14, 4485:11, | 4451:24, 4455:12, | 2,000 [5] - 4466:10, | 4397:11 2013 _[7] - 4298:2, |
| • | 4486:16, 4508:3, | 4457:24, 4458:12, | 4478:2, 4519:24, | 4305:6, 4391:11, |
| '15 [1] - 4400:8 | 4508:4, 4523:4, 4529:6 | 4480:6, 4505:22 | 4523:3, 4543:15 | 4399:17, 4401:19, |
| '86 [1] - 4428:18 | 10-year [1] - 4529:1 | 15-inch [2] - 4456:15, 4456:22 | 2,471 [1] - 4522:1 | 4527:5, 4529:2 |
| '87 [3] - 4428:15, | 100 [8] - 4318:25, | 1500 [1] - 4521:20 | 2.81 [1] - 4390:19 | 2014 [13] - 4301:5, |
| 4428:17, 4428:18 | 4336:11, 4341:13, | 153 [2] - 4409:16 | 20 [10] - 4301:5, | 4301:13, 4308:14, |
| '88 [2] - 4428:17, | 4341:19, 4401:20, | 154 [1] - 4482:22 | 4341:25, 4357:13, | 4310:16, 4310:18, |
| 4428:18 | 4462:23, 4463:3, | 15th [1] - 4549:11 | 4379:1, 4379:2, | 4382:19, 4387:16, |
| '89 [3] - 4428:15, | 4466:2 | 16 [3] - 4307:2, | 4406:10, 4456:4, | 4387:17, 4399:18, |
| 4428:17, 4428:18 | 10:02 [1] - 4362:1 | 4391:10, 4401:19 | 4477:18, 4483:3, | 4400:8, 4420:4, |
| '90 [1] - 4428:18 | 10:30 [1] - 4307:11 | 160 [2] - 4335:20, | 4483:6 20,000 [1] - 4443:7 | 4430:17, 4488:15 |
| 1 | 10:35 [1] - 4307:18 | 4335:22 | 20,793 [1] - 4443:9 | 2015 [7] - 4308:8, 4317:5, 4327:11, |
| | 10:47 [1] - 4307:20 | 161 [1] - 4336:2 | 200 [3] - 4379:20, | 4348:16, 4349:21, |
| /s [1] - 4549:15 | 11 [17] - 4300:19, 4308:20, 4311:5, | 163 [1] - 4323:2 | 4379:21, 4391:7 | 4368:18, 4389:8 |
| | 4318:25, 4345:17, | 165 [1] - 4335:23 | 2001 [2] - 4477:19, | 2016 [17] - 4285:13, |
| 0 | 4347:1, 4347:3, | 167 [2] - 4299:13, | 4477:20 | 4317:15, 4317:25, |
| 06-CV-410 [1] - | 4349:1, 4416:4, | 4358:24 17 _[4] - 4307:2, | 2002 [3] - 4368:18, | 4347:23, 4348:2, |
| 4346:20 | 4416:5, 4416:9, | 4354:6, 4481:10, | 4387:17, 4477:20 | 4348:7, 4348:12, |
| | 4416:14, 4449:11, | 4481:21 | 2004 [2] - 4380:10, | 4348:21, 4349:1, |
| 1 | 4449:15, 4449:18, | 171 [1] - 4307:1 | 4529:2 | 4349:6, 4349:10, |
| 4 rom 400E.40 | 4475:9, 4522:8 | 172 [1] - 4307:2 | 2006 [6] - 4343:24, | 4349:16, 4349:25, |
| 1 [32] - 4285:13, 4295:9, 4303:17, | 1148 [1] - 4300:4 | 173 [1] - 4307:2 | 4344:1, 4344:7, | 4399:16, 4476:3, |
| 4314:18, 4314:21, | 12 [12] - 4301:2, | 18 [4] - 4326:9, | 4346:6, 4346:23, | 4476:10, 4549:11 |
| 4321:25, 4322:5, | 4324:5, 4369:17, | 4344:6, 4348:20, | 4379:25 2007 [1] - 4344:18 | 2019 [1] - 4549:17 2020 [1] - 4379:3 |
| 4335:20, 4341:12, | 4381:1, 4393:7, | 4385:23 | 2007 [1] - 4344.16 2008 [5] - 4347:3, | 2020 [1] - 4379.3 206 [1] - 4347:6 |
| 4341:20, 4344:18, | 4393:11, 4422:20, 4449:12, 4449:19, | 183 [1] - 4522:2 | 4382:17, 4420:4, | 21 [3] - 4301:5, |
| 4348:7, 4348:16, | 4484:6, 4484:14, | 19 [7] - 4299:8, | 4425:4, 4527:5 | 4349:10, 4496:10 |
| 4348:18, 4349:22, | 4497:25 | 4348:11, 4351:21, | 2009 [2] - 4345:22, | 22 [2] - 4324:5, |
| 4378:20, 4389:3, | 12-page [1] - 4450:13 | 4352:2, 4356:7, | 4394:10 | 4328:10 |
| 4394:25, 4402:3, | 125 [2] - 4490:14, TH | MAGENTING G | ROUP 1 - 4421:25, | 220 [1] - 4401:7 |
| 4406:17, 4410:13, | | • | 1 | |
| | <u> </u> | lason & Lockha | ırt <u> </u> | 68 of 107 shee |
| | | 1 age 1000 to 1000 or 1000 | | 00 01 107 Shee |

| | 1 | | 1 | |
|---|---|---|---|--|
| 23 [4] - 4324:5, | 3410 [2] - 4476:7, | 4325 [1] - 4287:6 | 4:30 [1] - 4434:1 | 4465:16, 4465:25, |
| 4417:4, 4417:14, | 4476:12 | 4329 [1] - 4287:10 | 4B [2] - 4451:22, | 4522:15 |
| 4485:23 | 345 [1] - 4401:7 | 4339 [1] - 4286:19 | 4451:24 | 678 [2] - 4501:17, |
| 24 [10] - 4318:25, | 35 [2] - 4391:10, | 4343 [2] - 4287:14, | 7701.27 | 4502:19 |
| 4348:2, 4349:6, | 4494:5 | 4287:15 | 5 | 682 [1] - 4502:22 |
| 4415:16, 4415:20, | 35,000 [1] - 4508:9 | 4347 [1] - 4287:16 | <u> </u> | 302 [i] 4002.22 |
| 4418:14, 4418:23, | 36 [2] - 4393:7, 4496:9 | 4354 [1] - 4286:23 | 5 [22] - 4296:12, | 7 |
| 4530:24, 4532:19, | 37 [3] - 4396:3, | 4356 [1] - 4286:22 | 4296:21, 4297:2, | |
| 4532:21 | 4490:11, 4490:15 | 4357 [1] - 4286:24 | 4298:4, 4321:24, | 7 [13] - 4298:14, |
| 25 [4] - 4301:13, | 38 [2] - 4490:11, | 4358 [1] - 4286:12 | 4322:5, 4339:8, | 4306:15, 4321:24, |
| 4349:6, 4362:1, | 4496:16 | 4361 [1] - 4287:4 | 4339:21, 4343:16, | 4344:5, 4345:5, |
| 4517:25 | 384-1 [1] - 4343:15 | 4362 [1] - 4287:13 | 4349:1, 4360:2, | 4358:12, 4358:18, |
| 26 [2] - 4337:20, | | 4365 [1] - 4286:17 | 4398:12, 4413:3, | 4359:14, 4372:16, |
| 4487:23 | 4 | 4366 [1] - 4286:13 | 4438:22, 4473:19, | 4405:12, 4458:21, |
| 27 [2] - 4488:4, | 7 | 4369 [1] - 4286:17 | 4473:24, 4474:6, | 4527:16, 4527:17 |
| 4492:20 | 4 [29] - 4296:2, 4304:8, | 437 [1] - 4346:7 | 4498:4, 4498:11, | 70 [2] - 4439:19, |
| 282 [1] - 4473:10 | 4304:11, 4304:21, | 437 [1] - 4340.7 4370 [1] - 4287:3 | 4509:15, 4524:15, | 4527:6 |
| 29 [3] - 4297:18, | 4306:17, 4325:23, | 4370 [1] - 4287.5 4372 [2] - 4286:5, | 4541:17 | 75 [3] - 4503:20, |
| 4305:25, 4508:8 | 4334:25, 4335:22, | 4286:12 | 5,050 [1] - 4521:25 | 4503:23, 4510:19 |
| 2:43 [1] - 4434:5 | 4343:7, 4346:16, | 44 [5] - 4439:2, | 5-9 [1] - 4488:22 | 76 [1] - 4530:25 |
| 2:50 [1] - 4434:7 | 4349:1, 4359:7, | 4439:6, 4452:20, | 5.4.1 [2] - 4488:25, | 77 [2] - 4455:19, |
| 2B [1] - 4483:16 | 4359:21, 4362:15, | 4519:16, 4543:17 | 4489:9 | 4525:5 |
| | 4396:18, 4396:19, | 4405 [1] - 4286:17 | 5.4.2 [1] - 4489:24 | 770 [2] - 4301:11, |
| 3 | 4398:12, 4398:13, | 4414 [1] - 4286:5 | 50 [13] - 4358:25, | 4301:24 |
| | 4422:21, 4451:9, | 4415 [1] - 4286:23 | 4409:15, 4409:17, | 778 [1] - 4300:19 |
| 3 [35] - 4295:17, | 4451:23, 4519:16, | 4417 [1] - 4286:24 | 4411:7, 4414:16, | 779 [1] - 4301:3 |
| 4295:20, 4295:21, | 4521:11, 4521:13, | 4422 [1] - 4286:17 | 4414:21, 4452:1, | 78 [1] - 4522:5 |
| 4295:24, 4296:17, | 4529:3, 4529:4, | 4423 [1] - 4286:5 | 4452:16, 4503:20, | 782 [1] - 4301:19 |
| 4304:5, 4314:21, | 4530:23, 4532:13 | 4435 [1] - 4286:6 | 4503:23, 4513:15, | 789 [1] - 4298:15 |
| 4315:14, 4315:21, 4329:15, 4330:9, | 4,000 [2] - 4476:6, 4476:12 | 4436 [1] - 4286:6 | 4517:4, 4519:1 50,000 [1] - 4508:20 | |
| 4329: 15. 4330:9. | 44/0.12 | 1.100[1] 1200.0 | 30.000 HI - 4300.20 | l 8 |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | | 4438 [1] - 4286·25 | | |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 | 4438 [1] - 4286:25 4448 [1] - 4286:10 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 | |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 | 8 _[16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:21 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4522:6 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:16 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4485 [1] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4485 [1] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4287:6 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:23 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:23 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4490:5 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 4306 [2] - 4287:7, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4490:5 3200 [1] - 4476:13 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 4306 [2] - 4287:7, 4287:7 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 4530 [1] - 4286:6 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 616 [1] - 4502:19 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4490:5 3200 [1] - 4476:13 329 [1] - 4521:22 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4287:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 4306 [2] - 4287:7, 4287:7 4308 [4] - 4286:13, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 4530 [1] - 4286:11 47 [2] - 4442:11, | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 616 [1] - 4502:19 63 [1] - 4525:5 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:6 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 43490:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4490:5 3200 [1] - 4476:13 329 [1] - 4521:22 33 [5] - 4462:24, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4287:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 4306 [2] - 4287:7, 4287:7 4308 [4] - 4286:13, 4287:8, 4287:11, | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:13 4474 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4485 [1] - 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 4539 [1] - 4286:11 47 [2] - 4442:11, 4488:10 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 616 [1] - 4502:19 63 [1] - 4525:5 66 [8] - 4462:23, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4445:1, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4513:3, 4515:20, 4533:24, 4534:3, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4490:5 320 [1] - 4476:13 329 [1] - 4521:22 33 [5] - 4462:24, 4464:25, 4465:2, | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4286:13 4300 [2] - 4287:9, 4287:12 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4286:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:6 4306 [2] - 4287:7, 4287:7 4308 [4] - 4286:13, 4287:8, 4287:11, 4287:13 4313 [1] - 4286:5 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 4530 [1] - 4286:11 47 [2] - 4442:11, 4488:10 49 [3] - 4323:2, 4358:25, 4409:17 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 616 [1] - 4502:19 63 [1] - 4525:5 66 [8] - 4462:23, 4462:8, 4464:24 | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:16 8(d [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 |
| 4340:10, 4347:22, 4349:16, 4352:10, 4353:9, 4359:17, 4359:19, 4370:1, 4381:2, 4402:4, 4413:4, 4415:23, 4415:24, 4452:23, 4453:10, 4512:23, 4534:4, 4534:6, 4540:10 3.04 [1] - 4390:20 3.1 [1] - 4418:24 30 [7] - 4363:18, 4363:25, 4364:1, 4407:22, 4447:17, 4447:18, 4456:4 309 [1] - 4345:4 31 [1] - 4488:10 310 [1] - 4345:15 311-4 [1] - 4345:21 32 [1] - 4476:13 329 [1] - 4521:22 33 [5] - 4462:24, 4464:25, 4465:2, 4466:1, 4522:16 | 4-mile [1] - 4484:17 40 [2] - 4342:6, 4396:21 400 [1] - 4391:8 41 [1] - 4450:5 414-1 [1] - 4343:23 4295 [3] - 4286:3, 4287:5, 4287:5 4296 [2] - 4287:6, 4297 [1] - 4286:12 4298 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4287:10 4299 [1] - 4287:10 4301 [3] - 4287:8, 4287:9, 4287:10 4303 [3] - 4287:4, 4287:11, 4287:12 4304 [2] - 4287:4, 4287:13 4305 [1] - 4287:7, 4287:7 4308 [4] - 4286:13, 4287:8, 4287:11, 4287:13 4313 [1] - 4286:5 4314 [1] - 4286:5 | 4448 [1] - 4286:10 4457 [1] - 4286:18 4458 [3] - 4286:11, 4286:18, 4286:19 4462 [1] - 4286:14 4464 [1] - 4286:22 4468 [1] - 4286:21 4478 [1] - 4286:21 4479 [1] - 4286:20 4482 [2] - 4286:13, 4286:15 4487 [3] - 4286:10, 4286:16, 4286:16 4493 [1] - 4286:20 4495 [1] - 4286:9 45 [5] - 4440:11, 4441:8, 4450:15, 4450:16, 4451:6 4504 [1] - 4286:6 4530 [1] - 4286:11 47 [2] - 4442:11, 4488:10 49 [3] - 4323:2, 4358:25, 4409:17 | 500 [1] - 4295:21 501 [1] - 4296:2 51 [1] - 4296:2 537 [1] - 4285:12 54 [1] - 4299:6 56 [3] - 4354:5, 4500:22, 4528:3 568 [1] - 4296:12 5:02 [1] - 4548:17 6 6 [18] - 4297:23, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4306:6, 4346:23, 4350:4, 4358:12, 4358:17, 4359:7, 4367:6, 4367:20, 4372:20, 4385:24, 4457:3, 4457:8, 4526:23 60 [3] - 4351:20, 4351:25, 4411:7 61 [2] - 4351:20, 4351:25 616 [1] - 4502:19 63 [1] - 4525:5 66 [8] - 4462:23, AARQ:8, 4464:24, ROUP:1, 4465:15, | 8 [16] - 4299:4, 4307:24, 4344:13, 4361:16, 4363:18, 4364:2, 4365:10, 4365:18, 4462:8, 4465:21, 4528:20, 4529:11, 4530:23, 4532:1, 4532:13 8(c [1] - 4315:13 80 [6] - 4406:11, 4410:15, 4411:8, 4411:11, 4439:19, 4528:6 800 [1] - 4479:19 854 [2] - 4478:2, 4478:20 855 [1] - 4502:22 87 [1] - 4465:15 8:40 [1] - 4285:14 9 9 [9] - 4299:12, 4308:5, 4344:22, 4345:22, 4349:24, 4364:6, 4464:19, 4481:15, 4549:17 |

90 [5] - 4410:15, 4460:2. 4460:16. 4461:13, 4527:7 90,000 [1] - 4490:21 90-1331 [1] - 4343:4 91 [1] - 4297:24 92 [1] - 4529:12 93 [1] - 4522:6 **94** [1] - 4525:3 **95** [3] - 4406:11, 4465:17, 4516:13 96 [1] - 4529:5 979 [2] - 4356:18, 4356:23 980 [1] - 4356:23 99 [1] - 4318:23

Α

A-4[1] - 4511:9 **a.m** [3] - 4285:14, 4307:18, 4307:20 abatement [1] -4513:24 **ABID** [1] - 4285:18 ability [1] - 4516:11 able [7] - 4293:9, 4379:20, 4388:1, 4451:2, 4470:18, 4482:19, 4548:1 abnormal 131 -4315:15, 4330:22, 4361:2 abnormally [1] -4315:8 above-entitled [1] -4285:10 above-named [1] -4549:9 absolutely [7] -4351:5, 4385:13, 4387:7, 4424:16, 4434:2, 4510:6, 4510:19 abstract [3] - 4309:3, 4357:25, 4364:11 absurd [1] - 4412:4 abundance [23] -4357:7, 4358:9, 4358:21, 4368:4, 4373:9, 4376:2, 4378:21, 4382:24, 4383:9, 4383:19, 4384:15, 4385:3, 4385:8. 4394:22. 4395:1, 4395:4, 4395:15, 4396:9, 4407:5, 4419:16, 4419:21, 4420:2,

4420:10

abundances [1] -4375:17 abundant [1] -4336:13 academia [1] -4511:25 academic [1] -4539:17 academics [1] -4494:23 accepted [1] - 4510:18 access [1] - 4508:2 accomplish [2] -4467:12, 4467:18 accordance [1] -4447:15 according [3] -4324:4, 4333:11, 4405:23 account [9] - 4464:8, 4468:4, 4491:9, 4492:2, 4498:11, 4498:15, 4498:20, 4498:22, 4537:21 accrue [1] - 4519:9 accurate [3] -4313:10, 4374:11, 4417:20 accurately [2] -4314:16, 4495:25 ACF [30] - 4448:14, 4472:21, 4473:1, 4473:6, 4488:7, 4489:7, 4507:2, 4509:8, 4521:8, 4521:15, 4523:22, 4525:3, 4527:5, 4527:20, 4527:21, 4527:25, 4528:3, 4528:4, 4528:6, 4528:7, 4528:12, 4528:22, 4528:24, 4529:5, 4529:17, 4530:25, 4541:5, 4541:11 ache [1] - 4476:5 achieve [3] - 4466:13, 4468:2. 4523:6 achieved [2] -4452:14, 4466:11 achieving [1] - 4466:5 acknowledges [1] -4370:2 Acknowledgment [1] - 4449:14

acquire [1] - 4482:16

4469:17, 4470:8,

acquiring [3] -

4481:13

4456:17, 4456:23, 4457:25, 4458:12, 4475:18, 4478:10, 4478:24, 4479:17, 4479:25, 4480:12, 4480:24, 4481:13, 4498:8. 4524:24. 4524:25, 4543:23 acreage [5] - 4475:6, 4491:7, 4491:11, 4502:4, 4524:13 acres [11] - 4391:8, 4391:10, 4401:7, 4401:19, 4442:14, 4463:13, 4490:22, 4492:22, 4523:22, 4524:21 acronym [1] - 4459:7 Act [6] - 4346:1, 4369:2, 4369:5, 4487:2, 4496:20, 4497:25 action [1] - 4549:9 Actions [1] - 4297:14 actions [6] - 4305:21, 4399:9. 4400:6. 4400:16, 4400:23, 4483:18 activities [4] - 4437:3, 4492:21, 4493:8, 4511:1 activity [9] - 4390:22, 4398:21, 4401:13, 4473:8, 4486:1, 4507:2, 4508:22, 4509:4, 4528:10 actual [10] - 4319:24, 4347:16, 4477:5, 4477:14, 4478:12, 4478:23, 4482:17, 4499:16, 4531:24, 4533:3 adapted [1] - 4432:12 add [5] - 4292:13, 4339:10, 4382:25, 4412:18, 4509:13 added [2] - 4401:5, 4443:19 addition [2] - 4443:21, 4454:19 additional [7] -4291:22, 4309:10, 4353:3, 4406:21, 4452:13, 4456:4. 4508:16 address [1] - 4395:12 addresses [3] -4310:8, 4310:13, 4310:19

4391:25, 4518:3 adjusted [1] - 4515:3 adjustments [1] -4503:4 administer [1] -4414:17 administration [3] -4505:15, 4505:17, 4539:1 administrator [2] -4505:13, 4505:16 adopt [2] - 4313:13, 4435:14 adopted [1] - 4454:23 adoption [1] - 4497:6 advance [2] - 4366:2, 4487:17 adverse [2] - 4327:8, 4330:19 advice [1] - 4437:3 advise [2] - 4354:9, 4379:7 **Advisory** [1] - 4505:18 Affairs [1] - 4511:7 affect [2] - 4386:24, 4464:9 affecting [1] - 4407:13 affiliated [3] - 4437:1, 4437:6, 4483:22 afternoon [8] -4351:12, 4351:15, 4351:16, 4435:19, 4435:21, 4436:18, 4504:19, 4504:20 age [1] - 4325:4 Age [1] - 4297:4 agencies [6] - 4322:3, 4379:8, 4379:16, 4390:25, 4494:22, 4511:16 Agency [3] - 4505:14, 4505:19, 4511:11 agency [1] - 4382:11 Agency's [1] -4488:14 agents [2] - 4479:15, 4480:11 aggregate [2] -4471:14, 4528:18 ago [9] - 4291:1, 4373:3, 4393:16, 4402:14, 4411:16, 4448:10, 4449:9, 4453:16, 4499:4 Agree [1] - 4346:10 agree [20] - 4291:3, 4323:25, 4324:8, 4324:11, 4324:12,

4325:3, 4355:25.

4423:3, 4464:10, 4465:7, 4467:13, 4480:7, 4490:25, 4517:19, 4539:8, 4539:11, 4539:13, 4541:13 agreed [3] - 4350:17, 4423:4, 4423:6 Agreement [1] -4346:9 agreement [3] -4290:19, 4323:24, 4357:9 agricultural [16] -4441:14, 4449:25, 4450:10, 4455:9, 4473:16, 4481:25, 4482:10, 4494:9, 4495:1, 4505:6, 4508:21, 4509:4, 4509:12, 4510:9, 4526:6, 4542:6 Agricultural [3] -4436:22, 4436:25, 4475:11 Agriculture [5] -4331:25, 4332:24, 4333:10, 4458:18, 4544:6 agriculture [10] -4439:13. 4470:19. 4476:19, 4476:20, 4494:24, 4509:8, 4513:13, 4525:11, 4531:3, 4533:21 ahead [2] - 4479:23, 4494:14 aid [1] - 4498:16 air [1] - 4292:24 **Alabama** [8] - 4343:2, 4343:5, 4343:20, 4343:25, 4346:2, 4346:5, 4438:25, 4475:22 Albert [1] - 4504:25 **Aldo** [1] - 4289:10 Allan [6] - 4342:23, 4344:12, 4346:17, 4347:2, 4347:21, 4347:23 **Allan's** [1] - 4345:6 allegation [4] -4289:18, 4289:25, 4290:1, 4290:7 alleged [2] - 4511:21, 4515:7 alleges [2] - 4420:13, 4515:4 allocation [7] -

acre [19] - 4447:4, THE REPORTING GROUP:11, 4416:22,

4466:9, 4467:7,

| | 1 | 1 | | _ |
|--------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| 4467:19, 4468:3, | 4385:1, 4387:3, | analyzed [6] - | 4326:4, 4326:17, | 4538:2, 4538:3, |
| 4523:2, 4529:17, | 4409:7, 4423:25, | 4325:25, 4352:13, | 4327:17, 4331:19, | 4539:19, 4543:7, |
| 4543:14 | 4424:2, 4424:8, | 4396:25, 4420:1, | 4334:6, 4338:6, | 4544:1 |
| allot [1] - 4538:10 | 4438:6, 4452:12, | 4486:5, 4486:20 | 4339:8, 4339:22, | appropriate [8] - |
| allow [1] - 4411:24 | 4495:25 | analyzing [2] - | 4340:7, 4341:9, | 4307:10, 4433:18, |
| allowed [9] - 4399:10, | Analysis [3] - 4480:6, | 4321:23, 4461:20 | 4346:12, 4353:13, | 4474:18, 4474:22, |
| 4412:15, 4414:17, | 4488:15, 4488:22 | Andrews [1] - 4435:2 | 4354:21, 4359:10, | 4503:4, 4511:20, |
| 4414:22, 4418:12, | analysis [92] - | animal [1] - 4388:16 | 4363:15, 4367:8, | 4511:24, 4520:11 |
| 4446:13, 4446:18, | 4331:14, 4352:5, | animals [5] - 4336:16, | 4368:5, 4368:10, | approval [1] - 4511:7 |
| 4446:19, 4446:20 | 4354:19, 4374:13, | 4388:10, 4391:3, | 4370:14, 4371:2, | approve [2] - 4423:4, |
| allowing [3] - 4401:3, | 4381:15, 4381:21, | 4391:14, 4397:22 | 4371:17, 4371:19, | 4424:11 |
| 4457:12, 4457:20 | 4383:3, 4385:15, | annual [11] - 4386:3, | 4374:3, 4374:16, | April [3] - 4317:15, |
| allows [2] - 4382:2, | 4385:20, 4386:10, | 4387:6, 4396:15, | 4375:24, 4380:19, | 4317:24, 4346:6 |
| 4385:13 | 4387:11, 4387:25, | 4397:4, 4397:5, | 4403:12, 4413:12, | aquifer [2] - 4486:12, |
| Almanac [1] - 4288:9 | 4389:12, 4393:12, | 4476:22, 4508:20, | 4414:8, 4419:23, | 4486:19 |
| almost [13] - 4336:14, | 4393:20, 4395:24, | 4515:24, 4519:6, | 4422:6, 4423:1, | Aquifer [1] - 4484:8 |
| 4357:8, 4376:12, | 4410:1, 4419:16, | 4523:16, 4528:6 | 4426:22, 4427:10, | aquifers [5] - 4483:1, |
| 4391:8, 4396:18, | 4420:6, 4420:13, | annualize [1] - 4519:2 | 4502:16, 4516:19, | 4484:9, 4484:20, |
| 4400:7, 4429:22, | 4420:22, 4421:1, | annualized [1] - | 4517:14, 4517:20, | 4485:5, 4485:18 |
| 4498:8, 4502:23, | 4426:3, 4428:20, | 4515:1 | 4517:22, 4531:15, | arbitrarily [1] - 4383:1 |
| 4517:13, 4518:25, | 4428:23, 4429:1, | annually [2] - 4509:15, | 4531:24, 4533:3, | arcane [1] - 4470:1 |
| 4524:5, 4527:6 | 4429:6, 4429:7, | 4513:12 | 4535:1, 4541:24 | area [12] - 4363:9, |
| alone [3] - 4385:13, | 4437:4, 4446:2, | anonymously [1] - | Apalachicola's [2] - | 4403:9, 4447:20, |
| 4395:7, 4516:21 | 4452:7, 4453:18, | 4546:3 | 4344:24, 4345:11 | 4473:17, 4473:20, |
| alternative [3] - | 4458:13, 4461:15, | answer [17] - 4295:22, | Apalachicola- Chattahoochee- | 4473:24, 4508:25, |
| 4381:20, 4468:14, | 4465:24, 4469:23, 4470:1, 4471:14, | 4297:12, 4298:16, | Flint [1] - 4346:12 | 4509:2, 4527:23, |
| 4486:7 | 4471:19, 4472:15, | 4299:13, 4299:16, | apologize [4] - | 4527:24, 4527:25, |
| alternatives [1] - 4537:19 | 4480:7, 4480:17, | 4300:12, 4300:14, | 4365:12, 4454:7, | 4529:22 |
| 4937.19 Amended [1] - | 4482:1, 4485:24, | 4300:22, 4312:11, 4335:21, 4337:4, | 4456:7, 4484:2 | areas [16] - 4332:11, 4335:10, 4403:18, |
| 4342:25 | 4485:25, 4488:17, | 4339:20, 4360:25, | appear [1] - 4311:10 | 4403:19, 4404:4, |
| amendment [1] - | 4489:4, 4489:18, | 4363:2, 4429:11, | APPEARANCES [1] - | 4404:16, 4404:17, |
| 4539:2 | 4489:20, 4491:1, | 4495:24, 4537:18 | 4285:16 | 4404:22, 4405:1, |
| amenity [1] - 4537:25 | 4491:9, 4491:13, | answering [3] - | Appendix [1] - 4345:9 | 4405:2, 4408:23, |
| amicus [3] - 4495:11, | 4491:24, 4492:16, | 4296:6, 4296:16, | appendix [1] - 4482:6 | 4447:15, 4447:20, |
| 4495:15, 4495:17 | 4497:16, 4501:11, | 4309:2 | applications [1] - | 4448:1, 4448:4, |
| amount [33] - 4324:8, | 4501:18, 4501:23, | answers [2] - 4347:17, | 4466:14 | 4526:10 |
| 4391:5, 4391:13, | 4502:14, 4502:24, | 4352:20 | applied [5] - 4458:12, | arithmetic [1] - |
| 4398:16, 4399:17, | 4503:5, 4506:3, | anthropogenic [1] - | 4463:17, 4464:2, | 4477:16 |
| 4413:7, 4420:15, | 4506:19, 4506:20, 4509:16, 4509:22, | 4377:13 | 4467:21, 4543:11 | arithmetically [1] - |
| 4427:7, 4441:13, | 4509:16, 4509:22, 4509:23, 4510:5, | anticipate [2] - | apply [4] - 4447:3, | 4527:4 |
| 4441:16, 4441:19, | 4510:6, 4510:23, | 4342:6, 4439:15 | 4470:4, 4471:8, | Army [4] - 4343:3, |
| 4447:2, 4448:13, | 4511:5, 4511:13, | anticipated [1] - | 4502:5 | 4343:21, 4346:4, |
| 4453:4, 4456:16, | 4511:18, 4512:11, | 4521:19 | applying [1] - 4512:2 | 4347:5 |
| 4463:17, 4464:1, | 4512:14, 4512:20, | anticipates [1] - | appointed [1] - | arranged [1] - 4318:3 |
| 4470:2, 4470:9, | 4512:25, 4515:19, | 4439:18 | 4505:13 | arrests [1] - 4371:13 |
| 4496:12, 4519:6, 4524:8, 4526:9, | 4515:23, 4518:6, | anytime [1] - 4445:14 | Apportionment [1] - 4346:10 | arrived [1] - 4450:21 |
| 4524.6, 4520.9, 4526:14, 4527:12, | 4524:4, 4526:20, | anyway [2] - 4412:15, | apportionment [1] - | article [25] - 4308:23, 4354:22, 4354:24, |
| 4528:23, 4529:19, | 4526:21, 4526:24, | 4429:12 Apalachicola [65] - | 4506:17 | 4354.22, 4354.24, 4356:9, 4357:14, |
| 4529:20, 4533:20, | 4527:20, 4530:8, | 4296:13, 4300:7, | appreciate [2] - | 4357:17, 4364:5, |
| 4533:22, 4542:21, | 4534:2, 4535:25, | 4305:7, 4314:25, | 4435:7, 4547:11 | 4364:7, 4364:14, |
| 4543:10, 4547:10 | 4536:3, 4537:20, | 4315:2, 4315:8, | approach [19] - | 4364:17, 4365:16, |
| amounts [4] - | 4538:22, 4539:6 | 4315:22, 4316:10, | 4313:3, 4318:19, | 4366:3, 4366:12, |
| 4444:11, 4459:19, | analysts [1] - 4489:13 | 4316:12, 4317:1, | 4381:18, 4461:18, | 4366:14, 4366:18, |
| 4461:10, 4464:6 | analyze [8] - 4314:23, | 4317:6, 4317:10, | 4467:3, 4481:23, | 4367:1, 4367:4, |
| analogous [1] - | 4444:5, 4458:10, | 4319:25, 4321:13, | 4503:14, 4511:21, | 4367:17, 4367:19, |
| 4446:4 | 4463:6, 4469:19, 4486:7, 4503:8, | 4322:12, 4323:21, | 4519:4, 4522:25, | 4368:3, 4415:13, |
| analyses [11] - | 4521:7 m | 4324:4, 4325:14, | 4531:18, 4533:18, | 4415:17, 4416:18, |
| 4380:23, 4381:10, | THI | E REPORTING G | ROUP :19, 4537:24, | 4480:8, 4480:9 |
| | 1 | | 1 | |

4336:24, 4337:6,

4338:4, 4357:1,

4357:4, 4357:11,

4358:4, 4359:24,

4360:10, 4360:18,

4362:10, 4363:7,

4364:22. 4365:25.

4366:12, 4367:17,

4368:24, 4369:12,

4370:7, 4412:11,

articles [3] - 4512:1, 4512:2. 4517:7 artificial [3] - 4446:9, 4448:9, 4448:13 aside [3] - 4382:25, 4504:1, 4527:18 aspect [1] - 4447:13 assess [5] - 4333:7, 4333:17, 4333:21, 4381:25, 4396:8 **Assess** [1] - 4357:15 assessed [2] - 4455:4, 4495:22 assessing [1] - 4466:6 Assessment [1] -4356:11 assessment [9] -4328:2, 4357:2, 4358:13, 4359:15, 4359:18, 4359:25, 4360:19, 4396:6, 4510:9 assign [2] - 4520:12, 4535:9 assigned [1] - 4418:8 assist [1] - 4403:4 assisting [1] -4313:25 associate [1] -4463:22 associated [8] -4326:21, 4331:10, 4418:2, 4503:18, 4508:13, 4512:4, 4520:13, 4520:21 Associations [1] -4354:20 assorted [1] - 4290:24 assume [4] - 4338:13, 4489:14, 4496:6, 4497:17 assumed [6] -4466:18, 4466:20, 4496:1, 4496:2, 4497:19, 4515:6 assuming [2] -4453:25, 4469:24 assumption [2] -4431:3, 4431:5 assumptions [1] -4514:22 assure [1] - 4545:19 Atlanta [4] - 4503:17, 4508:1, 4508:25, 4509:2 Atlantic [2] - 4388:7, 4408:4 attachments [1] -4344:9 attempt [2] - 4470:6,

4541:22 attempted [1] - 4541:9 attempting [4] -4463:9, 4466:24, 4467:6, 4535:9 attention 191 -4438:21, 4450:5, 4452:19, 4469:10, 4490:10, 4496:16, 4506:6, 4506:19, 4533:24 attributed [1] -4310:23 Atwood [1] - 4547:24 Auburn [1] - 4438:17 auction [4] - 4467:14, 4467:17, 4467:24, 4474:23 auctions [4] -4477:14, 4478:13, 4478:15, 4479:4 audience [1] - 4392:1 augmenting [1] -4485:14 August [9] - 4349:1, 4359:25, 4360:19, 4372:20, 4382:19, 4442:1, 4530:22, 4532:19 author [4] - 4357:19, 4409:22, 4539:23, 4539:25 authored [2] - 4300:8, 4329:20 authors [2] - 4353:11, 4357:22 available [17] -4293:10, 4312:11, 4315:24, 4321:24, 4382:1, 4383:2,

4417:22, 4435:5,

4501:19, 4528:23,

4529:6, 4529:12,

4529:13, 4529:20,

4530:25, 4533:22,

average [10] - 4387:6,

4416:13, 4428:7,

4428:11, 4430:19,

4460:10, 4475:18,

averaged [2] - 4421:7,

4428:13, 4532:20

aware [49] - 4290:18,

4290:24, 4325:16,

4330:12, 4330:15,

4476:2, 4529:1,

4537:25

4529:6

4429:5

averages [2] -

4417:12, 4422:5, 4436:23, 4439:24, 4440:2, 4448:12, 4448:16, 4448:18, 4448:22, 4450:23, 4454:19, 4455:1, 4455:7, 4455:14, 4455:20, 4456:1, 4456:13, 4458:20, 4484:18, 4487:7, 4490:20 axis [2] - 4390:17 В baby [4] - 4392:11, 4392:12, 4392:22, 4400:3 backbone [1] - 4289:2 backdrop [1] -4528:14 background [3] -4295:3, 4504:23, 4540:2 backs [1] - 4469:25 backwards [1] -4304:9 bag [1] - 4356:4 Bainbridge [7] -4440:15, 4440:18, 4440:22, 4441:2, 4441:14, 4441:17, 4441:20 bank [1] - 4537:16 bankclimber [1] -4516:18 Bankruptcy [2] -4285:12, 4435:6 Bar [4] - 4359:20, 4385:4, 4385:6 bar [15] - 4319:16, 4319:19, 4383:8, 4383:10, 4383:18, 4383:22, 4383:25, 4391:18, 4391:23, 4513:5, 4513:7, 4527:8, 4529:18, 4534:4 Barack [1] - 4312:4

4332:25, 4333:4, 4333:6, 4333:17, 4333:18, 4333:22, 4336:11, 4341:13, 4368:5, 4376:7, 4376:10, 4379:23, 4382:12, 4382:14, 4382:22, 4382:24, 4383:1, 4383:4, 4383:5, 4383:16, 4384:3, 4384:12, 4384:24, 4385:5, 4390:21, 4391:5, 4394:1, 4395:1, 4420:3, 4420:8, 4420:23, 4421:11, 4421:13, 4421:16, 4421:21, 4531:21 based [20] - 4321:22, 4352:5, 4363:9, 4374:20, 4375:19, 4398:15, 4407:21, 4410:1, 4420:6, 4437:23, 4438:24, 4439:9, 4439:19, 4443:13, 4515:19, 4518:12, 4529:15, 4540:18, 4541:8, 4541:11 baseline [5] - 4489:14, 4490:2, 4492:14, 4492:16, 4520:22 baselines [1] -4495:22 basic [3] - 4323:24, 4381:18, 4489:22 basin [4] - 4483:19, 4507:3, 4527:13, 4535:11 Basin [26] - 4346:12, 4438:19, 4439:16, 4439:25, 4440:6, 4440:18, 4440:25, 4441:4, 4447:9, 4456:17, 4467:24, 4472:21, 4473:1, 4473:6, 4474:5, 4484:9, 4489:6, 4497:12, 4521:9, 4523:22, 4529:17, 4531:2, 4535:1, 4541:6, 4541:11, 4543:18 Basin-wide [1] -4473:6 basing [2] - 4444:7, 4446:14 **basis** [6] - 4448:14, 4332:12, 4333:1 THE REPORTING GROUP 1, 4515:2,

bars [40] - 4332:14,

4523:16, 4528:6, 4528:18 bat [1] - 4372:4 Bates [3] - 4344:10, 4344:19, 4347:5 batteries [1] - 4485:19 bay [25] - 4315:3, 4319:13, 4326:19, 4327:1, 4340:1, 4340:12, 4363:17, 4375:1, 4379:2, 4382:8, 4384:10, 4385:11, 4385:12, 4401:2, 4401:18, 4403:5, 4403:7, 4403:25, 4404:9, 4404:21, 4406:1, 4406:16, 4408:18, 4408:22, 4420:3 **Bay** [67] - 4296:13, 4300:7, 4305:7, 4314:25, 4315:8, 4316:10, 4316:11, 4316:12, 4317:1, 4317:6, 4317:10, 4320:1, 4321:13, 4322:12, 4323:21, 4324:4, 4325:14, 4325:17, 4325:20, 4326:4, 4327:17, 4331:19, 4334:6, 4338:6. 4339:8. 4339:22, 4340:7, 4341:9, 4353:13, 4354:21, 4359:11, 4363:10, 4364:5, 4364:8, 4367:9, 4368:5, 4368:10, 4370:14, 4371:2, 4371:17, 4371:19, 4374:3. 4374:16. 4375:24, 4378:10, 4378:12, 4378:17, 4378:19, 4378:24, 4380:19, 4403:12, 4406:15, 4413:13, 4414:8, 4414:15, 4414:17, 4414:19, 4419:23, 4422:6, 4423:1, 4424:21, 4425:6, 4427:10, 4516:19, 4517:15, 4517:20, 4517:22 Bay's [1] - 4379:13 bay-wide [6] - 4382:8, 4384:10, 4385:11, 4385:12, 4408:18, 4408:22 bear [1] - 4506:16 bears [2] - 4345:15,

| | I | I | 1 | |
|--|--------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|------------------------------|
| 4347:5 | 4427:9 | best [4] - 4456:23, | 4344:12, 4344:14, | 4517:7 |
| Beasley [1] - 4437:6 | benefit [27] - 4471:13, | 4458:4, 4511:14, | 4344:23, 4345:6, | border [3] - 4528:23, |
| Beaton [2] - 4348:3, | 4486:9, 4489:18, | 4520:25 | 4345:9, 4345:18, | 4531:1, 4533:23 |
| 4371:12 | 4491:24, 4492:11, | better [3] - 4288:7, | 4346:16, 4347:2, | born [1] - 4432:4 |
| become [10] - | 4492:16, 4492:17, | 4288:12, 4532:25 | 4352:11, 4354:17, | bottle [1] - 4321:4 |
| 4427:11, 4427:12, | 4500:12, 4509:16, | Between [2] - 4300:6, | 4356:8, 4358:12, | bottom [13] - 4306:8, |
| 4427:18, 4431:24, | 4509:22, 4509:23, | 4354:20 | 4362:13, 4362:15, | 4336:1, 4340:11, |
| 4432:6, 4432:12, | 4510:4, 4510:6, | between [28] - | 4362:16, 4362:19, | 4356:23, 4359:19, |
| 4432:25, 4448:16, | 4510:17, 4510:23, | 4295:16, 4301:4, | 4372:16, 4405:7, | 4373:6, 4405:16, |
| 4448:18, 4487:5 | 4511:17, 4512:11, | 4304:6, 4304:16, | 4415:16, 4436:11, | 4425:14, 4442:22, |
| Bedient's [3] - 4502:7, | 4512:14, 4512:20, | 4306:10, 4309:24, | 4438:1, 4445:1, | 4443:12, 4443:16, |
| 4502:24, 4532:11 | 4512:25, 4515:19, | 4311:18, 4351:18, | 4475:13, 4486:17, | 4457:5, 4457:8 |
| begin [6] - 4294:24, | 4515:23, 4518:6, | 4351:22, 4354:2, | 4533:25, 4534:7, | bought [1] - 4470:14 |
| 4303:11, 4313:23, | 4527:20, 4534:1, | 4354:10, 4377:8, | 4540:10, 4540:11, | bounds [1] - 4516:16 |
| 4314:12, 4413:3, | 4538:6, 4538:22 | 4385:2, 4386:17, | 4545:4 | boxes [1] - 4416:4 |
| 4434:23 | benefit-cost [19] - | 4386:20, 4387:8, | binders [5] - 4294:9, | break [6] - 4292:8, |
| beginning [3] - | 4471:13, 4491:24, | 4387:13, 4387:19, | 4314:6, 4350:11, | 4307:10, 4307:17, |
| 4303:16, 4376:22, | 4492:16, 4509:16, | 4390:14, 4391:7, | 4436:8, 4436:10 | 4342:1, 4342:8, |
| 4445:12 | 4509:22, 4510:4, | 4410:17, 4441:24, | biological [1] - 4315:3 | 4433:17 |
| begins [15] - 4305:21, | 4510:6, 4510:23, | 4477:8, 4480:11, | biologically [1] - | |
| 4327:24, 4328:12, | 4511:17, 4512:11, | 4491:6, 4503:23, | 4406:23 | breaking [1] - 4341:24 |
| 4330:4, 4335:22, | 4512:14, 4512:20, | 4506:18, 4527:11 | biologists [2] - | bred [1] - 4454:13 |
| 4340:1, 4340:11, | 4512:25, 4515:19, | beyond [2] - 4439:11, | 4322:11, 4357:2 | breeding [1] - 4454:14 |
| 4353:18, 4359:19, | 4515:23, 4518:6, | 4516:16 | biomass [2] - | bridge [1] - 4320:1 |
| 4361:10, 4365:20, | 4527:20, 4534:1, | bias [1] - 4536:15 | 4396:10, 4514:19 | brief [7] - 4289:21, |
| | 4538:22 | biases [1] - 4355:25 | biophysical [3] - | 4307:17, 4408:25, |
| 4370:2, 4373:7, | benefits [35] - 4454:1, | big [2] - 4432:16, | 4514:10, 4515:14, | 4462:10, 4495:11, |
| 4489:23, 4494:8 behalf [6] - 4293:23, | 4488:18, 4489:4, | 4538:24 | 4514.10, 4515.14, 4540:21 | 4495:17, 4541:16 |
| • | 4489:5, 4491:13, | | birds [1] - 4547:1 | briefly [5] - 4380:22, |
| 4296:4, 4312:5, | 4491:20, 4500:7, | biggest [1] - 4401:12 | | 4400:22, 4406:24, |
| 4318:13, 4319:4, | 4506:9, 4510:10, | bill [2] - 4457:12, | bit [13] - 4362:25, | 4423:15, 4449:15 |
| 4411:15 | 4510:12, 4511:21, | 4457:20 | 4363:12, 4363:13, | briefs [2] - 4495:15, |
| behind [25] - 4296:18, | 4512:3, 4512:19, | Bill [4] - 4291:5, | 4398:2, 4419:15, | 4545:18 |
| 4314:18, 4320:25, 4325:10, 4327:16, | 4513:6, 4514:5, | 4294:4, 4361:20, | 4457:7, 4467:5, 4479:18, 4487:1, | bring [1] - 4526:15 |
| · · | 4514:9, 4515:10, | 4363:3 | | bringing [1] - 4443:21 |
| 4329:14, 4339:8, | 4515:17, 4516:3, | billion [14] - 4472:22, | 4496:8, 4514:3, 4532:13, 4533:16 | brings [1] - 4527:2 |
| 4339:21, 4344:5, | 4516:5, 4516:6, | 4473:1, 4473:10, | | broad [1] - 4506:15 |
| 4344:11, 4344:13, | 4517:8, 4518:4, | 4499:20, 4508:8, | blasted [1] - 4548:5 | broader [1] - 4506:1 |
| 4344:22, 4345:5, | 4518:7, 4518:9, | 4508:19, 4509:10, | blue [20] - 4296:9, | broadest [2] - 4377:9, |
| 4345:8, 4345:17, 4346:16, 4347:1, | 4518:15, 4521:2, | 4509:13, 4509:15, | 4296:23, 4298:4, | 4377:11 |
| 4352:10, 4353:9, | 4524:9, 4527:19, | 4517:14, 4518:11, | 4298:21, 4299:9, | broadly [1] - 4510:7 |
| , , | 4538:19, 4538:25, | 4518:25, 4542:15 | 4299:18, 4299:22, | brought [1] - 4396:23 |
| 4354:17, 4358:12, | 4540:12, 4540:23, | binder [66] - 4294:12, | 4305:13, 4306:1, | Browner [1] - 4505:13 |
| 4359:6, 4364:6, | 4541:23 | 4295:9, 4295:14, | 4306:18, 4383:8, | Budget [1] - 4511:6 |
| 4366:16, 4527:16 | Berkeley [2] - | 4295:20, 4296:2, | 4384:1, 4384:24, | budget [1] - 4538:10 |
| believes [1] - 4405:24 | 4535:21, 4536:17 | 4296:9, 4296:12, | 4385:7, 4386:18, | bulk [1] - 4443:21 |
| bell [2] - 4437:10, | Berrigan [18] - | 4297:8, 4297:23, | 4390:21, 4391:4, | bullet [6] - 4306:1, |
| 4451:1 | 4323:17, 4333:12, | 4298:14, 4298:22, | 4425:4, 4514:20, | 4325:23, 4328:11, |
| below [3] - 4394:12, | 4323:17, 4333:12, 4333:15, 4334:17, | 4299:4, 4299:9, | 4515:5 | 4329:3, 4482:23, |
| 4425:20, 4430:19 | 4336:6, 4336:21, | 4299:12, 4299:23, | Board [1] - 4338:7 | 4486:24 |
| benchmark [7] - | | 4300:3, 4300:19, | boat [10] - 4318:3, | bullets [3] - 4469:2, |
| 4451:22, 4451:24, | 4338:1, 4339:11, 4340:15, 4350:6, | 4301:2, 4301:11, | 4318:5, 4318:8, | 4469:11, 4482:25 |
| 4452:3, 4452:4, | 4373:15, 4374:24, | 4301:22, 4303:5, | 4319:12, 4320:6, | burden [2] - 4468:24, |
| 4452:9, 4452:10, | | 4303:23, 4304:5, | 4320:17, 4321:15, | 4545:14 |
| 4452:18 | 4375:9, 4375:13, 4376:6, 4385:18, | 4304:21, 4305:4, | 4395:18, 4413:13, | Bureau [2] - 4495:8, |
| benchmarks [4] - | | 4306:6, 4306:15, | 4413:18 | 4495:10 |
| 4450:9, 4450:14, | 4411:15, 4411:20 | 4307:25, 4308:6, | bold [1] - 4496:25 | Bush [1] - 4505:17 |
| 4452:5, 4452:21 | Berrigan's [6] - | 4308:12, 4308:20, | bolded [1] - 4425:18 | bushels [3] - 4521:21, |
| bend [1] - 4426:11 | 4332:18, 4333:23, | 4314:19, 4325:11, | book [2] - 4507:11, | 4522:2, 4522:3 |
| bends [4] - 4426:14, | 4334:7, 4335:1, | 4343:8, 4343:17, | 4507:14 | Business [1] - 4505:1 |
| 4427:2, 4427:5, | 4339:7, 4339:22 _{THI} | E REPORTING G | ROUP [2] - 4507 :17, | business [2] - |
| | π. | I Ingan (Tablel - | I | |
| 22 of 107 shoots | I ^V . | lason & Lockha | II L —————————————————————————————————— | Poporting Croup (207) 707 60 |

4556

4508:13, 4510:15 buv 181 - 4403:24. 4466:17, 4469:25, 4477:18, 4477:21, 4477:22, 4478:1, 4523:15 buy-back [6] -4466:17, 4477:18, 4477:21, 4477:22, 4478:1, 4523:15 buy-backs [1] -4469:25 buying [1] - 4538:10 BY [27] - 4313:6, 4314:9, 4318:22, 4351:14, 4353:7, 4360:24, 4362:22, 4372:2, 4389:1, 4393:8, 4398:14, 4400:20, 4402:8, 4402:12, 4405:5, 4414:7, 4423:18, 4435:9, 4436:4, 4436:20, 4502:21, 4504:18, 4507:10, 4507:20, 4509:24, 4530:4, 4534:13

C

calculated [7] -4355:22, 4397:3, 4397:5, 4481:13, 4481:18, 4481:19, 4514:7 calculates [1] -4480:24 calculation [2] -4482:12, 4514:8 calculations [1] -4504:1 caliber [1] - 4546:21 California [3] -4535:21, 4536:17, 4537:8 callers [1] - 4537:17 Camacho [1] -4289:10 Camp [1] - 4308:22 cap [4] - 4456:15, 4456:18, 4456:22, 4458:11 capacities [1] -4505:12 caps [1] - 4461:16 captain [1] - 4318:8 Captain [7] - 4318:8, 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:12, 4371:11,

4413:13, 4413:18

captioned [3] -4343:1. 4344:14. 4346:2 **capture** [1] - 4358:19 carefully [1] - 4394:17 carnivorous [1] -4362:9 Carol [1] - 4505:13 Carolina [1] - 4475:23 carried [7] - 4474:24, 4477:14, 4477:15, 4478:14, 4482:14, 4501:12, 4544:10 carries [3] - 4315:14, 4437:2, 4457:9 carry [2] - 4506:3, 4511:4 carrying [1] - 4463:10 Cary [1] - 4435:6 case [55] - 4290:5, 4290:11, 4292:15, 4310:6, 4313:8, 4313:14, 4317:10, 4322:24, 4328:8, 4329:5, 4330:13, 4343:3, 4343:13, 4343:22, 4344:16, 4345:2, 4345:14, 4345:20, 4345:22, 4346:2, 4346:7, 4346:20, 4374:1, 4378:12, 4384:25, 4398:24, 4403:11, 4429:22, 4435:15, 4439:15, 4441:21, 4449:18, 4463:16, 4484:5, 4487:8, 4487:14, 4495:11, 4496:14, 4499:6, 4506:12, 4506:16, 4507:1, 4512:6, 4512:14, 4512:15, 4512:21, 4520:6, 4521:17, 4522:1,

4525:19, 4540:20,

4542:11, 4546:13,

4546:17, 4547:16

Case [2] - 4352:7,

cases [4] - 4331:13,

4355:15, 4461:1,

Cat [1] - 4319:15

catch [5] - 4355:18,

4355:21, 4358:5,

4394:19, 4545:15

Catch [2] - 4297:4,

Catch-At-Age [1] -

4353:8

4510:13

4357:14

4297:4

categorically [1] -4518:15 categories [1] -4508:18 category [1] - 4377:16 cattle [1] - 4440:1 causal [1] - 4381:21 caused [19] - 4314:24, 4315:18, 4321:12, 4325:19, 4330:24, 4339:1, 4363:21, 4370:14, 4371:2, 4382:6, 4385:11, 4386:15, 4388:5, 4407:24, 4408:21, 4411:4, 4412:8, 4414:1, 4422:25 causes [3] - 4366:20, 4408:2, 4408:16 Causes [1] - 4308:25 Caution [1] - 4297:15 caution [2] - 4323:13, 4395:8 cell [1] - 4457:11 census [3] - 4476:19, 4476:20 center [1] - 4304:24 Center [1] - 4365:5 central [3] - 4510:7, 4510:20, 4537:5 century [1] - 4390:23 certain [17] - 4303:8, 4322:18, 4335:5, 4342:14, 4342:18, 4353:24, 4353:25, 4358:4, 4403:15, 4424:16, 4427:20, 4429:15, 4429:16, 4429:18, 4430:6, 4432:19, 4483:10 certainly [24] -4290:10, 4291:16, 4292:7. 4314:7. 4323:6, 4325:7, 4328:1, 4329:10, 4358:24, 4370:22, 4381:18, 4388:5, 4424:1, 4436:17, 4436:23, 4440:2, 4441:16, 4446:23, 4447:22, 4469:22, 4498:22, 4510:25, 4514:8, 4519:12 certainty [1] - 4388:3 CERTIFICATE [1] -4549:1 certify [2] - 4549:3, 4549:7

4458:15, 4467:21, 4492:9, 4492:11, 4502:1, 4502:3, 4519:24, 4520:23, 4521:1 **chain** [1] - 4301:3 Chaires [2] - 4371:6, 4371:16 chairman [1] -4505:18 chance [2] - 4293:3, 4520:16 change [11] - 4385:2, 4444:19, 4444:21, 4444:22, 4445:24, 4467:5, 4491:13, 4510:13, 4510:14, 4518:12, 4518:16 changed [1] - 4510:23 **Changes** [1] - 4367:8 changes [5] - 4368:9, 4407:10, 4407:14, 4458:15, 4516:22 changing [4] -4387:24, 4402:13, 4405:6, 4444:11 **Chapman** [1] - 4546:8 CHAPMAN [1] -4546:9 characterized [2] -4358:5, 4473:15 characterizing [1] -4508:4 chart [12] - 4389:4, 4418:5, 4441:8, 4441:23, 4442:5, 4442:13, 4501:1, 4519:14, 4522:7, 4527:8, 4532:5, 4532:12 charts [1] - 4529:16 Chattahoochee [3] -4346:12, 4507:25, 4508:19 check [2] - 4401:10, 4401:23 checking [1] - 4546:4 Chesapeake [16] -4316:11, 4363:10, 4364:5, 4364:8, 4378:10, 4378:12, 4378:17, 4378:18, 4378:24, 4379:13, 4406:15, 4414:15, 4414:17, 4414:19, 4424:21, 4425:6 children [1] - 4539:8 choice [2] - 4447:1, 4537:19 THE REPORTING GROUP :S [1] - 4446:21

choosing [1] -4454:20 **chose** [1] - 4429:3 CHRISTIAN [1] -4285:22 Christine [1] -4505:16 Christmas [1] -4545:22 circled [1] - 4403:7 Circular [1] - 4511:8 circumstances [2] -4375:20, 4536:8 Cirino [1] - 4306:11 cite [10] - 4329:23, 4338:14, 4338:17, 4356:15, 4359:2, 4361:17, 4363:5, 4363:6, 4365:7, 4370:24 cited [3] - 4366:22, 4366:23, 4371:15 City [2] - 4344:24, 4345:10 **claimed** [1] - 4374:2 Claims [3] - 4345:1, 4345:12, 4346:1 clams [1] - 4377:19 Claudette [5] -4285:14, 4292:9, 4549:2, 4549:15, 4549:15 clean [1] - 4350:12 clear [9] - 4334:13, 4352:13, 4394:15, 4413:11, 4438:14, 4468:7, 4468:9, 4507:18, 4508:22 cleared [1] - 4412:19 **clearly** [1] - 4400:6 **CLERK** [4] - 4312:14, 4312:21, 4434:10, 4434:17 client [1] - 4431:6 climate [1] - 4364:23 **Climate** [1] - 4365:3 **Clinton** [1] - 4505:15 clip [5] - 4295:6, 4298:9, 4304:8, 4307:4, 4311:10 clips [14] - 4294:16, 4295:2, 4302:3, 4304:10, 4305:8, 4305:24, 4306:7, 4306:15, 4306:25, 4307:24, 4308:11, 4308:19, 4309:12, 4310:22 clock [1] - 4502:23

cfs [12] - 4441:18,

close [9] - 4375:23,

| | - | 1 | l | 1 |
|------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 4384:1, 4404:10, | 4406:18 | commercially- | 4454:17 | 4431:20 |
| 4482:3, 4508:20, | colleague [7] - | harvested [1] - | Complaint [2] - | conclusion [23] - |
| 4509:14, 4515:24, | 4294:3, 4294:8, | 4383:16 | 4343:1, 4346:17 | 4352:5, 4354:5, |
| 4523:12, 4527:7 | 4302:12, 4302:20, | Commission [4] - | complaint [4] - | 4376:17, 4380:16, |
| closed [3] - 4401:18, | 4303:7, 4311:23, | 4298:1, 4371:11, | 4299:5, 4299:7, | 4381:11, 4381:17, |
| 4427:3, 4427:6 | 4313:24 | 4416:24, 4549:17 | 4343:5, 4371:12 | 4384:8, 4386:11, |
| closely [1] - 4477:8 | colleagues [9] - | Commissioner's [1] - | completely [2] - | 4387:18, 4388:2, |
| closer [1] - 4320:2 | 4291:7, 4300:21, | 4350:5 | 4529:23, 4538:13 | 4388:19, 4389:10, |
| closest [1] - 4523:11 | 4304:7, 4304:23, | Commissioners [1] - | Complex [1] - 4300:5 | 4405:19, 4409:25, |
| closures [1] - 4356:5 | 4308:2, 4308:23, | 4338:7 | complex [3] - | 4414:1, 4422:19, |
| co [1] - 4409:22 | 4328:22, 4535:20, | Committee [1] - | 4467:15, 4526:5, | 4423:4, 4423:22, |
| co-author [1] - | 4536:23 | 4505:19 | 4544:3 | 4431:16, 4515:21, |
| 4409:22 | collected [4] - | committee [1] - | Compliance [2] - | 4515:22, 4525:24, |
| coast [3] - 4388:7, | 4316:22, 4355:13, | 4505:21 | 4489:1, 4489:25 | 4526:4 |
| 4408:4, 4417:7 | 4385:18, 4386:7 | committing [1] - | compliance [14] - | conclusions [15] - |
| Coastal [1] - 4300:10 | collecting [3] - | 4518:5 | 4401:11, 4489:9, | 4314:13, 4316:3, |
| coded [1] - 4442:4 | 4316:19, 4332:5 | commodities [3] - | 4489:15, 4490:2, | 4321:21, 4321:22, |
| cognizant [1] - | collection [1] - | 4446:15, 4509:12, | 4491:3, 4491:21, | 4353:12, 4353:24, |
| 4307:13 | 4316:17 | 4542:6 | 4494:15, 4494:19, | 4353:25, 4354:1, |
| cold [1] - 4320:8 | collectively [2] - | common [1] - 4480:16 | 4495:4, 4495:22, | 4358:11, 4410:4, |
| collapse [69] - 4294:7, | 4421:19, 4421:21 | commonly [4] - | 4496:1, 4496:7, | 4422:15, 4426:2, |
| 4314:24, 4315:9, | College [2] - 4312:10, | 4323:4, 4372:11, | 4496:9, 4497:17 | 4515:18, 4529:15 |
| 4315:18, 4315:23, | 4376:25 | 4373:4, 4373:13 | composed [2] - | Conclusions [1] - |
| 4321:12, 4327:12, | colleges [1] - 4437:2 | communications [1] - | 4493:11, 4493:13 | 4405:13 |
| 4329:14, 4330:25, | color[1] - 4442:4 | 4515:12 | composing [1] - | Conditions [1] - |
| 4331:9, 4338:2, | color-coded [1] - | Communities [1] - | 4449:16 | 4364:9 |
| 4339:1, 4341:12, | 4442:4 | 4357:16 | compounded [1] - | conditions [13] - |
| 4360:9, 4360:23, | column [7] - 4297:13, | communities [2] - | 4403:20 | 4315:17, 4324:12, |
| 4363:16, 4363:22, | 4298:25, 4305:15, | 4424:19, 4516:21 | concept [1] - 4472:16 | 4325:6, 4326:25, |
| 4365:24, 4366:12, | 4327:24, 4416:11, | community [7] - | concern [5] - 4418:19, | 4327:8, 4330:20, |
| 4367:16, 4368:23, | 4458:3, 4462:24 | 4324:10, 4338:6, | 4418:20, 4419:2, | 4368:6, 4384:23, |
| 4370:6, 4370:14, | columns [5] - 4416:5, | 4339:8, 4424:13, | 4419:3, 4535:19 | 4410:9, 4412:6, |
| 4371:2, 4376:19, | 4457:11, 4460:18, | 4427:17, 4427:18, | concerted [1] - | 4412:21, 4490:1 |
| 4378:13, 4380:19, | 4529:18 | 4537:1 | 4433:15 | conduct [11] - 4316:8, |
| 4380:20, 4381:12, | combinations [4] - | compare [4] - 4472:8, | conch [13] - 4334:6, | 4316:15, 4317:6, |
| 4382:18, 4382:20, | 4444:14, 4466:10, | 4514:9, 4519:8, | 4334:12, 4334:13, | 4317:18, 4379:5, |
| 4383:10, 4383:11, | 4523:3, 4543:15 | 4527:20 | 4334:18, 4336:16, | 4423:24, 4424:7, |
| 4383:20, 4383:23, | combined [2] - | compared [3] - | 4341:13, 4341:16, | 4425:8, 4467:23, |
| 4384:10, 4385:12, | 4390:6, 4533:22 | 4463:3, 4466:1, | 4372:6, 4372:9, | 4512:10, 4518:12 |
| 4386:12, 4386:15, | coming [10] - 4374:25, | 4510:11 | 4372:11, 4373:13, | conducted [7] - |
| 4388:1, 4388:4, | 4375:14, 4404:9, | compares [3] - | 4374:12, 4377:20 | 4381:15, 4387:2, |
| 4388:6, 4391:6, | 4450:22, 4499:5, | 4474:12, 4474:14, | conchs [12] - 4331:3, | 4387:10, 4387:24, |
| 4391:9, 4393:14, | 4500:10, 4500:16, | 4474:15 | 4331:4, 4331:11, | 4390:23, 4393:12, |
| 4395:9, 4397:17, | 4524:24, 4525:4, | comparing [6] - | 4336:13, 4336:15, | 4424:1 |
| 4400:14, 4401:17, | 4538:17 | 4481:12, 4500:1, | 4341:19, 4372:7, | conference [1] - |
| 4403:1, 4404:19, | commencing [1] - | 4500:7, 4522:8, | 4373:4, 4373:16, | 4445:11 |
| 4404:20, 4405:20, | 4285:13 | 4529:18, 4529:21 | 4373:20, 4374:25, | conferred [1] - 4303:2 |
| 4406:6, 4406:7, | comment [3] - 4431:2, | Comparison [1] - | 4375:13 | confidentiality [1] - |
| 4406:8, 4407:9, | 4435:25, 4471:1 | 4501:1 | conclude [6] - 4315:6, | 4310:6 |
| 4407:18, 4407:24, | commentary [1] - | comparison [10] - | 4315:14, 4315:21, | confirm [3] - 4313:9, |
| 4408:21, 4408:22, | 4353:4 | 4473:7, 4473:12, | 4330:21, 4351:21, | 4314:15, 4373:8 |
| 4410:20, 4411:4, | commented [1] - | 4506:8, 4512:18, | 4419:21 | confounded [1] - |
| 4412:8, 4414:2, | 4452:13 | 4527:10, 4527:19, | Concluded [1] - | 4420:13 |
| 4419:24, 4422:11, | comments [1] - | 4527:22, 4528:17, | 4548:18 | confounding [1] - |
| 4423:9, 4424:23 | 4311:2 | 4528:21, 4530:14 | concluded [3] - | 4384:22 |
| Collapse [2] - | commercial [4] - | comparisons [1] - | 4334:5, 4387:25, | confused [1] - |
| 4308:24, 4366:19 | 4369:9, 4509:7, | 4524:19 | 4420:6 | 4420:15 |
| collapsed [5] - | 4509:10, 4509:15 | compensation [1] - | concludes [2] - | confusing [1] - 4518:7 |
| 4378:19, 4395:10, | commercially [1] - | 4473:22 | 4302:7, 4309:6 | Congress [1] - 4285:12 |
| 4399:1, 4399:6, | 4383:16 TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP iding [1] - | 4200.12 |
| | N | Iason & Lockha | rt | |

| | T | 1 | 1 | |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--|--|------------------------------|
| conjoined [1] - 4536:3 | 4529:11 | 4443:4, 4444:2 | 4415:7, 4415:8, | 4513:24, 4515:19, |
| connection [8] - | consumptively [3] - | conversations [1] - | 4416:2, 4416:3, | 4515:23, 4515:25, |
| 4319:4, 4363:13, | 4528:22, 4529:5, | 4321:11 | 4416:18, 4418:25, | 4516:6, 4518:6, |
| 4363:17, 4364:4, | 4532:21 | convert [2] - 4477:23, | 4419:3, 4420:5, | 4519:8, 4519:22, |
| 4425:1, 4440:5, | contained [2] - | 4478:1 | 4420:24, 4421:6, | 4520:3, 4520:12, |
| 4505:8, 4507:1 | 4365:15, 4417:20 | convinced [1] - | 4421:10, 4423:2, | 4520:20, 4520:22, |
| connectivity [7] - | contains [15] - 4302:2, | 4399:19 | 4431:5, 4431:9, | 4521:4, 4523:2, |
| 4447:16, 4447:21, | 4347:22, 4348:1, | cooking [1] - 4430:5 | 4431:10, 4432:24, | 4523:8, 4527:20, |
| 4467:18, 4468:4, | 4348:6, 4348:11, | copied [1] - 4306:12 | 4440:10, 4447:7, | 4534:1, 4538:5, |
| 4502:9, 4502:11, | 4348:15, 4348:20, | copies [1] - 4546:7 | 4454:9, 4462:2, | 4538:22, 4543:14, |
| 4523:4 | 4348:25, 4349:5, | copy [3] - 4311:19, | 4463:5, 4465:6, | 4547:10 |
| consequence [2] - | 4349:10, 4349:15, | 4313:10, 4338:11 | 4470:11, 4471:21, | cost-benefit [2] - |
| 4411:22, 4412:2 | 4349:20, 4349:24, | core [2] - 4510:20, | 4472:17, 4473:3, | 4489:18, 4509:23 |
| Conservancy [1] - | 4350:3, 4359:14 | 4511:1 | 4473:12, 4488:20, | cost-effective [6] - |
| 4379:8 | contemporaneous [8] | corn [10] - 4454:12, | 4490:24, 4498:13, | 4466:8, 4467:7, |
| conservation [3] - | - 4323:3, 4323:12, | 4460:7, 4461:2, | 4498:18, 4503:11, | 4467:19, 4468:3, |
| 4497:2, 4512:12, | 4323:15, 4335:14, | 4461:6, 4461:8, | 4503:16, 4508:24, | 4523:2, 4543:14 |
| 4519:21 | 4358:18, 4370:12, | 4521:16, 4522:1, | 4509:25, 4510:1, | Costs [1] - 4501:2 |
| Conservation [7] - | 4370:25, 4412:12 | 4522:5, 4525:4, | 4515:8, 4518:14, | costs [31] - 4442:14, |
| 4297:25, 4369:2, | contemporaneously | 4542:22 | 4519:25, 4520:1, | 4453:24, 4454:1, |
| 4371:10, 4416:23, | [1] - 4323:8 | corner [1] - 4527:22 | 4522:9, 4522:10, | 4466:5, 4471:7, |
| 4449:6, 4496:24, | contemporary [2] - | Corps [4] - 4343:3, | 4522:12, 4522:14, | 4471:14, 4488:17, |
| 4501:2 | 4389:20, 4391:12 | 4343:21, 4346:4, | 4535:17, 4549:4 | 4488:18, 4489:5, |
| conservative [1] - | contents [7] - 4361:4, | 4347:5 | correctly [4] - | 4491:14, 4491:19, |
| 4514:22 | 4361:6, 4425:19, | correct [116] - | 4361:12, 4361:14, | 4492:3, 4492:7, |
| consider [10] - 4331:3, | 4425:20, 4425:21, | 4315:11, 4315:19, | 4361:15, 4388:15 | 4500:8, 4506:9, |
| 4331:4, 4335:14, | 4426:4, 4439:6 | 4315:25, 4316:9, | correlation [3] - | 4510:13, 4512:19, |
| 4335:16, 4388:15, | context [11] - 4320:13, | 4316:23, 4316:24, | 4354:2, 4354:10, | 4513:4, 4514:9, |
| 4452:23, 4467:10, | 4339:10, 4339:14, | 4317:7, 4317:15, | 4387:19 | 4518:3, 4518:7, |
| 4543:6, 4543:8, | 4339:18, 4352:18, | 4317:23, 4318:4, | correspondence [1] - | 4518:8, 4520:6, |
| 4543:12 | 4352:22, 4441:21, | 4319:6, 4319:16, | 4306:9 corridor[1] - 4484:17 | 4520:8, 4520:12, |
| considered [10] - | 4445:13, 4470:5, | 4320:7, 4320:12, | I | 4523:9, 4524:10, |
| 4323:5, 4323:6, | 4542:13, 4542:15 | 4320:22, 4321:8, | cost [78] - 4458:14, 4464:7, 4466:7, | 4527:19, 4539:11, 4543:13 |
| 4335:10, 4406:17, | contingent [5] - | 4322:4, 4322:19, | 4466:8, 4467:7, | cotton [16] - 4439:12, |
| 4415:3, 4416:1, | 4535:22, 4536:2, | 4322:22, 4323:11, | 4467:9, 4467:19, | 4439:17, 4439:20, |
| 4416:12, 4421:17, | 4536:4, 4536:19, 4537:10 | 4323:14, 4324:20, | 4467:20, 4468:3, | 4443:4, 4443:5, |
| 4421:21, 4526:14 considering [1] - | continue [3] - | 4324:21, 4325:20, | 4470:7, 4471:4, | 4443:23, 4443:24, |
| 4456:15 | 4307:22, 4342:2, | 4326:12, 4326:13, 4328:25, 4329:21, | 4471:12, 4471:13, | 4462:17, 4464:24, |
| consisted [1] - | 4411:25 | 4329:22, 4330:25, | 4473:25, 4474:1, | 4464:25, 4465:15, |
| 4393:20 | Continued [1] - | 4331:22, 4332:2, | 4477:7, 4478:22, | 4521:16, 4521:17, |
| consistent [3] - | 4287:1 | 4335:17, 4335:18, | 4478:23, 4481:13, | 4522:4, 4525:5, |
| 4376:17, 4484:21, | continued [1] - | 4335:19, 4337:16, | 4482:17, 4484:7, | 4542:22 |
| 4497:7 | 4394:13 | 4337:18, 4339:3, | 4486:8, 4489:18, | Cotton [1] - 4462:14 |
| constant [1] - 4397:1 | continues [3] - | 4340:23, 4351:23, | 4491:10, 4491:12, | cotton/peanut [1] - |
| constitutes [1] - | 4305:20, 4356:23, | 4353:24, 4354:4, | 4491:24, 4492:16, | 4442:24 |
| 4350:24 | 4359:20 | 4354:12, 4355:5, | 4492:17, 4498:22, | counsel [14] - 4288:3, |
| consulted [1] - | contrary [1] - 4315:24 | 4355:8, 4355:19, | 4499:6, 4499:7, | 4293:24, 4307:12, |
| 4537:13 | contrast [3] - 4384:6, | 4355:20, 4355:24, | 4499:8, 4499:11, | 4309:15, 4314:20, |
| Consumer [3] - | 4398:5, 4401:16 | 4356:13, 4359:4, | 4500:11, 4503:18, | 4337:17, 4339:14, |
| 4332:1, 4332:25, | contrasted [2] - | 4363:3, 4366:25, | 4503:22, 4509:16, | 4353:4, 4372:5, |
| 4333:11 | 4526:10, 4526:12 | 4368:7, 4368:19, | 4509:22, 4509:23, | 4372:16, 4372:21, |
| consumers [1] - | contributions [1] - | 4373:14, 4374:22, | 4510:4, 4510:6, | 4375:6, 4405:7, |
| 4525:12 | 4483:19 | 4378:10, 4383:13, | 4510:11, 4510:17, | 4407:1 |
| consuming [1] - | control [1] - 4433:24 | 4383:17, 4383:21, | 4510:23, 4511:3, | counselor [6] - |
| 4533:10 | controlled [1] - | 4383:24, 4390:3, | 4511:17, 4512:11, | 4478:11, 4487:6, |
| consumption [3] - | 4402:23 | 4390:4, 4393:18, | 4512:14, 4512:20, | 4492:15, 4511:12, |
| 4314:24, 4531:9, | convention [1] - | 4395:16, 4395:23, | 4512:25, 4513:11, | 4524:3, 4539:15 |
| 4531:12 | 4342:20 | 4402:20, 4409:3, | 4513:15, 4513:18, | counter [2] - 4307:5, |
| consumptive [1] - | conventional [2] - TH] | E REPORTING G | ROUP: 19, 4513:21, | 4320:25 |
| | | | I | |
| | M | lason & Lockha | ırt | |

4478:8, 4481:14,

4521:19, 4521:20,

| counter-designation |
|--|
| [1] - 4307:5 |
| counties [2] - |
| 4459:24, 4461:17 |
| country [1] - 4388:6 |
| County [5] - 4338:7, |
| 4350:5, 4460:6, |
| 4461:7 |
| county [1] - 4460:3 |
| couple [19] - 4307:14 |
| 4310:19, 4369:21, |
| 4372:4, 4380:1, |
| 4380:22, 4400:10, 4400:15, 4402:13, |
| 4402:18, 4411:16, |
| 4413:10, 4450:12, |
| 4459:15, 4463:16, |
| 4479:6, 4487:19, |
| 4496:15, 4541:15 |
| course [17] - 4290:3, |
| 4292:14, 4311:16, |
| 4337:25, 4341:16, |
| 4351:4, 4378:8, |
| 4389:15, 4394:4, |
| 4401:14, 4450:3, |
| 4461:2, 4463:16, |
| 4475:21, 4508:14, |
| 4517:24, 4533:1 |
| COURT [1] - 4285:1 |
| court [19] - 4292:2, |
| 4292:20, 4332:18, 4342:11, 4343:9, |
| 4343:17, 4346:6, |
| 4346:22, 4347:10, |
| 4348:14, 4348:17, |
| 4348:23, 4349:4, |
| 4349:18, 4349:22, |
| 4350:4, 4435:3, |
| 4435:5, 4462:7 |
| Court [62] - 4285:12, |
| 4291:9, 4294:10, |
| 4294:19, 4302:13, |
| 4303:7, 4305:5, |
| 4309:8, 4311:1, |
| 4311:20, 4334:15, |
| 4335:8, 4336:25, |
| 4337:5, 4337:23, 4338:24, 4347:19, |
| 4350:2, 4350:11, |
| 4351:3, 4354:9, |
| 4374:19, 4375:9, |
| 4376:23, 4377:5, |
| 4377:25, 4378:15, |
| 4378:18, 4380:23, |
| 4381:1, 4381:14, |
| 4383:12, 4384:5, |
| 4385:22, 4386:9, |
| 4388:25, 4389:4, |
| 4390:7, 4390:12, |
| 4391:18, 4391:21, |
| |

| 4393:6, 4393:19, |
|--|
| 4396:4, 4398:8, |
| 4398:19, 4400:23, |
| 4402:9, 4402:21, |
| 4406:3, 4406:25, |
| 4409:15, 4409:24, |
| 4423:21, 4425:25, |
| 4426:1, 4435:6, |
| 4437:23, 4455:22, |
| 4486:9, 4509:5, |
| 4549:16 |
| Court's [4] - 4292:7, |
| 4294:23, 4303:10, |
| 4336:3 |
| courtroom [2] - |
| 4293:7, 4433:14 |
| cover [3] - 4370:9, |
| 4449:3, 4485:12 |
| covered [3] - 4392:5, |
| 4400:25, 4456:9 |
| covering [1] - 4399:5 |
| covers [2] - 4387:15, |
| 4408:13 Cowie [3] - 4483:9, |
| 4483:11, 4483:21 |
| Coy [2] - 4318:9, |
| 4413:13 |
| CPUE [11] - 4300:7, |
| 4355:18, 4358:5, |
| 4393:17, 4394:4, |
| 4394:10, 4394:12, |
| 4394:18, 4395:2, |
| 4395:11, 4395:20 |
| crab [4] - 4321:5, |
| 4425:4, 4514:20, |
| 4514:25 |
| crabs [4] - 4331:7, |
| 4372:25, 4377:18, |
| 4515:6 |
| CRAIG [1] - 4285:20 |
| Craig [1] - 4302:20 |
| crash [2] - 4331:18, |
| 4341:18 |
| create [1] - 4429:17 |
| created [3] - 4294:10, 4347:12, 4459:20 |
| credit [1] - 4491:25 |
| Creek [2] - 4371:7, |
| 4371:16 |
| creeks [1] - 4441:3 |
| crew [1] - 4336:8 |
| criteria [2] - 4497:11, |
| 4497:18 |
| critical [3] - 4324:9, |
| 4358:19, 4447:20 |
| criticism [1] - 4420:12 |
| critiqued [1] - 4519:5 |
| crop [24] - 4437:11, |
| 4437:15, 4447:1, |
| 4447:4, 4452:24 TH |

4453:5, 4453:17, 4453:19, 4455:24, 4460:4, 4460:7, 4464:2, 4476:2, 4476:8, 4476:11, 4498:17, 4498:20, 4499:1. 4499:2. 4513:10, 4521:7, 4523:5, 4523:21 cropping [1] - 4452:24 crops [28] - 4439:8, 4440:6, 4442:14, 4442:16, 4444:12, 4444:20, 4444:21, 4444:22, 4445:24, 4446:6, 4454:15, 4454:20, 4454:22, 4459:19, 4461:3, 4461:17, 4472:25, 4473:16, 4499:21, 4501:16, 4509:9, 4521:8, 4521:16, 4524:24, 4542:4, 4542:14, 4542:16, 4542:23 Cross [1] - 4286:2 CROSS [2] - 4314:8, 4436:3 cross [17] - 4292:3, 4314:6, 4343:8, 4343:16, 4344:6, 4344:12, 4344:14, 4344:22, 4345:6, 4345:8, 4345:17, 4346:14, 4346:16, 4347:2, 4374:23, 4433:24, 4509:17 CROSS-**EXAMINATION** [2] -4314:8, 4436:3 cross-examination [15] - 4292:3, 4314:6, 4343:16, 4344:6, 4344:12, 4344:14, 4344:22, 4345:8, 4345:17, 4346:14, 4346:16, 4347:2, 4374:23, 4433:24, 4509:17 CRR [2] - 4285:14, 4549:15 cultural [1] - 4516:20 Curious [2] - 4352:6, 4353:8 current [3] - 4302:22, 4529:17, 4540:3 Current [1] - 4356:10 currents [1] - 4392:23 curve [5] - 4428:1, 4447:4, 4452:24 THE REPORTING GROUP 2, 4477:5,

4430:15, 4430:18 curves [2] - 4526:13 **cusp** [1] - 4379:13 cut [1] - 4452:16 cuts [1] - 4543:14 cutting [5] - 4464:13, 4472:5, 4473:22, 4503:19 cycle [1] - 4336:17 D DACS [3] - 4370:2, 4372:20, 4412:10 daily [1] - 4386:3

dangerous [1] -4544:21 Daniel [1] - 4506:20 **Dara** [1] - 4354:19 dash [2] - 4418:19, 4418:20 data [91] - 4316:17, 4316:19, 4316:20, 4316:22, 4316:25, 4322:2, 4326:11, 4332:4, 4334:19, 4335:12, 4335:16, 4352:6, 4352:13, 4352:14, 4352:16, 4353:3, 4353:21, 4353:22, 4353:23, 4354:25, 4355:2, 4355:4, 4355:7, 4355:9, 4355:11, 4355:13, 4356:1, 4356:3, 4356:22, 4357:3, 4357:4, 4357:7, 4357:9, 4357:10, 4358:5, 4382:1, 4382:10, 4383:2, 4385:13, 4385:14, 4385:16, 4385:17, 4385:18, 4385:21, 4386:5, 4386:6, 4386:18, 4387:12, 4387:21, 4388:18, 4388:20, 4389:9, 4393:22, 4393:23, 4393:24, 4393:25, 4397:3, 4401:25, 4412:11, 4423:25, 4424:2, 4428:9, 4428:14, 4428:17, 4428:21, 4429:8, 4459:25, 4461:22, 4463:2, 4464:22, 4464:24, 4465:4, 4465:12, 4465:14, 4465:19, 4474:17, 4474:25,

4521:23, 4525:3, 4526:6, 4526:7, 4526:16, 4544:5 **Data** [1] - 4357:15 databases [1] -4543:22 dataset [1] - 4352:14 date [1] - 4417:21 dated [5] - 4295:17, 4298:1, 4343:24, 4362:1, 4417:14 David [2] - 4349:25, 4361:19 day's [1] - 4395:19 days [3] - 4336:10, 4346:25, 4450:19 de [7] - 4515:8, 4515:15, 4515:17, 4516:3, 4519:11, 4540:22, 4540:24 dead [3] - 4331:20, 4332:2, 4393:3 deal [2] - 4351:3, 4529:25 **Deal** [3] - 4445:4, 4445:22, 4534:6 dealing [1] - 4309:22 deals [1] - 4377:7 debate [1] - 4523:24 **debates** [1] - 4532:16 decades [1] - 4380:14 December [9] -4285:13, 4295:17, 4301:5, 4345:22, 4348:16, 4348:18, 4349:22, 4488:15, 4549:11 decimate [2] -4408:17, 4408:18 decision [1] - 4424:11 Declaration [4] -4343:11, 4344:15, 4345:18, 4345:24 declaration [6] -4343:15, 4344:17, 4423:5, 4423:22, 4424:7, 4425:4 declarations [1] -4425:2 Declaratory [1] -4346:18 decline [11] - 4322:12, 4382:9, 4382:23, 4385:11, 4394:10, 4395:11, 4397:14, 4407:19, 4410:15, 4410:16, 4419:22

Mason & Lockhart.

declined [1] - 4546:11

| | • | T . | • | |
|---|--|--------------------------------------|---|--|
| declines [2] - 4407:15, | density [2] - 4331:20, | 4328:12, 4329:7, | 4497:2 | 4329:4, 4329:23, |
| 4420:7 | 4333:18 | 4412:25, 4413:2, | develops [1] - 4432:23 | 4330:16, 4330:21, |
| dedicated [1] - 4518:2 | denying [1] - 4291:15 | 4413:7 | Diagnosing [1] - | 4331:16, 4334:14, |
| deeper [1] - 4483:1 | department [1] - | describe [9] - | 4308:25 | 4335:14, 4336:25, |
| Defendants [1] - | 4540:7 | 4378:15, 4436:24, | diagnosing [1] - | 4337:5, 4337:15, |
| 4285:7 | Department [4] - | 4437:23, 4455:22, | 4366:20 | 4337:19, 4337:23, |
| deficit [13] - 4463:11, | 4331:25, 4332:24, | 4458:25, 4488:12, | die [5] - 4392:24, | 4338:17, 4339:12, |
| 4463:14, 4463:18, | 4333:10, 4544:6 | 4505:24, 4513:2, | 4404:10, 4411:23, | 4340:22, 4351:19, |
| 4463:21, 4463:23, | departments [1] - | 4540:2 | 4412:3, 4412:15 | 4351:20, 4352:18, 4352:25, 4353:10, |
| 4464:5, 4467:2, | 4511:16 | described [4] - 4353:22, 4416:17, | dies [1] - 4432:22 | 4354:6, 4354:8, |
| 4469:21, 4482:12, 4501:16, 4503:10 | departure [1] - 4472:14 | 4419:18, 4456:1 | difference [15] - 4406:25, 4410:7, | 4355:16, 4356:25, |
| 4501:16, 4503:10, 4513:11, 4522:25 | | describes [1] - | 4410:12, 4410:17, | 4358:3, 4358:16, |
| defined [3] - 4447:14, | dependent [16] - 4355:11, 4355:13, | 4374:25 | 4410:12, 4410:17, | 4358:25, 4359:23, |
| 4476:21, 4526:25 | 4355:17, 4356:1, | describing [1] - | 4431:18, 4441:24, | 4360:7, 4360:16, |
| defining [1] - 4508:5 | 4356:3, 4356:21, | 4400:22 | 4476:16, 4477:11, | 4360:21, 4361:8, |
| definitely [5] - | 4357:3, 4357:6, | description [1] - | 4477:17, 4479:16, | 4361:17, 4362:5, |
| 4380:21, 4397:15, | 4357:10, 4385:15, | 4333:5 | 4480:11, 4502:12, | 4363:18, 4364:15, |
| 4399:19, 4411:8, | 4385:21, 4386:4, | deserve [1] - 4424:23 | 4533:7 | 4365:7, 4365:22, |
| 4416:19 | 4386:6, 4393:23, | designated [13] - | differences [3] - | 4366:9, 4366:23, |
| definition [3] - 4406:6, | 4393:25, 4508:2 | 4306:25, 4307:3, | 4430:11, 4522:4, | 4367:2, 4367:14, |
| 4406:8, 4464:4 | depict [1] - 4507:22 | 4307:7, 4325:15, | 4523:18 | 4368:21, 4370:4, |
| definitive [1] - 4451:3 | depicted [1] - 4513:2 | 4329:17, 4339:23, | different [57] - | 4370:11, 4370:24, |
| degradation [1] - | depleted [1] - 4376:9 | 4356:9, 4361:18, | 4319:13, 4320:20, | 4371:15, 4372:19, |
| 4388:11 | depletion [1] - 4376:6 | 4365:11, 4366:18, | 4320:23, 4320:24, | 4380:18, 4380:25, |
| degree [2] - 4376:10, | deponent [1] - | 4369:17, 4370:18, | 4321:23, 4333:6, | 4381:1, 4385:23, |
| 4388:2 | 4350:23 | 4417:5 | 4333:17, 4335:10, | 4393:4, 4393:6, |
| degrees [1] - 4309:19 | deposition [50] - | designation [1] - | 4335:12, 4350:23, | 4396:2, 4406:4, 4409:5, 4409:14, |
| delayed [1] - 4292:3 | 4288:19, 4289:15, | 4307:5 | 4354:12, 4354:13, | 4409.5, 4409.14, 4421:2, 4425:12, |
| delta [1] - 4477:8 | 4290:5, 4290:19, | designations [11] - | 4368:15, 4382:3, | 4438:6, 4444:6, |
| deluge [1] - 4547:22 | 4302:12, 4302:22, | 4288:19, 4289:16, | 4384:23, 4387:3, | 4444:17, 4448:19, |
| demo [3] - 4498:4, | 4303:3, 4318:16, | 4290:5, 4290:8, 4202:7, 4202:11 | 4387:4, 4407:9, 4407:13, 4407:17, | 4452:13, 4473:17, |
| 4498:11, 4500:24 | 4318:24, 4319:9, | 4302:7, 4302:11, 4303:1, 4307:23, | 4411:2, 4416:6, | 4481:21, 4481:22, |
| demonstrate [1] - | 4319:22, 4322:17, | 4309:7, 4309:10, | 4416:7, 4416:10, | 4486:13, 4488:16, |
| 4538:19 | 4322:18, 4334:7, 4334:18, 4335:1, | 4349:15 | 4420:3, 4420:23, | 4490:5, 4498:1, |
| demonstrated [2] - | 4337:2, 4341:6, | desire [1] - 4545:6 | 4421:8, 4428:16, | 4500:23, 4501:10, |
| 4456:3, 4515:13 demonstrative [28] - | 4343:19, 4343:23, | detail [2] - 4409:6, | 4430:7, 4430:9, | 4505:3, 4519:16, |
| 4381:2, 4381:16, | 4347:8, 4347:13, | 4456:11 | 4430:13, 4442:3, | 4522:7, 4531:22, |
| 4385:24, 4386:2, | 4347:23, 4348:2, | details [1] - 4545:24 | 4442:9, 4442:13, | 4538:13 |
| 4389:3, 4390:5, | 4348:7, 4348:12, | detect [1] - 4396:11 | 4442:15, 4443:13, | DIRECT [2] - 4313:5, |
| 4391:16, 4393:7, | 4348:16, 4348:21, | determination [5] - | 4447:15, 4454:20, | 4435:8 |
| 4393:11, 4398:12, | 4349:2, 4349:6, | 4327:15, 4380:24, | 4454:21, 4457:10, | directly [8] - 4404:7, |
| 4398:13, 4400:19, | 4349:11, 4349:13, | 4420:1, 4422:11, | 4458:15, 4464:6, | 4425:3, 4425:10, |
| 4403:4, 4481:12, | 4349:14, 4349:16, | 4540:14 | 4464:8, 4466:10, | 4441:5, 4441:7, |
| 4481:21, 4507:11, | 4349:19, 4349:21, | determine [1] - | 4472:9, 4480:21, | 4457:5, 4515:16, |
| 4507:21, 4512:23, | 4349:25, 4363:5, | 4393:13 | 4495:24, 4495:25, | 4528:2 |
| 4513:3, 4515:20, | 4375:7, 4376:8, | determined [3] - | 4513:17, 4523:3, | Director [7] - 4469:4, |
| 4521:11, 4521:13, | 4441:12, 4448:21, | 4325:18, 4327:11, | 4526:7, 4528:25, | 4469:5, 4483:9, |
| 4524:15, 4526:23, | 4456:19, 4458:8, | 4422:25 | 4532:6, 4544:1 | 4483:11, 4483:21, 4487:21, 4490:6 |
| 4527:14, 4527:16, | 4464:23, 4465:8, | determines [1] - | difficult [3] - 4487:16, | disagree [7] - 4407:3, |
| 4528:20, 4531:20 | 4467:22, 4487:3, | 4430:23 | 4504:1, 4539:14 | 4414:12, 4420:20, |
| demonstratives [4] - | 4488:3, 4497:10 | develop [1] - 4489:14 | dip [2] - 4321:5, 4412:7 | 4422:17, 4423:7, |
| 4388:24, 4390:7, | depositions [1] - | developed [2] - | Direct [1] - 4286:2 | 4423:21, 4517:23 |
| 4398:11, 4507:7 | 4341:4 | 4488:6, 4511:8 | direct [88] - 4303:7, | disagreed [1] - |
| denominator [3] - | depth [5] - 4328:21, 4335:6, 4337:1, | developing [1] - | 4313:8, 4313:10, | 4423:23 |
| 4472:9, 4472:13, | 4337:9, 4547:6 | 4512:2 | 4313:13, 4314:14, | disagreement [1] - |
| 4474:4 | depths [1] - 4542:20 | Development [1] - 4496:23 | 4314:18, 4321:25, | 4491:6 |
| denominators [1] - 4474:3 | dermo [6] - 4325:7 TH] | 4496.23 E REPORTING G | ROUP :1, 4326:9, | disappear [1] - |
| 4414.3 | | TING G | I ' ' | |
| | M. M. | lason & Lockha | art | |

| | | T | T | 1 |
|---------------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 4518:19 | 4412:3, 4412:20, | 4301:7, 4301:15, | done [30] - 4291:11, | 4306:10, 4307:23, |
| disappointed [2] - | 4412:24, 4413:2, | 4301:24, 4304:2, | 4294:5, 4303:6, | 4308:2, 4308:7, |
| 4544:19, 4544:21 | 4413:8 | 4304:14, 4305:5, | 4331:24, 4333:14, | 4308:13, 4309:2, |
| Disaster [1] - 4298:1 | disease-related [1] - | 4305:12, 4305:19, | 4378:9, 4390:6, | 4311:2, 4311:3, |
| disaster [11] - 4298:3, | 4325:1 | 4305:24, 4306:16, | 4391:5, 4398:17, | 4312:1, 4312:7, |
| 4369:8, 4369:13, | disengaged [1] - | 4308:3, 4308:10, | 4399:16, 4405:1, | 4314:10, 4318:20, |
| 4369:14, 4423:1, | 4427:2 | 4308:20, 4310:16, | 4405:2, 4453:22, | 4328:3, 4329:9, |
| 4423:5, 4423:22, | disinterested [1] - | 4325:12, 4327:16, | 4461:15, 4465:1, | 4329:11, 4329:21, |
| 4424:12, 4425:2, | 4549:8 | 4327:22, 4329:8, | 4492:18, 4496:1, | 4332:3, 4337:10, |
| 4425:4, 4445:23 | dispense [1] - 4372:3 | 4329:12, 4329:14, | 4499:18, 4502:23, | 4339:12, 4342:23, |
| Discharge [1] - 4300:6 | display [1] - 4421:4 | 4329:18, 4329:20, | 4525:1, 4525:15, | 4344:12, 4345:6, |
| disclaimer [1] - | displayed [1] - 4367:5 | 4329:23, 4342:24, | 4536:13, 4536:14, | 4346:17, 4347:2, |
| 4417:18 | displaying [1] - | 4343:10, 4343:18, | 4536:25, 4539:15, | 4347:21, 4347:23, |
| discounting [1] - | 4419:17 | 4344:1, 4344:4, | 4539:16, 4539:17, | 4348:6, 4351:15, |
| 4478:16 | disproved [1] - 4424:3 | 4344:5, 4344:21, | 4545:25, 4548:12 | 4352:6, 4353:2, |
| discovered [1] - | disrupting [1] - | 4345:6, 4345:7, | dotted [1] - 4396:17 | 4353:8, 4353:22, |
| 4330:1 | 4516:19 | 4345:12, 4345:16, | double [1] - 4410:6 | 4354:19, 4361:19, |
| discovery [1] - | disruption [1] - | 4345:23, 4346:5, | double-take [1] - | 4361:20, 4361:25, |
| 4322:24 | 4516:20 | 4346:8, 4346:9, | 4410:6 | 4362:7, 4362:20, |
| discretionary [5] - | distance [1] - 4420:14 | 4346:15, 4346:22, | Douglas [1] - 4345:18 | 4363:2, 4363:5, |
| 4524:1, 4524:5, | distinguish [1] - | 4346:24, 4353:11, | Douglass [2] - | 4364:18, 4364:20, |
| 4524:7, 4524:14, | 4500:6 | 4356:8, 4359:6, | 4290:20, 4291:3 | 4365:12, 4365:15, |
| 4524:20 | distribute [1] - 4314:5 | 4365:10, 4366:22, | down [17] - 4326:18, | 4365:25, 4366:3, |
| discuss [4] - 4308:19, | distributed [1] - | 4369:17, 4370:18, | 4367:20, 4373:6, | 4366:12, 4367:25, |
| 4368:18, 4521:6, | 4474:2 | 4405:10, 4405:19, | 4395:20, 4397:12, | 4374:1, 4374:6, |
| 4523:7 | distributional [3] - | 4412:13, 4417:5, | 4405:4, 4406:16, | 4374:8, 4381:4, |
| discussed [12] - | 4471:19, 4473:14, | 4417:13, 4423:20, | 4441:19, 4442:17, | 4381:22, 4384:20, |
| 4294:15, 4294:21, | 4500:13 | 4438:8, 4438:9, | 4443:11, 4451:12, | 4384:21, 4387:10, |
| 4295:6, 4306:20, | District [7] - 4343:4, | 4438:13, 4438:14, 4438:21, 4440:14, | 4457:22, 4496:21, | 4397:2, 4397:3, |
| 4311:24, 4337:2, | 4344:17, 4345:3, | | 4502:16, 4522:2, | 4405:24, 4409:8, |
| 4359:3, 4455:2, | 4345:14, 4345:20, | 4445:21, 4448:11, 4449:1, 4449:12, | 4528:5, 4528:17 | 4409:11, 4409:14, 4409:18, 4410:1, |
| 4458:9, 4511:19, | 4346:5, 4346:21 | 4449:17, 4450:6, | downloaded [4] - | 4410:4, 4410:5, |
| 4520:19, 4523:14 | disturbance [1] - | 4452:22, 4456:7, | 4352:14, 4352:15, | 4412:22, 4413:23, |
| discusses [1] - 4305:8 | 4398:24 | 4457:1, 4468:23, | 4353:23, 4386:7 | 4413:24, 4414:8, |
| discussing [5] - | disturbances [2] - | 4472:15, 4483:14, | downstream [1] - | 4420:12, 4421:5, |
| 4301:18, 4308:11, | 4408:8, 4408:9 | 4484:1, 4484:22, | 4540:15 | 4422:10, 4427:15, |
| 4368:9, 4441:16, | dive [3] - 4320:6, | 4485:7, 4486:3, | Downstream [1] - | 4433:13, 4434:9, |
| 4499:4 | 4320:9, 4320:10 | 4494:8, 4496:13, | 4366:5 | 4434:24, 4435:10, |
| discussion [16] - | diverse [2] - 4404:2, | 4496:14, 4542:2 | dozens [2] - 4309:19, | 4436:5, 4436:21, |
| 4296:22, 4298:14, | 4427:17 | documentation [1] - | 4517:7 | 4437:6, 4437:14, |
| 4298:21, 4299:6, | divided [1] - 4394:5 | 4291:13 | dr [1] - 4515:18 | 4444:8, 4444:14, |
| 4299:23, 4304:24, | Division [4] - 4456:14, | documented [3] - | Dr [219] - 4290:20, | 4446:5, 4449:22, |
| 4305:14, 4305:20, 4306:17, 4367:6, | 4456:21, 4483:23, | 4368:3, 4408:10, | 4291:3, 4291:5, 4291:7, 4291:13, | 4452:11, 4453:21, |
| 4372:6, 4450:24, | 4497:7 | 4517:7 | 4293:6, 4293:9, | 4454:4, 4455:3, |
| 4372:6, 4450:24, 4456:18, 4458:8, | division [1] - 4482:13 | documents [22] - | 4293.6, 4293.9, 4294:2, 4295:2, | 4455:8, 4456:1, |
| 4468:19, 4523:25 | Docket [5] - 4343:5, | 4292:1, 4294:15, | 4294.2, 4295.2, | 4456:10, 4458:13, |
| Discussion [2] - | 4345:4, 4345:15, | 4294:17, 4294:20, | 4295:10, 4295:10, 4295:17, 4295:22, | 4459:6, 4461:18, |
| 4311:7, 4342:10 | 4345:21, 4346:7 | 4295:5, 4303:9, | 4296:4, 4296:6, | 4462:4, 4463:11, |
| discussions [4] - | docket [3] - 4343:14, | 4322:23, 4325:9, | 4296:16, 4297:12, | 4463:22, 4466:6, |
| 4321:10, 4321:15, | 4343:22, 4343:25 | 4336:3, 4342:18, | 4298:16, 4299:13, | 4466:23, 4469:23, |
| 4323:13, 4487:10 | doctor [1] - 4426:10 | 4343:8, 4347:7, | 4300:8, 4300:12, | 4475:4, 4477:2, |
| Discussions [1] - | document [96] - | 4358:10, 4358:14, | 4300:20, 4300:21, | 4477:12, 4479:8, |
| 4298:23 | 4295:15, 4296:8, | 4370:12, 4424:4, | 4301:4, 4301:12, | 4480:14, 4480:17, |
| Disease [1] - 4364:8 | 4296:17, 4296:18, | 4436:9, 4458:24, | 4302:2, 4302:8, | 4481:14, 4482:1, |
| disease [14] - 4325:1, | 4296:23, 4297:5, | 4484:3, 4484:4, | 4302:12, 4302:24, | 4483:9, 4483:11, |
| 4325:5, 4327:9, | 4297:12, 4297:18, | 4487:8, 4487:19 | 4303:3, 4303:24, | 4483:21, 4484:19, |
| 4327:11, 4329:7, | 4297:19, 4297:24, 4298:5, 4298:9, | dollars [6] - 4472:5, | 4303:25, 4304:7, | 4492:1, 4502:6, |
| 4329:13, 4382:8, | 4298:5, 4298:9, 4298:17. | 4476:23, 4499:20, | 4304:16, 4304:17, | 4502:7, 4502:24, |
| 4385:11, 4411:23, | 4298.19, 4299.17. 4299:21, 4300:1 TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP :23, 4304:25, | 4503:5, 4504:9, |
| , , , , , | , | • | 1 | 4504:19, 4505:8, |
| | N | Iason & Lockha | art | |

| | 1 | | I | |
|--|-------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|
| 4505:24, 4506:19, | Drought [4] - 4360:3, | 4310:7, 4310:13, | ecology [7] - 4312:9, | Edward [1] - 4308:22 |
| 4506:20, 4506:21, | 4364:9, 4366:4, | 4310:19, 4344:7, | 4323:25, 4377:3, | effect [5] - 4353:12, |
| 4509:16, 4509:21, | 4487:2 | 4344:9, 4361:16, | 4377:6, 4377:7, | 4405:25, 4407:7, |
| 4511:19, 4511:20, | drought-induced [1] - | 4361:19, 4361:24, | 4377:16, 4535:5 | 4510:16 |
| 4512:11, 4513:9, | 4363:20 | 4362:2, 4362:12, | econometrics [1] - | effective [14] - |
| 4513:17, 4514:5, | | 4363:7, 4365:14, | 4540:8 | |
| 4514:14, 4515:4, | droughts [1] - | 4369:20, 4370:19, | | 4398:23, 4399:7, |
| | 4487:17 | | economic [26] - | 4400:5, 4416:24, |
| 4516:10, 4516:12, 4516:23, 4517:12, | drove [1] - 4430:18 | 4370:24, 4371:6, | 4444:18, 4453:19, | 4419:9, 4419:14, |
| , | Drs [1] - 4409:3 | 4371:9 | 4458:10, 4458:13, | 4464:7, 4464:11, |
| 4518:10, 4518:24, | dry [15] - 4459:21, | e-mails [4] - 4301:4, | 4458:14, 4461:16, | 4466:8, 4467:7, |
| 4519:2, 4519:4, 4510:0, 4510:14 | 4460:3, 4460:7, | 4303:24, 4304:6, | 4463:6, 4466:25, | 4467:19, 4468:3, |
| 4519:9, 4519:14, | 4460:11, 4461:13, | 4304:22 | 4491:8, 4491:9, | 4523:2, 4543:14 |
| 4520:9, 4520:11, | 4465:2, 4465:17, | early [6] - 4317:15, | 4491:13, 4497:16, | effectively [2] - |
| 4522:25, 4523:12, | 4470:19, 4521:18, | 4317:24, 4327:11, | 4506:3, 4506:15, | 4381:22, 4487:9 |
| 4523:20, 4525:14, | 4522:9, 4529:8, | 4342:19, 4378:20, | 4507:2, 4508:21, | effectiveness [1] - |
| 4525:18, 4525:23, | 4529:9, 4530:20, | 4545:12 | 4509:3, 4510:10, | 4467:20 |
| 4526:16, 4527:9, | 4531:5, 4532:18 | ease [1] - 4478:17 | 4511:13, 4515:16, | effects [2] - 4327:8, |
| 4528:14, 4529:15, | Dry [1] - 4359:20 | easement [5] - 4470:3, | 4516:17, 4517:8, | 4330:19 |
| 4530:1, 4531:9, | dry-land [2] - 4470:19, | 4477:7, 4478:18, | 4524:4, 4528:10, | efficiency [2] - |
| 4531:13, 4531:23, | 4522:9 | 4478:23, 4482:16 | 4535:4 | 4355:22, 4394:8 |
| 4532:9, 4532:10, | due [9] - 4351:3, | easements [3] - | Economic [2] - | efficient [9] - 4328:3, |
| 4532:11, 4533:14, | 4360:17, 4361:11, | 4469:17, 4469:24, | 4488:14, 4488:22 | 4453:5, 4453:17, |
| 4534:24, 4535:18, | 4362:6, 4384:10, | 4474:7 | economical [1] - | 4453:19, 4454:2, |
| 4536:22, 4540:18, | 4396:24, 4411:1, | easier [3] - 4294:11, | 4464:12 | 4454:11, 4454:20, |
| 4540:25, 4541:2, | 4414:10, 4491:25 | 4294:18, 4486:17 | economically [3] - | 4454:22, 4506:8 |
| 4542:19, 4543:12, | dug [1] - 4526:16 | East [3] - 4319:18, | 4406:14, 4407:20, | effort [18] - 4355:18, |
| 4544:1, 4544:14 | DUNLAP [1] - 4285:23 | 4383:14, 4384:2 | 4468:5 | 4355:21, 4358:5, |
| drag [1] - 4450:13 | Dunlap [3] - 4292:9, | eastern [6] - 4323:25, | Economics [1] - | 4379:6, 4379:10, |
| dramatic [3] - | 4435:2, 4435:3 | 4324:3, 4363:22, | 4505:18 | 4379:17, 4379:22, |
| 4515:22, 4522:2, | During [1] - 4364:9 | 4378:22, 4379:2, | economics [20] - | 4379:24, 4380:1, |
| 4529:10 | during [35] - 4292:14, | 4380:7 | 4468:14, 4471:12, | 4389:16, 4394:3, |
| dramatically [1] - | 4292:16, 4293:24, | easy [1] - 4511:23 | 4491:23, 4505:4, | 4394:7, 4394:22, |
| 4394:23 | 4315:9, 4318:2, | eat [1] - 4336:19 | 4505:5, 4505:6, | 4395:4, 4395:14, |
| draw [2] - 4389:8, | 4318:7, 4319:12, | ECF [6] - 4343:5, | 4505:7, 4505:9, | 4396:22, 4433:15, |
| 4389:9 | 4320:5, 4320:12, | 4343:15, 4345:3, | 4506:2, 4510:7, | 4511:8 |
| drawing [1] - 4502:3 | 4322:24, 4341:18, | 4345:15, 4345:21, | 4510:9, 4510:20, | Effort [1] - 4357:15 |
| drawn [1] - 4465:4 | 4346:13, 4347:24, | 4346:6 | 4512:6, 4513:22, | efforts [2] - 4378:22, |
| dream [1] - 4495:16 | 4348:4, 4348:9, | ECHOLS [29] - | 4517:4, 4517:24, | 4379:9 |
| dredges [3] - 4414:18, | 4348:14, 4348:22, | 4285:21, 4312:2, | 4536:25, 4537:3, | egg [2] - 4432:21, |
| 4414:22, 4414:23 | 4349:3, 4349:8, | 4312:4, 4313:3, | 4537:6, 4540:7 | 4432:22 |
| drew [2] - 4501:24 | 4349:12, 4350:2, | 4313:6, 4313:17, | economies [1] - | eggs [5] - 4336:16, |
| driest [1] - 4530:21 | 4368:5, 4390:15, | 4313:20, 4342:5, | 4529:21 | 4432:11, 4432:15, |
| drill [3] - 4334:11, | 4391:9, 4398:18, | 4353:1, 4360:20, | economist [9] - | 4542:9, 4542:12 |
| 4372:13, 4373:24 | 4401:17, 4403:1, | 4371:25, 4372:2, | 4470:25, 4471:10, | egregious [2] - |
| drills [3] - 4373:1, | 4412:20, 4419:23, | 4388:23, 4389:1, | 4471:11, 4491:4, | 4518:6, 4538:5 |
| 4373:17, 4373:21 | 4441:12, 4458:8, | 4393:6, 4393:8, | 4505:25, 4525:7, | eight [2] - 4401:3, |
| driven [1] - 4525:13 | 4487:3, 4497:10, | 4398:10, 4398:14, | 4533:12, 4540:4, | 4505:23 |
| drop [5] - 4394:14, | 4504:3, 4504:14 | 4400:18, 4400:20, | 4540:9 | either [12] - 4341:4, |
| 4395:3, 4522:6 | dynamic [1] - 4407:12 | 4402:8, 4402:12, | economists [3] - | 4383:8, 4399:2, |
| dropped [1] - 4394:12 | • | 4403:3, 4405:4, | 4526:1, 4534:15, | 4419:23, 4472:4, |
| drops [2] - 4521:22, | E | 4405:5, 4414:4, | 4536:19 | 4486:20, 4487:15, |
| 4521:25 | | 4423:15, 4423:18, | ecosystem [1] - | 4491:11, 4523:17, |
| drought [15] - 4288:7, | e-mail [35] - 4295:10, | 4433:7 | 4407:11 | 4524:20, 4545:16, |
| 4363:20, 4368:5, | 4295:16, 4295:24, | Echols [2] - 4311:23, | Ecosystems [1] - | 4546:3 |
| 4408:19, 4410:9, | 4300:20, 4300:23, | 4312:4 | 4365:4 | electronically [1] - |
| 4412:6, 4412:20, | 4300:24, 4301:6, | ecological [3] - | editor [1] - 4546:16 | 4350:9 |
| 4460:15, 4460:16, | 4301:7, 4301:12, | 4511:21, 4512:4, | education [2] - | element [2] - 4412:20, |
| 4460:17, 4487:9, | 4304:9, 4304:15, | 4517:9 | 4295:2, 4472:5 | 4413:9 |
| 4487:12, 4503:20, | 4304:25, 4306:9, | ecologies [1] - | educational [1] - | elements [3] - |
| 4504:4, 4530:10 | 4308:1, 4308:7, THI | _ | ROUP :23 | 4377:12, 4389:12, |
| , | 4308:13, 4308:1 | L INDICINITING G. | ı | ,, |
| | M | lason & Lockha | rt | |

| 4397:15 | engineering [1] - | 4474:21, 4481:1 | Estuarine [1] - 4366:5 | 4344:6. 4344:12. |
|--|--|---|--|---|
| Elena [8] - 4391:7, | 4495:1 | Equitable [1] - | estuary [2] - 4363:21, | 4344:14, 4344:22, |
| 4398:2, 4398:21, | Engineers [3] - | 4346:10 | 4407:12 | 4345:8, 4345:17, |
| 4398:25, 4399:17, | 4343:3, 4343:21, | equitable [1] - | evaluate [3] - 4416:6, | 4346:14, 4346:16, |
| 4400:4, 4400:17, | 4346:4 | 4506:17 | 4420:23, 4494:2 | 4347:2, 4347:25, |
| 4401:1 | enjoyed [2] - 4321:3, | equivalent [1] - | evaluated [4] - | 4348:4, 4348:9, |
| Elevated [1] - 4360:3 | 4436:1 | 4466:16 | 4351:19, 4409:2, | 4348:14, 4348:23, |
| eliminate [7] - 4467:2, | ensure [2] - 4401:10, | Eric [1] - 4301:12 | 4455:20, 4479:8 | 4349:4, 4349:8, |
| 4492:9, 4521:8, | 4417:19 | error [4] - 4301:16, | evaluates [2] - | 4350:2, 4374:23, |
| 4538:23, 4542:21, | enters [1] - 4326:19 | 4518:6, 4538:5, | 4481:14, 4489:21 | 4433:24, 4462:7, |
| 4542:24, 4543:5 | entire [8] - 4307:7, | 4544:4 | evaluating [1] - | 4509:17 |
| eliminated [3] - | 4336:17, 4363:22, | errors [1] - 4526:11 | 4491:19 | examine [4] - 4389:13, |
| 4327:12, 4329:13, | 4387:15, 4445:17, | especially [1] - | evaluation [1] - | 4394:17, 4486:22, |
| 4427:20 | 4450:13, 4471:22, | 4397:11 | 4353:8 | 4506:15 |
| eliminating [3] - | 4517:3 | espousing [1] - | evaporation [5] - | examined [2] - |
| 4463:25, 4492:7, | entirely [2] - 4374:13, | 4537:16 | 4450:20, 4451:13, | 4316:21, 4355:6 |
| 4514:17 | 4464:13 | ESQ [10] - 4285:17, | 4451:17, 4451:20, | examining [1] - |
| Elliott [2] - 4289:4, | entirety [6] - 4322:20, | 4285:17, 4285:18, | 4452:17 | 4485:2 |
| 4289:7 | 4338:20, 4340:8, | 4285:18, 4285:20, | event [1] - 4549:8 | example [8] - 4324:15, |
| ELLIOTT [1] - 4289:5 | 4367:1, 4419:22, | 4285:20, 4285:21, | events [2] - 4324:13, | 4398:23, 4457:11, |
| Ellis [3] - 4293:23, | 4541:5 | 4285:21, 4285:22, | 4324:16 | 4460:6, 4501:13, 4508:14, 4518:4, |
| 4302:18, 4312:5 | entities [2] - 4505:10, | 4285:23 | evidence [29] - | 4521:18 |
| elsewhere [1] - 4489:6 embodied [1] - | 4505:11 | essential [2] - 4289:8, 4401:11 | 4291:20, 4315:1, | examples [1] - 4430:4 |
| 4358:17 | entitled [9] - 4285:10, 4354:19, 4356:10, | essentially [9] - | 4315:7, 4315:15, 4315:24, 4330:22, | exceeds [1] - 4441:25 |
| Emeritus [1] - 4540:5 | 4357:14, 4360:3, | 4444:7, 4466:16, | 4334:5, 4334:15, | except [3] - 4309:17, |
| EMILY [1] - 4285:20 | 4360:12, 4366:3, | 4476:24, 4478:15, | 4335:8, 4335:10, | 4380:1, 4446:17 |
| Emily [2] - 4291:8, | 4366:19, 4418:17 | 4485:19, 4489:19, | 4338:25, 4360:8, | exceptionally [1] - |
| 4293:22 | entity [2] - 4416:23, | 4508:1, 4535:22, | 4360:17, 4361:11, | 4525:9 |
| emphasize [1] - | 4466:21 | 4536:5 | 4362:6, 4363:14, | excerpt [3] - 4336:5, |
| 4289:11 | entrance [1] - 4375:24 | established [4] - | 4365:23, 4366:10, | 4337:6, 4337:24 |
| empirical [4] - | environment [5] - | 4342:20, 4401:10, | 4367:15, 4368:22, | excerpts [19] - 4294:3, |
| 4478:12, 4521:20, | 4336:18, 4377:9, | 4490:24, 4494:10 | 4370:5, 4382:1, | 4294:20, 4302:21, |
| 4521:22, 4525:3 | 4377:11, 4377:12, | estate [2] - 4479:15, | 4411:10, 4414:9, | 4325:10, 4347:9, |
| empirically [1] - | 4411:1 | 4480:11 | 4414:10, 4417:21, | 4347:22, 4348:1, |
| 4499:15 | environmental [18] - | Estate [1] - 4480:6 | 4433:5, 4525:24, | 4348:6, 4348:11, |
| employ [1] - 4502:15 | 4296:5, 4375:20, | estimate [16] - 4342:4, | 4526:17 | 4348:15, 4348:20, |
| employees [3] - | 4384:23, 4408:8, | 4358:9, 4470:6, | evolution [1] - | 4348:25, 4349:5, |
| 4508:8, 4508:17, | 4466:25, 4505:3, | 4475:4, 4481:17, | 4432:12 | 4349:10, 4349:15, 4349:20, 4349:24, |
| 4508:20 | 4505:5, 4506:2, | 4484:7, 4511:25, 4516:17, 4518:12, | evolved [2] - 4412:5, 4413:6 | 4350:3, 4350:7 |
| employment [2] - | 4506:3, 4510:8, 4510:24, 4516:11, | 4518:25, 4523:8, | exact [2] - 4320:4, | excess [1] - 4371:1 |
| 4528:5, 4529:22 | 4517:3, 4517:24, | 4510.25, 4525.6, 4523:9, 4526:9, | 4447:19 | excessive [1] - |
| empty [3] - 4441:3, 4441:5, 4441:6 | 4537:2, 4537:5, | 4540:17, 4542:24, | exactly [13] - 4326:23, | 4463:25 |
| enacted [1] - 4489:15 | 4537:25, 4540:8 | 4543:13 | 4358:22, 4373:25, | exchange [3] - |
| end [4] - 4372:24, | Environmental [8] - | estimated [6] - | 4384:17, 4399:21, | 4304:16, 4308:1, |
| 4402:9, 4457:19, | 4456:13, 4456:21, | 4503:17, 4513:9, | 4403:18, 4423:19, | 4361:19 |
| 4457:22 | 4483:23, 4488:13, | 4513:15, 4519:5, | 4426:19, 4444:13, | exclusively [1] - |
| Endangered [1] - | 4505:14, 4505:18, | 4519:8, 4520:9 | 4469:5, 4485:25, | 4509:1 |
| 4346:1 | 4505:19, 4511:11 | estimates [5] - | 4493:6, 4499:9 | excuse [4] - 4306:5, |
| endangered [1] - | Environmentally [1] - | 4484:19, 4514:12, | exam [1] - 4438:4 | 4307:2, 4311:3, |
| 4483:18 | 4458:17 | 4514:13, 4514:15, | EXAMINATION [9] - | 4410:2 |
| enforce [3] - 4491:16, | EPA [2] - 4489:20, | 4515:10 | 4313:5, 4314:8, | Executive [2] - |
| 4492:10, 4494:3 | 4505:16 | estimating [3] - | 4372:1, 4414:6, | 4378:25, 4539:2 |
| enforcement [3] - | EPD [3] - 4457:12, | 4475:3, 4480:18, | 4423:17, 4435:8, | exercise [1] - 4497:21 |
| 4419:13, 4493:14, | 4484:7, 4484:22 | 4512:3 | 4436:3, 4504:17, | exert [1] - 4407:7 |
| 4495:4 | equal [2] - 4395:3, 4463:7 | Estimating [2] - | 4530:3 | exerted [1] - 4394:3 |
| enforcing [1] - | equipment [4] - | 4479:13, 4480:9 estuarine [1] - | examination [25] - 4292:3, 4313:25, | exhibit [16] - 4292:2, 4292:18, 4303:17, |
| 4493:15 | 4313:19, 4474:1 TH | - · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | ROUP :6, 4343:16, | 4303:19, 4307:25, |
| engaged [1] - 4485:2 | .5.55, 4.1 | L KLICKLING G. | I | .555.10, 1007.20, |
| • | | | i i | |

| 4200.6 4242.20 | 4046.0 4046.45 | 4207:40 | Factual w 4245.0 | 4454.0 4454.04 |
|--|--|-------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|
| 4308:6, 4342:20, | 4316:8, 4316:15, | 4397:19 | Factual [1] - 4345:9 | 4451:9, 4451:24, |
| 4347:14, 4347:19, | 4544:10 | exploited [1] - 4378:3 | faculty [2] - 4536:17, | 4452:23, 4453:3, |
| 4348:25, 4350:10, | expert [34] - 4290:21, | explore [1] - 4484:24 | 4537:13 | 4453:22, 4468:4, |
| 4350:13, 4351:2, | 4293:7, 4312:7, | extend [2] - 4435:22, | fair [9] - 4443:3, | 4468:10, 4471:6, |
| 4390:10, 4461:8, | 4316:4, 4316:6, | 4509:11 | 4446:19, 4447:10, | 4471:15, 4471:23, |
| 4462:12 | 4317:3, 4317:4, | Extending [1] - 4346:9 | 4465:8, 4470:17, | 4471:25, 4472:6, |
| Exhibit [23] - 4295:15, | 4317:9, 4318:12, | Extension [4] - | 4471:18, 4476:11, | 4472:10, 4473:21, |
| 4295:21, 4296:2, | 4319:3, 4321:16, | 4436:22, 4436:25, | 4516:3, 4518:5 | 4474:1, 4484:8, |
| 4296:12, 4297:24, | 4328:8, 4330:13, | 4437:7, 4438:12 | fairly [3] - 4374:18, | 4484:20, 4494:21, |
| 4298:15, 4299:13, | 4335:2, 4337:8, | extensive [1] - 4424:2 | 4391:9, 4432:8 | 4498:17, 4498:24, |
| 4300:4, 4300:19, | 4337:13, 4338:14, | extensively [1] - | fall [3] - 4308:14, | 4499:21, 4500:3, |
| 4301:3, 4301:11, | 4340:25, 4341:3, | 4378:11 | 4422:3, 4547:21 | 4500:12, 4525:20, |
| 4301:19, 4301:24, | 4356:15, 4366:22, | extent [6] - 4350:23, | falloff [1] - 4525:10 | 4525:25, 4526:18, |
| 4308:12, 4347:20, | 4373:25, 4374:1, | 4399:18, 4402:25, | falls [1] - 4427:7 | 4527:6 |
| 4348:5, 4348:15, | 4374:6, 4381:5, | 4429:4, 4508:21, | false [2] - 4414:8, | farming [7] - 4437:4, |
| 4457:3, 4482:22, | 4409:2, 4430:25, | 4525:16 | 4414:14 | 4440:5, 4470:16, |
| 4485:12, 4488:10, | 4438:7, 4455:10, | extracted [2] - 4391:2, | familiar [38] - 4288:9, | 4473:8, 4494:18, |
| 4496:10 | 4502:1, 4506:24, | 4397:10 | 4305:5, 4325:12, | 4499:14, 4522:9 |
| EXHIBITS [2] - 4286:7, | 4512:6, 4541:4, | extracting [2] - | 4328:17, 4328:19, | farmland [6] - |
| 4287:1 | 4541:6 | 4391:14, 4398:5 | 4328:21, 4334:7, | 4474:11, 4474:13, |
| exhibits [10] - | expertise [4] - | extraction [2] - | 4334:9, 4353:16, | 4474:19, 4474:20, |
| 4291:23, 4310:10, | 4449:25, 4491:17, | 4389:22, 4397:16 | 4354:22, 4356:13, | 4475:18, 4543:18 |
| 4322:23, 4342:14, | 4491:19, 4540:7 | extraordinary [1] - | 4358:14, 4361:21, | farms [7] - 4476:21, |
| 4342:15, 4347:12, | experts [15] - 4290:21, | 4547:7 | 4362:7, 4364:14, | 4476:25, 4477:3, |
| 4350:8, 4350:18, | 4309:19, 4335:16, | extreme [2] - 4325:2, | 4364:16, 4367:11, | 4477:9, 4479:3, |
| 4351:6, 4398:16 | 4409:10, 4487:13, | 4430:21 | 4367:13, 4369:1, | 4524:21 |
| exist [1] - 4511:15 | 4487:15, 4501:24, 4512:8, 4514:10, | extremely [2] - | 4369:4, 4369:9, | fast [1] - 4486:15 |
| existence [1] - 4436:23 | 4514:11, 4514:12, | 4479:3, 4529:9 | 4405:10, 4409:21, | fault [1] - 4507:19 |
| | 4514:11, 4514:12, 4515:13, 4531:14, | | 4409:22, 4422:14, | favored [1] - 4430:1 |
| existing [4] - 4424:4, | 4532:6, 4540:20 | F | 4426:14, 4436:21, | favoring [1] - 4431:6 |
| 4446:6, 4489:15, | Expires [1] - 4549:17 | face [2] - 4446:23, | 4437:18, 4440:4, | FAWAL [4] - 4350:15, |
| 4520:14 | explain [28] - 4323:1, | 4454:1 | 4450:8, 4450:11, | 4350:20, 4351:5, |
| expect [13] - 4331:20, 4331:23, 4332:1, | 4353:2, 4375:4, | fact [32] - 4326:8, | 4452:3, 4452:4, | 4351:8 |
| 4331.23, 4352.1, | 4375:8, 4375:18, | 4338:5, 4341:3, | 4458:16, 4482:5, | FDACS [3] - 4333:14, |
| 4403:14, 4403:15, | 4377:5, 4377:25, | 4356:15, 4358:16, | 4487:4, 4487:6, | 4382:10, 4385:19 |
| 4411:3, 4411:5, | 4380:23, 4381:14, | 4359:2, 4369:13, | 4490:13 | feasibility [2] - 4485:3, 4522:23 |
| 4431:9, 4431:14, | 4384:5, 4386:9, | 4374:18, 4375:23, | far [12] - 4293:10, | |
| 4431:15, 4431:16 | 4390:12, 4391:21, | 4376:5, 4378:25, | 4326:24, 4357:6, 4372:10, 4374:15, | feasible [8] - 4463:10, 4464:14, 4464:18, |
| expected [6] - | 4393:19, 4396:3, | 4384:14, 4385:4, | 4408:19, 4427:4, | 4467:11, 4522:20, |
| 4332:15, 4382:21, | 4398:19, 4402:21, | 4392:9, 4395:12, | 4448:4, 4482:14, | 4543:7, 4543:9, |
| 4382:22, 4384:9, | 4406:24, 4409:24, | 4401:13, 4403:20, | 4535:24 | 4543:12 |
| 4411:7, 4411:10 | 4423:20, 4487:8, | 4403:22, 4407:3, | Farm [5] - 4461:21, | February [9] - |
| expenditures [1] - | 4503:2, 4504:23, | 4420:22, 4432:18, | 4462:14, 4462:19, | 4343:24, 4348:2, |
| 4517:19 | 4510:4, 4520:16, | 4443:20, 4452:11, | 4495:8, 4495:10 | 4348:20, 4349:16, |
| experience [10] - | 4522:24, 4524:17, | 4452:12, 4473:16, | farm [15] - 4440:1, | 4481:20, 4482:4, |
| 4321:22, 4407:21, | 4527:10 | 4481:4, 4487:16, | 4440:2, 4450:20, | 4482:6, 4501:9, |
| 4424:25, 4430:10, | explained [4] - | 4498:19, 4525:25, | 4450:25, 4451:10, | 4506:24 |
| 4439:13, 4439:14, | 4335:13, 4355:21, | 4539:18, 4542:19, | 4451:19, 4452:1, | fecund [1] - 4400:8 |
| 4478:12, 4493:14, | 4358:16, 4375:6 | 4545:12 | 4452:14, 4452:17, | federal [16] - 4322:3, |
| 4495:4, 4511:1 | explaining [1] - | factor [6] - 4330:9, | 4461:23, 4461:24, | 4369:8, 4369:13, |
| experienced [1] - | 4518:2 | 4330:12, 4331:14, | 4494:21, 4521:19, | 4379:7, 4379:16, |
| 4378:13 | explains [1] - 4368:3 | 4384:22, 4418:24, | 4544:5, 4544:11 | 4471:17, 4498:11, |
| experiences [2] - | explicitly [1] - 4535:7 | 4502:13 | Farmers [1] - 4288:9 | 4498:16, 4498:25, |
| 4411:1, 4436:2 | exploit [1] - 4397:4 | factors [10] - 4330:7, | farmers [37] - | 4499:7, 4499:13, |
| experimental [6] - | exploitation [9] - | 4356:4, 4356:5, | 4439:25, 4440:8, | 4499:21, 4500:5, |
| 4461:22, 4461:24, | 4395:25, 4396:4, | 4377:13, 4377:14, | 4444:19, 4444:21, | 4500:16, 4510:25, |
| 4521:19, 4521:23, | 4396:15, 4396:19, | 4407:10, 4407:13, | 4445:23, 4446:10, | 4511:15 |
| 4544:5, 4544:11 | 4397:1, 4397:4, | 4415:25, 4422:25, | 4446:13, 4446:18, | feeding [1] - 4368:12 |
| experiments [3] - | 4397:5, 4397:8, _{THI} | • ALAA 7 E REPORTING G | ROUP :19, 4448:15, | fellows [1] - 4321:3 |
| | | • | 1 | |
| 1 | 1./ | Isean & Iackha | rt | 1 |

| | 1 | 1 | | _ |
|---------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|
| felt [3] - 4358:8, | 4304:10, 4305:8, | 4371:2, 4376:9, | 4480:13, 4527:25 | 4344:23, 4345:3, |
| 4384:21, 4413:8 | 4305:13, 4309:4, | 4377:24, 4378:1, | five-week [1] - 4442:7 | 4345:10, 4345:15, |
| female [3] - 4431:24, | 4311:7, 4329:11, | 4378:2, 4378:7, | FL-ACF-02427204 [1] | 4345:20, 4346:3, |
| 4432:7, 4432:22 | 4332:4, 4346:24, | 4378:13, 4378:17, | - 4347:6 | 4346:19, 4346:21, |
| females [2] - 4432:25, | 4347:20, 4358:1, | 4378:19, 4381:12, | FL-ACF-03638114 [1] | 4350:9, 4354:21, |
| 4433:2 | 4359:9, 4367:7, | 4382:10, 4385:15, | - 4344:19 | 4369:12, 4371:10, |
| fertilize [2] - 4432:15, | 4369:21, 4390:16, | 4385:16, 4385:17, | FL-ACF-03638141 [1] | 4372:25, 4373:9, |
| 4432:21 | 4401:1, 4410:3, | 4385:21, 4386:4, | - 4344:20 | 4374:7, 4375:6, |
| few [13] - 4288:20, | 4416:11, 4416:12, | 4386:6, 4386:18, | FL-ACF-03671820 [1] | 4380:8, 4381:5, |
| 4290:16, 4291:14, | 4417:17, 4417:25, | 4388:4, 4391:6, | - 4344:10 | 4389:5, 4398:1, |
| 4292:1, 4336:10, | 4425:13, 4432:5, | 4393:14, 4393:22, | FL-ACF-03671829 [1] | 4398:17, 4399:7, |
| 4376:11, 4376:13, | 4438:4, 4442:25, | 4393:23, 4393:25, | - 4344:11 | 4399:18, 4400:16, |
| 4376:15, 4436:9, | 4443:1, 4443:25, | 4394:3, 4394:16, | flag [6] - 4296:9, | 4405:8, 4405:17, |
| 4447:12, 4499:4, | 4450:15, 4453:2, | 4396:5, 4396:8, | 4296:23, 4298:4, | 4407:2, 4410:11, |
| 4545:17, 4545:24 | 4453:8, 4453:9, | 4396:13, 4396:20, | 4299:9, 4299:18, | 4411:16, 4412:13, |
| fewer [2] - 4383:23, | 4462:15, 4462:16, | 4396:24, 4397:21, | 4299:23 | 4412:24, 4414:22, |
| 4395:21 | 4469:1, 4475:17, | 4399:1, 4399:5, | flagged [1] - 4294:20 | 4416:22, 4418:3, |
| fiction [1] - 4336:15 | 4475:25, 4479:12, | 4399:15, 4401:25, | flat [1] - 4376:13 | 4418:10, 4418:11, |
| field [8] - 4316:8, | 4481:17, 4482:24, | 4406:14, 4407:24, | flaws [1] - 4409:7 | 4418:19, 4419:3, |
| 4316:18, 4323:4, | 4489:8, 4491:4, | 4407:25, 4408:21, | Flint [27] - 4346:12, | 4419:6, 4419:8, |
| 4355:10, 4376:12, | 4496:17, 4509:9, | 4408:22, 4411:24, | 4438:18, 4439:16, | 4424:5, 4429:23, |
| 4505:25, 4506:1, | 4512:17, 4513:7, | 4412:11, 4412:15, | 4439:25, 4440:6, | 4437:20, 4438:15, |
| 4510:18 | 4524:11, 4527:22, | 4414:2, 4422:11, | 4440:18, 4440:22, | 4438:18, 4438:25, |
| figure [7] - 4409:17, | 4535:7, 4535:13, | 4422:25, 4423:9, 4425:4 | 4440:25, 4441:2, | 4475:22, 4491:6, |
| 4421:8, 4471:3, | 4545:17 | | 4441:4, 4441:20, | 4492:12, 4495:12, |
| 4519:7, 4530:7, | fiscal [1] - 4519:22 | Fishery [4] - 4308:24, | 4447:9, 4456:17, | 4512:5, 4512:18, 4514:6, 4514:10, |
| 4530:12, 4543:22 | Fisch [1] - 4300:8 | 4359:10, 4369:2, 4393:24 | 4459:13, 4467:24, | 4514:12, 4515:4, |
| filed [8] - 4343:25, | fish [2] - 4377:19, 4427:19 | fishery-dependent | 4472:1, 4472:10, | 4515:11, 4517:13, |
| 4345:1, 4345:13, | Fish [5] - 4297:25, | [15] - 4355:11, | 4473:18, 4474:5, | 4517:19, 4527:21, |
| 4345:21, 4346:2, | 4346:19, 4347:4, | 4355:13, 4355:17, | 4484:9, 4484:20, | 4528:1, 4528:4, |
| 4346:5, 4346:22, 4495:11 | 4371:10, 4416:23 | 4356:1, 4356:3, | 4487:2, 4489:6, | 4528:7, 4528:13, |
| final [4] - 4302:1, | fished [6] - 4382:12, | 4356:21, 4357:3, | 4497:12, 4531:2, 4543:17 | 4528:17, 4528:24, |
| 4309:9, 4309:11, | 4382:15, 4383:3, | 4357:6, 4357:10, | Flint-Ochlockonee [1] | 4529:7, 4529:13, |
| 4434:9 | 4383:4, 4384:13, | 4385:15, 4385:21, | - 4459:13 | 4529:20, 4529:25, |
| finalize [1] - 4350:12 | 4420:8 | 4386:4, 4386:6, | flip [2] - 4376:21, | 4531:1, 4531:14, |
| finally [6] - 4291:22, | Fisheries [4] - 4300:7, | 4393:23, 4393:25 | 4507:8 | 4533:23, 4535:5, |
| 4310:21, 4411:14, | 4300:11, 4356:10, | fishery-independent | flipped [2] - 4341:19, | 4540:19, 4546:22 |
| 4413:22, 4528:8, | 4369:5 | [8] - 4356:22, 4357:4, | 4479:23 | Florida's [13] - 4299:4, |
| 4548:3 | fisheries [11] - 4312:8, | 4357:9, 4382:10, | flood [1] - 4533:1 | 4307:4, 4311:4, |
| financial [3] - | 4333:16, 4370:14, | 4385:16, 4385:17, | floodplain [1] - | 4342:25, 4343:12, |
| 4498:16, 4513:19, | 4377:21, 4388:6, | 4386:18, 4401:25 | 4541:24 | 4345:25, 4372:5, |
| 4534:19 | 4390:24, 4395:10, | Fishery-independent | FLORIDA [1] - 4285:3 | 4373:25, 4382:11, |
| findings [3] - 4327:24, | 4399:20, 4403:10, | [1] - 4393:24 | Florida [109] - | 4419:13, 4448:14, |
| 4328:1, 4422:14 | 4404:1, 4407:22 | fishery-wide [3] - | 4285:17, 4289:3, | 4512:8, 4532:6 |
| fine [2] - 4292:11, | fishermen [1] - | 4407:24, 4408:21, | 4289:19, 4290:2, | Florida-low [1] - |
| 4405:3 | 4320:18 | 4408:22 | 4291:6, 4294:4, | 4419:3 |
| finish [4] - 4288:24, | fishers [2] - 4394:21, | Fishing [1] - 4418:18 | 4294:6, 4295:4, | Floridan [1] - 4484:8 |
| 4293:3, 4339:14, | 4425:7 | fishing [17] - 4333:7, | 4296:5, 4297:25, | flow [43] - 4315:22, 4324:9, 4325:25, |
| 4433:15 | fishery [70] - 4294:6, | 4355:22, 4355:23, | 4300:7, 4302:3, | 4324.9, 4325.25, 4326:8, |
| finished [2] - 4288:18, | 4314:25, 4315:23, | 4389:13, 4389:14, | 4302:23, 4305:6, | 4326:25, 4351:18, |
| 4544:25 | 4321:13, 4322:8, | 4394:2, 4394:6, 4394:7, 4394:22, | 4307:6, 4309:10, | 4351:22, 4354:3, |
| finishing [1] - 4545:12 | 4323:10, 4355:11, 4355:13, 4355:17, | 4394:25, 4395:14, | 4310:18, 4310:23, | 4354:11, 4360:9, |
| first [62] - 4288:25, | 4356:1, 4356:3, | 4395:19, 4424:13, | 4317:17, 4322:3, | 4363:15, 4365:24, |
| 4290:17, 4291:24, | 4356:21, 4356:22, | 4424:18 | 4322:7, 4322:11, | 4366:11, 4367:16, |
| 4295:1, 4295:6, | 4357:3, 4357:4, | five [9] - 4292:23, | 4331:6, 4331:11, | 4368:11, 4368:19, |
| 4295:23, 4296:15, | 4357:6, 4357:9, | 4384:13, 4433:21, | 4331:25, 4332:4, 4332:10, 4332:24, | 4368:23, 4370:6, |
| 4296:18, 4297:7, 4298:16, 4299:13, | 4357:10, 4363:23, | 4442:7, 4443:2, | 4332:10, 4332:24, | 4382:3, 4382:6, |
| 4300:24, 4304:1, | 4366:20, 4369:9 _{TH} | | - | 4384:11, 4385:10, |
| 1000.27, 100 1 .1, | 1 17 | L IVELOIVIING G. | I | 4386:3, 4386:14, |
| | 7. 7. | r 1 - 1 | - | 1 |

| 4386:17, 4386:20, | 4494:20 | 4528:3 | 4438:22, 4439:3, | 4350:7, 4413:17, |
|-----------------------------|---|--|-----------------------------|------------------------------|
| 4386:23, 4387:4, | | fundamental [1] - | 4439:6 | 4429:23, 4433:12, |
| , , | force's [1] - 4492:21 | • • | 4439.6 | |
| 4387:6, 4387:8, | forcing [2] - 4444:19, | 4492:15 | | 4434:8, 4438:11, |
| 4387:14, 4387:19, | 4444:21 | fundamentally [1] - | G | 4438:17, 4438:25, |
| 4408:14, 4410:19, | foregoing [1] - 4549:4 | 4407:17 | Gage [6] - 4326:12, | 4445:4, 4446:20, |
| 4410:20, 4440:22, | foregone [1] - 4475:5 | fundamentals [1] - | 4326:14, 4326:21, | 4450:9, 4450:23, |
| 4441:10, 4502:16, | forgive [1] - 4533:6 | 4506:16 | 4352:16, 4386:19, | 4455:10, 4458:19, |
| 4529:13, 4531:15, | form [1] - 4428:23 | funded [1] - 4425:5 | 4531:24 | 4459:20, 4468:18, |
| 4531:24, 4532:4 | formerly [1] - 4377:23 | funds [2] - 4369:8, | gage [2] - 4326:14, | 4470:21, 4472:21, |
| flowing [3] - 4441:19, | forming [1] - 4358:11 | 4369:13 | 4440:21 | 4473:1, 4475:22, |
| 4528:24, 4540:15 | forth [4] - 4442:17, | future [1] - 4405:14 | | 4476:1, 4478:13, |
| flows [17] - 4315:2, | 4452:21, 4461:8, | Future [2] - 4297:15, | gained [2] - 4540:14, | 4479:7, 4479:14, |
| 4325:18, 4380:18, | 4537:23 | 4356:10 | 4540:16 | 4484:7, 4484:21, |
| 4380:20, 4381:11, | forthcoming [1] - | FWC [4] - 4352:15, | garbage [2] - 4430:21, | 4485:2, 4491:6, |
| 4386:11, 4387:25, | 4517:9 | 4353:23, 4386:8, | 4430:22 | 4491:15, 4491:22, |
| 4411:4, 4422:7, | forward [2] - 4291:18, | 4389:6 | Gary [1] - 4344:7 | 4493:15, 4495:5, |
| 4440:25, 4441:24, | 4512:9 | FX-231 [2] - 4286:16, | gather [1] - 4474:16 | 4495:8, 4495:10, |
| 4483:18, 4483:19, | four [10] - 4319:13, | 4487:24 | gathered [1] - 4477:5 | 4499:14, 4499:21, |
| 4528:17, 4533:3, | 4403:8, 4442:19, | FX-232 [2] - 4286:16, | gathering [1] - | 4507:3, 4509:8, |
| 4533:9, 4533:11 | 4442:22, 4443:13, | 4488:4 | 4514:25 | 4514:11, 4514:18, |
| focus [16] - 4301:7, | 4443:24, 4444:1, | FX-412 [5] - 4286:17, | gears [1] - 4521:5 | 4518:13, 4519:9, |
| 4303:25, 4331:2, | 4444:4, 4466:9, | 4365:12, 4365:18, | general [11] - 4298:16, | 4520:3, 4521:6, |
| 4363:1, 4380:10, | 4543:16 | 4366:2, 4405:9 | 4299:14, 4300:12, | 4521:15, 4525:3, |
| 4412:22, 4445:19, | four-year [1] - 4442:19 | FX-413 [3] - 4286:17, | 4305:9, 4321:11, | 4525:17, 4525:20, |
| 4448:8, 4451:6, | fourth [5] - 4299:17, | 4369:18, 4422:22 | 4436:25, 4489:23, | 4525:25, 4527:6, |
| 4457:16, 4466:5, | 4308:15, 4359:16, | FX-53 [2] - 4286:15, | 4490:3, 4491:20, | 4527:12, 4527:20, |
| 4474:8, 4487:1, | 4369:22, 4469:16 | 4485:23 | 4517:10, 4529:24 | 4527:25, 4528:3, |
| 4490:3, 4492:19, | fraction [3] - 4396:12, | FX-56 [2] - 4286:15, | generally [6] - 4325:3, | 4528:7, 4528:12, |
| 4492:21 | 4397:9, 4397:13 | 4483:6 | 4326:24, 4355:10, | 4528:22, 4529:5, |
| focused [5] - 4352:20, | frame [2] - 4389:24, | FX-686 [2] - 4286:18, | 4378:4, 4406:11, | 4529:11, 4529:19, |
| 4444:13, 4497:10, | 4518:24 | 4458:22 | 4432:17 | 4530:25, 4532:8, |
| 4504:9, 4506:11 | framework [1] - | FX-874 [3] - 4286:18, | gentleman [2] - | 4532:21, 4533:10, |
| focuses [3] - 4305:20, | 4511:9 | 4457:3, 4457:18 | 4318:8, 4371:11 | 4533:21, 4534:7, |
| 4306:17, 4458:14 | Franklin [1] - 4350:5 | FX-875 [2] - 4286:19, | geographical [1] - | 4535:25, 4540:20, |
| focusing [2] - | frankly [2] - 4542:14, | 4339:23 | 4526:8 | 4543:9, 4545:1, |
| 4301:14, 4301:23 | 4547:15 | FX-886 [4] - 4286:19, | geologist [1] - | 4545:5, 4546:22 |
| folks [1] - 4391:24 | freezing [1] - 4547:23 | 4458:22, 4459:16, | 4487:25 | Georgia's [12] - |
| follow [4] - 4294:11, | fresh [4] - 4340:2, | 4459:25 | Georgakakos [1] - | 4302:25, 4308:19, |
| 4442:23, 4443:11, | 4340:12, 4399:2, | FX-921 [2] - 4286:20, | 4532:9 | 4314:20, 4314:23, |
| 4476:1 | 4404:8 | 4494:5 | George [2] - 4349:2, | 4436:22, 4437:7, |
| followed [2] - | freshets [3] - 4399:3, | FX-925 [2] - 4286:20, | 4505:17 | 4449:6, 4456:13, |
| 4453:21, 4461:18 | 4408:11, 4408:16 | 4480:6 | GEORGIA [1] - 4285:6 | 4456:21, 4483:22, |
| following [4] - 4301:5, | freshwater [2] - | FX-927 [2] - 4286:21, | Georgia [107] - | 4520:13, 4543:22 |
| 4342:21, 4511:2, | 4324:9, 4368:19 | 4475:9 | 4285:20, 4288:17, | Gerald [1] - 4495:7 |
| 4533:7 | Freshwater [2] - | FX-928 [1] - 4479:9 | 4288:20, 4289:16, | given [13] - 4307:10, |
| follows [1] - 4527:4 | 4300:6, 4354:20 | | 4291:11, 4292:15, | 4386:24, 4399:19, |
| food [2] - 4368:14, | fringe [1] - 4537:6 | fX-928 [1] - 4286:21 FX-929 [1] - 4464:20 | 4293:23, 4294:2, | 4402:22, 4419:8, |
| 4368:15 | front [4] - 4294:12, | FX-949 [1] - 4464.20 FX-949 [2] - 4286:22, | 4295:15, 4295:21, | 4419:11, 4427:7, |
| football [1] - 4376:12 | | 4364:6 | 4296:2, 4296:12, | 4439:13, 4439:14, |
| footnote [1] - 4498:13 | 4362:12, 4435:11, 4451:2 | FX-951 [2] - 4286:22, | 4298:15, 4300:3, | 4453:25, 4480:17, |
| forage [3] - 4509:9, | | 4356:9 | 4300:19, 4301:3, | 4526:21, 4526:24 |
| 4542:4, 4542:23 | Full [1] - 4488:25 full [11] - 4297:7, | FX-953 [3] - 4286:23, | 4301:11, 4301:19, | Glibert [3] - 4348:6, |
| force [17] - 4295:5, | | 4354:18, 4354:24 | 4301:24, 4302:19, | 4348:8, 4349:8 |
| 4296:15, 4429:7, | 4298:25, 4312:25, 4327:23, 4387:22 | | 4302:21, 4307:3, | Glickman [1] - |
| 4445:23, 4490:21, | 4327:23, 4387:22, | FX-955 [2] - 4286:23, | 4307:13, 4309:7, | 4436:14 |
| 4490:23, 4493:6, | 4443:13, 4489:9, | 4415:21 | 4310:9, 4312:5, | GLICKMAN [1] - |
| 4493:10, 4493:13, | 4489:15, 4496:6, 4501:16, 4503:10 | FX-956 [3] - 4286:24, 4357:13, 4358:1 | 4314:22, 4317:5, | 4436:18 |
| 4493:17, 4493:25, | fully [6] - 4341:4, | • | 4318:3, 4318:13, | goal [7] - 4333:15, |
| 4494:1, 4494:9, | 4385:9, 4401:18 | FX-957 [3] - 4286:24, 4417:6 4418:15 | 4319:4, 4337:17, | 4451:9, 4451:23, |
| 4494:15, 4494:19, | 4511:23, 4520:1 THE | E REPORTING G | ROUP:11, 4339:14, | 4452:23, 4453:10, |
| | 4011.20, 4020.1 | | I | |
| Ī | 1.// | lagon & Iockha | rt | |

| | 1 | ı | I | |
|--|---|--|--------------------------------------|---|
| 4453:12 | 4484:15, 4485:15, | 4370:18 | 4424:20, 4424:22 | 4413:23, 4437:22, |
| goals [3] - 4450:8, | 4485:18, 4501:23, | GX-486 [2] - 4287:4, | hardship [1] - 4321:12 | 4490:23, 4506:22, |
| 4450:14, 4452:5 | 4502:8 | 4361:18 | HARDWICK [1] - | 4524:4 |
| God [2] - 4312:19, | group [3] - 4296:6, | GX-491 [3] - 4287:4, | 4285:18 | hearing [2] - 4312:17, |
| 4434:15 | 4421:12, 4421:13 | 4304:5, 4304:11 | harm [2] - 4515:4, | 4434:13 |
| gold [1] - 4380:3 | Group [1] - 4488:7 | GX-496 [1] - 4287:5 | 4515:8 | HEARING [1] - |
| goods [1] - 4524:6 | guarantee [1] - 4548:6 | GX-500 [1] - 4287:5 | harmed [1] - 4402:24 | 4285:10 |
| government [18] - | guide [1] - 4511:8 | GX-501 [1] - 4287:6 | Harvard [5] - 4437:19, | hearsay [1] - 4350:24 |
| 4471:16, 4471:17, | Guidelines [2] - | GX-568 [4] - 4287:6, | 4505:2, 4505:3, | heavily [2] - 4382:12, |
| 4474:2, 4494:22, | 4488:14, 4488:21 | 4305:6, 4325:15, | 4517:25, 4537:9 | 4383:3 |
| 4498:16, 4499:7, | guidelines [2] - | 4327:19 | harvest [21] - 4332:17, | heavily-fished [1] - |
| 4499:13, 4499:22, | 4511:14, 4511:15 | GX-649 [3] - 4287:7, | 4370:13, 4376:16, | 4383:3 |
| 4500:16, 4505:10, | Gulf [6] - 4375:25, | 4306:7, 4310:12 | 4388:9, 4388:10, | hedonic [3] - 4469:23, |
| 4505:11, 4510:21, | 4408:6, 4417:7, | GX-741 [2] - 4287:7, | 4388:20, 4389:11, | 4470:1, 4480:17 |
| 4510:22, 4510:25, | 4418:1, 4419:11, | 4306:16 | 4390:1, 4390:20, | held [2] - 4285:11, |
| 4511:16, 4523:6, | 4427:9 | GX-752 [2] - 4287:8, | 4391:1, 4393:13, | 4505:22 |
| 4538:24, 4539:16 | GX-1018 [2] - 4287:11, | 4308:1 | 4395:18, 4401:15, | Hellgren [1] - 4301:13 |
| Government [2] - | 4303:18 | GX-770 [1] - 4287:8 | 4402:1, 4403:21, | help [7] - 4312:19, |
| 4505:1, 4505:2 | GX-1148 [1] - 4287:12 | GX-778 [1] - 4287:9 | 4404:13, 4408:3, | 4424:12, 4424:18, |
| Governor [1] - 4445:4 | GX-1270 [1] - 4343:7 | GX-779 [1] - 4287:9 | 4414:1, 4414:18, | 4425:8, 4434:15, |
| gradients [1] - | GX-1270-1276 [1] - | GX-782 [1] - 4287:10 | 4414:23, 4418:12 | 4534:10, 4547:25 |
| 4516:19 | 4287:14 | GX-789 [2] - 4287:10, | harvested [8] - | hereby [1] - 4549:3 |
| grand [1] - 4509:14 | GX-1271 [1] - 4343:11 | 4329:17 | 4355:23, 4378:3, | high [26] - 4315:8, |
| grandfathered [4] - | GX-1272 [1] - 4344:4 | GX-799 [2] - 4287:11, | 4378:5, 4383:16, | 4315:17, 4324:12, |
| 4447:11, 4448:4, | GX-1273 [2] - 4344:13, | 4308:6 | 4384:3, 4395:22, | 4324:15, 4324:22, |
| 4470:13, 4470:22 | 4344:20 | | 4402:19, 4412:16 harvesting [7] - | 4324:25, 4325:5, |
| grant [1] - 4470:3 | GX-1274 [1] - 4344:21 | Н | 4359:3, 4371:1, | 4325:19, 4327:8, |
| Grant [1] - 4437:1 granted [1] - 4447:9 | GX-1275 [1] - 4345:7 | habitat [18] - 4388:11, | 4376:18, 4401:2, | 4330:19, 4363:20, 4376:3, 4382:6, |
| graph [7] - 4382:14, | GX-1276 [1] - 4345:16 | 4388:16, 4391:2, | 4401:9, 4402:24, | 4382:7, 4384:11, |
| 4391:19, 4410:5, | GX-1280 [1] - 4343:18 | 4391:15, 4392:7, | 4411:25 | 4385:10, 4386:14, |
| 4419:17, 4475:17, | GX-1280-1284 [1] - | 4392:22, 4392:25, | Harvey [1] - 4371:9 | 4403:18, 4404:3, |
| 4498:10, 4531:15 | 4287:15 | 4393:1, 4399:12, | Hausman [2] - | 4404:11, 4404:14, |
| graphed [2] - 4397:7, | GX-1281 [1] - 4345:23 | 4400:13, 4400:21, | 4539:23, 4540:1 | 4404:15, 4404:22, |
| 4398:15 | GX-1282 [1] - 4346:8 GX-1283 [1] - 4346:15 | 4401:5, 4401:22, | Havens [24] - 4286:4, | 4481:16, 4537:14 |
| graphics [1] - 4441:10 | GX-1284 [1] - 4347:1 | 4415:10, 4415:13, | 4291:7, 4294:5, | higher [16] - 4328:12, |
| graphs [3] - 4383:7, | GX-1234 [1] - 4303:23 | 4416:1, 4416:7 | 4295:11, 4295:17, | 4368:4, 4397:13, |
| 4391:23, 4391:24 | gX-1338 [1] - 4287:12 | half [7] - 4317:25, | 4302:12, 4302:24, | 4397:24, 4404:23, |
| grasp [1] - 4392:1 | GX-1339 [3] - 4287:13, | 4392:14, 4473:11, | 4303:25, 4304:7, | 4407:4, 4407:7, |
| grazing [1] - 4439:22 | 4304:21, 4362:17 | 4473:12, 4517:13, | 4304:16, 4304:17, | 4411:12, 4422:7, |
| great [2] - 4375:17, | GX-1340 [2] - 4287:13, | 4518:11, 4518:25 | 4304:23, 4306:10, | 4427:14, 4443:24, |
| 4379:4 | 4308:12 | hand [12] - 4297:13, | 4307:23, 4308:2, | 4532:10, 4532:13, |
| Great [2] - 4379:15, | GX-1345 [1] - 4347:20 | 4311:25, 4312:15, | 4308:7, 4308:13, | 4533:16 |
| 4399:21 | GX-1345-1357 [1] - | 4383:18, 4388:25, | 4309:2, 4311:3, | highest [9] - 4376:1, |
| greater [3] - 4476:22, | 4287:16 | 4392:16, 4434:11, | 4348:17, 4362:15, | 4385:5, 4389:19, |
| 4478:23, 4503:19 | GX-1346 [1] - 4348:1 | 4435:18, 4507:16, 4527:22, 4531:18, | 4362:20, 4363:2 | 4397:9, 4397:10, |
| greatest [4] - 4447:21, | GX-1347 [1] - 4348:5 | 4527.22, 4531.16, 4549:10 | Havens's [3] - 4303:3, | 4403:13, 4403:17, |
| 4455:24, 4492:22, | GX-1348 [1] - 4348:10 | handed [5] - 4303:5, | 4304:25, 4363:5 | 4409:8, 4418:8 |
| 4511:1 | GX-1349 [1] - 4348:15 | 4313:7, 4337:17, | head [1] - 4538:22 | highlight [2] - 4336:1, |
| green [5] - 4418:5, | GX-1350 [1] - 4348:19 | 4343:8, 4344:2 | headers [2] - 4425:22, 4426:3 | 4511:10 |
| 4504:14, 4508:10, | GX-1351 [1] - 4348:24 | handle [1] - 4350:17 | headings [1] - | highlighted [15] - 4294:19, 4295:23, |
| 4529:3, 4531:21 | GX-1352 [1] - 4349:5 | handy [1] - 4486:18 | 4462:25 | 4297:8, 4298:10, |
| Greenblatt [2] - | GX-1353 [1] - 4349:9 | happy [4] - 4290:10, | Health [1] - 4366:5 | 4299:24, 4300:15, |
| 4348:10, 4348:13 | GX-1354 [1] - 4349:14 | 4341:25, 4453:8, | healthy [1] - 4420:9 | 4301:8, 4301:14, |
| gross [4] - 4472:16, | GX-1355 [1] - 4349:19 | 4545:21 | hear [2] - 4464:4, | 4301:23, 4304:11, |
| 4472:18, 4528:9, | GX-1356 [1] - 4349:23 | hard [5] - 4334:19, | 4545:21 | 4306:19, 4308:3, |
| 4528:11 | GX-1357 [1] - 4350:3 | 4335:12, 4424:20, | heard [10] - 4309:25, | 4347:16, 4362:20, |
| Groundwater [2] - 4496:20, 4497:24 | GX-4 [1] - 4365:11 | 4424:22, 4500:19 | 4313:18, 4326:20, | 4362:24 |
| groundwater [5] - | GX-459 [2] - 4287: TH] | E REPORTING G | ROUP 22, 4331:10, | highly [4] - 4416:24, |
| g. cananator [o] - | | • | 1 | |
| | ı N | lason & Lockha | rt | |

hurricane [1] -

4419:8, 4419:14, 4536:18 Hilborn [2] - 4356:12, 4356:13 himself [1] - 4293:9 hired [3] - 4317:3, 4317:4, 4431:7 Historic [1] - 4308:24 historic [1] - 4366:19 historical [1] -4378:21 historically [1] -4499:15 hit [1] - 4505:23 hobby [1] - 4476:24 Hoehn [19] - 4342:22, 4343:6, 4343:8, 4343:12, 4343:15, 4343:16, 4343:19, 4344:3, 4344:5, 4344:7, 4344:13, 4344:15, 4344:18, 4344:22, 4345:8, 4345:17, 4345:24, 4348:19, 4348:21 Hoehn's [1] - 4343:22 hold [4] - 4293:17, 4377:1, 4505:20, 4537:14 Hole [3] - 4319:18, 4383:14, 4384:2 home [2] - 4392:8, 4392:21 homeowner [1] -4504:2 honest [4] - 4424:22, 4437:9, 4441:10, 4512:17 Honor [94] - 4288:4, 4288:14, 4289:2, 4289:5, 4289:15, 4290:14, 4292:5, 4293:14, 4293:18, 4293:20, 4295:1, 4295:8, 4295:13, 4295:19, 4296:1, 4296:11, 4296:20, 4297:1. 4297:10. 4297:17, 4297:22, 4298:7, 4298:13, 4298:19, 4299:3, 4299:11, 4299:20, 4300:2, 4300:18, 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6, 4302:10, 4302:15, 4303:13, 4303:16, 4303:22, 4304:4, 4304:13, 4304:20, 4305:3,

4305:12, 4305:23, 4306:4, 4306:14, 4306:22, 4307:9, 4307:21, 4308:18, 4309:6, 4309:14, 4310:3, 4310:4, 4311:12. 4311:17. 4312:2, 4313:3, 4313:21, 4314:5, 4318:19, 4341:23, 4342:5, 4342:9, 4351:13, 4353:1, 4353:5, 4360:20, 4371:22, 4371:25, 4392:1, 4398:11, 4402:7, 4414:4, 4426:9, 4426:12, 4433:7, 4433:9, 4433:11, 4433:12, 4434:23, 4435:1, 4435:19, 4436:13, 4436:19, 4507:7, 4531:17, 4544:12, 4545:1, 4545:3, 4545:9, 4548:15, 4548:16 Hook [1] - 4459:6 hope [3] - 4436:9, 4493:19, 4547:20 hopefully [1] -4436:11 hopeless [1] -4536:20 horizontal [1] -4396:17 Hornberger [2] -4348:24, 4531:13 Hornbergerer [1] -

4349:2

4435:4

4320:5

4318:5

4545:24

4540:4

Houseman [1] -

huge [3] - 4496:12,

4503:18, 4525:11

human [1] - 4377:13

horrible [1] - 4536:13

hospitality [1] -

hotel [1] - 4321:7

Hotel [3] - 4384:1,

4385:4, 4385:6

hotels [1] - 4436:1

hour [2] - 4318:7,

hours [2] - 4307:15,

House [1] - 4365:3

housekeeping [3] -

4290:16, 4545:17,

4408:12 Hurricane [8] -4391:7, 4398:2, 4398:21, 4398:25, 4399:17. 4400:4. 4400:17, 4401:1 hurricanes [2] -4408:10, 4408:11 hydrological [1] -4533:6 hydrologist [3] -4501:22, 4501:23, 4533:15 hydrologist's [1] -4533:18 hydrologists [2] -4487:14, 4532:17 hydrology [1] -4501:24 hypotheses [3] -4381:20, 4381:23, 4382:3 hypothesis [2] -4315:22, 4382:6 hypothesize [1] -4492:7 hypothetical [1] -4464:14 ı

i.e [1] - 4506:17 idea [1] - 4510:22 ideal [2] - 4523:1, 4523:2 identification [1] -4546:4 identified [5] - 4331:7, 4343:14, 4407:23, 4408:2, 4423:8 identifies [1] -4444:18 identify [11] - 4289:24, 4319:22, 4342:14, 4342:21, 4347:8, 4409:6, 4449:15, 4463:9, 4466:12, 4467:6, 4541:20 identifying [2] -4366:20, 4415:5 Identifying [1] -4308:25 ignore [1] - 4492:1 ignored [1] - 4374:13 **IID** [1] - 4361:10 illegal [2] - 4401:13, 4402:2 illegally [2] - 4401:9,

illegally-irrigated [1] -4490:22 illustrating [1] -4513:4 imagine [1] - 4336:14 immediate [1] -4400:7 immediately [1] -4391:8 immodest [1] -4545:11 impact [20] - 4324:22, 4420:16, 4444:18, 4447:16, 4448:1, 4452:8, 4453:19, 4461:16, 4463:7, 4473:24, 4492:11, 4492:22, 4502:13, 4511:5, 4511:17, 4513:21, 4514:15, 4518:21, 4521:7, 4521:14 **impacting** [1] - 4473:8 impacts [14] -4458:11, 4458:15, 4471:19, 4472:10, 4492:9, 4500:4, 4502:3, 4512:4, 4515:13, 4525:11, 4534:19, 4535:5, 4540:17, 4540:21 Impacts [2] - 4366:3, 4418:18 impeachment [20] -4292:15, 4292:19, 4347:9, 4347:18, 4347:21, 4347:24, 4348:4, 4348:5, 4348:9, 4348:10, 4348:13, 4348:19, 4348:22, 4348:24, 4349:3, 4349:9,

4348:9, 4348:10, 4348:13, 4348:19, 4348:22, 4348:24, 4349:3, 4349:9, 4349:12, 4349:23, 4350:1, 4350:22 implement [1] -4451:25 implementation [2] -4419:8, 4520:13 Implementation [1] -4449:7 implementing [1] -4456:15 implies [1] - 4478:18 importance [1] -

implies [1] - 4478: importance [1] -4309:17 important [12] -4289:12, 4331:8

mportant [12] -4289:12, 4331:8, 4352:24, 4406:2, 4433:20, 4471:3, 4500:6, 4520:18, 4525:9, 4527:19 imposed [2] - 4399:8, 4446:10 imposing [2] -4456:22, 4461:16

impossible [2] -4487:12, 4539:15 impressed [2] -4546:20, 4547:4

impression [2] -4307:6, 4374:19 IN [1] - 4549:10 in-depth [4] - 4328:21, 4335:6, 4337:1,

4337:9 inadvertent [1] -4311:17

inappropriate [1] - 4430:17

inch [1] - 4402:3 inches [5] - 4402:4, 4457:25, 4458:12, 4460:8, 4543:10

inclined [1] - 4293:15 include [10] - 4350:10, 4377:3, 4377:18,

4377:3, 4377:18, 4378:6, 4440:24, 4479:2, 4497:1,

4503:6, 4515:9, 4542:17

included [4] -4377:15, 4409:9, 4466:15, 4500:9 includes [4] -

4328:20, 4377:13, 4388:9, 4480:25

including [8] -4329:21, 4358:9, 4402:2, 4416:17,

4439:22, 4455:3, 4536:16, 4542:20 **income** [1] - 4477:1

inconsistent [2] -

4334:1, 4385:9 increase [8] - 4315:16, 4324:17, 4324:19, 4330:23, 4385:8

4330:23, 4385:8, 4401:20, 4407:5, 4514:19

increased [15] -4360:17, 4361:11, 4362:6, 4366:21, 4368:3, 4384:15, 4394:23, 4395:5, 4406:20, 4408:19,

4414:9, 4414:10, 4420:9, 4427:24, 4514:24

Increased [1] - 4309:1

increases [3] - 4376:2, 4407:15. 4408:12 increasing [1] -4395:2 incredibly [1] - 4468:9 incremental [1] -4519:21 increments [2] -4466:15, 4523:4 incurred [1] - 4500:3 incurring [1] - 4471:6 indeed [10] - 4438:7, 4448:12, 4453:23, 4456:3, 4486:8, 4511:24, 4517:24, 4518:4, 4525:12, 4529:8 independent [12] -4316:17, 4356:22, 4357:4, 4357:9, 4382:10, 4385:16, 4385:17, 4386:5, 4386:18, 4393:24, 4401:25, 4412:11 index [5] - 4332:7, 4332:9, 4415:10, 4415:14, 4416:2 **INDEX** [1] - 4286:1 indicate [1] - 4390:21 indicated [4] -4382:13, 4386:17, 4389:21, 4412:14 indication [2] -4446:13, 4453:3 indications [1] -4460:14 indicator [3] - 4374:9, 4517:15, 4517:21 individual [2] -4289:21, 4459:19 Individual [1] -4357:16 individuals [10] -4306:11, 4308:14, 4321:11, 4329:21, 4357:21, 4361:21, 4424:22, 4437:19, 4495:3, 4537:17 induced [1] - 4363:20 industries [4] -4507:24, 4508:3, 4508:10, 4508:11 industry [1] - 4424:14 inescapable [1] -4515:21 inevitable [2] -4411:22, 4412:2 infections [1] -4328:12 infested [1] - 4362:9

Inflows [1] - 4354:20 influenced [1] -4356:3 inform [7] - 4316:3, 4316:6, 4318:12, 4319:3, 4321:16, 4321:20, 4335:7 information [18] -4321:23, 4322:2, 4323:16, 4323:20, 4358:20, 4389:8, 4390:10, 4429:16, 4429:25, 4430:3, 4431:4, 4431:11, 4480:10, 4501:5, 4502:2, 4503:7, 4526:8, 4528:14 Information [1] -4511:7 ingredients [2] -4430:6, 4430:8 initial [1] - 4492:20 initiated [3] - 4379:16, 4379:17, 4380:8 Iniunction [2] -4343:13, 4346:1 Injunctive [1] -4346:18 input [4] - 4501:25, 4524:5, 4524:8, 4524:9 inquire [1] - 4334:17 insects [1] - 4454:16 instance [8] -4363:19, 4383:15, 4396:17, 4404:5, 4407:23, 4408:20, 4412:12, 4454:12 instead [9] - 4410:8, 4411:12, 4428:12, 4428:17, 4474:4, 4478:2, 4478:20, 4530:20, 4538:15 Institute [5] - 4312:9, 4328:23, 4376:24, 4450:24, 4532:8 institution [1] - 4537:8 instrument [2] -4467:10, 4467:11 insurance [3] -4498:20, 4499:1, 4499:2 integrating [1] -4316:20 intelligent [2] -4455:21, 4456:5 intend [1] - 4350:11 intended [2] -4375:18, 4496:4

4364:8 intensive 131 -4376:16, 4508:5, 4508:12 intention [1] - 4425:25 interaction [1] -4323:9 interest [4] - 4442:6, 4457:4, 4487:5, 4492:6 interested [4] -4330:6, 4330:9, 4451:23, 4452:23 interesting [2] -4384:19, 4432:18 interests [1] - 4494:18 InterJurisdictional [1] - 4369:5 interpret [2] - 4515:16, 4540:23 Interpreting [1] -4357:14 interrupt [3] -4307:12. 4447:24. 4480:23 intertidal [1] - 4362:8 intrinsic [1] - 4535:10 introduce [5] - 4289:2, 4313:24, 4436:14, 4504:22, 4536:15 investigate [2] -4490:21, 4538:1 investigators [2] -4327:13, 4329:13 invite [12] - 4438:21, 4450:5, 4452:19, 4469:9, 4476:1, 4489:8, 4490:10, 4490:14, 4494:7, 4496:16, 4500:18, 4533:24 involve [1] - 4452:9 involved [6] - 4310:17. 4355:6, 4415:2, 4425:10, 4546:25 involvement [1] -4378:16 involving [1] -4437:18 inward [2] - 4375:2, 4375:15 IPM [5] - 4374:7, 4409:19, 4409:21, 4409:23, 4410:1 Irmak [2] - 4455:8, 4456:1 irrelevant [1] -4538:14 irrigate [7] - 4466:19.

4474:11, 4474:19, 4475:6, 4476:2, 4476:8, 4476:9, 4476:10. 4476:12. 4477:9, 4479:17, 4480:12, 4480:25, 4490:22, 4523:17, 4523:22, 4524:24, 4525:4, 4543:18, 4543:19, 4543:24 irrigating [4] -4471:24, 4471:25, 4504:6, 4504:9 irrigation [93] -4439:20, 4439:22, 4441:15, 4445:25, 4446:24, 4447:3, 4447:13, 4450:10, 4452:2, 4452:24, 4454:24, 4454:25, 4455:1, 4455:7, 4455:11, 4455:21, 4455:23, 4456:5, 4456:6, 4456:16, 4456:23, 4458:11, 4459:18, 4460:8, 4460:23, 4461:5, 4461:10, 4463:7, 4463:11, 4463:13, 4463:14, 4463:17, 4463:18, 4463:19, 4463:21, 4463:23, 4464:2, 4464:5, 4464:6, 4464:12, 4464:13, 4465:10, 4466:2, 4466:14, 4466:17, 4466:24, 4467:3, 4467:8, 4469:18, 4469:21, 4470:10, 4470:21, 4471:9, 4474:19, 4474:20, 4480:1, 4480:19, 4480:25, 4481:6, 4482:12, 4486:25, 4489:6, 4491:10, 4500:4, 4501:16, 4503:10, 4513:10, 4513:11, 4521:6, 4521:8, 4521:14, 4521:18, 4521:24, 4522:8, 4522:11, 4523:1, 4523:5, 4523:15, 4523:25, 4524:13, 4525:8, 4525:20, 4527:1, 4531:3, 4375:18, 4496:4 | I irrigate 171 - 4466:19. | AFGA:7, 4540:13, Intensification [1] | THE | REPORTING | GROUP :20, 4542:21,

4470:16, 4480:21,

4481:2, 4504:3

irrigated [20] -

4542:25, 4543:5, 4543:10, 4543:14 Irrigation [1] -4479:13 irrigators [1] -4525:17 issue [15] - 4289:14, 4310:5, 4403:19, 4413:9, 4424:15, 4467:18, 4485:8, 4485:10, 4486:5, 4503:13, 4524:2, 4524:7, 4527:9, 4533:6 issued [2] - 4450:9, 4497:6 issues [7] - 4314:23, 4326:20, 4326:23, 4380:6, 4450:25, 4456:9, 4506:15 item [5] - 4288:25, 4443:8, 4457:8, 4485:14, 4486:11 items [3] - 4399:10, 4425:21, 4485:13 itself [4] - 4324:23, 4401:4, 4478:24, 4481:7

J

Jack [1] - 4301:4 **JAMIE** [1] - 4285:17 January [1] - 4451:24 **Jenkins** [3] - 4349:7, 4540:25, 4541:2 Jenkins's [2] -4514:14, 4540:18 Jerry [2] - 4539:23, 4540:1 Jim [1] - 4459:6 job [2] - 4416:24, 4432:20 jobs [2] - 4425:6, 4528:6 John [4] - 4306:10, 4357:23, 4437:6, 4505:2 Joint [9] - 4297:24, 4299:12, 4344:24, 4344:25, 4345:11, 4346:9, 4482:21, 4488:10, 4496:10 joint [2] - 4398:16, 4438:16 **JOSH** [1] - 4285:21 Josh [3] - 4291:8, 4302:13, 4302:17 **JOSHUA** [1] - 4285:23 journal [2] - 4308:23,

4517:6 killed [1] - 4399:2 4428:22, 4429:10, 4305:23, 4308:18, 4404:25 Journal [1] - 4300:11 killing [1] - 4376:15 4429:20, 4430:25, 4312:24, 4328:11, least [7] - 4310:15, 4431:13, 4431:21, 4330:6, 4340:1, 4407:1, 4442:18, Judge [1] - 4435:6 **Kimbro** [7] - 4361:19, 4432:1, 4432:24, 4340:5, 4346:24, judge [1] - 4423:15 4361:25, 4374:1, 4467:9, 4491:20, 4433:6, 4433:10, 4365:19, 4370:9, 4498:6, 4548:6 Judgment [2] -4384:21, 4409:3, 4433:19, 4433:22, 4394:13, 4408:25, 4409:8, 4413:24 leave [3] - 4309:16, 4345:1, 4345:12 4434:2. 4435:20. 4414:16, 4414:21, 4374:19, 4533:18 judgment [1] -**Kimbro's** [3] - 4332:3, 4436:17, 4544:13, 4434:20, 4434:22, 4482:20 4362:7, 4410:4 leaving [2] - 4522:13, 4544:16, 4544:18, 4434:24, 4442:7, Judson [1] - 4490:6 kind [5] - 4470:1, 4529:12 4544:20, 4544:24, 4443:18, 4443:20, lectures [1] - 4518:2 4498:20, 4500:19, July [4] - 4344:6, 4545:7, 4545:10, 4450:19, 4457:5, led [3] - 4379:18, 4441:25, 4530:22, 4506:13, 4535:25 4546:10 4457:17, 4457:18, kindly [1] - 4359:13 4386:10, 4463:12 4532:19 land [26] - 4447:4, 4468:25, 4484:14, jumps [1] - 4443:18 kinds [1] - 4524:19 left [11] - 4297:13, 4464:7, 4470:15, 4486:23, 4499:17, 4305:15, 4383:9, June [11] - 4289:3, **Kirkland** [3] - 4293:23, 4470:19, 4476:2, 4499:18, 4499:24, 4289:7, 4347:22, 4302:18, 4312:4 4383:18, 4392:3, 4476:8. 4476:11. 4500:19, 4513:23, 4392:20, 4394:1, 4348:7, 4349:10, Kise [2] - 4291:17 4527:9, 4529:16, 4480:25, 4482:17, 4443:3, 4527:22, 4349:24, 4530:22, knowledge [2] -4530:11, 4539:20 4482:18, 4486:25, 4528:5, 4529:1 4532:18, 4549:17 4323:8, 4358:19 4501:19, 4517:20, lasted [1] - 4318:5 JX-154 [4] - 4286:13, left-hand [3] knowledgeable [1] -4518:8, 4518:9, lastly [1] - 4425:11 4297:13, 4383:18, 4468:20, 4485:12, 4536:7 4518:17, 4518:18, late [2] - 4317:15, 4527:22 4486:16 **known** [2] - 4373:4, 4522:9, 4523:16, 4317:24 legal [11] - 4289:3, **JX-167** [4] - 4286:13, 4373:13 4527:23, 4527:24, Latham [1] - 4314:1 4289:19, 4384:16, 4308:22, 4311:5, knows [1] - 4509:21 4527:25, 4529:22, **Latin** [1] - 4373:10 4384:17, 4392:4, 4366:18 Kondolf [2] - 4349:9, 4538:10, 4543:17, laughing [1] - 4410:2 JX-169 [2] - 4286:14, 4401:14, 4402:2, 4349:11 4543:24 Laura [2] - 4405:8, 4402:3, 4420:2, 4462:9 Land [1] - 4437:1 4436:14 4478:22 **JX-21** [1] - 4286:9 L landings [30] - 4326:9, law [7] - 4446:20, legal-size [2] -JX-45 [2] - 4286:10, laboratory [1] -4352:14, 4354:2, 4491:22, 4492:10, 4384:16, 4392:4 4448:23 4354:10, 4354:24, 4316:15 4493:15, 4494:3, legally [2] - 4470:23, JX-47 [2] - 4286:10, Laboratory [2] -4355:2, 4355:4, 4495:5, 4495:23 4470:24 4488:22 4355:7, 4355:9, 4458:18, 4461:25 lawn [2] - 4504:3, legislators [1] -JX-50 [4] - 4286:11, lack [3] - 4310:24, 4355:23, 4386:3, 4504:14 4538:17 4358:18, 4359:2, 4386:4, 4386:20, 4388:10, 4521:23 lawns [2] - 4504:7, legislature [1] -4359:6 4387:1, 4387:9, lag [1] - 4386:21 4504:9 4538:9 JX-65 [2] - 4286:11, 4387:13, 4387:20, lags [1] - 4387:3 laws [1] - 4491:16 **Leitman** [2] - 4349:14, 4539:22 4388:20, 4389:7, laid [1] - 4515:20 **lawsuit** [1] - 4316:13 4349:17 JX-77 [5] - 4286:12, 4389:9, 4389:15, Lake [1] - 4441:3 lawyer [3] - 4291:20, length [2] - 4489:25, 4358:18, 4359:2, 4389:18, 4390:8, LANCASTER [65] -4413:17, 4470:25 4535:18 4359:14, 4372:17 4390:14, 4390:17, 4285:11, 4288:2, lawyers [4] - 4310:17, less [11] - 4411:7, **JX-91** [1] - 4286:12 4390:18, 4393:23, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4310:19, 4318:2, 4444:3, 4454:13, 4394:4, 4394:5, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4547:10 K 4396:23 4293:1, 4293:13, laymen's [1] - 4395:16 Karl [6] - 4286:4, landscaping [1] -4293:19, 4293:21, lead [8] - 4324:16, 4291:7, 4294:5, 4508:15 4294:22, 4294:25, 4324:25, 4330:8, language [7] -4295:11, 4302:24, 4302:9, 4302:16, 4397:17, 4413:25, 4348:17 4303:12, 4303:20, 4353:17, 4362:20, 4455:11, 4460:13, 4362:24, 4453:15, keep [6] - 4319:1, 4307:16, 4309:15, 4460:20 4457:1, 4515:15, 4383:12, 4476:18,

4311:13, 4311:21,

4312:3, 4312:13,

4313:4, 4313:22,

4314:2, 4314:7,

4318:21, 4342:3,

4342:7, 4371:23,

4402:11, 4414:5,

4426:7, 4426:10,

4426:13, 4426:17,

4426:20, 4426:24,

4427:1, 4427:12,

4427:23, 4428:4

4486:18, 4504:14,

keeping [1] - 4541:23

Kennedy [1] - 4505:2

Kenneth [1] - 4349:7

keeps [1] - 4547:9

Kent [1] - 4371:9

kept [1] - 4547:1

key [5] - 4330:5,

4382:5, 4396:9,

4400:25, 4524:7

4520:25

4454:18, 4454:24, 4468:11, 4473:10, 4481:6, 4485:22, 4531:6 Lettenmaier [1] -4531:13 letter [3] - 4327:2, 4344:8, 4347:3 **level** [9] - 4315:16, 4330:23, 4390:21, 4397:9, 4402:23, 4409:8, 4413:3, 4463:7, 4466:25 levels [18] - 4325:2, 4329:6, 4368:15, 4394:13, 4397:10, 4397:24, 4398:3, 4398:6, 4398:7, 4399:8, 4399:16,

leading [2] - 4360:22,

leak [1] - 4513:24

learn [1] - 4499:19

lease [1] - 4408:24

leased [1] - 4341:13

leases [10] - 4341:8,

4402:24, 4403:6,

4403:8, 4403:10,

4402:18, 4402:23,

learned [1] - 4290:25

4393:14

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP:2, 4404:21,

4529:24

4525:10

4400:10

large [4] - 4392:3,

4504:21, 4511:24,

larger [1] - 4544:11

larvae [4] - 4399:24,

4400:3, 4400:9,

last [41] - 4288:15,

4292:12, 4297:6,

88 of 107 sheets

| 4404.7 4400.47 |
|--------------------------------------|
| 4401:7, 4403:17, |
| 4407:19, 4412:25, |
| 4441:24, 4461:16, |
| 4465:10 |
| liberal [1] - 4424:18 |
| lie [1] - 4413:14 |
| lieu [2] - 4290:21, |
| 4290:22 |
| life [2] - 4288:12, |
| 4336:17 |
| light [1] - 4311:24 |
| Lighthouse [1] - |
| 4320:3 |
| lightly [4] - 4382:15, |
| 4383:4, 4384:3, |
| 4384:13 |
| lightly-fished [1] - |
| 4383:4 |
| likely [3] - 4493:13, |
| 4494:2, 4537:18 |
| likewise [1] - 4465:16 |
| limit [4] - 4448:13, |
| |
| 4466:24, 4505:23, |
| 4542:25 |
| limitations [2] - |
| 4447:12, 4448:5 |
| limited [2] - 4426:3, |
| 4463:19 |
| limiting [1] - 4463:17 |
| limits [2] - 4356:4, |
| 4445:22 |
| line [22] - 4307:2, |
| 4318:24, 4318:25, |
| 4335:20, 4335:22, |
| 4336:2, 4344:8, |
| 4386:18, 4390:9, |
| 4390:18, 4391:18, |
| 4391:24, 4396:18, |
| 4442:25, 4443:1, |
| 4443:8, 4443:25, |
| 4444:2, 4446:7, |
| 4446:12, 4483:19, |
| 4514:5 |
| lines [2] - 4442:4, |
| 4443:4 |
| Lipcius [21] - 4286:5, |
| 4293:6, 4294:2, |
| 4312:1, 4312:7, |
| |
| 4313:1, 4313:7, 4314:10, 4318:20, |
| |
| 4328:3, 4337:10, |
| 4339:12, 4353:2, |
| 4365:12, 4372:3, |
| 4387:15, 4389:2, |
| 4391:17, 4411:14, |
| 4414:8, 4422:10 |
| lipcius [2] - 4351:15, |
| 4353:8 |
| list [6] - 4341:4, |
| |
| 4351:2, 4459:18, |

| 4486:12, 4494:18, | |
|--|-----|
| 4546:3 | le |
| listed [6] - 4357:22, | l . |
| 4425:21, 4439:23, | |
| 4449:20, 4459:24, | le |
| 4486:8 | |
| listing [2] - 4415:25, | le |
| 4422:24 | |
| lists [1] - 4350:13 | |
| literally [2] - 4408:17, | |
| 4410:21 | |
| literature [7] - | |
| 4363:20, 4399:4, 4408:2, 4510:19, | |
| 4510:21, 4511:25, | |
| 4537:4 | |
| literatures [1] - 4517:3 | |
| litigation [12] - | |
| 4316:5, 4318:14, | |
| 4319:5, 4338:12, | |
| 4343:1, 4344:1, | |
| 4344:16, 4345:2, | |
| 4345:5, 4345:14, | |
| 4345:19, 4539:17 | |
| live [21] - 4288:22, | |
| 4290:23, 4294:1, | |
| 4332:11, 4333:1, | |
| 4388:10, 4388:16, | |
| 4389:22, 4391:3, | |
| 4391:14, 4391:20, 4392:3, 4392:6, | |
| 4392:7, 4392:9, | |
| 4392:14, 4392:19, | |
| 4397:22, 4399:22, | |
| 4413:6, 4413:7 | |
| lived [1] - 4288:11 | |
| lives [1] - 4388:17 | |
| livestock [5] - 4440:3, | |
| 4440:5, 4440:9, | |
| 4443:19, 4443:21 | |
| living [2] - 4453:23, | |
| 4504:24 | |
| Livingston [3] - | |
| 4368:8, 4368:18, | |
| 4427:15 | |
| lobsters [1] - 4377:19 | |
| local [2] - 4408:23, 4473:24 | |
| | |
| localized [6] - 4324:13, 4324:16, | |
| 4324:25, 4376:2, | |
| 4403:15, 4404:15 | |
| located [1] - 4326:16 | |
| location [2] - 4319:15, | |
| 4319:18 | le |
| locations [4] - | |
| 4319:13, 4319:21, | |
| 4379:23, 4415:5 | |

LOESS [4] - 4428:1,

| 4420.45 |
|------------------------|
| 4430:15 |
| long-term [3] - |
| 4324:9, 4428:13, |
| 4428:21 |
| longstanding [1] - |
| 4516:20 |
| look [96] - 4291:1, |
| 4308:5, 4313:9, |
| 4318:24, 4329:10, |
| 4339:6, 4340:10, |
| 4359:6, 4361:4, |
| 4361:6, 4362:11, |
| 4365:10, 4366:14, |
| 4367:21, 4370:21, |
| 4372:15, 4372:23, |
| 4387:17, 4390:5, |
| 4394:11, 4394:12, |
| 4396:17, 4398:9, |
| 4401:1, 4405:16, |
| 4409:13, 4410:21, |
| 4419:12, 4422:20, |
| 4428:8, 4428:12, |
| 4435:13, 4440:11, |
| 4441:9, 4444:8, |
| 4444:10, 4444:16, |
| 4449:3, 4450:12, |
| 4450:15, 4451:13, |
| 4452:15, 4452:16, |
| 4452:18, 4464:18, |
| 4465:25, 4468:9, |
| 4471:11, 4472:7, |
| 4474:17, 4474:22, |
| 4475:7, 4477:13, |
| |
| 4478:12, 4479:7, |
| 4481:8, 4481:25, |
| 4482:11, 4482:19, |
| 4485:17, 4486:11, |
| 4487:23, 4488:4, |
| 4496:15, 4497:22, |
| 4498:3, 4499:12, |
| 4499:15, 4501:15, |
| 4508:15, 4509:3, |
| 4509:9, 4509:11, |
| 4510:12, 4510:13, |
| 4515:1, 4518:16, |
| 4518:20, 4523:20, |
| 4524:22, 4528:15, |
| 4529:8, 4530:21, |
| 4533:15, 4533:19, |
| 4535:3, 4535:15, |
| 4537:12, 4539:7, |
| 4541:5, 4541:14, |
| 4543:3, 4546:2, |
| 4547:23 |
| looked [41] - 4310:11, |
| 4336:7, 4337:8, |
| 4352:7, 4353:21, |
| 4354:14, 4366:14, |
| 4382:9, 4382:12, |
| 4000:44 4000:40 |

| 4425:21, 4439:23, | 4428:21 | 4469:23, 4470:20, |
|-------------------------------------|--|------------------------|
| 4449:20, 4459:24, | longstanding [1] - | 4477:2, 4484:3, |
| 4486:8 | 4516:20 | 4495:21, 4497:13, |
| sting [2] - 4415:25, | look [96] - 4291:1, | 4497:24, 4508:3, |
| 4422:24 | 4308:5, 4313:9, | 4509:6, 4509:7, |
| sts [1] - 4350:13 | 4318:24, 4329:10, | 4513:18, 4522:16, |
| terally [2] - 4408:17, | 4339:6, 4340:10, | 4523:18, 4529:16, |
| 4410:21 | 4359:6, 4361:4, | 4530:18, 4530:20, |
| terature [7] - | 4361:6, 4362:11, | 4533:9, 4535:2, |
| 4363:20, 4399:4, | 4365:10, 4366:14, | 4535:14, 4541:8, |
| 4408:2, 4510:19, | 4367:21, 4370:21, | 4543:6 |
| 4510:21, 4511:25, | 4372:15, 4372:23, | looking [41] - 4297:5, |
| 4537:4 | 4387:17, 4390:5, | 4325:9, 4334:19, |
| teratures [1] - 4517:3 | 4394:11, 4394:12, | 4400:12, 4405:14, |
| tigation [12] - | 4396:17, 4398:9, | 4418:22, 4419:4, |
| 4316:5, 4318:14, | 4401:1, 4405:16, | 4428:20, 4430:10, |
| | 4409:13, 4410:21, | 4438:15, 4440:3, |
| 4319:5, 4338:12, 4343:1, 4344:1, | 4419:12, 4422:20, | 4442:23, 4471:14, |
| 4344:16, 4345:2, | 4428:8, 4428:12, | 4472:10, 4473:6, |
| | 4435:13, 4440:11, | 4473:9, 4473:18, |
| 4345:5, 4345:14, | 4441:9, 4444:8, | 4474:5, 4475:5, |
| 4345:19, 4539:17 | 4444:10, 4444:16, | 4475:25, 4478:25, |
| ve [21] - 4288:22, | 4449:3, 4450:12, | 4480:20, 4482:10, |
| 4290:23, 4294:1, | 4450:15, 4451:13, | 4500:7, 4500:13, |
| 4332:11, 4333:1, | 4452:15, 4452:16, | 4501:7, 4502:23, |
| 4388:10, 4388:16, | 4452:18, 4464:18, | 4503:10, 4507:24, |
| 4389:22, 4391:3, | 4465:25, 4468:9, | 4510:23, 4517:5, |
| 4391:14, 4391:20, | 4471:11, 4472:7, | 4518:3, 4521:14, |
| 4392:3, 4392:6, | 4474:17, 4474:22, | 4522:13, 4524:18, |
| 4392:7, 4392:9, | 4475:7, 4477:13, | 4524:20, 4526:5, |
| 4392:14, 4392:19, | 4478:12, 4479:7, | 4528:9, 4538:3, |
| 4397:22, 4399:22, | 4481:8, 4481:25, | 4538:5, 4539:22 |
| 4413:6, 4413:7 | 4482:11, 4482:19, | looks [7] - 4418:10, |
| ved [1] - 4288:11 | | 4471:19, 4474:11, |
| ves [1] - 4388:17 | 4485:17, 4486:11, | 4475:17, 4478:4, |
| vestock [5] - 4440:3, | 4487:23, 4488:4, | |
| 4440:5, 4440:9, | 4496:15, 4497:22, | 4478:8, 4532:20 |
| 4443:19, 4443:21 | 4498:3, 4499:12, | losers [1] - 4548:9 |
| ving [2] - 4453:23, | 4499:15, 4501:15, | loss [5] - 4451:9, |
| 4504:24 | 4508:15, 4509:3, | 4452:1, 4499:1, |
| ivingston [3] - | 4509:9, 4509:11, 4510:12, 4510:13 | 4499:2, 4500:3 |
| 4368:8, 4368:18, | 4510:12, 4510:13, 4515:1, 4518:16, | losses [2] - 4450:19, |
| 4427:15 | 4518:20, 4523:20, | 4451:19 |
| obsters [1] - 4377:19 | 4516:20, 4523:20, 4524:22, 4528:15, | lost [4] - 4392:23, |
| ocal [2] - 4408:23, | 4529:8, 4530:21, | 4481:25, 4482:10, |
| 4473:24 | 4529.6, 4530.21, 4533:15, 4533:19, | 4513:12 |
| ocalized [6] - | | loud [1] - 4336:3 |
| 4324:13, 4324:16, | 4535:3, 4535:15, | Louisiana's [1] - |
| 4324:25, 4376:2, | 4537:12, 4539:7, | 4404:6 |
| 4403:15, 4404:15 | 4541:5, 4541:14, | low [34] - 4315:1, |
| ocated [1] - 4326:16 | 4543:3, 4546:2, 4547:23 | 4315:22, 4325:18, |
| ocation [2] - 4319:15, | | 4326:3, 4330:8, |
| 4319:18 | looked [41] - 4310:11, | 4360:8, 4363:15, |
| ocations [4] - | 4336:7, 4337:8, | 4365:23, 4366:11, |
| 4319:13, 4319:21, | 4352:7, 4353:21, | 4367:15, 4368:11, |
| 4379:23, 4415:5 | 4354:14, 4366:14, | 4368:23, 4370:5, |
| .OESS [4] - 4428:1, | 4382:9, 4382:12, | 4380:18, 4380:20, |
| 4428:5, 4428:23 THE | E REPORTING G | ROUP :11, 4382:3, |
| • | , , , | i |

4397:2, 4419:16,

4446:4, 4446:5,

4456:2, 4468:14,

```
4382:6, 4384:10,
 4385:10, 4386:11,
 4386:14, 4387:25,
 4399:3, 4404:3,
 4404:17, 4407:19,
 4408:16, 4410:19,
 4418:19, 4419:3,
 4430:19, 4533:13
lower [15] - 4326:18,
 4385:6, 4394:19,
 4394:20, 4404:25,
 4405:2, 4411:4,
 4411:12, 4422:1,
 4422:6, 4444:12,
 4484:9, 4484:20,
 4528:5, 4543:1
Lower [9] - 4439:16,
 4459:13, 4472:1,
 4472:10, 4473:18,
 4474:5, 4484:9,
 4484:20, 4497:12
lowest [1] - 4398:7
luckily [1] - 4477:2
lunch [2] - 4292:8,
 4342:1
LW[1] - 4460:20
          M
```

madam [1] - 4342:11 magnitude [1] -4411:9 Magnuson [1] -4369:1 Magnuson-Stevens [1] - 4369:1 Mahoney [4] - 4291:8, 4294:9, 4302:13, 4302:17 MAHONEY [23] -4285:21, 4302:15, 4302:17, 4303:13, 4303:15, 4303:22, 4304:4, 4304:13, 4304:20, 4305:3, 4305:11, 4305:18, 4305:23, 4306:4, 4306:14, 4306:22, 4307:21, 4308:5, 4308:10, 4308:18, 4309:6, 4309:14, 4310:3 mail [35] - 4295:10, 4295:16, 4295:24, 4300:20, 4300:23, 4300:24, 4301:6, 4301:7, 4301:12, 4304:9, 4304:15, 4304:25, 4306:9, 4308:1, 4308:7, 4308:13, 4308:16,

| 4310:7, 4310:13, | Mann [1] - 4329:1 | 4314:2, 4314:7, | mean [21] - 4292:7, | member [1] - 4289:18 |
|---|--|--|---|--|
| 4310:19, 4344:7, | | 4318:21, 4342:3, | 4307:12, 4316:18, | members [2] - |
| 4344:9, 4361:16, | manufacturing [1] - 4508:3 | 4342:7, 4371:23, | 4334:13, 4341:16, | 4494:19, 4537:14 |
| 4361:19, 4361:24, | manuscript [1] - | 4402:11, 4414:5, | 4379:16, 4386:3, | memo [12] - 4329:10, |
| 4362:2, 4362:12, | 4300:5 | 4426:7, 4426:10, | 4426:11, 4427:4, | 4365:15, 4365:17, |
| 4363:7, 4365:14, | map [2] - 4403:5, | 4426:13, 4426:17, | 4464:4, 4470:23, | 4365:18, 4365:25, |
| 4369:20, 4370:19, | 4459:13 | 4426:20, 4426:24, | 4474:16, 4478:25, | 4369:22, 4369:23, |
| 4370:24, 4371:6, | March [2] - 4317:5, | 4427:1, 4427:12, | 4480:22, 4493:20, | 4405:8, 4405:13, |
| 4371:9 | 4344:1 | 4427:23, 4428:4, | 4495:24, 4499:15, | 4405:18, 4422:21 |
| mails [4] - 4301:4, | Marcia [1] - 4348:12 | 4428:22, 4429:10, | 4510:4, 4533:19, | Memorandum [1] - |
| 4303:24, 4304:6, | Marine [4] - 4300:10, | 4429:20, 4430:25, | 4547:7, 4547:13 | 4344:25 |
| 4304:22 | 4312:10, 4328:23, | 4431:13, 4431:21, | meander [5] - | memorialized [1] - |
| main [4] - 4327:24, | 4376:24 | 4432:1, 4432:24, | 4426:11, 4426:14, | 4292:22 |
| 4328:1, 4382:11, | marine [16] - 4312:8, | 4433:6, 4433:10, | 4427:2, 4427:5, | memory [1] - 4501:14 |
| 4408:3 | 4323:5, 4331:17, | 4433:19, 4433:22, | 4427:9 | memos [1] - 4413:24 |
| Maine [6] - 4285:13, | 4335:16, 4377:2, | 4434:2, 4435:20, | meaning [6] - | mention [4] - 4340:22, |
| 4285:15, 4288:9, | 4377:3, 4377:6, | 4436:17, 4544:13, | 4379:22, 4396:7, | 4340:25, 4341:5, |
| 4537:7, 4547:20, | 4377:7, 4377:16, | 4544:16, 4544:18, | 4410:14, 4427:13, | 4511:10 |
| 4549:3 | 4377:19, 4377:23, | 4544:20, 4544:24, | 4442:3, 4506:8 | mentioned [16] - |
| mainstream [3] - | 4407:5, 4427:11, | 4545:7, 4545:10, | meaningful [1] - | 4389:25, 4393:17, |
| 4471:12, 4513:22, | 4427:13, 4427:18 | 4546:10 | 4513:20 | 4393:21, 4395:7, |
| 4516:16 | mark [2] - 4346:25, | Master [3] - 4292:24, | means [12] - 4368:12, | 4397:20, 4399:22, |
| maintain [1] - 4397:20 | 4533:2 | 4449:18, 4504:22 | 4368:14, 4377:12, | 4400:15, 4403:11, |
| major [11] - 4378:22, | Mark [8] - 4323:17, | Masters [2] - 4449:19, | 4386:23, 4396:20, | 4403:14, 4406:15, |
| 4379:21, 4380:10, | 4332:18, 4333:11, | 4462:13 | 4397:12, 4463:9, | 4415:2, 4430:14, |
| 4382:23, 4405:25, | 4333:14, 4350:6, | masters [3] - 4449:22, | 4466:12, 4470:2, | 4463:15, 4506:21, |
| 4419:17, 4420:8, | 4449:18, 4449:19, | 4449:23, 4456:10 | 4491:22, 4516:5, | 4538:3, 4541:15 |
| 4421:11, 4421:16, | 4462:13 | masters's [1] - 4462:4 | 4543:8 | mentioning [2] - |
| 4536:1 | marked [13] - 4296:8, | matches [1] - 4477:7 | meant [12] - 4334:17, | 4455:5, 4547:9 |
| majority [3] - 4424:21, | 4296:23, 4297:23, | matching [4] - 4526:6, | 4375:19, 4395:2, | Menzel [1] - 4368:2 |
| 4504:8, 4537:2 | 4298:15, 4299:8, | 4526:7, 4526:8, | 4415:5, 4424:12, | Menzie [1] - 4381:22 |
| male [3] - 4431:24, | 4299:12, 4299:18, | 4544:2 | 4439:8, 4459:7, | merely [1] - 4291:19 |
| 4432:6, 4432:20 | 4301:2, 4305:25, | material [6] - 4292:19, | 4463:23, 4463:25, | MERKI [28] - 4285:20, |
| males [4] - 4402:6, | 4306:18, 4343:7, | 4292:20, 4347:9, | 4464:1, 4464:5, | 4293:20, 4293:22, |
| 4432:14, 4432:25, | 4343:10, 4364:6 | 4347:21, 4449:24, | 4473:25 | 4294:23, 4295:1, |
| 4433:3 | market [1] - 4446:15 | 4455:25 | measure [12] - | 4295:8, 4295:13, |
| man [1] - 4306:10 | markets [2] - 4320:14, | materials [6] - | 4355:22, 4357:7, 4383:19, 4394:2, | 4295:19, 4296:1, |
| manage [6] - 4378:3, | 4320:20 | 4290:25, 4413:23, 4431:23, 4439:15, | 4394:4, 4394:6, | 4296:11, 4296:20, |
| 4378:4, 4388:14, | marking [1] - 4342:20 | 4488:6, 4520:5 | 4395:13, 4396:22, | 4297:1, 4297:10, |
| 4401:12, 4456:24, 4458:4 | Mary [2] - 4312:11, | mathematical [1] - | 4484:25, 4518:3, | 4297:17, 4297:22, |
| | 4376:25 | 4409:10 | 4518:14, 4539:14 | 4298:7, 4298:13, |
| management [19] - 4312:8, 4322:8, | Mason [4] - 4285:14, 4549:2, 4549:15, | mathematics [1] - | measured [1] - | 4298:19, 4299:3, 4299:11, 4299:20, |
| 4377:22, 4377:24, | 4549:2, 4549:15, 4549:15 | 4477:24 | 4528:11 | |
| | | | 4020.11 | 4300:2 4300:18 |
| 4378:1, 4378:2 | | | | 4300:2, 4300:18, 4301:1 4301:10 |
| 4378:1, 4378:2, 4378:6, 4390:24, | massive [4] - 4389:22, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 | 4301:1, 4301:10, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, | measurement [2] - | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 mechanical [3] - | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, 4418:18, 4511:6 | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, 4294:22, 4294:25, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 maximize [1] - | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 method [10] - 4381:19, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, 4418:18, 4511:6 managers [1] - 4424:6 | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, 4294:22, 4294:25, 4302:9, 4302:16, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 maximize [1] - 4453:24 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 mechanical [3] - 4414:18, 4414:22, 4414:23 | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 method [10] - 4381:19, 4418:12, 4463:11, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, 4418:18, 4511:6 managers [1] - 4424:6 managing [3] - 4416:23, 4416:25, 4546:16 | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, 4294:22, 4294:25, 4302:9, 4302:16, 4303:12, 4303:20, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 maximize [1] - 4453:24 maximum [5] - | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 mechanical [3] - 4414:18, 4414:22, 4414:23 meet [1] - 4547:3 | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 method [10] - 4381:19, 4418:12, 4463:11, 4466:7, 4480:18, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, 4418:18, 4511:6 managers [1] - 4424:6 managing [3] - 4416:23, 4416:25, | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, 4294:22, 4294:25, 4302:9, 4302:16, 4303:12, 4303:20, 4307:16, 4309:15, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 maximize [1] - 4453:24 maximum [5] - 4410:7, 4410:11, 4526:14, 4526:15, 4527:2 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 mechanical [3] - 4414:18, 4414:22, 4414:23 meet [1] - 4547:3 meeting [2] - 4321:4, | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 method [10] - 4381:19, 4418:12, 4463:11, 4466:7, 4480:18, 4482:9, 4526:5, |
| 4378:6, 4390:24, 4393:22, 4394:16, 4396:5, 4399:9, 4400:6, 4400:15, 4400:23, 4416:21, 4419:7, 4494:25 Management [4] - 4356:11, 4369:2, 4418:18, 4511:6 managers [1] - 4424:6 managing [3] - 4416:23, 4416:25, 4546:16 | massive [4] - 4389:22, 4408:7, 4408:12, 4408:14 MASTER [65] - 4285:11, 4288:2, 4288:5, 4290:12, 4290:15, 4292:11, 4293:1, 4293:13, 4293:19, 4293:21, 4294:22, 4294:25, 4302:9, 4302:16, 4303:12, 4303:20, 4307:16, 4309:15, 4311:13, 4311:21, | Mathias [1] - 4349:11 matter [7] - 4285:10, 4299:5, 4321:17, 4491:17, 4491:20, 4491:23, 4500:14 matters [4] - 4290:17, 4309:23, 4450:1, 4473:14 mature [1] - 4392:3 maximize [1] - 4453:24 maximum [5] - 4410:7, 4410:11, 4526:14, 4526:15, 4527:2 | measurement [2] - 4326:20, 4326:23 measures [14] - 4389:14, 4389:15, 4396:7, 4440:21, 4444:13, 4458:15, 4468:16, 4468:19, 4484:25, 4503:9, 4512:12, 4513:8, 4519:21, 4528:25 mechanical [3] - 4414:18, 4414:22, 4414:23 meet [1] - 4547:3 | 4301:1, 4301:10, 4301:21, 4302:1, 4302:6 Merki [3] - 4291:8, 4293:22, 4303:8 met [5] - 4318:11, 4319:2, 4320:23, 4321:3, 4467:1 metering [1] - 4526:6 method [10] - 4381:19, 4418:12, 4463:11, 4466:7, 4480:18, 4482:9, 4526:5, 4535:21, 4535:23, |

| | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|--|
| 4512:2, 4512:3 | 4519:6, 4519:7, | 4544:4 | 4315:8, 4315:12, | 4311:16, 4311:22, |
| methodology [3] - | 4519:13, 4538:16 | models [6] - 4409:21, | 4324:13, 4324:16, | 4312:2, 4312:4, |
| 4409:9, 4510:18, | mind [6] - 4319:2, | 4416:6, 4416:8, | 4325:1, 4332:17, | 4313:3, 4313:6, |
| 4534:14 | 4352:12, 4400:22, | 4416:10, 4429:14, | 4336:10, 4336:12, | 4313:17, 4313:20, |
| methods [5] - 4517:5, | 4425:16, 4445:12, | 4429:15 | 4351:18, 4351:23, | 4313:21, 4313:23, |
| 4535:6, 4536:1, | 4476:18 | moderate [4] - 4404:3, | 4360:17, 4361:3, | 4314:4, 4314:9, |
| 4537:4, 4537:5 | mine [2] - 4482:14, | 4404:11, 4404:17, | 4361:11, 4362:6, | 4318:19, 4318:22, |
| metric [2] - 4355:17, | 4501:15 | 4418:20 | 4376:3, 4396:24, | 4341:23, 4342:5, |
| 4355:18 | minimis [5] - 4515:8, | modifications [1] - | 4403:15, 4403:17, | 4342:9, 4342:11, |
| metro [2] - 4503:17, | 4515:15, 4516:4, | 4469:22 | 4404:15, 4404:23, | 4350:15, 4350:19, |
| 4508:25 | 4519:11, 4540:24 | modified [1] - 4462:12 | 4406:21, 4407:8, | 4350:20, 4351:1, |
| metropolitan [2] - | minimize [1] - 4451:9 | modifying [1] - 4502:4 | 4411:2, 4413:4, | 4351:5, 4351:7, |
| 4508:1, 4509:2 | minimus [2] - | moment [12] - | 4414:10 | 4351:8, 4351:12, |
| Mexico [1] - 4375:25 | 4515:17, 4540:22 | 4364:11, 4367:10, | most [26] - 4288:10, | 4351:14, 4353:1, |
| microphone [2] - | ministerial [1] - | 4373:3, 4393:16, | 4323:9, 4331:8, | 4353:5, 4353:7, |
| 4312:22, 4434:18 | 4310:5 | 4448:8, 4453:15, | 4333:15, 4355:15, | 4360:20, 4360:24, |
| microwaves [1] - | minor [5] - 4326:22, | 4463:15, 4474:7, | 4358:8, 4379:18, | 4362:18, 4362:22, |
| 4431:1 | 4419:18, 4421:12, | 4495:2, 4504:2, | 4380:21, 4399:1, | 4371:21, 4371:25, |
| mid-1900's [1] - | 4421:16, 4421:21 | 4513:6, 4527:18 | 4399:19, 4402:6, | 4372:2, 4388:23, |
| 4378:20 | minus [1] - 4516:6 | momentary [1] - | 4406:16, 4417:21, | 4389:1, 4393:6, |
| middle [4] - 4304:1, | minute [5] - 4291:1, | 4458:25 | 4424:12, 4424:20, | 4393:8, 4398:10, |
| 4304:25, 4469:2, | 4448:10, 4468:23, | moments [2] - | 4447:14, 4447:20, | 4398:14, 4400:18, |
| 4469:10 | 4475:8, 4502:20 | 4291:14, 4499:4 | 4464:11, 4467:8, | 4400:20, 4402:8, |
| Middle [4] - 4344:17, | minutes [4] - 4292:24, | monetary [1] - | 4482:5, 4508:4, | 4402:12, 4403:3, |
| 4345:3, 4345:14, | 4341:25, 4342:6, | 4516:17 | 4508:6, 4514:13, | 4405:4, 4405:5, |
| 4345:20 | 4433:21 | monetize [2] - | 4518:6, 4524:6 | 4414:4, 4414:7, |
| midway [1] - 4496:20 | mischaracterizes [1] - | 4516:22, 4541:9 | mostly [1] - 4288:19 | 4423:14, 4423:15, |
| might [38] - 4288:15, | 4360:21 | monetized [1] - | Motion [5] - 4343:12, | 4423:18, 4426:9, |
| 4288:16, 4288:23, | mischief [1] - 4492:18 | 4521:3 | 4344:24, 4344:25, | 4433:7, 4433:8, |
| 4289:1, 4293:15, | mislead [1] - 4413:14 | money [6] - 4470:2, | 4345:11, 4345:25 | 4433:12, 4433:21, |
| 4307:9, 4310:5, | misleading [2] - | 4472:7, 4499:5, | mouth [2] - 4404:10, | 4433:23, 4434:3, |
| 4318:17, 4330:10, | 4374:18, 4524:22 | 4500:15, 4538:20, | 4420:14 | 4434:4, 4434:8, |
| 4332:15, 4332:16, | miss [3] - 4547:15, | 4538:25 | move [8] - 4303:22, | 4434:23, 4435:9, |
| 4412:7, 4412:18, | 4547:16, 4547:17 | money's [1] - 4547:12 | 4305:4, 4306:22, | 4435:17, 4435:19, |
| 4425:22, 4428:18, | missing [1] - 4532:23 | monitor [1] - 4401:10 | 4353:6, 4442:9, | 4435:22, 4436:4, |
| 4433:17, 4436:14, | mistaken [1] - 4445:10 | monitoring [1] - | 4485:13, 4496:9, | 4436:13, 4436:20, |
| 4438:8, 4439:17, | MIT [1] - 4540:7 | 4379:24 | 4507:8 | 4502:21, 4504:18, |
| 4441:13, 4444:11, | Mitchell [2] - 4460:6, | month [3] - 4288:11, | moves [1] - 4453:12 | 4507:6, 4507:10, |
| 4451:8, 4464:11, | 4461:7 | 4504:3, 4504:14 | movie [1] - 4336:15 | 4507:16, 4507:20, |
| 4470:14, 4477:13, | mix [2] - 4306:24, | monthly [2] - 4397:4, | moving [5] - 4297:22, | 4509:20, 4509:24, |
| 4486:16, 4489:22, | 4494:21 | 4459:18 | 4304:14, 4452:20, | 4530:2, 4530:4, |
| 4493:17, 4493:18, | mix-up [1] - 4306:24 | months [7] - 4401:3, | 4484:7, 4528:2 | 4531:17, 4534:10, |
| 4493:24, 4496:17, | model [27] - 4316:25, | 4421:8, 4421:25, | MR [131] - 4288:4, | 4534:12, 4534:13, |
| 4498:1, 4499:6, | 4328:2, 4374:7, | 4460:21, 4460:22, | 4288:14, 4289:6, | 4539:19, 4544:12, |
| 4499:8, 4500:3, | 4374:8, 4374:9, | 4460:23, 4530:21 | 4290:13, 4290:14, | 4544:14, 4544:17, |
| 4537:21, 4541:10, | 4409:19, 4409:23, | morning [25] - 4288:2, | 4290:16, 4292:12, | 4545:1, 4545:3, |
| 4543:4 | 4410:1, 4416:17, | 4288:4, 4288:24, | 4293:2, 4293:14, | 4545:9, 4546:9, |
| Mike [1] - 4347:3 | 4429:15, 4429:17, | 4288:25, 4289:14, | 4293:15, 4302:10, | 4548:14, 4548:16 |
| Miles [4] - 4336:9, | 4429:18, 4429:24, | 4289:17, 4290:14, | 4302:15, 4302:17, | MS [30] - 4289:5, |
| 4375:1, 4375:14, | 4430:12, 4430:13, | 4290:15, 4291:5, | 4303:13, 4303:15, | 4293:20, 4293:22, |
| 4375:23 | 4430:20, 4430:23, | 4293:20, 4293:21, | 4303:22, 4304:4, | 4294:23, 4295:1, |
| miles [1] - 4527:23 | 4431:4, 4431:10, | 4302:15, 4302:16, | 4304:13, 4304:20, | 4295:8, 4295:13, |
| Miller [1] - 4461:7 | 4532:6, 4532:7, | 4308:22, 4312:2, | 4305:3, 4305:11, | 4295:19, 4296:1, |
| million [17] - 4379:20, | 4532:9, 4532:11, | 4312:3, 4313:21, | 4305:18, 4305:23, | 4296:11, 4296:20, 4297:1, 4297:10, |
| 4379:21, 4390:19, | 4532:24, 4532:25, | 4313:22, 4314:10, | 4306:4, 4306:14, | 4297:17, 4297:10, 4297:17, 4297:22, |
| 4390:20, 4400:10, | 4533:17 | 4314:11, 4322:15, | 4306:22, 4307:9, | 4297.17, 4297.22, 4298:7, 4298:13, |
| 4508:16, 4511:3, | Model [1] - 4297:4 | 4330:1, 4352:8, | 4307:21, 4308:5, | 4298:19, 4299:3, |
| 4513:12, 4513:18, | modeling [5] - | 4362:14, 4367:5 | 4308:10, 4308:18, | 4290:19, 4299:3, |
| 4513:23, 4514:3, | 4409:11, 4497:20, | Mortality [1] - 4360:13 | 4309:6, 4309:14, | 4300:2, 4300:18, |
| 4516:2, 4516:7, | 4502:1, 4521:20 TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP .3, 43 10:4, | 4301:1, 4301:10, |
| | 1. | | 1 | ,, |
| <u> </u> | - Iv | Iason & Lockha | 1 L L | |

4425:14 4301:21, 4302:1, 4471:24 4391:16, 4396:3, 4351:11, 4434:5, 4302:6, 4314:3, necessary [2] -4400:18, 4403:3, 4434:7, 4548:17 **nutrition** [1] - 4368:13 4436:18 4369:8, 4523:25 4446:7, 4446:8, **notes** [1] - 4549:5 Mullin [1] - 4480:4 need [20] - 4291:23, 4451:13, 4457:5, nothing [8] - 4312:19, 0 multi [1] - 4547:18 4292:4, 4292:5, 4457:9, 4457:13, 4371:21, 4423:14, o'clock [1] - 4541:17 multi-talented [1] -4457:17, 4458:3, 4292:25, 4323:13, 4433:8. 4434:15. oath [1] - 4336:6 4339:20, 4352:12, 4479:23. 4485:14. 4534:5, 4540:14, 4547:18 Obama [2] - 4378:25, 4486:11, 4489:3, multiple [6] - 4330:7, 4382:25, 4390:2, 4540:16 4539:1 4489:24, 4497:5 4381:23, 4390:11, 4391:1, 4394:16, notice [1] - 4494:17 object [6] - 4291:21, 4428:14, 4487:8, 4395:12, 4397:18, nice [4] - 4436:5, noticed [2] - 4309:18, 4350:21, 4351:6, 4401:20, 4409:5, 4436:6, 4495:16, 4537:19 4421:24 4353:1, 4353:3, 4424:13, 4436:11, 4547:19 mussel [2] - 4328:19, notoriously [1] -4545:6 4516:18 4463:12, 4477:6, Nicholas [1] - 4300:8 4358:6 objection [3] -4492:8 night [1] - 4371:12 November [5] -4289:24, 4291:2, needed [2] - 4400:1, nine [2] - 4382:22, 4295:11, 4301:13, Ν 4360:20 4453:4 4420:2 4344:18, 4347:3, naive [1] - 4536:12 objections [1] needs [3] - 4401:21, NOAA [17] - 4298:2, 4349:20 name [16] - 4293:22, 4351:2 4455:24, 4467:1 4308:7, 4364:23, Number [2] - 4286:8, 4302:17, 4312:23, objective [1] - 4428:24 negative [2] - 4498:8, 4365:14, 4369:22, 4287:2 4312:24, 4312:25, observation [2] -4516:7 4413:24, 4422:10, number [42] -4372:9, 4372:11, 4326:2, 4335:15 negligible [2] -4422:21, 4422:25, 4292:18, 4303:17, 4373:10, 4434:19, observations [7] -4391:13, 4410:25 4423:8, 4423:11, 4307:25, 4308:6, 4434:20, 4434:21, 4323:3, 4350:17, negotiations [1] -4423:22, 4423:24, 4310:12, 4316:20, 4434:22, 4437:9, 4362:8, 4370:13, 4424:4, 4424:10, 4548:10 4343:4, 4343:14, 4437:17, 4495:7, 4371:1, 4373:8, 4424:17, 4425:1 neighbors [1] -4343:22, 4347:14, 4506:22 4409:10 4504:13 **NOAA's** [1] - 4422:14 4381:2, 4387:2. named [4] - 4306:10, **obtain** [1] - 4470:3 noncompliance [4] -4389:4, 4389:16, Nelson [1] - 4313:1 4318:8, 4371:11, obtained [1] - 4421:5 4495:23, 4496:2, **NESPAL** [3] - 4459:4, 4394:2, 4394:5, 4549:9 obtaining [1] -4496:6, 4497:19 4394:20, 4405:17, 4459:8, 4459:20 namely [1] - 4529:10 4478:22 net [2] - 4461:20, nongovernmental [1] 4409:6, 4439:25, names [2] - 4319:24, obviously [2] -- 4379:7 4447:18, 4447:19, 4516:5 4320:4 4303:17, 4433:23 nonirrigated [8] -4460:3, 4460:7, never [11] - 4336:12, narrowly [1] - 4506:11 occasion [2] -4340:22, 4340:25, 4462:24, 4463:3, 4467:1, 4469:11, narrowly-focused [1] 4317:11, 4493:22 4476:12, 4477:9, 4477:7, 4481:18, 4401:18, 4408:1, - 4506:11 4482:2, 4484:4. occurred [3] -4480:12, 4523:17, 4408:22, 4412:8, Natalie [1] - 4314:1 4334:16, 4338:3, 4412:17, 4439:18, 4524:25, 4543:23 4494:18, 4504:12, **NATALIE** [1] - 4285:18 4420:7 4486:5, 4524:3 nonprofessional [1] -4515:5, 4519:20, **Nathan** [1] - 4534:6 4524:21, 4525:19, occurrences [1] -4476:24 nevertheless [1] national [2] - 4472:18, 4310:16 4532:10, 4536:16, nonuse [8] - 4534:16, 4492:2 4547:8 occurs [2] - 4424:24, 4536:18, 4536:21, new [5] - 4350:18, 4534:17, 4534:20, **National** [3] - 4458:17, 4464:2 4542:8 4351:6, 4424:8, 4534:25, 4535:9, 4461:25, 4475:11 numbered [1] -Ochlockonee [2] -4535:19, 4536:2, 4448:5, 4489:21 native [3] - 4378:23, 4371:19, 4459:13 4539:3 4294:16 newly [1] - 4489:15 4379:18, 4388:8 October [5] - 4337:20, **numbers** [31] **normal** [1] - 4410:9 newly-enacted [1] -Natural [1] - 4360:13 4362:1, 4382:18, 4292:2, 4294:18, normally [1] - 4515:23 4489:15 natural [17] - 4315:11, 4417:14, 4487:24 4298:20, 4299:15, Norman's [1] - 4320:3 next [47] - 4294:1, 4336:12, 4351:22, OF [4] - 4285:1, 4299:21, 4329:25, 4296:21, 4297:2, **north** [2] - 4320:2, 4285:3, 4285:6, 4377:14, 4392:6, 4398:9, 4399:25, 4320:3 4297:11, 4298:9, 4398:24, 4408:8, 4285:9 4403:22, 4428:16, Northern [3] - 4343:4, 4298:13, 4298:20, 4505:5, 4505:9, offered [1] - 4409:2 4442:3, 4456:8, 4346:4, 4346:21 4299:5, 4299:22, 4505:25, 4506:2, 4481:15, 4482:16, offering [1] - 4406:19 4301:17, 4305:4, northern [1] - 4319:25 4506:4, 4510:8, 4484:21, 4502:8, Office [2] - 4511:6 4306:7, 4306:14, Notary [2] - 4285:15, 4535:10, 4537:2, 4502:17, 4503:1, 4307:24, 4308:5, **office** [1] - 4364:23 4549:2 4539:3, 4539:10 4503:2, 4520:23, official [2] - 4308:8, 4308:10, 4343:10, note [5] - 4306:23, naturally [3] -4521:1, 4521:4, 4389:6 4343:18, 4344:4, 4323:7, 4350:15, 4407:10, 4407:14,

officials [3] - 4322:8,

4323:4, 4335:15

old [1] - 4479:18

OMB [2] - 4511:8,

4538:23

4353:18, 4489:22

noted [2] - 4368:9,

Noted [7] - 4307:18, 4360:12, 4390:5 THE REPORTING GROUP **al** [2] - 4361:10,

4389:18

4344:21, 4345:7,

4345:16, 4345:23,

4346:8, 4346:15,

4347:7, 4360:2,

4407:15

Nature [1] - 4379:8

near [1] - 4326:18

necessarily [1] -

4529:9, 4530:15,

4531:9, 4531:13,

4531:21, 4532:12,

4533:1, 4533:12

| once [3] - 4292:23, |
|--|
| 4375:6, 4469:15 |
| one [123] - 4289:15, |
| 4290:2, 4290:20, |
| 4291:5, 4293:16, |
| 4305:18, 4309:18, |
| 4309:21, 4310:11, |
| 4310:15, 4317:11, |
| 4317:24, 4319:15, |
| 4321:3, 4323:15, |
| 4324:15, 4324:19, |
| 4325:8, 4327:7, |
| 4328:22, 4330:18, |
| 4336:19, 4350:15, |
| 4355:23, 4365:19, |
| 4367:4, 4367:24, |
| 4370:25, 4374:23, |
| 4375:23, 4377:24, |
| 4379:14, 4381:10, |
| 4382:2, 4382:5, |
| 4383:15, 4384:2, |
| 4384:19, 4385:6, |
| 4386:13, 4386:21, |
| 4388:18, 4389:12, |
| 4389:14, 4392:9, |
| 4392:14, 4395:19, |
| 4396:9, 4396:12, |
| 4396:16, 4397:15, |
| 4400:9, 4401:12, |
| 4406:2, 4407:9, |
| 4408:3, 4408:7, |
| 4410:10, 4412:18, 4412:21, 4413:11, |
| 4412.21, 4413.11, 4415:3, 4415:9, |
| 4421:8, 4428:10, |
| 4442:22, 4444:15, |
| 4451:15, 4451:25, |
| 4452:11, 4462:11, |
| 4462:16, 4463:17, |
| 4464:12, 4466:13, |
| 4469:21, 4474:24, |
| 4475:16, 4477:21, |
| 4477:22, 4478:5, |
| 4478:8, 4479:12, |
| 4479:14, 4479:15, |
| 4479:22, 4479:24, |
| 4482:5, 4484:13, |
| 4486:24, 4488:8, |
| 4490:1, 4492:19, |
| 4501:13, 4503:9, |
| 4503:13, 4504:21, |
| 4505:12, 4511:19, |
| 4513:16, 4514:6, |
| 4514:13, 4514:15, |
| 4515:3, 4515:22, |
| 4518:1, 4518:15, |
| 4518:17, 4520:21, |
| 4523:11, 4523:13, |
| 4526:25, 4529:1, |
| 4534:5, 4536:1, |
| 4539:20, 4547:8, |
| I |

4547:9, 4548:6 one-half [1] - 4392:14 one-third [1] -4464:12 one-year [4] -4477:21, 4477:22, 4478:5, 4478:8 ones [10] - 4320:25, 4385:7, 4396:9, 4404:11, 4408:3, 4447:21, 4501:7, 4501:10, 4513:17, 4546:5 ongoing [1] - 4478:1 open [5] - 4373:1, 4425:12, 4438:1, 4541:23, 4548:10 opening [2] - 4289:20, 4506:23 operations [2] -4440:9, 4476:24 opined [1] - 4455:10 **opinion** [10] - 4357:6, 4363:14, 4363:17, 4399:14, 4406:19, 4412:1, 4438:7, 4467:17, 4511:14, 4537:1 opinions [2] -4370:10, 4409:2 opportune [1] -4435:24 opportunity [12] -4288:21, 4339:13, 4339:18, 4350:21, 4351:6, 4352:18, 4352:19, 4375:8, 4435:1, 4488:8, 4539:11, 4545:6 opposed [1] - 4524:24 opposite [1] - 4410:21 optimal [3] - 4324:1, 4324:2, 4324:3 option [4] - 4480:20, 4481:5, 4483:16, 4484:14 options [1] - 4484:13 orally [1] - 4309:20 Order [2] - 4379:1, 4539:2 order [11] - 4294:13, 4303:4, 4310:6, 4388:14, 4411:9, 4424:6, 4470:3, 4478:16, 4510:12, 4516:6, 4523:8 organism [2] -

4324:23, 4432:23

organisms [5] -

4392:7, 4412:6, 4427:19 organize [1] - 4468:18 organs [1] - 4432:5 orient [1] - 4390:16 original [3] - 4337:8, 4465:12, 4465:14 Original [1] - 4285:1 otherwise [6] -4315:2, 4358:20, 4380:3, 4392:23, 4408:15, 4492:18 ought [3] - 4491:15, 4500:9, 4538:15 outcome [1] - 4549:8 outdoor [4] - 4503:15, 4503:19, 4504:7, 4513:14 outer [2] - 4336:11, 4375:1 output [5] - 4473:19, 4508:7, 4508:16, 4508:20, 4509:4 outside [1] - 4427:8 ovens [1] - 4431:1 overall [4] - 4330:5, 4380:5, 4473:19, 4500.8 overharvest [1] -4382:4 overharvesting [6] -4370:11, 4376:18, 4402:1, 4405:20, 4405:23, 4405:24 overwatering [1] -4527:3 own [4] - 4446:14, 4501:11, 4520:14, 4537:8 owned [1] - 4321:7 Oyster [11] - 4296:13, 4298:1. 4300:6. 4305:7, 4308:24, 4325:14, 4325:17, 4327:17, 4354:21, 4364:8, 4366:6 oyster [134] - 4293:6, 4294:6, 4295:4, 4296:5, 4296:14, 4312:7, 4314:25, 4315:7, 4315:9, 4315:23, 4319:15, 4319:18, 4320:13, 4320:18, 4321:13, 4322:10, 4322:13, 4323:20, 4323:25, 4324:1, 4324:4, 4324:10, 4325:4, 4326:8, 4327:9,

4334:4, 4334:11, 4338:2, 4341:8, 4341:12, 4341:13, 4341:20, 4351:18, 4353:13, 4354:2, 4355:23, 4358:13, 4359:15, 4359:18, 4359:25, 4360:9, 4360:19, 4363:16, 4363:23, 4365:24, 4366:11, 4366:19, 4367:16, 4368:4, 4372:13, 4373:1, 4373:17, 4373:21, 4373:24, 4373:25, 4374:6, 4376:7, 4376:10, 4378:7, 4378:12, 4378:17, 4378:19, 4378:23, 4379:2, 4379:14, 4379:18, 4379:19, 4379:23, 4380:2, 4380:4, 4380:7, 4380:19, 4381:12, 4382:24, 4383:9, 4383:25, 4385:12, 4386:3, 4386:4, 4386:12, 4388:6, 4389:6, 4390:24, 4391:6, 4392:4, 4392:9, 4392:14, 4393:14, 4395:5, 4399:4, 4399:11, 4399:14, 4399:20, 4400:10, 4400:11, 4401:14, 4403:9, 4404:1, 4406:21, 4407:25, 4409:23, 4410:25, 4412:5, 4413:4, 4416:21, 4416:22, 4419:16, 4419:21, 4420:3, 4420:9, 4420:16, 4420:23, 4422:11, 4423:8, 4432:9, 4432:10 oystering [2] -4371:13, 4516:21 oysterman [2] -4340:21, 4395:17 oystermen [6] -4320:11, 4320:15, 4403:25, 4404:6, 4389:22, 4389:2 THE REPORTING GROUP s [67] - 4311:24,

4328:17, 4328:24,

4330:20, 4331:19,

4331:21, 4331:24,

4332:7, 4332:14,

4333:16, 4333:17,

4333:4, 4333:6,

4312:12, 4315:16, 4328:20, 4330:23, 4331:12, 4332:11, 4332:15, 4332:16, 4333:1, 4333:19, 4333:22, 4336:18, 4341:13. 4374:3. 4376:11, 4376:13, 4376:15, 4377:19, 4379:21, 4382:24, 4383:23, 4384:16, 4384:18, 4388:8, 4388:12, 4388:14, 4390:2, 4392:7, 4392:11, 4392:12, 4392:19, 4392:22, 4395:4, 4395:21, 4396:10, 4396:21, 4397:14, 4397:22, 4399:1, 4399:5, 4399:23, 4400:3, 4400:8, 4401:13, 4402:2, 4402:5, 4404:9, 4407:8, 4407:22, 4408:13, 4411:22, 4412:2, 4412:14, 4413:6, 4414:18, 4414:23, 4420:2, 4431:24, 4432:16, 4514:20, 4514:25, 4515:5, 4534:19, 4540:18

Ρ

p.m [6] - 4351:9, 4351:11, 4362:1, 4434:5, 4434:7, 4548:17 Pacific [1] - 4409:23 page [166] - 4294:18, 4295:23, 4296:8, 4296:17, 4296:18, 4296:22, 4296:24, 4297:4, 4297:5, 4297:7, 4297:11, 4297:12, 4297:14, 4297:18, 4298:4, 4298:8, 4298:9, 4298:11, 4298:20, 4299:1, 4299:8, 4299:15, 4299:17, 4299:21, 4299:25, 4300:14, 4303:18, 4304:2, 4304:8, 4304:11, 4304:15, 4305:1, 4305:13, 4305:16, 4305:18, 4305:19, 4305:25, 4306:5, 4306:9, 4306:17, 4307:1,

| 4309:4, 4311:6, | 4287:2 | 4411:17, 4424:9, | Paths [1] - 4308:25 | 4519:22 |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--|--------------------------------------|
| 4314:21, 4315:6, | pages [10] - 4294:21, | 4425:5, 4430:16, | Patricia [2] - 4348:8, | percent [78] - 4336:12, |
| 4315:14, 4315:21, | 4311:5, 4321:25, | 4433:3, 4438:4, | 4349:8 | 4378:21, 4396:21, |
| 4318:23, 4318:25, | 4336:22, 4358:25, | 4448:14, 4471:18, | pattern [5] - 4382:23, | 4403:23, 4406:10, |
| 4322:5, 4323:2, | 4366:2, 4369:21, | 4476:19, 4478:13, | 4384:17, 4429:6, | 4406:11, 4406:12, |
| 4325:23, 4326:9, | 4459:15, 4490:11, | 4513:7, 4520:5, | 4429:8, 4429:9 | 4406:17, 4410:13, |
| 4327:21, 4328:10, | 4549:4 | 4536:4, 4542:8 | pause [2] - 4337:10, | 4410:14, 4410:15, |
| 4329:25, 4330:2, | paid [4] - 4471:15, | partially [1] - 4341:5 | 4476:15 | 4410:16, 4410:24, |
| 4335:20, 4335:23, | 4471:16, 4474:8 | participants [1] - | pay [6] - 4470:2, | 4411:3, 4411:5, |
| 4335:24, 4336:1, | Panday [1] - 4502:6 | 4449:16 | 4471:8, 4472:3, | 4411:8, 4411:11, |
| 4339:25, 4340:4, | Panday's [1] - 4502:7 | participate [1] - | 4472:8, 4504:3, | 4411:13, 4439:20, |
| 4340:5, 4340:8, | paper [7] - 4298:17, | 4537:3 | 4504:13 | 4452:1, 4452:16, |
| 4340:10, 4351:21, | 4299:14, 4300:9, | participating [1] - | paying [3] - 4471:5, | 4455:12, 4456:4, |
| 4351:24, 4352:2, | 4300:13, 4309:3, | 4479:4 | 4471:22, 4472:2 | 4462:23, 4462:24, |
| 4352:3, 4353:17, | 4352:7, 4352:10 | particular [38] - | payments [5] - | 4463:3, 4463:8, |
| 4354:6, 4356:18, 4356:23, 4358:1, | paragraph [55] - | 4289:17, 4290:6, | 4498:23, 4499:1, | 4464:24, 4464:25, |
| 4359:7, 4359:16, | 4297:7, 4298:25, | 4306:8, 4307:1, | 4499:16, 4499:17, | 4465:1, 4465:2, 4465:15, 4465:17, |
| 4359:17, 4359:19, | 4299:6, 4304:1, | 4318:24, 4325:10, | 4500:5 | 4465:25, 4466:1, |
| 4359:21, 4360:2, | 4305:15, 4308:16, | 4325:22, 4327:22, | Payne [1] - 4301:4 | 4466:2, 4466:15, |
| 4361:10, 4361:25, | 4311:7, 4314:21, 4315:6, 4315:13, | 4329:3, 4334:2, 4334:21, 4353:16, | Peanut [1] - 4461:25 | 4473:11, 4473:13, |
| 4363:18, 4364:2, | 4315:21, 4322:5, | 4362:19, 4363:6, | peanut [8] - 4443:5, | 4473:19, 4473:24, |
| 4365:18, 4367:6, | 4323:2, 4327:23, | 4370:7, 4382:13, | 4443:23, 4443:25, 4462:16, 4462:18, | 4474:6, 4503:20, |
| 4367:20, 4369:22, | 4330:4, 4340:1, | 4384:24, 4395:18, | 4462:19, 4462:21, | 4503:23, 4513:15, |
| 4370:1, 4371:5, | 4340:6, 4340:8, | 4405:18, 4417:13, | 4525:6 | 4522:5, 4522:6, |
| 4372:20, 4372:21, | 4340:11, 4351:20, | 4428:7, 4429:24, | peanuts [15] - | 4522:15, 4522:16, |
| 4381:1, 4385:23, | 4351:24, 4351:25, | 4440:14, 4445:21, | 4439:12, 4439:17, | 4523:4, 4525:3, |
| 4393:7, 4396:3, | 4353:17, 4354:5, | 4447:3, 4447:12, | 4439:21, 4461:7, | 4525:5, 4527:7, |
| 4405:12, 4405:16, | 4356:21, 4358:24, | 4455:18, 4458:14, | 4463:8, 4465:1, | 4529:3, 4529:4, |
| 4409:15, 4409:16, | 4359:9, 4363:18, | 4484:25, 4485:4, | 4465:2, 4465:16, | 4529:5, 4529:11, |
| 4409:17, 4415:20, | 4363:24, 4363:25, | 4500:23, 4503:9, | 4498:7, 4498:12, | 4529:12, 4530:23, |
| 4415:23, 4415:24, | 4365:19, 4367:7, | 4506:4, 4506:6, | 4498:14, 4521:16, | 4530:24, 4530:25, |
| 4417:17, 4418:1, | 4367:21, 4370:1, | 4506:18, 4515:25, | 4521:25, 4522:5, | 4532:2, 4532:13, |
| 4418:4, 4418:14, | 4372:23, 4372:24, | 4533:16, 4535:19 | 4542:22 | 4532:19, 4532:21, |
| 4418:23, 4421:2, | 4373:7, 4409:16, | particularly [8] - | peculiar [1] - 4498:6 | 4543:17 |
| 4422:21, 4423:20, | 4445:22, 4446:8, | 4330:6, 4448:3, | penultimate [1] - | percentage [8] - |
| 4425:13, 4425:17, | 4448:10, 4448:11, | 4451:23, 4452:22, | 4305:14 | 4522:4, 4523:21, |
| 4438:22, 4439:2, 4439:5, 4439:6, | 4451:13, 4453:2, | 4487:3, 4496:2, | people [15] - 4320:21, | 4524:23, 4527:13, |
| 4440:11, 4441:8, | 4453:8, 4453:9, | 4508:2, 4536:7 | 4320:23, 4323:8, | 4530:9, 4533:2, 4533:9, 4533:11 |
| 4442:9, 4442:11, | 4468:25, 4469:1, 4469:6, 4489:9, | parties [5] - 4303:1, 4310:7, 4311:18, | 4401:9, 4424:20, | percentages [1] - |
| 4442:17, 4443:12, | 4492:20, 4516:13, | 4350:16, 4547:9 | 4466:18, 4470:9, | 4543:23 |
| 4443:17, 4449:11, | 4535:8 | parts [11] - 4324:5, | 4476:25, 4508:13, | perfect [2] - 4467:7, |
| 4449:15, 4449:18, | paragraphs [5] - | 4334:9, 4335:4, | 4514:24, 4536:6, | 4543:13 |
| 4449:19, 4450:5, | 4321:24, 4445:8, | 4335:6, 4352:7, | 4538:8, 4546:21, 4546:24, 4547:17 | perfectly [4] - 4464:7, |
| 4450:15, 4451:6, | 4445:20, 4469:9, | 4367:4, 4375:22, | Per [1] - 4357:14 | 4466:8, 4466:24, |
| 4452:20, 4455:19, | 4490:14 | 4401:1, 4462:6, | per [31] - 4324:5, | 4467:7 |
| 4457:5, 4457:8, | pardon [3] - 4493:18, | 4484:11, 4504:1 | 4355:18, 4355:21, | perform [3] - 4383:2, |
| 4457:9, 4457:13, | 4521:21, 4541:1 | party [1] - 4306:25 | 4355:23, 4358:5, | 4488:17, 4512:20 |
| 4457:17, 4457:18, | paren [1] - 4373:1 | pass [4] - 4457:12, | 4395:21, 4430:12, | performance [2] - |
| 4458:3, 4458:6, | part [33] - 4288:16, | 4457:20, 4519:17, | 4456:17, 4456:23, | 4394:8, 4395:14 |
| 4462:15, 4468:8, | 4290:10, 4296:21, | 4539:19 | 4457:25, 4458:12, | performed [2] - |
| 4469:1, 4469:2, | 4298:2, 4298:20, | passage [1] - 4398:25 | 4460:3, 4460:8, | 4321:20, 4420:22 |
| 4469:3, 4469:10, | 4299:5, 4301:16, | passed [3] - 4294:9, | 4473:1, 4475:18, | performing [1] - |
| 4480:5, 4483:14, | 4319:25, 4327:16, | 4362:14, 4539:23 | 4476:5, 4478:10, | 4489:19 |
| 4484:6, 4484:14, | 4334:21, 4335:25, | passing [1] - 4441:17 | 4479:25, 4498:8, | perhaps [11] - |
| 4488:22, 4490:4, 4490:15, 4496:16, | 4347:19, 4365:3, | past [4] - 4337:11, | 4504:3, 4508:7, | 4288:24, 4318:16, |
| 4496:21, 4497:25, | 4393:12, 4401:2, | 4407:1, 4455:2, | 4508:16, 4509:10, | 4334:22, 4341:24, |
| 4500:22, 4522:8 | 4401:6, 4403:6, | 4495:23 | 4511:3, 4514:4, | 4342:23, 4442:19, |
| Page [2] - 4286:8, | 4403:12, 4409:1 _{THI} | E REPORTING G | ROUP :2, 4519:7, | 4454:17, 4488:2, |
| 3 (-) | 1./ | • Mason & Lockha | r+ | |
| | Iv. | ιαρυπ α LUCKIId | U | 94 of 107 she |
| | | - | | |

| | • | T | I | Т |
|------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 4505:22, 4532:23, | 4364:21, 4380:5 | Pine's [2] - 4397:2, | plotted [2] - 4531:14, | 4399:11, 4406:1, |
| 4548:8 | personnel [2] - | 4397:3 | 4531:23 | 4406:9, 4406:12, |
| period [20] - 4354:12, | 4365:14, 4493:14 | pine's [2] - 4295:2, | plus [3] - 4404:21, | 4406:16, 4407:18, |
| 4354:13, 4354:14, | perspective [2] - | 4304:17 | 4469:9, 4481:1 | 4408:18, 4410:7, |
| 4355:2, 4355:6, | 4491:8, 4535:4 | piqued [1] - 4487:5 | poached [1] - 4380:2 | 4410:12, 4410:16, |
| 4382:17, 4382:18, | persuade [1] - 4290:2 | place [5] - 4383:20, | pockets [1] - 4538:17 | 4528:3, 4528:4 |
| 4382:19, 4386:21, | pertains [5] - 4303:25, | 4401:23, 4466:22, | Point [1] - 4319:15 | population-wide [1] - |
| 4387:16, 4387:23, | 4305:14, 4307:24, | 4521:1, 4524:11 | point [28] - 4291:24, | 4363:22 |
| 4389:7, 4389:21, | 4376:5, 4387:22 | places [2] - 4380:1, | 4311:9, 4312:6, | populations [2] - |
| 4390:15, 4393:2, | Petes [9] - 4329:9, | 4403:15 | 4328:11, 4329:3, | 4407:16, 4529:22 |
| 4398:18, 4417:1, | 4329:11, 4364:18, | Plaintiff [1] - 4285:4 | 4341:24, 4370:12, | Populations [1] - |
| 4422:2, 4422:3 | 4364:20, 4365:15, | plan [4] - 4291:5, | 4374:23, 4375:21, | 4366:6 |
| periods [3] - 4382:16, | 4367:25, 4405:8, | 4497:1, 4497:6, | 4379:12, 4384:20, | portfolio [2] - 4404:2, |
| 4383:5, 4387:4 | 4405:18, 4405:24 | 4497:8 | 4428:7, 4428:9, | 4404:19 |
| permanent [2] - | Petes's [4] - 4365:25, | Plan [2] - 4449:7, | 4432:13, 4456:14, | portion [9] - 4298:10, |
| 4469:18, 4478:18 | 4366:3, 4366:12, | 4496:24 | 4462:11, 4463:21, | 4299:24, 4301:14, |
| permanently [1] - | 4412:22 | plane [1] - 4545:15 | 4465:20, 4476:11, | 4301:23, 4307:7, |
| 4427:6 | Petrie [2] - 4480:2, | planning [1] - 4459:10 | 4483:8, 4493:7, | 4340:7, 4340:14, |
| permission [4] - | 4480:19 | plant [1] - 4455:25 | 4500:6, 4501:17, | 4355:16, 4507:3 |
| 4294:23, 4303:10, | Ph.D [6] - 4286:3, | planting [5] - 4390:14, | 4516:10, 4520:18, | portions [9] - 4295:23, |
| 4314:4, 4336:4 | 4286:4, 4286:5, | 4453:5, 4453:17, | 4522:19, 4526:25, | 4300:16, 4303:2, |
| permit [3] - 4388:25, | 4286:6, 4380:9, | 4453:19, 4454:2 | 4527:1 | 4322:21, 4339:6, |
| 4470:13, 4470:22 | 4380:12 | play [7] - 4289:16, | pointed [1] - 4374:1 | 4342:16, 4361:17, |
| permits [8] - 4447:6, | Phaneuf [4] - 4506:21, | 4291:5, 4294:2, | pointing [1] - 4524:12 | 4375:1, 4414:17 |
| 4447:8, 4447:11, | 4519:2, 4519:4, | 4302:2, 4302:11, | points [7] - 4384:19, | Portland [1] - 4285:13 |
| 4447:14, 4447:25, | 4534:24 | 4302:21, 4309:8 | 4396:7, 4423:24, | portrayed [1] - |
| 4448:5, 4497:6 | Phaneuf's [1] - | played [54] - 4290:9, | 4428:14, 4428:17, | 4495:16 |
| Permits [1] - 4480:10 | 4506:20 | 4294:14, 4295:7, | 4429:5, 4482:23 | pose [1] - 4381:19 |
| permitted [5] - 4470:9, | Phase [2] - 4345:1, | 4295:12, 4295:18, | policies [4] - 4506:5, | position [13] - 4377:1, |
| 4470:12, 4491:7, | 4345:12 | 4295:25, 4296:10, | 4506:7, 4510:24, | 4385:10, 4386:14, |
| 4491:11, 4492:3 | phenomenon [1] - | 4296:19, 4296:25, | 4520:14 | 4410:19, 4478:21, |
| permitting [3] - | 4506:4 | 4297:9, 4297:16, | policy [9] - 4467:11, | 4487:11, 4495:12, |
| 4447:5, 4448:17, | PHILIP [1] - 4285:17 | 4297:21, 4298:6, | 4489:14, 4494:25, | 4505:20, 4505:22, |
| 4494:9 | photographs [1] - | 4298:12, 4298:18, | 4496:3, 4510:11, | 4525:19, 4538:7, |
| Perry [10] - 4290:18, | 4391:20 | 4299:2, 4299:10, | 4510:12, 4510:16, | 4538:16, 4540:3 |
| 4291:10, 4293:2, | phrase [1] - 4448:9 | 4299:19, 4300:1, | 4520:20, 4543:7 | positions [1] - |
| 4435:21, 4506:10, | physiology [2] - | 4300:17, 4300:25, | Policy [1] - 4365:4 | 4381:23 |
| 4509:20, 4520:15, | 4324:22, 4432:4 | 4301:9, 4301:20, | political [1] - 4538:21 | positive [2] - 4520:6, |
| 4522:15, 4534:11, | pick [1] - 4482:22 | 4301:25, 4302:5, | poll [7] - 4536:5, | 4520:8 |
| 4546:23 | pictures [1] - 4373:23 | 4303:3, 4303:14, | 4536:6, 4536:11, | possibility [2] - |
| PERRY [25] - 4285:17, | Pierce [1] - 4547:24 | 4303:21, 4304:3, | 4537:10, 4537:12, | 4446:3, 4543:4 |
| 4288:4, 4288:14, | pilot [1] - 4456:1 | 4304:12, 4304:19, | 4538:15, 4539:6 | possible [11] - 4327:7, |
| 4289:6, 4290:13, | Pine [6] - 4286:3, | 4305:2, 4305:10, | polls [1] - 4479:15 | 4330:19, 4432:2, |
| 4293:15, 4307:9, | 4291:6, 4294:4, | 4305:17, 4305:22, | pond [1] - 4450:25 | 4433:25, 4441:11, |
| 4310:4, 4434:4, | 4349:19, 4349:21, | 4306:3, 4306:13, | ponds [8] - 4440:1, | 4455:10, 4467:9, |
| 4435:19, 4435:22, | 4361:20 | 4306:21, 4307:1, | 4440:2, 4450:20, | 4467:14, 4467:23, |
| 4436:4, 4436:13, | pine [27] - 4291:13, | 4308:4, 4308:9, | 4451:10, 4451:19, | 4467:25, 4483:7 |
| 4436:20, 4502:21, | 4295:10, 4295:16, | 4308:17, 4309:5, | 4452:1, 4452:14, | possibly [1] - 4545:23 |
| 4530:4, 4531:17, | 4295:22, 4296:4, | 4309:13, 4310:22, | 4452:17 | post [2] - 4384:7, |
| 4534:12, 4534:13, | 4296:6, 4296:16, | 4311:11, 4342:16, | population [32] - | 4398:21 |
| 4539:19, 4544:12, | 4297:12, 4298:16, | 4347:10, 4348:17, | 4316:25, 4322:13, | post-Hurricane [1] - |
| 4544:14, 4545:3, | 4299:13, 4300:8, | 4349:7, 4349:17, | 4331:19, 4332:8, | 4398:21 |
| 4545:9, 4548:14 | 4300:12, 4300:20, | 4349:22, 4350:4, | 4353:14, 4363:22, | potential [5] - |
| Perry's [1] - 4433:24 | 4300:21, 4301:4, | 4350:7 | 4378:23, 4379:14, | 4355:25, 4386:13, |
| person [3] - 4289:23, | 4301:12, 4302:2, | plays [1] - 4525:8 | 4379:20, 4385:12, | 4456:3, 4521:2 |
| 4549:8 | 4302:8, 4303:24, | plenty [1] - 4465:19 | 4394:20, 4394:22, | potentially [2] - |
| personal [2] - | 4304:16, 4311:2, | plot [2] - 4326:8, | 4395:1, 4395:15, | 4524:22, 4533:16 |
| 4310:12, 4424:25 | 4329:21, 4352:6, | 4326:11 | 4396:11, 4396:12, | poultry [2] - 4542:9, |
| personally [4] - | 4353:22, 4361:25, | plots [3] - 4464:6, | 4397:12, 4397:14, | 4542:12 |
| 4357:20, 4357:24, | 4387:10 TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP :16, 4398:3, | pounds [2] - 4521:21, |
| | 1.7 | • Nason & Lockha | ı rt | |
| 5 of 107 sheets | - IV. | idSOII & LOCKIIC | The | e Reporting Group (207) 797-60 |
| | | | | |

| 4521:22 |
|---|
| 4521:22 pouring [1] - 4492:25 |
| PowerPoint [1] - |
| 4296:3 |
| practice [1] - 4485:6 |
| practices [6] - 4440:4, |
| 4451:25, 4454:23, |
| 4455:2, 4514:1, |
| 4525:20 |
| Pratt [1] - 4505:1 |
| pre [2] - 4383:19, |
| 4384:7 |
| precipitation [1] - |
| 4531:6 |
| precise [1] - 4537:15 |
| precisely [2] - 4458:9, |
| 4472:20 |
| predation [25] - |
| 4315:16, 4324:17, |
| 4330:23, 4331:9, |
| 4334:16, 4335:8, |
| 4339:1, 4340:15, |
| 4360:18, 4361:11, |
| 4362:7, 4374:9, |
| 4382:4, 4382:7, |
| 4384:11, 4385:11, 4406:5, 4406:20, |
| 4407:24, 4408:20, |
| 4411:23, 4412:3, |
| 4414:9, 4414:11 |
| |
| ■ Pregation [1] - |
| Predation [1] - 4360:13 |
| 4360:13 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4335:14, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 prefiled [15] - 4335:14, 4336:25, 4421:1, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 prefiled [15] - 4335:14, 4336:25, 4421:1, 4438:6, 4444:6, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 prefiled [15] - 4335:14, 4336:25, 4421:1, 4438:6, 4444:6, 4444:16, 4448:19, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 prefiled [15] - 4335:14, 4336:25, 4421:1, 4438:6, 4444:6, 4444:16, 4448:19, 4481:21, 4481:22, |
| 4360:13 predator [3] - 4331:12, 4374:2, 4374:15 predators [8] - 4324:19, 4330:20, 4331:8, 4331:17, 4334:6, 4368:4, 4375:20, 4407:6 predict [4] - 4403:16, 4487:9, 4487:12, 4487:17 predicted [2] - 4288:10, 4514:18 predictions [3] - 4381:25, 4382:5, 4386:13 predictive [1] - 4332:7 prefer [3] - 4315:17, 4537:20, 4538:1 preference [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 preferred [1] - 4357:3 prefiled [15] - 4335:14, 4336:25, 4421:1, 4438:6, 4444:6, 4444:16, 4448:19, |

| 4500:23, 4501:10, 4531:22, 4538:13 |
|--|
| Preliminary [2] - |
| 4343:13, 4345:25 premium [1] - 4498:25 |
| preparation [1] - |
| 4438:12 prepare [2] - 4438:5, |
| 4527:14 |
| prepared [11] - |
| 4293:4, 4316:4, 4321:17, 4323:16, |
| 4325:17, 4329:4, |
| 4433:13, 4433:14, 4435:24, 4483:11, |
| 4507:6 |
| preparing [1] - 4326:11 |
| 4326.11 Preparing [2] - |
| 4488:14, 4488:22 |
| prepositioned [1] - 4436:8 |
| presence [2] - 4373:8, 4373:21 |
| present [3] - 4292:25, |
| 4421:1, 4478:17 |
| Present [1] - 4285:23 presentation [6] - |
| 4296:3, 4338:5, |
| 4338:10, 4339:7, |
| 4339:22, 4439:3 presented [2] - |
| 4329:8, 4519:14 |
| preserve [1] - 4517:14 |
| preserved [1] - 4518:19 |
| preserving [3] - |
| 4518:8, 4518:9, 4541:23 |
| president [1] - 4495:7 |
| President [1] - |
| 4378:25 press [5] - 4445:2, |
| 4445:10, 4445:11, |
| 4492:5, 4492:6 |
| pressure [5] - 4333:8, 4359:3, 4389:13, |
| 4389:14, 4395:5 |
| pretending [1] - 4538:6 |
| pretrial [1] - 4289:20 |
| pretty [2] - 4334:12, |
| 4546:5 prevalence [4] - |
| 4329:7, 4373:16, |
| 4373:19, 4413:7 |
| prevalent [4] - 4325:5, |

4331:5, 4331:15,

4427:22

```
previous [4] - 4301:6,
 4303:1. 4303:6.
 4520:5
previously [8] -
 4311:18, 4316:21,
 4390:8. 4390:19.
 4496:5, 4519:5,
 4520:9, 4520:19
price [5] - 4474:18,
 4474:22, 4478:10,
 4498:12, 4498:15
priced [1] - 4514:22
priceless [3] - 4539:5,
 4539:9, 4539:12
prices [5] - 4446:15,
 4475:8, 4477:5,
 4478:14, 4525:12
primarily [1] - 4342:22
primary [1] - 4374:2
prime [2] - 4379:23,
 4508:14
PRIMIS [33] - 4285:20,
 4290:14, 4290:16,
 4292:12, 4293:2,
 4293:14, 4302:10,
 4311:16, 4311:22,
 4342:11, 4350:19,
 4351:1, 4351:7,
 4433:12, 4433:21,
 4433:23, 4434:3,
 4434:8, 4434:23,
 4435:9, 4435:17,
 4504:18, 4507:6,
 4507:10, 4507:16,
 4507:20, 4509:20,
 4509:24, 4530:2,
 4534:10, 4544:17,
 4545:1, 4548:16
Primis [9] - 4293:16,
 4302:20, 4311:13,
 4435:23, 4533:25,
 4540:11, 4542:3,
 4544:16, 4546:24
principal [2] -
 4314:13, 4521:16
principle [1] - 4492:15
principles [2] -
 4323:24
Prins [1] - 4311:4
Prinz [1] - 4311:8
private [3] - 4341:8,
 4402:18, 4402:23
problem [2] - 4311:14,
 4397:25
problematic [1] -
 4358:6
problems [2] -
 4401:12, 4536:15
```

```
Proceeding [1] -
                                                    4548:18
                                                   proceeding [3] -
                                                    4375:2, 4375:14,
                                                    4379:11
                                                   PROCEEDINGS [2] -
                                                    4285:9, 4288:1
                                                   Proceedings [1] -
                                                    4549:6
                                                   process [4] - 4446:10,
                                                    4448:9, 4537:16,
                                                    4538:21
                                                   processor [1] -
                                                    4340:21
                                                   produce [1] - 4446:16
                                                   produced [2] -
                                                    4296:14, 4322:24
                                                   product [6] - 4403:23,
                                                    4404:16, 4472:16,
                                                    4472:18, 4528:10,
                                                    4528:12
                                                   production [8] -
                                                    4455:25, 4472:25,
                                                    4523:21, 4524:6,
                                                    4524:23, 4525:4,
                                                    4525:6, 4525:10
                                                   Production [1] -
                                                    4458:17
                                                   Productivity [1] -
                                                    4354:21
                                                   productivity [4] -
                                                    4315:3, 4481:25,
                                                    4482:10, 4527:11
                                                   Professor [9] -
                                                    4385:14, 4387:15,
                                                    4389:2, 4391:17,
                                                    4402:10, 4411:14,
                                                    4505:1, 4540:4,
                                                    4540:5
                                                   professor [10] -
                                                    4302:23, 4312:9,
                                                    4313:7, 4372:3,
                                                    4377:2, 4377:21,
                                                    4377:23, 4437:11,
                                                    4437:14, 4540:6
                                                   professors [4] -
                                                    4290:3, 4294:4,
                                                    4494:23, 4494:24
                                                   profile [1] - 4546:12
                                                   profit [7] - 4442:15,
                                                    4442:24, 4443:7,
                                                    4443:8, 4443:16,
                                                    4443:18, 4443:22
                                                   profitability [3] -
                                                    4513:13, 4514:24,
                                                    4525:11
                                                   profits [4] - 4443:23,
                                                    4443:25, 4453:24,
                                                    4475:5
prevent [1] - 4471: THE REPORTING GROUP IM [9] - 4328:15,
```

```
4328:18, 4328:20,
 4328:21, 4328:24,
 4364:23, 4417:12,
 4430:16, 4505:4
programs [3] - 4456:2,
 4472:5, 4472:6
prohibited [3] -
 4401:2, 4401:14,
 4471:25
project [2] - 4415:2,
 4438:25
projects [1] - 4456:2
Prolonged [1] -
 4360:3
promptly [1] - 4545:20
prone [1] - 4404:22
pronunciation [1] -
 4427:25
proper [1] - 4521:4
properly [1] - 4521:3
property [1] - 4537:22
proposal [4] -
 4288:17, 4463:22,
 4470:18. 4485:18
proposals [4] -
 4491:25, 4496:3,
 4496:4, 4510:24
proposed [15] -
 4288:18, 4466:6,
 4485:1, 4491:14,
 4506:5, 4506:7,
 4510:10, 4510:11,
 4512:11, 4513:9,
 4514:16, 4515:25,
 4516:8, 4519:20,
 4545:4
proposes [1] -
 4444:14
Protection [8] -
 4456:14, 4456:21,
 4483:23, 4487:2,
 4488:13, 4505:14,
 4505:19, 4511:11
protocol [1] - 4333:3
proves [7] - 4360:8,
 4363:15, 4365:23,
 4366:10, 4367:15,
 4368:22. 4370:5
provide [16] - 4292:17,
 4332:7, 4339:13,
 4339:18, 4347:14,
 4347:18, 4350:11,
 4352:18, 4391:17,
 4392:21, 4392:22,
 4397:22, 4401:22,
 4421:8, 4425:6,
 4514:13
provided [12] -
 4294:12, 4314:19,
 4314:20, 4338:11,
```

proceed [3] - 4293:5,

| | - | | | |
|--|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|
| 4346:13, 4350:8, | Q | R | 4332:21, 4333:4, | reasonable [1] - |
| 4357:1, 4372:16, | | | 4333:13, 4335:6, | 4388:2 |
| 4382:10, 4389:3, | quantified [1] - 4539:5 | rain [3] - 4288:6, | 4335:24, 4335:25, | reasons [4] - 4310:13, |
| 4499:20, 4515:11 | quantitative [1] - | 4288:10, 4522:13 | 4336:3, 4336:4, | 4412:21, 4497:22, |
| provides [1] - 4511:9 | 4401:24 | rainfall [4] - 4325:19, | 4336:23, 4337:24, | 4523:7 |
| provision [1] - 4357:1 | quantitatively [1] - | 4427:7, 4532:7, | 4338:22, 4339:1, | rebuttal [6] - 4288:18, |
| Public [2] - 4285:15, | 4541:14 | 4532:24 | 4339:5, 4339:25, | 4290:4, 4290:11, |
| 4549:2 | quarrel [3] - 4326:2, | raise [2] - 4312:14, | 4340:5, 4340:7, | 4290:23, 4293:18, |
| public [3] - 4414:23, | 4326:6, 4326:7 | 4434:10 | 4340:9, 4340:11, | 4545:4 |
| 4419:17, 4506:5 | quarter [1] - 4499:20 | raised [1] - 4384:20 | 4340:13, 4341:4, | rebutting [1] - 4290:6 |
| publication [6] - | queen [1] - 4377:19 | raising [1] - 4440:4 | 4356:20, 4357:25, | receive [2] - 4369:8, |
| 4300:10, 4353:9, | questioning [1] - | RALPH [1] - 4285:11 | 4359:9, 4359:18, | 4369:13 |
| 4367:24, 4417:22, | 4372:5 | ran [1] - 4501:19 | 4360:4, 4360:5, | received [1] - 4380:12 |
| 4475:12, 4475:16 | questions [27] - | range [7] - 4324:1, | 4360:14, 4361:12, | recent [2] - 4447:14, |
| publications [2] - | 4295:22, 4296:7, | 4324:2, 4324:3, | 4361:14, 4361:15, | 4452:12 |
| 4367:23, 4367:24 | 4296:16, 4297:2, | 4344:10, 4454:23, | 4362:3, 4362:23, | Recent [1] - 4364:9 |
| publicly [3] - 4338:2, | 4297:13, 4297:18, | 4459:19, 4477:3 | 4364:11, 4365:18, | recently [1] - 4490:24 |
| 4338:4, 4402:18 | 4298:17, 4298:24, | ranges [1] - 4413:2 | 4367:10, 4369:25, 4405:21, 4405:22, | Recess [3] - 4307:19, |
| publish [2] - 4290:3, | 4299:14, 4299:16, | ranked [1] - 4418:2 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 4351:10, 4434:6 |
| 4290:4 | 4300:13, 4300:14, | ranking [1] - 4418:2 | 4410:4, 4419:7, 4431:23, 4439:5, | recharge [1] - 4485:4 |
| published [2] - | 4300:22, 4301:6, | RAO [2] - 4285:18, | 4439:7, 4445:8, | recognize [6] - |
| 4416:10, 4517:6 | 4309:3, 4339:20, 4347:17, 4352:21, | 4314:3 | 4445:12, 4445:17, | 4370:19, 4441:18, |
| Pull [2] - 4312:22, | 4372:7, 4372:21, | Rao [1] - 4314:1 | 4449:24, 4453:15, | 4459:8, 4481:19, |
| 4434:18 | 4381:9, 4433:7, | rate [14] - 4390:20, | 4457:7, 4457:11, | 4483:7, 4491:5 |
| pump [1] - 4485:19 | 4489:3, 4506:11, | 4395:25, 4396:4, | 4457:13, 4457:18, | recognized [3] - |
| purchase [5] - | 4530:2, 4544:17, | 4396:15, 4396:19, | 4457:21, 4459:7, | 4390:24, 4436:16, |
| 4474:18, 4474:22, | 4544:18 | 4397:1, 4397:19, 4439:22, 4454:24, | 4462:6, 4469:6, | 4539:1 |
| 4475:7, 4478:9, | quick [1] - 4370:21 | 4455:1, 4455:7, | 4469:13, 4469:15, | recollection [9] - |
| 4517:20 | quickly [5] - 4452:20, | 4455:11, 4485:3, | 4489:8, 4490:14, | 4318:17, 4319:23, |
| purchases [1] - | 4485:12, 4487:23, | 4546:6 | 4490:17, 4494:7, | 4334:22, 4456:18, |
| 4537:22 | 4488:4, 4547:2 | rates [5] - 4332:17, | 4494:14, 4516:12, | 4456:25, 4458:7, |
| purple [1] - 4516:18 purplish [1] - 4394:11 | quite [15] - 4310:12, | 4397:5, 4397:6, | 4516:14, 4517:2, | 4472:23, 4478:19, 4519:1 |
| purpose [3] - 4332:5, | 4374:18, 4399:7, | 4397:8, 4441:11 | 4537:17 | recommend [1] - |
| 4332:6, 4413:15 | 4403:2, 4409:22, | rather [5] - 4464:13, | reading [6] - 4314:15, | 4535:25 |
| purposes [2] - | 4480:16, 4480:21, | 4466:15, 4514:16, | 4333:23, 4410:23, | recommendation [3] - |
| 4292:16, 4313:14 | 4482:2, 4484:4, | 4526:5, 4543:4 | 4425:16, 4448:11, | 4418:9, 4422:24, |
| pursuing [1] - 4380:9 | 4494:18, 4514:22, | ratio [3] - 4341:12, | 4468:25 | 4548:7 |
| put [31] - 4291:18, | 4515:16, 4529:10, | 4341:19, 4530:24 | ready [2] - 4293:4, | recommendations [1] |
| 4291:23, 4292:4, | 4532:13, 4533:16 | rational [1] - 4466:25 | 4353:5 | - 4417:20 |
| 4292:9, 4298:22, | quo [1] - 4510:14 | Ray [1] - 4356:13 | real [3] - 4479:15, | recommended [1] - |
| 4362:16, 4381:8, | quote [5] - 4336:7, | reach [8] - 4381:11, | 4480:10, 4492:3 | 4532:8 |
| 4389:2, 4391:1, | 4358:6, 4358:19, | 4388:2, 4388:19, | Real [1] - 4480:6 | recommending [2] - |
| 4392:20, 4397:23, | 4446:9, 4456:23 | 4422:19, 4424:7, | reality [1] - 4539:18 | 4535:23, 4535:24 |
| 4399:22, 4400:9, | Qureshi [3] - 4314:11, | 4426:1, 4515:19, | realize [1] - 4498:24 | reconciles [1] - |
| 4403:3, 4429:16, | 4351:16, 4393:16 | 4529:15 | really [16] - 4319:11, | 4478:5 |
| 4429:24, 4430:3, | QURESHI [21] - | reached [8] - 4314:13, | 4380:3, 4392:1, | record [28] - 4291:23, |
| 4430:6, 4430:7, | 4285:18, 4313:21, | 4321:21, 4353:12, | 4398:23, 4403:19, | 4292:4, 4292:10, |
| 4430:12, 4430:17, | 4313:23, 4314:4, | 4380:24, 4424:10, | 4430:20, 4430:22, | 4292:13, 4292:21, |
| 4430:20, 4430:23, | 4314:9, 4318:19, | 4515:21, 4525:23, | 4436:1, 4462:11, | 4292:22, 4306:23, |
| 4466:22, 4512:9, | 4318:22, 4341:23, | 4526:4 | 4471:4, 4504:2, | 4310:1, 4342:10, |
| 4527:18, 4529:24, | 4342:9, 4351:12, 4351:14, 4353:5, | reaches [1] - 4326:18 | 4506:21, 4538:4, 4547:4, 4547:17, | 4342:13, 4347:8, |
| 4534:11, 4542:13, | 4353:7, 4360:24, | read [82] - 4292:6, | 4548:1 | 4347:12, 4350:16, |
| 4542:15 | 4362:18, 4362:22, | 4311:3, 4311:8, | reappointed [1] - | 4374:21, 4389:19, |
| putting [4] - 4431:3, | 4371:21, 4414:7, | 4318:25, 4322:20, | 4505:15 | 4391:13, 4398:3, |
| 4492:14, 4503:25, | 4423:14, 4426:9, | 4322:21, 4323:13, | reason [6] - 4408:15, | 4398:6, 4398:7, |
| 4528:8 | 4433:8 | 4326:25, 4327:23, 4327:25, 4328:3, | 4429:2, 4432:9, | 4399:8, 4399:25, |
| | | 4327:25, 4328:3, 4328:6, 4328:11, | 4466:4, 4484:24, | 4401:6, 4425:17, |
| | mir. | | ROUP :9 | 4436:16, 4507:18, |
| | TH: | r velokitne e | ruur • | 4546:15, 4546:20, |

| | 1 | | 1 | |
|--|---|--|---|--------------------------------------|
| 4547:5 | 4376:7, 4380:2, | 4310:16, 4312:12, | release [3] - 4400:10, | replenishment [1] - |
| recover [1] - 4399:11 | 4414:24, 4416:21, | 4491:7, 4542:11 | 4445:2, 4445:10 | 4485:4 |
| recovered [2] - | 4419:18, 4419:19 | region [5] - 4417:7, | relevant [4] - 4294:19, | reply [1] - 4545:18 |
| 4398:4, 4399:15 | refer [17] - 4311:1, | 4507:25, 4509:8, | 4300:16, 4500:2, | Report [6] - 4296:14, |
| recovery [8] - 4295:4, | 4334:10, 4339:25, | 4517:21 | 4527:21 | 4298:1, 4305:7, |
| 4296:5, 4296:15, | 4358:24, 4361:1, | regional [5] - 4472:16, | reliable [1] - 4323:19 | 4325:15, 4325:18, |
| 4400:7, 4419:1, | 4363:24, 4372:11, | 4472:19, 4497:6, | reliance [1] - 4515:12 | 4327:17 |
| 4425:8, 4486:12, | 4372:13, 4380:25, | 4528:9, 4528:11 | relied [8] - 4316:22, | report [39] - 4305:9, |
| 4486:19 | 4385:22, 4405:6, | Regional [1] - 4496:23 | 4326:11, 4327:15, | 4316:4, 4316:7, |
| recreational [1] - | 4409:14, 4457:4, | regions [1] - 4459:10 | 4329:6, 4329:12, | 4317:9, 4321:16, |
| 4534:20 | 4481:17, 4513:11, | regulations [6] - | 4358:11, 4385:21, | 4328:8, 4329:10, |
| recross [2] - 4414:5, | 4534:16, 4536:11 | 4489:16, 4489:21, | 4424:4 | 4330:13, 4335:3, |
| 4426:8 | refereed [1] - 4517:6 | 4495:21, 4506:5, | Relief [1] - 4346:18 | 4337:8, 4337:13, |
| Recross [1] - 4286:2 | reference [12] - | 4506:7, 4511:2 | relief [4] - 4423:5, | 4338:15, 4341:1, |
| RECROSS [2] - | 4308:15, 4328:14, | Regulatory [1] - | 4424:12, 4424:23, | 4341:3, 4356:16, |
| 4414:6, 4530:3 | 4367:23, 4368:8, | 4511:7 | 4542:11 | 4359:15, 4359:18, |
| RECROSS- | 4371:6, 4374:24, | regulatory [4] - | relies [2] - 4354:24, | 4359:25, 4360:19, |
| EXAMINATION [2] - | 4376:5, 4391:4, | 4489:20, 4496:3, | 4355:2 | 4366:23, 4370:2, |
| 4414:6, 4530:3 | 4396:6, 4446:9, | 4511:5, 4511:17 | relieve [1] - 4545:13 | 4372:20, 4412:24, |
| recruitment [1] - | 4457:24, 4496:20 | Reheis [1] - 4487:21 | rely [3] - 4355:17, | 4417:6, 4444:5, |
| 4330:8 | Referenced [2] - | REIGSTAD [1] - | 4357:3, 4502:24 | 4450:23, 4455:16, |
| rectangle [1] - | 4286:8, 4287:2 referenced [4] - | 4285:22 | remain [1] - 4376:15 | 4455:19, 4462:6, 4481:20, 4482:4, |
| 4394:11 | | Reigstad [1] - 4507:13 | remainder [1] - 4307:4 | 4482:6, 4488:17, |
| red [10] - 4307:4, | 4292:2, 4372:10, 4374:16, 4393:17 | Reigstad's [1] - | remained [3] - 4397:1, | 4506:24, 4535:8, |
| 4382:13, 4383:8, | references [4] - | 4507:19 | 4420:9, 4430:19 | 4535:13, 4541:4, |
| 4383:15, 4384:12, | 4367:19, 4368:2, | reject [1] - 4385:13 | remaining [1] - | 4541:6, 4545:20 |
| 4384:24, 4390:18, 4403:7, 4513:5, | 4368:17, 4372:25 | relate [4] - 4298:24, 4299:6, 4299:24, | 4486:24 | reporter [3] - 4292:20, |
| 4534:4 | referred [10] - | 4299:0, 4299:24, 4489:4 | remains [2] - 4379:25, 4380:3 | 4342:12, 4435:4 |
| redact [1] - 4310:7 | 4334:11, 4334:12, | related [10] - 4295:22, | remarkable [1] - | Reporter [1] - 4549:16 |
| redacted [3] - | 4355:10, 4375:13, | 4296:7, 4299:16, | 4523:1 | REPORTER [1] - |
| 4310:14, 4310:20, | 4381:21, 4388:20, | 4300:14, 4304:10, | remedies [9] - | 4502:20 |
| 4311:19 | 4478:9, 4480:14, | 4305:24, 4325:1, | 4491:14, 4506:7, | reporting [5] - 4355:3, |
| redaction [1] - | 4480:15, 4511:13 | 4372:4, 4378:9, | 4513:8, 4513:16, | 4355:7, 4389:20, |
| 4311:15 | referring [17] - | 4380:7 | 4514:16, 4515:3, | 4546:16 |
| redirect [3] - 4339:17, | 4315:11, 4331:24, | relates [14] - 4289:15, | 4518:17, 4540:21, | reports [9] - 4323:7, |
| 4342:4, 4371:24 | 4373:17, 4373:21, | 4289:21, 4295:2, | 4542:19 | 4323:16, 4333:14, |
| REDIRECT [3] - | 4375:9, 4383:14, | 4296:16, 4296:22, | remedy [8] - 4410:8, | 4336:8, 4358:13, |
| 4372:1, 4423:17, | 4398:20, 4398:22, | 4297:3, 4297:18, | 4410:10, 4466:6, | 4358:17, 4401:25, |
| 4504:17 | 4443:9, 4447:5, | 4298:10, 4298:14, | 4515:25, 4516:8, | 4412:10, 4417:19 |
| Redirect [1] - 4286:2 | 4480:2, 4480:3, | 4298:21, 4306:7, | 4518:20, 4519:9, | represent [6] - |
| reduce [5] - 4451:25, | 4481:3, 4481:4, | 4370:10, 4384:7, | 4523:10 | 4291:12, 4302:18, |
| 4453:4, 4464:12, | 4484:13, 4486:21 | 4389:9 | remember [12] - | 4359:1, 4416:5, |
| 4524:8, 4543:4 | refers [2] - 4386:2, | relating [1] - 4372:7 | 4437:16, 4441:12, | 4416:9, 4531:25 |
| reduced [1] - 4315:3 | 4418:11 | Relationship [1] - | 4441:16, 4464:23, | representation [1] - |
| reduces [1] - 4492:10 | reflect [9] - 4310:1, 4323:8, 4326:24, | 4300:5 | 4467:20, 4467:22, | 4547:6 |
| reducing [8] - | 4323:8, 4326:24, 4342:15, 4347:9, | relationship [12] - | 4483:25, 4493:12, | representations [1] - 4465:9 |
| 4441:14, 4464:1, | 4358:18, 4381:10, | 4351:18, 4351:22, | 4497:10, 4501:14, | representative [2] - |
| 4464:6, 4489:5, | 4417:21, 4512:25 | 4385:2, 4386:16, 4386:17, 4386:20, | 4501:20, 4546:1 | 4542:17, 4547:8 |
| 4491:10, 4500:4, | reflected [2] - | 4386:17, 4386:20, 4387:8, 4387:13, | reminded [1] - | representatives [2] - |
| 4523:5, 4542:20 | 4358:20, 4409:25 | 4387:19, 4390:13, | 4413:10 removal [3] - 4390:1, | 4494:22, 4538:8 |
| reduction [6] - 4406:9, | refresh [4] - 4318:17, | 4397:18 | removal [3] - 4390:1, 4469:18, 4486:25 | representing [1] - |
| 4406:10, 4406:12, 4513:10, 4513:14, | 4334:22, 4401:4, | relationships [2] - | remove [3] - 4392:19, | 4546:21 |
| 4513:10, 4513:14, 4513:16 | 4458:7 | 4377:8, 4516:21 | 4470:9, 4520:21 | represents [1] - |
| reductions [4] - | regard [6] - 4291:4, | relative [3] - 4332:9, | rental [1] - 4478:5 | 4465:13 |
| 4368:19, 4446:5, | 4291:10, 4342:18, | 4524:1, 4530:11 | repeat [1] - 4509:12 | reputable [1] - |
| 4466:13, 4467:8 | 4358:23, 4379:5, | relatively [5] - 4362:2, | repeatedly [1] - | 4536:18 |
| reef [1] - 4420:16 | 4537:14 | 4376:3, 4384:1, | 4517:6 | request [8] - 4298:3, |
| reefs [7] - 4362:9, | regarding [4] - $_{ m THI}$ | | ROUP se [1] - 4375:11 | 4310:8, 4311:14, |
| | | 1 | I | ľ |

| 4318:23, 4340:10, |
|--|
| 4360:4, 4424:11, |
| 4546:11 |
| requested [4] - |
| 4302:3, 4309:11, |
| 4410:11, 4546:1 |
| requests [1] - 4310:7 |
| require [3] - 4288:22, 4388:12, 4454:18 |
| required [3] - 4468:11, |
| 4511:4, 4513:25 |
| requirement [1] - |
| 4452:8 |
| requirements [6] - |
| 4369:7, 4369:10, |
| 4450:14, 4452:5, |
| 4466:20, 4497:21 requiring [1] - 4463:7 |
| requisite [1] - 4390:25 |
| Research [3] - |
| 4297:20, 4306:2, |
| 4461:25 |
| research [4] - 4317:7, |
| 4317:20, 4380:11, |
| 4505:4 |
| researched [1] - |
| 4322:12 reserved [1] - 4351:2 |
| reservoir [1] - 4485:21 |
| reshell [4] - 4379:22, |
| 4390:2, 4397:24, |
| 4399:23 |
| reshelled [7] - |
| 4382:15, 4384:3, |
| 4384:14, 4398:3, |
| 4399:7, 4399:18, 4401:6 |
| reshelling [12] - |
| 4390:22, 4391:5, |
| 4391:13, 4392:21, |
| 4397:19, 4398:6, |
| 4398:17, 4398:21, |
| 4399:16, 4401:22, |
| 4430:16, 4430:17 |
| Resilience [1] - |
| 4309:1 |
| resilience [1] - 4366:21 |
| resistant [2] - |
| 4454:15, 4454:16 |
| resource [24] - |
| 4320:14, 4323:9, |
| 4323:20, 4359:18, |
| 4388:11, 4388:17, |
| 4389:13, 4395:5, |
| 4399:12, 4416:20, |
| 4416:25, 4423:1, 4494:25, 4505:5, |
| 4505:6, 4505:9, |
| 4505:25, 4506:2, |

| 4506:4, 4510:8, 4536:9, 4537:2, 4538:14, 4540:9 | r |
|--|-------------|
| resources [5] - 4516:12, 4516:23, 4517:16, 4539:4, 4539:10 | r |
| Resources [2] - 4450:24, 4532:8 | r |
| respect [6] - 4310:9, 4310:21, 4374:11, 4378:16, 4380:6, 4388:3 | r r r |
| respective [4] - 4350:13, 4420:16, 4437:2, 4437:5 | r |
| respectively [1] - 4522:5 | r |
| respond [2] - 4293:16, 4435:25 | r |
| response [6] - 4290:17, 4304:17, 4304:18, 4398:23, 4399:6, 4492:8 | r |
| responsible [2] - 4322:8, 4331:18 | r |
| ResSim [3] - 4502:25, 4532:10, 4532:25 | |
| rest [3] - 4403:24, 4404:21, 4457:13 | |
| restaurants [2] - 4435:25, 4546:2 | |
| Restoration [1] - 4297:14 | |
| restoration [15] - 4305:21, 4378:17, | r |
| 4379:6, 4379:9, 4379:10, 4379:17, | r |
| 4379:19, 4379:22, 4380:1, 4380:4, | F |
| 4400:21, 4401:19, 4415:1, 4415:4, 4415:6 | r |
| restore [5] - 4378:22, 4379:1, 4379:20, | r |
| 4401:18 restoring [1] - 4379:13 | F |
| restrict [1] - 4543:10 | |
| restricted [1] - 4470:13 | |
| restricting [3] - 4445:24, 4473:21, 4540:12 | |
| restriction [1] - 4447:2 restrictions [3] - 4399:9, 4446:21, | |
| 4446:23 result [9] - 4324:15, | |
| 4387:5, 4412:23, 4429:18, 4429:2 THE | 3 |

| 4482:13, 4503:24, 4518:17, 4518:20 resulting [1] - 4368:10 results [6] - 4330:5, 4430:11, 4430:13, 4431:12, 4431:14, 4465:9 retained [1] - 4314:22 Retained [1] - 4418:18 return [1] - 4498:8 returned [1] - 4311:23 reveal [1] - 4370:13 |
|--|
| revealed [3] - 4537:24, 4538:2, 4538:18 revenue [1] - 4442:15 revenues [3] - 4472:3, 4476:22, 4499:9 |
| reverse [1] - 4478:16 reversed [1] - 4529:23 revert [1] - 4433:2 review [8] - 4300:9, 4316:2, 4316:5, 4327:2, 4360:13, |
| 4439:14, 4476:19, 4480:14 reviewed [17] - 4322:2, 4322:7, 4322:10, 4322:18, |
| 4322:23, 4323:16, 4328:7, 4329:3, 4335:2, 4335:4, 4353:19, 4367:1, 4412:10, 4413:22, 4438:20, 4465:20, |
| 4512:5 reviewing [1] - 4314:12 revise [1] - 4413:25 Richards [1] - 4435:3 ridiculous [1] - 4412:9 |
| rights [5] - 4344:16, 4345:2, 4345:13, 4345:19, 4470:8 ring [1] - 4437:10 rings [1] - 4451:1 |
| River [28] - 4315:2, 4315:22, 4326:4, 4326:17, 4346:12, 4363:16, 4379:15, 4399:21, 4426:23, 4438:19, 4439:16, |
| 4439:25, 4440:6, 4440:18, 4440:22, 4440:25, 4441:2, 4441:4, 4447:9, 4456:17, 4467:24, |
| 4487:2, 4489:6, 4517:15, 4517:22, |

4365:23, 4366:11, 4367:15, 4368:11, 4368:23, 4370:6, 4384:10, 4385:10, 4386:3, 4387:8, 4387:14, 4387:19, 4387:25, 4404:10, 4408:14, 4410:19, 4420:14, 4426:21, 4447:16, 4448:2 rivers [1] - 4426:14 RMR [2] - 4285:14, 4549:15 Rob [2] - 4348:3, 4371:11 Robert [3] - 4434:9, 4434:21, 4504:25 robert [1] - 4286:6 rock [19] - 4315:17, 4330:24, 4331:2, 4331:5, 4331:7, 4334:10, 4334:16, 4335:9, 4341:16, 4372:12, 4372:25, 4373:9, 4373:17, 4373:22, 4374:5, 4374:10, 4376:3, 4376:14, 4407:6 Roger [1] - 4329:1 role [5] - 4295:3, 4379:5, 4438:11, 4525:9, 4538:23 Roman [3] - 4361:10, 4425:13, 4425:14 Romuald [2] - 4312:7, 4313:1 romuald [1] - 4286:5 room [1] - 4544:4 rotated [1] - 4439:9 rotation [9] - 4437:24, 4439:9, 4439:19, 4442:16, 4442:19, 4442:24, 4443:5, 4443:14. 4444:22 rotational [1] -4442:14 rotations [5] -4437:20, 4442:15, 4444:9, 4444:12, 4454:21 roughly [2] - 4473:2, 4490:21 routinely [2] -4410:25, 4428:25 REPORTING GROUP 1-4419:7,

river [30] - 4325:18,

4325:25, 4326:8, 4326:19, 4351:22,

4354:2, 4354:10,

4360:8, 4363:15,

4465:2, 4465:3, 4472:25, 4473:16, 4501:16, 4509:9, 4513:10, 4542:3, 4542:14, 4542:22 rows [2] - 4460:12, 4460:19 rule [2] - 4489:23, 4490:3 run [2] - 4316:25, 4467:14 running [1] - 4502:25 runoff [2] - 4532:7, 4532:24 runs [1] - 4335:22 S

| salinities [9] - |
|-------------------------|
| 4315:18, 4376:1, |
| 4403:13, 4407:4, |
| 4408:16, 4421:7, |
| 4422:1, 4422:2, |
| 4422:7 |
| salinity [40] - 4324:1, |
| 4324:2, 4324:3, |
| 4324:12, 4324:15, |
| 4324:22, 4324:25, |
| 4325:5, 4325:19, |
| 4327:8, 4330:19, |
| 4363:21, 4368:4, |
| 4382:6, 4384:11, |
| 4384:25, 4385:2, |
| 4385:5, 4385:10, |
| 4386:14, 4399:3, |
| 4403:18, 4404:3, |
| 4404:4, 4404:11, |
| 4404:12, 4404:14, |
| 4404:16, 4404:17, |
| 4404:22, 4405:1, |
| 4405:2, 4408:19, |
| 4416:13, 4420:15, |
| 4420:23, 4421:4, |
| 4427:14, 4516:18 |
| Salinity [1] - 4360:3 |
| sample [3] - 4332:11, |
| 4333:3, 4333:6 |
| sampled [2] - |
| 4332:14, 4332:16 |
| sampling [1] - 4373:8 |
| save [5] - 4437:21, |
| 4438:18, 4439:19, |
| 4479:20, 4490:18 |
| saved [2] - 4441:14, |
| 4444:11 |
| saving [1] - 4456:4 |
| savings [2] - 4452:14, |
| 4455:12 |
| saw [11] - 4322:15, |
| 4336:7, 4366:15, |
| 4384:16, 4410:3, |

| | | | <u> </u> | |
|---|--|--|---|--|
| 4410:5, 4411:12, | season [4] - 4356:4, | 4407:18, 4410:8, | 4419:1, 4456:7, | 4436:25, 4437:8, |
| 4411:17, 4413:4, | 4421:9, 4460:24, | 4411:7, 4412:7, | 4476:6, 4483:25, | 4475:12 |
| 4462:6, 4511:12 | 4461:2 | 4413:3, 4417:5, | 4488:2 | services [3] - 4508:15, |
| scale [2] - 4396:16, | seasonal [1] - 4502:13 | 4417:7, 4417:14, | seeking [1] - 4542:11 | 4517:9, 4524:6 |
| 4413:1 | seasons [1] - 4422:8 | 4417:17, 4417:23, | seepage [2] - 4451:14, | Services [4] - 4332:1, |
| scan [2] - 4451:12, 4453:2 | seated [2] - 4312:21, | 4418:1, 4418:2, 4418:7, 4418:17, | 4451:20 | 4332:25, 4333:11, 4438:12 |
| scanned [2] - 4335:4, | 4434:17 second [29] - 4289:1, | 4418:21, 4419:9, | sees [1] - 4515:23 segment [4] - 4302:2, | set [22] - 4295:1, |
| 4337:1 | 4291:4, 4298:24, | 4431:9, 4431:11, | 4302:4, 4443:1, | 4296:15, 4297:2, |
| scenario [3] - 4410:8, | 4298:25, 4300:14, | 4436:5, 4436:6, | 4518:1 | 4297:17, 4304:9, |
| 4516:1, 4519:24 | 4306:1, 4306:9, | 4438:24, 4439:1, | selected [6] - 4309:8, | 4304:10, 4307:24, |
| Scenarios [1] - 4501:2 | 4325:22, 4327:23, | 4439:4, 4440:15, | 4383:1, 4383:5, | 4309:2, 4309:7, |
| scenarios [5] - | 4353:17, 4361:25, | 4441:23, 4441:25, | 4383:6, 4391:19 | 4309:11, 4310:11, |
| 4410:10, 4489:14, | 4365:19, 4370:1, | 4442:13, 4442:21, | selection [1] - | 4311:1, 4347:7, |
| 4516:2, 4519:10, | 4371:5, 4372:23, | 4442:25, 4443:5, | 4532:25 | 4347:19, 4381:22, |
| 4520:2 | 4396:11, 4401:5, | 4443:7, 4443:12, | Seminole [1] - 4441:4 | 4388:18, 4391:4, |
| scheduling [3] - | 4408:7, 4408:25, | 4443:15, 4443:16, | send [1] - 4546:6 | 4413:1, 4443:3, |
| 4455:21, 4455:23, | 4414:13, 4445:8, | 4443:23, 4445:25, | sense [11] - 4316:20, | 4444:13, 4445:22, |
| 4456:6 | 4445:20, 4445:21, | 4446:7, 4446:11, | 4334:3, 4377:10, | 4509:13 |
| scholar [1] - 4354:9 | 4446:8, 4448:10, | 4446:16, 4449:14, 4449:18, 4449:19, | 4377:11, 4392:17, | sets [2] - 4389:6, |
| scholars [2] - 4358:4, | 4451:15, 4469:10, 4501:15, 4500:13 | 4451:1, 4451:8, | 4411:24, 4439:12, | 4459:25 |
| 4358:8 | 4501:15, 4509:13 Secretary [1] - | 4451:17, 4452:25, | 4469:20, 4511:2, | settle [4] - 4393:1, 4399:13, 4548:5 |
| School [1] - 4505:2 science [5] - 4336:14, | 4538:11 | 4453:3, 4453:14, | 4528:8, 4544:2 sensible [1] - 4523:9 | settled [1] - 4399:25 |
| 4377:2, 4377:23, | section [18] - 4297:3, | 4453:15, 4457:24, | sensitive [3] - 4448:3, | seven [2] - 4449:9, |
| 4437:11, 4516:17 | 4297:19, 4298:23, | 4458:6, 4459:4, | 4468:5 | 4505:22 |
| Science [3] - 4312:10, | 4305:21, 4306:2, | 4459:10, 4459:22, | sent [2] - 4300:20, | several [13] - 4294:17, |
| 4365:4, 4376:24 | 4360:2, 4360:5, | 4459:24, 4460:2, | 4301:12 | 4300:22, 4306:11, |
| Sciences [1] - 4328:23 | 4360:12, 4360:18, | 4461:6, 4461:9, | sentence [15] - | 4308:13, 4329:20, |
| sciences [1] - 4437:15 | 4363:1, 4367:6, | 4461:11, 4462:13, | 4297:6, 4300:24, | 4336:21, 4366:2, |
| scientific [17] - | 4367:7, 4405:13, | 4462:23, 4464:18, | 4305:15, 4330:6, | 4450:19, 4468:16, |
| 4315:1, 4315:7, | 4444:17, 4449:14, | 4465:15, 4465:18, 4466:11, 4468:10, | 4334:3, 4373:7, | 4475:13, 4494:23, |
| 4315:24, 4317:6, | 4450:13, 4488:25, 4489:24 | 4469:11, 4470:20, | 4446:8, 4457:14, | 4494:24, 4509:17 |
| 4317:18, 4360:8, | sections [3] - 4303:8, | 4475:18, 4475:20, | 4457:17, 4489:23, | severe [4] - 4460:14, 4460:16, 4503:20 |
| 4363:14, 4363:20, | 4360:10, 4425:23 | 4475:23, 4476:3, | 4492:19, 4493:4, 4493:5, 4497:5, | shall [6] - 4312:17, |
| 4365:23, 4366:10, 4367:15, 4368:22, | sector [1] - 4509:4 | 4476:14, 4481:15, | 4535:13 | 4312:18, 4434:13, |
| 4370:5, 4379:5, | sediment [1] - | 4483:1, 4483:16, | sentinel [4] - 4328:15, | 4434:14, 4497:1, |
| 4381:19, 4388:3, | 4408:13 | 4484:9, 4485:15, | 4328:17, 4328:19, | 4497:7 |
| 4426:2 | see [160] - 4288:21, | 4485:16, 4486:1, | 4328:24 | share [1] - 4486:9 |
| scientist [1] - 4302:24 | 4291:2, 4291:14, | 4486:2, 4487:18, | separate [2] - | shell [8] - 4388:12, |
| scientists [6] - | 4294:8, 4308:3, | 4488:8, 4488:25, | 4337:14, 4421:15 | 4388:16, 4389:23, |
| 4323:5, 4325:16, | 4324:19, 4325:23, | 4489:13, 4492:24, 4493:5, 4494:1, | separately [1] - | 4390:14, 4391:15, |
| 4355:14, 4423:11, | 4328:14, 4331:20, | 4494:12, 4495:7, | 4530:18 | 4391:20, 4392:13, |
| 4424:5, 4425:1 | 4331:23, 4332:1, | 4496:10, 4496:19, | September [3] - | 4392:15 |
| score [1] - 4418:9 | 4332:15, 4340:14, | 4496:24, 4497:3, | 4338:7, 4346:23, | shelling [2] - 4379:22, |
| Scott [1] - 4437:14 | 4340:16, 4366:3, 4369:20, 4371:6, | 4497:8, 4498:4, | 4350:4 | 4390:9 |
| screen [9] - 4310:25, | 4372:24, 4373:11, | 4498:7, 4499:13, | sequence [2] - | Shellman [6] - 4461:21, 4461:22, |
| 4311:10, 4362:12, | 4382:21, 4382:22, | 4501:3, 4503:23, | 4304:18, 4495:16 | 4461:24, 4462:14, |
| 4362:16, 4367:5, 4381:9, 4519:18, | 4383:7, 4383:8, | 4508:6, 4509:10, | series [15] - 4300:22, 4303:24, 4304:6, | 4462:19, 4465:5 |
| 4534:11, 4547:2 | 4384:9, 4385:7, | 4509:14, 4512:18, | 4304:22, 4305:8, | shells [2] - 4331:21, |
| scroll [1] - 4362:25 | 4386:25, 4391:10, | 4519:20, 4519:23, | 4305:24, 4306:7, | 4332:2 |
| se [1] - 4430:12 | 4391:21, 4391:23, | 4521:17, 4523:6, | 4306:15, 4308:19, | shift [3] - 4432:17, |
| seafood [5] - 4320:14, | 4392:2, 4392:4, | 4524:11, 4525:2, 4526:17, 4527:7 | 4428:20, 4428:25, | 4497:25, 4521:5 |
| 4320:20, 4320:24, | 4392:15, 4392:16, | 4526:17, 4527:7, 4527:24, 4528:15, | 4429:4, 4443:12, | Shiver [6] - 4318:9, |
| 4340:21, 4417:19 | 4392:17, 4395:10, | 4527.24, 4526.15, 4528:21, 4529:2, | 4489:3, 4514:21 | 4318:11, 4319:2, |
| Seafood [4] - 4417:6, | 4396:25, 4397:6, | 4532:12, 4536:8, | serve [1] - 4392:7 | 4320:12, 4413:13, |
| 4417:12, 4417:18, | 4398:2, 4400:4, 4407:14, 4407:1 mhi | 4E40.2 | Service [6] - 4346:20, | 4413:18 |
| 4418:9 | 4407.14, 4407.1 THI | E REPORTING G | ROUP 4, 4436:22, | short [7] - 4336:4, |
| | M | lason & Lockha | art | |
| | | . 490 | | 100 of 107 she |
| | | | | |

| | _ | | 1 | |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|
| 4362:2, 4433:16, | sincerely [1] - 4435:7 | 4439:19, 4443:13 | South [1] - 4475:23 | 4427:20, 4427:21, |
| 4433:19, 4472:14, | single [3] - 4392:9, | sod-based [5] - | Southeast [1] - | 4432:19, 4483:18, |
| 4503:13, 4525:14 | 4400:11, 4526:25 | 4437:23, 4438:24, | 4475:21 | 4515:5 |
| shortly [2] - 4326:19, | sit [4] - 4292:5, | 4439:9, 4439:19, | spat [11] - 4386:24, | specific [13] - 4334:9, |
| 4545:3 | | 4443:13 | | 4347:17, 4370:12, |
| | 4437:9, 4437:16, | | 4392:5, 4392:8, | , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , |
| show [5] - 4309:9, | 4468:13 | soil [3] - 4437:11, | 4392:10, 4392:11, | 4398:9, 4452:10, |
| 4318:16, 4384:14, | site [2] - 4320:3 | 4437:15, 4523:4 | 4392:12, 4392:18, | 4452:18, 4455:14, |
| 4481:9, 4521:13 | sitting [1] - 4307:14 | Sole [1] - 4347:4 | 4397:23, 4399:13, | 4456:8, 4456:25, |
| showed [3] - 4373:23, | situation [3] - | solemnly [2] - | 4399:25, 4400:3 | 4496:15, 4503:1, |
| 4385:8, 4488:3 | 4404:25, 4496:5, | 4312:16, 4434:12 | speaking [2] - 4339:4, | 4506:10, 4526:10 |
| showing [1] - 4310:25 | 4511:22 | someone [2] - | 4528:15 | specifically [7] - |
| shown [2] - 4390:19, | Situation [5] - | 4429:17, 4538:20 | special [1] - 4490:20 | 4297:6, 4298:24, |
| 4524:17 | 4296:14, 4305:7, | sometime [1] - | Special [2] - 4292:24, | 4333:9, 4413:1, |
| shows [3] - 4383:22, | 4325:15, 4325:17, | 4547:21 | 4504:22 | 4423:23, 4496:4, |
| 4394:9, 4477:11 | 4327:17 | sometimes [5] - | SPECIAL [65] - | 4497:21 |
| Sibert [1] - 4357:23 | sixth [2] - 4311:6, | 4432:25, 4437:3, | 4285:11, 4288:2, | specified [1] - 4523:1 |
| side [16] - 4320:1, | 4330:2 | 4496:1, 4496:2, | 4288:5, 4290:12, | specifies [1] - 4489:25 |
| 4383:18, 4389:25, | size [9] - 4325:4, | 4539:13 | 4290:15, 4292:11, | speculate [3] - |
| 4390:8, 4392:3, | 4336:20, 4356:4, | somewhat [1] - | 4293:1, 4293:13, | 4493:16, 4504:5, |
| 4392:13, 4394:1, | 4384:16, 4384:17, | 4542:17 | 4293:19, 4293:21, | 4504:15 |
| 4492:17, 4510:17, | 4392:4, 4392:17, | somewhere [4] - | 4294:22, 4294:25, | speculating [2] - |
| 4514:7, 4514:10, | 4402:3, 4529:21 | 4413:5, 4472:4, | 4302:9, 4302:16, | 4437:25, 4495:6 |
| 4520:22, 4527:12, | skip [1] - 4475:13 | 4499:5, 4500:10 | 4303:12, 4303:20, | speculator [1] - |
| 4534:5 | • • • | * | 4307:16, 4309:15, | 4493:20 |
| | skipped [1] - 4301:17 | soon [2] - 4293:8, | 4311:13, 4311:21, | |
| sides [1] - 4350:12 | slide [2] - 4296:7, | 4545:23 | , | speculators [1] - |
| sign [2] - 4394:15, | 4440:16 | sorry [39] - 4301:16, | 4312:3, 4312:13, | 4493:17 |
| 4394:16 | slight [1] - 4412:7 | 4317:4, 4328:3, | 4313:4, 4313:22, | spell [2] - 4312:23, |
| signed [2] - 4344:18, | sliver [2] - 4541:10, | 4328:5, 4334:2, | 4314:2, 4314:7, | 4434:19 |
| 4378:25 | 4541:13 | 4340:3, 4340:4, | 4318:21, 4342:3, | spelled [1] - 4434:22 |
| significance [1] - | Slough [1] - 4344:8 | 4351:24, 4352:3, | 4342:7, 4371:23, | spend [2] - 4461:19, |
| 4390:13 | sloughs [1] - 4541:23 | 4361:5, 4363:24, | 4402:11, 4414:5, | 4496:12 |
| significant [8] - | small [11] - 4391:10, | 4365:11, 4380:14, | 4426:7, 4426:10, | spending [1] - 4508:6 |
| 4331:20, 4405:25, | 4402:3, 4432:6, | 4394:25, 4405:1, | 4426:13, 4426:17, | spends [1] - 4538:4 |
| 4441:19, 4441:22, | 4432:9, 4432:10, | 4414:10, 4417:10, | 4426:20, 4426:24, | spent [5] - 4325:9, |
| 4448:1, 4512:15, | 4432:14, 4447:18, | 4418:22, 4435:2, | 4427:1, 4427:12, | 4496:13, 4517:13, |
| 4520:8, 4533:2 | 4476:23, 4479:3, | 4447:24, 4449:19, | 4427:23, 4428:4, | 4538:21, 4538:25 |
| significantly [2] - | 4530:15, 4540:11 | 4453:6, 4454:9, | 4428:22, 4429:10, | sperm [5] - 4432:10, |
| 4395:6, 4453:4 | smaller [3] - 4383:22, | 4455:5, 4457:3, | 4429:20, 4430:25, | 4432:13, 4432:15, |
| silently [2] - 4489:10, | 4482:2, 4519:12 | 4458:23, 4472:12, | 4431:13, 4431:21, | 4432:20, 4432:22 |
| 4489:11 | Smith [2] - 4519:15, | 4476:6, 4480:22, | 4432:1, 4432:24, | spoken [2] - 4338:1, |
| silt [1] - 4408:12 | 4546:25 | 4485:24, 4486:13, | 4433:6, 4433:10, | 4338:4 |
| siltation [1] - 4399:4 | snail [8] - 4334:10, | 4486:15, 4492:25, | 4433:19, 4433:22, | spot [1] - 4319:15 |
| similar [5] - 4387:11, | 4341:17, 4362:9, | 4507:17, 4533:5, | 4434:2, 4435:20, | spots [2] - 4415:4, |
| 4412:23, 4452:8, | 4372:12, 4373:9, | 4534:9, 4539:25, | 4436:17, 4544:13, | 4415:5 |
| 4499:3, 4519:4 | 4374:5, 4374:10, | 4541:18, 4547:3 | 4544:16, 4544:18, | spring [2] - 4422:2, |
| similarly [5] - 4373:20, | 4407:6 | sort [3] - 4391:4, | 4544:20, 4544:24, | 4547:21 |
| 4374:6, 4383:25, | | 4401:3, 4404:18 | 4545:7, 4545:10, | sprinkler [9] - |
| 4392:15, 4521:25 | snails [13] - 4315:17, | sorts [1] - 4492:18 | 4546:10 | |
| • | 4324:20, 4330:24, | sought [1] - 4466:12 | specializations [1] - | 4462:23, 4463:2, |
| simple [3] - 4432:8, | 4331:2, 4331:5, | Sound [1] - 4458:17 | 4377:24 | 4463:8, 4464:25, |
| 4513:19, 4539:18 | 4331:7, 4334:16, | | specialize [1] - | 4465:16, 4465:17, |
| simply [11] - 4353:2, | 4335:9, 4373:1, | sound [2] - 4428:19, | 4377:17 | 4465:25, 4466:1, |
| 4378:2, 4386:23, | 4373:17, 4373:22, | 4536:12 | Species [2] - 4346:1, | 4466:2 |
| 4394:5, 4396:15, | 4376:3, 4376:14 | sounds [1] - 4533:5 | 4418:19 | Spurgeon [1] - 4480:3 |
| 4407:9, 4428:12, | snow [1] - 4288:13 | source [2] - 4323:19, | | square [1] - 4527:23 |
| 4491:23, 4508:5, | social [1] - 4516:20 | 4404:21 | species [15] - | St [1] - 4359:20 |
| 4536:11, 4542:13 | society [1] - 4516:8 | sources [9] - 4316:20, | 4372:10, 4373:10, | staff [1] - 4385:18 |
| simulating [1] - | socioeconomic [2] - | 4323:15, 4399:24, | 4374:3, 4374:8, | stages [1] - 4492:21 |
| 4544:3 | 4356:5, 4424:15 | 4400:2, 4400:3, | 4374:12, 4377:9, | Stakeholders [1] - |
| simulations [2] - | sod [5] - 4437:23, | 4411:2, 4477:6, | 4377:15, 4377:18, | 4488:7 |
| 4503:3, 4503:6 | 4438:24, 4439:9 TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP :3, 4427:19, | stakeholders [2] - |
| | | • / | I | · · |
| 01 of 107 sheets | <u> </u> | Iason & Lockha | | Reporting Group (207) 797-6 |
| 01 01 107 3HCC(3 | | 1 age 1505 to 1505 of 1505 | III | 5 1.0porting Oroup (201) 191-0 |

| 4493:18, 4493:24 stamps [1] - 4344:19 | 4474:8, 4491:15, 4492:11, 4499:14, | 4529:15, 4530:1, | strive [1] - 4466:13 | subsets [1] - 4387:23 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Stamps 11 - 4544, 19 | 7732.11.7733.17. | 4533:14, 4544:14 | strives [1] - 4417:18 | subsidies [1] - |
| stand [2] - 4344:3, | 4514:18, 4538:4, | Stavins's [1] - 4481:17 | strong [1] - 4289:24 | 4498:12 |
| 4495:1 | 4543:9, 4549:3 | stay [4] - 4292:9, | strongly [1] - 4517:23 | subsidized [1] - |
| standard [1] - 4380:3 | state's [1] - 4487:24 | 4296:21, 4433:25, | structure [4] - | 4499:5 |
| start [5] - 4304:8, | statement [11] - | 4462:19 | 4368:10, 4368:12, | subsidizes [1] - |
| 4365:17, 4438:7, | 4289:20, 4291:10, | stayed [1] - 4320:6 | 4368:16, 4376:11 | 4499:13 |
| 4469:16, 4530:7 | 4291:20, 4339:10, | staying [4] - 4304:13, | Struhs [1] - 4346:13 | subsidy [2] - 4498:25, |
| started [1] - 4336:9 | 4361:2, 4362:10, | 4305:11, 4321:8, | studied [2] - 4353:11, | 4500:9 |
| starting [4] - 4300:23, | 4370:7, 4412:4, | 4423:19 | 4439:9 | substance [1] - |
| 4335:20, 4340:6, | 4412:9, 4414:11, | stem [1] - 4381:25 | studies [6] - 4367:20, | 4507:21 |
| 4394:9 | 4537:18 | stenographic [1] - | 4368:18, 4379:6, | substantial [4] - |
| starts [6] - 4315:13, | statements [5] - | 4549:5 | 4479:6, 4479:11, | 4336:11, 4406:9, |
| 4335:21, 4356:22, | 4300:23, 4338:25, | step [1] - 4504:21 | 4539:17 | 4420:7, 4531:7 |
| 4409:16, 4469:4, | 4359:24, 4376:9, 4424:5 | stepped [1] - 4289:10 | study [15] - 4353:18, | substantially [1] - |
| 4469:5 | STATES [1] - 4285:1 | Steve [1] - 4349:17 | 4354:17, 4354:18, | 4481:5 |
| STATE [2] - 4285:3, 4285:6 | States [7] - 4343:3, | Stevens [1] - 4369:1 | 4357:11, 4368:2, | substantiate [1] - 4431:20 |
| state [22] - 4312:23, | 4343:21, 4345:4, | Steverson [1] - 4538:11 | 4368:9, 4370:7, 4437:18, 4438:16, | substantiated [1] - |
| 4314:21, 4322:7, | 4346:3, 4346:19, | stick [2] - 4510:2, | 4437.16, 4436.16, 4438:20, 4439:18, | 4431:17 |
| 4323:4, 4335:15, | 4474:11, 4544:6 | 4523:12 | 4461:21, 4465:5, | substrate [5] - |
| 4379:7, 4379:16, | states [11] - 4340:14, | still [12] - 4297:1, | 4507:2, 4508:21 | 4388:12, 4392:20, |
| 4392:6, 4418:8, | 4340:15, 4360:22, | 4298:7, 4387:18, | studying [3] - 4380:6, | 4397:23, 4400:1, |
| 4418:12, 4419:11, | 4398:16, 4414:16, | 4406:17, 4470:15, | 4407:22, 4485:8 | 4400:5 |
| 4430:1, 4434:19, | 4418:1, 4418:20, | 4471:13, 4485:2, | sub [4] - 4384:17, | subtidal [1] - 4362:8 |
| 4438:24, 4471:16, | 4437:2, 4437:5, | 4499:6, 4499:11, | 4401:14, 4402:2, | successful [2] - |
| 4472:3, 4483:19, | 4506:18 | 4500:14, 4520:20, | 4420:2 | 4379:18, 4379:25 |
| 4498:13, 4537:21, | stations [2] - 4401:10, | 4529:9 | sub-legal [3] - | sufficient [3] - |
| 4538:8, 4538:9 | 4401:23 | stipulate [2] - | 4401:14, 4402:2, | 4399:12, 4400:5, |
| State [71] - 4285:15, | Statistic [1] - 4475:12 | 4465:13, 4535:12 | 4420:2 | 4432:14 |
| 4285:17, 4285:20, | Statistical [1] - 4297:3 statistical [4] - | stipulating [1] - | sub-legal-size [1] - | sufficiently [1] - |
| 4294:6, 4302:18, 4302:25, 4312:5, | 4385:1, 4386:16, | 4535:16 | 4384:17 | 4392:21 |
| 4312:6, 4314:22, | 4387:8, 4428:23 | Stock [1] - 4356:11 stock [4] - 4328:1, | subject [5] - 4316:13, 4344:8, 4395:25, | suffocates [1] - 4408:13 |
| 4317:5, 4317:17, | statistically [1] - | 4357:2, 4357:7, | 4462:3, 4539:6 | suggest [2] - 4307:9, |
| 4318:2, 4318:13, | 4428:19 | 4396:5 | submission [1] - | 4374:11 |
| 4319:4, 4322:3, | statistics [1] - 4477:10 | Stocks [1] - 4357:16 | 4293:18 | suggested [2] - |
| 4331:6, 4331:11, | status [6] - 4323:20, | stocks [1] - 4419:2 | submit [7] - 4288:18, | 4427:15, 4433:1 |
| 4342:24, 4343:1, | 4396:8, 4419:9, | stone [2] - 4331:7, | 4290:5, 4290:10, | suggesting [1] - |
| 4343:2, 4343:12, | 4419:11, 4419:13, | 4372:25 | 4290:19, 4311:19, | 4533:14 |
| 4343:20, 4344:16, | 4510:14 | stop [1] - 4320:14 | 4511:5, 4512:10 | suitability [4] - |
| 4344:23, 4345:2, | Status [1] - 4357:15 | storage [3] - 4485:19, | submitted [25] - | 4415:10, 4415:14, |
| 4345:10, 4345:13, 4345:19, 4346:2, | statutory [1] - 4505:23 | 4486:12, 4486:19 | 4298:2, 4313:8, | 4416:1, 4416:7 |
| 4345:19, 4346:2, 4346:3, 4346:19, | stavins [2] - 4435:10, | stores [1] - 4320:24 | 4317:9, 4328:8, | suitable [1] - 4415:6 |
| 4369:12, 4374:7, | 4509:21 Stavins [33] - 4286:6, | storm [2] - 4408:12, | 4330:13, 4330:15, | Sumatra [5] - 4326:12, |
| 4380:9, 4381:5, | 4293:9, 4433:13, | 4408:15 | 4335:2, 4336:25, 4337:5, 4337:7, | 4326:14, 4326:21, |
| 4382:11, 4398:1, | 4434:9, 4434:21, | story [2] - 4445:9, | 4337:13, 4337:19, | 4352:16, 4386:19 |
| 4398:17, 4399:6, | 4434:24, 4435:10, | 4445:11 | 4337:22, 4338:24, | Summary [2] - 4345:1, 4345:11 |
| 4400:16, 4404:5, | 4436:5, 4436:21, | stove [1] - 4430:6 strategy [1] - 4419:7 | 4339:12, 4347:13, | summary [1] - |
| 4410:11, 4411:15, | 4498:4, 4498:10, | streamflow [4] - | 4353:10, 4356:25, | 4475:16 |
| 4412:13, 4413:17, | 4500:24, 4504:19, | 4485:14, 4492:23, | 4358:3, 4359:23, | summer [12] - |
| 4414:21, 4416:21, | 4504:25, 4505:8, | 4501:6, 4501:8 | 4364:15, 4506:24, | 4337:14, 4421:24, |
| 4418:3, 4434:8, | 4505:24, 4507:12, | Streamflows [1] - | 4512:9, 4520:5, | 4421:25, 4504:14, |
| 4450:9, 4466:21, | 4509:16, 4511:19, | 4501:2 | 4541:7 | 4530:9, 4530:18, |
| 4470:7, 4470:8, 4470:20, 4471:4, | 4514:5, 4515:4, | Street [1] - 4285:12 | submitting [1] - | 4531:2, 4531:4, |
| 4470:20, 4471:4, 4471:5, 4471:8, | 4515:18, 4516:10, | Stressors [1] - 4367:8 | 4367:2 | 4531:9, 4531:16, |
| 4471:3, 4471.8, 4471:22, 4472:2, | 4516:23, 4519:14, 4523:20, 4525:14 | strides [1] - 4379:4 | subscribe [2] - | 4532:5, 4547:21 |
| 4472:8, 4472:21, | 4523:20, 4525:14, 4527:9, 4528:14 THE | etrika 141 - 4402.21 | 4537:4, 4549:10 | summers [1] - 4422:6 |
| ,, | 4527:9, 4528:14 THE | E REPORTING GI | ROUP t [1] - 4505 :7 | Sundig [5] - 4444:14, |
| | M | ason & Lockha | rt | |
| | | . age .50 . to .50 . 050 / | | 102 of 107 she |

| 4446:5, 4452:11, | 4285:1 | - | 4534:3, 4534:4, | tens [1] - 4512:1 |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------|
| 4453:21, 4454:6 | Surface [1] - 4346:11 | Т | 4534:6, 4540:10, | term [7] - 4324:9, |
| Sundig's [1] - 4444:8 | surface [3] - 4427:8, | tab [125] - 4295:9, | 4542:2 | 4334:18, 4378:5, |
| Sunding [30] - | 4484:15, 4502:8 | 4295:10, 4295:14, | table [21] - 4293:24, | 4428:13, 4428:21, |
| 4349:23, 4350:1, | surprise [3] - 4499:19, | 4295:20, 4295:21, | 4361:4, 4361:6, | 4509:16, 4510:2 |
| 4454:4, 4455:3, | 4499:25 | 4295:24, 4296:2, | 4415:21, 4415:25, | terms [25] - 4320:13, |
| 4466:23, 4475:4, | | 4296:12, 4296:21, | 4418:17, 4418:23, | • • |
| 4477:2, 4477:12, | surprised [3] - | 4297:2, 4297:23, | 4419:4, 4421:2, | 4334:3, 4395:16, |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 4512:16, 4517:2, | 4298:8, 4298:14, | 4425:19, 4425:20, | 4407:8, 4446:24, |
| 4479:8, 4480:14, 4481:14, 4492:1, | 4548:4 | 4298:21, 4299:4, | 4425:19, 4425:20, 4426:4, 4442:5, | 4446:25, 4463:20, |
| 4504:8, 4504:9, | surprising [3] - | 4299:12, 4300:3, | 4475:17, 4475:25, | 4467:20, 4467:21, |
| ' ' | 4410:23, 4517:11, | 4300:19, 4301:2, | 4475.17, 4475.25, | 4469:21, 4473:17, |
| 4511:20, 4513:9, | 4526:2 | 4301:11, 4301:17, | | 4489:22, 4500:14, |
| 4513:17, 4514:16, | survey [8] - 4332:25, | 4301:18, 4301:22, | 4503:24, 4519:16 | 4502:13, 4503:9, |
| 4515:3, 4517:12, | 4333:5, 4333:17, | 4303:17, 4303:23, | tables [3] - 4497:13, | 4513:12, 4513:25, |
| 4518:10, 4519:14, | 4333:21, 4334:4, | 4304:5, 4304:21, | 4497:14, 4501:20 | 4514:23, 4515:14, |
| 4520:9, 4520:11, | 4382:11, 4536:25, | 4305:4, 4305:13, | tabs [1] - 4294:16 | 4517:8, 4523:14, |
| 4525:23, 4535:18, | 4546:2 | 4306:1, 4306:6, | talented [1] - 4547:18 | 4523:18, 4523:21, |
| 4536:22, 4542:19, | surveying [1] - | 4306:15, 4306:18, | talks [1] - 4542:19 | 4527:23, 4529:10 |
| 4543:12, 4544:1 | 4333:19 | 4307:24, 4308:5, | Tallahassee [1] - | terrific [2] - 4436:2, |
| Sunding's [23] - | surveys [9] - 4331:24, | 4308:11, 4308:20, | 4289:23 | 4436:15 |
| 4458:13, 4461:18, | 4332:2, 4332:3, | 4310:11, 4311:5, | target [1] - 4496:4 | tested [1] - 4291:19 |
| 4463:11, 4463:22, | 4332:6, 4333:16, | 4314:18, 4325:11, | task [18] - 4295:4, | testified [20] - |
| 4466:6, 4469:23, | 4358:21, 4393:24, | 4327:16, 4329:15, | 4296:15, 4490:21, | 4321:21, 4331:17, |
| 4480:17, 4482:1, | 4396:11, 4425:8 | 4334:25, 4339:8, | 4490:23, 4492:21, | 4336:6, 4341:11, |
| 4484:19, 4501:8, | survival [2] - 4324:10, | 4339:21, 4343:7, | 4493:6, 4493:10, | 4341:19, 4373:3, |
| 4501:9, 4502:4, | 4386:25 | 4343:16, 4344:5, | 4493:13, 4493:17, | 4381:5, 4402:15, |
| 4502:12, 4503:5, | Survival [1] - 4366:5 | 4344:11, 4344:13, | 4493:25, 4494:1, | 4405:18, 4406:4, |
| 4506:19, 4512:11, | suspend [1] - 4470:21 | 4344:22, 4345:5, | 4494:9, 4494:15, | 4411:21, 4449:17, |
| 4516:12, 4518:24, | suspicious [1] - | 4345:8, 4345:17, | 4494:19, 4494:20, | 4450:3, 4483:10, |
| 4519:9, 4522:25, | 4357:2 | 4346:16, 4347:1, | 4506:11, 4506:14, | 4517:12, 4520:11, |
| 4523:12, 4525:18, | sustainable [6] - | 4352:10, 4353:9, | 4506:15 | 4535:18, 4538:11, |
| 4526:16 | 4390:25, 4397:21, | 4354:17, 4356:7, | taught [1] - 4537:7 | 4541:12, 4542:8 |
| superior [1] - 4357:10 | 4485:6, 4497:2, | 4357:13, 4358:12, | tax [2] - 4472:4, | testify [5] - 4290:23, |
| Supplemental [1] - | 4497:11, 4497:17 | 4358:17, 4359:7, | 4499:9 | 4455:9, 4506:25, |
| 4345:24 | sustainably [1] - | 4359:14, 4361:16, | Taylor [2] - 4480:2, | 4540:25, 4541:2 |
| supplemental [1] - | 4378:5 | 4362:15, 4364:6, | 4480:19 | testifying [3] - |
| 4350:10 | Sutton [2] - 4411:16, | 4365:10, 4365:11, | teaching [1] - 4517:25 | 4309:20, 4373:15, |
| Supplemented [1] - | 4411:20 | 4365:12, 4366:16, | team [5] - 4289:3, | 4373:19 |
| 4342:25 | swear [2] - 4312:16, | 4369:17, 4370:17, | 4289:19, 4292:1, | testimony [110] - |
| supplementing [1] - | 4434:12 | 4372:16, 4405:7, | 4296:5, 4311:4 | 4288:23, 4290:6, |
| 4476:25 | Swift [1] - 4344:8 | 4415:16, 4415:20, | teams [1] - 4547:5 | 4290:19, 4290:22, |
| supplied [1] - 4531:20 | swim [1] - 4392:23 | 4417:4, 4422:20, | technical [1] - | 4291:14, 4291:15, |
| supply [1] - 4545:4 | switch [2] - 4363:12, | 4438:1, 4438:22, | 4391:24 | 4291:18, 4292:16, |
| support [6] - 4333:7, | 4432:7 | 4445:1, 4448:24, | technologies [1] - | 4294:13, 4312:16, |
| 4379:6, 4406:13, | sworn [5] - 4291:14, | 4457:3, 4458:21, | 4513:25 | 4313:8, 4313:11, |
| 4424:14, 4483:18, | 4291:15, 4291:18, | 4459:16, 4462:8, | Technology [1] - | 4313:14, 4314:14, |
| 4498:12 | 4313:13, 4435:14 | 4464:19, 4465:21, | 4365:4 | 4314:18, 4321:25, |
| Support [2] - 4344:25, | symptom [1] - 4395:8 | 4468:20, 4475:9, | Ted [1] - 4344:7 | 4322:7, 4322:10, |
| 4345:10 | synthesized [1] - | 4479:9, 4480:6, | telephone [2] - | 4323:2, 4326:9, |
| supporting [1] - | 4526:13 | 4481:10, 4482:21, | 4536:14, 4537:17 | 4329:4, 4329:23, |
| 4510:22 | system [11] - 4326:17, | 4483:3, 4483:6, | telephoned [1] - | 4330:16, 4330:21, |
| Supporting [2] - | 4392:24, 4399:23, | 4485:11, 4485:21, | 4536:8 | 4331:16, 4332:19, |
| 4343:12, 4345:25 | 4403:10, 4407:10, | 4485:23, 4486:13, | temporary [1] - | 4333:24, 4334:8, |
| supports [4] - | 4407:12, 4407:16, | 4486:16, 4487:23, | 4486:25 | 4334:14, 4336:24, |
| 4381:16, 4382:1, | 4427:11, 4427:13, | 4488:4, 4488:10, | tend [4] - 4422:6, | 4337:5, 4337:15, |
| 4405:19, 4410:18 | 4427:21, 4448:17 | 4490:5, 4494:5, | 4422:9, 4424:17, | 4337:19, 4337:23, |
| suppose [1] - 4526:3 | System [1] - 4367:9 | 4496:9, 4507:11, | 4454:2 | 4338:18, 4339:13, |
| supposed [1] - | systems [5] - 4291:25, | 4507:22, 4509:3, | tender [2] - 4313:17, | 4340:23, 4342:22, |
| 4507:16 | 4377:8, 4452:24. | 4526:23 4527:17 | 4435:17 | 4347:13, 4350:22, |
| SUPREME [1] - | 4452:25, 4526:8 THI | | ROUP [1] - 4513:10 | 4351:19, 4351:20, |
| | 1 | | 1 | |

| | T | T | 1 | T |
|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|-----------------------------|
| 4352:19, 4352:25, | Theodore [4] - | 4364:7, 4419:4, | 4319:12, 4320:5 | triggered [1] - 4382:7 |
| 4353:10, 4354:6, | 4343:11, 4344:15, | 4440:15, 4453:9 | Toward [1] - 4309:1 | trip [9] - 4318:2, |
| 4354:8, 4355:16, | 4345:24, 4348:21 | titled [16] - 4297:19, | toward [1] - 4366:21 | 4318:3, 4318:5, |
| 4356:25, 4358:3, | therefore [14] - | 4298:23, 4300:5, | trace [1] - 4500:15 | 4320:12, 4321:15, |
| 4358:16, 4358:25, | 4347:11, 4391:15, | 4342:24, 4343:11, | tracked [1] - 4310:23 | 4355:23, 4395:16, |
| 4359:3, 4359:24, | 4391:19, 4406:13, | 4344:23, 4345:9, | traditionally [1] - | 4395:19, 4395:21 |
| 4360:7, 4360:16, | 4411:24, 4420:15, | 4346:9, 4346:17, | 4528:10 | trips [4] - 4389:16, |
| 4360:22, 4361:8, | 4466:12, 4515:15, | 4367:8, 4449:6, | transcribed [2] - | 4394:2, 4394:6, |
| 4361:18, 4362:5, | 4523:7, 4524:14, | 4449:14, 4480:9, | 4342:17, 4347:11 | 4395:21 |
| 4363:6, 4363:19, | 4525:2, 4529:24, | 4488:25, 4489:24, | transcript [22] - | trivial [2] - 4515:14, |
| 4364:15, 4365:7, | 4540:23, 4543:1 | 4501:1 | 4292:18, 4332:21, | 4540:22 |
| 4365:22, 4366:10, | therein [1] - 4417:20 | today [15] - 4288:10, | 4335:1, 4338:22, | trophic [3] - 4368:10, |
| 4366:24, 4367:2, | thinking [5] - 4319:11, | 4288:15, 4288:24, | 4339:2, 4339:7, | 4368:12, 4368:16 |
| 4367:14, 4368:21, | 4414:13, 4463:12, | 4289:3, 4290:9, | 4339:21, 4343:19, | trouble [1] - 4429:21 |
| 4370:5, 4370:11, | 4473:7, 4504:11 | 4293:3, 4293:10, | 4343:23, 4343:24, | true [6] - 4288:16, |
| 4370:25, 4371:16, | third [7] - 4289:14, | 4309:25, 4364:18, | 4347:23, 4348:2, | 4313:10, 4332:13, |
| 4374:24, 4375:5, | 4301:7, 4445:8, | 4366:15, 4399:15, | | |
| 4375:12, 4376:8, | 4445:20, 4448:11, | 4433:15, 4438:4, | 4348:8, 4348:12, 4348:16, 4348:21, | 4414:8, 4537:24, 4539:10 |
| 4380:18, 4381:2, | 4464:12, 4493:2 | 4450:21, 4491:1 | | |
| 4406:5, 4409:5, | Third [1] - 4342:25 | today's [1] - 4313:25 | 4349:6, 4349:11, 4349:16, 4349:21, | truly [1] - 4491:2 |
| 4411:17, 4413:23, | | Todd [1] - 4505:16 | | trust [1] - 4358:22 |
| 4421:2, 4423:3, | thirdly [1] - 4401:8 thousand [5] - 4324:6, | together [3] - 4421:12, | 4349:25, 4549:5 | truth [8] - 4312:18, |
| 4425:12, 4434:12, | | 4421:13, 4528:9 | TRANSCRIPT [1] - | 4312:19, 4352:23, |
| 4435:11, 4435:15, | 4441:18, 4441:21, | Tommy [4] - 4340:18, | 4285:9 | 4352:24, 4434:14, |
| 4435:18, 4444:6, | 4476:22, 4479:19 | • | transcripts [2] - | 4434:15 |
| 4448:19, 4450:18, | thousands [3] - | 4402:14, 4402:24, | 4322:18, 4349:2 | try [2] - 4524:2, |
| 4452:13, 4462:4, | 4447:8, 4512:1 | 4403:6 | transfer [1] - 4484:19 | 4534:24 |
| 4462:13, 4487:20, | three [27] - 4300:21, | tomorrow [2] - | transferring [1] - | trying [13] - 4352:22, |
| 4490:5, 4500:23, | 4309:22, 4318:5, | 4288:24, 4545:14 | 4482:25 | 4353:2, 4424:18, |
| 4501:9, 4512:9, | 4318:7, 4320:5, | tong [3] - 4418:10, | translate [2] - | 4442:2, 4453:23, |
| 4512:10, 4516:13, | 4380:14, 4386:22, | 4418:11, 4419:6 | 4514:23, 4515:11 | 4467:2, 4475:4, |
| 4517:17, 4522:8, | 4400:25, 4410:22, | took [9] - 4381:18, | treats [1] - 4476:21 | 4479:20, 4490:17, |
| 4525:18, 4531:22, | 4422:24, 4423:7, | 4383:20, 4400:16, | tremendously [1] - | 4522:19, 4522:22, |
| 4533:8 | 4423:24, 4425:18, | 4486:17, 4519:4, | 4503:22 | 4531:25, 4535:3 |
| text [10] - 4304:11, | 4442:16, 4442:18, | 4531:8, 4531:12, | trend [2] - 4428:13, | Tubbs [1] - 4437:14 |
| 4306:19, 4308:3, | 4443:4, 4443:20, | 4541:10, 4543:25 | 4428:21 | turn [80] - 4295:9, |
| 4310:24, 4453:7, | 4444:3, 4447:20, | top [14] - 4299:7, | Trends [2] - 4356:10, | 4295:13, 4296:1, |
| 4453:9, 4453:10, | 4484:11, 4484:13, | 4301:8, 4304:15, | 4359:10 | 4296:11, 4297:11, |
| 4455:15, 4457:8, | 4513:8, 4513:16, | 4309:4, 4357:22, | tri [1] - 4438:24 | 4298:4, 4299:3, |
| 4457:22 | 4521:15, 4521:16, | 4359:21, 4425:17, | Tri [5] - 4344:16, | 4299:11, 4299:22, |
| textual [1] - 4311:2 | 4530:21 | 4443:3, 4443:25, | 4345:2, 4345:4, | 4300:2, 4300:18, |
| THE [33] - 4285:1, | three-hour [2] - | 4444:2, 4462:15, | 4345:13, 4345:19 | 4301:1, 4301:10, |
| 4312:14, 4312:20, | 4318:7, 4320:5 | 4508:3, 4508:4, | tri-state [1] - 4438:24 | 4305:12, 4305:18, |
| 4312:21, 4312:25, | three-year [3] - | 4529:4 | Tri-State [4] - 4344:16, | 4306:5, 4306:6, |
| 4313:18, 4402:6, | 4442:16, 4442:18, | topic [3] - 4395:25, | 4345:2, 4345:13, | 4318:23, 4327:21, |
| 4426:12, 4426:15, | 4443:4 | 4408:25, 4490:13 | 4345:19 | 4328:10, 4329:11, |
| 4426:19, 4426:21, | threshold [1] - 4511:3 | topics [6] - 4363:12, | Tri-States [1] - 4345:4 | 4330:1, 4334:25, |
| 4426:25, 4427:4, | thrives [2] - 4340:1, | 4387:24, 4402:13, | trial [15] - 4289:22, | 4335:20, 4356:7, |
| 4427:13, 4428:3, | 4340:12 | 4405:6, 4525:14, | 4291:24, 4293:25, | 4356:18, 4357:13, |
| 4428:6, 4428:24, | throughout [8] - | 4541:16 | 4332:21, 4333:23, | 4359:7, 4359:13, |
| 4429:19, 4430:2, | 4388:7, 4403:10, | total [11] - 4443:7, | 4342:15, 4342:19, | 4359:17, 4360:12, |
| 4429.19, 4430.2, 4431:8, 4431:15, | 4403:25, 4406:16, | 4460:3, 4460:10, | 4346:25, 4442:7, | 4361:24, 4365:18, |
| 4431:25, 4432:3, | 4419:22, 4420:3, | 4460:13, 4460:20, | 4450:4, 4455:9, | 4369:16, 4370:17, |
| 4433:1, 4433:11, | 4461:8, 4474:10 | 4508:7, 4508:8, | 4462:4, 4468:17, | 4371:5, 4380:16, |
| 4434:10, 4434:16, | thrust [1] - 4500:8 | 4508:18, 4509:14, | 4500:19, 4517:12 | 4385:20, 4391:16, |
| 4434:17, 4434:21, | Thursday [1] - 4362:1 | 4514:2, 4532:4 | tributaries [4] - | 4393:4, 4396:2, |
| 4502:20, 4544:15, | time-series [2] - | totally [1] - 4518:19 | 4379:1, 4379:2, | 4398:8, 4405:12, |
| 4544:19, 4544:23 | 4428:20, 4428:25 | totals [2] - 4461:10, | 4379:14, 4441:3 | 4415:16, 4415:20, |
| themselves [1] - | timing [1] - 4324:8 | 4473:9 | tricky [1] - 4457:7 | 4417:4, 4417:25, |
| 4508:12 | tiny [1] - 4402:5 | touched [1] - 4400:21 | tried [1] - 4290:1 | 4418:14, 4439:2, |
| 1000.12 | title [5] - 4297:14, TH | E REPORTING G | ROUP r _[1] - 4501:14 | 4442:11, 4444:25, |
| 1 | n. | Isaan (Taalaha | ı rt | |
| | <u> </u> | Iason & Lockha | | 104 of 107 she |
| | | . 32 .220 .0 .000 01 1000 | | 20.01.207.5110 |

undertaken [1] -

4448:23, 4449:11, 4457:2, 4457:13, 4458:2, 4458:6, 4458:21, 4459:15, 4462:8, 4464:19, 4465:21, 4468:20, 4479:9. 4480:5. 4481:9, 4483:3, 4483:13, 4484:6, 4488:9, 4488:21, 4490:4, 4494:5, 4500:22, 4507:11, 4509:3, 4512:23, 4521:11, 4524:15, 4545:20 turned [1] - 4390:8 Turner [6] - 4469:4, 4469:5, 4483:9, 4483:12, 4483:22, 4490:6 turning [6] - 4295:20, 4296:24, 4298:8, 4301:22, 4507:21, 4538:22 turns [2] - 4503:22 twice [1] - 4482:17 two [53] - 4291:4, 4293:4, 4294:3, 4314:23, 4314:25, 4318:5, 4319:21, 4320:20, 4320:23, 4320:24, 4331:7, 4339:4, 4346:24, 4375:22, 4382:16, 4386:21, 4387:1, 4390:6. 4391:19. 4393:22, 4394:24, 4396:9, 4399:10, 4408:3, 4408:9, 4410:17, 4410:22, 4437:18, 4443:18, 4444:4, 4458:24, 4463:23, 4469:9, 4469:20, 4473:9, 4475:7, 4477:18, 4479:14, 4495:1, 4497:13, 4497:14, 4504:13, 4506:18, 4508:18, 4525:14, 4526:7, 4527:14, 4528:24, 4529:16, 4529:18, 4536:1, 4545:18 type [11] - 4372:10, 4444:21, 4452:8, 4478:8, 4485:25, 4489:19, 4523:4, 4523:5, 4532:7, 4533:17, 4537:20 types [10] - 4321:23,

4335:15, 4358:17, 4377:15, 4393:22, 4432:4, 4444:19, 4444:22, 4445:24, 4447:20 typical [1] - 4333:3 typically [7] - 4336:2, 4408:10, 4425:22, 4430:2, 4437:1, 4510:14, 4536:13

U

U.S [4] - 4347:4, 4488:13, 4511:6, 4511:11 UGA [2] - 4437:11, 4437:15 **UIF** [1] - 4450:23 **UIF's** [1] - 4533:1 ultimately [1] - 4524:7 unable [1] - 4319:21 unanimous [1] -4357:8 unbelievable [1] -4340:16 uncorrelated [1] -4387:22 under [31] - 4294:16, 4295:10, 4295:21, 4295:24, 4297:2, 4297:14, 4297:19, 4298:8, 4298:22, 4300:9, 4306:1, 4311:7, 4336:6, 4359:10, 4367:7, 4410:8, 4416:4, 4419:7, 4419:13, 4443:4, 4446:20, 4451:8, 4453:10, 4459:6, 4460:2, 4470:18, 4489:9, 4490:1, 4490:2, 4498:7, 4522:25 Under [1] - 4489:25 Under-Compliance [1] - 4489:25 under-compliance [1] - 4490:2 underground [1] -4485:21 underlying [1] -4381:15 underneath [1] -4367:6 understood [3] -4309:21, 4319:7, 4376:8

undertake [1] -

4468:18

4354:19 undertaking [2] -4332:6, 4520:2 underwater [2] -4525:17, 4525:25 underwatered [1] -4526:18 underwatering [1] -4527:5 underway [2] -4378:22, 4395:9 unfortunate [3] -4403:2, 4403:19, 4404:24 unfortunately [1] -4408:5 unhappy [1] - 4548:7 uniformly [1] -4429:22 unique [1] - 4388:14 unirrigated [3] -4474:13, 4474:20, 4479:17 unit [3] - 4355:18, 4355:21, 4358:5 Unit [1] - 4357:15 United [6] - 4343:2, 4343:21, 4346:3, 4346:19, 4474:10, 4544:6 UNITED [1] - 4285:1 universities [2] -4537:7, 4537:13 University [23] -4290:2, 4291:6, 4294:4, 4295:4, 4296:4, 4302:23, 4305:6, 4317:17, 4322:11, 4380:9, 4412:24, 4436:21, 4437:7, 4437:19, 4437:20. 4438:15. 4438:17, 4458:18, 4459:20, 4505:3, 4535:20, 4536:17 unless [3] - 4445:18, 4488:2, 4534:6 unlike [1] - 4381:20 unnumbered [1] -4311:5 unpublished [1] -4300:4 unquote [1] - 4456:24 unreasonable [2] -4422:18, 4424:10 unsound [1] - 4406:23

4390:1, 4393:13, 4402:1, 4408:3, 4414:1 Unusual [1] - 4364:7 up [38] - 4303:9, 4306:24, 4309:19, 4311:18, 4312:22, 4350:12, 4362:16, 4362:25, 4381:8, 4381:23, 4387:5, 4389:2, 4393:6, 4403:3, 4412:19, 4412:23, 4413:2, 4413:12, 4417:21, 4425:18, 4428:11, 4430:18, 4434:18, 4443:18, 4450:22, 4482:23, 4485:20, 4503:22, 4509:14, 4509:17, 4514:2, 4519:15, 4522:21, 4525:13, 4526:7, 4526:9, 4547:1, 4547:23 up-to-date [1] -4417:21 updated [1] - 4488:15 upper [3] - 4507:24, 4508:19, 4527:22 Upper [2] - 4484:8, 4497:11 upstream [1] -4540:13 **Upstream** [1] - 4366:4 **USDA**[11] - 4462:2, 4474:10, 4474:17, 4474:25, 4475:2, 4475:11, 4476:20, 4477:9. 4478:4. 4480:24, 4481:14 users [1] - 4482:25 uses [3] - 4480:18, 4509:5, 4527:13 **USGS** [4] - 4326:14, 4327:2, 4352:16, 4386:19 usual [1] - 4510:15

validate [3] - 4387:11, 4456:8, 4484:23 valuating [1] - 4489:4 valuation [5] -4535:22, 4536:2, 4536:4, 4536:19, 4537:11 value [43] - 4428:12, 4473:17, 4474:11, THE REPORTING GROUP :5, 4476:2, :5, 4478:17,

4479:16, 4479:25, 4480:18, 4480:20, 4480:24, 4481:5, 4481:6, 4509:7, 4509:10, 4509:15, 4510:10, 4511:20, 4515:7. 4516:11. 4516:17, 4516:22, 4517:16, 4517:21, 4518:11, 4518:12, 4518:16, 4519:3, 4524:1, 4534:15, 4534:16, 4534:20, 4534:25, 4535:9, 4536:2, 4536:9, 4537:22, 4538:14, 4539:4, 4541:11, 4541:22 Value [2] - 4479:13, 4480:9 values [12] - 4474:14, 4474:15, 4475:18, 4534:17, 4534:18, 4534:21, 4534:25, 4535:10, 4535:19 valuing [3] - 4480:20, 4517:8, 4536:2 variable [7] - 4416:12, 4416:16, 4439:22, 4454:24, 4455:1, 4455:7, 4455:11 variable-rate [4] -4454:24, 4455:1, 4455:7, 4455:11 variables [5] - 4387:7, 4416:11, 4464:9, 4466:9, 4543:16 variation [1] - 4411:5 varied [1] - 4527:6 varieties [7] - 4452:24, 4453:5, 4453:17, 4453:20, 4454:3, 4454:11, 4454:14 variety [3] - 4505:12, 4527:21, 4535:6 various [9] - 4310:13, 4415:25, 4418:1, 4425:23, 4440:5, 4441:24, 4444:14, 4459:25, 4521:8 vast [2] - 4504:8, 4537:1 vastly [1] - 4519:12 vegetation [1] -4454:17 version [1] - 4362:18 versus [11] - 4343:2,

unsustainable [9] -

4376:18. 4388:9.

4343:21, 4346:3,

4346:19, 4356:21,

4473:10, 4474:20,

4479:17, 4522:9, 4533:22, 4543:24 vertical [2] - 4390:17, 4457:10 viable [2] - 4406:14, 4407:20 video [73] - 4292:19, 4294:11, 4294:14, 4294:16, 4294:24, 4295:7, 4295:12, 4295:18, 4295:25, 4296:10, 4296:19, 4296:25, 4297:9, 4297:16, 4297:21, 4298:6, 4298:12, 4298:18, 4299:2, 4299:10, 4299:19, 4300:1, 4300:17, 4300:25, 4301:9, 4301:20, 4301:25, 4302:1, 4302:4, 4302:5, 4302:7, 4302:11, 4303:1, 4303:9, 4303:14, 4303:21, 4303:25, 4304:3, 4304:12, 4304:19, 4304:24, 4305:2, 4305:10, 4305:17, 4305:22, 4306:3, 4306:13, 4306:17, 4306:21, 4307:22, 4308:4, 4308:9, 4308:11, 4308:15, 4308:17, 4309:5, 4309:9, 4309:13, 4309:21, 4338:11, 4338:14, 4338:20, 4339:2, 4342:16, 4347:11, 4347:14, 4349:3, 4349:7, 4349:12, 4349:17, 4349:19, 4350:1, 4350:4 videos [3] - 4291:4, 4292:14, 4293:4 videotape [1] -4366:15 videotaped [2] -4302:22, 4338:10 view [8] - 4291:19, 4380:4, 4391:12, 4403:2, 4403:5, 4404:24, 4517:1, 4520:17 views [1] - 4538:10 Vincent [1] - 4359:20 Virginia [4] - 4312:9, 4328:23, 4363:9, 4376:24 visit [3] - 4317:10,

4317:24, 4413:15 visited [4] - 4317:6, 4317:16, 4319:13, 4413:12 vocabulary [1] -4427:24 voice [1] - 4538:9

W

wait [1] - 4522:21

VOLUME [1] - 4285:5

voluntary [1] - 4355:3

Wait [1] - 4502:20 walk [4] - 4291:8, 4302:13, 4380:22, 4469:14 Walton [2] - 4289:8, 4546:25 Ward [2] - 4340:18, 4402:14 ward [5] - 4341:18, 4373:19, 4402:17, 4403:21, 4404:18 Ward's [2] - 4402:24, 4403:6 ward's [2] - 4341:5, 4408:23 warn [1] - 4323:12 warned [1] - 4431:22 warning [2] - 4394:15, 4394:16 Warren [1] - 4344:7 wash [1] - 4500:11 waste [2] - 4525:20, 4526:2 watch [1] - 4339:2 Watch [4] - 4417:6, 4417:12, 4417:18, 4418:9 watched [1] - 4338:20 water [100] - 4314:23, 4320:7, 4320:9, 4320:10, 4340:2, 4340:12, 4344:16, 4345:2, 4345:4, 4345:13, 4345:19, 4353:12, 4399:2, 4404:9, 4427:5, 4437:21, 4438:18, 4439:20, 4441:13, 4441:17, 4441:19, 4444:11, 4444:12, 4445:22, 4446:24, 4447:3, 4448:13, 4451:9, 4451:25, 4453:4, 4453:5, 4453:17, 4453:19, 4453:24, 4454:11, 4454:13, 4454:1

4454:20, 4454:21, 4454:22, 4454:24, 4455:12, 4455:23, 4456:4, 4456:16, 4456:24, 4458:4, 4458:11, 4459:10, 4460:8. 4463:25. 4464:1, 4466:14, 4467:21, 4471:9, 4480:1, 4482:25, 4484:15, 4491:10, 4492:25, 4494:25, 4495:13, 4497:2, 4502:16, 4503:15, 4503:19, 4504:7, 4505:6, 4506:17, 4508:2, 4508:5, 4508:6, 4508:11, 4508:12, 4508:14, 4508:23, 4509:1, 4509:5, 4513:14, 4514:17, 4525:21, 4526:9, 4526:15, 4527:11, 4527:12, 4528:16, 4528:21, 4528:23, 4529:3, 4529:4, 4529:6, 4529:12, 4529:13, 4529:17, 4529:19, 4529:20, 4533:20, 4540:15, 4543:15, 4546:14 Water [7] - 4366:4, 4449:6, 4450:24, 4479:13, 4480:9, 4496:23, 4532:8 water-efficient [6] -4453:5, 4453:17, 4453:19, 4454:11, 4454:20, 4454:22 watermen [1] - 4425:7 Waters [1] - 4346:11 Watkins [1] - 4314:1 ways [6] - 4415:9, 4438:18, 4469:20, 4477:1, 4502:12, 4527:21 wazoo [1] - 4309:20 web [2] - 4368:14, 4368:15 website [3] - 4352:15, 4352:16, 4386:8 weeds [1] - 4506:13 week [1] - 4442:7 week's [1] - 4392:24 weeks [5] - 4402:13, 4411:16, 4545:18 weighted [1] - 4329:7 welcome [4] - 4314:2,

4445:15 welfare [2] - 4513:21 west [2] - 4320:1, 4375:24 western [1] - 4340:6 westernmost [1] -4403:6 wet [1] - 4459:21 whatsoever [3] -4413:9, 4514:17, 4537:6 whereas [2] - 4391:8, 4494:8 WHEREOF [1] -4549:10 white [7] - 4374:6, 4374:8, 4381:4, 4384:20, 4409:11, 4409:18, 4413:23 White [2] - 4365:3, 4409:3 white's [4] - 4409:14, 4410:1, 4410:5, 4420:12 Whitman [1] - 4505:16 whole [4] - 4312:18, 4434:14, 4454:22, 4477:2 Wicomico [2] -4379:15, 4399:21 wide [11] - 4363:22, 4382:8, 4384:10, 4385:11, 4385:12, 4407:24, 4408:18, 4408:21, 4408:22, 4473:6 widespread [1] -4368:9 wife [1] - 4545:21 Wilber [1] - 4354:19 Wildlife [5] - 4297:25, 4346:20, 4347:4, 4371:10, 4416:23 William [4] - 4286:3, 4312:10, 4349:21, 4376:25 willing [3] - 4465:11, 4465:13, 4535:12 window [1] - 4392:25 WINE [1] - 4285:17 winners [1] - 4548:9 winter [1] - 4422:2 WIRA [1] - 4538:23 wish [2] - 4292:6, 4477:13 wished [1] - 4537:25 wishes [2] - 4289:24, 4520:21 Withdrawals [1] -THE REPORTING GROUP:4

withdrawals [2] -4353:13. 4484:15 withdrawing [1] -4463:13 WITNESS [28] -4312:20, 4312:25, 4313:18, 4402:6, 4426:12, 4426:15, 4426:19, 4426:21, 4426:25, 4427:4, 4427:13, 4428:3, 4428:6, 4428:24, 4429:19, 4430:2, 4431:8, 4431:15, 4431:25, 4432:3, 4433:1, 4433:11, 4434:16, 4434:21, 4544:15, 4544:19, 4544:23, 4549:10 witness [12] -4288:23, 4294:1, 4313:17, 4429:13, 4429:23, 4429:24, 4434:9, 4434:25, 4435:18, 4442:7, 4540:19, 4541:11 Witness [1] - 4286:2 witnessed [2] -4326:3, 4341:12 witnesses [6] -4303:6. 4389:6. 4405:17, 4487:15, 4487:16, 4545:2 woman [1] - 4321:7 word [12] - 4309:23, 4433:20, 4440:15, 4451:13, 4451:17, 4457:10, 4459:4, 4470:1, 4518:10, 4524:4, 4526:1, 4539:11 words [7] - 4425:18, 4427:25, 4463:16, 4467:5, 4516:7, 4523:16, 4539:3 works [3] - 4364:22, 4365:3, 4404:1 world [2] - 4379:19, 4510:15 worldwide [2] -4388:7, 4401:12 worse [2] - 4427:25, 4516:8 worth [1] - 4547:12 write [3] - 4360:16, 4362:5, 4363:17 writing [3] - 4288:19, 4309:20, 4358:21 written [17] - 4291:12, 4292:17, 4294:13,

4589

```
4308:22, 4380:17,
                           4529:7, 4531:5
 4380:25, 4381:1,
                          yellow [4] - 4347:16,
 4385:23, 4393:4,
                           4362:21, 4362:24,
 4396:2, 4406:4,
                           4418:5
 4409:14, 4415:13,
                         yesterday [1] - 4445:2
 4415:18, 4425:12,
                          Yield [1] - 4462:14
 4435:11, 4540:5
                          yield [18] - 4462:16,
wrote [8] - 4359:1,
                           4462:17, 4462:18,
 4360:7, 4365:16,
                           4462:20, 4462:21,
 4365:22, 4366:9,
                           4465:17, 4499:1,
 4367:14, 4368:21,
                           4521:7, 4521:19,
 4370:4
                           4523:19, 4526:13,
                           4526:15, 4527:2,
          X
                           4542:22, 4542:24,
                           4543:2, 4543:22
X's [1] - 4416:4
                          yields [3] - 4446:5,
XVII [1] - 4285:5
                           4521:7, 4521:15
                          yourself [21] -
          Υ
                           4312:22, 4327:25,
                           4328:4, 4330:10,
year [53] - 4327:3,
                           4356:20, 4359:10,
 4380:12, 4386:24,
                           4359:19, 4360:5,
 4396:20, 4442:16,
                           4360:14, 4362:3,
 4442:18, 4442:19,
                           4362:23, 4364:12,
 4442:22, 4443:4,
                           4365:19, 4367:11,
 4443:13, 4443:24,
                           4369:25, 4434:18,
 4443:25, 4444:1,
                           4439:5, 4457:21,
 4444:3, 4444:4,
                           4468:24, 4504:22
 4457:25, 4458:12,
 4460:7, 4460:8,
                                    Ζ
 4460:11, 4460:15,
 4460:22, 4461:1,
                          Zeng [4] - 4531:9,
 4461:5, 4461:13,
                           4531:10, 4531:23,
 4473:2, 4474:12,
                           4532:10
 4477:21, 4477:22,
                          zero [6] - 4396:16,
 4478:5, 4478:8,
                           4413:2, 4519:22,
 4499:17, 4499:18,
                           4520:3, 4520:12,
 4499:24, 4508:7,
                           4540:13
 4508:17, 4509:10,
 4511:4, 4514:4,
 4515:2, 4516:2,
 4516:7, 4519:7,
 4519:22, 4521:18,
 4529:8, 4529:9,
 4529:14, 4530:10,
 4530:20, 4531:5,
 4532:18
years [30] - 4326:3,
 4386:22, 4387:1,
 4404:8. 4404:14.
 4407:22, 4414:16,
 4414:21, 4422:1,
 4443:13, 4443:18,
 4443:20, 4449:9,
 4459:21, 4460:3,
 4465:2, 4465:3,
 4465:17, 4477:18,
 4485:9, 4505:22,
 4510:19, 4517:4,
 4518:1, 4519:1,
 4527:5, 4529:2,
```

THE REPORTING GROUP