816 **PROCEEDINGS** 2 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Terrific. 814 3 Nobody got up. SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES No. 142, Original They're slow learners, but they learn. 5 Proceed, counsel. STATE OF FLORIDA, 6 MR. ECHOLS: Good morning, your Honor. Plaintiff, 7 CROSS-EXAMINATION VOLUME IV STATE OF GEORGIA 8 BY MR. ECHOLS: Defendants. 9 Good morning, Mr. Berrigan. 10 Good morning. The above-entitled matter came on for HEARING 11 If we could please pick up where we left off before SPECIAL MASTER RALPH I. LANCASTER, held in the 12 yesterday. We were looking at JX-77, which was U. S. Bankruptcy Court, at 537 Congress Street, Portland, Maine, on November 4, 2016, commencing at 13 the Governor's letter to the federal government 8:55 a.m., before Claudette G. Mason, RMR, CRR, a 14 in connection with the request for federal Notary Public in and for the State of Maine. 15 disaster relief. And we were back, I believe, to APPEARANCES: For the State of Florida: PHILIP J. PERRY, ESQ.

JAMIE L. WINE, ESQ. 16 the August 2012 oyster resource assessment report JAMIE L. WINE, ESQ. ABID R. QURESHI, ESQ. CHRISTOPHER J. FAWAL, ESQ. NATALIE HARDWICK RAO, ESQ. 17 that you had drafted. Do you recall that? 18 Α. CRAIG S. PRIMIS, ESQ. BARACK S. ECHOLS, ESQ. JOSH MAHONEY, ESQ. For the State of Georgia: 19 Q. If we could please turn back to that page again. 20 Let's take a look first, if we could, at the JOSHUA D. DUNLAP, ESQ. Also Present: 21 paragraph underneath the executive summary. And 22 I would like to read a few lines from this 23 paragraph and then ask you some questions about THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart 24 it, if that's all right. 25 Α. That's good. THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart 815 817 INDEX Q. So in the first paragraph here it starts off and 1 Witness <u>Direct Cross</u> <u>Redirect</u> <u>Recross</u> 2 says, observation and sampling of oyster Mark Berrigan 816 968, 1024 1013 3 populations on the primary oyster-producing reefs 4 in Apalachicola Bay during July 2012 indicated 5 that oyster populations were depleted over most 6 of the reef areas sampled and that surviving 7 oyster populations are severely stressed. **EXHIBITS** 8 Do you see that? Page Referenced Number 9 Α. Yes. 10 JX-50 846 And could you explain, please, what is meant by JX-52 914, 1009 11 depleted. JX-60 922, 993 JX-74 867 12 Yes. The term that I typically use for the loss JX-75 868, 1006 13 or extensive mortality among oysters would be JX-77 816, 941, 995 JX-78 948, 1017, 1024 14 depleted. Depleted means that there has been JX-150 859, 958, 987 15 some impact on the population that is less than 16 the number of ovsters. FX-608 875 FX-875 969 17 Q. And does depleted in reference to a reef, as is 18 in this particular paragraph, also mean that GX-2 896 there may be fewer oysters present in that 19 GX-498 945 GX-1248 954 20 location? 931 GX-1296 21 A. If there's an ongoing depletion event, that would GX-1297 888 GX-1305 918 22 suggest clearly that there were less oysters on 23 the reef. 24 Q. If I could ask you to skip one sentence and go 25 down to where it begins more detailed sampling. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 818 820 1 Are you with me? 1 the -- after the letter from the Governor; A. Yes. 2 2 and then the letter from Commissioner Putnam 3 Q. All right. I would like to read that and ask 3 is the August report. 4 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. 4 you, again, a couple of questions. It says, more 5 detailed sampling and analyses confirmed the 5 MR. ECHOLS: Okay. And I'm still just 6 condition of oyster resources and suggested that 6 reading from the third page there under the 7 the poor condition was the result of a 7 executive summary. 8 combination of environmental factors and fishery 8 BY MR. ECHOLS: 9 practices. 9 Q. And, Mr. Berrigan, then that was one of the 10 We touched on this briefly yesterday; but in 10 fishery practices that you identified. What else 11 the category of fishery practices -- and correct 11 did you intend to have included in this category 12 me if I'm wrong -- I believe you stated that one 12 of fishery practices appear in the second to last 13 set of fishery practices might involve the 13 sentence of the first paragraph there? 14 oystermen, when they're harvesting oysters, if 14 A. I believe that the culling is the primary 15 they don't cull and take off the smaller oysters 15 practice that I would have been talking about. 16 16 and throw them back into the bay. Is that **Q.** And, sir, how would culling cause the poor 17 correct; that would be one fishery practice? 17 condition of the oyster resources as set forth in 18 18 A. Culling would be a fisheries practice. the sentence there? 19 **Q.** And could you -- rather than it be in my words, 19 A. I don't -- in my opinion culling had little to do 20 20 could you explain to the Court what culling is? with the condition of the resources in the bay. 21 21 A. Typically oysters are harvested in Apalachicola I don't say that anywhere that there's -- that 22 22 Bay using hand tongs, which are rakes with culling was a contributing factor. 23 opposable heads. And the action of those rakes 23 **Q.** Well, I just want to make sure that we're clear. 24 is scissor-like. And the oystermen hold these 24 We just went through that -- the sampling and 25 long-handled tongs; and they work them in such a 25 analyses that you performed confirmed the THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 819 821 1 fashion that they scoop oysters together and then 1 condition and suggested that the poor condition 2 2 pick them out of the water. And they place the was the result of a combination of environmental 3 3 oysters that come out of the -- out of the tongs factors and fishery practices. So the poor 4 onto a culling board, as it's called. The rake 4 condition was the result of, in part, fishery 5 5 heads are such that they do allow some small practices, which you defined as culling --6 6 shell fragments and small oysters to fall improper culling. Correct? 7 7 A. Yes. And I -- and I see the point that you're through; but typically they will include juvenile 8 8 oysters, marketable oysters, and shell. When making there. The -- in certain circumstances 9 that's placed on the culling board, then either 9 and in -- and this will be important, I think, 10 the tonger or typically -- or more typically 10 throughout this discussion as to what the context 11 there will be another helper on board, another 11 of this should be or will be in my words. 12 crew member that will go through this material 12 We can look at the depletion event as a 13 13 and take out the legal-size oysters, place them bay-wide event, in which case the environmental 14 into bags or baskets or whatever their container 14 conditions affected the ovsters bay-wide. If we 15 unit would be. And the remainder of the material 15 look at the isolated events on Cat Point and East 16 is pushed back into the water. So the entire 16 Hole exclusively, then we could say that 17 practice is considered to be culling, is the 17 harvesting had an impact. That impact, as I have 18 local term for it. 18 mentioned in this report and others, was more 19 19 severe and intense because we were dealing with

MR. ECHOLS: And I apologize at the beginning, your Honor. We're in tab 1 of that binder. I didn't know if you have your binder still from yesterday. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you, counselor. MR. ECHOLS: Okay. And tab 1 will be

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

20

21

22

23

24

25

So I have to qualify my statements in that THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

an already stressed resource. Therefore, with

the stressed resource, culling practices would

that affected the depletion event throughout the

have an impact, certainly, but not at a level

20

21

22

23

24

25

bay.

1

2

3

5

6

13

15

16

17

18

19

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 fisheries practices affected two of the oyster 2 bars in Apalachicola Bay primarily. The others 3 were not affected by harvesting or culling. 4 **Q.** And it is correct, is it not, sir, that Cat Point 5 and East Hole were the primary producing reefs in 6 Apalachicola Bay? 7 A. They have historically been the primary producing 8 reefs in Apalachicola Bay. 9 Q. Meaning that those are the reefs from which most 10 of the oysters that are harvested or a large

portion of the oysters that are harvested come from that the oystermen then bring to the dock and sell?

14 A. Under favorable circumstances, that's correct.

15 Q. And so your testimony is that with respect to
16 those two primary producing reefs, those, as you
17 write here in this August 2012 report which went
18 to the federal government sent by the Governor -19 those were harmed by poor harvesting practices?

20 A. In 2012.

21 Q. Very good.

22

23

24

25

2

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

If we could turn a couple more pages in, please, to page 3 of your August 2012 report.

And if you wouldn't mind, please, looking at the second to the last paragraph, which begins Cat THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

823

**1** Point and East Hole Bar.

A. I see it.

disrupted.

3 **Q.** All right. And as with the first page, let me 4 read you a couple of sentences and ask you a 5 couple of questions. It says, starting off here, 6 Cat Point and East Hole Bar have been subject to 7 a combination of factors that have adversely 8 affected oyster populations, oyster reef habitat, 9 and the oyster fishery. Oyster populations over 10 much of the reef area are depleted and the 11 quality of the substrate is degraded to a point

Once again, I'm going to ask for your help in instructing us and the Court as far as what some of these terms are. So in the first instance where it states, the quality of the substrate is degraded, could you please explain what substrate is and what it means for it to be degraded.

where spat settlement and recruitment have been

A. Oyster bars or functional oyster reefs are made up of living and dead oysters. The dead oysters over time build up what we typically refer to as substrate. And that substrate, over another period of time, a longer period of time, is going to build up some elevation as a feature that we

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

can identify as a reef.

A functional oyster reef will have, I said, living oysters of all life stages and dead shell, and a firmness, a consolidated elevation that all in all is considered a substrate.

I don't know if that was very clear, but --

Q. And then, again, to help us out here, where it states that -- I lost my place here -- spat
settlement, where it states that spat settlement
and recruitment have been disrupted, would you please explain that?

12 A. What was the question again? I'm sorry.

Q. If you wouldn't mind, we're in the same --

14 A. Paragraph?

Q. -- sentence there where it says -- after the quality of substrate is degraded, it says it's degraded to a point where spat settlement and recruitment have been disrupted. Could you explain what that means.

A. Yes. For the most part, oyster populations in
Apalachicola Bay are dependent upon substrate
to -- for larval recruitment. In the broadest
and most basic terms that I can use now, oysters,
both males and the females, extrude their gametes
into the water column where the gametes -- the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

male and female gametes are fertilized. And larvae -- the fertilized egg develops through various stages that we'll just call larval stages until they get to the stage where they're ready to settle out. Typically these larval stages will settle on almost any suitable surface, but the most suitable surface is typically the shell of living or dead oysters.

The settling of this -- of these larvae into a sessile stage is called spat. And the typical reference there is spat fall. When the larvae set on the existing shell or substrate, the terminology is spat fall.

So we speak of successful spat fall, we're talking about successful reproduction and setting. When we talk about recruitment -- when I talk about recruitment, I'm generally talking about the spat that has grown to, let's say, from the size of a microscopic size practically to the size of a fingernail or something like that. That would become a spat that we could recognize and count.

So when we see high numbers of spat, then we're talking about successful recruitment. If we don't see spat on these reefs or on these

THE REPORTING GROUP

- 1 shells, then we talk about recruitment failure.
- 2 **Q.** So in a layman's terms, is spat a baby oyster?
- A. Yes. We can call them a baby oyster.
- Q. Okay. You mentioned sessile. Just so we're all
- understanding the term, when they become 6 sessile -- S E S S I L E?
- 7

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

8 Q. -- what does that mean, please?

find a suitable habitat.

9 A. The -- throughout the early life stages or the 10 larval stages, the larvae are free swimming. So 11 they're moving in the water column in and out of 12 areas. They're primarily guided by salinity 13 gradients, wind and wave action, and prevailing 14 water currents. When they set, the trochophore 15 larvae will bounce around the bottom trying to 16

> Their success rate is probably not that good. It's a big bay, and there's not a whole lot of places they're going to find that are really favorable to survival. But once they attach, they cement themselves to that substrate. And from that point on, they're sessile. So they can no longer move away or -- or seek a more favorable place to live. They're there for the duration of their life.

> > THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- A. If they are removed, it would lower the standing 2 stock, yes.
- 3 Q. I want to turn back a few more pages to page 7 of
- the August 2012 report, please. And in
  - particular, in the middle of the page there's a
- 6 heading that says Harvesting Pressure.
- 7 Α.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2

8 **Q.** And if we look here -- let me start at the first 9 sentence. It says, declining oyster population 10 parameters can be associated with harvesting, as 11 well as environmental influences and natural 12 mortality.

> And then it goes on, reported oyster landings for Franklin County in 2011 increased marginally over 2010 in both production and bags per trip; but harvesting pressure, as measured in reported trips, increased by about 20 percent.

We talked about the environmental influences and the natural mortality; but is it true, as you state here in this report, that one potential cause of declining oyster population parameters can be harvesting?

- 23 Α. Yes.
- 24 **Q.** And I think we touched on yesterday that there 25 was an increase in reported trips -- I believe we THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

827

- **Q.** If we could do down to the next sentence in that
- 2 same paragraph, there is one other thing that I
- 3 wanted to ask your help to understand. The
- 4 sentence says, stress associated with prolonged
- 5 high salinity, high natural mortality and
- 6 predation, and intensive fishing effort have
  - markedly reduced standing stocks of juvenile,
- 8 sub-adult, and adult oysters.
- 9 Do you see that?
- 10 A. Yes.

7

- 11 **Q.** And we have already talked about that there was
- 12 high salinity, predation, and you defined
- 13 intensive fishing effort; but I don't think we
- 14 discussed what are standing stocks?
- 15 A. Standing stock is a term that's used in almost
- 16 all population studies. And that is the -- the
- 17 living stocks that are there. It could be 18 standing stocks of fish or shrimp or whatever.
- 19 But in this case, it's the living oysters that
- 20 are on the reefs.
- 21 **Q.** And is it -- when here you refer to them as being
- 22 markedly reduced, one way that they could be
- 23 markedly reduced would be if they are not there,
- 24 if they have been removed; correct -- the living
- 25 oyster? That would be low standing stocks?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 touched on it; maybe we didn't -- by about 20
  - percent, meaning that there are more oystermen in
- 3 boats going out into the bay to harvest during
- this period of time?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 **Q.** Let me continue to the next sentence there. It
- 7 says, oyster population parameters for Cat Point
- 8 Bar and East Hole Bar suggest that oyster
- 9 abundances and potential production is markedly
- 10 depressed, possibly reflecting the effects of
- 11 continuous harvesting, poor harvesting practices, 12 as well as less than optimal environmental
- 13 conditions in 2010 and 2011.

We talked about already the poor harvesting 14 15 practices. Now, what, sir, is continuous

- 16 harvesting? What do you mean there?
- 17 In the case of Cat Point and East Hole Bar, there 18 had been certain accommodations made, I would
- 19 say. The term probably might not be correct
- 20 there, but there were circumstances where
- 21 harvesting on those bars was extended beyond the
- 22 normal winter harvesting season for those areas.
- 23 Q. And does this go back to what we touched on
- 24 yesterday that with the BP oil spill, the Florida 25 Fish and Wildlife Commission extended the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

832 1 harvesting days that were available on some of 1 to the last sentence of that paragraph beginning 2 2 the bars -- the seasons for harvesting for some another. And it states there, sir, another 3 of the bars? 3 contributing factor was the management decision A. Yes. It would include that -- that type of to allow harvesting from these reefs during the 5 activity that we discussed. summer of 2010 in response to the oil spill 6 **Q.** And this was a change post to 2010 from the way 6 event, April 2010. This resulted in an intense 7 Fish and Wildlife had managed the fishery 7 harvesting effort which precluded any recovery 8 8 previously? time for the resource. 9 A. Yes. There was an extension of harvesting days. 9 Are you with me, sir? 10 **Q.** In the next -- the last sentence of that 10 A. I'm trying to find where you are. 11 paragraph, please, sir, it states, overharvesting 11 Oh, I'm sorry. It's the last --12 is most damaging when environmental conditions 12 Okay. I'm -- okay. Okay. 13 are less than optimal, recruitment is low, and 13 Q. Do you see it there? 14 natural mortality is high. 14 A. I have got it now. 15 Now, you would agree with me that here we are 15 That paragraph that begins vessel counts, and 16 16 in a drought; so environmental conditions are it's the very last two sentences of that 17 obviously less than optimal. Correct? 17 paragraph. 18 18 A. That's correct. A. Okay. What was your question? 19 Q. And here we have talked about some of the 19 Yes. So the question is to confirm for me, 20 20 increase in mortality. Now, what did you mean first, if you would, please, the management 21 21 here when you said overharvesting is most decision to allow harvesting from these reefs 22 22 damaging when you have these circumstances of during the summer of 2010 in response to the oil 23 poor environmental conditions and the like? 23 spill event, that's what we talked about a couple 24 A. The impacts on standing stocks is going to be 24 of times that given the BP oil spill, that 25 greater when harvesting is occurring and there is 25 Florida Fish and Wildlife opened up the bay for THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 831 833 1 no renewing of that population. When I'm talking 1 additional harvesting days and additional seasons 2 2 about a population that is stressed, if you look for a couple of bars? 3 Α. at these numbers that are in these tables and you 3 Yes. 4 look at various parameters, those parameters 4 **Q.** And then the next sentence that you have is 5 5 indicate that there is no recruitment, no growth reference to the intense harvesting effort, in 6 6 in survival of babies, juvenile, and sub-legal which you discussed before; but you mentioned 7 7 oysters. So there is going to be an impact on here further, this precluded any recovery time 8 those standing stock numbers. You are going to 8 for the resource. Could you please explain that. 9 reduce the number of standing stocks. That is 9 Α. Yes, I could. The normal situation that is part 10 10 obvious and inevitable. of establishing the seasons in Apalachicola Bay 11 **Q.** So because the population is not being 11 are such that the winter harvesting bars are 12 12 replenished at the rate it normally would be, the closed for three months during the summertime. 13 13 removal of these oysters to a degree higher than This three months allows recovery during the 14 is beneficial is why the overharvesting is most 14 period when they're not harvested. The other 15 damaging. Would that be accurate? 15 side of that story is the summer harvesting 16 A. No, it would not be. I wouldn't agree with that 16 season is closed for nine months, so that has 17 17 nine months to recover. If the area is fished statement. 18 **Q.** Would you agree with the statement that 18 continuously over that period of time, that 19 overharvesting is most damaging when 19 recovery time is not there. 20 environmental conditions are less than optimal, 20 And that's what happened in this instance, given 21 21 recruitment is low, and natural mortality is the expansion of the harvesting days and bars, 22 22 that this precluded the time for these bars to high? 23 recover? 23 A. Yes, I will agree with that.

Q. Okay. If we could continue down that section to

the next paragraph, please. Let's just go down

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

24

25

24

25

It precluded the time, but it didn't preclude

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

recovery. Some reefs recovered. Some reefs were

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 836 1 never fished. 1 present. Correct? **Q.** Is it -- is that the case that some oyster reefs 2 A. That's correct. 2 3 were doing well, whereas, these others were the 3 Q. And so for two years -- I guess it's over --April 2011 to 2012, for over two years there have 4 ones that were most affected? 5 A. They were. They were doing well in late 2010. 5 been continued observations that there's 6 They were not doing well in 2012. 6 harvesting of small oysters taking place? 7 7 Q. Is that accurate; in 2012 your testimony is there A. I would say that that was correct over that time 8 are no reefs that were doing well? 8 9 A. That's correct. I mean, that's a broad brush; 9 Q. And if we could go to the next sentence, please, 10 but I will accept that. 10 it says, excessive harvesting of sub-legal 11 **Q.** Can we turn to the next page please, page 8. And 11 oysters from 2010 through 2012, which you just 12 if I could direct you, please, sir, to the 12 explained, that this reduced recruitment among 13 paragraph beginning some of the decline. 13 sub-legal size classes to legal size, 14 A. Okay. 14 contributing to declining trends in estimated 15 Q. Now, there, sir, you write in this official 15 production in 2012/2013. This situation results 16 16 report, some of the decline of legal-size oysters from harvesting and culling practices of the 17 17 can be attributed to the excessive harvesting of fishermen when sub-legal oysters are not culled 18 18 and returned to the reef to grow to marketable sub-legal oysters. Since 2010 there have been 19 numerous reports of oystermen harvesting oysters 19 size. 20 20 below the legal size limits, and observations in You just explained a moment ago to the Court 21 21 what recruitment meant. And here you say that the marketplace confirmed that the harvest of 22 22 small oysters was very common during the DWH oil this excessive harvesting of the small oysters 23 spill event and has persisted to the present. 23 that's been taking place for two years reduced 24 Are you with me there? 24 recruitment. Does that mean then that because 25 25 A. Yes. small oysters were taken out of the water, they THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 835 837 Q. And, again here, there's a 3-inch size limit for 1 were not able to grow up to become big 2 2 oysters with some tolerance; is that correct? market-size oysters? A. Yes. That's -- that's -- recruitment in this 3 A. That's correct. 3 4 Q. And so when we talk about sub-legal oysters, case means being -- growing into market size. 4 5 we're talking about oysters that are smaller than 5 Q. And as you also explained to the Special Master a 6 that? 6 moment ago, after oysters are pulled up with the 7 A. Less then 3 inches. 7 hand tongs, what the fishermen are supposed to do 8 Q. Less than 3 inches. And that might include --8 is cull off the smaller ones and put them back. 9 sub-legal might include juvenile oysters? 9 But what you were reporting here is that that was 10 10 Would you call some of them juvenile as well? not taking place as it should have been? 11 A. I use those two terms somewhat interchangeable. 11 Α. No. There -- it -- it is a common practice; and 12 Sub-legal is really referring to those that are 12 it was taking place during this period of time. 13 13 Q. But that's -- and that's not the way it's going to be legal in a matter of months. 14 Juveniles would be a wider range, I think. But I 14 supposed to be? 15 would not say that I haven't used those terms 15 Α. According to the regulation, that's not the way 16 16 interchangeably in this report. it's supposed to be. 17 **Q.** And you note here that observations in the 17 Q. And for the health of the oyster resource and the 18 marketplace confirmed that the harvest of small 18 reefs? 19 oysters was very common during the oil spill 19 Α. No. It really doesn't have a lot to do with the 20 event. That's a true statement; correct? 20 health of the oyster reefs. What this is saying 21 21 A. Yes, that is. is that it reduces the number of oysters that are 22 Q. And then here we're in 2012 when you have written 22 recruited into that size. 23 and submitted this official report in August of 23 So if you look at the production parameter of 24 2012. And you state that that observation --24 harvestable oysters per acre, that's going to be 25 those types of observations have persisted to the 25 reduced by taking out those smaller oysters that

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

19

25

4

5

6

7

18

21

841

- 1 would have eventually moved into that size class 2 and raise that number.
- 3 **Q.** And is it not correct that the reason there was a
- 4 fishery collapse is that there were not
- 5 sufficient legal-size, market-size oysters to be
- 6 harvested?
- 7 A. That is not the biological case. You -- the case
- 8 that could be made from a fisheries perspective
- 9 is that if there are not enough harvestable
- 10 oysters remaining, then there would be a collapse
- 11 in the fishery. What I'm talking about for the
- 12 most part in this report is that there was a
- 13 major depletion event that occurred because of
- 14 poor environmental quality. And it had very
- 15 little to do with harvesting or taking of legal
- 16 or sub-legal oysters, because that was the end
- 17 play. The damage and stress was done and was --
- 18 had progressed to a very dire situation prior to
- 19 the harvesting of adult oysters.
- 20 **Q.** It's your testimony, sir, then that it makes no
- 21 difference for the health of the oyster resource
- 22 if the small juvenile oysters are taken off the
- 23 reef and not returned, that that has no effect on
- 24 the health of the oyster reef and the oyster
- 25 resource?

2

10

11

12

13

14

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 but the -- the overall vitality would not be 2
  - We can -- we can put this in terms of allocation, I guess. If you -- if you have a
- 5 standing stock and you know that that standing 6 stock is going to grow to some size, and you want 7 to harvest it at that size, but you take it 8 before it gets to that size, there's really no
- 9 difference except that you have taken that same
- 10 oyster earlier. 11 Q. How about if we have a situation where, as here,
- 12 there are very few market-size oysters. Let's
- 13 say they have all been harvested, and now all the
- 14 juvenile oysters have been harvested. Does that
- 15 cause an effect on the health of the reef, or is
- 16 the reef still healthy in your opinion?
- 17 A. The reef is definitely not healthy. If you can 18 harvest all of that product, it's not healthy.
  - This is a renewable situation that is dynamic.
- 20 And in Apalachicola Bay, you have to 21 understand that spawning is taking place almost
- 22 every month of the year. There's recruitment
- 23 almost every month of the year. There are
- 24 spawning peaks that we can watch and follow and
  - make -- be able to develop relationships about

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

839

- A. In my opinion it does not. Natural mortality is
- so high and so high even among that class that it
- 3 has little to do with the vitality and
- 4 functionality of an oyster population. These
- 5 oysters, for the most part, live for
- 6 approximately 18 to 24 months. If they are
- 7 removed when they're 15 months old or removed 8
- when they're 24 months old, it really does not
- 9 have an impact on the functionality of the reef.
  - What does have a very great impact on the functionality of the reef is the recruitment of spat and small oysters. And they should be the driving factor for the population, not the end of

the life of these oysters. It's the beginning

- 15 that's important.
- 16 **Q.** How about if they're all removed, sir? All the
- 17 juvenile oysters, sub-legal oysters are removed
- 18 from the reef?
- 19 A. If all of the sub-legal oysters that were going
- 20 to move into the adult-size classes were removed,
- 21 there would be a -- the number that we look at 22 for harvestable oysters per meter, per acre,
- 23
- would, of course, drop to a very low level. The
- 24 value of the crop might drop if the oysters were 25 too small. So there would be some value there;
- THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 what's going to happen on that reef. And by

- 2 looking at those -- that population as a whole, 3 you're able to establish whether that population
  - is healthy and whether that reef is healthy.
  - Again, taking the top of that or the end of those oysters is not critical. It's -- those

oysters are -- can I elaborate on something?

- 8 Q. Well, why don't we -- we can continue on. I'm
- 9 sure your counsel will have time --
- 10 A. Okay.
- 11 **Q.** -- to have you elaborate on some of these.
- 12 Α. Okay.
- 13 Q. Let's try to get through at least this first
- section before we get to the morning break. 14
- 15 A. Okay.
- 16 Q. It is your testimony, sir, that if all the
- 17 juvenile oysters and all the market-size oysters
  - have been removed, then that would be an
- 19 unhealthy reef?
- 20 Α. It's -- that is a very hypothetical situation. I
  - mean, that occurs in massive mortalities, massive
- 22 depletion events, and what I would call an
- 23 extension event, which I have seen on reefs. I
- 24 have seen that many times. But those did not

25 come from harvesting. I have never had the

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

844 1 occasion to see where harvesting was efficient 1 get there -- but still, now, in August 2012 this 2 2 enough to remove all of those oysters. same harvesting practice is taking place? 3 But to answer your question, if they were all 3 Α. That's correct. 4 gone, I would say, yes, that reef is in serious 4 Q. Next sentence down, you refer here -- this is the 5 ecological trouble. paragraph beginning the Division's 2011. And it 6 Q. Okay. Well, let's good. And I'm going to show 6 states, the Division's 2011 oyster resource 7 you some pictures before we finish this first 7 assessment report for Apalachicola Bay, Division 8 8 of Aquaculture 2011, stated that oyster block of that situation where you have harvested 9 reefs where all the oysters have been removed. 9 population estimates indicated that recruitment 10 So we'll get to that, so you can explain that to 10 would keep pace with harvesting pressure and 11 the Court then. 11 sustain production throughout the 2011/12 winter 12 The next paragraph here says -- this is the 12 harvesting season, colon, with the caveat that 13 paragraph beginning the practice. And it says, 13 increased harvesting pressure and/or the unabated 14 the practice of harvesting sub-legal oysters 14 harvesting of sub-legal stocks may alter the 15 appears to be an extension of a "use it or lose 15 production/harvesting balance. In 2011, reports 16 it" attitude that prevailed during the fall and 16 of the harvest and sale of oysters below the 17 winter of 2010. Following the oil spill in April 17 legal-size limit was still common practice, and 18 2010, there was an acknowledged threat to oyster 18 it is now clear that there are not sufficient 19 resources in Apalachicola Bay, and management 19 numbers of juvenile and market-size oysters to 20 20 policies were directed toward harvesting support harvesting throughout the upcoming 21 21 available resources in the face of a growing risk 22 22 of loss. That's what you wrote here in August of 2012? 23 23 A. Yes. That's what you wrote in this official report 24 24 **Q.** And this is a warning that you were providing in that was provided to the Governor and provided to 25 the federal government. Correct? 25 2011, it states, that if this increased THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 843 845 1 A. That's correct. 1 harvesting pressure or the unabated harvesting of 2 **Q.** And this is in August 2012. Right? sub-legal stocks continued, there may not be 3 3 A. That's correct. sufficient numbers of juvenile and market-size 4 **Q.** It goes on, throughout the period when oil posed 4 oysters to support harvesting throughout the 5 5 an unpredictable threat to the oyster fishery, upcoming season. Right? 6 6 A. That's correct. less effort was directed toward enforcing size 7 7 Q. And you did -- you did a 2011 report. This was limits, perhaps yielding to the view that it 8 8 would be more beneficial to harvest the available something that you recognized even a year prior 9 9 resource. But, unfortunately, many oystermen to this August 2012 report; isn't that the case? 10 10 A. This -- this was a -- something that is pretty have continued the same harvesting practices that 11 11 were allowed during the oil spill threat. easy to recognize when you look at the data and 12 12 Now, in that first sentence there, sir, it make this interpretation. 13 13 says, less effort was directed toward enforcing What this is stating is that we have a 14 size limits. 14 nine-month season. If you harvest all the 15 Now, that's the responsibility of Florida 15 juveniles or sub-legal ones in the first two or 16 Fish and Wildlife Commission. Correct? 16 three months of that season, yes, you're going to 17 A. That's correct. 17 begin to run out by that -- by the end of that 18 **Q.** The size limit being 3 inches and the rule being 18 season. 19 that except for some tolerances, those small and 19 **Q.** And this is a concern that you raised in 2011, 20 juvenile oysters are not supposed to be taken out 20 not just in 2012? 21 21 of the water? A. I have raised that concern almost every year when 22 22 A. They're not supposed to be. there's some concern about the number of standing 23 23 stocks. **Q.** And here you're saying in August 2012 that

24

25

24

25

even though back when the oil was believed to

possibly be coming to the Bay -- and it didn't

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

And, again, that becomes an allocation issue.

Do you want to try to take them all in the first

THE REPORTING GROUP

849

3

9

1 couple of months of the harvest, or do you want 2 to try to make that last throughout the whole 3 season? 4 The dealers and the processors would love to

be able to say, okay, let's make this last the whole time. The oystermen, on the other hand, are saying, I need the money now. I'm going to harvest now.

So that's -- when they speak of tragedy of the commons, this is a perfect example of that.

**Q.** Let's take a look at what you wrote in the 2011 report, if we could, please. And I have got this behind tab No. 2 in your binder, and it has been designated as a joint exhibit submitted by both Florida and Georgia. And it's JX-50.

Are you at the 2011 report?

17 A. Yes. I'm sorry.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

18 **Q.** No. I just wanted to make sure.

> And if you would look, please, underneath the introduction just to time-set ourselves here, the last sentence of the first paragraph states, this report summarizes oyster resource surveys conducted by the Division of Aquaculture from 2009 through September 2011.

Do you see that?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 and the abundance of juvenile, sub-legal, and

2 market-size oysters suggest that the overall

condition of many reefs has declined over the

4 past two years. Some of the decline of

5 legal-size oysters can be attributed to the

6 excessive harvesting of sub-legal oysters during

7 the fall and winter of 2010 when a "use it or 8

lose it" attitude prevailed.

Do you see that?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So here back in September 2011, a year before 12 what we were just reading in 2012, you had the 13 same concern that you were expressing in this

14 official state report. Correct?

15 A. That's correct.

16 Q. And if you go to the very end of that page --17 I'll skip the middle sentence there -- there is 18 the sentence that begins however. Do you see 19 that?

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. And then this continues onto page 5 of the 22 report. It states, however, it remains uncertain 23 whether oyster populations on Cat Point and East 24 Hole Bars can sustain concentrated harvesting

25 effort for the remainder of the winter harvesting

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

847

1 A. Yes.

2 **Q.** So we can take generally the date of this report 3 to be in or around September 2011?

A. I'm sorry. What --4

5 **Q.** I'm sorry. Since we don't have the date of the 6 particular month --

7 A. Oh, yes.

8 **Q.** -- at the top of it, so we should understand this 9 to be about a September 2011 report?

A. Okay. Yes. 10

11 **Q.** Let's go -- I don't want to re-cover things that 12 are the same as in the prior report; but there 13 are some things that are a little bit different 14 here.

> If we could go to page 4. And on page 4 -well, let's go down to the very bottom of that page. There's the paragraph that begins the overall. Do you see that?

19 A. I see it.

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q. Okay. As you will see if you look up at the top, you have the references to intense harvesting pressure and the like; and you report on the fact that the population parameters are depressed. But if we go to this particular paragraph at the bottom, it says, the overall condition of reefs

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

season.

1

4

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 And that's a warning that you put in this 3 official 2011 -- September 2011 oyster resource assessment report as part of your responsibility 5 at DACS. Correct?

6 A. Yes. And it's -- it means the same thing. It --7 if harvesting is extensive in the beginning, the 8 resources may not last throughout the season.

9 **Q.** And you have a similar statement, if we stay on 10 the same page and go down one, two, three, four, 11 five paragraphs to the one that begins stable or 12 declinina.

13 A. I see it.

14 **Q.** And there it states, stable or declining 15 population estimates over the past two years 16 generally indicated that oyster populations are 17 stressed -- which you stated before.

> During 2010 and 2011 oyster population parameters reflected relatively stable production estimates, which, when compared to harvesting pressure, number of trips, suggests that resource availability may not be capable of sustaining current harvesting levels, bags per trip. The number of bags per trip has declined each year for the past five years.

> > THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

8

10

13

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

Now, could you please explain to the Court what you're referring to here when you state resource availability may not be capable of sustaining current harvesting levels, bags per

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. In this particular report, this is creating a predictive index for what the fishery is going to be like in the 2011-2012 winter harvesting season.

These data are collected prior to the opening of that season. So we have a series of production parameters that I'll call them. And by analyzing and interpreting that data and those production parameters, I'm able to tell the oyster industry what I feel is going to be the situation for their fishery.

When I can tell by changing parameters -- and it might be the number of recruits. It might be the density. It might be the predicted bags per acre. It might be the percentage of legals and sub-legals. It might be the percentage of oysters that we expect to recruit. By looking at those numbers, if I see that some of those numbers are -- have changed to such a degree that I think that within the next nine months this is

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 know, down the road?

2 A. I'm warning them that's because there are some

indices in our data that suggest that we're not

recruiting fast enough or there has been a -- a

break or an impairment or damage to some portion

6 of this cycle.

7 Q. And that's what you're putting in this official

DACS report, which is part of the information

9 that the Fish and Wildlife Commission uses in

evaluating what limits, if any, it should apply

11 to harvesting in the bay?

12 Α. We had this discussion yesterday. To my

knowledge -- and I would be the most

14 knowledgeable person -- I don't know that FWC has

15 used this data to set any kind of limits other

16 than extending the harvesting season to five to

17 seven days after November 15 or 16 of each year.

18 **Q.** So I just want to make sure that we have got your

19 testimony clear, sir, that you, as the most

20 knowledgeable and resource manager for

21 Apalachicola Bay, take all the time and effort to

22 put these reports together and to lay out where

23 you have concerns about what may happen in the

fishery, and none of this goes to FWC?

25 Α. You have to -- the report would go to FWC. The

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

851

going to affect what they harvest, then that's what I say.

And this is -- in these reports, that's pretty much it. It's my interpretation of that data as to what you can expect to harvest. When I say that the expectation for harvest may not -the availability may not be high enough to last through nine months, that is always going to depend upon harvesting levels.

And, again, I go back to the allocation thing. You have nine months to harvest these oysters. Do you want to try to harvest them all in the first week, or do we want it to last?

So that -- this is where I'm constantly trying to influence the -- the harvesting community that this is not an unlimited resource out there. Based on what I'm looking at, you may have trouble meeting your orders in April or May. Think about it.

That's what I'm -- I'm telling the industry.

**Q.** And you're saying here that at the current harvesting levels that were taking place that the industry was taking the oysters out of the bay, you're warning them that there may not be sufficient resource if they keep doing that, you

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

report is a public document. It's typically published in the local paper. I typically have a meet -- an organizational or public workshop type of thing in Franklin County, maybe in a presentation in front of the Board of County Commissioners, that type of thing, to give them the information that we have.

So I always send this to FWC. But the only thing in their regulations that relies on this is that particular extension of the number of days per week in the winter harvesting area.

12 Q. Well, you're not saying, sir, that FWC is

13 precluded from, on its own having read your

14 report and these warnings -- you're not saying

that FWC is precluded from putting in some limits

16 if it decides that's the best way --

17 A. If it wanted to go through their rule-making 18 process, yes, they could -- they could use this

19 information.

20 But it's not even the rule-making process though, 21 right, because right after the August 2012 report 22 when everybody realized that the resource had

23 been so depleted, FWC imposed some limits.

24 Right?

25 A. I -- they -- I don't know the answer to that. I

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

856 1 don't believe that there was -- I don't know the 1 At the very top of that page, there is the 2 answer to that; so I probably should not say 2 paragraph -- and I guess I'll read it, although 3 anything. 3 I'll read it slowly enough for madam court 4 But I -- I think that what they did was reporter. It states, there were numerous reports 5 through Executive Order extended the harvesting 5 of oystermen harvesting oysters below the 6 days. I don't know that they did anything with 6 legal-size limit. And observations in the 7 bag limits. 7 marketplace confirmed that the harvest of small 8 **Q.** So your recollection is that after receiving the 8 oysters was very common during the DWH oil spill 9 August 2012 report where you warned that the 9 event. This situation resulted from harvesting 10 standing stocks were low and the resource was 10 and culling practices attributed to fishermen 11 depleted, FWC expanded the amount of days for 11 responding to the uncertainties that the bay 12 harvesting? 12 would be closed and the fishery lost. Throughout 13 A. No, that's not what I said. 13 the period when oil posed an unpredictable threat 14 Q. Okay. 14 to the oyster fishery, less effort was directed 15 A. Those expanded days were previous to this report. 15 toward enforcing size limits, perhaps yielding to 16 16 After the 2012 report came out and we had the view that it would be more beneficial to 17 discussions and we met with the community and 17 harvest the available resource, a "use it or lose 18 18 things like that, FWC did not expand the days it" approach. 19 after that to the best of my knowledge. 19 And that's what you put in this official 20 20 Q. And you're not saying, sir, that FWC, which is report back here in September 2011. Right? 21 21 the resource manager that manages the fishery --A. That's correct. 22 22 you're not saying that they're legislatively **Q.** And, again, here you're talking and providing 23 23 this information publicly and to FWC saying size precluded from taking actions to protect the 24 24 limits are not being enforced? fishery and the resource; are you? 25 Α. 25 A. I say that, and I don't know what the reaction No, they're not legislatively precluded from THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 855 857 1 that. And I wouldn't -- I would -- when I'm 1 from FWC would have been to see that because I'm 2 2 speaking of resource management and fisheries sure they're saying that we are enforcing it the 3 management, I consider myself to be a resource 3 way we're supposed to. 4 Q. I'm sure they are. And we'll get to that management -- manager, not a fisheries manager. 4 5 5 So when you -- when you combine those two terms, testimony, because now you have said this two 6 6 that's going to make my testimony confusing years in a row. But FWC, you would expect, would 7 7 because I'm not on the fishery side; I'm on the say, we are doing a good job? 8 resource side. 8 Α. That's correct. 9 Q. Right. 9 O. But that's not what your view was and what you 10 10 wrote in September 2011 or in August 2012? A. I'm in a different agency. 11 11 Q. Correct. And you for 30 years have been the This -- let me qualify that a little bit now. 12 12 resource manager writing these reports. And, This is -- if you look at this thing, there were 13 13 frankly, I wasn't aware these are totally public. numerous reports. 14 So everybody in the community, FWC and everybody 14 I get this information from the dealers, the 15 15 can see if you're raising a warning about the processors, the oystermen, the community members. 16 16 I'm the person they call and talk about this, decreasing population; is that correct? 17 17 these situations. So what I'm doing here in A. Yes. Everybody can see that. 18 Q. And FWC then has that information. And they're 18 trying to report to the industry is to bring in 19 the fishery manager, and they're the ones then 19 all of the information that I'm given for this. 20 who would get to decide if they're going to do 20 I do agree that there was a "use it or lose 21 anything with this information? 21 it" approach. And in discussions as a resource 22 A. It would be their decision. 22 manager and as a -- and dealing with fisheries 23 23 Q. Let's go to the next page. And I'm only going to managers, under the circumstances, it was -- it 24 take a short amount of time on it because it's 24 was not an unprudent decision to allow oystermen 25 25 very similar to what we looked at before, page 6. to remove those stocks because it did look like THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

we were going to lose those harvesting areas.

There would be no point in trying to salvage those oysters. They wouldn't be there the next year. So there is no point in doing it. It's almost like leaving fruit on the vine. We would go ahead and harvest it because we are at a real risk of losing the economic benefit that we have

9 Q. But at this point, sir, we're in September 2011.

10 The oil spill was in April 2010. Right?

11 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

19

20

21

22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

23

24

- 12 Q. And then you had the same thing --
- 13 A. Well, I'm talking -- I'm sorry. I'm talking 14 about while during the oil spill, when there was 15 a real risk there.
- Q. Right. 16
- 17 A. That's what I'm talking about. I'm not talking 18 about the years following that.

What I have said is that in the years following that, the same attitude existed and continued, that that's what I got from various reports from people.

23 **Q.** But this paragraph, there were numerous reports 24 and the "use it or lose it", that's an accurate 25 representation of your opinion on this matter.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

BY MR. ECHOLS:

**Q.** Let's go into the Contributing Factors section in the middle of the page there, please. And let me read here. It says, in April 2010 the Deepwater Horizon event caused oyster fishermen in the community to change their individual economic strategies and thus caused the Franklin County Seafood Workers Association, FCSWA, to request the Department open Apalachicola Bay in its entirety. In order to accommodate their request, the Department opened the summer oyster bars early, 5/21/10, and subsequently opened the winter oyster bars early, 6/18/10.

Correct?

And that's consistent with what you testified about the steps that FWC took in response to, I guess, not only the threat, but the request from the Seafood Workers Association to expand the availability of harvesting. Right?

20 A. Yes.

21 **Q.** It goes on to say, even after the entire bay was 22 open for harvesting, there were numerous reports 23 of oystermen harvesting oysters below the legal 24 size limit, and observations in the marketplace 25 confirmed that the harvest of small oysters was

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

859

A. I -- I would say yes.

Correct?

Q. All right. I want to move back or, rather, forward in time to when you were putting together the August 2012 report that the Governor sent to the federal government. And just before that -and I believe you and I talked about this before in your deposition -- there was a series of notes that you put together to set out some information to potentially include in the report.

And I would ask if we can take a look at tab 3 of your binder. And behind tab 3 we have got JX-150. And, again, being a JX, that means this is a document that both Florida and Georgia have designated to be entered into evidence.

If you would, please take a look at JX-150.

- 17 A. Oh, I have it. I'm sorry.
- 18 **Q.** And this is the document JX-150. At the top it 19 says, Input For Mark's Report, July 2012. Do you 20 see that?
- 21 A. Yes.

22 MR. ECHOLS: And, sir, are you there,

too, on tab 3, sir?

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Yes.

25 MR. ECHOLS: Very good.

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

very common during the DWH oil spill event. This situation resulted from harvesting and culling practices attributed to fishermen responding to the uncertainties that the bay would inevitably be closed and the fishery lost.

And you go on to say there's less effort directed at enforcing size limits, and at the bottom the "use it or lose it" approach.

And these are your notes that you were taking for yourself at this time in July 2012 in preparation for putting together the August 2012 resource assessment report; is that correct?

13 A. I -- I would probably agree with that. I don't 14 recall this particular part of my process in 15 doing it. But it's here, and so I'll accept 16 that.

17 Q. And I don't know if it assists you to recall at 18 all, but if you look down at the bottom 19 right-hand corner, the very, very bottom

20 right-hand corner, do you see that there is a 21 number -- what we call a Bates number or a

22 document number?

23 A. Yes.

24 And it's got the FL-ACF-Berrigan. Do you see

25

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

3

5

16

18

19

2

6

7

TRIAL - November 4, 2010 (Vol. IV

1 A. Yes.

3

2 Q. Does that help you recall that these are among

the documents that you were asked to provide and

- 4 gave to the State of Florida's attorneys that
- 5 then were produced to us in the course of the
- 6 litigation?
- 7 A. I'm sorry. I didn't follow that completely.
- **8 Q.** I'll make it simpler. When we asked for -- when
- **9** Georgia and when we asked to have your
- 10 deposition, we also asked you to provide
- documents relating to the topics of this lawsuit.
- **12** Do you recall that?
- 13 A. Yes.
- **14 Q.** And some of the lawyers -- I don't recall which
- one -- from the State of Florida came to you and
- asked you to give them the documents you had
- 17 relating to this lawsuit?
- 18 A. Okay. Yes. And this was one of those.
- 19 Q. And this is one of those, as you can see --
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. -- from the bottom right-hand corner where it has
- your name. That's the way the documents from you
- were numbered.
- 24 A. Okay. I'm not arguing that. I'm just saying I
- 25 don't recall how this entered into the process.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 I mean, typically this is not the way I work.

2 I usually write the report and then do amending

drafts and that type of thing. I typically

4 wouldn't go to this kind of trouble and then

- write the report.
- 6 Q. Okay. But --
- 7 A. I'm just confused about how this fits into that 8 process.
- 9 Q. Sure. But you don't have any dispute, sir, that10 you wrote this?
- 11 A. No. No. I'm fine with that.
- **12 Q.** This is your document, and these are your words.
- 13 Right?
- 14 A. Yes. My only concern there was that you said
- 15 that I made these notes prior to writing the
  - report. These may have come after I wrote the
- 17 report.

But, yes, I'm not -- I'm not arguing that they're not my notes.

- **20 Q.** Would you call this process here that you're
- writing about, the fishermen placing everything
- in the tongs into the bag, would you call that
- 23 tonging up trash?
- 24 A. Yes. That's the terminology.
- **Q.** I recall that because in your direct testimony THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

863

- **1 Q.** Oh, sorry.
- 2 A. I mean, I understand how it entered into the
- 3 process that we're in now. I don't know how it
- 4 entered into the process of writing the report.
- **5 Q.** Very good. Let's please go down to the paragraph
- that starts further compounding. And I wouldlike to -- we have talked about the first part.
- 8 Let's go to the last sentence, please, where it
- **9** starts exacerbating. Are you with me, sir?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And it's got, exacerbating this harvesting
- pressure is a new cultural characteristic of the
- harvester, wherein fishermen are not only
- 14 ignoring the size restrictions, but placing
- everything in the tongs into the bag, resulting
- in a loss of shell, cultch, and shellstock.
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. Yes.
- **19 Q.** And this is one of the notes that you put down
- 20 for yourself at the time as you're preparing to
- put together the August 2012 official DACS
- 22 report. Right?
- 23 A. Again, I -- I confirm that this is here; but I
- 24 can't confirm that I put this down before or
- 25 after the report or whatever.

THE REPORTING GROUP
Mason & Lockhart

- 1 that you submitted in the case, there was that
  - reference. And if we could look -- I don't know
- 3 if you have your direct testimony in front of
- 4 you, but we'll pull it up on the screen. It's
- **5** paragraph 59 in your direct testimony.
  - And we -- I believe that --
  - MR. ECHOLS: I believe, your Honor, it's
- 8 on page 17 of the written direct testimony,
- 9 sir.
- 10 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- 11 Q. And there, sir -- are you there, Mr. Berrigan?
- 12 A. Yes.
- **13 Q.** And there, sir, in paragraph 59 you said in your
- written direct testimony, similarly, the collapse
- of the oyster fishery in Apalachicola Bay in 2012
- 16 was not as a result of harvesters taking unculled
- oysters and dead shell off the reefs when
- 18 harvesting. This practice is commonly called
- **19** tonging trash. Observations suggest that this
- **20** practice is uncommon, and only practiced by a
- 21 small group of unskilled oystermen. This type of
- harvesting results in a vastly degraded product
- and is meant to deceive the processor and the
- **25** practice is that the oystermen are hauling off

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

consumer. The concern with this harvesting

4

13

- 1 the bay.
- 2 Correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And that's what you have in your sworn written 5 testimony here?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Let's go back to JX-150. And in JX-150, which 8 you have acknowledged --
- 9 MR. ECHOLS: And this is back, again, 10 judge, in tab 3 where we were.
- 11 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- 12 **Q.** The portion that was highlighted here saying that 13 this is a new cultural characteristic of the 14 harvester, wherein fishermen are not only 15 ignoring the size restrictions, but placing 16 everything in the tongs into the bag, resulting 17 in a loss of shell, cultch, and shellstock.

And that, what you're writing here in 2012 at the time of these events, is where you're stating that this tonging trash is taking place. Right?

- 21 A. I see that in both, yes, if that's the question.
- 22 Q. Yes.

18

19

20

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

All right. Let's see if we can get through a couple things quickly and then finish this line of discussion.

#### THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

If we could turn, please -- we'll move

forward. We had the August 2012 report. Let's go to September, the next month. And in tab 4 of your binder, sir, you will find a Summary of Oyster Resource Assessment for Apalachicola Bay

7 MR. ECHOLS: And for the record, this 8 document is JX-74, another joint exhibit.

dated September 2012.

- 9 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- Q. Are you there, sir? 10
- 11 A. Yes. I'm sorry. Yes.
- 12 Q. No problem. And if we could look on the -- on 13 the very first page --
- MR. ECHOLS: And here we are in tab 14 15 No. 4.
- BY MR. ECHOLS: 16
- 17 Q. And on the very first page on tab No. 4, if we 18 could look to the second to the last bullet, please. That starts the continued. And here you 19 20 write in this summary in September 2012, the 21 continued depletion of the oyster populations 22 could lead to longer term debilitation of oyster 23 resources and oyster reef habitats. The 24 long-term impairment of reef structure, reef 25 elevations, shell matrix, and shell balance is of

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1 serious concern because substrate on many reefs 2 is degraded to a point where spat settlement and

3 recruitment have been disrupted.

Do you see that, sir?

- A. Yes.
- 6 **Q.** And this is what you are putting in this report 7 in September of 2012?
- A. Yes. 8
- Q. And here, as you were explaining to the Court how 9 10 there is the reef structure and the reef
- 11 elevation, you're noting that there is a
- 12 long-term impairment of it because the substrate
  - is degraded and that this may affect the
- 14 reproduction, spat settlement, and recruitment.
- 15 Right?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. If we could go to tab 5. We're still in September 2012. 18

19 MR. ECHOLS: And for the record, tab 5 20 is JX-75. That's another joint exhibit.

- 21 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- 22 **Q.** And this document is similar to the -- somewhat 23 similar to the format of the August report. This 24 is an Oyster Resources in Apalachicola Bay 25 September 2012 report. Do you see that?

## THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

869

1 A. Yes.

867

- Q. And if you look at the bottom right-hand corner, 3 you can identify, again, this came out of your 4 files. It has the numbering system that shows it
- 5 came out of your files. Do you see that?
- A. Yes. 6
- 7 Q. I don't want to go over the things -- the
- 8 document is in the record. There's a lot that
- 9 repeats what we have seen in these other
- 10 documents with respect to fishery practices and
- 11 harvesting pressures. But if we could then turn
  - back to page 3, are you with me, sir?
- 13 A. Yes.

2011.

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q. Okay. And then there is the section at the bottom of page 3 that says Harvesting. We have got the first paragraph there, sir. It says, oyster abundance and potential production are markedly depressed, possibly reflecting the effects of intensive harvesting and poor harvesting practices combined with less than optimal environmental conditions in 2010 and

> And then, as we have seen before, overharvesting is most damaging when environmental conditions are less than optimal,

> > THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

70

recruitment is low, and natural mortality ishigh.

**3** And both of those are true statements.

4 Correct?

#### 5 A. That's correct.

6 **Q.** And the last -- let's go to the next paragraph. 7 It states, harvesting practices may have had a 8 detrimental impact on standing stocks and oyster 9 resources on the primary producing reefs, where 10 standing stocks of juvenile, sub-legal, and 11 market-size oysters, as well as the overall 12 condition of the substrate have declined 13 substantially over the past two years as a result 14 of continuous, concentrated, and intensive

harvesting by the majority of the fishing fleet,
and the excessive harvesting of sub-legal
oysters.

And that's what you wrote in September of 2012?

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. Is that accurate, sir?

22 A. Yes.

25

7

8

11

14

17

18

Q. And this was a true statement; you were beingaccurate in this official report as part of your

duties as the resource manager --

# THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 BY MR. ECHOLS:

2 Q. You mention in your written direct that in the3 fall of 2012, you presented at a meeting of the

4 Franklin County Board of Commissioners. Do you

recall that?

6 A. Yes.

5

13

Q. And this was a public meeting where members ofthe community were invited to come, listen, ask

**9** questions, participate. Correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And you discussed with them your findings and the

12 Department's findings about the health of the

oyster resource at that time. Do you recall

**14** that?

15 A. That's correct.

**16 Q.** And --

17 A. I do recall it.

**18 Q.** I'm sorry?

19 A. I do recall it.

20 Q. And, in fact, this is something you mentioned in

your written direct; and it's an exhibit that

22 Florida has put on their exhibit list. It's

23 Exhibit 608. And it's not a document because

24 it's a video.

This meeting was actually videoed. Right?
THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

871

1 A. Yes.

**Q.** -- of the oyster population?

3 A. Yes.

**Q.** And then the last sentence -- or, rather, the

paragraph says, some of the decline of legal-sizeoysters can be attributed to the excessive

harvesting of sub-legal oysters. Since 2010

there have been numerous reports of oystermen

9 harvesting oysters below the legal size limits,10 and observations in the marketplace confirmed

that the harvest of small oysters was very common

during the DWH oil spill event and has persistedto the present.

And you wrote that as well, sir?

15 A. Yes.

**16 Q.** So at this point in time we have at least five

different occasions that you have raised this concern from September 2011 to your July notes --

just internal, I take it -- the August report,

the September summary report we just looked at,

21 and then this September report. Is that

accurate?A. Yes. It's a continuous concern.

24 Q. All right. Now, sir, you mention in your --

25 MR. ECHOLS: We can take that down.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1 A. I only understand that it has. I have not seen the video.

**Q.** Okay. But you -- you have -- I can -- you cite

4 in your written direct that you were at the

5 meeting. And I think actually -- hold on a

6 second.

10

20

7 A. I cite that I was at the meeting, and it was

8 video recorded.

 ${f Q.}$  Okay. In paragraph 49 of your written direct you

have the statement, I viewed a true and accurate

11 copy -- I think we're missing an of -- the

12 Commission meeting at which I presented Exhibit

13 608. And it is an accurate representation of

14 what occurred during this meeting.

15 A. I have read transcripts, not -- I have not seen the video.

17 Q. Oh, so this was a misstatement; you haven't

18 viewed it?19 A. Okay.

**Q.** Well --

21 A. I mean, does it say that I -- okay. All right.

22 I -- let me make this clear. I have not seen the

23 video. I have reviewed the transcript.

**24 Q.** Okay. It's an inaccurate statement?

25 A. Okay.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

**Q.** Is that correct?

5

16

17

18

19

1

- A. Repeat the statement. 2
- 3 **Q.** It is inaccurate in your written direct testimony
- to say that you have viewed a copy of this 4
  - meeting -- a video of the meeting?
- 6 A. Does it say I reviewed a copy of the video? 7 Which number is it, sir?
- 8 **Q.** Paragraph 49, please.
- 9 A. Okay. I was on it.
- 10 **Q.** I don't want to take too much time. Just let the 11 Court know if you view this as accurate or not?
- 12 A. Well, I mean, when I think true and accurate 13 copy, I'm thinking transcript. I'm sorry. 14 That's -- you know.
- 15 Q. Okay. Very good.

Well, I want to ask you about something that you presented to the Franklin County Board of Commissioners and to the entire community, the oystermen and such that were at this meeting.

20 MR. ECHOLS: If we could go to slide 1, 21 please.

- BY MR. ECHOLS: 22
- 23 **Q.** And if you wouldn't mind here, we had to pull 24 this off of the YouTube, you know, that's on the 25 internet there. Can we play what you have here.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

875

- (Whereupon the video was played.)
- MR. ECHOLS: And here, if I might 2
- 3 approach, your Honor, I have got a copy of
- this slide from Florida Exhibit 608. 4
- 5 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- 6 **Q.** And so now, sir, as you're presenting to the
- 7 Franklin County Board of Commissioners and the
- 8 Apalachicola oyster industry and community, you
- 9 intended your statements to be true and accurate;
- 10 did you not?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. And what you told them was, as you have explained
- 13 some today and in your official reports, that,
- 14 quote, we have lost a lot of reef structure on
- 15 our most important reefs. And you go on to say
- 16 that this is a very serious issue. Correct?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 **Q.** And we're going to talk more about restoration
- later and things that the State could have, 19
- 20 but did not do. But you note that we have got
- 21 to figure out methods of restoring those.
- 22 Right?
- A. Surely. That's my job. 23
- 24 **Q.** Right. And when you say we, are you referring
- 25 there to FDACS, to FWC, to the community, to the

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- 1 fishermen?
- 2 A. I use the term we quite a lot in these types of 3
  - meetings. It's trying to be collective in my
- 4 view that I'm part of them, and they're part of 5
  - me. I mean, yes, it's a -- a collaborative type
- 6 of we.

8

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

9

- 7 **Q.** And collaborative in the sense that everybody
  - should be working together in efforts to protect
- 9 the oyster resource. Correct?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 **Q.** You go on here to say, I mean in the past with
- 12 Apalachicola under normal or optimal conditions,
- 13 these oyster populations have been so resilient
- 14 that you've been able to fish them hard -- I
- 15 guess fish them hard is relatively
- 16 self-explanatory.

You go on to say, you've been able to take the adults. You've been able to take the smaller oysters, and the population has come back. We've seen it come back time and time again.

Now, does this go to the point that you, I believe, testified to yesterday that the harvest of the sub-legal oysters, the smaller oysters, is a relatively common practice?

25 A. Yes. It's a relatively common practice.

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

877

- **Q.** You go on to say -- and you're providing this information to the Franklin County Board of
- 3 Commissioners and the community -- in this
- 4 case -- and that's referring to here in
- 5 September 6, 2012. Correct?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 **Q.** So we're talking about the summer of 2012.
- 8 In this case we probably bent it too far.
  - That's what you told them?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 **Q.** You said, we bent until we broke. Correct?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- 13 **Q.** And you went on to say, now, so things are going 14 to have to change as far as management is

15 concerned to allow this to come back.

16 And when you're referring to management 17 there, you're referring to fishery management. 18 Correct?

- A. Management of the oyster fishery primarily. 19
- 20 Q. And this is September 6, 2012, you know, which -
  - and we don't have to look back to it now; but you
- 22 can -- is the same date of the Governor's letter
- 23 to the U.S. Department of Commerce requesting a 24 fishery disaster declaration?
- 25 A. I'll take your word for it. I -- I never made

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

878 880 1 that comparison before. 1 understanding what these things looks like. 2 2 MR. ECHOLS: I'm going to move on to a 3 new subject, your Honor. I don't know if 3 A. Okav. 4 it's a good time to do a break. MR. ECHOLS: If we could put up slide 2, 5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 5 please. 6 A. Please take a break and please move on to another 6 BY MR. ECHOLS: 7 subject. 7 Q. So what you have here, sir, are three examples 8 (Time Noted: 10:21 a.m.) 8 that Dr. Lipcius gave me of different conditions 9 (Recess Called) 9 of reef substrate. Do these, as a general 10 (Time Noted: 10:37 a.m.) 10 matter, look kind of familiar to you as far as a 11 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 11 subtidal oyster reef? 12 BY MR. ECHOLS: 12 A. I would certainly recognize it. 13 Q. Mr. Berrigan, I'm going to totally change gears 13 Q. You know what; I think you may have to move your 14 here now, if I could, and go back to asking your 14 microphone closer. 15 help to explain certain things about the oyster 15 Α. Yes. I would recognize them as oyster reefs. 16 Q. 16 reefs and the sampling process just so that the Sure. 17 Court and we all have the same thing in our heads 17 Α. The bottom one I wouldn't be 100 percent sure. 18 18 as we're reading these documents. Okay? **Q.** Sure. But assuming these are all oyster reefs; 19 A. Okay. 19 but the top left-hand corner one, A, now, in this 20 20 Q. One of the things that you talk about in your particular picture, you can see -- well, 21 21 written direct is that you can tell by looking at actually, sir, why don't you describe it to the 22 22 the reefs that -- well, you say that the surface Court. How you -- how would you describe this to 23 23 the Court? of a reef has a different appearance if living 24 24 A. This is a view of what I would consider to be a oysters are removed from it compared to a normal, 25 unharvested reef or a reef suffering significant 25 functional oyster reef. You see adult oysters in THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 879 881 1 mortality. Right? 1 clusters. You will see smaller oysters. We 2 2 A. That's correct. don't have the resolution to see spat or real 3 3 **Q.** And most of the reefs in Apalachicola Bay are juveniles on there, but this would be a typical 4 subtidal; is that right? 4 reef that probably has not been harvested since 5 5 A. Yes. these oysters are, in my opinion, still clustered Q. So that's under the water. 6 6 together. This would be very representative of a 7 7 And as part of your resource assessment, you restored reef that hadn't yet been subject to 8 or some of the folks working for you, Mr. John 8 harvesting. 9 9 Q. Okay. Gunter, Joe Shields, actually go under the water 10 10 and look at the reefs; is that right? MS. WINE: Excuse me, counsel. Do you 11 A. That's correct. 11 have hard copies of these demonstratives? 12 Q. So I just want to make sure, because when I think 12 We don't -- we haven't been provided 13 13 of reef, I think of coral reefs and such. And anything other than what you're flashing up this is very, very different; is that right -- or 14 14 on the screen right now. 15 somewhat different? 15 MR. ECHOLS: Oh, yes. 16 A. Well, they're living biological features, both 16 Do you have that -- oh, sorry. 17 coral reefs and oyster reefs. 17 BY MR. ECHOLS: 18 Q. All right. I just want to make sure that when 18 Q. And then, sir, if we could bring up picture B, if 19 we're thinking about it, we know what it looks 19 you wouldn't mind describing it to the Court how 20 like. And I have some demonstratives. 20 you would interpret this. 21 And I'll tell you up front that this is 21 A. Although -- from looking at this, I can't really 22 22 not Apalachicola. I wasn't able to find those. tell whether we're looking at all dead oysters or 23 23 But our expert, Dr. Lipcius, who helped restore not. It would appear that we're looking at --24 the center feature there would be of a box, which the Chesapeake Bay oyster population, he gave me 24 25 some pictures to assist the Court as far as 25 would be a dead oyster with the shell still THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

2 But if I was -- in my predirect testimony, I 3 explained that when you have a massive mortality, 4 the oysters will stay in place. But because 5 they're no longer functioning, because they're no 6 longer living and pumping water and actively 7 creating these microcurrents and those type of 8 things that keep the silt off of them, the one 9 thing that you will notice typically on a -- when

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

1

2

3

articulated.

And if you do a comparison, you can see -although the -- that this -- the comparison is obvious here. It's not always so obvious.

you have a mass mortality is that the oysters

begin to silt in. And I think picture B is

16 **Q.** So could this represent a live reef that's been 17 harvested, or your interpretation would be that 18 this is a reef that has dead oysters on it?

fairly representative of that.

19 A. I can't tell that from -- from this. It -- it 20 would appear that there are live oysters here; 21 but I -- I just could not tell from this. I 22 mean, in -- in the real situation, you would --23 you could tap the oysters or be able to just wave 24 your hand and remove the silt and be able to tell 25 whether they were living or dead. I really can't

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

would you describe this?

2 A. Well, the closest thing that I could say about 3 this -- if, in fact, it is an oyster reef, this 4

is what the major reefs in Apalachicola looked 5

6 was an extremely disruptive hurricane in terms of

like after the passage of Hurricane Elena, which

7 tidal surge.

8 Q. Okay. And this reef has no elevation, you know, 9 no oyster shell whatsoever. Correct?

10 A. I can't tell.

11 **Q.** One of the things -- and tell me if you agree 12 or disagree with this. You know Mr. Kal

Knickerbocker who succeeded you at DACS?

14 A. Yes.

13

21

24

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

15 Q. When I was asking Mr. Knickerbocker to explain to 16 me what the quality of the substrate being

17 degraded meant, he told me that -- he said

18 normally a reef has got all kinds of aberrations

19 on it; and it's very rough. That would be

20 consistent with the A picture that we looked at.

Right?

22 More or less?

23 A. Yes.

Q. But then he went on to explain that one that's

25 been harvested heavily, that's been knocked down,

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

883

make that judgment based on the amount of silt. But this reef may be a reef that, you know,

just has a lot of silt on it.

- 4 Q. Sure. In any event, regardless whether they're 5 alive or dead, if you were out or an oysterman 6 were out tonging with the big rake handles, 7 tonging up, they would be picking up shells?
- 8 A. That's correct. That's correct.
- 9  $\boldsymbol{Q}.\;\;$  Okay. And that's the process that you described 10 before where you pick up all the shells, put it 11 on the culling board. And this would be in 12 connection with the resource surveys, something 13 that you or Mr. Shields, Mr. Gunter would do in 14 that process?

15 Sorry. Sorry. I went totally sideways. 16 Even if these oysters are dead, the shells

17 are there?

18 A. That's an important factor --

19 Q. Right.

20 A. -- in -- in determining whether or not a reef has 21 been harvested or whether there's been a natural 22 mortality event.

23 Q. Okay. Can we take a look at C, please. And now, 24 if you will assume with me that this does reflect 25 what is a reef or supposed to be a reef, how

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1 then you're looking at a surface more similar to 2 a tabletop. Does that sound accurate to you?

3 A. The area that is harvested could be flattened, 4 but typically working with tongs is not going to 5 do a great deal to the topographic feature.

Reefs are --

7 Q. You should move the mike again. I'm having 8 trouble hearing you.

Α. Reefs, as I said, are very haphazard in a way, in a natural way. But the edges of reefs typically will show elevation. And that elevation is built up over hundreds of years, maybe thousands of years. And it takes some pretty violent storms. And Hurricane Elena is the only time that I have witnessed anything that violent occurring. And it still did not change much of the topography. It did level off the tops of bars; but in most cases it either exaggerated or -- or somewhat obscured elevation by the movement of materials from one side of the reef to the other.

MS. WINE: I'm sorry, your Honor. I have been trying to give counsel a lot of leeway; but I just want to note that he was just reading testimony, I believe, to the witness without providing the witness a copy

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

888 1 of that testimony or any context, which I 1 described as a parking lot? 2 2 believe is improper. I just want to note my A. I think I have heard that used in -- in work 3 objection. 3 groups and that type of thing. 4 MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, this is **Q.** And let's take a look at one example of that. 5 deposition testimony that we have designated 5 I think we have got some additional exhibits 6 that will be in the record. 6 here. And so we have got a second binder that 7 7 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Sorry? begins with, I believe, tab 6. 8 MR. ECHOLS: I'm sorry. This is 8 Did I give you the proper thing, sir? 9 deposition testimony of Mr. Kal Knickerbocker 9 A. I see it. 10 which we have designated to the Court to be 10 Q. Okay. If you wouldn't mind taking a look at 11 included in the record. When it gets to our 11 tab 6. 12 case, you know, we will proffer that, as the 12 A. Okay. 13 other deposition testimony has been. 13 MR. ECHOLS: And tab 6 for the record is 14 I'm not asking Mr. Berrigan to confirm 14 GX-1297. 15 or deny, you know, whether Mr. Knickerbocker's 15 BY MR. ECHOLS: 16 16 **Q.** And you will see that it's two-pages of some statement is correct. I'm asking whether he 17 agrees with the characterization of the reef. 17 running e-mails. And as is always kind of 18 18 To the extent that you want me to get a annoying, in order to have it in sequence you 19 deposition, I can pull it. It's up to you. 19 have to start at the end and work your way back 20 20 MS. WINE: Your Honor, we would just up forward to get the context. 21 request if he's doing any more of this in the 21 So if I could direct you to the second 22 22 future, that he provide the actual testimony page --23 to the witness so the witness can see what 23 A. Correct. 24 he's referencing and look at the context if 24 **Q.** -- and the earliest e-mail there, which starts in 25 he would like. 25 the middle of that page from Joe Shields, III. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 887 889 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: That's 1 1 Do you see that? A. Yes. 2 reasonable, counsel. 2 3 MR. ECHOLS: Yes, your Honor. Will do. 3 **Q.** And who is Joe Shields, sir? BY MR. ECHOLS: 4 A. He is a member of my -- my research or resource group. He works for DACS. He worked for me. I 5 **Q.** All right. So to the extent that the picture C 5 6 is a reef there, you would agree by looking at it 6 was his direct supervisor. 7 there is zero shell there. There is no habitat 7 Q. And he worked for you for approximately 10 years; 8 there that would be suitable for oysters. 8 was that right? 9 Correct? 9 A. I -- I don't know how long. I didn't -- I 10 10 A. It would be very poor substrate. wouldn't think that it was 10 years. It might 11 11 **Q.** All right. And so if the spat that you talked have been a shorter duration than what. 12 about before were to settle, that spat wouldn't 12 Q. But he participated in work with you --13 have anything to grow on. Right? 13 A. Yes. 14 A. Silt is a -- is a very debilitating factor for 14 **Q.** -- in doing some of the resource protection 15 clean substrate. 15 surveys? 16 **Q.** Have you ever heard the term used to describe the 16 Yes, he did. 17 condition of a reef as being -- as looking like 17 **Q.** And he did some of the dives as well? 18 a, quote, parking lot? Have you ever heard that 18 A. Absolutely. 19 term before? 19 **Q.** And, in fact, after -- you did most of the dives 20 20 A. I probably used that in trying to explain what for the first 25 years or so; but then he started 21 21 Cat Point reef looked like after Hurricane Elena. to do more of them? 22 22 **Q.** How about with respect to this time period when, A. That's correct. 23 23 as you acknowledged, there was excessive and **Q.** All right. So, now, here we have got in this 24 intensive and continuous harvesting on Cat Point; 24 e-mail Mr. Shields to you. Can you identify 25 do you have any recollection of it being 25 that, indeed, that's the case? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

892 A. That's the case. 1 MS. WINE: I would object to that 2 2 Q. And we're here in mid-2012, in July. And if we characterization. And he's not showing him 3 look at what Mr. Shields is telling you in the 3 that portion of the report. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Sustained. 4 very first paragraph --5 A. Yes, I see it. 5 MR. ECHOLS: Do we have his deposition, 6 Q. Okay. And he says there, Mark, we dove on 6 Mr. Smith? 7 Cat Point and East Hole this morning. If 7 BY MR. ECHOLS: 8 8 **Q.** I'll come back to that once we pull up the you recall what we were tonging up when we 9 were with the commissioner, you can imagine 9 testimony. 10 what I saw on East Hole today -- a parking 10 A. Okay. 11 lot with oysters concentrated around stone 11 **Q.** But -- so your testimony is at least that stone 12 crab burrows. My thoughts would be that this 12 crabs were a major part of the issue as far as 13 lack of resource is more a function of extended 13 predation in your experience? 14 harvesting pressure, rather than the adverse 14 A. Definitely. 15 effects of a freshet, like the one associated 15 **Q.** And the -- the characterization here that 16 with TS Debby. I did not see any sedimentation 16 Mr. Shields is providing you is that the East 17 layered on resource. 17 Hole Bar looked like a parking lot with oysters 18 Do you see that? 18 concentrated around the stone crab burrows. And 19 A. I see it. 19 he's telling you that his assessment of this, 20 **Q.** And it's correct at this time that there had been 20 based on having done these dives, is that the 21 Tropical Storm Debby, and you and the other 21 lack of resource is more a function of extended 22 22 resource managers were checking to see whether harvesting pressure. Correct? 23 the storm had caused damage to the reef? 23 A. That's what he is saying. 24 A. That's correct. 24 Q. And then could you --25 Q. And Mr. Shields, as he said, went out and dove 25 MR. ECHOLS: If we could take that down. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 891 893 1 the reef and identified, as he described it, that BY MR. ECHOLS: 2 East Hole was a parking lot; and he identified **Q.** Could you explain to me what is shell hash. 3 two stone crab burrows. Correct? 3 A. Shell hash is the more fine shell. It's the broken shell that you find as the basis of oyster 4 A. That's what he says. 5 5 **Q.** Now, stone crabs weren't particularly a problem reef. 6 in -- as far as predators at this point in time. 6 It's a terminology that we use. It probably 7 7 does not have a good scientific definition, but Were they? 8 8 A. They were an extreme problem at this time. it's finer shell. 9 Q. Stone crabs were probably less than 4 percent of 9 10 10 any issue? also not very good substrate? 11 11 A. Not necessarily. Shell hash is proven to be a A. Pardon me? 12 Q. Weren't they less than 5 percent, minimal, de 12 pretty good substrate on Cat Point Bar in the 13 13 past. It's one of the reasons that fishermen minimis, as far as any stone crab impact on the 14 resource? 14 like Cat Point Bar is the fact that oysters set 15 A. No. I think that they were the major predator on 15 on shell hash; and that produces what they like 16 Cat Point Bar. By far the major predator. 16 to call a single cup oyster, which is a premium 17 Q. The only reason I'm asking you, sir, is you know 17 quality product. **Q.** Have you ever heard the term used "shell hash 18 that Florida has an oyster expert in this case, 18 19 19 Dr. David Kimbro? parking lot"? 20 A. I understand what he's saying when he says that 20 A. Yes, I do. 21 21 because I dove on that same situation. **Q.** And Dr. Kimbro, who we'll have here in a couple 22 22 of days, I'm sure, he said that the stone crabs, Q. Okav. 23 23 A. But I also understand at the same time what he's based on his experiments, were not an issue at 24 all, that they were --24 saying about the -- about the stone crabs and the 25 A. That could be --25 shell aggregated around the stone crab burrows. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

896 1 This is a very typical scene on Cat Point and had 1 would be weighted; and you throw it off the boat 2 2 been for several years. randomly. It settles to the bottom on the reef. 3 Stone crabs tend to forage. And they're very 3 Is that right? Semi-random. 4 good foragers. And they will pick up all of the Α. 5 live oysters within a certain circumference of 5 Q. Okav. 6 their homes and drag them there. So when you 6 A. If that quadrat landed in an area where there 7 find a stone crab burrow, it will be surrounded 7 were no oysters, we would not sample that. We 8 by live oysters and dead oysters. And it is easy 8 would replace the quadrat. 9 enough to pick up a dead oyster shell from a 9 Q. Okay. And -- I'm sorry. And the next step is 10 stone crab burrow and see how the animal ate the 10 once the quadrat has gone down, the diver -- you 11 oyster. 11 or Mr. Shields or whoever the diver is -- goes 12 **Q.** So that there would be shell there then? You 12 and --13 would find shell? 13 MR. ECHOLS: Can we put the picture of 14 A. There is shell around those. And I'm very 14 the reefs back up, please. 15 familiar with what he's talking about. 15 BY MR. ECHOLS: 16 16 **Q.** And so it would not look like what we had up **Q.** And so this quadrat would land on some surface? 17 before, that picture C, where we couldn't see any 17 A. That's correct. 18 18 shell, correct, because you would have shell on? **Q.** It could be like A or B or C. And then you would 19 A. You could probably find some areas where -- that 19 scoop up everything that's within that square; is 20 20 were devoid of large shells or live oysters. But that right? 21 21 in the later stages of this depletion event on A. That's correct. 22 22 Q. And then you take what's in the square, and you Cat Point, stone crabs were extremely abundant. 23 23 I don't know what they were per meter squared put it in a mesh bag? 24 24 or that type of thing, but the abundance was A. Yes. 25 25 Q. And this Georgia Depo 2, if you could identify greater than we had ever witnessed. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 895 897 1 Q. Let's -- given that we have looked at the 1 it. Is this the type of mesh bag generally that 2 2 different pictures of the types of reef would be used? 3 structure, I wanted to do that to -- for you to 3 A. No. We would use typically a dive bag. This 4 give the Court the opportunity to understand 4 looks like a culture bag. It's a nice bag, but 5 5 it's not what we would use. We would use better your sampling and survey methodology --6 6 A. Correct. something with a much larger mesh so that water 7 Q. -- which you describe in your direct. And you 7 would pour through it easily. 8 8 explained how you used -- how you collect samples Q. Okay. Well, this is not a great demonstrative 9 using quadrats; is that correct? 9 then; but I'm going to --10 10 A. That's correct. A. I would like to have those for my clam farm. 11 **Q.** I will tell Dr. Lipcius that he put me in a bad 11 Q. And it's -- just so -- it's always easier, at 12 12 least I think, rather than using the word itself, situation. 13 13 to have an item to look at. No, just kidding. 14 So I have got here --14 So if the quadrat lands on one of these 15 15 surfaces, if it landed on a surface like A, you MR. ECHOLS: I don't have extra copies 16 16 would be scooping up a lot of material to go in of it. I'm sorry. 17 A. I could recognize that anywhere 20 feet deep. 17 the mesh bag. Correct? 18 Q. Can you confirm that this is similar to the type 18 That's correct. Α. 19 of quadrat that you would use? 19 **Q.** If it landed on a surface like C, there is not 20 A. It is. 20 much of anything there; is that right? 21 MR. ECHOLS: I don't know if your Honor 21 A. Well, there -- yes. I can't make that call from 22 22 wants to see what this looks like. this picture. But if you -- we certainly would BY MR. ECHOLS: 23 23 sample that bottom if we -- if the quadrat landed Q. Okay. So this is a PVC quarter meter square on that bottom, we would sample that. 24 24 25 pipe. And as you testified in your direct, this 25 Q. I'm sorry. You would sample it, you said? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 900 1 A. Yes. 1 slide, please. Q. Okay. 2 BY MR. ECHOLS: 2 A. Because it's representative of the reef. **Q.** So this is, just so you and the Court are aware, MR. ECHOLS: Could we have these slides? the center of East Hole oyster bar in January 5 (Discussion off the record.) 5 2013 when Dr. Kimbro's graduate students were 6 MR. ECHOLS: Okay. If we could put up 6 diving there. I took this off of his video. It 7 the next demonstrative. 7 was online. Do you see that? 8 BY MR. ECHOLS: 8 A. No, I haven't, sir. 9 Q. Again, this is just to assist everybody with 9 Q. I'm sorry. But here is a situation where there 10 being able to see. And recognizing, as I do now, 10 is no dead shell at all. You're not getting dead 11 that this bag is not exactly the type; but here, 11 oysters subject to predation. 12 for instance, would be a situation if you went 12 A. That looks pretty bad. 13 down to the quadrat and you scooped up a bunch of 13 **Q.** Closer to a parking lot? 14 shell and put it in a bag. And your bags have 14 Okay. All right. We're done with that. 15 larger mesh, but it could --15 What was the date there? 16 16 **Q.** January 2013. A. Yes. It's the same. 17 Q. It is the same, okay. And that would be -- this 17 Α. Okay. 18 18 **Q.** So this is directly after the oyster disaster is both -- in your process you would scoop up 19 both live and dead oysters and shell? 19 declaration has been requested and right at the 20 20 A. That's correct. time, as you have been describing, that Cat Point 21 21 **Q.** Everything that's within the quadrat you put in and East Hole have been subject to continuous and 22 22 the bag. And if it were a healthy reef like we intensive harvesting and that sub-legal and legal 23 were looking at before, it's a pretty full bag. 23 oysters are being taken and poor harvesting 24 Riaht? 24 practices are taking place where people aren't 25 25 A. It could be so full that it's difficult for throwing the oysters back in as they should. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 899 901 1 the diver to lift, or it could be like you see 1 Right? 2 in this other picture that there's not much in 2 A. I didn't say that. That's -- what this shows 3 it. 3 is -- yes, this could be on East Hole. Is this Q. Okay. 4 representative of all of East Hole? I can't tell 4 5 5 you that. MR. ECHOLS: Now, can we go to the next demonstrative, please. 6 Q. Sure. 6 7 BY MR. ECHOLS: 7 A. And would we be sampling on a place like that? I 8 8 **Q.** Here -- maybe that's a better bag, actually. can tell you, no; we would not. 9 Here we have a situation where you can see in 9 So I'll take your word that it is what it is. 10 10 the top left, there is the quadrat? Q. But change gears again now, still -- it would 11 11 A. That's correct. make sense to continue; but in a related manner 12 Q. And then the -- the mesh bag, there is a 12 as we have looked at, is it correct, sir, that 13 13 different reefs are different, you know, different style mesh bag, I believe. 14 A. That's a dive bag. That's the type we use. 14 depending on where they are in the bay, the 15 Q. Okay. That's the type you use. 15 salinity and other conditions that they are 16 Here. I'll give you a hard copy, if you 16 exposed to, and the substrate characteristics and 17 like 17 the like? You would agree with that; would you 18 And this is a situation here where there's 18 19 almost nothing being pulled up in these samples. 19 A. Yes, I definitely would agree that they are 20 20 different. 21 A. That's what it looks like. 21 **Q.** And would you also agree, sir, that what happens 22 22 Q. So there's no shell, dead or alive, live oysters, on one reef may not be a good representation of 23 23 or anything. Right? what you could expect bay-wide or on another 24 A. That's what it appears to be, yes. 24 reef?

25

A. That's correct.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

MR. ECHOLS: And can we flip to the next

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

8

903

- 1 Q. Basically each one of these reefs acts as its own 2 little individual ecosystem? 3
- A. I'm trying to think of the right word for that.
- 4 I mean, when we talk about ecosystem, we're
- 5 talking about a little larger thing. But
- 6 there -- there's -- let's just say that they are
- 7 isolated ecosystems that -- there is terminology
- 8 for it; and it's not micro, eco, or macro. But I
- 9 don't recall what it is.

10

24

1

9

18

But your statement is essentially correct.

- 11 **Q.** Okay. Basically -- basically all of these reefs 12 are acting as kind of individual ecosystems based 13 on the conditions of the portion of the bay 14 they're in. Right?
- 15 A. As a scientist, I just have a difficult time 16 agreeing with that because they're not isolated 17 as far as reproductive potential. They are 18 dependent upon other reefs for reproduction. 19 The -- their reproduction is not isolated. Once 20 they have spawned into the water column, those 21 larvae may move miles from -- from that reef. So 22 larvae that are spawned on a reef are not 23 necessarily going to set on a reef -- on the same
- 25 Q. Okay. Sir, do you remember that you and I met THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

reef. Most likely they won't.

- 1 in Apalachicola Bay; would that be accurate?
- 2 A. Yes. I agree with the premise that we're dealing 3 with here that one reef is not representative of
- 4 the other reef -- of another reef.
- Q. And also not representative of the bay. Right --6 a single reef?
- 7 Not a single reef.
  - Q. In fact, as you have explained to me, as a matter
- 9 of fact, it's impossible; and it shouldn't be
- 10 done. Right?
- 11 A. It should not be done.
- 12 Q. Yes. I take it you were not involved in working
- 13 with Florida's experts in connection with their
- 14 preparing their expert reports?
- 15 A. No, I was not.
- 16 **Q.** So to that extent -- to the extent, if it is the 17 case, that Dr. White had a model that based 18 conditions on the bay on a single reef, you would 19 have told him that it's impossible to make a 20 statement of one size fits all and shouldn't be 21 done to reach conclusions about the entire bay 22 from a single reef?

23 MS. WINE: Your Honor, I object to that 24 again. Again, he's characterizing something 25 that an expert witness said or maybe said,

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

before when I took your deposition?

- A. Yes. 2
- 3 Q. Okay. I'm not trying to be controversial at all, 4 but just to be complete and accurate, if I can
- 5 refer you to page 148 of your deposition.
- A. Okay. 6
- 7 Q. And if you will see in the area of lines 11 to 8 25, I had asked you a question about what you were noting at this point in time. And you said 10 in part in response there, quote, and we --  $\mbox{\sc I'm}$ 11 starting on line 17. And we early found out that 12 what happens on one reef is not a good 13 representation of what to expect bay-wide or on 14 another reef and things like that. All of these 15 reefs are acting as kind of individual ecosystems
- 16 based on the conditions of the -- that portion of
- 17 the bay.

Correct? That was your testimony?

- 19 A. That's correct. I don't find a problem with 20 that, except that trying to be more scientific 21 about it, my terminology of individual ecosystems 22 is -- you know, it's very broad there.
- 23 **Q.** Sure. And then -- but you also then would agree

Mason & Lockhart

- 24 it's very difficult to make a statement of one 25 size fits all when you're talking about oysters
  - THE REPORTING GROUP

- 1 his characterization of it, and asking the 2 witness to comment on it.
- 3 MR. ECHOLS: Judge, I don't think it's 4 an unfair question for me to -- whether I'm 5 accurate or not, obviously Dr. Wilson will be
- 6 here. Counsel will have redirect. If I'm
- 7 shown to be wrong, that's fine. But given 8
- that I have got Mr. Berrigan, who has got 9 30-plus years of experience evaluating the
- 10 bay, and this is his sworn testimony, I don't

think it's an unfair question.

- 12 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Would you ask 13 the question again, please.
- 14 MR. ECHOLS: Sure.

15 BY MR. ECHOLS:

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. And I can keep it very simple. Would you agree, sir, that in your opinion based on your experience as one of the most knowledgeable people about the bay, that it would be inappropriate and should not be done to draw conclusions about the entire bay based on a single oyster bar?
- 23 MS. WINE: Now, he's just asking him a 24 hypothetical. And he's a fact witness, your 25 Honor.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

908 1 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I'm sorry? 1 a clean surface to set on. The act of shelling 2 2 MS. WINE: I said now he's asking a is putting clean shell on these reefs so that 3 hypothetical. And he's a fact witness, not 3 there is a clean surface available for oysters to 4 an expert witness, your Honor. set on. It's a very common practice and probably 5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: You may 5 the most simple management practice that we can 6 6 do that has proven to be successful. Very 7 A. To the issues that you address there, you will 7 simple, adding habitat, creating habitat that the 8 have to repeat to me. 8 oysters can use. 9 But let me say this before that. I am not a 9 Typically this is done in a large scale. 10 modeler. I really don't do very much modeling. 10 Typically we use a barge to deploy the materials. 11 And I know that there are a lot of limitations to 11 We also collect these oyster shells often from 12 modeling, and they're based on available 12 processing plants so that we recycle the shell 13 information. So I would never tell anybody don't 13 that's from shucked oysters. do this. 14 14 By placing it out there, we are -- we are 15 And I forget exactly what you said in the 15 creating or rehabilitating, the term that we use 16 16 middle of that question that I -- that I found a most, reef structure. And we can deploy that at 17 17 little bit objectionable. But I think it was various levels, depending upon how impaired the 18 18 something to the effect that I would never tell reef structure is. 19 somebody to do that or something like that. And 19 Q. You would agree that it's a -- it's an important 20 20 I would actually encourage them to do the resource management tool for maintaining and 21 21 modeling. enhancing productive oyster habitats? 22 22 Now, whether or not I would trust their A. It's a -- did you say important? 23 conclusions, if their conclusions were opposed or 23 **Q.** Important resource. 24 24 contradictory to what I have personally observed, A. Yes, it is important. 25 I would have a problem with that. 25 Q. And I think you called it a best management THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 907 909 Q. One thing, as you described when we were looking 1 practice? 2 at the picture of the different types of reef 2 A. It's among the best management practices that I 3 3 structures, when you first looked at the A have been involved in. 4 Q. And when we were looking at some of the other picture that looked -- was very healthy, had the 4 5 elevation, you said it appeared to be a restored 5 pictures and you described how -- the functional 6 reef. Do you recall that? 6 reef versus reefs that may not be in that good a 7 A. Yes, I said -- what I think I said was this 7 shape, would you agree that restoring habitat is 8 photograph looks like photographs that we have 8 an important aspect in restoring reef 9 taken of recently restored reefs. We -- I have 9 functionality? A. Yes. 10 seen very similar things like this in our work. 10 11 11 **Q.** And changing to that topic, the restoration of Q. And, in fact, actually, you did a couple of 12 reefs was part of your responsibilities in DACS. 12 papers about large-scale reef restorations that 13 Right? 13 were done in Apalachicola Bay back in the 14 A. That's correct. 14 mid-'80's; isn't that right? 15 **Q.** And one of the main ways that this restoration is 15 A. That's correct. 16 done is through a process calling shelling or 16 Because, as you mentioned before, you had -- in 17 reshelling? 17 the '85 time period there was Hurricane Elena 18 A. That's correct. 18 and, I think, Kate back to back; and it 19 **Q.** And is it also known sometimes as cultching? 19 practically decimated the entire oyster 20 A. Yes, it could be called cultching. 20 population in the bay? 21 21 **Q.** And could you describe generally for the Court A. That's correct. 22 22 **Q.** And at that point in time, given the decimation what does this restoration process of cultching 23 or reshelling -- what does it involve? 23 of the oyster population, the State took some 24 A. As I explained earlier in trying to give the 24 significant and prompt actions to restore the bay 25 basis of the life cycle of oysters, oysters need 25 and the reefs. Right? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

912 A. It was relatively prompt. I think it took maybe 1 annual budget request. 2 Q. And most years you were -- you were successful in 2 two years to line up the budget and --3 **Q.** I'm sorry. Among the things that the State did 3 getting some funds for shelling; but there were 4 was to put in place a massive reshelling program. 4 some years when you weren't? 5 5 A. There may have been a gap in there; but I'm 6 A. It was a large reshelling program for the time. 6 thinking for the last 10 years that I was with --7 Q. And I think if you -- I don't know if you can 7 or the last 13 years that I was with the 8 ball park it, somewhere in the neighborhood of 8 Department of Agriculture, we were probably 9 200 acres was shelled within -- to -- in each 9 getting federal funding. I mean, there may be a 10 year in a two-year period. Does that sound about 10 gap there; but we had at least three grants 11 right? 11 throughout that period of time of either five or 12 A. That's -- that's an estimate that I could deal 12 seven-year duration, I think. 13 with. I don't recall the actual acreage. 13 Fair to say though that at least with this 14 Q. Now, then at some point in time, the State of 14 collapse of the oyster fishery, there was by the 15 Florida stopped funding shelling directly. 15 time you left in April 2013; is that right? A. Yes. 16 16 Right? 17 A. Their -- at one time we did have a legislative 17 Q. By the time you left in April 2013, there hadn't 18 18 line item that was a recurring budget for the been any large amount of Florida state funds 19 shelling program. It was a relatively small 19 devoted towards reshelling any portion of the bay 20 20 budget. after the collapse? 21 21 A. There was no state budget. The EDRP budget that Following one of the hurricanes -- and I 22 22 can't recall which one or the exact dates, but -we were involved with, I think, ran until maybe 23 23 the end of the fiscal year for the feds in 2013. I was able to request and be awarded grants for oyster restoration projects. And it was Florida 24 24 So when I left, we were still operating on 25 and the other Gulf states. So we oftentimes 25 federal moneys. And then there were additional THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 911 913 1 shared in these Congressional funding programs. 1 moneys that were allocated from various work 2 2 When we were receiving those funds, the programs and things like that that I am not 3 3 legislative budget did not include money for familiar with. 4 shelling. So -- and we probably received that 4 Q. But as you testified, you were able to do some 5 Congressional or federal dollars for the last --5 shelling with the funds that you obtained. 6 6 Correct? for probably my entire tenure at the Department 7 7 A. That's correct. of Agriculture. And because we switched 8 8 agencies, there was no budget request when we **Q.** And in general, you got pretty good results from 9 9 the reefs where you did the shelling; didn't were already getting money. 10 10 you? So it would be inaccurate really to say that 11 11 the State stopped funding it when they actually A. I would say that we were pretty good at what we 12 12 weren't funding it because we already had funds. were doing. 13 13 **Q.** And I just want to have a couple examples of that So they weren't -- we weren't getting double 14 fundina. 14 because you reported on the fact that you were 15 Q. Right. I didn't mean to say otherwise. You 15 doing this resource management. You're shelling 16 weren't getting double funding. You, as part of 16 areas, and the oysters are doing pretty well 17 your job in resource management, would go out and 17 during these couple of years in 2011 and 2012. 18 get grants and apply for grants? 18 If you wouldn't mind looking, sir, at tab 7 of 19 A. That's correct. That was in the report. 19 your binder. 20 **Q.** So you had to get the money from a grant from the 20 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Is this 21 federal government or wherever. And since you 21 binder 1 or 2? 22 22 were able to get the money that way, the State MR. ECHOLS: It's binder 2, your Honor. 23 23 didn't have to have it as its own budget line SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you. 24 24 MR. ECHOLS: I think it starts at tab 6. 25 A. That's right. The agency did not put it in their 25 Do you have that, sir? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) 914 916 BY MR. ECHOLS: 1 harvest on it because it would mean that we were 2 2 Q. Okay. And can you -- for the record, this is doing too good a job. I mean, that's a strange 3 tab 7. This document is Joint Exhibit 52, JX-52. 3 thing. I have no understanding of that. 4 And can you identify this, sir, as being one of Growth is occurring on second generation 5 the -- the types of assessments that you and your 5 oysters, which is good. That means -- that's 6 staff, Mr. Gunter, Marshall, and Shields, would 6 typically what we shoot for a lot. We know that 7 do to check up and evaluate on bars that you had 7 we try to get some spat to set in the beginning; 8 reshelled? Is that accurate? 8 but we know that the second generation is going 9 A. Yes. This was a -- this was a different type of 9 to be the most important generation because we're 10 reconnaissance. These were tonging samples as 10 going to have achieved what we were looking for, 11 opposed to quadrat samples. 11 getting a living, functional reef base, which is 12 **Q.** Right. So it is a different methodology. 12 really what oysters are going to prefer. 13 So as you were explaining before, this would 13 They do have a -- a stimulation to set where 14 just be using the hand tongs as opposed to going 14 there are other living oysters, which makes sense 15 down with the quadrat. Right? 15 in their survival. You know, they set where 16 16 A. Yes. there are oysters -- living oysters. That's good 17 Q. Okay. If you look just on -- if you go to the 17 for them. 18 first page -- and I apologize that these -- I 18 **Q.** Okay. And just to keep track of where we are 19 could not find pictures in color for this 19 date-wise, this -- and on the front page, it's 20 20 February 2011 when this assessment is done. document; so we have got these black and white. 21 21 But I'll give you a better one shortly. A. Okay. 22 22 A. I have seen these in color, I'm sure. **Q.** And you note in that same page that -- or 23 23 **Q.** I'm sure. And so this is the page at the top Mr. Shields or whoever put this together notes 24 that says Bulkhead. Are you there, sir? 24 that perhaps the site could use some more 25 25 A. Which page? substrate coming up. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 915 917 1 Yes. First picture? 1 Could you turn in two more pages, please. 2 2 Q. Yes. And then, unfortunately, these are not numbered; 3 3 A. Bulkhead. but this at the top says Hotel. Q. Bulkhead. And what's Bulkhead? A. 4 Hotel Bar. 5 5 A. Bulkhead is a bar in the summer harvesting area Okay. Hotel is another bar; is that correct? 6 in the eastern Apalachicola Bay. 6 Α. That's correct. 7 Q. And rather than me go through these line by line, 7 Q. And I see, as in the prior page, they identify 8 can you just explain to the Court, please, what 8 the dates when you did some reshelling at this 9 is set forth here? What is being reported about 9 bar and the volume that was planted. Again, here 10 the results of the assessment of Bulkhead Bar? 10 when it says zero harvesting pressure, is that 11 11 A. Bulkhead Bar, and then we have -- this is a plant the same thing that you just were explaining that 12 12 site that was planted in July and August of 2008. the oystermen were not going to the site? 13 13 The estimated volume of the plant was 1,000 cubic A. The -- as I had said earlier, you can distinguish 14 vards. 14 by looking at oysters whether or not there's been 15 15 harvesting pressure. Based on their tong samples, they are looking 16 at low mortality, which means that the oysters 16 And let me say that the man who is doing the 17 that they're tonging there are mostly alive. A 17 tonging here is a real oysterman. He has been a 18 good spat set is -- you can see spat on these 18 lifelong oysterman. So we were very happy to 19 oysters, good growth, zero harvesting pressure. 19 have him. And when he makes a lick with those 20 That's -- and this is an area in the summer 20 tongs, he can tell a whole lot about what's going 21 harvesting area, which means that oyster 21 on. 22 harvesters are not there. 22 Q. Okay. Who is that? 23 23 This is a peculiar thing about a lot of our A. James Marshall.

Mason & Lockhart

plant sites is that oystermen, even when they

know there's oysters on it, do not want to

THE REPORTING GROUP

24

25

Page 914 to 917 of 1061

24

25

**Q.** James Marshall, very good.

Now, the last part, could you explain to the

THE REPORTING GROUP

16

19

2

919

- 1 Court at the very bottom of that paragraph where
- 2 it says, excellent overall. Could easily be
- 3 2,000 bushels per acre when dive assessments
- 4 occurred in late spring, what does that mean?
- 5 A. It means that just based on what they're looking
- 6 at, they feel that if we had done quadrat
- 7 sampling, that the production parameters might
- 8 yield as high as 2,000 bushels per acre.
- 9 Q. Is that a lot of bushels per acre?
- 10 A. That's extremely high.
- 11 **Q.** That would be a very functional, a very healthy
- 12 reef?
- 13 A. That would be a healthy reef.
- 14 **Q.** And this is one that you planted on dates in
- 15 2008, 2009, and 2010?
- 16 A. Yes. This is a little bigger plant, 6,600 cubic
- 17 vards.
- 18 **Q.** Now, since these are all terrible black and white
- 19 pictures -- I have got some things in color.
- 20 It's not -- it's from after -- just after you
- 21 left; but it's -- you will see, just so you can
- 22 explain to the Court what these things are,
- 23 Mr. Shields had pulled these. This is GX-1305.
- 24 Do you have that, sir?
- 25 A. Yes.

7

# THE REPORTING GROUP

Q. Okay. As I said, I know you were not copied on

Mason & Lockhart

- 2 this. This is from April 2014 after you had
- 3 left. But this is Mr. Shields reporting on an
- 4 assessment that he did on some of the plant
- 5 sites. And I only provided it here because we
- 6 got a lot better pictures in this.
  - And, you know, I will leave it to you, sir,
- 8 whichever, based on your experience, would be
- 9 informative to explain to the Court, show the
- 10 Court some of these things we have been talking
- 11 about like spat and spat settlement, what it
- 12 actually looks like. You can pick and direct the
- 13 Court to whichever picture you think best
- 14 explains that.
- 15 A. If I was looking at these slides and making a
- 16 determination, I would not be as encouraged by
- 17 this as this would appear to be. As a matter of
- 18 fact, I might use this to -- to actually show the
- 19 opposite.
- 20 These -- this -- let's start at the back 21 page.
- 22 Oh, the back page looks great. I'm sorry.
- 23 Q. So --
- 24 A. Let's start at the back. Let's start at the
- 25 back, yes.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- 1 Q. Just to make sure we have got everybody on the
- 2 same page, is this the one that at the very
- 3 bottom right-hand corner it ends in 313?
- A. Yes. That's a good one to start. That's a -
  - that's a view that I would really be encouraged
- 6 to see. And if we roll to the previous one
- 7 before that --
- 8 **Q.** 312?
- 9 A. The longer picture. The one right before that
- 10 one. It's an enlarged view of the same
- 11 oysters -- that one.
- 12 **Q.** And is that, sir, the culling board that you
- 13 described before?
- 14 A. No. That's just a -- that's a walkway on an
- 15 oyster boat that the oysterman would stand on
  - while he's tonging.
- 17 **Q.** Let me direct you, if I could, please, to the
- 18 page that has 307 in the bottom right-hand
  - corner. Could you please identify and explain to
- 20 the Court what this shows is the --
- 21 A. This is a piece of shell hash that has a juvenile
- 22 oyster attached to it that has some barnacles
- 23 growing on it.
- 24 **Q.** So there's -- there is a spat on this?
- 25 There's not spat that I can see. This -- by the

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

921 1 time this oyster is that size, which is about an

- inch, we would no longer consider that spat.
- 3 That would be something that I would consider as
- a juvenile oyster. Once -- once an oyster starts
- 5 to develop and the shell develops away from the
- 6 shell that it's attached to, then it's no longer
- 7 considered spat in my terminology.
- Q. Got it. 8
- 9 In any event, your experience has been that
- 10 there have been good results in development of
- 11 juvenile oysters in the sites where you had
- 12 planted in a lot of cases?
- 13 MS. WINE: I'm sorry. We're looking at
- 14 something from 2014 now. Are you asking
- 15 about when he was there in the '08, '09, '10?
- 16 MR. ECHOLS: That wasn't my question,
- 17 no.
- 18 BY MR. ECHOLS:
- 19 **Q.** I said in any event, sir, your experience has
- 20 been that when you and the folks working for you
- 21 at DACS restored reefs, you had -- did get some
- 22 good results from that restoration?
- 23 A. Yes. We had -- we were -- we had some very 24 successful restoration projects and some that
- 25 were less successful.

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

00

- 1 Q. All right.
- 2 A. But typically when we're putting down cultch
- material, it's almost always going to be apositive.
- 5 Q. Okay. Let's look at another example then. Can6 you turn back to your binder, tab 8.
- 7 A. Are we not going to give an explanation of these pictures?
- 9 Q. No. It was just so we could have something in10 color.
- 11 And tab 8 -- behind tab 8 we have got Joint 12 Exhibit 60. Are you there, sir?
- 13 A. Yes.
- **14 Q.** Okay. And this Joint Exhibit 60 you will see at
- the top says October 2011 Assessment of Minor
- 16 Bars in the Western End of Apalachicola Bay.
- Now, in October 2011, you still were working for DACS; and you were responsible for resource
- 20 A. October 2011?

management. Right?

- **21 Q.** Yes, sir.
- 22 A. Yes.

19

1

10

11

12

13

- 23 Q. And here, is this, similarly to the prior report
- 24 we looked at, one of those assessments that your
- 25 staff is doing to assess how planted reefs are

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 Q. And here it says in this assessment of these bars

2 on the western end of Apalachicola Bay, with the

3 exception of Scorpion Reef, all areas exhibited

4 new growth, a good spat set, overall good health

and high numbers of live oysters. The appearance

- 6 of the oyster meat and texture is improving.
- 7 They are becoming fatter and healthier as the
- 8 temperatures cool.
- **9** Do you see that?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. That's all positive. Right?
- 12 A. Those are positives.
- 13 Q. And then we go on. It says, the minimal fresh14 mortality observed was the result of predation by
- the oyster drill. During drought conditions, the
- 16 oyster drill is able to embed within these reef
- 17 complexes and can have a significant impact on
- the health of the oyster reef.
- 19 And that's correct, too. Right?
- 20 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

- 21 Q. And as you testified yesterday, when there's
- drought, when it's drier, oyster drills show up
- in these locations. Correct?
- 24 A. That's correct.
- **Q.** And then it goes on to say, at present, the THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

923

developing?

- A. They -- it looks to me here that they haveassessed more than just planted bars.
- Q. Oh, I'm sorry. That's -- you're absolutelyright. I see that at the top here it states that
- this assessment was undertaken due to reports bythe industry and a leaseholder of a large number
- 8 of dead or dying oysters found in the western end9 of the bay.
  - And sometimes it would be the case that oystermen, folks in the industry would come to DACS and say, hey, I see something that doesn't look right. And you would go out to check to
- 14 find out if there was a problem or not?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 Q. Right. Yes, I'm sorry. This wasn't just based17 on planting.
- 18 Can you look then at the overall description19 there with the paragraph that says Overall.
- 20 A. Yes. I see it.
- Q. And there it says, and here we are in October2011. We're still in the drought. Correct?
- 23 A. We are -- we are in the process, yes.
- 24 Q. Right.
- 25 A. We're in the progression of this thing.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- oyster drill can be found throughout the western portion of the bay system. Mortalities will continue until the river begins to rise.
  - But at this point here we're already near the end of 2011. It says, the Scorpion Reef area was the only area observed to be in poor condition.

Right?

- 8 A. That appears to be what they saw.
- Q. And at the last two sentences of that paragraph
  it says, however, as noted earlier, the other
  reefs observed were in good condition. There
  were no significant mortality events occurring in
- the western end of the bay.

14 Right?

- 15 A. That -- that's a broad statement that they made.
- **16 Q.** That's a broad positive statement. Right?
- 17 A. If it were correct, I would say it was a positive 18 statement.
- **Q.** You figure Mr. Shields and Mr. Gunter got it
- 20 wrong?21 A. No. I'm thinking that their terminology, the
- western end of the bay, is one thing. Where
- 23 these leases are is where they're talking about.
- 24 If they were talking about the southwestern
- 25 portion of the bay where the mortalities had THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 begun and where we had already quit sampling by Q. Recently dead oysters. And they're called boxes. 2 2 this time because of extensive mortality, that And some -- there's new boxes and old boxes; 3 would throw that statement into question. 3 is that right? 4 Q. But here --A. I would suppose you could categorize new and old. 5 A. As for where they're talking about, if they're 5 **Q.** And then sometimes is it the case that these 6 talking about where they -- where these leases 6 things are called gapers? Have you heard that 7 are located is western Apalachicola Bay, I'm 7 before? 8 8 A. Yes, you could use that term. Gapers, typically agreeable to that. 9 Q. Okay. If we can turn one page in, please. It's 9 you're talking about very fresh dead oysters. 10 the page that at the top -- and we can ignore the 10 Q. Okay. So they're dead oysters. 11 pictures since they're black and white, if we 11 So we have two dead oysters, fresh boxes, and 12 like; but at the very top it says North Spur 12 two drills present; but otherwise, the 13 Plant Site. Do you see that? 13 description here is that -- you would 14 A. Yes. 14 characterize, would you not, that this bar --15 Q. What does plant site mean? 15 this portion of the bar is doing quite well? 16 A. Yes. I -- I think that you have shown that at 16 A. That would be an area that we had done 17 restoration on. 17 this time, and they have shown at this time that 18 18 **Q.** And can you agree with me, sir, as reflected here the bay, in fact, is in good shape and coming 19 in this October 2011 report, in the middle of the 19 back. 20 20 drought at the North Spur plant site where you That's one of the things that I have 21 21 had done restoration, the DACS people working for represented about this area and the recovery from 22 22 you were reporting no sign of fresh mortality, the Deepwater oil spill. At this time, things 23 23 were looking pretty good. But the things that I good growth, large range of size classes, animals 24 24 would add to this that need to be qualified is looked healthy, good overall appearance, one 25 fresh box, one drill, and no harvesting occurring 25 that the southern portions of St. Vincent Sound THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 927 929 1 at this site. 1 where you would expect the highest salinity 2 2 Do you read that the same way I do? conditions were already in bad shape. And 3 3 A. Yes. At that time things were -- were fairly Scorpion Reef in western St. Vincent Sound where 4 good; and we were encouraged. you would expect the most high salinity 5 5 **Q.** I'm sorry. Can we go to the next page there. We conditions, those were already in bad shape. 6 6 have got Little Gully. So what we have demonstrated here is, yes, 7 7 A. That's correct. what we were doing out there, it all looked good. 8 **Q.** And so Little Gully, is that another reef? 8 At this time things looked like we were in good 9 A. That's a location on Dry Bar Reef. 9 shape. This was nine months before we started to 10 10 Q. Oh, it's on Dry Bar. Okay. really recognize that -- the severity of the 11 11 And here it says that this is a test -- or, depletion. 12 12 Q. rather, a sampling that was done with the tongs Well, that's not exactly right though; is it, 13 13 again; is that right? 14 A. I'm assuming that all of this was done by tongs 14 A. And then a year -- by a year later, these reefs 15 since there's no quadrat data with it. 15 were essentially gone. 16 Q. And here, again, on Little Gully, which you said 16 Yes, that's my observations of it. 17 is on Dry Bar, is that --17 **Q.** At the time that you wrote the August 2012 18 A. Yes. 18 resource assessment report --19 Q. Okay. And here, again, we have got no sign of 19 That's right. 20 fresh mortality, and new growth. Animals look 20 -- there were reefs that were doing relatively 21 healthy, good overall appearance. There are two 21 well; were they not? 22 22 A. They were still doing relatively well in July boxes -- and for the Court's purpose, boxes, 23 23 of 2012. By October -- and I went back out those are dead oysters. Right? 24 A. Recently dead oysters where the shell is still 24 there -- when we started to recognize the 25 25 severity of the situation, there weren't 5 THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

932 1 percent of the oysters on these reefs right here Q. And there in this document summarizing some of 2 2 the activities of your group it says under East 3 Q. Okay. Let's split the difference here. Let's go 3 Hole Managed Site, background. In order to 4 to September. We'll go to the -- let's go back compare and contrast the conditions of the 5 to the meeting that you had with the Franklin natural bars which are currently underproducing, 6 County Board of Commissioners --6 a managed or planted bar was chosen to 7 Α. Okay. 7 demonstrate differences during diving assessments 8 Q. -- in September 2012 and what you told them. 8 which will occur the week of October 22. A. Right. 9 Do you see that? Q. And what you told the entire oyster community. 10 A. Yes. 10 11 A. Yes. That was in September. 11 Q. And it continues on to say, initial observations 12 Q. Yes. 12 suggest that one of the East Hole plant sites 13 MR. ECHOLS: Just put them in order. 13 chosen had been worked. A spat set was observed 14 Okay. 14 everywhere throughout the site, and large oysters 15 BY MR. ECHOLS: 15 were present. 16 **Q.** All right. So we have got some additional clips. 16 And then it continues to the next page and 17 And we'll get you the slides here from the 17 says, and overall, everything was still growing. 18 meeting that you attended and spoke to the 18 This is a good example of a site which has been 19 community about the status of the oyster reefs in 19 refurbished and has produced. It will be 20 September 2012, the same date that the Governor 20 utilized during resource assessments next week. 21 21 sent the request for the disaster declaration to And that is the case that even here in 22 22 the federal government. October 2012 you were finding that bars that you 23 23 Do you know what; while he's collecting those had planted and refurbished were doing well --24 24 doing quite well even though we're here in things to distribute, why don't you please turn 25 to tab 9 as he hands these all out. Tab 9 in 25 October 2012 during the drought? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 931 933 1 your binder -- I'll meet you up here in October 1 A. This particular bar on East Hole, I did dive on 2 because this is tab 9, which is a GX-1296 2 it, I think, in October. And it is as was stated 3 3 document. here. 4 And are you there, sir, at tab 9 at the top 4 This is not my report. I didn't write this. 5 5 says --But this looks like it probably came from Joe, 6 6 A. Yes. 1296. 7 Q. Yes. It says, synopsis of activities conducted 7 Q. No reason to think that Joe is giving you 8 by BAD staff on October 2012. Do you see it? 8 inaccurate information? 9 A. Yes 9 A. No, no. Q. And what's the BAD staff? 10 Q. Okay. 10 11 11 A. That's the Bureau of Aquaculture Development. Α. He sees things somewhat different than me; but, 12 And that's Department of Agriculture and Consumer 12 no, I'm not suggesting that at all. 13 Services. 13 And then --14 **Q.** That's your department? 14 Q. Very good. Let's go back --15 15 MS. WINE: I think he needs to finish. A. That's my group, yes. 16 Q. Your group. And you're still at the -- in this 16 A. -- the situation on East Hole was as stated. It 17 group in October 2012. 17 did not appear that it had been fished, and it 18 And, again, if you look at the bottom 18 appeared that it was still doing okay at that 19 right-hand corner, this is one of the documents 19 time. But that was a very -- that was, you know, 20 you provided us. 20 a outlier. 21 21 A. Okay. Q. Okay. Because this is a portion of East Hole 22 22 **Q.** Let me take you to the bottom section there where that had not been fished, you said. Right? 23 23 it has the heading East Hole Managed Site. Do A. Apparently not. 24 Okay. Let's go back to September. And this will 24 you see that? 25 25 be the last thing I do in this section. And we A. Yes. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 1 were talking about the Board of Commissioners A. I don't know the context of this statement. I 2 2 meeting that you attended and presented. And I would have to see what the but, no, meant. 3 believe everybody has the slides from that now. 3 Q. Okay. But actually what had happened in between 4 I just want to ask you about some of the was some guy interrupted you, and you said you 5 additional things you told the Board of 5 would take questions later. So I took out the 6 Commissioners and all the members of the 6 interruption. 7 Apalachicola oyster community about how the bars 7 But, regardless, whatever you're referring 8 were doing relatively, especially comparing those 8 to, you're saying there are some bars that are 9 that you had planted versus those that had not 9 doing fine. Right? 10 10 A. Let me read this. 11 MR. ECHOLS: Can we look at slide 5, 11 I'm talking about shell. The bars that I'm 12 please. 12 talking about right now are on East Hole. Some 13 (Whereupon the video was played.) 13 of you who have already been out there fishing 14 BY MR. ECHOLS: 14 know where we're talking about. 15 Q. Okay. In that -- that, again, is you, sir, 15 I would -- I would take from this excerpt 16 16 presenting to the Franklin Board of County that we're talking about the same planted reef 17 Commissioners and the Apalachicola oyster 17 that we have been talking about on East Hole. 18 18 Q. Got it. community? 19 A. Yes. 19 MR. ECHOLS: Let's go to slide 7, 20 20 Q. And here you're noting to -- at the same time, please. You can go ahead and play that. 21 21 September 2012, when the Governor's request is (Whereupon the video was played.) 22 22 BY MR. ECHOLS: going for a disaster declaration, that there are 23 areas of the bay that have normal reef structure, 23 Q. And that's, again, you presenting to the Franklin Board of Commissioners and the Apalachicola 24 normal oyster populations; and these are small --24 25 very small areas, and most of those are managed 25 oyster community; and that's what you told them? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 935 937 1 areas that you, DACS, have been planting over the 1 A. Yes. 2 last few years. Correct? 2 And you have to understand the context here. 3 3 A. That's correct. Most of this listening audience are not real 4 Q. And those areas that you planted and reshelled, 4 receptive to what we have to say. What they want 5 they survived very well. That's what you told 5 us to say is there was oil in there and there was 6 6 dispersant in there and there was a mass 7 A. They had survived very well to that point. 7 extinction. What I'm giving them is an 8 **Q.** Yes. To that point, which is September 2012? 8 explanation of why we know that there was not a 9 A. That's correct. 9 mass extinction because there are living, 10 10 Q. And then you further go on to say that not only functioning reefs out there at this point. 11 Q. And, in fact, you tell them that you looked at did they survive well, they have normal size 11 12 12 some of the shell that we planted most recently frequencies, distribution, spat, juveniles, 13 13 adults, mortality; everything is normal on the covered with spat. And that's a good, healthy 14 bar that you planted. Right? 14 thina --15 A. I will agree with that. 15 A. Yes. 16 **Q.** Okay. Let's go and see what else you said. 16 **Q.** -- right? 17 MR. ECHOLS: Let's go to slide 6, 17 All right. MR. ECHOLS: Let's go to the next slide, 18 please. 18 19 (Whereupon the video was played.) 19 please. 20 BY MR. ECHOLS: 20 (Whereupon the video was played.) 21 Q. Do you see that, again, here we are talking about 21 BY MR. ECHOLS: 22 22 on East Hole -- I'm not sure if this is the same Q. And that's true also, is it not, that you were 23 23 portion that we were looking at before; but identifying to the Franklin County community and 24 you're telling everybody that the bars that had the commissioners that there was a difference 24

been shelled were doing fine. Right?

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

25

25

from some reefs to others; and, in fact, that the

THE REPORTING GROUP

940 1 areas that you had managed and shelled were not 1 (Time Noted: 12:00 p.m.) 2 so severely damaged. Right? 2 (Recess Called) 3 A. As some of the natural reefs in the area, yes. 3 (Time Noted: 1:00 p.m.) Q. Right. Let's just put slide 1 back up once more. 4 MR. ECHOLS: Good afternoon, your Honor. 4 5 And we don't need to play this at all. 5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Good 6 This is where we started earlier today. And 6 afternoon. 7 you can see how it all relates to the broader 7 MR. ECHOLS: One thing, with my 8 conversation because you were telling in this 8 apologies before of not being able to quickly 9 section of the presentation that -- the community 9 identify the section for the question I was 10 that we have got to figure out methods of 10 asking of Dr. Kimbro relating to stone crabs 11 restoring those. Right? 11 versus the oyster drills, I just wanted to 12 A. Yes. We were at a point now where we need to 12 direct the Court's attention and 13 think more progressively about restoration. 13 Mr. Berrigan's to -- Dr. Kimbro's direct 14 **Q.** And here you're talking not just about the little 14 testimony was what I was recalling, paragraph 15 smaller reefs or the minor bars. In the prior 15 16 16 And, again, with apologies. That's what sentence you are explaining that we have lost a 17 17 lot of reef structure on our most important I wasn't able to locate before. 18 reefs, which is very serious. Right? 18 BY MR. ECHOLS: 19 A. That's correct. 19 Q. Dr. Kimbro's direct testimony said, in all our 20 20 experiments, 95 percent of the predation on **Q.** And then the last thing that you tell the 21 community, using we because everyone should 21 oysters was caused by a predatory snail. And I 22 22 protect the resource, is that for things to come had been asking you, sir, Mr. Berrigan, whether 23 back, things are going to have to change as far 23 your experience with the bay indicated that only 24 as management is concerned to allow this to come 24 5 percent of the predation was caused by the 25 back. Correct? 25 stone crab or other things. But you said that THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 939 941 A. Yes. 1 1 was inconsistent with your experience; is that 2 2 Would you like me to explain that? correct? Q. No thank you. 3 A. On Cat Point specifically. 3 I'm done with this section. 4 Q. Okay. Thank you. That was all. 4 5 5 MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, I don't know if I want to change topics. The last topic 6 you want to take a lunch break. 6 here, sir, I want to ask you to explain to the 7 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Do you have 7 Court about landings data, the fishery dependent 8 8 data and what that is. And just as an intro, an estimate counsel of how -- I'm talking 9 to -- yes. Do you have an estimate of how 9 could we please, if you wouldn't mind going back 10 10 long you're going to be with this witness? to your binder, tab 1, the JX-77. And in your 11 MS. WINE: Well, I don't believe he's 11 August 2012 report -- and this is just to have 12 finished with the examination. 12 as a reference, if I can find it -- so this is 13 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I thought he 13 page 2 of the report. The one that at the very 14 was. 14 top --15 MR. ECHOLS: Oh, no. I'm sorry, judge. 15 A. Yes, I have it. 16 I didn't know if you thought that given I was 16 **Q.** Okay. At the top it says in 2011. And then 17 at a breaking point, I think I have only --17 there's the table 1 in the middle. 18 let's see. I have just got one more subject 18 And I wanted to confirm with you, sir, that 19 matter, which should be able to be done, you 19 this table of oyster landings in Apalachicola Bay is the -- what you would call fishery dependent 20 know, in 40 minutes or so. 20 21 I didn't know if you thought --21 data; that is, the data that the Fish and 22 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Four-zero? 22 Wildlife Commission collects about the pounds of 23 23 oysters that are harvested and brought to the MR. ECHOLS: Four-zero, yes, sir. 24 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: We'll take a 24 dock to be sold or eaten; is that correct? 25 break. 25 A. Yes. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

944 1 **Q.** And similarly, in that you can see running down Q. I'll grab it. the second column, it's measured in pounds of A. Thanks. 2 2 3 meat. Is that right? 3 Q. No problem. A. Pounds of meat. If I could direct you, please, to page 220, 5 **Q.** Pounds of meat, right. 5 line 5. 6 And this also reports of number of trips, 6 A. Okay. 7 which we have talked about before. Correct? 7 Q. Okay, sir. And when I took your deposition, were 8 A. Correct. 8 you asked these questions; and did you give these 9 Q. And the list -- the number of licenses that have 9 answers? 10 been issued as well. Correct? 10 Question. Did you believe at the time based 11 A. That's correct. 11 on your --12 Q. And I think in a prior question we talked about 12 (Discussion off the record.) 13 bags per trip, but that's the next column. 13 BY MR. ECHOLS: 14 Right? 14 **Q.** -- based on your experience that there was 15 A. That's correct. 15 underreporting of landings by fishermen? 16 16 **Q.** And looking at the harvesting licenses column, Answer. Yes. 17 can you confirm for me, please, that in 2010 that 17 And did you believe that there was a 18 18 reflects the highest number of harvesting substantial amount of underreporting by 19 licenses that is listed for that 10-year, 11-year 19 oystermen? 20 20 period? Answer. I do believe there is a lot of 21 A. Yes, it is. 21 underreporting. 22 22 Q. Now, the landings data, although it's -- strike Was that your testimony, sir? 23 that. 23 A. Okay. It is. 24 The landings data is the official FWC data of 24 **Q.** So that means that these numbers that we have on 25 how many oysters have been harvested. Right? 25 the screen that are the official Fish and THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 943 945 A. Yes. I would -- those numbers would have come 1 Wildlife pounds of meat that are brought to the 2 2 from FWC fishery statistics. dock in your opinion are even higher in reality 3 3 **Q.** And those are supposed to be live oysters that as far as the pounds of oysters that are taken are taken out of the water and brought to the out of the bay and harvested. Correct? 4 4 5 dock? 5 A. I would -- in my opinion, that is correct; but we A. That's correct. 6 6 always use the official statistical data in our 7 Q. And -- but you believe, however, that landings 7 reporting. I don't -- I don't try to indicate 8 data such as these are likely underreported? 8 that there's a lot of underreporting or there's 9 A. I would -- I would believe that they are 9 substantial underreporting. We use these values. 10 underreported. 10 Q. Right. If you wouldn't mind turning, sir, 11 11 please, to tab 10 in your binder, which is binder **Q.** In fact, you would agree with me, would you not, 12 that there is a substantial amount of 12 No. 2. And at binder No. 2, for the record, this 13 13 is GX-498. Do you have that, sir? underreporting by oystermen? 14 A. I have never tried to make an estimate of -- of 14 A. I have it. 15 that. I don't know how that could be estimated, 15 Q. And do you see at the top here, this is an e-mail 16 whether it's substantial or not. But I will 16 from you dated December 4, 2012? 17 agree with the underreporting. 17 A. I see it. 18 Q. How about if I rephrase it. You do believe, do 18 Q. And if you need to, for context, please do refer 19 19 you not, there is a lot of underreporting? to the earlier part of the e-mail, which is 20 20 A. I believe that there's underreporting. Mr. Steve Brown asking you to explain why there's 21 21 Q. Okay. Mr. Berrigan, not to torture you at this a difference of about 24 percent in monitoring 22 22 point, do you still have your deposition with you station reports. Do you see that? 23 23 A. Yes. up there? 24 A. I may have just dropped it over the side. I'm 24 And in your response to Mr. Brown you say, Steve, 25 25 I think that all landings were required to pass THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

- - -

5

16

- **1 Q.** And this gets forwarded from Mr. Brown, then from
- 2 Mr. Heil to Mr. Estes. And Mr. Estes, as you go
- 3 up a notch here in the e-mail string, Mr. Estes
- 4 is an assistant director of FWC?
- A. He's an assistant division director of Marine
   Fisheries Management, I believe.
- **7 Q.** And that's part of?
- 8 A. That's FWC.
- **9 Q.** Yes, thanks. Part of FWC.

10 And then you have got the e-mail from you 11 there above that, from Mark Berrigan. And you're 12 e-mailing Joe Shields and Leslie Palmer. And if 13 you would just look at the first two sentences 14 there. Before I flip to the back and ask you 15 some questions, you say, FYI, interesting how 16 many oysters were harvested so far in 2012. See 17 the by-month comparisons for landings and trips. 18 Do you see that?

- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. All right. Now, to see the by-month comparisons for landings and trips we have to go in a couple of pages to where the attachment is of the Excel chart. And it's the next page after this. So
  this would be the last page of that document, I believe.

# THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

951

- Are you at where we have --
- 2 A. Yes.

1

- ${f Q.}$  -- the 2011 running down with pounds and trips in
- 4 2012?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. And you understand this to be the by-month7 landings data that was being provided to Mr. Heil
- 8 that he requested?
- 9 A. I would believe that's the case.
- $\textbf{10} \quad \textbf{Q.} \quad \text{And do you read this as I do that if you look at}$
- 11 the month column, going down the second column to
- the left, that those would be the -- 1 would be
- 13 January; 2, February; 3, and so on?
- 14 A. Yes. I agree.
- **15**  $\mathbf{Q}$ . And then we were looking at the table you had in
- your -- in your August 2012 report. Here we also
- have pounds like the FWC pounds reported?
- 18 A. Yes.
- **19 Q.** And we also have trips. Correct?
- 20 A. That's correct.
- **21 Q.** And so 1 being January in 2011; and going across,
- then we have got the column for 2012. Correct?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- **24 Q.** Therefore, it would be your understanding of this
- first row to be that in January 2012, according

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- 1 to the official FWC data, 332,556 pounds of
- 2 oysters were harvested?
- 3 A. That's correct.
- **4 Q.** And that compares to January 2011, the prior
  - year, in which there were only 160,768 pounds
- 6 harvested. Right?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- **8 Q.** So in January 2012, more than double the amount
- 9 of oysters --
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 Q. So I take it if more than double the amount of
- oysters were harvested, there must have been a
- 13 lot of live oysters available?
- 14 A. That would certainly indicate it. But it looks
- 15 like they might be the same amount. I mean, the
  - number of trips is about twice as much; and the
- 17 number of landings is about twice as much, just
- 18 at first glance at that.
- **19 Q.** Okay. But we can agree that there were twice --
- more than twice as many pounds of oysters --
- 21 A. Landed.
- **22 Q.** -- taken out of the bay and landed?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 Q. Similarly, if we go down a month to February of
- 25 2012, we have 289,000-and-change of oysters that

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

953

- 1 are harvested. Correct?
  - 2 A. Yes.

4

7

12

15

20

23

24

- **Q.** And if you look at February in the prior year, in
  - 2011 it's 199,000. Right?
- 5 A. Okay.
- **Q.** So we're not quite 100,000 more; but it's more -
  - substantially more. Right?
- **8** Would you agree with me?
- 9 A. I agree it's more.
- 10 Q. Okay. And, similarly, if you look at March, you
- 11 have 283,896 compared to 219,000. And I guess we
  - can look at April and May. And would you agree
- with me that then during the first five months,
- in every month, January through May of 2012,
  - there were more pounds of oysters harvested than
- in the same five months in 2011?
- 17 A. Yes. I agree.
- **18 Q.** Now, this data was identified as being
- 19 preliminary, do you recall from the e-mail,
  - because we don't have it for the entirety of the
- 21 year. Right?
- 22 A. Well, it's preliminary in a lot of ways. Usually
  - the annual data is not completely confirmed until
  - about six to nine months into the following year.
- 25 So the asterisks would stay on that data for

THE REPORTING GROUP

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) 954 1 2012. But that's -- it's --2 2 Q. Luckily, since now we're in 2016, we have final 3 data --3 A. I would think so. Q. -- from Fish and Wildlife --5 A. I would think so. 6 7 **Q.** -- since it runs through 2012. 7 8 MR. ECHOLS: And this is a -- it's an 8 9 Excel file or a column file; so, your Honor, 9 10 I had to convert it into a bar chart in order 10 11 to be able to see it. But it's GX-1248. 11 12 MS. WINE: Your Honor, I just want to 12 13 note that this is the first time we're seeing 13 14 this. 14 15 MR. ECHOLS: It is -- I'm sorry, judge. 15 16 16 It's listed on the exhibit list. 17 And just to be clear, your Honor, this 17 18 18 is the official Fish and Wildlife landings 19 data that I put into a bar chart because, 19 20 20 otherwise, all you have is a list of numbers. 21 21 And the -- my understanding is that the 22 22 parties -- both parties have agreed that 23 there are a number of large data sets that 23 24 would be unwieldy to actually hand a big 24

## THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

So as long as it is replicable and I

provide the time periods of the specific data

that's provided, they have access; and they

know what all this is. It's on the exhibit.

stack of Excel things.

A. Yes. The actual landings is different, yes.

Q. Yes, sir. So, for instance, if you go back to

1989, it's as low as 820,000, whereas, in 2012

it's 3.03 million. Right?

A. Yes. That's what it looks like from this chart.

Q. And also, would you agree that based on the

official landings data in 2011 and 2012, those

are the two highest amounts of landings of

oysters over the past 25 years?

A. Yes. Based on this chart I would agree.

**Q.** And this is at a time when your reports, as far

as the resource assessment for 2011 and 2012,

have indicated that the abundance, the

availability of the population of oysters is

expected to be either stable or declining.

Correct?

A. I'm not sure I followed that. But I -- what I will say is, yes, my reports suggest that in

this -- with intensive harvesting, that there

will be a decline in that final season there, that 2012-2013 season.

Q. Right. We had the 2011 report that said that --

A. Yes. They're both -- both were indicators of declining landings.

25 Q. Right. And you recall because there was the THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

955

1

2

4

caveat that you had put in there that said that

if harvesting continues at this level, the

3 resource may not be able to keep up. Do you

MS. WINE: Your Honor, we haven't had a chance to check that. I see that he cites a source here. We have no idea who compiled this, who made the chart. We have had no ability to assess it.

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: You may proceed.

BY MR. ECHOLS: 12

13 **Q.** Now, Mr. Berrigan, as I said, what we have got is 14 the official Fish and Wildlife landings summary 15 data. And we have pulled out here, I think -- if 16 my math is right, it's about 25 years worth of 17 that data. Do you see that?

18 A. Yes.

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

19 **Q.** Now, could you first -- first, one thing, just 20 generally would you agree with me that looking at 21 this data, that the harvest rate is not the same 22 in every year. I mean, there is a degree of 23 variation from year to year?

A. Harvest rate?

25 Q. Well, the -- let's say the amount harvested.

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

recall that? 5 A. I recall that. And if we had that data, it would

6 confirm what I'm saying. 7 Q. It would confirm -- and this would confirm that

8 the landings data -- official landings data of 9

FWC, which we pulled from the government itself, 10 that these two years when the oyster population

is declining, according to your surveys, these 11

12 two years, the very most amounts in pounds of

13 oysters are being pulled out of the bay; is that

14 riaht?

15 A. The amount here, yes, as shown is the highest.

16 But we don't have -- you're not showing the data

17 for the 2013 year, which would have been the end

18 of the 2012-2013. You would have seen a very

19 marked decline in these production numbers. And

that's what I was predicting.

21 **Q.** Well, exactly. Particularly because the intense

22 commercial harvesting had continued?

23 A. The same level of harvesting or more

harvesting -- the predictability of the declining number of harvests would be confirmed if we had

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

20

24

25

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 960 1 that data. That's -- that's my statement there. 1 intensive harvesting was taking place. Correct? **Q.** One other thing that's taking place or not taking 2 2 A. It was taking place, and the numbers that you put 3 place, rather, around this time --3 up there showed it. Q. And concentrated harvesting and continuous 4 MR. ECHOLS: Can we flip back to JX-150, 5 please. 5 harvesting; is that right? 6 BY MR. ECHOLS: 6 A. Concentrated and continuous harvesting, it's 7 Q. And JX-150 is -- tab 3. If you go to tab 3 in 7 continuous for nine months --Q. Yes? 8 your binder, please? 8 9 A. Which binder? 9 A. -- if the oysters are available. 10 Q. Binder No. 1, please. And this is the document 10 **Q.** You do recall your report says continuous 11 that on the first page says Input For Mark's 11 harvesting. Right? 12 Report, the notes that you had taken down. Do 12 A. I -- I'll buy that. 13 you recall that? 13 I'm getting --14 A. Yes. 14 Q. I'm sorry. I couldn't hear you, sir? 15 **Q.** If we could please go to the second page of that 15 A. I said I will agree with that. 16 16 document. I mean, you have shot me full of a lot of 17 17 A. I have it. statements here; and I'm not keeping up with Q. And I just wanted to confirm for you; we talked 18 every one of them quite as well as you are. 18 19 earlier about the importance of restoration and 19 Go ahead. 20 20 reshelling. Correct? Q. Okay. Would you also agree with me that over 21 21 A. Yes. this two years in a row, your official reports, 22 22 **Q.** And at the very bottom here of your notes for which were public and made available to FWC, 23 your report, you include that Cat Point/East Hole 23 expressed concerns about the sub-legal harvesting 24 and Dry Bar/St. Vincent, no cultching in over a 24 taking place? 25 decade. Do you see that? 25 Α. Yes. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 959 961 1 A. No, I don't. But it sounds like an accurate 1 **Q.** And they further noted that the sub-legal 2 2 statement. harvesting was not being enforced against. 3 3 I don't know where you are. Right? A. It was my opinion that sub-legal harvesting was 4 **Q.** I'm at the very, very, very, very bottom. 4 5 A. Okay. 5 going on. I do not know for fact whether or not **Q.** Do you see that? 6 6 it was underreported or even occurring. 7 7 That was the word on the street. That's what A. Yes, I see it now. I have been told. That is my opinion that it was 8 **Q.** And you said that sounds like an accurate 8 9 statement. These -- the primary producing 9 occurring. But I was not out there measuring or 10 10 bars for the bay, Dry Bar/St. Vincent and counting or doing any of those things to prove 11 Cat Point/East Hole didn't have any substantial 11 one way or the other. 12 cultching in over a decade at this point. 12 Q. And, similarly, we saw in at least four, perhaps 13 13 Correct? five occasions that you were commenting on this 14 A. That's -- Cat Point was -- probably was never 14 "use it or lose it" approach to harvesting 15 cultched in 100 years. 15 oysters. Right? 16 Q. Okay. All right. Mr. Berrigan, you would agree 16 Α. Yes. And I -- and you have to understand what 17 with me, would you not, that having gone through 17 "use it or lose it" means in this context. 18 these reports for 2011 and 2012, we saw that for 18 This -- when you have -- when you're at risk of 19 two years in a row these official resource 19 losing the whole crop, you might as well harvest 20 assessment reports you had were warning about the 20 it. There's no point in trying to salvage it, 21 high level of harvesting taking place. Correct? 21 save it, or do anything like that because natural 22 22 A. It warned that if intensive harvesting occurs, mortality is going to wipe it out. You might as 23 23 the resource will not sustain harvesting through well get the economic benefit from it. 24 that winter harvesting period. 24 Leaving it there does not mean that it's 25 Q. And that is precisely what your report said, that 25 going to be available to the fishery at another

37 of 85 sheets

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

962 1 time. It will be lost to the fishery. That's 2 what "use it or lose it" means. 3 Q. In 2011 and 2012 when the oil hadn't reached the 4 bay, "use it or lose it" to you still meant that all the oysters should be harvested? 6

A. If they were saleable. And we had these discussions. If they were saleable oysters, would it be better to leave them there to die; or would it be an economic advantage to harvest

Although this was never an official policy, there were discussions; and the discussions would lean toward it's better to use them than lose them.

15 Q. By the time you retired from DACS in April 2013, 16 would it be accurate to say that FWC had never 17 closed the bay entirely from harvesting, at least 18 from this 2010, the oil spill, to April 2013 when 19 you left FWC, never?

20 A. Would it be entirely true to say what again, 21

22 Q. That FWC never entered an Executive Order closing 23 the bay from harvesting.

24 A. No. The bay was never closed to harvesting. 25 It's not really a management decision to do that.

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1 in the progress of this depletion event, but 2 neither was it in 1985. That -- those closures

were introduced and adopted as part of a recovery

5 Q. Right. And the bay was in need of recovery at 6 this point in time; was it not?

That's what you explained to the Franklin County Board of Commissioners. Right?

9 Yes, it's very much in need of recovery.

10 Q.

3

7

8

11

12

13

14

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

Α. But recovery couldn't begin until conditions were reasonable to assume some sort of -- some level of success. There was no recovery plan in place when I was talking to those people.

15 Q. You would agree with me, would you not, sir, that 16 closing the bay probably would have accelerated recovery?

Α. There's been -- as far as I know, we haven't started a recovery process yet. I was -- I was actually gone.

> I did make some notes and provided management options. And those management options would have included area closures for restored areas. But none of that had been implemented at the time that I was there. And I don't know that a true

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

963

965 recovery plan has been implemented to this point.

A. For the most part by that time, the depletion 2 Q. Right. But you would agree with me, would you 3 event had proceeded so far that most of the not, that one view would be that closing the bay oysters were already dead. Fishermen are not would accelerate recovery? going to go into areas that are already depleted. 5 In the broadest stroke, yes. But it would -- it

6 wouldn't accelerate recovery during a depletion 7 event. Q. 8 All right. Could you --

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

9 A. Those are two different things with different 10 timetables. That depletion event would 11 essentially have to come to an end before you 12 would start recovery.

I left in 2013. The depletion event was still ongoing. And that's -- that's when -- when you follow those numbers out and get into 2013, then you will start to understand how that declaration of disaster was determined and funded and those kind of things. We're cutting this off in -- before it reaches its final culmination.

20 Sir, would you mind going to page 240 of your 21 deposition transcript, please. 22 So I'm not talking about then. I'm talking

23 about February 19, 2016, when you provided your 24 sworn testimony.

25 Which number?

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

Q. Does --2

8

9

25

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

3 4 5 6 So it doesn't -- it's really not a management 7

decision to close those areas because they're not going to go to them. The oysters are already gone. They're already dead.

10 Q. Do you recall, sir, back in the 1980's after

11 Hurricane Elena had decimated the oyster 12 population that there was, indeed, a period of

13 time when FWC closed the entire bay from

14 harvesting?

15 A. Yes, there was.

16 Q. And that was in order to assist with the recovery 17 of the resource having been decimated. Correct?

18 A. That's correct.

19 **Q.** And at this point in time with the resource being 20 at least depleted, FWC did not close the bay 21 entirely at all. Right?

22 A. No. But it was a management option that was 23 discussed that closures would help accelerate 24 recovery. I mean, it is -- it is an option that

could be used. It wasn't used in the process or

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

968 **Q.** Page 240, please, line 6 --1 have a minute, I think we have another map 2 2 A. Okay. that we would like to set up by the witness, 3 **Q.** -- and where you were asked this question, and 3 if that's okav. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 4 did you give this answer. 5 Question. Have you had any conversations 5 MS. WINE: And, your Honor, just for the 6 with Mr. Knickerbocker -- your successor -- or 6 record, the map that they are setting up is 7 anyone -- the "your successor" part I added. 7 just a blow-up of a map that was included in 8 Have you had any conversations with 8 Mr. Berrigan's prefiled direct testimony at 9 Mr. Knickerbocker or anyone else within the State 9 page 9 and then, again, attached at the back 10 about whether it may have assisted the recovery 10 of his direct testimony. 11 of the resource to close the bay more 11 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. WINE: 12 significantly than was done? 12 13 There is an objection. 13 **Q.** Good afternoon, Mr. Berrigan. 14 Answer. I have not had any discussions with 14 A. Good afternoon. 15 Mr. Knickerbocker about it. I have certainly had 15 Q. I would like to start with the September 2012 16 discussions about it with oyster dealers and 16 Franklin County Commissioners meeting that 17 17 processors and oystermen and things like that. Georgia's counsel asked you about and showed you 18 That is one view, that closing the bay would 18 some video clips from. Do you know what I'm 19 accelerate recovery. And that's probably very 19 talking about? 20 20 A. Yes. true. 21 21 **Q.** And, sir, they showed you just selective portions Was that your testimony, sir? 22 A. And it still would be. That is not what we were 22 of that meeting that was videotaped. Correct? 23 discussing, but that would still be my testimony, 23 A. Yes. 24 24 as stated here. Q. And, in fact, I don't know if you still have --25 At the time that this conversation took place 25 were you handed these individual --THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 967 969 1 in the deposition, I was representing the Oyster A. Yes. Q. -- slides? 2 Dealers Association. And they strongly were in 2 3 favor of bay closures during recovery. But this 3 The last one that has page 8 in the bottom was -- this was well after 2013 -- 2012 --4 4 right-hand corner --5 A. Yes. 2012-2013 in the harvesting season. So they're 5 6 not really on the same time scale, these two 6 **Q.** Let me know; do you have that one in front of 7 discussions. 7 you? 8 **Q.** And at the time of your deposition, sir, in A. Yes. 8 9 February when I took your deposition, you were 9 **Q.** And, sir, you will recall that they just played 10 10 not being paid by the State of Florida as a that snippet right there without any context 11 consultant. Were you? around it. Correct? 11 12 A. I was not. 12 A. Yes. 13 Q. And today, as you're testifying in court and 13 MS. WINE: And, your Honor, if I may, we 14 providing your direct testimony, you are now a 14 took the liberty of preparing a full 15 paid consultant for the State of Florida. 15 transcription of that meeting as opposed to 16 Correct? 16 just the portions that are depicted on these 17 A. Not during this testimony. 17 slides that Georgia's counsel handed out. 18 **Q.** No. But since then -- since your deposition, you 18 May I hand these out, your Honor? SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Please. 19 were hired as a consultant. And, in fact, I 19 20 MS. WINE: And we have marked it as a 20 believe it's paragraph 1 of your direct 21 21 testimony, you are a paid consultant? new exhibit, FX-875. 22 A. I was paid to provide the pretrial direct 22 BY MS. WINE: 23 testimony, if I said that correctly. 23 Q. Now, sir, if you would indulge me, I would like 24 Q. Okay. Thank you. 24 to play exactly what you said right after this 25 MS. WINE: Your Honor, if we could just 25 snippet that they played that's depicted on THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

		Q70			972
1		970 No. 8.	1		SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Certainly.
2		MS. WINE: So if you would, Mr. Walton,	2		THE WITNESS: Do you want me to do it on
3		could you play clip No. 5.	3		that screen?
4		(Whereupon the video was played.)	4		MR. ECHOLS: Oh, sure.
	DV	MS. WINE:	5		<b>,</b>
5	_				MS. WINE: I would say whatever is
6	Q.	Sir, is it still your view today that the primary	6		easier for you and for the Special Master.
7		problem that caused the depletion event in 2011	7		SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Either way.
8		and 2012 is the lack of fresh water?	8		MR. ECHOLS: If you could, that would be
9		Yes, it is.	9		great. Thank you.
10	Q.	And, sir, you went on actually, before that	10	A.	I believe that the scenario that I'm about to run
11		statement you explained in that meeting the	11		through is consistent with what I have written in
12		progression that you saw and the reasons why you	12		those reports as far as the effects of high
13		came to that conclusion. Do you recall that?	13		salinity in the bay.
14	Α.	I don't recall it, but it would have made sense	14		SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Mr. Berrigan,
15	_	for me to make that effort.	15		will you keep your voice up so the reporter
16	Q.	Okay. Let's see if we can help you out with that	16		can get that.
17		memory.	17		THE WITNESS: I'll do my best, sir.
18		MS. WINE: If you would, Mr. Walton,	18	Α.	Let me give a brief description of the bay
19		please play clip 2.	19		system. You may have already had this; you may
20		(Whereupon the video was played.)	20		not. But typically when I'm talking about
21	_	MS. WINE:	21		Apalachicola Bay, it includes the entire bay
22	Q.	And, sir, is that consistent with your	22		system. The system includes St. Vincent Sound,
23		recollection that in your September 2011 oyster	23		which is to here; Apalachicola Bay, which is
24		assessment report when you first began to see the	24		here. I speak of this as being eastern
25		depletion event, you identified the lack of fresh	25		Apalachicola Bay, which is the summer harvesting
		THE REPORTING GROUP			THE REPORTING GROUP
		Mason & Lockhart			Mason & Lockhart
		971			973
1		water and the need for some major changes in	1		season area; and western Apalachicola Bay, which
2		freshwater input as a critical issue?	2		is the western portion of this bay. This area is
3	_	Yes.	3		called St. George Sound, and it contains the
4	Q.	And, sir, just to continue where you talk about	4		reefs that we have talked the most about today,
5		the progress	5		Cat Point Bar and East Hole. These are a
6		MS. WINE: If we could, Mr. Walton,	6		
7			_		contiguous bar that run north and south across
8		please play clip 3.	7		the entire bay system.
	D\/	(Whereupon the video was played.)	8		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.
9		(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE:	8 9		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see
10		(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that	8 9 10		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the
10 11		(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the	8 9 10 11		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel
10 11 12	Q.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay?	8 9 10 11 12		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that
10 11 12 13	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is.	8 9 10 11 12 13		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.
10 11 12 13 14	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first	8 9 10 11 12 13 14		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source
10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.)  MS. WINE:  Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay?  Yes, it is.  And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event progressed and its impact in the various areas	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water that comes out of here on the tide is swept to
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event progressed and its impact in the various areas where we find bars.	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water that comes out of here on the tide is swept to the east.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event progressed and its impact in the various areas where we find bars.  MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, may I come over	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water that comes out of here on the tide is swept to the east.  You can see these reefs right here, the main
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.)  MS. WINE:  Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay?  Yes, it is.  And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event progressed and its impact in the various areas where we find bars.  MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, may I come over to the side so I can see this?	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water that comes out of here on the tide is swept to the east.  You can see these reefs right here, the main reefs, are very close to where the fresh water is
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A.	(Whereupon the video was played.) MS. WINE: Sir, in what you just listened to, is that consistent with your recollection of how the depletion event progressed throughout the bay? Yes, it is. And, sir, if you could, since you're the first witness actually speaking about the bay and the oyster bars, if the Special Master would allow this, could you show us on that map and I realize that nobody is going to be able to read the names of the bars on that maybe. But show us on that map, which, again, is contained in your prefiled direct, how the depletion event progressed and its impact in the various areas where we find bars.  MR. ECHOLS: Your Honor, may I come over	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		the entire bay system.  This is a new bridge that you can see there.  And if if it was drawn on here, you would see where the Intracoastal Waterway comes out of the river, come downs here to a point above Hotel Bar, and then goes back to the east and out that way.  And fresh water the freshwater source being all of this area, East Bay River, St.  Mark's, Apalachicola River, all of these tributaries provide fresh water into here.  Typically there's a prevailing wind and tidal action that moves from east to west in the bay during most of the season. So some fresh water is swept into the mouths and some fresh water that comes out of here on the tide is swept to the east.  You can see these reefs right here, the main

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 974 to 977 of 1061

going to be the highest.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Where we saw this event begin -- and in several of those reports it talks about even in 2010 we had quit sampling St. Vincent Bar. At one time we had four sampling stations along St. Vincent Bar here. That would have been from the southern end to the northern end.

By 2011, the winter harvesting season, this bar was eliminated from sampling at all. There were no adult oysters that we found in our sampling stations. So we don't sample when there's nothing there. That's not the aim of our sampling was not to determine cause and effects and things like that. Our -- the point of our sampling was to determine where there are oysters and how many are there so we can tell the fishermen essentially where they are. We weren't involved in 20 years of telling them where they weren't.

The -- this area across here is Dry Bar, which we talked about; North Spur, which is another area that we talked about.

But in -- when the samples were taken in July of 2012 -- and this is a year after the photographs and stuff that we talked about --

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

> > 975

close to a year -- there were pockets in here where oysters were still good, particularly on North Spur which had been recently restored. Green Point, that had been recently restored. These two were the principal areas that we're talking about that had -- there were some on these smaller bars back here were still okay.

So this area right here was still receiving some influence from fresh water.

But when we went back out again in October and November of 2012 and looked at these after we had already predicted that things were going to get worse, the mortality event had now encompassed all the St. Vincent Sound.

Previously we talked about Scorpion and those that were out there that we -- that were -- where it was first noticeable. Now, the entire area was essentially depleted of oysters, including oyster leases that weren't being fished, and specifically this lease, which actually had some freshwater source, was completely depleted. These inner tidal reefs I walked along, there weren't any live oysters on them.

And what we saw and what we observed throughout this movement or progression of this

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

depletion event was a large number of conchs.

And I'm just going to use the word conchs because that's what we use to commonly call that.

By November, the last time that I went out there to look at these, we were doing tong samples. And we came all the way to the jetties.

Now, the Intracoastal Waterway cuts the jetties. It's right there. They're right on the edge of the Intracoastal Waterway. And all of these oysters -- 95 percent of these oysters were now dead. And so that whole thing had progressed that way.

What -- what this really involves then is there's no more fishing out here. People -- the fishing fleet had pretty much moved to this spot at the beginning of the summer harvesting season in 2012; and they essentially stayed there. When they came back out here, there was nothing there. So we have compressed all of the fishing that could have been on all of these bars to right here. This is the area where we're fishing.

And much of the conversation that we have had and discussion that we have had about intensive harvesting was the inevitable consequence of not being able to fish anywhere else. Of course,

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

they're going to fish these stocks down. That was inevitable.

And we see that and we see the landings up; that's good. The value was extremely high, highest they have ever had. The demand was the highest it's been, because the other states weren't producing.

So, yes, there was extreme harvesting pressure. Did it have a debilitating effect? Yes, it did, on those standing stocks.

But the harvesting pressure in those two years had nothing to do with the mass depletion that took place in this bay and all of this other area. And it is my opinion that high salinity based on benthic ecology that we observed was responsible for the depletion event throughout the bay.

Q. Thank you, sir. Unless the Special Master has something else, you can take your seat again.

And, sir, if you would indulge me with one more piece of this video.

You went on to explain the importance of fresh water after you identified it as the biggest problem. Again, this is the last clip from the Franklin County Commission meeting in

THE REPORTING GROUP

TRIAL - November 4, 2016 (Vol. IV) Florida v. Georgia 978 980 1 September of 2012. 1 haemastoma, all the same, in the western portion 2 2 MS. WINE: Mr. Walton, please play clip 4. of the bay; and stone crabs, Menippe mercenaria, 3 (Whereupon the video was played.) 3 in St. George Sound on Cat Point and East Hole. Q. And, sir --4 BY MS. WINF: 5 Q. Now, sir, I think you just said that when you 5 A. There were other marine predators there as well; 6 were out there looking in the bay, you saw a lot 6 and there were other marine organisms there that 7 of dead oysters; is that correct? 7 typically would not be there under normal 8 A. That's correct. 8 fluctuating salinities, including marine sponges, 9 **Q.** And what is the magnitude of the mortality that 9 marine soft and hard corals, various types of 10 you saw out in the reefs? 10 echinoderms. There were a lot of animals with 11 A. I would characterize it as 100 percent, although 11 marine affinities that typically would not be on 12 that's very unlikely that it's 100 percent. But 12 those reefs that were there. 13 the efficiency of predation was extremely high. 13 **Q.** And, sir, if predators have gotten to the oyster 14 **Q.** And is seeing a number of dead oysters on the 14 population on a reef, when you go look at that 15 reefs consistent with the theory that intensive 15 reef, what would you expect to see? 16 16 harvesting caused the issue on those reefs? A. Say that again, please. 17 MR. ECHOLS: Objection, your Honor. 17 **Q.** If predators have been attacking an oyster 18 18 She's leading the witness. population on a reef, when you go look at that 19 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Sustained. 19 reef, what would you expect to see? 20 20 BY MS. WINE: A. Well, if it was while the -- while predation is 21 21 **Q.** Sir, is -- by seeing dead oysters on the reefs, actively occurring, you would see the predators. 22 22 what did that tell you, if anything, about the And they would be essentially all over the live 23 cause of the start of the depletion? 23 oysters and going through their feeding process. 24 A. Well, it's -- it's the same discussion as we had 24 If the event -- if you observed the reef 25 previously where you can clearly distinguish 25 after the event, you would simply see oysters, THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 979 981 1 between reefs that have been harvested, reefs 1 particularly in place, but gaped. And if you 2 where there's been a natural mortality event, or 2 look at those oysters or closely observe them, 3 epizootic, or one that has been depleted by other 3 you would see that the -- even in the very 4 freshly dead ones, the shell is very good. But causes. 4 5 5 For the most part, when we examined reefs in you look inside, and the meats are gone. 6 October and November of 2012, it was very clear 6 Q. And, sir, if a reef has been harvested intensely, 7 7 that tonging was not taking place, that whole bed or overharvested is a term that Georgia's counsel 8 8 oysters were there and that all size categories has used, what would you expect to see when you 9 from spat to adults were affected and not -- not 9 look at that reef? 10 10 just affected, were killed. A. If it had been harvested, you would find far less 11 11 intact oysters. You would find evidence that --**Q.** And, sir, what does the presence of predators 12 12 of tonging, which would break up the clusters and indicate to you? 13 13 A. Well, the first thing that is noted, that their break up the reef a little bit. It would be 14 presence indicates high salinity. These are 14 fairly evident that tongs had been used. 15 marine predators, and typically they would not be 15 **Q.** And, sir, if you would, in the bars where you 16 there in any numbers like what we saw under 16 noticed -- you observed the depletion events 17 normal fluctuating salinity regimes. This was a 17 progressing, what did you actually see on those 18 prolonged high salinity situation that allowed 18 bars? 19 these predators to become established and also 19 A. Well, in the beginning, when we looked at the 20 complete their life cycle in the bay, which was a 20 southern portions of St. Vincent Bar, we saw a 21 fairly abnormal situation for the most part. 21 bar that had become completely dysfunctional. 22 22 **Q.** And, sir, what types of predators did you observe Very little shell material was remaining. And 23 23 in the bay during the depletion event? this is not unusual for that particular bar

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

because it is in a high energy area. When the

oysters die, because of tidal movement and wave

Page 978 to 981 of 1061

24

25

24

25

A. Well, the two major ones that we observed were

the Florida rock snail or oyster drill or Thais

THE REPORTING GROUP

action and scour, the shells break up and are quickly broken up.

When I looked at oysters between the time period, let's say, of July when the samples were taken and then went back and looked in late October and November, the condition of the reef was essentially the same, except all the oysters were dead. The oysters, like I said, were still -- when they were clustered, they were still there. The clusters were still there. We saw dead oysters from the size of a thumbnail up to marketable size. It looked like a functioning reef at that point, but all the oysters were -- all the meats in the oysters were gone. They

16 Q. And, sir, prior to this event, had Dry Bar and17 St. Vincent Bar been productive reefs in the bay?

were dead.

- 18 A. They have been very productive, but they also -19 St. Vincent's Bar, let me be clear, has always
  20 been subject to salinity variations. It's a
  21 pretty harsh environment out there on that reef.
  22 But when conditions are suitable or favorable, it
  23 has been very productive.
- Q. Now, sir, you said just before, and it'sreflective of something you said in paragra

reflective of something you said in paragraph 56
THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

fishing was occurring. And it just -- it just became more compressed and more intense on a very isolated oyster population. I did not feel that taking those oysters had anything to do with it.

I mean, it -- what it did was it increased
the early harvest of some of those so that the
product ran out maybe sooner than it would have
had there been some sort of allocation of that -of that crop. But that's just not the way that
it is. The fishermen are going to take what's

- 12 Q. And, sir, you stated earlier that you don't think
  13 the taking of an oyster that's less than 3 inches
  14 in size has a biological effect on the bay. What
  15 did you mean by that?
- A. It would -- in some fisheries where you would
   effectively diminish the larger adults, they
   might -- it might have some impact on
   reproductive potential. In oysters, they begin
   to contribute to the reproductive population at a
   very early age, some of them probably maybe just
   a few months old.

Most small oysters are male. Most larger oysters are females. By taking sub-legal oysters, you're not having -- you're not

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

of your prefiled direct, that you believe that

overharvesting or intense harvesting on Cat Point and East Hole was a result of the depletion event

and not a cause. Is that correct?

A. That's correct. That's what I tried to point out there that this was the inevitable consequence of depletion within the bay starting from the more distant areas from the river, compressing inward, that it not only -- not only compressed the living populations to a smaller isolated area, it compressed the fishing pressure to that area.

And I might add that during this time -- and I probably already said this -- that prices were high. Demand was high. And there were not a lot of other jobs around. So a lot of people were involved in the oyster harvesting.

- 17 Q. And, sir, you have said that you don't believe
  18 that overharvesting or intense harvesting was a
  19 cause of the depletion event. Do you believe
  20 that the taking of oysters smaller than 3 inches
  21 in size was a cause of the depletion event?
- A. No, I don't even see that they're related. I see
   that one is the result of the depletion event.
   The depletion event had started and was

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

progressing throughout this period that -- since

effectively changing the biological reproductive potential.

As a matter of fact, when we reviewed some of these things, we had in the past looked at reducing the size limit. And during that time I wrote position papers indicating that reducing the size limit was not going to have a biological effect or a negative biological effect.

And another thing that we did, we tried -- we also talked about moving the season back so that we could protect the small oysters until they grow. That was not intended to have a biological effect either.

There is no evidence that removing sub-legal oysters has ever had an adverse impact on reproductive potential in Apalachicola Bay.

Apalachicola Bay is an extremely productive system. It's not like a lot of other systems, and it's certainly not like systems further north in the Chesapeake and those areas where what I'm saying would not be true for those oyster populations because those oyster populations are much more vulnerable to losing gametes. But in Florida, and especially in Apalachicola Bay, reproductive potential is extremely high and is

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

- 1 not affected by taking that end of the crop.
- Q. Sir, what is about poor culling practices or 2
- 3 tonging trash, as Georgia's counsel referred you
- 4 to; could that have caused the depletion event
- 5 that took place in Apalachicola Bay?
- 6 A. It certainly wouldn't have caused a depletion
- 7 event. These things that occurred 24 months into
- 8 the progress of this depletion event certainly
- 9 can't be moved to the beginning to be a cause.
- 10 They're a consequence. And consequences of
- 11 running out of a crop too early leads some
- 12 harvesters to really bad practices. I mean,
- 13 maybe they're trying to feed their family. Maybe
- 14 they're trying to do something else with the
- 15 money. But that sector of poor harvesting is 16
- there. 17 I mean, I assume that in the information that 18 I was given, that there's some factual point to
  - that. I have never seen it. I have never opened up a bag of oysters and seen just trash. But we hear it from people that are on the water and
- those kind of things. I don't think it's a 23 widespread practice. I think it's a widespread
- 24 conversation.

20

21

22

25

2

I don't think that the dealers are in

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- 1 mortality resulting in weak recruit and extensive
- 2 harvesting on some of the major reef complexes.
- 3 Do you see that, sir?
- A. Yes. 4
- Q. And is that consistent with your view that the
- 6 intense -- or overharvesting was a cause of the
- 7 depletion event -- excuse me, was a consequence
- 8 of the depletion event and not a cause of the
- 9 depletion event?
- 10 A. Yes, that's my opinion. And my observations 11 would support that opinion.
- 12 **Q.** And is that the observations that are laid out in
- 13 the rest of that paragraph, sir?
- 14 A. Yes. Yes.
- 15 Q. And you will see, sir, you go on to say that the
- 16 reefs are showing negative effects of severe
- 17 drought and decreased freshwater flow rates from
- 18 the Apalachicola River, parens, less than 1 foot
- 19 river height since May 2011, including decreased
- recruitment and increased natural oyster 21 mortality, parens, predation, disease, and stress
- 22 associated with high salinity regimes.
- 23 Do you see that, sir?
- 24 A. Yes.

20

25 Q. And is that consistent with your view --

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

987

- 1 business to buy trash. I don't know how they
  - would sustain their business. Their customers
- 3 are certainly not going to continue to buy a
- 4 product that's trash. So it's not a sustainable
- 5 practice. I don't know who would buy dead shell.
- 6 Q. And, sir, if you could please take the first
- 7 binder of documents that Georgia's counsel gave
- 8 you and turn to tab 3, which is JX-150. And
- 9 these are some notes written in -- you said these
- 10 were your notes, although you couldn't recall 11
- exactly when you prepared them. Is that correct? 12 A. Yes. That's correct.
- 13 Q. And you will recall that Georgia's counsel
- 14 referenced some language in this document that
- 15 had to do with poor tonging practices. Correct?
- 16 A. Okav.
- 17 Q. And what he didn't show you was the overview in
- 18 this document.
- 19 MS. WINE: So, Mr. Walton, if we could
- 20 just blow up the overview.
- 21 BY MS. WINE:
- 22 Q. And, sir, if we read this, it says, downward
- 23 fluctuations in resource availability can be
- 24 attributed to less than optimal environmental
- 25 conditions, increased predation, and natural

Mason & Lockhart

THE REPORTING GROUP

- A. Yes, it is.
- 2 **Q.** -- that the lack of fresh water was the cause of
- 3 the depletion event here?
- A. Yes, it is. 4
- 5 **Q.** Sir, you mentioned briefly when you were shown
- 6 the progression of events -- of the depletion
- 7 event that on the map there were some private
- 8 leased oyster bars; is that correct?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 **Q.** And can you just explain what those are.
- 11 A. The State has for some time leased sovereignty
- 12 submerged lands to private individuals to grow
- 13 oysters. They would take nonproductive bay
- 14 bottom and cultch that or plant it with shell.
- 15 And it's an extensive method of farming oysters.
- 16 And it's a practice that is quite common
- 17 throughout the Gulf and in Apalachicola Bay. I
  - think there's about 600 acres of submerged lands
- 19 in Apalachicola Bay that are held under private
- 20

18

- 21 **Q.** And, sir, do you know whether Mr. Tommy Ward is
- 22 one of those leaseholders?
- 23 A. Yes, he is.
- 24 And, sir, on that map, do you know approximately
- 25 where his leases are located?

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

989

992 1 A. Yes, I do. 1 And I will try not to belabor this, but, 2 2 Q. And could you show the Special Master, if you again, like the video, you were only shown 3 would, just the general area. 3 selected portions of this document, which is your THE WITNESS: Can you see this, sir? 4 4 2011 oyster resources assessment report. 5 Can you see that okay? 5 Correct? 6 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Yes. 6 A. That's correct. 7 THE WITNESS: Down in this corner --7 Q. And, sir, if you would, turn to page 4. Do you 8 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Yes? 8 see the heading that says Fishery Trends in 9 THE WITNESS: -- this is a shellfish 9 Apalachicola Bay? 10 lease right here. It's labeled here lease 10 A. I do. 11 525. This is a lease that is owned by 11 **Q.** Do you see that first paragraph that begins 12 Mr. Ward. 12 annual oyster resources? 13 This is another lease here, another 13 A. Yes. 14 lease there, another lease there, another 14 **Q.** It says it shows moderate fluctuations in oyster 15 lease there, lease there, lease there. So 15 densities, standing stocks, and production 16 16 estimates. Do you see that? those are the locations of the oyster leases. 17 17 BY MR. ECHOLS: That's that first sentence still. 18 18 A. Yes. **Q.** And, sir, the private leases, are they open to 19 the public for harvesting? 19  $\boldsymbol{\mathsf{Q}}.\ \ \,$  And then we come to language that is very similar 20 20 A. No, they're not. to what we looked at in JX-150, which was tab 3. 21 21 **Q.** At any time? Also that document was from October of 2011, so 22 22 A. At no time are they open to the public. from the very same time period. That said 23 **Q.** So in your view, sir, are they subject to intense 23 downward fluctuations can be attributed to less 24 harvesting? 24 than optimal environmental conditions, increased 25 A. No, they're not. 25 predation, and natural mortality resulting in THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 991 993 1 **Q.** And, sir, did you visit any of these leased areas 1 weak recruitment and extensive harvesting on some 2 2 when you were observing the depletion event in of the major reef complexes. 3 3 Apalachicola Bay? Do you see that? A. Yes, I did. A. Yes. 4 4 5 **Q.** And what did you observe in those leased areas? 5 Q. And, again, sir, that's consistent with your 6 A. I observed extensive mortality on the leased 6 view that the extensive harvesting was a result 7 areas, and I was assured by the leaseholders that 7 of the depletion event and not a cause; is that 8 8 it was not from harvesting. true? 9 Q. And what -- what did you see in terms of the 9 A. That's true. 10 mortality? Were you able to see why there were 10 **Q.** And, sir, if you would, take out the other binder 11 11 and turn to tab 8. Tab 8 is JX-60. Let me know dead oysters? 12 A. In two instances, we did observe a large 12 when you're there, sir. 13 13 A. I'm there. abundance of conchs. 14 Q. And, sir, are all the leases in the area that you 14 Q. Okay. And Georgia's counsel also showed you this 15 just depicted for the Special Master, are they 15 document, which is dated October 2011. And when 16 all in that one area that you just listed for the 16 he was showing it to you, he did not show you --17 Special Master? 17 actually, excuse me. He did show you the section 18 A. Yes. They're all in St. Vincent Sound or the 18 that's labeled Overall. And he read very quickly 19 westernmost portion of Apalachicola Bay. They're 19 a sentence that I want to ask you about. 20 all located in areas that were affected by high 20 It's right in the middle of the paragraph. 21 21 salinity throughout this event. It starts with mortalities. 22 Q. Sir, if you would, I would like to look at some 22 MS. WINE: Mr. Walton, if you see that 23 of the documents that Georgia's counsel showed 23 sentence. 24 you. So if you still have the first binder in 24 BY MS. WINF: 25 front of you, and turn to tab 2, if you would. Q. It was -- the previous sentence is talking about THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

		I RIAL - Novembe	: 4, 20	ν) טו	
_		994	_		996
1		the presence of oyster drills in the bay. And it	1		portion of this document regarding harvesting.
2		says, mortalities associated with this predator	2		Do you recall that?
3		will continue until the Apalachicola River begins	3	A.	Yes.
4		to rise. Do you see that?	4	Q.	And I would just like to take a few moments to
5	A.	Yes, I do.	5		walk through some of the other statements that
6	Q.	And, sir, do you agree with that statement?	6		you made in this document. Okay?
7	A.	Yes. The statement would say that if we do not	7	Α.	Okay.
8		have additional fresh water, we're not going to	8	_	So, sir, if we turn to page 3, you will see the
9		get rid of these predators.	9	٦.	second to last paragraph is talking about Cat
10	Q.		10		
	Q.	And, sir, if you turn to the last page of this			Point and East Hole. And that's a paragraph I
11		document, there is a section entitled	11		believe Georgia's counsel asked you about.
12		Conclusions. And, again, this is your concluding	12	_	Correct?
13		remarks in October of 2011. And, again, in the	13	Α.	I'm not certain, but
14		middle of the paragraph there's a sentence that	14	Q.	Okay. And if you go down to the next one, it's
15		says, there is the presence of the oyster drill	15		talking about Dry Bar and St. Vincent Bar. Do
16		predator.	16		you see that?
17		Do you see that?	17	A.	Yes.
18		MS. WINE: Mr. Walton, this is the last	18	Q.	And it talks about the samples that were taken
19		page of the document; and if you would	19		from Dry Bar and St. Vincent Bar. Correct?
20		highlight the sentence that says, there is	20	A.	Yes.
21		the presence of the oyster drill predator.	21	Q.	And if you look
22	BY N	MS. WINE:	22		MS. WINE: Again, Mr. Walton, I'm making
23	Q.	And right after it says, this predator will	23		your life tough, but right in the middle of
24	٦.	continue to be a fixture until the Apalachicola	24		that paragraph it says, samples were
25		River levels rise and salinity levels decline.	25		collected.
23		THE REPORTING GROUP	23		THE REPORTING GROUP
		Mason & Lockhart			Mason & Lockhart
١,		995		D\/ A	997
1		Do you see that, sir?	1	_	4S. WINE:
2	_	Yes, I do.	2	Q.	Do you see that sentence?
3	Q.	And do you agree with that statement?	3		MS. WINE: If we could just highlight through
4	A.	Yes, I agree with that.	4		the end of that paragraph, Mr. Walton.
5	Q.	And this was your view in the fall of 2011 when	5	BY N	MS. WINE:
6		you were first noticing the depletion event	6	Q.	And it says, samples were collected from the
7		occurring. Correct?	7		Little Gully area on Dry Bar, because no live
8	A.	Yes. This is my view. This is not my report	8		oysters were collected on St. Vincent Bar.
9		though.	9		And, sir, what did you mean there?
10	Q.	Thank you for that correction.	10	A.	When we went to sample the normal sample stations
11		This is consistent with your view at the	11		on St. Vincent's Bar, there were no live oysters.
12		time. Correct?	12	Q.	And, sir, just, again, why don't you sample dead
13	A.	It is consistent, yes.	13		oysters or reefs that have no live oysters?
14	Q.	Thank you, sir.	14	A.	The purpose of our sampling is to to provide a
15	A.	This is from my staff.	15		predictive index of oyster populations and
16	Q.	Thank you.	16		harvestable oysters and where they can be found.
17	→•	Now, sir and sorry for flipping binders.	17		This is supposed to act as an aid to both the
18		If you can go to the first binder Georgia's	18		fishermen and the processors. We were not in the
19 20		counsel handed you. And if you could, sir, turn	19		process at that time of trying to document or
		to tab 1, which is JX-77. And a couple pages	20		confirm the absence of oysters or the depletion
21		into that exhibit is your 2012 August 2012	21		of oysters. We simply don't sample where there's
22		oyster resource assessment report. Do you see	22		no oysters. It's not something that is useful to
23		that, sir?	23	_	us in what we're trying to accomplish.
1_		Yes, I do.	24	Q.	And, sir, that paragraph continues, St. Vincent
24	Α.	·			
24 25	A. Q.	And, again, sir, you were shown a very select	25		Bar extending from Dry Bar southward was
	_	·	25		Bar extending from Dry Bar southward was THE REPORTING GROUP

Florida v. Georgia

1000 1 continued -- considered to be depleted of 1 populations on shallow and inner tidal reefs in 2 2 marketable oysters. The oyster population on the Miles -- and then you list a few. Could you 3 St. Vincent Bar was likely decimated by stress 3 just, if you would, sir, tell us where the Miles 4 associated with high salinity, disease, and 5 predation. 5 A. The Miles are in St. Vincent Sound, and they're 6 Do you see that, sir? 6 called the Miles because they essentially are how 7 A. Yes, I do. 7 many miles from the Intracoastal Waterway. So 8 Q. And what did you mean there? 8 you have all the way out from 1 Mile, but the 9 A. As it -- as it says, the reason that we saw or 9 first noticeable mile is 2 Mile, which is a 2 10 considered to be the most reasonable solution to 10 mile channel. And then you go out to 13 Mile, 11 why there were no oysters on there was that this 11 while is pretty much the westernmost end of 12 area was very subject to high salinities because 12 St. Vincent Sound. And collectively it's called 13 of its location in the bay. And with those high 13 the Miles. But we're referring to St. Vincent 14 salinity -- prolonged high salinity regimes, we 14 Sound. 15 had stress, predation, and natural mortality. 15 **Q.** Sir, you go on to say that those reefs are also 16 Q. Now, sir, if you could turn to the next page, 16 severely stressed, showing signs of intense 17 17 which is page 4 of this document, the first full predation and natural mortality. 18 18 paragraph on that page -- it's a long paragraph. Is that consistent with what you were seeing 19 A. I see it. 19 at this time? 20 20 **Q.** You will see it starts at the beginning talking A. Yes, it was. 21 21 **Q.** And you go on to say bars in northwestern about some reefs, North Spur, Green Point, and 22 22 Cabbage Lumps. Do you see that? Apalachicola Bay and eastern St. Vincent Sound, 23 A. Yes. 23 including Green Point, North Spur, and Cabbage 24 **Q.** Where are those reefs located, sir? 24 Lumps -- and just to pause there, are those the 25 A. Those reefs are located in either the -- North 25 ones we were talking about earlier in this THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 999 1001 1 Spur and Green Point are in the western portions 1 paragraph? 2 2 of Apalachicola Bay; and Cabbage Lumps is located Can you perhaps show the Special Master where 3 in the eastern portions of St. Vincent Sound. 3 those ones are? 4 A. Cabbage Lumps is right here. North Spur is right 4 They're a relatively close grouping of reefs. 5 5 Q. And, sir, you go on to say in the middle of that here. 6 paragraph --6 And the other one was Green Point? 7 7 Q. Yes. MS. WINE: There is a sentence that 8 8 begins also. Mr. Walton, if you can A. Green Point is right here. 9 highlight that. 9 So they're clustered right here in the 10 10 northern portion of the bay. And like I tried to Right there, yes. 11 BY MS. WINE: 11 point out on that map, they would have had the 12 Q. Also, oysters on these reef will likely be 12 last influence of fresh water. So they would 13 13 subject to intense predation from rock snails, have been the reefs that we would have expected to stand up the longest. But they, too, were 14 while salinity levels remain high. 14 15 15 affected. Do you see that? 16 A. Yes, I do. 16 Q. Right. And you go on to say about those reefs 17 Q. And what did you mean by that sentence? 17 that they are more strongly influenced by river 18 A. We could see a progression of predation that was 18 flows than bars located further away from the 19 leading to these bars. And if there was no fresh 19 river mouth. Prevailing flows and circulation 20 water or a strong enough fluctuation in the 20 patterns move plumes of fresh water westward from 21 salinity regime to retard the movement of these 21 the river over these reefs before they are 22 22 predators, they were going to essentially eat dispersed throughout the bay and St. Vincent 23 23 their way to these bars and then eat the oysters 24 24 on these bars. Sir, is that what you were just describing in 25 25 **Q.** You go on in that paragraph to say, oyster terms of the location? THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

4

5

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

Florida v. Georgia 1008

1009

1 with what their life cycle is, but throughout my 2 time diving there in 2012, observing those --3 those leases, we saw hundreds of egg cases, which 4 confirmed the fact that the snails were there to 5 stay until they were flushed out by serious

7 **Q.** Thank you, sir. We're done with that document. 8 If you could now turn briefly to tab 5, so

you were ahead of me.

freshwater input.

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

25

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

This is JX-75. And it's a September 2012 oyster assessment report that Georgia's counsel showed you. First of all, can you just explain what this September 2012 report is, just a month after the last report that we were looking at.

15 A. I believe that this is an effort to synthesize 16 the information into more or less an executive 17 summary or something of that nature.

18 **Q.** Okay, sir. And if you could, please, turn to 19 page 2 of that document. I believe Georgia's 20 counsel just directed you to a -- one statement 21 regarding harvesting. And I would like to direct 22 you to this page 2 and the heading Prolonged 23 Drought in Lower River Discharge. Do you see 24 that?

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

2 Α. That's correct.

3 Q. And could you tell us which bars in Apalachicola Bay the State of Florida traditionally reshelled?

If you can generalize it.

reshelling. Correct?

6 A. Yes. I'm trying to do it in that way.

> I believe that we have made an effort to reshell most of the bars in Apalachicola other than Cat Point Bar.

10 Q. And why is that?

> There has been resistance from the fishing community for us to have our heavy equipment on that bar because it has always been the lifeblood, and it really has never needed it. I mean, Cat Point Bar has traditionally been the source of a -- a very sustainable resource, highly renewable resource. It never really needed that much. It was thriving on its own. And I believe that the community probably felt, well, if it's not broke, you don't need to be worried about it. So we did avoid planting there.

But in the eastern portion of the bay, we -over time we planted some on East Hole, some on Platform Bar, Porter's Bar, Peanut Patch. In the

> THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1007

Q. And, sir, I don't want to belabor this by reading

2 all of it, given that we just went through the

3 August 2012 report, but if I could, under the

4 first paragraph in that heading, the last

sentence says, fresh water is a critical factor

driving fluctuations in salinity that prevents

destructive marine predators from becoming

established.

A. Yes, I do.

Sir, is that consistent with your view of what was happening with the depletion event?

11 A. Yes, it is.

**Q.** And lastly, at the bottom of that page, the last sentence in the last paragraph says, poor recruitment -- poor recruitment and poor survival can be directly attributed to prolonged high salinity environment, which is also confirmed by the presence of marine predators, primarily stone crabs and Florida rock snails, parens, oyster drills.

Do you see that?

21 A. Yes, I do.

22 **Q.** And is that consistent with your view of what 23 caused the depletion event?

A. Yes, it is.

Q. Sir, you were asked some questions about

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1 summer areas, we planted on Norman's Lump,

Lighthouse, Bulkhead, Hotel. In the western part

3 of the bay, we planted on Green Point, North

4 Spur, planted some on St. Vincent's Bar, planted 5

Cabbage Top, Paradise Flats, Bayou Flats. So 6 there's a good cross-section of the bay that has

7 been rehabilitated by shell planting.

8 Q. And, sir, Georgia's counsel showed you a

9 document. It was JX-52. But it was reflective 10

of shelling efforts in 2008, 2009, and 2010.

11 Correct?

12 Α. Yes.

17

18

19

22

23

24

25

13 Q. I'm not trying to test your memory on the years; 14 I'm just trying to move us along.

15 A. That is testing my memory. I don't --

Q. Thank you, sir. 16

> Now, sir, do you think if -- let me ask it this way. Do you think that the 2012 depletion event could have been prevented if Florida had done more reshelling in the bay?

20 21

Under the circumstances, no. There's nothing that could have been done with the poor environmental quality. And when I say poor environmental quality, I'm talking about high salinity. Under those circumstances, the areas

THE REPORTING GROUP

1012 1 that we rehabilitated just happened to be in 1 depletion. 2 areas that were -- had some influence of fresh 2 Q. And why do you say that? 3 water. So they did work for a while. But they, 3 A. Closing the bay would have nothing to do with 4 too, were finally depleted by predation. lowering the salinity in the bay. 5 MS. WINE: My colleagues are reminding 5 Q. Now, sir, you managed the oyster resources in 6 me that we have been going for quite awhile. 6 Apalachicola Bay for 30 years. Correct? 7 Would this be a time for a -- a good time for 7 That's correct. 8 an afternoon break? 8 **Q.** And together with your predecessors, the bay has 9 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Let me ask 9 been managed for over 50 years. Correct? 10 counsel to confer and advise us, and 10 A. Yes. At least 50 years. 11 particularly advise Mr. Berrigan, whether you 11 **Q.** And throughout history, what are the causal 12 think you're going to be able to finish this 12 factors that you have observed as causing major 13 afternoon or not, because depending upon your 13 depletion events in the bay? 14 answer, we'll either take a break; or we'll 14 A. Primarily catastrophic events, too much fresh 15 recess for the weekend. 15 water; and too high salinities, not enough fresh 16 MS. WINE: Your Honor, I don't have very 16 water. 17 much more. I anticipate he could definitely 17 **Q.** And, sir, has intensive harvesting ever caused a 18 18 get out of here. But -major depletion event in Apalachicola Bay? 19 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I would ask 19 A. Not that I'm aware of. 20 20 Q. And has the taking of juvenile oysters ever you to confer with counsel. 21 MS. WINE: Oh, I'm sorry, sir. 21 caused a major depletion event in Apalachicola 22 22 (Discussion off the record.) Bay? 23 MS. WINE: We have conferred, and we're 23 A. Not that I'm aware of. 24 both confident that we could get Mr. Berrigan 24 **Q.** And, sir, you have seen the bay bounce back, be 25 out of here today even with an afternoon 25 resilient after some of the depletion events in THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 1011 1013 1 break. 1 the past. Correct? 2 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: We'll take a 2 A. That's correct. 3 break. 3 **Q.** And what was different in 2012? 4 A. Well, in my -- my last observation is 2012 MS. WINE: Thank you, sir. 4 5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: And we'll 5 conditions had not improved. They were the high 6 6 hold you to it. salinity, low freshwater input was still 7 THE WITNESS: Yes. 7 continuing when I left. Conditions to my 8 8 (Time Noted: 2:42 p.m.) knowledge may not have even improved yet. I'm 9 9 (Recess Called) not certain. 10 10 (Time Noted: 2:56 p.m.) **Q.** Thank you, sir. I have no further questions. 11 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 11 BY MS. WINE: 12 12 BY MR. ECHOLS: Q. Sir, I can assure you I just have a few more 13 13 questions. **Q.** Mr. Berrigan, I think we're all in agreement 14 Under the -- you recall you were asked about 14 there were less than optimal environmental 15 potential closure of the bay. Correct? 15 conditions. Correct? 16 A. Yes. 16 A. That's correct. 17 **Q.** And, sir, under the environmental conditions that 17 **Q.** We were in a drought which was affecting most of 18 you observed during this depletion event with the 18 the southeastern United States, including 19 low flows and high salinity, would closing the 19 Georgia, including Florida. Right? 20 bay in your view have prevented the depletion 20 That's correct. 21 event? 21 **Q.** We have had droughts before. There have been 22 22 A. It would not have. higher salinity. There have been predators. Q. And why not? 23 23 Correct? 24 A. Closing the bay would have had nothing to do with A. That's part of the ecology of oystering. 24 25 altering the conditions that were causing the 25 Q. In fact, yesterday you said -- you tried at least THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

		TRIAL - NOVETIDE	T	,	10.10
		1014		_	1016
1		to make sure it was clear that we understand	1	Q.	It's a drought. Doesn't FWC have to manage the
2		that. You said it wasn't a surprise at all to	2		fishery during drought as well as during good
3		you. Right?	3		weather?
4	A.	It wasn't a surprise to me to see the origin of	4	A.	Well, I think I see what you're saying; but as
5		this depletion. It wasn't surprising to me to	5		this event progressed, it would have been
6		see the progression of the depletion. But it was	6	6 essentially too late to try and manage individual	
7		surprising to me to see how catastrophic it	7	7 reefs that had living populations. I mean, I	
8		actually was.	8		don't understand what the point would be there.
9	Q.	•	9		You would manage the remaining oysters for
10	٠.	couple of times in your responses to Ms. Wine's	10		what reason? What reason would we come up with
11		questions you said it was an inevitable	11		to say we're going to close this to fishing when
12		, ,	12		
		consequence that the primary producing bars would			the community at large would say don't deprive us
13		be fished because the other bars had been	13		of the economic benefit for no reason?
14		affected by predators and salinity. Do you	14		And there wouldn't be a reason for closing
15		recall saying that?	15		that fishery because those oysters were not going
16	Α.	Yes, I do.	16		to make it to the next harvesting season. We
17		MR. ECHOLS: Could you put the map up.	17		those oysters in this bay typically live for two
18		Are you able to pull out first,	18		summers. And the the primary time that we
19		let's this middle portion here, let's do	19		lose oysters to natural mortality in that system
20		that.	20		is usually July, August, and September. So if
21	BY I	MR. ECHOLS:	21	you closed an area let's say you close an area	
22	Q.	So, now, we have got the Dry Bar/St. Vincent and	22		that has an oyster population on it. And then
23		the Cat Point/East Hole, those are primary	23		you come back the next year, you know that that
24		producing bars. Correct?	24		oyster population that was there is not going to
25	A.	That's correct. With Cat Point being the primary	25		be alive; and you also know that without
		THE REPORTING GROUP			THE REPORTING GROUP
	Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart		Mason & Lockhart		
		4045			
		1015			1017
1		1015 one.	1		recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or
1 2	Q.		1 2		
	Q.	one.			recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or
2		<b>one.</b> A large portion of the oysters that are harvested	2		recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by
2	Α.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do.	2	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a
2 3 4	A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?	2 3 4	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.
2 3 4 5	A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it?	2 3 4 5	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.
2 3 4 5 6	A. Q. A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is.	2 3 4 5 6	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. Q. A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is.	2 3 4 5 6 7	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it?  Yes, it is. It's managed by the State?  Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q. A. Q. A.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Q. A. Q. A.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q. A. Q. A.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. Q. A. Q. A.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife?  All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Q. A. Q. A.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Q. A. Q. A.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife?  All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife?  All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction?  Would you say that again, please.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction?  Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal circumstances, they wouldn't be able to fish all	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They were harvesting more.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal circumstances, they wouldn't be able to fish all the oysters off of those bars.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They were harvesting more.  Right. So at this point in time when we have the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction?  Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal circumstances, they wouldn't be able to fish all the oysters off of those bars. Right. But this was not normal circumstances.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They were harvesting more.  Right. So at this point in time when we have the primary producing bars, and you're saying that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	one. A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right? A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction? Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal circumstances, they wouldn't be able to fish all the oysters off of those bars. Right. But this was not normal circumstances. No, this was not.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They were harvesting more.  Right. So at this point in time when we have the primary producing bars, and you're saying that that's where the concentration is going, it's not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	A large portion of the oysters that are harvested in any given year come from those bars. Right?  A large portion do. This is a managed fishery; isn't it? Yes, it is. It's managed by the State? Yes, it is. Now, are these bars exempt from being managed by Fish and Wildlife? All the bars are managed the same. So are you you're not testifying, are you, sir, that because there was a drought and because some of the outlying bars were affected by predation, that required Fish and Wildlife to let the oystermen fish these bars to extinction?  Would you say that again, please. Fish and Wildlife wasn't required to let the oystermen harvest all the oysters off these primary producing bars. Right? They weren't required to. And under normal circumstances, they wouldn't be able to fish all the oysters off of those bars. Right. But this was not normal circumstances.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Q.	recruitment, it's not going to be renewed or regenerated or sustained. So a management by closing an area to protect dead oysters is not a sound management decision.  But we're not talking about dead oysters, sir.  We're talking about live oysters on Cat Point and East Hole.  MR. ECHOLS: And can we put up JX-78, please, the last page. And I don't know which tab that is.  78, tab 11, your Honor, is the one we had before. And I'm looking at the last page of JX-78, tab 11.  I have it.  Okay.  And we looked at this earlier. And I just want to make sure it's clear. It's not the case that the fishermen were just harvesting the same amount as they had harvested previously.  Correct?  According to the landing statistics, no. They were harvesting more.  Right. So at this point in time when we have the primary producing bars, and you're saying that

1018 1020 1 that they took just the 160,000 pounds that they Q. Right. And so if you look at the data -- and 2 did in 2011, but Fish and Wildlife allowed them 2 this is the second to last page here on JX-78 --3 to take double that in January of 2012, almost 3 for 2012 where we only have half of the year, 4 double that the next month. And every single half of the harvesting year, for Franklin 5 month in the first -- the first five months of County -- that's where Apalachicola Bay is. 6 2012 Florida Fish and Wildlife let the fishermen 6 Correct? 7 take what's there. As you said, fishermen are 7 Α. That's correct. 8 8 going to take what's there if Fish and Wildlife Q. So up at this point in time by June 2012, half 9 doesn't regulate it. 9 the year, we have already got 1,737,222 pounds of 10 A. They could have regulated it. That's what I was 10 ovsters harvested. Right? 11 trying to have a discussion about. What would 11 Α. Yes. That's correct. 12 12 Q. And if you look, just for a comparison's sake, you regulate for? 13 For one thing, they wouldn't know what these 13 you know, at 2010, Franklin County here -- you 14 landings were for 60 days or so after. 14 know we have got the entire year of data because 15 **Q.** So they don't have enough information even to 15 we're in 2012 -- the entirety of 2010 in Franklin 16 16 regulate the fishery? County was harvested was 1,947,201. 17 A. They don't get the landing statistics; they don't 17 A. Would you like to know the reason why? 18 get the trip tickets completed for 30 to 60 days. 18 Q. No. 19 There is a lag period for turning those in. 19 Α. Okay. 20 20 That's not my point. My point is you're Q. But -- so it's the case, is it not, that you had 21 21 talking about should FWC allocate that resource? almost the same amount the entire year of 2010 of 22 22 harvesting just in this first half of 2012. And the danger in allocating that resource is 23 23 that it may not survive until the end. And if Correct? 24 24 A. That's what the statistics indicate. you look at the data that you're showing me, you 25 25 MR. ECHOLS: Could we put the last slide can tell it's not going to last through the whole THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 1019 1021 1 1 number up -- 8 up, please. season. 2 When you look at the other part of this data, 2 BY MR. ECHOLS: 3 when it's there, you will see, as we predicted, 3 Q. Now, we looked at this before. It isn't the 4 that those mortalities did occur. They fished case -- strike that, sir. 5 those stocks down. There would have been no 5 Now, there have been droughts before; and the 6 fishery has not collapsed. Right? point in saving them. 6 7 7 I just -- I don't know how else to make that Α. Yes. That's correct. 8 point that closing -- stopping fishing for what 8 Q. I don't know if you recall -- I looked it up; but 9 point? I mean, management -- to make management 9 there was a state-wide drought in the '89 to '92 10 10 period. Do you recall that? decisions, you have to look at the effect on the 11 11 fishing stocks. You want to look at the Α. Yes, I do. 12 12 economics. You want to look at the future of Q. Okay. And the fishery didn't collapse. Correct? 13 13 these things. When you do all of those things A. Yes. But there were -- we did -- I think there 14 and understand the ecology and the situation of 14 was a study done at that time. And they did show 15 15 some correlation with river flow and a two-year oysters in that case, it would not make sense to 16 16 lag period that was typical of what we see have a closure. 17 MR. ECHOLS: Can we go one page earlier 17 because, again, you're always talking about how 18 18 the effect is on recruitment. It's not the end here, please, in JX-78. 19 BY MR. ECHOLS: 19 product that you're looking at. It is the 20 Q. We didn't look at this page before, but this has 20 beginning product. You have to look at the early 21 the annual landings. But please do note at the 21 recruitment to tell what it's going to be. And 22 bottom it says that the 2012 data -- you recall 22 typically that's two years. 23 23 we only have it complete through June. Right? So drought has a negative effect on 24 Do you remember that was the discussion? 24 recruitment. It's not going to show up during 25 25 A. I understand what that asterisk means. the drought; it's going to show up two years THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1024 1 after the drought. 1 have one question as a follow-up. 2 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: One. 2 **Q.** Okay. So we had the drought here, and we didn't 3 have a fishery collapse here or here or here or 3 MS. WINE: It's only because he invited 4 here or here at any of these points? it, sir. I can't leave it hanging. 5 A. I would suggest to you that in 1995 and '96 on 5 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 6 here that it shows significant decline after that 6 BY MS. WINF: 7 drought. 7 Q. If you -- I don't know if you're still on tab 11, 8 Q. Okay. Well, how about 1998? You had a drought 8 JX-78. We were looking at the landings 9 in 1998, too; do you recall that? 9 information on page -- what's titled page 1 at 10 A. Not specifically. 10 the bottom, although it's the third page of the 11 Q. Okay. I looked it up. After 1998 we had a 11 exhibit. And Georgia's counsel pointed out the 12 drought, and we didn't have a fishery collapse. 12 numbers for 2010 in Franklin County. 13 You know, we had plenty of landings. There were 13 MS. WINE: The 1-nine number, 14 even more then. Right? 14 Mr. Walton, and then the 2012 number, the 15 A. That's what it indicates. 15 1-seven number for Franklin County. 16 16 BY MS. WINE: **Q.** Now, let's talk about what was different about 17 this drought here. Now, the thing that is 17 **Q.** And I think you asked or indicated that you had 18 18 different -- or multiple things that are an explanation for those numbers; so I'm asking 19 different, in the two years prior to this 19 you, sir, what that is? 20 20 collapse here, that's the only time I have been A. Yes, I do. In 2010 that was the year of the 21 21 Deepwater Horizon oil spill. Demand for Gulf able to find -- and you can confirm for me --22 22 reports that you wrote -- resource assessment seafood disappeared. We're lucky we harvested 23 reports talking about a "use it or lose it" 23 that much of it. We probably harvested what you 24 attitude. Would you confirm that? 24 see there prior to the spill or prior to all the 25 A. I can't confirm what you just said, but I brought 25 media coverage of what was happening. THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart 1023 1025 1 up many times "use it or lose it". I have tried 1 The large increase in 2011-2012 that we're 2 my best to explain that approach. 2 talking about is during a period of greatest 3 **Q.** And that was after 2010 with the BP oil spill. 3 demand, because the other Gulf states were not producing because they were still suffering from 4 Correct? 4 5 5 various catastrophic events, and the highest A. That approach was brought up, yes. 6 6 price, which brings oystermen to work. That's **Q.** And in the same two-year time period, we had 7 7 reports in 2011 and in 2012 where you warned that going to bring them out. 8 8 Florida Fish and Wildlife was not enforcing size Plus, during this period of time, there --9 limits. Correct? 9 there's not a lot of other job opportunities. 10 10 A. I reported that I had heard or had information And people will quit their other jobs to oyster 11 11 that size limits were not being enforced. when there is that much money to be gained. 12 **Q.** And you also reported in these same two years 12 MS. WINE: Your Honor, I'm done with my 13 13 prior to the collapse that overharvesting was exam. 14 taking place of sub-legal oysters which was 14 I did remember that I forgot at the 15 detrimental to recruitment. Right? 15 start of my exam to introduce my colleague 16 A. Detrimental to recruitment and to market size: 16 Natalie Rao, who has been assisting me today 17 that's correct. 17 at counsel table. And I just wanted to make 18 **Q.** And then we also have in these two years the 18 sure to introduce her to your Honor. 19 highest -- the largest -- the highest amount of 19 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Welcome. 20 pounds of oysters landed in Apalachicola Bay in 20 MS. RAO: Good afternoon, your Honor. 21 the prior 25 years. Right? 21 MR. ECHOLS: No further questions, your 22 A. That is correct. Highest demand, highest price, 22 23 23 more fishermen. SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Mr. Berrigan, 24 MR. ECHOLS: No further questions. 24 of all the people involved in this, I'm the 25 MS. WINE: Your Honor, briefly, I just 25 least informed. So forgive me if I don't ask THE REPORTING GROUP THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart Mason & Lockhart

- 1 the question properly. But in your -- one of
- your reports you refer to oysters as sessile animals. 3
- 4 THE WITNESS: Sessile.
- SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Would you 5
- tell me what the heck a sessile animal is?
- 7 THE WITNESS: That -- oysters cement
- themselves to their substrates, so they're 8
- 9 immobile. Oysters cement themselves to the
- substrate and essentially become immobile. 10
- They can't swim. They can't walk. They 11
- 12 can't crawl. Wherever they set, for the most
- part that's where they're going to live their 13

life out. 14

20

25

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Why were 15 managed reefs performing better for some 16

17 portions of 2012 than the other reefs?

THE WITNESS: I would like to take 18 19 credit for our group saying that we put them in the right places, because we put them in

- areas where we had the most stable 21
- 22 environment for their -- them to grow. They
- 23 were all somewhat proximal to the river and
- 24 freshwater discharge.

We had really learned in our process not THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

1027

22

- 1 to construct reefs in the far reaches of
- 2 Apalachicola Bay or in areas that were too
- 3 far away from the river because favorable
- conditions were just not predictable.

5 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Does the

- 6 success that you had in reshelling some reefs
- 7 up through 2012 indicate that increased
- salinity was the primary cause of the oyster 8
- 9 collapse?

THE WITNESS: In the areas that we're 10

- 11 talking about on Green Point, North Spur, and on East Hole, all of those bars, as we saw in
- 13 these photographs, started off very good. We
- had good recruitment on them, good survival, 14
- 15 and good growth. Throughout the progress of
- this depletion event, all of those planted
- 17 reefs were adversely affected and had --
- experienced extensive mortality, probably in
- some places reaching as much as 100 percent. 19
- But they were the last ones to go. 20
- 21 I dove on the East Hole plant site, I
- 22 think, in November of 2012, really kind of in
- 23 response to this one note, and it still
- 24 looked pretty good at that time. Of course,
- it was right beside the Intracoastal

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

- Waterway, which is a conveyance for what
- little fresh water there was through the bay.
- SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: I realize 3
- that you were not employed at the time, but
- has Florida engaged in reshelling since 2012?
- THE WITNESS: I'm not certain of this 6
- 7 answer; but I believe that there has been
- almost a continuous reshelling program
- ongoing. And that reshelling program has
- primarily been for employment of oystermen 10
- that otherwise wouldn't be able to make a 11
- living right now. 12

SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: And do you 13

- know what the result was? 14
- THE WITNESS: I do not. And I actually 15
- want -- one of my clients has asked me 16
- 17 several times to try to find that information
- out, and I haven't got it. I have tried. 18
- SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Are you at 19
- 20 all familiar with the ACF Stakeholders
- Sustainable Water Implementation Plan? 21
  - THE WITNESS: No, I'm not.
- SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: And then, 23
- 24 finally -- and this one is just because of
- the way I read things. Would you go to

THE REPORTING GROUP

Mason & Lockhart

1029

- volume 1 and tab 3, JX-150, Joint Exhibit 150.
- Do you have that?
- 3 THE WITNESS: Yes, I do.
- 4 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: It's -- I
- 5 understand that you told both counsel that
- these were your notes. And, yet, the heading 6
- 7 says Input For Mark's Report. Did you write
- that? 8
- 9 THE WITNESS: In reading this and
- reading some of these sentences are not mine. 10
- 11 I'm not certain as to what this was. And
- I -- I may have conceded that these were my 12
- 13 notes; but I -- I am somewhat confused by
- them. Most of the statements in there are --14
- 15 I agree with.
- 16 SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: Thank you.
- 17 You have clarified that for me and made me
- feel a lot better. 18
- 19 Counsel?
- 21 MR. ECHOLS: Nothing, your Honor.
- 22 MS. WINE: Nothing further, your Honor.
  - SPECIAL MASTER LANCASTER: We will
- recess for the weekend. 24
- 25 Alec has furnished counsel with a list THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

20

23

```
1030
 1
        of good restaurants, and that's one of the
2
        things that Portland does have. I suggest
3
        that you try them out. I'm sure you're all
 4
        aware of the fact that this is a daylight
 5
        savings time change, so there will be an hour
 6
        change this weekend. You may not be aware
7
        that this building will be closed on the 11th
8
        on Veteran's Day, so you're going to have a
9
        long weekend. You're going to have another
        chance to sample Portland's restaurants.
10
11
            We'll be in recess. Thank you.
12
            MR. ECHOLS: Thank you, your Honor.
13
            THE WITNESS: Thank you.
             (Time Noted: 3:22 p.m.)
14
15
             (Proceeding adjourned to Monday,
         November 7, 2016, at 9:00 a.m.)
16
17
                (End of day)
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
                THE REPORTING GROUP
                 Mason & Lockhart
                                                1031
                   CERTIFICATE
 1
2
            I, Claudette G. Mason, a Notary Public
3
        in and for the State of Maine, hereby certify
 4
        that the foregoing pages are a correct
5
        transcript of my stenographic notes of the
6
        Proceedings.
7
            I further certify that I am a
8
        disinterested person in the event or outcome
9
        of the above-named cause of action.
10
            IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I subscribe my hand
11
        this 28th day of November, 2016.
12
13
14
15
                    /s/ Claudette G. Mason
                    Claudette G. Mason, RMR, CRR
16
                    Court Reporter
17
   My Commission Expires
    June 9, 2019.
18
19
20
21
```

THE REPORTING GROUP Mason & Lockhart

•	<b>160,768</b> [1] - 952:5	856:20, 857:10,	976:17, 978:1,	<b>30-plus</b> [1] - 905:9
	<b>17</b> [2] - 865:8, 903:11	858:9, 869:22,	979:6, 995:21,	<b>307</b> [1] - 920:18
<b>'08</b> [1] - 921:15	<b>18</b> [1] - 839:6	871:18, 913:17,	1004:4, 1006:2,	<b>312</b> [1] - 920:8
<b>'09</b> [1] - 921:15	<b>19</b> [1] - 965:23	916:20, 922:15,	1004:4, 1000:2,	<b>312</b> [1] - 920.8 <b>313</b> [1] - 920:3
<b>'10</b> [1] - 921:15		922:17, 922:20,	1000:10, 1000:13,	
<b>'85</b> [1] - 909:17	<b>1980's</b> [1] - 963:10	923:22, 925:5,	1013:3, 1013:4,	<b>332,556</b> [1] - 952:1
<b>'89</b> [1] - 1021:9	<b>1985</b> [1] - 964:2	926:19, 941:16,	1018:3, 1018:6,	<b>3:22</b> [1] - 1030:14
<b>'92</b> [1] - 1021:9	<b>1989</b> [1] - 956:3	949:18, 949:20,	1019:22, 1020:3,	
<b>'96</b> [1] - 1022:5	<b>199,000</b> [1] - 953:4	951:3, 951:21,	1020:8, 1020:15,	4
<b>55</b> [1] 1022.0	<b>1990</b> [1] - 947:8	952:4, 953:4,	1020:22, 1023:7,	<b>4</b> [11] - 814:13, 847:15,
1	<b>1991</b> [2] - 947:9,	953:16, 956:7,	1024:14, 1026:17,	867:3, 867:15,
	947:10	956:12, 956:22,	1027:7, 1027:22,	867:17, 891:9,
/ <b>s</b> [1] - 1031:15	<b>1995</b> [1] - 1022:5	959:18, 962:3,	1028:5	945:16, 978:2,
	<b>1998</b> [3] - 1022:8,	970:7, 970:23,	2012-2013 [3] -	992:7, 998:17
1	1022:9, 1022:11	974:8, 988:19,	956:21, 957:18,	<b>40</b> [1] - 939:20
4 040.00 040.05	<b>1:00</b> [1] - 940:3	992:4, 992:21,	967:5	<b>49</b> [2] - 873:9, 874:8
<b>1</b> [17] - 819:20, 819:25,		993:15, 994:13,	<b>2012/2013</b> [1] - 836:15	
874:20, 913:21, 938:4, 941:10,	2	995:5, 1018:2,	<b>2013</b> [11] - 900:5,	5
	<b>2</b> [15] - 846:13, 880:4,	1023:7	900:16, 912:15,	
941:17, 951:12, 951:21, 958:10	896:25, 913:21,	<b>2011-2012</b> [2] - 850:8,	912:17, 912:23,	<b>5</b> [12] - 848:21, 868:17,
951:21, 958:10, 967:20, 988:18,	913:22, 941:13,	1025:1	957:17, 962:15,	868:19, 891:12,
995:20, 1000:8,	945:12, 951:13,	<b>2011/12</b> [1] - 844:11	962:18, 965:13,	929:25, 934:11,
1004:3, 1024:9,	970:19, 991:25,	<b>2012</b> [105] - 816:16,	965:15, 967:4	940:24, 944:5,
1029:1	1000:9, 1006:19,	817:4, 822:17,	<b>2014</b> [2] - 919:2,	970:3, 1002:3,
<b>1,000</b> [1] - 915:13	1006:22	822:20, 822:23,	921:14	1004:2, 1006:8
<b>1,737,222</b> [1] - 1020:9	<b>2,000</b> [2] - 918:3,	828:4, 834:6, 834:7,	<b>2016</b> [5] - 814:13,	<b>5/21/10</b> [1] - 860:12
1,947,201 [1] -	918:8	835:22, 835:24,	954:2, 965:23,	<b>50</b> [2] - 1012:9,
1020:16	<b>20</b> [4] - 828:17, 829:1,	836:4, 836:11,	1030:16, 1031:11	1012:10
<b>1-nine</b> [1] - 1024:13	895:17, 974:18	843:2, 843:23,	<b>2019</b> [1] - 1031:17	<b>52</b> [1] - 914:3
<b>1-seven</b> [1] - 1024:15	<b>200</b> [1] - 910:9	844:1, 844:22,	<b>219,000</b> [1] - 953:11	<b>525</b> [1] - 990:11
<b>10</b> [4] - 889:7, 889:10,	<b>2002</b> [1] - 1004:4	845:9, 845:20,	<b>22</b> [1] - 932:8	<b>537</b> [1] - 814:12
912:6, 945:11	<b>2007</b> [1] - 949:15	848:12, 853:21,	<b>220</b> [1] - 944:4	<b>56</b> [1] - 982:25
<b>10-year</b> [1] - 942:19	<b>2008</b> [3] - 915:12,	854:9, 854:16,	<b>24</b> [5] - 839:6, 839:8,	<b>59</b> [2] - 865:5, 865:13
<b>100</b> [6] - 880:17,	918:15, 1009:10	857:10, 859:5,	945:21, 946:8, 986:7	
946:5, 959:15,	<b>2009</b> [3] - 846:24,	859:19, 861:10,	<b>240</b> [2] - 965:20, 966:1	6
978:11, 978:12,	918:15, 1009:10	861:11, 863:21,	<b>25</b> [5] - 889:20, 903:8,	<b>6</b> [13] - 855:25, 877:5,
1027:19	<b>2010</b> [28] - 828:15,	865:15, 866:18,	955:16, 956:9,	877:20, 888:7,
<b>100,000</b> [1] - 953:6	829:13, 830:6,	867:2, 867:6,	1023:21	888:11, 888:13,
<b>1006</b> [1] - 815:11	832:5, 832:6,	867:20, 868:7,	<b>283,896</b> [1] - 953:11	913:24, 935:17,
<b>1009</b> [1] - 815:9	832:22, 834:5,	868:18, 868:25,	289,000-and-change	966:1, 1003:18,
<b>1013</b> [1] - 815:3	834:18, 836:11,	870:19, 872:3,	[1] - 952:25	1003:23, 1003:24,
<b>1017</b> [1] - 815:12	842:17, 842:18,	877:5, 877:7,	28th [1] - 1031:11	1004:10
<b>1024</b> [2] - 815:3,	848:7, 849:18,	877:20, 913:17,	<b>2:42</b> [1] - 1011:8	<b>6,600</b> [1] - 918:16
815:12	858:10, 860:4,	929:17, 929:23,	<b>2:56</b> [1] - 1011:10	<b>6/18/10</b> [1] - 860:13
<b>10:21</b> [1] - 878:8	869:21, 871:7,	930:8, 930:20,		<b>60</b> [4] - 922:12,
<b>10:37</b> [1] - 878:10	918:15, 942:17,	931:8, 931:17,	3	922:14, 1018:14,
<b>11</b> [6] - 903:7, 948:18,	962:18, 974:4,	932:22, 932:25, 934:21, 935:8	2 may 900-00 005-7	1018:18
948:22, 1017:11,	1009:10, 1020:13,	934:21, 935:8, 941:11, 945:16,	<b>3</b> [20] - 822:23, 835:7,	<b>600</b> [1] - 989:18
1017:13, 1024:7	1020:15, 1020:21,	947:11, 945:16, 947:11, 949:15,	835:8, 843:18,	<b>608</b> [3] - 872:23,
<b>11-year</b> [1] - 942:19	1023:3, 1024:12,	947:11, 949:15, 949:17, 949:19,	859:12, 859:23, 866:10, 869:12	873:13, 875:4
<b>11th</b> [1] - 1030:7	1024:20	949:17, 949:19, 949:21, 950:16,	866:10, 869:12, 869:15, 951:13,	
<b>1296</b> [1] - 931:6	<b>2011</b> [56] - 828:14,	951:4, 951:16,	958:7, 971:7,	7
<b>12:00</b> [1] - 940:1	829:13, 836:4,	951:22, 951:25,	983:20, 984:13,	<b>7</b> [7] - 828:3, 913:18,
<b>13</b> [2] - 912:7, 1000:10	844:5, 844:6, 844:8,	951:22, 951:25, 952:8, 952:25,	987:8, 992:20,	
<b>142</b> [1] - 814:1	844:15, 844:25,	953:14, 954:1,	996:8, 1029:1	914:3, 936:19, 1003:18, 1003:23,
<b>148</b> [1] - 903:5	845:7, 845:19, 846:11, 846:16,	954:7, 956:3, 956:7,	<b>3-inch</b> [1] - 835:1	1030:16, 1003:23,
<b>15</b> [2] - 839:7, 852:17	846:11, 846:16, 846:24, 847:3,	956:12, 959:18,	<b>3.03</b> [1] - 956:4	<b>78</b> [2] - 948:22,
<b>150</b> [1] - 1029:1	846:24, 847:3, 847:9, 848:11,	962:3, 967:4,	<b>30</b> [3] - 855:11,	7 <b>6</b> [2] - 946.22, 1017:11
<b>16</b> [1] - 852:17	040.2 040.40	The state of the s		1017.11
<b>160,000</b> [1] - 1018:1	849:3, 849:18, THI	E REPORTING G	ROUP :6, 1018:18	
1	]	•	I	

## 991:10, 1005:23, 903:15 agency [2] - 855:10, 1020:21, 1028:8 8 1010:12, 1014:18, action [5] - 818:23, 911:25 alter [1] - 844:14 8 [9] - 834:11, 922:6, 826:13, 973:19, 1015:22, 1022:21, aggregated [1] altering [1] - 1011:25 922:11, 969:3, 1028:11 982:1, 1031:9 893:25 amending [1] - 864:2 970:1, 993:11, abnormal [1] - 979:21 actions [2] - 854:23, ago [2] - 836:20, 837:6 amount [15] - 854:11, 1021:1 above-entitled [1] -909:24 agree [38] - 830:15, 855:24, 883:1, **816** [2] - 815:3, 815:11 814:10 actively [2] - 882:6, 912:18, 943:12, 831:16, 831:18, **820,000** [1] - 956:3 above-named [1] -980:21 831:23, 857:20, 944:18, 949:22, 846 [1] - 815:9 1031:9 activities [2] - 931:7, 861:13, 884:11, 952:8, 952:11, **85** [1] - 940:15 absence [1] - 997:20 932:2 887:6, 901:17, 952:15, 955:25, 859 [1] - 815:12 absolutely [2] activity [1] - 830:5 901:19, 901:21, 957:15, 1017:19, 867 [1] - 815:10 889:18, 923:4 acts [1] - 902:1 903:23, 904:2, 1020:21, 1023:19 868 [1] - 815:11 actual [5] - 886:22, 905:16, 908:19, abundance [5] amounts [2] - 956:8, 875<sub>[1]</sub> - 815:14 909:7, 926:18, 848:1, 869:17, 910:13, 946:2, 957:12 888 [1] - 815:18 935:15, 943:11, 894:24, 956:13, analyses [3] - 818:5, 946:6, 956:1 **896** [1] - 815:16 943:17, 951:14, 991:13 add [2] - 928:24, 820:25, 1002:14 8:55 [1] - 814:14 952:19, 953:8, abundances [1] -983:12 analyzing [1] - 850:13 953:9, 953:12, 829:9 animal [2] - 894:10, added [1] - 966:7 953:17, 955:20, abundant [3] - 894:22, 9 adding [1] - 908:7 1026:6 956:6, 956:10, 1004:23, 1005:20 additional [7] - 833:1, animals [4] - 926:23, 9 [6] - 930:25, 931:2, 959:16, 960:15, accelerate [4] -927:20, 980:10, 888:5, 912:25, 931:4, 968:9, 960:20, 964:15, 963:23, 965:4, 1026:3 930:16, 934:5, 994:8 1031:17 965:2, 994:6, 995:3, 965:6, 966:19 annoying [1] - 888:18 address [1] - 906:7 **914** [1] - 815:9 995:4, 1029:15 accelerated [1] annual [4] - 912:1, adjourned [1] -918 [1] - 815:18 **agreeable** [1] - 926:8 964:16 953:23, 992:12, 1030:15 922 [1] - 815:10 agreed [1] - 954:22 accept [3] - 834:10, adopted [1] - 964:3 1019:21 931 [1] - 815:17 agreeing [1] - 902:16 861:15, 947:19 adult [8] - 827:8, answer [10] - 842:3, 941 [1] - 815:11 agreement [1] -853:25, 854:2, access [1] - 955:3 838:19, 839:20, 945 [1] - 815:16 1013:13 906:6, 944:16, accommodate [1] -880:25, 974:10, 948 [1] - 815:12 agrees [1] - 886:17 944:20, 966:4, 860:10 1005:19, 1005:20 **95** [2] - 940:20, 976:10 accommodations [1] Agriculture [3] -966:14, 1010:14, adult-size [1] - 839:20 **954** [1] - 815:17 911:7, 912:8, 931:12 - 829:18 1028:7 adults [4] - 876:18, 958 [1] - 815:12 ahead [4] - 858:6, answers [1] - 944:9 accomplish [1] -935:13, 979:9, **968** [1] - 815:3 936:20, 960:19, 997:23 anticipate [1] -984:17 969 [1] - 815:14 1006:9 according [4] -1010:17 advantage [1] - 962:9 **987** [1] - 815:12 aid [1] - 997:17 Apalachicola [60] -837:15, 951:25, adverse [2] - 890:14, 993 [1] - 815:10 aim [1] - 974:12 957:11, 1017:21 817:4, 818:21, 985:15 995 [1] - 815:11 alec [1] - 1029:25 accurate [20] - 831:15, 822:2, 822:6, 822:8, adversely [2] - 823:7, 9:00 [1] - 1030:16 alive [5] - 883:5, 824:21, 833:10, 834:7, 858:24, 1027:17 899:22, 915:17, 840:20, 842:19, 870:21, 870:24, advise [2] - 1010:10, Α 844:7, 852:21, 930:2, 1016:25 871:22, 873:10, 1010:11 860:9, 865:15, 873:13, 874:11, allocate [1] - 1018:21 affect [2] - 851:1, a.m [4] - 814:14, allocated [1] - 913:1 867:5, 868:24, 874:12, 875:9, 868:13 878:8, 878:10, 875:8, 876:12, 885:2, 893:9, 903:4, allocating [1] affected [15] - 821:14, 1030:16 879:3, 879:22, 904:1, 905:5, 914:8, 1018:22 821:23, 822:1, aberrations [1] -884:4, 904:1, 959:1, 959:8, 962:16 allocation [4] - 840:4, 822:3, 823:8, 834:4, 884:18 ACF [2] - 861:24, 909:13, 915:6, 845:24, 851:10, 840:2, 979:9, ABID [1] - 814:18 922:16, 924:2, 1028:20 984:8 979:10, 986:1, ability [1] - 955:9 926:7. 934:7. achieved [1] - 916:10 allow [7] - 819:5, 991:20, 1001:15, able [30] - 837:1, 934:17, 936:24, acknowledged [3] -1014:14, 1015:14, 832:4, 832:21, 840:25, 841:3, 842:18, 866:8, 857:24, 877:15, 941:19, 972:21, 1027:17 846:5, 850:14, 972:23, 972:25, 887:23 938:24, 971:16 affecting [1] - 1013:17 876:14, 876:17, 973:1, 973:16, acre [6] - 837:24, allowed [3] - 843:11, affinities [1] - 980:11 876:18, 879:22, 985:16, 985:17, 839:22, 850:20, 979:18, 1018:2 afternoon [8] - 940:4, 882:23, 882:24, 985:24, 986:5, 918:3, 918:8, 918:9 allows [1] - 833:13 940:6, 968:13, 898:10, 910:23, 988:18, 989:17, acreage [1] - 910:13 almost [11] - 825:6, 968:14, 1010:8, 911:22, 913:4, 989:19, 991:3, acres [2] - 910:9, 827:15, 840:21, 1010:13, 1010:25, 924:16, 939:19, 991:19, 992:9, 840:23, 845:21, 989:18 1025:20 940:8, 940:17, 994:3, 994:24, 858:5, 899:19, act [2] - 908:1, 997:17 age [1] - 984:21

954:11, 957:3,

971:18, 976:25,

999:2, 1000:22,

acting [2] - 902:12 THE REPORTING GROUP, 1018:3,

	_	_	_	_
1003:1, 1003:3,	963:5, 963:7,	attach [1] - 826:20	<b>bad</b> [5] - 897:11,	833:22, 860:11,
1004:20, 1008:3,	964:23, 971:22,	attached [4] - 920:22,	900:12, 929:2,	860:13, 885:17,
1008:8, 1012:6,	975:5, 983:8,	921:6, 949:14, 968:9	929:5, 986:12	914:7, 923:3, 924:1,
1012:18, 1012:21,	985:20, 991:1,	attachment [2] -	<b>BAD</b> [2] - 931:8,	932:5, 932:22,
1020:5, 1023:20,	991:5, 991:7,	949:12, 950:22	931:10	934:7, 935:24,
1027:2	991:20, 1005:8,	attacking [1] - 980:17	bag [22] - 854:7,	936:8, 936:11,
apologies [2] - 940:8,	1009:1, 1009:25,	attended [2] - 930:18,	863:15, 864:22,	938:15, 959:10,
940:16	1010:2, 1026:21,	934:2	866:16, 896:23,	971:16, 971:19,
apologize [2] -	1027:2, 1027:10	attention [2] - 940:12,	897:1, 897:3, 897:4,	971:23, 975:7,
819:19, 914:18	arguing [2] - 862:24,	1003:18	897:17, 898:11,	976:20, 981:15,
appear [6] - 820:12,	864:18	attitude [4] - 842:16,	898:14, 898:22,	981:18, 989:8,
881:23, 882:20,	articulated [2] - 882:1,	848:8, 858:20,	898:23, 899:8,	999:19, 999:23,
919:17, 933:17,	927:25	1022:24	899:12, 899:13,	999:24, 1000:21,
949:21	aspect [1] - 909:8	attorneys [1] - 862:4	899:14, 947:6,	1001:18, 1005:9,
appearance [4] -	assess [2] - 922:25,	attributed [10] -	947:7, 986:20	1008:3, 1008:8,
878:23, 924:5,	955:9	834:17, 848:5,	bags [8] - 819:14,	1014:12, 1014:13,
926:24, 927:21	assessed [1] - 923:3	856:10, 861:3,	828:15, 849:23,	1014:24, 1015:3,
APPEARANCES [1] -	Assessment [2] -	871:6, 987:24,	849:24, 850:4,	1015:9, 1015:11,
814:16	867:5, 922:15	992:23, 1002:8,	850:19, 898:14,	1015:14, 1015:16,
appeared [2] - 907:5,	assessment [20] -	1002:18, 1007:15	942:13	1015:20, 1015:23,
933:18	816:16, 844:7,	audience [1] - 937:3	<b>balance</b> [2] - 844:15,	1017:24, 1027:12
apply [2] - 852:10,	849:4, 861:12,	August [29] - 816:16,	867:25	Bars [2] - 848:24,
911:18	879:7, 892:19,	820:3, 822:17,	<b>ball</b> [1] - 910:8	922:16
approach [7] - 856:18,	915:10, 916:20,	822:23, 828:4,	Bankruptcy [1] -	base [1] - 916:11
857:21, 861:8,	919:4, 923:6, 924:1,	835:23, 843:2,	814:12	based [19] - 851:17,
875:3, 961:14,	929:18, 956:12,	843:23, 844:1,	<b>Bar</b> [39] - 823:1, 823:6,	883:1, 891:23,
1023:2, 1023:5	959:20, 970:24,	844:22, 845:9,	829:8, 829:17,	892:20, 902:12,
April [12] - 832:6,	992:4, 995:22,	853:21, 854:9,	891:16, 892:17,	903:16, 904:17,
836:4, 842:17,	1004:5, 1006:11,	857:10, 859:5,	893:12, 893:14,	905:17, 905:21,
851:18, 858:10,	1022:22	861:11, 863:21,	915:10, 915:11,	906:12, 915:15,
860:4, 912:15,	assessments [5] -	867:2, 868:23,	917:4, 927:9,	918:5, 919:8,
912:17, 919:2,	914:5, 918:3,	871:19, 915:12,	927:10, 927:17,	923:16, 944:10,
953:12, 962:15,	922:24, 932:7,	929:17, 941:11,	973:5, 973:12,	944:14, 956:6,
962:18	932:20	949:22, 951:16,	974:4, 974:6,	956:10, 977:15
Aquaculture [3] -	assist [3] - 879:25,	995:21, 1004:4,	974:20, 981:20,	<b>basic</b> [1] - 824:23
844:8, 846:23,	898:9, 963:16	1007:3, 1016:20	982:16, 982:17,	<b>basis</b> [2] - 893:4,
931:11	assistant [2] - 950:4,	availability [6] -	982:19, 996:15,	907:25
area [35] - 823:10,	950:5	849:22, 850:3,	996:19, 997:7,	baskets [1] - 819:14
833:17, 853:11,	assisted [1] - 966:10	851:7, 860:19,	997:8, 997:11,	Bates [1] - 861:21
885:3, 896:6, 903:7,	assisting [1] -	956:14, 987:23	997:25, 998:3,	<b>Bay</b> [50] - 817:4,
915:5, 915:20,	1025:16	available [10] - 830:1,	1008:9, 1008:15,	818:22, 822:2,
915:21, 925:5,	assists [1] - 861:17	842:21, 843:8,	1008:25, 1009:4	822:6, 822:8,
925:6, 926:16,	associated [7] -	856:17, 906:12,	<b>bar</b> [17] - 900:4,	824:21, 833:10,
928:21, 938:3,	827:4, 828:10,	908:3, 952:13,	905:22, 915:5,	840:20, 842:19,
964:23, 973:1,	890:15, 988:22,	960:9, 960:22,	917:5, 917:9,	843:25, 844:7,
973:2, 973:15,	994:2, 998:4, 1003:6	961:25	928:14, 928:15,	852:21, 860:9,
974:20, 974:22,	Association [3] -	avoid [1] - 1008:21	932:6, 933:1,	865:15, 867:5,
975:8, 975:17,	860:8, 860:18, 967:2	awarded [1] - 910:23	935:14, 954:10,	868:24, 879:3,
976:21, 977:14,	<b>assume</b> [4] - 883:24,	<b>aware</b> [6] - 855:13,	954:19, 973:6,	879:24, 904:1,
981:24, 983:10,	948:2, 964:12,	900:3, 1012:19,	974:9, 981:21,	909:13, 915:6,
983:11, 990:3,	986:17	1012:23, 1030:4,	981:23, 1008:13	922:16, 924:2,
991:14, 991:16,	assuming [2] -	1030:6	Bar/St [3] - 958:24,	926:7, 941:19,
997:7, 998:12,	880:18, 927:14	awhile [1] - 1010:6	959:10, 1014:22	972:21, 972:23,
1016:21, 1017:3	assumption [2] -	_	BARACK [1] - 814:21	972:25, 973:1,
areas [30] - 817:6,	948:2, 948:5	В	barge [1] - 908:10	973:15, 985:16,
826:12, 829:22,	<b>assure</b> [1] - 1011:12	<b>babies</b> [1] - 831:6	barnacles [1] - 920:22	985:17, 985:24,
858:1, 894:19,	<b>assured</b> [1] - 991:7	baby [2] - 826:2, 826:3	bars [51] - 822:2,	986:5, 989:17, 989:10, 991:3
913:16, 924:3,	asterisk [1] - 1019:25	background [1] -	823:20, 829:21,	989:19, 991:3, 991:19, 992:9,
934:23, 934:25,	asterisks [1] - 953:25	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	830:2, 830:3, 833:2,	991:19, 992:9, 999:2, 1000:22,
935:1, 935:4, 938:1,	<b>ate</b> [1] - 894:10 TH	E REPORTING G	ROUP 1, 833:21,	JJJ.Z, 1000.ZZ,
1			1	ĺ

899:8, 914:21,

1003:1, 1004:20, 1008:4, 1012:6, 1012:18, 1012:22, 1020:5, 1023:20, 1027:2 bay [90] - 818:16, 820:20, 821:13, 821:14, 821:24, 826:18, 829:3, 832:25, 851:24, 852:11, 856:11, 860:21, 861:4, 866:1, 901:14, 901:23, 902:13, 903:13, 903:17, 904:5, 904:18, 904:21, 905:10, 905:19, 905:21, 909:20, 909:24, 912:19, 923:9, 925:2, 925:13, 925:22, 925:25, 928:18, 934:23, 940:23, 945:4, 946:23, 952:22, 957:13, 959:10, 962:4, 962:17, 962:23, 962:24, 963:13, 963:20, 964:5, 964:16, 965:3, 966:11, 966:18, 967:3, 971:12, 971:15, 972:13, 972:18, 972:21, 973:2, 973:7, 973:19, 977:13, 977:17, 978:6, 979:20, 979:23, 980:2, 982:17, 983:7, 984:14, 989:13, 994:1, 998:13, 1001:10, 1001:22, 1005:2, 1008:23, 1009:3, 1009:6, 1009:20, 1011:15, 1011:20, 1011:24, 1012:3, 1012:4, 1012:8, 1012:13, 1012:24, 1016:17, 1028:2 bay-wide [4] - 821:13, 821:14, 901:23, 903:13 Bayou [1] - 1009:5 became [1] - 984:2 become [7] - 825:21, 826:5, 837:1, 979:19, 981:21, 1004:20, 1026:10

becomes [1] - 845:24 becoming [2] - 924:7, 1007:7 bed [1] - 979:7 began [2] - 970:24, 1005:6 begin [5] - 845:17, 882:11, 964:11, 974:2, 984:19 beginning [13] -819:20, 832:1, 834:13, 839:14, 842:13, 844:5, 849:7, 916:7, 976:16, 981:19, 986:9, 998:20, 1021:20 begins [13] - 817:25, 822:25, 832:15, 847:17, 848:18, 849:11, 888:7, 925:3, 992:11, 994:3, 999:8, 1002:14, 1004:14 begun [1] - 926:1 behind [3] - 846:13, 859:12, 922:11 belabor [2] - 992:1, 1007:1 belief [2] - 948:5, 948:7 below [5] - 834:20, 844:16, 856:5, 860:23, 871:9 beneficial [3] -831:14, 843:8, 856:16 benefit [3] - 858:7, 961:23, 1016:13 bent [2] - 877:8, 877:11 benthic [1] - 977:15 Berrigan [19] - 815:3, 816:9, 820:9, 861:24, 865:11, 878:13, 886:14, 905:8, 940:22, 943:21. 950:11. 955:13, 959:16, 968:13, 972:14, 1010:11, 1010:24, 1013:13, 1025:23 Berrigan's [2] -940:13, 968:8 beside [1] - 1027:25 best [7] - 853:16, 854:19, 908:25, 909:2, 919:13, 972:17, 1023:2

better [8] - 895:5,

919:6, 962:8, 1019:22, 1024:10 962:13, 1026:16, bounce [2] - 826:15, 1029:18 1012:24 between [3] - 936:3, box [2] - 881:24, 979:1, 982:3 926:25 beyond [1] - 829:21 boxes [6] - 927:22, big [4] - 826:18, 837:1, 883:6, 954:24 **BP** [3] - 829:24, 832:24, 1023:3 bigger [1] - 918:16 biggest [1] - 977:24 break [13] - 841:14, binder [23] - 819:21, 819:22, 846:13, 939:6, 939:25, 981:12, 981:13, 859:12, 867:4, 982:1, 1010:8, 888:6, 913:19, 913:21, 913:22, 1010:14, 1011:1, 1011:3 922:6, 931:1, 941:10, 945:11, breaking [1] - 939:17 945:12, 948:19, **bridge** [1] - 973:8 958:8, 958:9, brief [1] - 972:18 958:10, 987:7, briefly [4] - 818:10, 991:24, 993:10, 989:5, 1006:8, 995:18 1023:25 **binders** [1] - 995:17 bring [4] - 822:12, biological [7] - 838:7, 857:18, 881:18, 879:16, 984:14, 1025:7 985:1, 985:7, 985:8, **brings** [1] - 1025:6 985:12 broad [4] - 834:9, 903:22, 925:15, **bit** [4] - 847:13, 857:11, 906:17, 925:16 981:13 broader [1] - 938:7 black [3] - 914:20, 918:18, 926:11 965:5 block [1] - 842:8 broke [2] - 877:11, blow [2] - 968:7, 1008:20 987:20 broken [2] - 893:4, blow-up [1] - 968:7 982:2 Board [11] - 853:5, brought [5] - 941:23, 872:4, 874:17, 943:4, 945:1, 875:7, 877:2, 930:6, 1022:25, 1023:5 934:1, 934:5, Brown [4] - 945:20, 934:16, 936:24, 964:8 brown [3] - 945:24, board [5] - 819:4, 946:12, 947:13 819:9, 819:11, brush [1] - 834:9 883:11, 920:12 budget [9] - 910:2, boat [2] - 896:1, 910:18, 910:20, 920:15 911:3, 911:8, **boats** [1] - 829:3 911:23, 912:1, bottom [25] - 826:15, 912:21 847:16, 847:25, build [2] - 823:22, 861:8, 861:18, 823:25 861:19, 862:21, building [1] - 1030:7 869:2, 869:15, built [1] - 885:11 880:17, 896:2, 897:23, 897:24, 915:4, 915:5, 918:1, 920:3, 915:10, 915:11, 920:18, 931:18, 1009:2 931:22, 958:22, bulkhead [2] - 915:3,

928:1, 928:2, 928:11 852:5, 878:4, 878:6, broadest [2] - 824:22, 949:2, 949:11, 950:1 Bulkhead [6] - 914:24,

989:14, 1007:12,

bullet [1] - 867:18 bunch [1] - 898:13 Bureau [1] - 931:11 burrow [2] - 894:7, 894:10 burrows [4] - 890:12, 891:3, 892:18, 893:25 bushels [3] - 918:3, 918:8, 918:9 business [2] - 987:1, 987:2 buy [4] - 960:12, 987:1, 987:3, 987:5 **BY** [55] - 816:8, 820:8, 860:1, 865:10, 866:11, 867:9, 867:16, 868:21, 872:1, 874:22, 875:5, 878:12, 880:6, 881:17, 887:4, 888:15, 892:7, 893:1, 895:23, 896:15, 898:8. 899:7. 900:2. 905:15, 914:1, 921:18, 930:15, 934:14, 935:20, 936:22, 937:21, 940:18, 944:13, 955:12, 958:6, 968:12, 969:22, 970:5, 970:21, 971:9, 978:4, 978:20, 987:21, 990:17, 993:24, 994:22, 997:1, 997:5, 999:11, 1013:12, 1014:21, 1019:19, 1021:2, 1024:6, 1024:16 by-month [3] - 950:17, 950:20, 951:6

## С

Cabbage [5] - 998:22, 999:2, 1000:23, 1001:4. 1009:5 capable [2] - 849:22, 850:3 case [24] - 821:13, 827:19, 829:17, 834:2, 837:4, 838:7, 845:9, 865:1, 877:4, 877:8, 886:12, 889:25, 890:1, 891:18, 904:17, 923:10, 928:5, 932:21, 951:9, 1017:17, 1019:15,

THE REPORTING GROUP,

1020:20, 1021:4	860:6, 877:14,	clear [10] - 820:23,	collecting [1] - 930:23	860:6, 872:8,
cases [4] - 885:18,	878:13, 885:16,	824:6, 844:18,	collective [1] - 876:3	874:18, 875:8,
921:12, 1005:19,	901:10, 938:23,	852:19, 873:22,		875:25, 877:3,
1006:3		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	collectively [1] -	
	941:5, 1030:5, 1030:6	954:17, 979:6,	1000:12	930:10, 930:19,
Cat [29] - 821:15,		982:19, 1014:1,	collects [1] - 941:22	934:7, 934:18,
822:4, 822:25,	changed [1] - 850:24	1017:17	colon [1] - 844:12	936:25, 937:23,
823:6, 829:7,	changes [1] - 971:1	clearly [2] - 817:22,	<b>color</b> [4] - 914:19,	938:9, 938:21,
829:17, 848:23,	<b>changing</b> [3] - 850:17,	978:25	914:22, 918:19,	1008:12, 1008:19,
887:21, 887:24,	907:11, 985:1	clients [1] - 1028:16	922:10	1016:12
890:7, 891:16,	<b>channel</b> [1] - 1000:10	<b>clip</b> [5] - 970:3,	<b>column</b> [10] - 824:25,	compare [1] - 932:4
893:12, 893:14,	characteristic [2] -	970:19, 971:7,	826:11, 902:20,	compared [4] -
894:1, 894:22,	863:12, 866:13	977:24, 978:2	942:2, 942:13,	849:20, 878:24,
900:20, 941:3,	characteristics [1] -	<b>clips</b> [2] - 930:16,	942:16, 951:11,	949:18, 953:11
958:23, 959:11,	901:16	968:18	951:22, 954:9	compares [1] - 952:4
959:14, 973:5,	characterization [4] -	<b>close</b> [8] - 963:7,	combination [3] -	comparing [1] - 934:8
980:3, 983:2, 996:9,	886:17, 892:2,	963:20, 966:11,	818:8, 821:2, 823:7	comparison [3] -
1008:9, 1008:15,	892:15, 905:1	973:25, 975:1,	combine [1] - 855:5	878:1, 882:13,
1014:23, 1014:25,	characterize [2] -	999:4, 1016:11,	combined [1] - 869:20	882:14
1017:6	928:14, 978:11	1016:21	coming [3] - 843:25,	comparison's [1] -
catastrophic [3] -	characterizing [1] -	<b>closed</b> [9] - 833:12,	916:25, 928:18	1020:12
1012:14, 1014:7,	904:24	833:16, 856:12,	commencing [1] -	comparisons [2] -
1025:5	chart [6] - 950:23,	861:5, 962:17,	814:13	950:17, 950:20
categories [1] - 979:8	954:10, 954:19,	962:24, 963:13,	comment [2] - 905:2,	compiled [1] - 955:7
categorize [1] - 928:4	955:8, 956:5, 956:10	1016:21, 1030:7	1005:21	complete [5] - 903:4,
category [2] - 818:11,	check [11] - 914:7,	closely [1] - 981:2	commenting [1] -	949:21, 979:20,
820:11	923:13, 946:1,	closer [2] - 880:14,	961:13	1005:23, 1019:23
causal [1] - 1012:11	946:2, 946:20,	900:13	Commerce [1] -	completed [1] -
caused [13] - 860:5,	946:22, 946:24,	closest [1] - 884:2	877:23	1018:18
860:7, 890:23,	947:9, 947:10,	closing [10] - 962:22,	commercial [1] -	completely [4] -
940:21, 940:24,	947:21, 955:6	964:16, 965:3,	957:22	862:7, 953:23,
970:7, 978:16,	checking [1] - 890:22	966:18, 1011:19,	Commission [7] -	975:21, 981:21
986:4, 986:6,	Chesapeake [2] -	1011:24, 1012:3,	829:25, 843:16,	completeness [1] -
1003:14, 1007:23,	879:24, 985:20	1016:14, 1017:3,	852:9, 873:12,	949:17
1012:17, 1012:21	chosen [2] - 932:6,	1019:8	941:22, 977:25,	completing [1] -
causes [1] - 979:4	932:13	closure [2] - 1011:15,	1031:17	1005:18
causing [2] - 1011:25,	CHRISTOPHER [1] -	1019:16	Commissioner [1] -	complexes [3] -
1012:12	814:18	closures [4] - 963:23,	820:2	924:17, 988:2, 993:2
caveat [2] - 844:12,	circulation [1] -	964:2, 964:23, 967:3	commissioner [1] -	compliant [1] - 947:1
957:1	1001:19	clustered [3] - 881:5,	890:9	compounding [1] -
cement [3] - 826:21,	circumference [1] -	982:9, 1001:9	Commissioners [12] -	863:6
1026:7, 1026:9	894:5	clusters [3] - 881:1,	853:6, 872:4,	compressed [4] -
center [2] - 881:24,	circumstances [10] -	981:12, 982:10	874:18, 875:7,	976:19, 983:9,
900:4	821:8, 822:14,	Coast [1] - 1004:19	877:3, 930:6, 934:1,	983:11, 984:2
certain [8] - 821:8,	829:20, 830:22,	collaborative [2] -	934:6, 934:17,	compressing [1] -
829:18, 878:15,	857:23, 946:7,	876:5, 876:7	936:24, 964:8,	983:8
894:5, 996:13,	1009:21, 1009:25,	collapse [11] - 838:4,	968:16	conceded [1] -
1013:9, 1028:6,	1015:22, 1015:24	838:10, 865:14,	commissioners [1] -	1029:12
1029:11	cite [2] - 873:3, 873:7	912:14, 912:20,	937:24	concentrated [6] -
certainly [10] - 821:22,	cites [1] - 955:6	1021:12, 1022:3,	common [11] - 834:22,	848:24, 870:14,
880:12, 897:22,	clam [1] - 897:10	1022:12, 1022:20,	835:19, 837:11,	890:11, 892:18,
952:14, 966:15,	clarified [1] - 1029:17	1023:13, 1027:9	844:17, 856:8,	960:4, 960:6
972:1, 985:19,	class [2] - 838:1,	collapsed [1] - 1021:6	861:1, 871:11,	concentration [1] -
986:6, 986:8, 987:3	839:2	colleague [1] - 102 1.0	876:24, 876:25,	1017:25
CERTIFICATE [1] -	classes [3] - 836:13,	1025:15	908:4, 989:16	concern [9] - 845:19,
1031:1	839:20, 926:23	colleagues [1] -	commonly [2] -	845:21, 845:22,
certify [2] - 1031:3,	· ·	1010:5	865:18, 976:3	848:13, 864:14,
1031:7	Claudette [4] - 814:14,	collect [2] - 895:8,	commons [1] - 846:10	865:24, 868:1,
<b>chance</b> [2] - 955:6,	1031:2, 1031:15, 1031:15	908:11	community [21] -	871:18, 871:23
1030:10	clean [4] - 887:15,	collected [4] - 850:10,	851:16, 854:17,	concerned [2] -
<b>change</b> [10] - 830:6,	908:1, 908:2, 90 TH		ROUP  4, 857:15,	877:15, 938:24
<b>5</b> ( ), 12212,	000.1, 000.2, 90 1111		- · ○ ○ - □¬, ∪∪≀ . I∪, I	57.1.15, 000.Z4
	7.7	1-1- c T1-1		1

	_			
00000rpg (0) 050:00	1006:4 1007:46	050-04 067-40	925-20 926-4	007:11 007:10
concerns [2] - 852:23,	1006:4, 1007:16	858:21, 867:19,	835:20, 836:1,	987:11, 987:12,
960:23	confused [2] - 864:7,	867:21, 957:22,	836:2, 836:7, 838:3,	987:15, 989:8,
conchs [3] - 976:1,	1029:13	998:1	842:25, 843:1,	989:9, 992:5, 992:6,
976:2, 991:13	confusing [1] - 855:6	continues [6] -	843:3, 843:16,	995:7, 995:12,
concluding [1] -	Congress [1] - 814:12	848:21, 932:11,	843:17, 844:3,	996:12, 996:19,
994:12	Congressional [2] -	932:16, 957:2,	845:6, 848:14,	1008:1, 1008:2,
conclusion [1] -	911:1, 911:5	997:24, 1005:13	848:15, 849:5,	1009:11, 1011:15,
970:13	connection [3] -	continuing [1] -	855:11, 855:16,	1012:6, 1012:7,
conclusions [4] -	816:14, 883:12,	1013:7	856:21, 857:8,	1012:9, 1013:1,
904:21, 905:21,	904:13	continuous [11] -	859:1, 860:14,	1013:2, 1013:15,
906:23	consequence [5] -	829:11, 829:15,	861:12, 866:2,	1013:16, 1013:20,
Conclusions [1] -	976:24, 983:6,	870:14, 871:23,	868:16, 870:4,	1013:23, 1014:24,
994:12	986:10, 988:7,	887:24, 900:21,	870:5, 872:9,	1014:25, 1017:20,
<b>condition</b> [14] - 818:6,	1014:12	960:4, 960:6, 960:7,	872:15, 874:1,	1020:6, 1020:7,
818:7, 820:17,	consequences [1] -	960:10, 1028:8	875:11, 875:16,	1020:11, 1020:23,
820:20, 821:1,	986:10	continuously [1] -	875:17, 876:9,	1021:7, 1021:12,
821:4, 847:25,	consider [4] - 855:3,	833:18	876:10, 877:5,	1023:4, 1023:9,
848:3, 870:12,	880:24, 921:2, 921:3	contradictory [1] -	877:6, 877:10,	1023:17, 1023:22,
887:17, 925:6,	considered [6] -	906:24	877:11, 877:12,	1031:4
925:11, 982:6	819:17, 824:5,	contrast [1] - 932:4	877:18, 879:2,	correction [1] - 995:10
conditions [30] -	921:7, 998:1,	contribute [1] -	879:11, 883:8,	correctly [1] - 967:23
821:14, 829:13,	998:10, 1004:18	984:20	884:9, 886:16,	correlate [1] - 1005:16
830:12, 830:16,	consistent [14] -	Contributing [1] -	887:9, 888:23,	correlation [1] -
830:23, 831:20,	860:15, 884:20,	860:2	889:22, 890:20,	1021:15
869:21, 869:25,	970:22, 971:11,	contributing [3] -	890:24, 891:3,	counsel [27] - 816:5,
876:12, 880:8,	972:11, 978:15,	820:22, 832:3,	892:22, 894:18,	841:9, 881:10,
901:15, 902:13,	988:5, 988:25,	836:14	895:6, 895:9,	885:22, 887:2,
903:16, 904:18,	993:5, 995:11,	controversial [1] -	895:10, 896:17,	905:6, 939:8,
924:15, 929:2,	995:13, 1000:18,	903:3	896:21, 897:17,	968:17, 969:17,
929:5, 932:4,	1007:9, 1007:22	conversation [4] -	897:18, 898:20,	981:7, 986:3, 987:7,
964:11, 982:22,	consistently [1] -	938:8, 966:25,	899:11, 899:20,	987:13, 991:23,
987:25, 992:24,	948:17	976:22, 986:24	901:12, 901:25,	993:14, 995:19,
1002:9, 1002:19,	consolidated [1] -	conversations [2] -	902:10, 903:18,	996:11, 1006:11,
1011:17, 1011:25,	824:4	966:5, 966:8	903:19, 907:14,	1006:20, 1009:8,
1013:5, 1013:7,	constantly [1] -	convert [1] - 954:10	907:18, 909:15,	1010:10, 1010:20,
1013:15, 1027:4	851:14	conveyance [1] -	909:21, 911:19,	1024:11, 1025:17,
conducted [2] -	construct [1] - 1027:1	1028:1	913:6, 913:7, 917:5,	1029:5, 1029:19,
846:23, 931:7	consultant [4] -	<b>cool</b> [1] - 924:8	917:6, 923:15,	1029:25
confer [2] - 1010:10,	967:11, 967:15,	copied [1] - 919:1	923:22, 924:19,	counselor [1] - 819:24
1010:20	967:19, 967:21	copies [2] - 881:11,	924:23, 924:24,	count [1] - 825:22
conferred [1] -	consumer [1] - 865:24	895:15	925:17, 927:7,	counting [1] - 961:10
1010:23	Consumer [1] -	<b>copy</b> [7] - 873:11,	935:2, 935:3, 935:9,	counts [1] - 832:15
confident [1] -	931:12	874:4, 874:6,	938:19, 938:25,	County [20] - 828:14,
1010:24	contained [1] - 971:20	874:13, 875:3,	941:2, 941:24,	853:4, 853:5, 860:7,
confirm [16] - 832:19,	container [1] - 819:14	885:25, 899:16	942:7, 942:8,	872:4, 874:17,
863:23, 863:24,	contains [1] - 973:3	coral [2] - 879:13,	942:10, 942:11,	875:7, 877:2, 930:6,
886:14, 895:18,	context [11] - 821:10,	879:17	942:15, 943:6,	934:16, 937:23,
941:18, 942:17,	886:1, 886:24,	<b>corals</b> [1] - 980:9	945:4, 945:5,	949:16, 964:8,
957:6, 957:7,	888:20, 936:1,	corner [10] - 861:19,	946:18, 946:21,	968:16, 977:25,
958:18, 997:20,	937:2, 945:18,	861:20, 862:21,	949:7, 949:9,	1020:5, 1020:13,
1005:5, 1022:21,	948:24, 949:13,	869:2, 880:19,	951:19, 951:20,	1020:16, 1024:12,
1022:24, 1022:25	961:17, 969:10	920:3, 920:19,	951:22, 951:23,	1024:15
confirmation [1] -	contiguous [1] - 973:6	931:19, 969:4, 990:7	952:3, 952:7,	couple [15] - 818:4,
1005:24	continue [9] - 829:6,	correct [178] - 818:11,	952:10, 952:23,	822:22, 823:4,
confirmed [12] -	831:24, 841:8,	818:17, 821:6,	953:1, 956:16,	823:5, 832:23,
818:5, 820:25,	901:11, 925:3,	822:4, 822:14,	958:20, 959:13,	833:2, 846:1,
834:21, 835:18,	971:4, 987:3, 994:3,	827:24, 829:5,	959:21, 960:1,	866:24, 891:21,
856:7, 860:25,	971.4, 967.3, 994.3, 994:24	829:19, 830:17,	963:17, 963:18,	909:11, 913:13,
871:10, 953:23,	continued [8] - 836:5,	830:18, 834:9,	967:16, 968:22,	913:17, 950:21,
957:25, 1003:13,	843:10, 845:2, TH		Neo-11, 978:7, ROUP : 983:4 983:5	995:20, 1014:10
,,	040.10, 040.2, 1711	T IVELOIVITING G	ROUP 3, 983:4, 983:5,	
	1.7	lagon & Tockha	rt	

942:24, 943:8,

945:6, 949:20,

949:23, 951:7,

952:1, 953:18,

course [4] - 839:23, 862:5. 976:25. 1027:24 court [2] - 856:3, 967:13 COURT [1] - 814:1 Court [26] - 814:12, 818:20, 823:15, 836:20, 842:11, 850:1, 868:9, 874:11, 878:17, 879:25, 880:22, 880:23, 881:19, 886:10, 895:4, 900:3, 907:21, 915:8, 918:1, 918:22, 919:9, 919:10, 919:13, 920:20, 941:7, 1031:16 Court's [2] - 927:22, 940:12 cover [1] - 847:11 coverage [1] -1024:25 covered [1] - 937:13 crab [8] - 890:12, 891:3, 891:13, 892:18, 893:25, 894:7, 894:10, 940:25 crabs [10] - 891:5, 891:9, 891:22, 892:12, 893:24, 894:3, 894:22, 940:10, 980:2, 1007:18 CRAIG [1] - 814:20 crawl [1] - 1026:12 creating [4] - 850:6, 882:7, 908:7, 908:15 credit [1] - 1026:19 crew [1] - 819:12 critical [3] - 841:6, 971:2, 1007:5 crop [5] - 839:24, 961:19, 984:9, 986:1. 986:11 **cross** [1] - 1009:6 Cross [1] - 815:2 CROSS [1] - 816:7 **CROSS-EXAMINATION** [1] -816:7 cross-section [1] -1009:6 CRR [2] - 814:14, 1031:15 cubic [2] - 915:13, 918:16

cull [2] - 818:15, 837:8 culled [1] - 836:17 **culling** [19] - 818:18, 818:20, 819:4, 819:9, 819:17, 820:14, 820:16, 820:19, 820:22, 821:5, 821:6, 821:21, 822:3, 836:16, 856:10, 861:2, 883:11, 920:12, 986:2 culmination [1] -965:19 cultch [4] - 863:16, 866:17, 922:2, 989:14 cultched [1] - 959:15 cultching [5] - 907:19, 907:20, 907:22, 958:24, 959:12 cultural [2] - 863:12, 866:13 culture [1] - 897:4 cup [1] - 893:16 current [3] - 849:23, 850:4, 851:21 currents [1] - 826:14 **customers** [1] - 987:2 cuts [1] - 976:7 **cutting** [1] - 965:18 cycle [5] - 852:6, 907:25, 979:20, 1005:24, 1006:1 cycles [2] - 1005:18, 1005:22

## D

**DACS** [12] - 849:5,

852:8, 863:21, 884:13, 889:5, 907:12, 921:21, 922:18, 923:12, 926:21, 935:1, 962:15 damage [3] - 838:17, 852:5, 890:23 damaged [1] - 938:2 damaging [5] -830:12, 830:22, 831:15, 831:19, 869:24 danger [1] - 1018:22 data [42] - 845:11, 850:10, 850:13, 851:5, 852:3, 852:15, 927:15, 941:7, 941:8, 941:21, 942:22,

953:23, 953:25, 954:3, 954:19, 954:23, 955:2. 955:15, 955:17, 955:21, 956:7, 957:5, 957:8, 957:16, 958:1, 1002:14, 1018:24, 1019:2, 1019:22, 1020:1, 1020:14 date [6] - 847:2, 847:5, 877:22, 900:15, 916:19, 930:20 date-wise [1] - 916:19 dated [3] - 867:6, 945:16, 993:15 dates [3] - 910:22, 917:8, 918:14 David [6] - 891:19, 949:2, 949:3, 949:5, 949:11, 949:14 daylight [1] - 1030:4 days [13] - 830:1, 830:9, 833:1, 833:21, 852:17, 853:10, 854:6, 854:11, 854:15, 854:18, 891:22, 1018:14, 1018:18 de [1] - 891:12 dead [39] - 823:21, 824:3, 825:8, 865:17, 881:22, 881:25, 882:18, 882:25, 883:5, 883:16, 894:8, 894:9, 898:19, 899:22, 900:10, 923:8, 927:23, 927:24, 928:1, 928:9, 928:10, 928:11, 963:4, 963:9, 976:11, 978:7, 978:14, 978:21, 981:4, 982:8, 982:11, 982:15, 987:5, 991:11, 997:12, 1017:3, 1017:5 deal [2] - 885:5, 910:12 dealers [6] - 846:4, 857:14, 946:9, 947:15, 966:16, 986:25 THE REPORTING GROUP 1ed [9] - 823:11,

dealing [3] - 821:19, 857:22. 904:2 **Debby** [2] - 890:16, 890:21 debilitating [2] -887:14, 977:9 debilitation [1] -867:22 decade [2] - 958:25, 959:12 **deceive** [1] - 865:23 December [2] -945:16, 947:11 decide [1] - 855:20 decides [1] - 853:16 decimated [4] -909:19, 963:11, 963:17, 998:3 decimation [1] -909:22 decision [7] - 832:3, 832:21, 855:22, 857:24, 962:25, 963:7, 1017:4 decisions [1] -1019:10 declaration [5] -877:24, 900:19, 930:21, 934:22, 965:17 decline [8] - 834:13, 834:16, 848:4, 871:5, 956:20, 957:19, 994:25, 1022:6 declined [3] - 848:3, 849:24, 870:12 declining [11] - 828:9, 828:21, 836:14, 849:12, 849:14, 956:15, 956:24, 957:11, 957:24, 1002:8, 1002:18 decreased [3] -988:17, 988:19, 1003:2 decreasing [1] -855:16 deep [1] - 895:17 Deepwater [3] - 860:4, 928:22, 1024:21 Defendants [1] -814:7 defined [2] - 821:5, 827:12 definitely [4] - 840:17, 892:14, 901:19, 1010:17 **definition** [1] - 893:7

823:18, 823:19, 824:16, 824:17, 865:22, 868:2, 868:13, 884:17 degree [3] - 831:13, 850:24, 955:22 demand [5] - 977:5, 983:14, 1023:22, 1024:21, 1025:3 demonstrate [1] -932:7 demonstrated [1] -929:6 demonstrative [3] -897:8, 898:7, 899:6 demonstratives [2] -879:20, 881:11 densities [1] - 992:15 density [1] - 850:19 deny [1] - 886:15 Department [6] -860:9, 860:11, 877:23, 911:6, 912:8, 931:12 department [1] -931:14 Department's [1] -872:12 dependent [4] -824:21, 902:18, 941:7, 941:20 depicted [3] - 969:16, 969:25, 991:15 depleted [16] - 817:5, 817:11, 817:14, 817:17, 823:10, 853:23, 854:11, 963:5, 963:20, 975:18, 975:21, 979:3, 998:1, 1005:2, 1010:4 depletion [56] -817:21, 821:12, 821:23, 838:13, 841:22, 867:21, 894:21, 929:11, 963:2, 964:1, 965:6, 965:10, 965:13, 970:7. 970:25. 971:12, 971:21, 976:1, 977:12, 977:16, 978:23, 979:23, 981:16, 983:3, 983:7, 983:19, 983:21, 983:23, 983:24, 986:4, 986:6, 986:8, 988:7, 988:8, 988:9, 989:3, 989:6, 991:2, 993:7, 995:6,

997:20, 1003:12, development [1] -1006:23 dock [4] - 822:12, 958:12, 977:1, 1005:6, 1007:10, 921:10 discharge [2] -941:24. 943:5. 945:2 990:7, 996:14, 1007:23, 1009:18, 1002:20, 1026:24 develops [2] - 825:2, document [35] -1004:13, 1019:5 1011:18, 1011:20, 921:5 discrepancy [4] -853:1, 859:14, downs [1] - 973:11 1012:1, 1012:13, devoid [1] - 894:20 859:18, 861:22, downward [2] -946:6, 946:8, 1012:18, 1012:21, 947:18, 947:19 864:12, 867:8. 987:22, 992:23 devoted [1] - 912:19 1012:25, 1014:5, 868:22, 869:8, **Dr** [11] - 879:23, 880:8, die [2] - 962:8, 981:25 discussed [5] -1014:6, 1027:16 827:14, 830:5, 872:23, 914:3, 891:19, 891:21, difference [5] **deploy** [2] - 908:10, 833:6, 872:11, 914:20, 931:3, 897:11, 900:5, 838:21, 840:9, 908:16 963:23 932:1, 950:24, 904:17, 905:5, 930:3, 937:24, Depo [1] - 896:25 958:10, 958:16, 940:10, 940:13, discussing [1] -945:21 deposition [17] -987:14, 987:18, 966:23 940:19 differences [1] - 932:7 859:8, 862:10, 992:3, 992:21, drafted [1] - 816:17 different [23] - 847:13, discussion [7] -886:5, 886:9, 821:10, 852:12, 993:15, 994:11, drafts [1] - 864:3 855:10, 871:17, 886:13, 886:19, 994:19, 996:1, 866:25, 976:23, drag [1] - 894:6 878:23, 879:14, 892:5, 903:1, 903:5, 996:6, 997:19, 978:24, 1018:11, draw [1] - 905:20 879:15, 880:8, 998:17, 1002:4, 943:22, 944:7, 1019:24 895:2, 899:13, drawn [1] - 973:9 948:9, 965:21, Discussion [3] -1003:10, 1003:17, 901:13, 901:20, drier [1] - 924:22 967:1, 967:8, 967:9, 1003:21, 1003:22, 898:5, 944:12, 907:2, 914:9, drill [8] - 924:15, 1006:7, 1006:19, 967:18 914:12, 933:11, 1010:22 924:16, 925:1, depressed [4] discussions [8] -1009:9 956:1, 965:9, 926:25, 979:25, 829:10, 847:23, 854:17, 857:21, documents [9] -1013:3, 1022:16, 994:15, 994:21, 862:3, 862:11, 869:18, 1003:4 962:7, 962:12, 1022:18, 1022:19 1004:24 862:16, 862:22, deprive [1] - 1016:12 966:14, 966:16, difficult [3] - 898:25, drills [9] - 924:22, 869:10, 878:18, describe [7] - 880:21, 967:7 902:15. 903:24 928:12, 940:11, 931:19, 987:7, 880:22, 884:1, diminish [1] - 984:17 disease [3] - 988:21, 994:1, 1004:17, 991:23 887:16, 895:7, 998:4, 1003:6 dire [1] - 838:18 1004:23, 1005:14, dollars [1] - 911:5 907:21, 1002:1 disinterested [1] -1005:18, 1007:19 direct [31] - 834:12, done [24] - 838:17, described [6] - 883:9, 864:25, 865:3, 1031:8 driving [2] - 839:13, 888:1, 891:1, 907:1, 892:20, 900:14, dispersant [1] - 937:6 1007:6 865:5, 865:8, 904:10, 904:11, 909:5. 920:13 865:14, 872:2, dispersed [1] drop [2] - 839:23, 904:21, 905:20, describing [3] -1001:22 872:21, 873:4, 839:24 907:16, 908:9, 881:19, 900:20, 873:9, 874:3, dispute [1] - 864:9 dropped [1] - 943:24 1001:24 909:13, 916:20, 878:21, 888:21, disrupted [4] - 823:13, drought [21] - 830:16, 918:6, 926:16, description [3] -889:6, 895:7, 824:10, 824:18, 923:22, 924:15, 926:21, 927:12, 923:18, 928:13, 895:25, 919:12, 868:3 924:22, 926:20, 927:14, 939:4, 972:18 920:17, 940:12, disruptive [1] - 884:6 932:25, 988:17, 939:19, 966:12, designated [4] -940:13, 940:19, distant [1] - 983:8 1002:20, 1013:17, 846:14, 859:15, 1006:7, 1009:20, 944:4, 967:14, 1015:13, 1016:1, distinguish [2] -1009:22, 1021:14, 886:5, 886:10 967:20, 967:22, 917:13, 978:25 1016:2, 1021:9, 1025:12 destructive [1] -968:8, 968:10, 1021:23, 1021:25, distribute [1] - 930:24 double [6] - 911:13, 971:21, 983:1, 1007:7 1022:1, 1022:2, distribution [1] -911:16, 952:8, detailed [2] - 817:25, 1003:17, 1006:21 1022:7, 1022:8, 935:12 952:11, 1018:3, 818:5 Direct [1] - 815:2 1022:12, 1022:17 disturbing [1] -1018:4 determination [1] directed [6] - 842:20, Drought [1] - 1006:23 1005:17 dove [4] - 890:6, 919:16 843:6, 843:13, dive [4] - 897:3, droughts [2] -890:25, 893:21, 856:14, 861:7, determine [2] -1013:21, 1021:5 899:14, 918:3, 933:1 1027:21 974:13, 974:15 1006:20 Dry [12] - 927:9, diver [3] - 896:10, down [29] - 817:25, determined [1] directly [3] - 900:18, 927:10, 927:17, 896:11, 899:1 827:1, 831:24, 965:17 910:15, 1007:15 divers [1] - 1003:13 958:24, 959:10, 831:25, 844:4, divers' [1] - 1002:25 determining [2] director [2] - 950:4, 974:20, 982:16, 847:16, 849:10, 883:20, 949:17 950:5 996:15, 996:19, dives [3] - 889:17, 852:1, 861:18, disagree [1] - 884:12 detrimental [3] -997:7, 997:25, 889:19, 892:20 863:5, 863:19, 870:8, 1023:15, disappeared [1] -1014:22 diving [3] - 900:6, 863:24, 871:25, 1023:16 1024:22 due [1] - 923:6 932:7, 1006:2 884:25, 892:25, develop [2] - 840:25, disaster [6] - 816:15, **DUNLAP** [1] - 814:23 division [1] - 950:5 896:10, 898:13, 921:5 877:24, 900:18, duration [3] - 826:25, Division [2] - 844:7, 914:15, 922:2, developing [1] - 923:1 930:21, 934:22, 889:11, 912:12 846:23 942:1, 951:3, Development [1] -965:17 during [38] - 817:4, Division's 121 - 844:5. THE REPORTING GROUP 11, 952:24, 931:11 Discharge [1] -829:3, 832:4,

000.00 000.40
832:22, 833:12,
833:13, 834:22,
835:19, 837:12,
842:16, 843:11,
848:6, 849:18,
856:8, 858:14,
861:1, 871:12,
873:14, 913:17,
924:15, 932:7,
932:20, 932:25,
946:15, 953:13,
965:6, 967:3,
967:17, 973:20,
979:23, 983:12,
985:5, 1011:18,
1016:2, 1021:24,
1025:2, 1025:8
duties [1] - 870:25
<b>DWH</b> [4] - 834:22,
856:8, 861:1, 871:12
dying [1] - 923:8
dynamic [1] - 840:19
dysfunctional [1] -
981:21

```
Ε
e-mail [9] - 888:24,
 889:24, 945:15,
 945:19, 948:16,
 949:1, 950:3,
 950:10, 953:19
e-mailing [2] - 949:11,
 950:12
e-mails [2] - 888:17,
 948:25
earliest [1] - 888:24
early [8] - 826:9,
 860:12, 860:13,
 903:11, 984:6,
 984:21, 986:11,
 1021:20
easier [2] - 895:11,
 972:6
easily [2] - 897:7,
 918:2
east [3] - 973:12,
 973:19, 973:23
East [33] - 821:15,
 822:5, 823:1, 823:6,
 829:8, 829:17,
 848:23, 890:7,
 890:10, 891:2,
 892:16, 900:4,
 900:21, 901:3,
 901:4, 931:23,
 932:2, 932:12,
 933:1, 933:16,
 933:21, 935:22,
 936:12, 936:17,
 973:5, 973:15,
```

```
980:3, 983:3,
 996:10, 1008:24,
 1017:7, 1027:12,
 1027:21
eastern [5] - 915:6,
 972:24, 999:3,
 1000:22, 1008:23
easy [3] - 845:11,
 894:8, 947:19
easy-to-accept [1] -
 947:19
eat [2] - 999:22,
 999:23
eaten [1] - 941:24
echinoderms [1] -
 980:10
ECHOLS [101] -
 814:21, 816:6,
 816:8, 819:19,
 819:25, 820:5,
 820:8, 859:22,
 859:25, 860:1,
 865:7, 865:10,
 866:9, 866:11,
 867:7, 867:9,
 867:14. 867:16.
 868:19, 868:21,
 871:25, 872:1,
 874:20, 874:22,
 875:2, 875:5, 878:2,
 878:12, 880:4,
 880:6, 881:15,
 881:17, 886:4,
 886:8, 887:3, 887:4,
 888:13, 888:15,
 892:5, 892:7,
 892:25, 893:1,
 895:15, 895:21,
 895:23, 896:13,
 896:15, 898:4,
 898:6, 898:8, 899:5,
 899:7, 899:25,
 900:2, 905:3,
 905:14, 905:15,
 913:22, 913:24,
 914:1, 921:16,
 921:18, 930:13,
 930:15, 934:11,
 934:14, 935:17,
 935:20, 936:19,
 936:22, 937:18,
 937:21, 939:5,
 939:15, 939:23,
 940:4, 940:7,
 940:18, 944:13,
 954:8, 954:15,
 955:12, 958:4,
 958:6, 971:24,
```

972:4, 972:8,

978:17, 990:17,

```
1013:12, 1014:17,
 1014:21, 1017:8,
 1019:17, 1019:19,
 1020:25, 1021:2,
 1023:24, 1025:21,
 1029:21, 1030:12
eco [1] - 902:8
ecological [1] - 842:5
ecology [3] - 977:15,
 1013:24, 1019:14
economic [5] - 858:7,
 860:6, 961:23,
 962:9, 1016:13
economics [1] -
 1019:12
ecosystem [2] - 902:2,
 902:4
ecosystems [4] -
 902:7, 902:12,
 903:15, 903:21
edge [1] - 976:9
edges [1] - 885:10
EDRP [1] - 912:21
effect [11] - 838:23,
 840:15, 906:18,
 977:9, 984:14,
 985:8, 985:13,
 1019:10, 1021:18,
 1021:23
effectively [2] -
 984:17, 985:1
effects [7] - 829:10,
 869:19, 890:15,
 972:12, 974:13,
 988:16, 1003:2
efficiency [1] - 978:13
efficient [1] - 842:1
effort [14] - 827:6,
 827:13, 832:7,
 833:5, 843:6,
 843:13, 848:25,
 852:21, 856:14,
 861:6, 947:18,
 970:15, 1006:15,
 1008:7
efforts [2] - 876:8,
 1009:10
egg [3] - 825:2,
 1005:19, 1006:3
either [8] - 819:9,
 885:18, 912:11,
 956:15, 972:7,
 985:13, 998:25,
 1010:14
elaborate [2] - 841:7,
 841:11
Elena [6] - 884:5,
 885:14, 887:21,
 909:17, 946:15,
```

```
elevation [8] - 823:25,
                                 824:4. 868:11.
                                 884:8, 885:11,
                                 885:19, 907:5
                                elevations [1] - 867:25
                                eliminated [1] - 974:9
                                embed [1] - 924:16
                                employed [1] - 1028:4
                                employment [1] -
                                  1028:10
                                encompassed [1] -
                                 975:14
                                encourage [1] -
                                 906:20
                                encouraged [3] -
                                 919:16, 920:5, 927:4
                                end [22] - 838:16,
                                 839:13, 841:5,
                                 845:17, 848:16,
                                 888:19, 912:23,
                                 923:8, 924:2, 925:5,
                                 925:13, 925:22,
                                 957:17, 965:11,
                                 974:7, 986:1, 997:4,
                                  1000:11, 1004:5,
                                  1018:23, 1021:18
                                End [2] - 922:16,
                                 1030:17
                                ends [1] - 920:3
                                energy [1] - 981:24
                                enforced [3] - 856:24,
                                 961:2, 1023:11
                                enforcing [6] - 843:6,
                                 843:13, 856:15,
                                 857:2, 861:7, 1023:8
                                engaged [1] - 1028:5
                                enhancing [1] -
                                  908:21
                                enlarged [1] - 920:10
                                entered [5] - 859:15,
                                 862:25, 863:2,
                                 863:4, 962:22
                                entire [14] - 819:16,
                                 860:21, 874:18,
                                 904:21, 905:21,
                                 909:19, 911:6,
                                 930:10, 963:13,
                                 972:21, 973:7,
                                 975:17, 1020:14,
                                  1020:21
                                entirely [3] - 962:17,
                                 962:20, 963:21
                                entirety [3] - 860:10,
                                 953:20, 1020:15
                                entitled [3] - 814:10,
                                 994:11, 1003:19
                                environment [3] -
                                 982:21, 1007:16,
                                 1026:22
THE REPORTING GROUP nmental [21] -
```

```
818:8, 821:2,
 821:13, 828:11,
 828:18, 829:12,
 830:12, 830:16,
 830:23, 831:20,
 838:14, 869:21,
 869:25. 987:24.
 992:24, 1002:9,
 1002:19, 1009:23,
 1009:24, 1011:17,
 1013:14
epizootic [1] - 979:3
equipment [1] -
 1008:12
especially [2] - 934:8,
 985:24
ESQ [9] - 814:17,
 814:17, 814:18,
 814:18, 814:19,
 814:20, 814:21,
 814:21, 814:23
essentially [12] -
 902:10, 929:15,
 965:11, 974:17,
 975:18, 976:17,
 980:22, 982:7,
 999:22, 1000:6,
 1016:6, 1026:10
establish [1] - 841:3
established [3] -
 979:19. 1004:20.
 1007:8
establishing [1] -
 833:10
establishment [1] -
 1005:16
Estes [3] - 950:2,
 950:3
estimate [4] - 910:12,
 939:8, 939:9, 943:14
estimated [3] -
 836:14, 915:13,
 943:15
estimates [4] - 844:9,
 849:15, 849:20,
 992:16
estuary [2] - 1004:25,
 1005:19
evaluate [1] - 914:7
evaluating [2] -
 852:10, 905:9
event [67] - 817:21,
 821:12, 821:13,
 821:23, 832:6,
 832:23, 834:23,
 835:20, 838:13,
 841:23, 856:9,
 860:5, 861:1,
 871:12, 883:4,
 883:22, 894:21,
```

944:14

921:9, 921:19, 963:3, 964:1, 965:7, 965:10, 965:13, 970:7, 970:25, 971:12, 971:21, 974:2, 975:13, 976:1, 977:16, 979:2, 979:23, 980:24, 980:25, 982:16, 983:3, 983:19, 983:21, 983:23, 983:24, 986:4, 986:7, 986:8, 988:7, 988:8, 988:9, 989:3, 989:7, 991:2, 991:21, 993:7, 995:6, 1003:12, 1003:14, 1005:6, 1007:10, 1007:23, 1009:19, 1011:18, 1011:21, 1012:18, 1012:21, 1016:5, 1027:16, 1031:8 events [10] - 821:15, 841:22, 866:19, 925:12, 981:16, 989:6, 1012:13, 1012:14, 1012:25, 1025:5 eventually [1] - 838:1 everywhere [1] -932:14 evidence [3] - 859:15, 981:11, 985:14 evident [2] - 981:14, 1002:25 exacerbating [2] -863:9, 863:11 exact [1] - 910:22 exactly [6] - 898:11, 906:15, 929:12, 957:21, 969:24, 987:11 exaggerated [1] -885:18 exam [2] - 1025:13, 1025:15 **EXAMINATION** [4] -816:7, 968:11, 1013:11, 1024:5 examination [1] -939:12 examined [2] -946:25, 979:5 example [4] - 846:10, 888:4, 922:5, 932:18 **examples** [2] - 880:7, 913:13 exceeds [1] - 946:8 Excel [3] - 950:22,

954:9, 954:25 excellent [1] - 918:2 **except** [4] - 840:9, 843:19, 903:20, 982:7 exception [1] - 924:3 excerpt [2] - 936:15, 1003:16 excessive [7] -834:17, 836:10, 836:22, 848:6, 870:16, 871:6, 887:23 exclusively [1] -821:16 excuse [4] - 881:10, 988:7, 993:17, 1004:4 **Executive** [2] - 854:5, 962:22 **executive** [3] - 816:21, 820:7, 1006:16 exempt [1] - 1015:9 Exhibit [8] - 872:23, 873:12, 875:4, 914:3, 922:12, 922:14, 948:22, 1029:1 exhibit [10] - 846:14, 867:8, 868:20, 872:21, 872:22, 954:16, 955:4, 969:21, 995:21, 1024:11 exhibited [1] - 924:3 **EXHIBITS** [1] - 815:7 exhibits [1] - 888:5 existed [1] - 858:20 existing [1] - 825:12 expand [2] - 854:18, 860:18 expanded [2] -854:11, 854:15 expansion [1] -833:21 expect [11] - 850:22, 851:5, 857:6, 901:23, 903:13, 929:1, 929:4, 947:14, 980:15, 980:19, 981:8 expectation [1] -851:6 expected [2] - 956:15, 1001:13 experience [9] -892:13, 905:9, 905:18, 919:8,

921:9, 921:19,

940:23, 941:1,

experienced [1] -1027:18 experiments [2] -891:23, 940:20 expert [5] - 879:23, 891:18, 904:14, 904:25, 906:4 experts [1] - 904:13 Expires [1] - 1031:17 explain [26] - 817:10, 818:20, 823:18, 824:11, 824:19, 833:8, 842:10, 850:1, 878:15, 884:15, 884:24, 887:20, 893:2, 915:8, 917:25, 918:22, 919:9, 920:19, 939:2, 941:6, 945:20, 947:18, 977:22, 989:10, 1006:12, 1023:2 explained [10] -836:12, 836:20, 837:5, 875:12, 882:3, 895:8, 904:8, 907:24, 964:7, 970:11 explaining [5] - 868:9, 914:13, 917:11, 938:16, 947:13 explains [1] - 919:14 explanation [3] -922:7, 937:8, 1024:18 explanatory [1] -876:16 exposed [1] - 901:16 expressed [1] -960:23 expressing [1] -848:13 extended [5] - 829:21, 829:25, 854:5, 890:13, 892:21 extending [2] -852:16, 997:25 extension [4] - 830:9, 841:23, 842:15, 853:10 **extensive** [9] - 817:13, 849:7, 926:2, 988:1, 989:15, 991:6, 993:1, 993:6, 1027:18 extent [4] - 886:18,

937:9, 1015:16 extra [1] - 895:15 extreme [2] - 891:8, 977:8 extremely [7] - 884:6, 894:22, 918:10, 977:4, 978:13, 985:17, 985:25 extrude [1] - 824:24 F

face [1] - 842:21 fact [24] - 847:22, 872:20, 884:3, 889:19, 893:14, 904:8, 904:9, 905:24, 906:3, 909:11, 913:14, 919:18. 928:18. 937:11, 937:25, 943:11, 961:5, 967:19, 968:24, 985:3, 1005:23, 1006:4, 1013:25, 1030:4 factor [6] - 820:22, 832:3, 839:13, 883:18, 887:14, 1007:5 factors [4] - 818:8, 821:3, 823:7, 1012:12 Factors [1] - 860:2 factual [1] - 986:18 failure [2] - 826:1, 946:6 fair [2] - 912:13, 949:22 fairly [4] - 882:12, 927:3, 979:21, 981:14 fall [8] - 819:6, 825:11, 825:13, 825:14, 842:16, 848:7, 872:3, 995:5 familiar [5] - 880:10, 894:15, 913:3, 1005:25, 1028:20 family [1] - 986:13 far [21] - 823:15, 877:8, 877:14, 879:25, 880:10, 891:6, 891:13, 891:16, 892:12, 902:17, 938:23, 945:3, 949:19, 950:16, 956:11, 963:3, 964:18, THE REPORTING GROUP:1, 1027:3

farm [1] - 897:10 farming [1] - 989:15 fashion [1] - 819:1 fast [1] - 852:4 fatter [1] - 924:7 favor [1] - 967:3 favorable [5] - 822:14, 826:20, 826:24, 982:22, 1027:3 **FAWAL** [1] - 814:18 FCSWA [1] - 860:8 FDACS [2] - 875:25, 949:6 feature [3] - 823:25, 881:24, 885:5 **features** [1] - 879:16 **February** [8] - 916:20, 948:10, 951:13, 952:24, 953:3, 965:23, 967:9 federal [10] - 816:13, 816:14, 822:18, 842:25, 859:6, 911:5, 911:21, 912:9, 912:25, 930:22 feds [1] - 912:23 feed [1] - 986:13 feeding [1] - 980:23 feet [1] - 895:17 **felt** [1] - 1008:19 female [1] - 825:1 females [2] - 824:24, 984:24 fertilized [2] - 825:1, 825:2 few [8] - 816:22, 828:3, 840:12, 935:2, 984:22, 996:4, 1000:2, 1011:12 fewer [1] - 817:19 figure [3] - 875:21, 925:19, 938:10 **file** [2] - 954:9 files [2] - 869:4, 869:5 fill [1] - 947:23 filled [1] - 947:24 final [3] - 954:2, 956:20, 965:19 finally [2] - 1010:4, 1028:24 findings [2] - 872:11, 872:12 fine [5] - 864:11, 893:3, 905:7, 935:25, 936:9 finer [1] - 893:8 fingernail [1] - 825:20

887:5, 904:16

finish [4] - 842:7,

000.04 000.45	
866:24, 933:15, 1010:12	
finished [1] - 939:12	
firmness [1] - 824:4	
first [51] - 816:20,	
817:1, 820:13,	
823:3, 823:16,	
828:8, 832:20,	
841:13, 842:7,	
843:12, 845:15,	
845:25, 846:21, 851:13, 863:7,	
867:13, 867:17,	
869:16, 889:20,	
890:4, 907:3,	
914:18, 915:1,	
948:25, 950:13,	
951:25, 952:18,	
953:13, 954:13, 955:10, 958:11	
955:19, 958:11, 970:24, 971:14,	
975:17, 979:13,	
987:6, 991:24,	
992:11, 992:17,	
995:6, 995:18,	
998:17, 1000:9, 1004:6, 1006:12,	
1004:6, 1006:12,	
1007:4, 1014:18,	
1018:5, 1020:22	
<b>fiscal</b> [1] - 912:23 <b>Fish</b> [17] - 829:25,	
830:7, 832:25,	
843:16, 852:9,	
941:21, 944:25,	
954:5, 954:18,	
955:14, 1015:10,	
1015:15, 1015:18,	
1018:2, 1018:6,	
1018:8, 1023:8	
<b>fish</b> [7] - 827:18, 876:14, 876:15,	
976:25, 977:1,	
1015:16, 1015:22	
fished [7] - 833:17,	
834:1, 933:17,	
933:22, 975:19,	
1014:13, 1019:4	
fisheries [7] - 818:18	
822:1, 838:8, 855:2	,
855:4, 857:22, 984:16	
Fisheries [1] - 950:6	
fishermen [19] -	
836:17, 837:7,	
856:10, 860:5,	
861:3, 863:13,	
864:21, 866:14,	
876:1, 893:13,	
944:15, 963:4,	
974:17, 984:10,	

997:18, 1017:18,
1018:6, 1018:7,
1023:23
Fishery [1] - 992:8
fishery [43] - 818:8,
818:11, 818:13, 818:17, 820:10,
820:12, 821:3,
821:4, 823:9, 830:7,
838:4, 838:11,
843:5, 850:7, 850:16, 852:24,
854:21, 854:24,
855:7, 855:19,
856:12, 856:14,
861:5, 865:15,
869:10, 877:17, 877:19, 877:24,
912:14, 941:7,
941:20, 943:2,
946:17, 961:25,
962:1, 1015:5,
1016:2, 1016:15, 1018:16, 1021:6,
1021:12, 1022:3,
1022:12
fishing [14] - 827:6,
827:13, 870:15,
936:13, 976:14, 976:15, 976:19,
976:21, 983:11,
984:1, 1008:11,
1016:11, 1019:8,
1019:11 <b>fits</b> [3] - 864:7, 903:25,
904:20
<b>five</b> [9] - 849:11,
849:25, 852:16, 871:16, 912:11,
871:16, 912:11,
953:13, 953:16, 961:13, 1018:5
fixture [1] - 994:24
FL [1] - 861:24
FL-ACF-Berrigan [1] -
861:24
flashing [1] - 881:13
Flats [2] - 1009:5 flattened [1] - 885:3
fleet [2] - 870:15,
976:15
flip [3] - 899:25,
950:14, 958:4
flipping [1] - 995:17 FLORIDA [1] - 814:3
Florida [25] - 814:17,
829:24, 832:25,
843:15, 846:15,
859:14, 862:15,
872:22, 875:4,
891:18, 910:15, TH

910:24, 912:18, 946:19, 967:10, 967:15, 979:25, 985:24, 1007:18, 1008:4, 1009:19, 1013:19, 1018:6, 1023:8, 1028:5 Florida's [3] - 862:4, 904:13, 1004:19 flow [3] - 988:17, 1003:2, 1021:15 flows [3] - 1001:18, 1001:19, 1011:19 fluctuating [2] -979:17, 980:8 fluctuation [1] -999:20 fluctuations [4] -987:23, 992:14, 992:23, 1007:6 flushed [1] - 1006:5 folks [3] - 879:8, 921:20, 923:11 follow [4] - 840:24, 862:7. 965:15. 1024:1 follow-up [1] - 1024:1 **followed** [1] - 956:17 following [5] - 842:17, 858:18, 858:20, 910:21, 953:24 food [1] - 1005:12 **foot** [1] - 988:18 **forage** [1] - 894:3 foragers [1] - 894:4 foregoing [1] - 1031:4 forget [1] - 906:15 forgive [1] - 1025:25 forgot [1] - 1025:14 format [1] - 868:23 forth [2] - 820:17, 915:9 forward [3] - 859:4, 867:2, 888:20 forwarded [1] - 950:1 four [5] - 849:10, 939:22, 939:23, 961:12, 974:5 four-zero [2] - 939:22, 939:23 fragments [1] - 819:6 Franklin [20] - 828:14, 853:4, 860:7, 872:4, 874:17, 875:7, 877:2, 930:5, 934:16, 936:23, 937:23, 949:16, 964:7, 968:16, 977:25 1020:4

free [1] - 826:10 frequencies [1] -935:12 fresh [25] - 924:13, 926:22, 926:25, 927:20, 928:9, 928:11, 970:8, 970:25, 973:14, 973:17, 973:20, 973:21, 973:25, 975:9, 977:23, 989:2, 994:8, 999:19, 1001:12, 1001:20, 1007:5, 1010:2, 1012:14, 1012:15, 1028:2 freshet [1] - 890:15 freshly [1] - 981:4 freshwater [8] - 971:2, 973:14, 975:21, 988:17, 1003:2, 1006:6, 1013:6, 1026:24 front [6] - 853:5, 865:3, 879:21, 916:19, 969:6, 991:25 fruit [1] - 858:5 full [5] - 898:23, 898:25, 960:16, 969:14, 998:17 function [2] - 890:13, 892:21 functional [6] -823:20, 824:2, 880:25, 909:5, 916:11, 918:11 functionality [4] -839:4, 839:9, 839:11, 909:9 functioning [3] -882:5, 937:10, 982:12 funded [1] - 965:17 **funding** [7] - 910:15, 911:1, 911:11, 911:12, 911:14, 911:16, 912:9 **funds** [5] - 911:2, 911:12, 912:3, 912:18, 913:5 furnished [1] -1029:25 future [2] - 886:22, 1019:12 FWC [34] - 852:14, 852:24, 852:25, THE REPORTING GROUP 1, 853:12,

1024:12, 1024:15

frankly [1] - 855:13

853:15, 853:23, 854:11, 854:18, 854:20, 855:14, 855:18, 856:23, 857:1, 857:6, 860:16, 875:25, 942:24, 943:2. 949:9, 950:4, 950:8, 950:9, 951:17, 952:1, 957:9, 960:22, 962:16, 962:19, 962:22, 963:13, 963:20, 1016:1, 1018:21 **FX-608** [1] - 815:14 FX-875 [2] - 815:14, 969:21 **FYI** [1] - 950:15

G gained [1] - 1025:11 gametes [4] - 824:24, 824:25, 825:1, 985:23 gap [2] - 912:5, 912:10 gaped [1] - 981:1 gapers [2] - 928:6, 928:8 gears [2] - 878:13, 901:10 general [4] - 880:9, 913:8, 990:3, 1003:12 generalize [1] -1008:5 generally [6] - 825:17, 847:2, 849:16, 897:1, 907:21, 955:20 generation [3] - 916:4, 916:8, 916:9 George [2] - 973:3, 980:3 **GEORGIA** [1] - 814:6 Georgia [6] - 814:20, 846:15, 859:14, 862:9, 896:25, 1013:19 Georgia's [14] -968:17, 969:17, 981:7, 986:3, 987:7, 987:13, 991:23, 993:14, 995:18, 996:11, 1006:11, 1006:19, 1009:8, 1024:11 given [10] - 832:24,

833:20, 857:19,

895:1, 905:7,

909:22, 939:16, 927:8, 927:16, 997:7 851:12, 856:7, 986:18, 1007:2, Gunter [4] - 879:9, 856:17, 858:6, 1015:3 883:13, 914:6, 860:25, 871:11, 925:19 876:22, 916:1, glance [1] - 952:18 government [7] -946:24, 946:25, guy [1] - 936:4 949:19, 955:21, 816:13, 822:18, **GX-1248** [2] - 815:17, 955:24, 961:19, 842:25, 859:6, 954:11 962:9, 984:6, 911:21, 930:22, GX-1296 [2] - 815:17, 957:9 931:2 1015:19 Governor [5] - 820:1, harvestable [4] -**GX-1297** [2] - 815:18, 822:18, 842:24, 837:24, 838:9, 888:14 839:22, 997:16 859:5, 930:20 GX-1305 [2] - 815:18, Governor's [3] harvested [33] -918:23 816:13, 877:22, 818:21, 822:10, **GX-2** [1] - 815:16 934:21 822:11, 833:14, GX-498 [2] - 815:16, 838:6, 840:13, grab [1] - 944:1 945:13 840:14, 842:8, gradients [1] - 826:13 881:4, 882:17, graduate [1] - 900:5 Н 883:21, 884:25, grant [1] - 911:20 habitat [6] - 823:8, 885:3, 941:23, grants [4] - 910:23, 826:16, 887:7, 942:25, 945:4, 911:18, 912:10 908:7, 909:7 950:16, 952:2, great [5] - 839:10, habitats [2] - 867:23, 952:6, 952:12, 885:5, 897:8, 908:21 953:1, 953:15, 919:22, 972:9 haemastoma [1] -955:25, 962:5, greater [2] - 830:25, 980:1 979:1, 981:6, 894:25 half [4] - 1020:3, 981:10, 1015:2, greatest [1] - 1025:2 1020:4, 1020:8, 1017:19, 1020:10, Green [8] - 975:4, 1020:22 1020:16, 1024:22, 998:21, 999:1, hand [17] - 818:22, 1024:23 1000:23, 1001:6, 837:7, 846:6, harvester [2] - 863:13, 1001:8, 1009:3, 861:19, 861:20, 866:14 1027:11 862:21, 869:2, harvesters [3] group [7] - 865:21, 880:19, 882:24, 865:16, 915:22, 889:5, 931:15, 914:14, 920:3, 986:12 931:16, 931:17, 920:18, 931:19, Harvesting [2] - 828:6, 932:2, 1026:19 954:24, 969:4, 869:15 grouping [1] - 999:4 969:18, 1031:10 harvesting [145] groups [1] - 888:3 handed [3] - 968:25, 818:14, 821:17, grow [7] - 836:18, 969:17, 995:19 822:3, 822:19, 837:1, 840:6, handled [1] - 818:25 828:10, 828:16, 887:13, 985:12, handles [1] - 883:6 828:22, 829:11, 989:12, 1026:22 **hands** [1] - 930:25 829:14, 829:16, arowina [4] - 837:4. hanging [1] - 1024:4 829:21, 829:22, 842:21, 920:23, haphazard [1] - 885:9 830:1, 830:2, 830:9, 932:17 830:25, 832:4, happy [1] - 917:18 grown [1] - 825:18 832:7, 832:21, hard [5] - 876:14, growth [7] - 831:5, 833:1, 833:5, 876:15, 881:11, 915:19, 916:4, 833:11, 833:15, 899:16, 980:9 924:4, 926:23, 833:21, 834:17, HARDWICK [1] -927:20, 1027:15 834:19, 836:6, 814:19 guess [7] - 836:3, 836:10, 836:16, harmed [1] - 822:19 840:4, 856:2, 836:22, 838:15, harsh [1] - 982:21 860:17, 876:15, 838:19, 841:25, harvest [31] - 829:3, 948:23, 953:11 842:1, 842:14, 834:21, 835:18, guided [1] - 826:12 842:20, 843:10, 840:7, 840:18, Gulf [6] - 910:25, 844:2, 844:10, 843:8, 844:16, 949:16, 989:17, 844:12, 844:13, 845:14, 846:1, 1004:19, 1024:21, 1029:6 844:14, 844:20, 846:8, 851:1, 851:5, 1025:3 THE REPORTING GROUP [3] - 818:23,

851:6, 851:11,

847:21, 848:6, 848:24, 848:25, 849:7, 849:20, 849:23, 850:4, 850:8, 851:9, 851:15, 851:22, 852:11. 852:16. 853:11, 854:5, 854:12, 856:5, 856:9, 858:1, 860:19, 860:22, 860:23, 861:2. 863:11, 865:18, 865:22, 865:24, 869:11, 869:19, 869:20, 870:7, 870:15, 870:16, 871:7, 871:9, 881:8, 887:24, 890:14, 892:22, 900:22, 900:23, 915:5, 915:19, 915:21, 917:10, 917:15, 926:25, 942:16, 942:18, 956:19, 957:2, 957:22, 957:23, 957:24, 959:21, 959:22, 959:23, 959:24, 960:1, 960:4, 960:5, 960:6, 960:11, 960:23, 961:2, 961:4, 961:14, 962:17, 962:23, 962:24, 963:14, 967:5, 972:25, 974:8, 976:16, 976:24, 977:8, 977:11, 978:16, 983:2, 983:16, 983:18, 986:15, 988:2, 990:19, 990:24, 991:8, 993:1, 993:6, 996:1, 1006:21, 1012:17, 1016:16, 1017:18, 1017:22, 1020:4, 1020:22 harvests [1] - 957:25 hash [7] - 893:2, 893:3, 893:9, 893:11, 893:15, 893:18, 920:21 hauling [1] - 865:25 heading [8] - 828:6, 931:23, 992:8, 1003:24, 1004:10, 1006:22, 1007:4,

819:5, 878:17 health [8] - 837:17, 837:20, 838:21, 838:24, 840:15, 872:12, 924:4, 924:18 **healthier** [1] - 924:7 healthy [12] - 840:16, 840:17, 840:18, 841:4, 898:22, 907:4, 918:11, 918:13, 926:24, 927:21, 937:13 hear [2] - 960:14, 986:21 heard [6] - 887:16, 887:18, 888:2, 893:18, 928:6, 1023:10 **HEARING** [1] - 814:10 hearing [1] - 885:8 heavily [1] - 884:25 heavy [1] - 1008:12 heck [1] - 1026:6 height [1] - 988:19 Heil [6] - 949:2, 949:3, 949:5, 949:11, 950:2, 951:7 held [2] - 814:11, 989:19 help [7] - 823:14, 824:7, 827:3, 862:2, 878:15, 963:23, 970:16 helped [1] - 879:23 helper [1] - 819:11 hereby [1] - 1031:3 high [43] - 825:23, 827:5, 827:12, 830:14, 831:22, 839:2, 851:7, 870:2, 918:8, 918:10, 924:5. 929:4. 959:21, 972:12, 977:4, 977:14, 978:13, 979:14, 979:18, 981:24, 983:14. 985:25. 988:22, 991:20, 998:4, 998:12, 998:13, 998:14, 999:14, 1002:21, 1003:6, 1005:8, 1005:13, 1005:17, 1005:25, 1007:15, 1009:24, 1011:19, 1012:15, 1013:5 higher [4] - 831:13, 945:2, 1005:7, 1013:22

**Gully** [4] - 927:6,

highest [12] - 929:1, 942:18. 956:8. 957:15, 974:1, 977:5, 977:6, 1023:19, 1023:22, 1025:5 highlight [4] - 994:20, 997:3, 999:9, 1002:11 highlighted [1] -866:12 highly [1] - 1008:17 hired [1] - 967:19 historically [1] - 822:7 history [1] - 1012:11 hold [3] - 818:24, 873:5, 1011:6 Hole [35] - 821:16, 822:5, 823:1, 823:6, 829:8, 829:17, 848:24, 890:7, 890:10, 891:2, 892:17, 900:4, 900:21, 901:3, 901:4. 931:23. 932:3, 932:12, 933:1, 933:16, 933:21, 935:22, 936:12, 936:17, 958:23, 959:11, 973:5, 980:3, 983:3, 996:10, 1008:24, 1014:23, 1017:7, 1027:12, 1027:21 homes [1] - 894:6 Honor [36] - 816:6, 819:20, 865:7, 875:3, 878:3, 885:21, 886:4, 886:20, 887:3, 895:21, 904:23, 905:25, 906:4, 913:22, 939:5, 940:4, 954:9, 954:12, 954:17, 955:5, 967:25, 968:5, 969:13, 969:18, 971:24, 978:17, 1010:16, 1017:11, 1023:25, 1025:12, 1025:18, 1025:20, 1025:22, 1029:21, 1029:22, 1030:12 Horizon [2] - 860:5, 1024:21 Hotel [4] - 917:3, 917:4, 973:11, 1009:2 hotel [1] - 917:5

hour [1] - 1030:5 hundreds [2] - 885:12, 1006:3 Hurricane [6] - 884:5, 885:14, 887:21, 909:17, 946:15, 963:11 hurricane [1] - 884:6 hurricanes [1] -910:21 hypothetical [3] -841:20, 905:24, 906:3

I idea [1] - 955:7 identified [6] - 820:10, 891:1. 891:2. 953:18, 970:25, 977:23 identify [8] - 824:1, 869:3, 889:24, 896:25, 914:4, 968:7 917:7, 920:19, 940:9 identifying [1] -972:22 937:23 ignore [1] - 926:10 ignoring [2] - 863:14, 866:15 III [1] - 888:25 imagine [1] - 890:9 941:1 immobile [2] - 1026:9, 1026:10 impact [13] - 817:15, increased [10] -821:17, 821:22, 831:7, 839:9, 839:10, 870:8, 891:13, 924:17, 971:22, 984:18, 985:15 impacts [1] - 830:24 963:12 impaired [1] - 908:17 impairment [3] -997:15 852:5, 867:24, 868:12 Implementation [1] -1028:21 implemented [2] -1027:7 964:24, 965:1 importance [2] -958:19, 977:22 important [11] - 821:9, 1024:17 839:15, 875:15, 883:18, 908:19, 1022:15 908:22, 908:23, 908:24, 909:8, 916:9, 938:17 imposed [1] - 853:23

impossible [2] -

904:9, 904:19 902:2, 902:12, 903:15, 903:21, improper [2] - 821:6, 968:25, 1016:6 886:2 improved [2] - 1013:5, individuals [1] -1013:8 989:12 indulge [2] - 969:23, improving [1] - 924:6 IN [1] - 1031:10 977:20 inaccurate [4] industry [7] - 850:15, 873:24, 874:3, 851:20, 851:23, 857:18, 875:8, 911:10, 933:8 923:7, 923:11 inappropriate [1] -905:20 inevitable [5] -831:10, 976:24, inch [1] - 921:2 977:2, 983:6, inches [5] - 835:7, 1014:11 835:8, 843:18, 983:20, 984:13 inevitably [1] - 861:4 include [10] - 819:7, 975:9, 1001:12, 830:4, 835:8, 835:9, 1010:2 859:10, 911:3, 958:23, 1003:10, influenced [1] -1001:17 1005:3, 1005:21 influences [2] included [4] - 820:11, 828:11, 828:18 886:11, 964:23, information [18] -852:8. 853:7. includes [2] - 972:21, 853:19, 855:18, 855:21, 856:23, including [7] - 975:18, 857:14, 857:19, 980:8, 988:19, 1000:23, 1003:4, 859:9, 877:2, 906:13, 933:8, 1013:18, 1013:19 986:17, 1006:16, inconsistent [1] -1024:9, 1028:17 increase [3] - 828:25, 830:20, 1025:1 initial [1] - 932:11 828:14, 828:17, inner [2] - 975:22, 844:13, 844:25, 1000:1 984:5, 987:25, 988:20, 992:24, Input [3] - 859:19, 958:11, 1029:7 1003:5, 1027:7 input [3] - 971:2, indeed [2] - 889:25, 1006:6, 1013:6 inside [1] - 981:5 index [2] - 850:7, 833:20, 898:12, **INDEX** [1] - 815:1 indicate [6] - 831:5, 956:2 945:7, 952:14, 979:12, 1020:24, instructing [1] -823:15 indicated [6] - 817:4, intact [1] - 981:11 844:9, 849:16, intend [1] - 820:11 940:23, 956:13, intended [2] - 875:9, 985:12 indicates [2] - 979:14, intense [12] - 821:19, 832:6, 833:5, indicating [1] - 985:6 847:21, 957:21, indicator [1] - 946:2 983:2, 983:18, indicators [1] - 956:23 984:2, 988:6,

intensely [1] - 981:6 intensive [12] - 827:6, 827:13, 869:19, 870:14, 887:24, 900:22, 956:19, 959:22, 960:1, 976:23, 978:15, 1012:17 interchangeable [1] -835:11 interchangeably [1] -835:16 interesting [1] -950:15 internal [1] - 871:19 internet [1] - 874:25 influence [4] - 851:15, interpret [1] - 881:20 interpretation [3] -845:12, 851:4, 882:17 interpreting [1] -850:13 interrupted [1] - 936:4 interruption [1] -936:6 Intracoastal [5] -973:10, 976:7, 976:9, 1000:7, 1027:25 intro [1] - 941:8 introduce [2] -1018:15, 1023:10, 1025:15, 1025:18 introduced [1] - 964:3 **informative** [1] - 919:9 introduction [1] informed [1] - 1025:25 846:20 invited [2] - 872:8, 1024:3 involve [2] - 818:13, 907:23 involved [6] - 904:12, 909:3, 912:22, 974:18. 983:16. 1025:24 instance [4] - 823:16, involves [1] - 976:13 inward [1] - 983:8 isolated [6] - 821:15, instances [1] - 991:12 902:7, 902:16, 902:19, 983:10, 984:3 issue [7] - 845:24, 875:16, 891:10, 891:23, 892:12, 971:2, 978:16 issued [1] - 942:10 issues [1] - 906:7 it" [1] - 1023:1 item [3] - 895:13, 910:18, 911:24 990:23, 999:13, itself [2] - 895:12, THE REPORTING GROUP:16 957:9

indices [1] - 852:3

IV [1] - 814:5 859:18, 866:7, 993:18 large [16] - 822:10, learners [1] - 816:4 958:4, 958:7, 987:8, lack [5] - 890:13, 894:20. 908:9. lease [11] - 975:20, 892:21, 970:8, 909:12, 910:6, 989:20, 990:10, 992:20, 1029:1 **JX-50** [2] - 815:9, 970:25, 989:2 912:18, 923:7, 990:11, 990:13, James [2] - 917:23, 846:15 lag [2] - 1018:19, 926:23, 932:14, 990:14, 990:15 917:24 JX-52 [3] - 815:9, 1021:16 954:23, 976:1, leased [5] - 989:8, **JAMIE** [1] - 814:17 991:12, 1015:2, 989:11, 991:1, 914:3, 1009:9 laid [1] - 988:12 January [10] - 900:4, 1015:4, 1016:12, JX-60 [2] - 815:10, LANCASTER [46] -991:5, 991:6 900:16, 948:10, 993:11 814:11, 816:2, 1025:1 leaseholder [1] -951:13, 951:21, **JX-74** [2] - 815:10, 819:23, 820:4, large-scale [1] -923:7 951:25, 952:4, 909:12 867:8 859:24, 878:5, leaseholders [2] -952:8, 953:14, larger [5] - 897:6, **JX-75** [3] - 815:11, 878:11, 886:7, 989:22, 991:7 1018:3 868:20, 1006:10 887:1, 892:4, 898:15, 902:5, leases [8] - 925:23, jetties [2] - 976:6, **JX-77** [4] - 815:11, 905:12, 906:1, 984:17, 984:23 926:6, 975:19, 976:8 816:12, 941:10, 906:5, 913:20, largest [1] - 1023:19 989:25, 990:16, job [5] - 857:7, 875:23, 913:23, 939:7, larvae [7] - 825:2, 995:20 990:18, 991:14, 911:17, 916:2, 939:13, 939:22, 825:9, 825:11, **JX-78** [7] - 815:12, 1006:3 1025:9 939:24, 940:5, 826:10, 826:15, least [12] - 841:13, 948:22, 1017:8, iobs [2] - 983:15, 955:10, 968:4, 902:21, 902:22 871:16, 892:11, 1017:13, 1019:18, 1025:10 969:19, 972:1, 1020:2, 1024:8 larval [4] - 824:22, 895:12, 912:10, **Joe** [6] - 879:9, 972:7, 972:14, 825:3, 825:5, 826:10 912:13, 961:12, 888:25, 889:3, K 978:19, 990:6, last [46] - 820:12, 962:17, 963:20, 933:5, 933:7, 950:12 990:8, 1010:9, 822:25, 830:10, 1012:10, 1013:25, Kal [2] - 884:12, 886:9 **John** [1] - 879:8 1010:19, 1011:2, 832:1, 832:11, 1025:25 Joint [5] - 914:3, Kate [2] - 909:18, 1011:5, 1024:2, 832:16, 846:2, leave [3] - 919:7, 922:11, 922:14, 946:15 1025:19, 1025:23, 846:5, 846:21, 962:8, 1024:4 948:22, 1029:1 keep [7] - 844:10, 1026:5, 1026:15, 849:8. 851:7. leaving [2] - 858:5, 851:25, 882:8, joint [3] - 846:14, 1027:5, 1028:3, 851:13, 863:8, 961:24 867:8, 868:20 905:16, 916:18, 1028:13, 1028:19, 867:18, 870:6, **leeway** [1] - 885:23 957:3, 972:15 JOSH [1] - 814:21 1028:23, 1029:4, 871:4, 911:5, 912:6, left [12] - 816:11, keeping [1] - 960:17 **JOSHUA** [1] - 814:23 1029:16, 1029:23 912:7. 917:25. 880:19, 899:10, kidding [1] - 897:13 judge [4] - 866:10, land [1] - 896:16 925:9, 933:25, 912:15, 912:17, 905:3, 939:15, killed [1] - 979:10 landed [7] - 896:6, 935:2, 938:20, 912:24, 918:21, 954:15 Kimbro [3] - 891:19, 897:15, 897:19, 941:5, 950:24, 919:3, 951:12, 891:21, 940:10 judgment [1] - 883:1 897:23, 952:21, 969:3, 976:4, 962:19, 965:13, July [11] - 817:4, Kimbro's [3] - 900:5, 952:22, 1023:20 977:24, 994:10, 1013:7 859:19, 861:10, 940:13, 940:19 landing [2] - 1017:21, 994:18, 996:9, left-hand [1] - 880:19 kind [9] - 852:15, 871:18, 890:2, 1018:17 1001:12, 1003:16, legal [42] - 819:13, 915:12, 929:22, 864:4, 880:10, landings [33] - 828:13, 1004:13, 1006:14, 831:6, 834:16, 949:22, 974:23, 888:17, 902:12, 941:7, 941:19, 1007:4, 1007:12, 834:18, 834:20, 982:4, 1016:20 903:15, 965:18, 1007:13, 1013:4, 942:22, 942:24, 835:4, 835:9, June [4] - 949:20, 986:22, 1027:22 943:7, 944:15, 1017:9, 1017:12, 835:12, 835:13, 1019:23, 1020:8, **kinds** [1] - 884:18 945:25, 946:3, 1018:25, 1020:2, 836:10, 836:13, 1031:17 Knickerbocker [6] -946:4, 946:7, 1020:25, 1027:20 836:17, 838:5, juvenile [19] - 819:7, 884:13, 884:15, 946:10, 947:16, lastly [1] - 1007:12 838:15, 838:16, 827:7, 831:6, 835:9, 886:9, 966:6, 966:9, 949:15, 949:17, late [4] - 834:5, 918:4, 839:17, 839:19, 835:10, 838:22, 966:15 949:18, 950:17, 982:5, 1016:6 842:14, 844:14, 839:17, 840:14, Knickerbocker's [1] -950:21, 951:7, lawsuit [2] - 862:11, 844:17, 845:2, 841:17, 843:20, 952:17, 954:18, 886:15 862:17 845:15, 848:1, 844:19, 845:3, knocked [1] - 884:25 955:14, 956:1, lawyers [1] - 862:14 848:5, 848:6, 856:6, 848:1, 870:10, knowledge [3] -956:7, 956:8, lay [1] - 852:22 860:23, 870:10, 920:21, 921:4, 852:13, 854:19, 956:24, 957:8, 870:16, 871:5, layered [1] - 890:17 921:11, 1005:19, 1013:8 977:3, 1018:14, layman's [1] - 826:2 871:7, 871:9, 1012:20 1019:21, 1022:13, knowledgeable [3] -876:23, 900:22, lead [1] - 867:22 juveniles [4] - 835:14, 1024:8 852:14, 852:20, 960:23, 961:1, leading [2] - 978:18, 845:15, 881:3, 905:18 lands [3] - 897:14, 999:19 961:4, 984:24, 935:12 known [1] - 907:19 989:12, 989:18 leads [1] - 986:11 985:14, 1023:14 **JX** [1] - 859:13 language [4] - 987:14, lean [1] - 962:13 legal-size [7] - 819:13, **JX-150** [11] - 815:12, 992:19, 1003:8, 834:16, 838:5, learn [1] - 816:4 859:13, 859:16, 844:17, 848:5,

labeled [2] - 990:1

THE REPORTING GROUP d [1] - 1026:25

longest [1] - 1001:14

856:6, 871:5 legals [2] - 850:20, 850:21 legislative [2] -910:17, 911:3 legislatively [2] -854:22, 854:25 Leslie [1] - 950:12 less [30] - 817:15, 817:22, 829:12, 830:13, 830:17, 831:20, 835:7, 835:8, 843:6, 843:13, 856:14, 861:6, 869:20, 869:25, 884:22, 891:9, 891:12, 921:25, 946:4, 946:9, 948:1, 981:10, 984:13, 987:24, 988:18, 992:23, 1002:8, 1002:19, 1006:16, 1013:14 letter [4] - 816:13, 820:1, 820:2, 877:22 level [7] - 821:22, 839:23, 885:17, 957:2, 957:23, 959:21, 964:12 levels [8] - 849:23, 850:4, 851:9, 851:22, 908:17, 994:25, 999:14 liberty [1] - 969:14 licenses [3] - 942:9, 942:16, 942:19 lick [1] - 917:19 life [12] - 824:3, 826:9, 826:25, 839:14, 907:25, 979:20, 996:23, 1005:18, 1005:22, 1005:24, 1006:1, 1026:14 lifeblood [1] - 1008:14 lifelong [1] - 917:18 lift [1] - 899:1 Lighthouse [1] -1009:2 likely [5] - 902:24, 943:8, 946:9, 998:3, 999:12 limit [7] - 835:1, 843:18, 844:17, 856:6, 860:24, 985:5, 985:7 limitations [1] -906:11 limits [17] - 834:20, 843:7, 843:14,

852:10, 852:15, 853:15, 853:23, 854:7, 856:15, 856:24, 861:7, 871:9, 947:6, 947:7, 1023:9, 1023:11 line [9] - 866:24. 903:11, 910:2, 910:18, 911:23, 915:7, 944:5, 966:1 lines [2] - 816:22, 903:7 Lipcius [3] - 879:23, 880:8, 897:11 list [6] - 872:22, 942:9, 954:16, 954:20, 1000:2, 1029:25 listed [3] - 942:19, 954:16, 991:16 listen [1] - 872:8 listened [1] - 971:10 listening [1] - 937:3 litigation [1] - 862:6 live [20] - 826:24, 839:5, 882:16, 882:20, 894:5, 894:8, 894:20, 898:19, 899:22, 924:5, 943:3, 952:13, 975:23, 980:22, 997:7, 997:11, 997:13, 1016:17, 1017:6, 1026:13 living [17] - 823:21, 824:3, 825:8, 827:17, 827:19, 827:24, 878:23, 879:16, 882:6, 882:25, 916:11, 916:14, 916:16, 937:9, 983:10, 1016:7, 1028:12 **local** [2] - 819:18, 853:2 locate [1] - 940:17 located [8] - 926:7, 989:25, 991:20, 998:24, 998:25, 999:2, 1000:4, 1001:18 location [4] - 817:20, 927:9, 998:13, 1001:25 locations [2] - 924:23, 990:16 long-handled [1] -

818:25

long-term [2] -

867:24, 868:12

look [61] - 816:20, 821:12, 821:15, 828:8, 831:2, 831:4, 837:23, 839:21, 845:11, 846:11, 846:19, 847:20, 857:12, 857:25, 859:11, 859:16, 861:18, 865:2, 867:12, 867:18, 869:2, 877:21, 879:10, 880:10, 883:23, 886:24, 888:4, 888:10, 890:3, 894:16, 895:13, 914:17, 922:5, 923:13, 923:18, 927:20, 931:18, 934:11, 948:23, 950:13, 951:10, 953:3, 953:10, 953:12, 976:5, 980:14, 980:18, 981:2, 981:5, 981:9, 991:22, 996:21, 1018:24, 1019:2, 1019:10, 1019:11, 1019:12, 1019:20, 1020:1, 1020:12, 1021:20 looked [27] - 855:25, 871:20, 884:4, 884:20, 887:21, 892:17, 895:1, 901:12, 907:3, 907:4, 922:24, 926:24, 929:7, 929:8, 937:11, 975:11, 981:19, 982:3, 982:5, 982:12, 985:4, 992:20, 1017:16, 1021:3, 1021:8, 1022:11, 1027:24 looking [33] - 816:12, 822:24, 841:2, 850:22, 851:17, 878:21, 881:21, 881:22, 881:23, 885:1, 887:6, 887:17, 898:23, 907:1, 909:4, 913:18, 915:15, 916:10, 917:14, 918:5, 919:15, 921:13, 928:23, 935:23, 942:16,

1006:14, 1017:12, 1021:19, 1024:8 looks [13] - 879:19, 880:1, 895:22, 897:4, 899:21, 900:12, 907:8, 919:12, 919:22, 923:2, 933:5, 952:14, 956:5 lose [15] - 842:15, 848:8, 856:17, 857:20, 858:1, 858:24, 861:8, 961:14, 961:17, 962:2, 962:4, 962:13, 1016:19, 1022:23, 1023:1 losing [3] - 858:7, 961:19, 985:23 loss [4] - 817:12, 842:22, 863:16, 866:17 lost [6] - 824:8, 856:12, 861:5, 875:14, 938:16, 962:1 love [1] - 846:4 low [10] - 827:25, 830:13, 831:21, 839:23, 854:10, 870:1. 915:16. 956:3, 1011:19, 1013:6 **Lower** [1] - 1006:23 lower [1] - 828:1 lowering [1] - 1012:4 luckily [1] - 954:2 lucky [1] - 1024:22 **Lump** [1] - 1009:1 Lumps [4] - 998:22, 999:2, 1000:24, 1001:4 lunch [1] - 939:6

## M

macro [1] - 902:8 madam [1] - 856:3 magnitude [1] - 978:9 MAHONEY [1] -814:21 mail [9] - 888:24, 889:24, 945:15, 945:19, 948:16, 949:1, 950:3, 950:10, 953:19 mailing [2] - 949:11, 950:12 mails [2] - 888:17, main [2] - 907:15, 973:24 Maine [3] - 814:13, 814:15, 1031:3 maintaining [1] -908:20 major [12] - 838:13, 884:4, 891:15, 891:16, 892:12, 971:1, 979:24, 988:2, 993:2, 1012:12, 1012:18, 1012:21 majority [1] - 870:15 male [2] - 825:1, 984:23 males [1] - 824:24 man [1] - 917:16 manage [3] - 1016:1, 1016:6, 1016:9 Managed [2] - 931:23, 932:3 managed [11] - 830:7, 932:6. 934:25. 938:1, 1012:5, 1012:9, 1015:5, 1015:7, 1015:9, 1015:11, 1026:16 Management [1] -950:6 management [27] -832:3, 832:20, 842:19, 855:2, 855:3, 855:4, 877:14, 877:16, 877:17, 877:19, 908:5, 908:20, 908:25, 909:2, 911:17, 913:15, 922:19, 938:24, 962:25, 963:6, 963:22, 964:21, 964:22, 1017:2, 1017:4, 1019:9 manager [8] - 852:20, 854:21, 855:4, 855:12, 855:19, 857:22, 870:25 managers [2] -857:23, 890:22 manages [1] - 854:21 manner [1] - 901:11 map [9] - 968:1, 968:6, 968:7, 971:17, 971:20, 989:7, 989:24, 1001:11, 1014:17 March [1] - 953:10 marginally [1] -828:14

THE REPORTING GROUP 15

4005 40 4005 00
1025:19, 1025:23,
1026:5, 1026:15,
1027:5, 1028:3,
1028:13, 1028:19,
1028:23, 1029:4,
1029:16, 1029:23
Master [8] - 837:5,
971:16, 972:6,
977:18, 990:2,
991:15, 991:17,
1001:2
material [5] - 819:12,
819:15, 897:16,
922:3, 981:22
materials [2] - 885:19,
908:10
math [1] - 955:16
matrix [1] - 867:25
matter [8] - 814:10,
835:13, 858:25,
880:10, 904:8,
919:17, 939:19,
985:3
mean [36] - 817:18,
826:8, 829:16,
830:20, 834:9,
836:24, 841:21,
863:2, 864:1,
873:21, 874:12,
876:5, 876:11,
882:22, 902:4,
911:15, 912:9,
916:1, 916:2, 918:4,
926:15, 952:15,
955:22, 960:16,
961:24, 963:24,
984:5, 984:15,
986:12, 986:17,
997:9, 998:8,
999:17, 1008:15,
1016:7, 1019:9
meaning [2] - 822:9,
829:2
means [14] - 817:14,
823:19, 824:19,
837:4, 849:6,
859:13, 915:16,
915:21, 916:5,
918:5, 944:24,
961:17, 962:2,
1019:25
meant [7] - 817:10,
836:21, 865:23,
884:17, 936:2,
947:23, 962:4
measured [2] -
828:16, 942:2
measuring [1] - 961:9
mousumg [i] - 301.9

meat [5] - 924:6,

942:3, 942:4, 94

THE

945:1	1014:19
meats [2] - 981:5,	might [20] - 818:13
982:14	829:19, 835:8,
media [1] - 1024:25	835:9, 839:24,
meet [2] - 853:3, 931:1	850:18, 850:19,
meeting [19] - 851:18,	850:20, 850:21,
872:3, 872:7,	875:2, 889:10,
872:25, 873:5,	918:7, 919:18,
873:7, 873:12,	952:15, 961:19,
873:14, 874:5,	961:22, 983:12,
874:19, 930:5,	984:18
930:18, 934:2,	<b>mike</b> [1] - 885:7
968:16, 968:22,	Mile [3] - 1000:8,
969:15, 970:11,	1000:9, 1000:10
977:25	<b>mile</b> [2] - 1000:9,
meetings [1] - 876:3	1000:10
member [2] - 819:12,	<b>miles</b> [2] - 902:21,
889:4	1000:7
members [3] - 857:15,	Miles [5] - 1000:2,
872:7, 934:6	1000:3, 1000:5,
memory [4] - 970:17,	1000:6, 1000:13
1004:24, 1009:13,	<b>million</b> [1] - 956:4
1009:15	mind [10] - 822:24
<b>Menippe</b> [1] - 980:2	824:13, 874:23,
mention [2] - 871:24,	881:19, 888:10,
872:2	913:18, 941:9,
mentioned [6] -	945:10, 948:18,
821:18, 826:4,	965:20
833:6, 872:20,	mine [1] - 1029:10
909:16, 989:5	minimal [2] - 891:
mercenaria [1] - 980:2	924:13
mesh [7] - 896:23,	minimis [1] - 891:
897:1, 897:6,	minor [1] - 938:15
897:17, 898:15,	Minor [1] - 922:15
899:12, 899:13	minute [1] - 968:1
met [2] - 854:17,	minutes [1] - 939::
902:25	missing [1] - 873:
meter [3] - 839:22,	misstatement [1]
894:23, 895:24	873:17
method [1] - 989:15	model [1] - 904:17
methodology [2] - 895:5, 914:12	modeler [1] - 906:
methods [2] - 875:21,	<b>modeling</b> [3] - 906 906:12, 906:21
938:10	
micro [1] - 902:8	moderate [1] - 992
microcurrents [1] -	moment [2] - 836: 837:6
882:7	
microphone [1] -	moments [1] - 996 Monday [1] - 1030
880:14	money [7] - 846:7,
microscopic [1] -	911:3, 911:9,
825:19	911:20, 911:22,
mid-'80's [1] - 909:14	986:15, 1025:11
mid-2012 [1] - 890:2	moneys [2] - 912:2
middle [14] - 828:5,	913:1
848:17, 860:3,	monitored [1] -
888:25, 906:16,	946:11
926:19, 941:17,	monitoring [1] -
949:1, 993:20,	945:21
994:14, 996:23,	month [14] - 840:2
	ROUP :3, 845:14,
Í	,,

1014:19 might [20] - 818:13, 829:19, 835:8, 835:9, 839:24, 850:18, 850:19, 850:20, 850:21, 875:2, 889:10, 918:7, 919:18, 952:15, 961:19, 961:22, 983:12, 984:18 mike [1] - 885:7 Mile [3] - 1000:8, 1000:9, 1000:10 mile [2] - 1000:9, 1000:10 miles [2] - 902:21, 1000:7 Miles [5] - 1000:2, 1000:3, 1000:5, 1000:6, 1000:13 million [1] - 956:4 mind [10] - 822:24, 824:13, 874:23, 881:19, 888:10, 913:18, 941:9, 945:10, 948:18, 965:20 mine [1] - 1029:10 minimal [2] - 891:12, 924:13 minimis [1] - 891:13 minor [1] - 938:15 Minor [1] - 922:15 minute [1] - 968:1 minutes [1] - 939:20 missing [1] - 873:11 misstatement [1] -873:17 model [1] - 904:17 modeler [1] - 906:10 modeling [3] - 906:10, 906:12, 906:21 moderate [1] - 992:14 moment [2] - 836:20, 837:6 moments [1] - 996:4 **Monday** [1] - 1030:15 money [7] - 846:7, 911:3, 911:9, 911:20, 911:22, 986:15, 1025:11 moneys [2] - 912:25, 913:1 monitored [1] -946:11 monitoring [1] -945:21 month [14] - 840:22,

847:6, 867:3, 950:17, 950:20, 951:6, 951:11, 952:24, 953:14, 1006:13, 1018:4, 1018:5 monthly [2] - 949:18, 949:19 months [21] - 833:12, 833:13, 833:16, 833:17, 835:13, 839:6, 839:7, 839:8, 845:16, 846:1, 850:25, 851:8, 851:11, 929:9, 953:13, 953:16, 953:24, 960:7, 984:22, 986:7, 1018:5 morning [5] - 816:6, 816:9, 816:10, 841:14, 890:7 mortalities [6] -841:21, 925:2, 925:25, 993:21, 994:2, 1019:4 Mortality [3] -1003:19, 1003:24, 1004:10 mortality [34] -817:13, 827:5. 828:12, 828:19, 830:14, 830:20, 831:21, 839:1, 870:1, 879:1, 882:3, 882:10, 883:22, 915:16, 924:14, 925:12, 926:2, 926:22, 927:20, 935:13, 961:22, 975:13, 978:9, 979:2, 988:1, 988:21, 991:6, 991:10, 992:25, 998:15, 1000:17, 1003:5, 1016:19, 1027:18 most [48] - 817:5, 822:9, 824:20, 824:23, 825:7, 830:12, 830:21, 831:14, 831:19, 834:4, 838:12, 839:5, 852:13, 852:19, 869:24, 875:15, 879:3, 885:17, 889:19, 902:24, 905:18, 908:5, 908:16, 912:2, 916:9, 929:4,

934:25, 937:3, 937:12, 938:17, 947:18, 949:21, 957:12, 963:2, 963:3, 973:4, 973:20, 979:5, 979:21. 984:23. 998:10, 1004:18, 1008:8, 1013:17, 1026:12, 1026:21, 1029:14 mostly [1] - 915:17 mouth [1] - 1001:19 mouths [1] - 973:21 move [11] - 826:23, 839:20, 859:3, 867:1, 878:2, 878:6, 880:13, 885:7, 902:21, 1001:20, 1009:14 moved [5] - 838:1, 976:15, 986:9, 1005:11 movement [4] -885:19, 975:25, 981:25, 999:21 moves [1] - 973:19 moving [3] - 826:11, 985:10, 1004:25 MR [100] - 816:6, 816:8, 819:19, 819:25, 820:5, 820:8, 859:22, 859:25, 860:1, 865:7, 865:10, 866:9, 866:11, 867:7, 867:9, 867:14, 867:16, 868:19, 868:21, 871:25, 872:1, 874:20, 874:22, 875:2, 875:5, 878:2, 878:12, 880:4, 880:6, 881:15, 881:17, 886:4, 886:8, 887:3, 887:4, 888:13, 888:15, 892:5, 892:7, 892:25, 893:1, 895:15, 895:21, 895:23, 896:13, 896:15, 898:4, 898:6, 898:8, 899:5, 899:7, 899:25, 900:2, 905:3, 905:14, 905:15, 913:22, 913:24, 914:1, 921:16, 921:18, 930:13,

930:15, 934:11,

934:14, 935:17, 935:20, 936:19, 936:22, 937:18, 937:21, 939:5, 939:15, 939:23, 940:4, 940:7, 940:18. 944:13. 954:8, 954:15, 955:12, 958:4, 958:6, 971:24, 972:4, 972:8, 978:17, 990:17, 1013:12, 1014:17, 1014:21, 1017:8, 1019:17, 1019:19, 1020:25, 1021:2, 1023:24, 1025:21, 1029:21, 1030:12 MS [54] - 881:10, 885:21, 886:20, 892:1, 904:23, 905:23, 906:2, 921:13, 933:15, 939:11, 954:12, 955:5, 967:25, 968:5, 968:12, 969:13, 969:20, 969:22, 970:2, 970:5, 970:18, 970:21, 971:6, 971:9, 972:5, 978:2, 978:4, 978:20, 987:19, 987:21, 993:22, 993:24, 994:18, 994:22, 996:22, 997:1, 997:3, 997:5, 999:7, 999:11, 1010:5, 1010:16, 1010:21, 1010:23, 1011:4, 1011:11, 1023:25, 1024:3, 1024:6, 1024:13, 1024:16, 1025:12, 1025:20, 1029:22 multiple [1] - 1022:18 must [1] - 952:12 Ν

name [1] - 862:22 named [1] - 1031:9 names [1] - 971:19 **NATALIE** [1] - 814:19 Natalie [1] - 1025:16 natural [20] - 827:5, 828:11, 828:19, 830:14, 831:21, 839:1, 870:1, 883:21, 885:10, THE REPORTING GROUP 7, 1000:9 932:5, 938:3,

961:21, 979:2, 987:25, 988:20, 992:25, 998:15, 1000:17, 1003:5, 1016:19 Natural [3] - 1003:19, 1003:24, 1004:10 nature [1] - 1006:17 near [1] - 925:4 necessarily [2] -893:11, 902:23 need [10] - 846:7, 907:25, 928:24, 938:5, 938:12, 945:18, 964:5, 964:9, 971:1, 1008:20 needed [2] - 1008:14, 1008:18 needs [1] - 933:15 negative [4] - 985:8, 988:16, 1003:1, 1021:23 neighborhood [1] -910:8 never [16] - 834:1, 841:25, 877:25, 906:13, 906:18, 943:14, 959:14, 962:11, 962:16, 962:19, 962:22, 962:24, 986:19, 1008:14, 1008:17 new [9] - 863:12, 866:13, 878:3, 924:4, 927:20, 928:2, 928:4, 969:21, 973:8 next [31] - 827:1, 829:6, 830:10, 831:25, 833:4, 834:11, 836:9, 842:12, 844:4, 850:25, 855:23, 858:3, 867:3, 870:6, 896:9, 898:7, 899:5, 899:25, 927:5, 932:16, 932:20, 937:18, 942:13, 950:23, 996:14, 998:16, 1002:24, 1004:17, 1016:16, 1016:23, 1018:4 nice [1] - 897:4 nine [9] - 833:16, 833:17, 845:14, 850:25, 851:8, 851:11, 929:9,

845:14 nobody [2] - 816:3, 971:18 none [2] - 852:24, 964:24 nonproductive [1] -989:13 normal [14] - 829:22, 833:9, 876:12, 878:24, 934:23, 934:24, 935:11, 935:13, 946:7, 979:17, 980:7, 997:10, 1015:21, 1015:24 normally [2] - 831:12, 884:18 Norman's [1] - 1009:1 **north** [2] - 973:6, 985:19 North [10] - 926:12, 926:20, 974:21, 975:3, 998:21, 998:25, 1000:23, 1001:4, 1009:3, 1027:11 **northern** [2] - 974:7, 1001:10 northwestern [1] -1000:21 Notary [2] - 814:15, 1031:2 notch [1] - 950:3 note [8] - 835:17, 875:20, 885:23, 886:2, 916:22, 954:13, 1019:21, 1027:23 Noted [7] - 878:8, 878:10, 940:1, 940:3, 1011:8, 1011:10, 1030:14 noted [3] - 925:10, 961:1, 979:13 notes [15] - 859:8, 861:9, 863:19, 864:15, 864:19, 871:18, 916:23, 958:12, 958:22, 964:21, 987:9, 987:10, 1029:6, 1029:13, 1031:5 nothing [9] - 899:19, 974:12, 976:18, 977:12, 1009:21, 1011:24, 1012:3, 1029:21, 1029:22 notice [1] - 882:9 noticeable [2] -

noticed [1] - 981:16 noticing [2] - 995:6, 1005:7 noting [3] - 868:11, 903:9, 934:20 November [9] -814:13, 852:17, 975:11, 976:4, 979:6, 982:6, 1027:22, 1030:16, 1031:11 Number [1] - 815:8 number [30] - 817:16, 831:9, 837:21, 838:2, 839:21, 845:22, 849:21, 849:24, 850:18, 853:10, 861:21, 861:22, 874:7, 923:7, 942:6, 942:9, 942:18, 952:16, 952:17, 954:23, 957:25, 965:25, 976:1, 978:14, 1005:13, 1021:1, 1024:13, 1024:14, 1024:15 numbered [2] -862:23, 917:2 **numbering** [1] - 869:4 numbers [17] -825:23, 831:3, 831:8, 844:19, 845:3, 850:23, 850:24, 924:5, 943:1, 944:24, 954:20, 957:19, 960:2, 965:15, 979:16, 1024:12, 1024:18 numerous [6] -834:19, 856:4, 857:13, 858:23, 860:22, 871:8 0 oath [1] - 948:11 object [2] - 892:1, 904:23

**objection** [3] - 886:3, 966:13, 978:17 objectionable [1] -906:17 obscured [1] - 885:19 observation [3] -817:2, 835:24, 1013:4 observations [15] -834:20, 835:17, 835:25, 836:5,

953:24, 960:7

856:6, 860:24,	960:21, 962:11	1017:11, 1018:13,	otherwise [4] -	880:25, 881:25,
865:19, 871:10,	often [1] - 908:11	1017:11, 1018:13,	911:15, 928:12,	884:3, 884:9,
929:16, 932:11,	oftentimes [1] -	1024:2, 1026:1,	954:20, 1028:11	891:18, 893:4,
988:10, 988:12,	910:25	1027:23, 1028:16,	ourselves [1] - 846:20	893:16, 894:9,
1002:25, 1003:13,	oil [22] - 829:24,	1028:24, 1030:1	outcome [1] - 1031:8	894:11, 900:4,
1002:25, 1003:15,		ones [9] - 834:4,		900:18, 905:22,
observe [4] - 979:22,	832:5, 832:22,	837:8, 845:15,	outlier [1] - 933:20	908:11, 908:21,
	832:24, 834:22,		outlying [1] - 1015:14	909:19, 909:23,
981:2, 991:5, 991:12	835:19, 842:17,	855:19, 979:24,	outpaces [1] - 949:20	
observed [14] -	843:4, 843:11,	981:4, 1000:25,	overall [11] - 840:1,	910:24, 912:14,
906:24, 924:14,	843:24, 856:8,	1001:3, 1027:20	847:18, 847:25,	915:21, 920:15,
925:6, 925:11,	856:13, 858:10,	ongoing [3] - 817:21,	848:2, 870:11,	920:22, 921:1,
932:13, 975:24,	858:14, 861:1,	965:14, 1028:9	918:2, 923:18,	921:4, 924:6,
977:15, 979:24,	871:12, 928:22,	online [1] - 900:7	924:4, 926:24,	924:15, 924:16,
980:24, 981:16,	937:5, 962:3,	open [4] - 860:9,	927:21, 932:17	924:18, 924:22,
991:6, 1005:15,	962:18, 1023:3,	860:22, 990:18,	Overall [2] - 923:19,	925:1, 930:10,
1011:18, 1012:12	1024:21	990:22	993:18	930:19, 934:7,
<b>observing</b> [2] - 991:2,	<b>old</b> [5] - 839:7, 839:8,	opened [4] - 832:25,	overharvested [1] -	934:17, 934:24,
1006:2	928:2, 928:4, 984:22	860:11, 860:12,	981:7	936:25, 940:11,
obtained [1] - 913:5	once [8] - 823:14,	986:19	overharvesting [9] -	941:19, 946:17,
<b>obvious</b> [3] - 831:10,	826:20, 892:8,	opening [1] - 850:10	830:11, 830:21,	949:15, 957:10,
882:15	896:10, 902:19,	operating [1] - 912:24	831:14, 831:19,	963:11, 966:16,
obviously [2] -	921:4, 938:4	opinion [13] - 820:19,	869:24, 983:2,	970:23, 971:16,
830:17, 905:5	one [87] - 817:24,	839:1, 840:16,	983:18, 988:6,	975:19, 979:25,
occasion [1] - 842:1	818:12, 818:17,	858:25, 881:5,	1023:13	980:13, 980:17,
occasions [2] -	820:9, 827:2,	905:17, 945:2,	overview [2] - 987:17,	983:16, 984:3,
871:17, 961:13	827:22, 828:20,	945:5, 961:4, 961:8,	987:20	984:13, 985:21,
occur [2] - 932:8,	849:10, 849:11,	977:14, 988:10,	own [4] - 853:13,	985:22, 988:20,
1019:4	862:15, 862:18,	988:11	902:1, 911:23,	989:8, 990:16,
occurred [4] - 838:13,	862:19, 863:19,	opportunities [1] -	1008:18	992:4, 992:12,
873:14, 918:4, 986:7	878:20, 880:17,	1025:9	owned [1] - 990:11	992:14, 994:1,
occurring [10] -	880:19, 882:8,	opportunity [1] -	oyster [146] - 816:16,	994:15, 994:21,
830:25, 885:15,	884:11, 884:24,	895:4	817:2, 817:3, 817:5,	995:22, 997:15,
916:4, 925:12,	885:20, 888:4,	opposable [1] -	817:7, 818:6,	998:2, 999:25,
926:25, 961:6,	890:15, 893:13,	818:23	820:17, 822:1,	1003:5, 1004:4,
961:9, 980:21,	897:14, 901:22,	opposed [4] - 906:23,	823:8, 823:9,	1004:17, 1004:18,
984:1, 995:7	902:1, 903:12,	914:11, 914:14,	823:20, 824:2,	1005:1, 1005:9,
occurs [2] - 841:21,	903:24, 904:3,	969:15	824:20, 826:2,	1005:14, 1005:20,
959:22	904:20, 905:18,	opposite [1] - 919:19	826:3, 827:25,	1006:11, 1007:18,
October [19] - 922:15,	907:1, 907:15,	optimal [12] - 829:12,	828:9, 828:13,	1012:5, 1016:22,
922:17, 922:20,	910:17, 910:21,	830:13, 830:17,	828:21, 829:7,	1016:24, 1025:10,
923:21, 926:19,	910:22, 914:4,	831:20, 869:21,	829:8, 834:2,	1027:8
929:23, 931:1,	914:21, 918:14,	869:25, 876:12,	837:17, 837:20,	<b>Oyster</b> [3] - 867:5,
931:8, 931:17,	920:2, 920:4, 920:6,	987:24, 992:24,	838:21, 838:24,	868:24, 967:1
932:8, 932:22,	920:9, 920:10,	1002:9, 1002:19,	839:4, 840:10,	oyster-producing [1] -
932:25, 933:2,	920:11, 922:24,	1013:14	842:18, 843:5,	817:3
975:10, 979:6,	925:22, 926:9,	option [2] - 963:22,	844:6, 844:8,	oystering [1] -
982:6, 992:21,	926:24, 926:25,	963:24	846:22, 848:23,	1013:24
993:15, 994:13	928:20, 931:19,		849:3, 849:16,	oysterman [4] - 883:5,
<b>OF</b> [4] - 814:1, 814:3,	932:12, 939:18,	options [2] - 964:22	849:18, 850:15,	917:17, 917:18,
814:6, 814:9	940:7, 941:13,	order [6] - 860:10,	856:14, 860:5,	920:15
official [21] - 834:15,	955:19, 958:2,	888:18, 930:13,	860:11, 860:13,	oystermen [29] -
	960:18, 961:11,	932:3, 954:10,	865:15, 867:21,	818:14, 818:24,
835:23, 842:23,	965:3, 966:18,	963:16		822:12, 829:2,
848:14, 849:3,	969:3, 969:6, 974:5,	Order [2] - 854:5,	867:22, 867:23, 869:17, 870:8,	834:19, 843:9,
852:7, 856:19,	977:20, 979:3,	962:22		846:6, 856:5,
863:21, 870:24,	983:23, 989:22,	orders [1] - 851:18	871:2, 872:13,	857:15, 857:24,
875:13, 942:24,	991:16, 996:14,	organisms [1] - 980:6	875:8, 876:9,	860:23, 865:21,
944:25, 945:6,	1001:6, 1003:16,	organizational [1] -	876:13, 877:19,	865:25, 871:8,
952:1, 954:18,	1004:18, 1006:20,	853:3	878:15, 879:17,	874:19, 915:24,
955:14, 956:7,	1014:0 1015:1	origin [1] - 1014:4	879:24, 880:11,	917:12, 923:11,
957:8, 959:19,	THI	E REPORTING G	ROUP 5, 880:18,	,,
	IV	• Nason & Lockha	rt	
3 of 85 sheets	IV.		The	e Reporting Group (207) 797-6
				. 5 1 ( - 7

page [74] - 816:19,

834:11, 847:15,

847:17, 848:16,

823:3, 828:3, 828:5,

820:6. 822:23.

040 40 044 40
943:13, 944:19,
946:23, 947:14,
947:20, 966:17,
1004:22, 1015:16,
1015:19, 1025:6,
1028:10
oysters [230] - 817:13,
817:16, 817:19,
817:22, 818:14,
818:15, 818:21,
819:1, 819:3, 819:6,
819:8, 819:13,
821:14, 822:10,
822:11, 823:21,
824:3, 824:23,
825:8, 827:8,
827:19, 831:7,
831:13, 834:16,
834:18, 834:19,
834:22, 835:2,
835:4, 835:5, 835:9,
835:19, 836:6,
836:11, 836:17,
836:22, 836:25,
837:2, 837:6,
837:21, 837:24,
837:25, 838:5,
838:10, 838:16,
838:19, 838:22,
839:5, 839:12,
839:14, 839:17,
839:19, 839:22,
839:24, 840:12,
840:14, 841:6,
841:7, 841:17,
842:2, 842:9,
842:14, 843:20,
844:16, 844:19,
845:4, 848:2, 848:5,
848:6, 850:22,
851:12, 851:23,
856:5, 856:8, 858:3,
860:23, 860:25,
865:17, 870:11,
870:17, 871:6,
871:7, 871:9,
871:11, 876:19,
876:23, 878:24,
880:25, 881:1,
881:5, 881:22,
882:4, 882:10,
882:18, 882:20,
882:23, 883:16,
887:8, 890:11,
892:17, 893:14,
894:5, 894:8,
894:20, 896:7,
898:19, 899:22,
900:11, 900:23,
900:25, 903:25,
907:25, 908:3,

908:8, 908:13, 913:16, 915:16, 915:19, 915:25, 916:5, 916:12, 916:14, 916:16, 917:14, 920:11, 921:11. 923:8. 924:5, 927:23, 927:24, 928:1, 928:9, 928:10, 928:11, 930:1, 932:14, 940:21, 941:23, 942:25, 943:3, 945:3, 950:16, 952:2, 952:9, 952:12, 952:13, 952:20, 952:25, 953:15, 956:9, 956:14, 957:13, 960:9, 961:15, 962:5, 962:7, 963:4, 963:8, 974:10, 974:15, 975:2, 975:18, 975:23, 976:10, 978:7, 978:14, 978:21, 979:8, 980:23, 980:25, 981:2, 981:11, 981:25, 982:3, 982:7, 982:8, 982:11, 982:13, 982:14, 983:20, 984:4, 984:19, 984:23, 984:24, 984:25, 985:11, 985:15, 986:20, 989:13, 989:15, 991:11, 997:8, 997:11, 997:13, 997:16, 997:20, 997:21, 997:22, 998:2, 998:11, 999:12, 999:23, 1012:20, 1015:2, 1015:19, 1015:23, 1016:9, 1016:15, 1016:17, 1016:19, 1017:3, 1017:5, 1017:6, 1019:15, 1020:10, 1023:14, 1023:20, 1026:2, 1026:7, 1026:9

**p.m** [5] - 940:1, 940:3, 1011:8, 1011:10, 1030:14

pace [1] - 844:10 Page [1] - 815:8

848:21, 849:10, 855:23, 855:25, 856:1, 860:3, 865:8, 867:13, 867:17, 869:12, 869:15, 888:22, 888:25, 903:5, 914:18, 914:23, 914:25, 916:19, 916:22, 917:7, 919:21, 919:22, 920:2, 920:18, 926:9, 926:10, 927:5, 932:16, 941:13, 944:4, 948:25, 950:23, 950:24, 958:11, 958:15, 965:20, 966:1, 968:9, 969:3, 992:7, 994:10, 994:19, 996:8, 998:16, 998:17, 998:18, 1002:3, 1003:23, 1003:24, 1004:1, 1004:10, 1006:19, 1006:22, 1007:12, 1017:9, 1017:12, 1019:17, 1019:20, 1020:2, 1024:9, 1024:10 pages [8] - 822:22, 828:3, 888:16, 917:1. 950:22. 995:20, 1003:18, 1031:4 paid [4] - 967:10, 967:15, 967:21, 967:22 Palmer [1] - 950:12 paper [1] - 853:2 papers [2] - 909:12, 985:6 Paradise [1] - 1009:5 paragraph [57] -816:21, 816:23, 817:1, 817:18, 820:13, 822:25, 824:14, 827:2, 830:11, 831:25, 832:1, 832:15, 832:17, 834:13, 842:12, 842:13, 844:5, 846:21, 847:17, 847:24, REPORTING GROUP , 957:21, THE

863:5, 865:5, 865:13, 869:16, 870:6, 871:5, 873:9, 874:8, 890:4, 918:1, 923:19, 925:9, 940:14, 967:20, 982:25. 988:13. 992:11, 993:20, 994:14, 996:9, 996:10, 996:24, 997:4, 997:24, 998:18, 999:6, 999:25, 1001:1, 1002:6, 1002:13, 1004:13, 1005:13, 1007:4, 1007:13 paragraphs [1] -849:11 parameter [1] - 837:23 parameters [11] -828:10, 828:21, 829:7, 831:4, 847:23, 849:19, 850:12, 850:14, 850:17, 918:7 pardon [1] - 891:11 parens [3] - 988:18, 988:21, 1007:18 park [1] - 910:8 parking [7] - 887:18, 888:1, 890:10, 891:2, 892:17, 893:19, 900:13 part [30] - 821:4, 824:20, 833:9, 838:12, 839:5, 849:4, 852:8, 861:14, 863:7, 870:24, 876:4, 879:7, 892:12, 903:10, 907:12, 911:16, 917:25, 945:19, 950:7, 950:9, 963:2, 964:3, 966:7, 979:5, 979:21, 1009:2, 1013:24, 1019:2, 1026:13 participate [1] - 872:9 participated [1] -889:12 particular [11] -817:18, 828:5, 847:6, 847:24, 850:6, 853:10, 861:14, 880:20, 933:1, 948:15, 981:23 particularly [5] -

975:2, 981:1, 1010:11 parties [2] - 954:22 pass [1] - 945:25 passage [1] - 884:5 past [11] - 848:4, 849:15, 849:25, 870:13, 876:11, 893:13, 956:9, 985:4, 1003:3, 1004:21, 1013:1 Patch [1] - 1008:25 patterns [1] - 1001:20 pause [1] - 1000:24 peaks [1] - 840:24 Peanut [1] - 1008:25 peculiar [1] - 915:23 people [10] - 858:22, 900:24, 905:19, 926:21, 964:14, 976:14, 983:15, 986:21, 1025:10, 1025:24 per [14] - 828:15, 837:24, 839:22, 849:23, 849:24, 850:4, 850:19, 853:11, 894:23, 918:3, 918:8, 918:9, 942:13 percent [15] - 828:17, 829:2, 880:17, 891:9, 891:12, 930:1, 940:20, 940:24, 945:21, 946:5, 946:8, 976:10, 978:11, 978:12, 1027:19 percentage [2] -850:20, 850:21 perfect [1] - 846:10 performed [1] -820:25 performing [1] -1026:16 perhaps [5] - 843:7, 856:15, 916:24, 961:12, 1001:2 period [27] - 823:24, 829:4, 833:14, 833:18, 836:8, 837:12, 843:4, 856:13, 887:22, 909:17, 910:10, 912:11, 942:20, 946:15, 959:24, 963:12, 982:4, 983:25, 992:22, 1005:25, 1018:19, 1021:10, 1021:16,

	T	1	ı	
1023:6, 1025:2,	908:14	1001:11, 1016:8,	849:16, 867:21,	842:13, 842:14,
1025:8	Plaintiff [1] - 814:4	1017:23, 1018:20,	876:13, 934:24,	844:2, 844:17,
periods [1] - 955:2	<b>plan</b> [3] - 964:4,	1019:6, 1019:8,	983:10, 985:22,	865:18, 865:20,
PERRY [1] - 814:17	964:13, 965:1	1019:9, 1020:8	997:15, 1000:1,	865:25, 876:24,
persisted [4] - 834:23,	Plan [1] - 1028:21	Point [34] - 821:15,	1002:8, 1002:18,	876:25, 908:4,
835:25, 871:12,	plant [10] - 915:11,	822:4, 823:1, 823:6,	1004:25, 1005:1,	908:5, 909:1,
1005:9	915:13, 915:24,	829:7, 829:17,	1005:15, 1005:16,	986:23, 987:5,
person [3] - 852:14,	918:16, 919:4,	848:23, 887:21,	1016:7	989:16
857:16, 1031:8	926:15, 926:20,	887:24, 890:7,	Porter's [1] - 1008:25	practiced [1] - 865:20
personally [1] -	932:12, 989:14,	891:16, 893:12,	portion [21] - 822:11,	practices [24] - 818:9,
906:24	1027:21	893:14, 894:1,	852:5, 866:12,	818:11, 818:13,
perspective [1] -	Plant [1] - 926:13	894:22, 900:20,	892:3, 902:13,	820:10, 820:12,
838:8	planted [19] - 915:12,	941:3, 959:14,	903:16, 912:19,	821:3, 821:5,
PHILIP [1] - 814:17	917:9, 918:14,	973:5, 975:4, 980:3,	925:2, 925:25,	821:21, 822:1,
photograph [1] -	921:12, 922:25,	983:2, 996:10,	928:15, 933:21,	822:19, 829:11,
907:8	923:3, 932:6,	998:21, 999:1,	935:23, 973:2,	829:15, 836:16,
photographs [3] -	932:23, 934:9,	1000:23, 1001:6,	980:1, 991:19,	843:10, 856:10,
907:8, 974:25,	935:4, 935:14,	1001:8, 1008:9,	996:1, 1001:10,	861:3, 869:10,
1027:13	936:16, 937:12,	1008:15, 1009:3,	1008:23, 1014:19,	869:20, 870:7,
<b>pick</b> [6] - 816:11,	1008:24, 1009:1,	1014:25, 1017:6,	1015:2, 1015:4	900:24, 909:2,
819:2, 883:10,	1009:3, 1009:4,	1027:11	portions [9] - 928:25,	986:2, 986:12,
894:4, 894:9, 919:12	1027:16	Point/East [3] -	968:21, 969:16,	987:15
picking [1] - 883:7	planting [4] - 923:17,	958:23, 959:11, 1014:23	981:20, 992:3,	precisely [1] - 959:25
picture [14] - 880:20,	935:1, 1008:21,		999:1, 999:3,	preclude [1] - 833:24
881:18, 882:11,	1009:7	pointed [1] - 1024:11	1005:1, 1026:17	precluded [8] - 832:7,
884:20, 887:5,	plants [1] - 908:12	points [1] - 1022:4	<b>Portland</b> [2] - 814:13, 1030:2	833:7, 833:22,
894:17, 896:13,	Platform [1] - 1008:25	policies [1] - 842:20 policy [1] - 962:11	Portland's [1] -	833:24, 853:13, 853:15, 854:23,
897:22, 899:2,	plausibility [1] -	poincy [1] - 962.11 poor [21] - 818:7,	1030:10	854:25
907:2, 907:4, 915:1,	1003:14	820:16, 821:1,	posed [2] - 843:4,	Predation [3] -
919:13, 920:9	<b>play</b> [9] - 838:17,	821:3, 822:19,	856:13	1003:20, 1003:25,
pictures [9] - 842:7,	874:25, 936:20,	829:11, 829:14,	position [1] - 985:6	1003:20, 1003:23,
879:25, 895:2,	938:5, 969:24, 970:3, 970:19,	830:23, 838:14,	positive [4] - 922:4,	predation [21] - 827:6,
909:5, 914:19, 918:19, 919:6,	970.3, 970.19, 971:7, 978:2	869:19, 887:10,	924:11, 925:16,	827:12, 892:13,
922:8, 926:11	played [11] - 875:1,	900:23, 925:6,	925:17	900:11, 924:14,
piece [2] - 920:21,	934:13, 935:19,	986:2, 986:15,	positives [1] - 924:12	940:20, 940:24,
977:21	936:21, 937:20,	987:15, 1007:13,	possibly [3] - 829:10,	978:13, 980:20,
pipe [1] - 895:25	969:9, 969:25,	1007:14, 1009:22,	843:25, 869:18	987:25, 988:21,
place [32] - 819:2,	970:4, 970:20,	1009:23	post [1] - 830:6	992:25, 998:5,
819:13, 824:8,	971:8, 978:3	population [32] -	potential [9] - 828:20,	998:15, 999:13,
826:24, 836:6,	plenty [1] - 1022:13	817:15, 827:16,	829:9, 869:17,	999:18, 1000:17,
836:23, 837:10,	plumes [1] - 1001:20	828:9, 828:21,	902:17, 984:19,	1003:5, 1005:7,
837:12, 840:21,	<b>plus</b> [1] - 1025:8	829:7, 831:1, 831:2,	985:2, 985:16,	1010:4, 1015:15
844:2, 851:22,	pockets [1] - 975:1	831:11, 839:4,	985:25, 1011:15	predator [6] - 891:15,
866:20, 882:4,	point [42] - 821:7,	839:13, 841:2,	potentially [1] -	891:16, 994:2,
900:24, 901:7,	823:11, 824:17,	841:3, 844:9,	859:10	994:16, 994:21,
910:4, 946:20,	826:22, 858:2,	847:23, 849:15,	pounds [17] - 941:22,	994:23
946:22, 947:11,	858:4, 858:9, 868:2,	849:18, 855:16,	942:2, 942:4, 942:5,	predators [16] - 891:6,
958:2, 958:3,	871:16, 876:21,	871:2, 876:19,	945:1, 945:3, 951:3,	979:11, 979:15,
959:21, 960:1,	891:6, 903:9,	879:24, 909:20,	951:17, 952:1,	979:19, 979:22,
960:2, 960:24,	909:22, 910:14,	909:23, 956:14,	952:5, 952:20,	980:5, 980:13,
964:13, 966:25,	925:4, 935:7, 935:8,	957:10, 963:12,	953:15, 957:12,	980:17, 980:21,
977:13, 979:7,	937:10, 938:12,	980:14, 980:18,	1018:1, 1020:9,	994:9, 999:22,
981:1, 986:5,	939:17, 943:22,	984:3, 984:20,	1023:20	1004:19, 1007:7,
1023:14	946:19, 949:8,	998:2, 1016:22, 1016:24	pour [1] - 897:7	1007:17, 1013:22, 1014:14
placed [1] - 819:9	959:12, 961:20,	populations [23] -	practically [2] -	
places [3] - 826:19,	963:19, 964:6,	817:3, 817:5, 817:7,	825:19, 909:19	predatory [1] - 940:21 predecessors [1] -
1026:20, 1027:19	965:1, 973:11,	823:8, 823:9,	practice [20] - 818:17,	1012:8
placing [4] - 863:14,	974:14, 982:13,		818:18, 819:17,	predictability [1] -
864:21, 866:15,	983:5, 986:18, TH	E REPORTING G	ROUP   5, 837:11,	predictability [1] -
	N	Iason & Lockha	rt	
5 of 85 sheets	I.		The	e Reporting Group (207) 797-60

957:24 predictable [1] -1027:4 predicted [3] - 850:19, 975:12, 1019:3 predicting [1] - 957:20 predictive [2] - 850:7, 997:15 predirect [1] - 882:2 prefer [1] - 916:12 prefiled [3] - 968:8, 971:21, 983:1 preliminary [3] -949:15, 953:19, 953:22 premise [1] - 904:2 premium [1] - 893:16 preparation [1] -861:11 prepared [1] - 987:11 preparing [3] -863:20, 904:14, 969:14 presence [7] - 979:11, 979:14, 994:1, 994:15, 994:21, 1005:15, 1007:17 present [7] - 817:19, 834:23, 836:1, 871:13, 924:25, 928:12, 932:15 Present [1] - 814:23 presentation [2] -853:5, 938:9 presented [4] - 872:3, 873:12, 874:17, 934:2 presenting [3] - 875:6, 934:16, 936:23 Pressure [1] - 828:6 pressure [15] -828:16, 844:10, 844:13, 845:1, 847:22, 849:21, 863:12, 890:14, 892:22, 915:19, 917:10, 917:15, 977:9, 977:11, 983:11 pressures [1] - 869:11 pretrial [1] - 967:22 pretty [14] - 845:10, 851:4, 885:13, 893:12, 898:23, 900:12, 913:8, 913:11, 913:16, 928:23, 976:15, 982:21, 1000:11, 1027:24 prevailed [2] - 842:16,

848:8 prevailing [3] -826:13, 973:18, 1001:19 prevented [2] -1009:19, 1011:20 prevents [1] - 1007:6 previous [3] - 854:15, 920:6, 993:25 previously [4] - 830:8, 975:15, 978:25, 1017:19 price [2] - 1023:22, 1025:6 prices [1] - 983:13 primarily [7] - 822:2, 826:12, 877:19, 947:4, 1007:17, 1012:14, 1028:10 primary [15] - 817:3, 820:14, 822:5, 822:7, 822:16, 870:9, 959:9, 970:6, 1014:12, 1014:23, 1014:25. 1015:20. 1016:18, 1017:24, 1027:8 PRIMIS [1] - 814:20 principal [1] - 975:5 private [4] - 989:7, 989:12, 989:19, 990:18 problem [10] - 867:12, 891:5, 891:8, 903:19, 906:25, 923:14, 944:3, 948:21, 970:7. 977:24 proceed [2] - 816:5, 955:11 proceeded [1] - 963:3 Proceeding [1] -1030:15 PROCEEDINGS [2] -814:9, 816:1 Proceedings [1] -1031:6 process [21] - 853:18, 853:20, 861:14, 862:25, 863:3, 863:4, 864:8, 864:20, 878:16, 883:9, 883:14, 898:18, 907:16, 907:22, 923:23, 963:25, 964:19, 980:23, 997:19,

1005:5, 1026:25

processing [1] -

908:12

processor [1] - 865:23 processors [4] -846:4, 857:15, 966:17, 997:18 produced [2] - 862:5, 932:19 produces [1] - 893:15 producing [12] -817:3, 822:5, 822:7, 822:16, 870:9, 959:9, 977:7, 1014:12, 1014:24, 1015:20, 1017:24, 1025:4 product [7] - 840:18, 865:22, 893:17, 984:7, 987:4, 1021:19, 1021:20 production [12] -828:15, 829:9, 836:15, 837:23, 844:11, 849:19, 850:12, 850:14, 869:17, 918:7, 957:19, 992:15 production/ harvesting [1] -844:15 productive [5] -908:21, 982:17, 982:18, 982:23, 985:17 proffer [1] - 886:12 program [5] - 910:4, 910:6, 910:19, 1028:8, 1028:9 programs [2] - 911:1, 913:2 progress [5] - 964:1, 971:5, 986:8, 1005:6, 1027:15 progressed [5] -838:18, 971:12, 971:22, 976:11, 1016:5 progressing [2] -981:17, 983:25 progression [6] -923:25, 970:12, 975:25, 989:6, 999:18, 1014:6 progressively [1] -938:13 projects [2] - 910:24, 921:24 Prolonged [1] -1006:22 prolonged [6] - 827:4, 979:18, 998:14,

910:1 proper [2] - 888:8, 947:2 properly [1] - 1026:1 protect [5] - 854:23, 876:8, 938:22, 985:11, 1017:3 protection [1] -889:14 prove [1] - 961:10 proven [2] - 893:11, 908:6 provide [7] - 862:3, 862:10, 886:22, 955:2, 967:22, 973:17, 997:14 provided [9] - 842:24, 881:12, 919:5, 931:20, 951:7, 955:3, 964:21, 965:23 providing [6] - 844:24, 856:22, 877:1, 885:25, 892:16, 967:14 proximal [2] -1005:10, 1026:23 Public [2] - 814:15, 1031:2 public [7] - 853:1, 853:3, 855:13, 872:7, 960:22, 990:19, 990:22 **publicly** [1] - 856:23 published [1] - 853:2 pull [5] - 865:4, 874:23, 886:19, 892:8, 1014:18 pulled [6] - 837:6, 899:19, 918:23, 955:15, 957:9, 957:13 pumping [1] - 882:6 purpose [2] - 927:22, 997:14 pushed [1] - 819:16 put [32] - 837:8, 840:3, 849:2, 852:22, 856:19, 859:9, 863:19, 863:21, 863:24, 872:22, 880:4, 883:10, 896:13, 896:23, 897:11, 898:6, 898:14, 898:21, 910:4, 911:25, 916:23, 930:13,

1007:15

prompt [2] - 909:24,

954:19, 957:1, 960:2, 1014:17, 1017:8, 1020:25, 1026:19, 1026:20 Putnam [1] - 820:2 putting [7] - 852:7, 853:15, 859:4, 861:11, 868:6, 908:2, 922:2 PVC [1] - 895:24

### Q

quadrat [14] - 895:19, 896:6, 896:8, 896:10, 896:16, 897:14, 897:23, 898:13, 898:21, 899:10, 914:11, 914:15, 918:6, 927:15 quadrats [1] - 895:9 qualified [1] - 928:24 qualify [2] - 821:25, 857:11 quality [8] - 823:11, 823:17, 824:16, 838:14, 884:16, 893:17, 1009:23, 1009:24 quarter [1] - 895:24 questions [13] -816:23, 818:4, 823:5, 872:9, 936:5, 944:8, 950:15, 1007:25, 1011:13, 1013:10, 1014:11, 1023:24, 1025:21 quickly [4] - 866:24, 940:8, 982:2, 993:18 quit [3] - 926:1, 974:4, 1025:10 quite [7] - 876:2, 928:15, 932:24, 953:6, 960:18, 989:16, 1010:6 quote [3] - 875:14, 887:18. 903:10 **QURESHI** [1] - 814:18

R rainfall [1] - 1003:2 raise [1] - 838:2 raised [3] - 845:19, 845:21, 871:17 raising [1] - 855:15 rake [2] - 819:4, 883:6 rakes [2] - 818:22, 818:23 **RALPH** [1] - 814:11

THE REPORTING GROUP, 946:20,

	1	1		•
ran [2] - 912:22, 984:7	891:17, 933:7,	RECROSS-	884:3, 884:8,	978:21, 979:1,
random [1] - 896:4	998:9, 1016:10,	EXAMINATION [1] -	884:18, 885:20,	979:5, 980:12,
	1016:13, 1016:14,	1013:11	886:17, 887:6,	982:17, 988:16,
randomly [1] - 896:2	1010:13, 1010:14,		887:17, 887:21,	997:13, 998:21,
range [2] - 835:14,	reasonable [3] -	recruit [2] - 850:22, 988:1	890:23, 891:1,	998:24, 998:25,
926:23	887:2, 964:12,		893:5, 895:2, 896:2,	999:4, 1000:1,
Rao [1] - 1025:16	998:10	recruited [1] - 837:22	898:3, 898:22,	1000:15, 1001:13,
<b>RAO</b> [2] - 814:19,		recruiting [1] - 852:4	901:22, 901:24,	1000:15, 1001:13,
1025:20	reasons [2] - 893:13, 970:12	recruitment [33] -	902:21, 902:22,	1001:10, 1001:21,
rate [4] - 826:17,	recalling [1] - 940:14	823:12, 824:10,	902:23, 902:24,	1016:7, 1026:16,
831:12, 955:21,	received [1] - 911:4	824:18, 824:22, 825:16, 825:17,	903:12, 903:14,	1026:17, 1027:1,
955:24	receiving [3] - 854:8,	825:24, 826:1,	904:3, 904:4, 904:6,	1027:6, 1027:17
rates [3] - 988:17, 1002:20, 1003:3	911:2, 975:8	830:13, 831:5,	904:7, 904:18,	refer [6] - 823:22,
	recent [1] - 1004:24	831:21, 836:12,	904:22, 907:2,	827:21, 844:4,
rather [8] - 818:19,	recently [6] - 907:9,	836:21, 836:24,	907:6, 908:16,	903:5, 945:18,
859:3, 871:4, 890:14, 895:12,	927:24, 928:1,	837:3, 839:11,	908:18, 909:6,	1026:2
915:7, 927:12, 958:3	937:12, 975:3, 975:4	840:22, 844:9,	909:8, 909:12,	reference [5] - 817:17,
re [1] - 847:11	receptive [1] - 937:4	868:3, 868:14,	916:11, 918:12,	825:11, 833:5,
re[1] - 647.11	Recess [3] - 878:9,	870:1, 988:20,	918:13, 924:16,	865:2, 941:12
reach [1] - 904:21	940:2, 1011:9	993:1, 1003:4,	924:18, 927:8,	Referenced [1] - 815:8
reach [1] - 904:21	recess [3] - 1010:15,	1007:14, 1017:1,	934:23, 936:16,	referenced [1] -
	1029:24, 1030:11	1021:18, 1021:21,	938:17, 980:14,	987:14
reaches [2] - 965:19, 1027:1	recognize [7] -	1021:24, 1023:15,	980:15, 980:18,	references [1] -
	825:21, 845:11,	1023:16, 1027:14	980:19, 980:24,	847:21
reaching [1] - 1027:19	880:12, 880:15,	recruits [1] - 850:18	981:6, 981:9,	referencing [1] -
reaction [1] - 856:25	895:17, 929:10,	recurring [1] - 910:18	981:13, 982:6,	886:24
read [15] - 816:22, 818:3, 823:4,	929:24	recycle [1] - 908:12	982:13, 982:21,	referred [1] - 986:3
853:13, 856:2,	recognized [1] - 845:8	Redirect [1] - 815:2	988:2, 993:2, 999:12	referring [9] - 835:12,
856:3, 860:4,	recognizing [1] -	REDIRECT [2] -	reefs [93] - 817:3,	850:2, 875:24,
873:15, 927:2,	898:10	968:11, 1024:5	822:5, 822:8, 822:9,	877:4, 877:16,
936:10, 951:10,	recollection [4] -	redirect [1] - 905:6	822:16, 823:20,	877:17, 936:7,
971:18, 987:22,	854:8, 887:25,	reduce [1] - 831:9	825:25, 827:20,	946:14, 1000:13
993:18, 1028:25	970:23, 971:11	reduced [7] - 827:7,	832:4, 832:21,	reflect [1] - 883:24
reading [7] - 820:6,	reconnaissance [1] -	827:22, 827:23,	833:25, 834:2,	reflected [2] - 849:19,
848:12, 878:18,	914:10	836:12, 836:23,	834:8, 837:18,	926:18
885:24, 1007:1,	record [12] - 867:7,	837:25, 1002:20	837:20, 841:23,	reflecting [2] - 829:10,
1029:9, 1029:10	868:19, 869:8,	reduces [1] - 837:21	842:9, 847:25,	869:18
reads [1] - 1004:17	886:6, 886:11,	reducing [2] - 985:5,	848:3, 865:17,	reflective [2] - 982:25,
ready [1] - 825:4	888:13, 898:5,	985:6	868:1, 870:9,	1009:9
real [6] - 858:6,	914:2, 944:12,	Reef [4] - 924:3,	875:15, 878:16,	reflects [1] - 942:18
858:15, 881:2,	945:12, 968:6,	925:5, 927:9, 929:3	878:22, 879:3,	refurbished [2] -
882:22, 917:17,	1010:22	reef [102] - 817:6,	879:10, 879:13,	932:19, 932:23
937:3	recorded [1] - 873:8	817:17, 817:23,	879:17, 880:15,	regarding [2] - 996:1,
reality [1] - 945:2	recover [2] - 833:17,	823:8, 823:10,	880:18, 884:4,	1006:21
realize [2] - 971:18,	833:23	824:1, 824:2,	885:6, 885:9,	regardless [2] - 883:4,
1028:3	recovered [1] - 833:25	836:18, 838:23,	885:10, 896:14, 901:13, 902:1,	936:7
realized [1] - 853:22	recovery [22] - 832:7,	838:24, 839:9,	901:13, 902:1,	regenerated [1] -
really [22] - 826:19,	833:7, 833:13,	839:11, 839:18,	903:15, 907:9,	1017:2
835:12, 837:19,	833:19, 833:25,	840:15, 840:16,	907:12, 908:2,	regime [2] - 999:21,
839:8, 840:8,	928:21, 963:16,	840:17, 841:1,	909:6, 909:25,	1005:12
881:21, 882:25,	963:24, 964:3,	841:4, 841:19,	913:9, 921:21,	regimes [4] - 979:17,
906:10, 911:10,	964:5, 964:9,	842:4, 867:23,	922:25, 925:11,	988:22, 998:14,
916:12, 920:5,	964:11, 964:13,	867:24, 868:10,	929:14, 929:20,	1003:7
929:10, 962:25,	964:17, 964:19,	875:14, 878:23,	930:1, 930:19,	regulate [3] - 1018:9,
963:6, 967:6,	965:1, 965:4, 965:6,	878:25, 879:13,	937:10, 937:25,	1018:12, 1018:16
976:13, 986:12,	965:12, 966:10,	880:9, 880:11,	938:3, 938:15,	regulated [1] -
1005:25, 1008:14,	966:19, 967:3	880:25, 881:4,	938:18, 973:4,	1018:10
1008:17, 1026:25,	Recross [1] - 815:2	881:7, 882:16,	973:24, 973:25,	regulation [1] - 837:15
1027:22	RECROSS [1] -	882:18, 883:2,	075.22 978.10	regulations [1] - 853:9
reason [9] - 838:3,	1013:11 TH	E REPORTING G	ROUP 5, 978:16,	rehabilitated [2] -
	N	Iason & Lockha	nrt	

1009:7, 1010:1 842:23, 844:7, 1022:23, 1023:7, 833:8, 837:17, rehabilitating [1] -845:7, 845:9, 1026:2 838:21, 838:25, 908:15 846:12, 846:16, represent [1] - 882:16 843:9, 844:6, related [2] - 901:11, 846:22, 847:2, 846:22, 849:3, representation [4] -983:22 847:9, 847:12, 858:25, 873:13, 849:21, 850:3, 847:22, 848:14, 851:16, 851:25, relates [1] - 938:7 901:22. 903:13 848:22. 849:4. 852:20, 853:22, relating [3] - 862:11, representative [6] -850:6, 852:8, 854:10, 854:21, 862:17, 940:10 881:6, 882:12, 854:24, 855:2, relationships [1] -852:25, 853:1, 898:3, 901:4, 904:3, 853:14, 853:21, 904:5 855:3, 855:8, 840:25 854:9, 854:15, 855:12, 856:17, represented [1] relatively [10] -854:16, 856:20, 857:21, 861:12, 849:19, 876:15, 928:21 870:25, 872:13, 857:18, 859:5, 876:24, 876:25, representing [1] -859:10, 861:12, 876:9, 879:7, 967:1 910:1, 910:19, 863:4, 863:22, 883:12, 889:4, 929:20, 929:22, represents [1] - 946:6 863:25, 864:2, 889:14, 890:13, 934:8, 999:4 reproduction [4] -864:5, 864:16, 890:17, 890:22, reliable [1] - 946:2 825:15, 868:14, 864:17, 867:2, 891:14, 892:21, 902:18, 902:19 relief [1] - 816:15 868:6, 868:23, 908:20, 908:23, relies [1] - 853:9 reproductive [6] -911:17, 913:15, 868:25, 870:24, 902:17, 984:19, remain [1] - 999:14 871:19, 871:20, 922:18, 929:18, 984:20, 985:1, remainder [2] -871:21, 892:3, 932:20, 938:22, 985:16, 985:25 819:15, 848:25 911:19, 922:23, 956:12, 957:3, request [10] - 816:14, remaining [3] -926:19, 929:18, 959:19, 959:23, 860:8, 860:10, 838:10, 981:22, 933:4, 941:11, 963:17, 963:19, 860:17. 886:21. 1016:9 941:13, 946:7, 966:11, 987:23, 910:23, 911:8, remains [1] - 848:22 995:22, 1008:16, 951:16, 956:22, remarks [1] - 994:13 912:1, 930:21, 958:23, 959:25, 1008:17, 1018:21, 934:21 remember [3] -960:10, 970:24, 1018:22, 1022:22 requested [2] -902:25, 1019:24, 992:4, 995:8, resources [11] -900:19, 951:8 1025:14 995:22, 1004:5, 818:6, 820:17, requesting [1] reminding [1] - 1010:5 1005:4, 1006:11, 820:20, 842:19, 877:23 removal [1] - 831:13 1006:13, 1006:14, 842:21, 849:8, required [4] - 945:25, remove [3] - 842:2, 1007:3 867:23, 870:9, 1015:15, 1015:18, 857:25, 882:24 992:4, 992:12, reported [9] - 828:13, 1015:21 removed [10] - 827:24, 1012:5 828:16, 828:25, requirement [1] -828:1, 839:7, 913:14, 915:9, Resources [1] -947:4 839:16, 839:17, 946:3, 951:17, 868:24 requirements [1] -839:20, 841:18, 1023:10, 1023:12 respect [3] - 822:15, 947:2 842:9, 878:24 Reporter [1] - 1031:16 869:10, 887:22 research [1] - 889:4 removing [1] - 985:14 reporter [2] - 856:4, responding [2] reshell [1] - 1008:8 renewable [2] -972:15 856:11, 861:3 reshelled [3] - 914:8, 840:19, 1008:17 reporting [8] - 837:9, response [6] - 832:5, 935:4, 1008:4 renewed [1] - 1017:1 919:3, 926:22, 832:22, 860:16, reshelling [13] renewing [1] - 831:1 945:7, 946:4, 903:10, 945:24, 907:17, 907:23, repeat [2] - 874:2, 947:15, 947:20, 1027:23 910:4, 910:6, 906:8 948.3 responses [1] -912:19, 917:8, repeats [1] - 869:9 reports [28] - 834:19, 1014:10 958:20, 1008:1, rephrase [1] - 943:18 844:15, 851:3, responsibilities [1] -1009:20, 1027:6, replace [1] - 896:8 852:22, 855:12, 907:12 1028:5, 1028:8, replenished [1] -856:4, 857:13, responsibility [2] -1028:9 831:12 858:22, 858:23, 843:15, 849:4 resilient [2] - 876:13, replicable [1] - 955:1 860:22, 871:8, responsible [2] -1012:25 Report [3] - 859:19, 875:13, 904:14, 922:18, 977:16 resistance [1] -958:12, 1029:7 923:6, 942:6, rest [1] - 988:13 1008:11 report [78] - 816:16, 945:22, 956:11, restaurants [2] resolution [1] - 881:2 820:3, 821:18, 956:18, 959:18, 1030:1, 1030:10 **Resource** [1] - 867:5 822:17, 822:23, 959:20, 960:21, restoration [11] resource [62] -828:4, 828:20, 972:12, 974:3, 875:18, 907:11, 816:16, 821:20, 834:16, 835:16, 1004:22, 1022:27 THE REPORTING GROUP 5, 907:22, 835:23, 838:12,

910:24, 921:22, 921:24, 926:17, 926:21, 938:13, 958:19 restorations [1] -909:12 restore [3] - 879:23, 909:24, 946:17 restored [7] - 881:7, 907:5, 907:9, 921:21, 964:23, 975:3, 975:4 restoring [4] - 875:21, 909:7, 909:8, 938:11 restrictions [2] -863:14, 866:15 result [11] - 818:7, 821:2, 821:4, 865:16, 870:13, 924:14, 947:13, 983:3, 983:23, 993:6, 1028:14 resulted [3] - 832:6, 856:9, 861:2 resulting [4] - 863:15. 866:16, 988:1, 992:25 results [6] - 836:15, 865:22, 913:8, 915:10, 921:10, 921:22 retard [1] - 999:21 retired [1] - 962:15 returned [2] - 836:18, 838:23 reviewed [3] - 873:23, 874:6, 985:3 rid [1] - 994:9 right-hand [8] -861:19, 861:20, 862:21, 869:2, 920:3, 920:18, 931:19, 969:4 rise [3] - 925:3, 994:4, 994:25 risk [4] - 842:21, 858:7, 858:15, 961:18 **River** [7] - 973:15, 973:16, 988:18, 994:3, 994:25, 1003:3, 1006:23 river [12] - 925:3, 973:11, 983:8, 988:19, 1001:17, 1001:19, 1001:21, 1002:20, 1005:10, 1021:15, 1026:23, 1027:3 **RMR** [2] - 814:14,

1031:15 road [1] - 852:1 rock [3] - 979:25, 999:13, 1007:18 **roll** [1] - 920:6 rough [1] - 884:19 row [4] - 857:6, 951:25, 959:19, 960:21 rule [3] - 843:18, 853:17, 853:20 rule-making [2] -853:17, 853:20 run [3] - 845:17, 972:10, 973:6 running [4] - 888:17, 942:1, 951:3, 986:11 runs [1] - 954:7

### S

sake [1] - 1020:12 **sale** [1] - 844:16 saleable [2] - 962:6, 962:7 **salinities** [3] - 980:8, 998:12, 1012:15 salinity [36] - 826:12, 827:5, 827:12, 901:15, 929:1, 929:4, 972:13, 977:14, 979:14, 979:17, 979:18, 982:20, 988:22, 991:21, 994:25, 998:4, 998:14, 999:14, 999:21, 1002:21, 1003:6, 1005:8, 1005:12, 1005:17, 1005:25, 1007:6, 1007:16, 1009:25, 1011:19, 1012:4, 1013:6, 1013:22, 1014:14, 1027:8 salvage [2] - 858:2, 961:20 sample [10] - 896:7, 897:23, 897:24, 897:25, 974:11, 997:10, 997:12, 997:21, 1030:10 sampled [1] - 817:6 samples [11] - 895:8, 899:19, 914:10, 914:11, 915:15, 974:23, 976:6, 982:4, 996:18, 996:24, 997:6

817:25, 818:5, 820:24, 878:16, 895:5, 901:7, 918:7, 926:1, 927:12, 974:4, 974:5, 974:9, 974:11, 974:13, 974:15. 997:14. 1004:14 save [1] - 961:21

saving [1] - 1019:6 savings [1] - 1030:5 saw [16] - 890:10, 925:8, 946:6, 959:18, 961:12, 970:12, 974:2, 975:24, 978:6, 978:10, 979:16, 981:20, 982:11, 998:9, 1006:3, 1027:12

**scale** [3] - 908:9, 909:12, 967:6 scenario [1] - 972:10 scene [1] - 894:1 scientific [2] - 893:7, 903:20

scientist [1] - 902:15 scissor [1] - 818:24 scissor-like [1] -818:24

scoop [3] - 819:1,

896:19, 898:18 scooped [1] - 898:13 **scooping** [1] - 897:16 Scorpion [4] - 924:3,

925:5, 929:3, 975:15 scour [1] - 982:1 screen [4] - 865:4, 881:14, 944:25, 972:3

Seafood [2] - 860:8, 860:18

seafood [1] - 1024:22 season [24] - 829:22, 833:16, 844:12, 844:21, 845:5,

845:14, 845:16, 845:18, 846:3,

849:1, 849:8, 850:9, 850:11, 852:16, 956:20, 956:21, 967:5, 973:1,

973:20, 974:8, 976:16, 985:10, 1016:16, 1019:1

seasons [3] - 830:2, 833:1, 833:10 seat [1] - 977:19

second [19] - 820:12, 822:25, 867:18,  $_{
m THE}$  873:6, 888:6, 888:21, 916:4, 916:8, 942:2, 948:25, 949:18, 951:11, 958:15, 996:9, 1002:7, 1002:12, 1002:13, 1020:2

section [13] - 831:24, 841:14, 860:2, 869:14, 931:22, 933:25, 938:9, 939:4, 940:9, 993:17, 994:11, 1003:19, 1009:6 sector [1] - 986:15

sedimentation [1] -890:16 see [143] - 817:8,

821:7, 823:2,

825:23, 825:25, 827:9, 832:13, 842:1, 846:25, 847:18, 847:19, 847:20, 848:9,

848:18, 849:13, 850:23, 855:15, 855:17, 857:1, 859:20, 861:20, 861:24, 862:19,

863:17, 866:21, 866:23, 868:4, 868:25, 869:5, 880:20, 880:25, 881:1, 881:2,

882:13, 886:23, 888:9. 888:16. 889:1, 890:5, 890:16, 890:18,

890:19, 890:22, 894:10, 894:17, 895:22, 898:10,

899:1, 899:9, 900:7, 903:7, 915:18, 917:7, 918:21, 920:6, 920:25,

922:14, 923:5, 923:12, 923:20, 924:9, 926:13,

931:8, 931:24, 932:9, 935:16, 935:21, 936:2, 938:7, 939:18,

942:1, 945:15, 945:17, 945:22, 949:19, 949:24, 950:16, 950:18, 950:20, 954:11,

955:6, 955:17,

970:24, 971:25, 973:8, 973:9, 973:24, 977:3, 980:15, 980:19, 980:21, 980:25, 981:3, 981:8, 981:17. 983:22. 988:3, 988:15, 988:23, 990:4, 990:5, 991:9, 991:10, 992:8, 992:11, 992:16, 993:3, 993:22, 994:4, 994:17,

995:1, 995:22, 996:8, 996:16, 997:2, 998:6, 998:19, 998:20,

998:22, 999:15, 999:18, 1002:10, 1002:22, 1003:8, 1003:18, 1003:24,

1004:10, 1004:15, 1006:23, 1007:20, 1014:4, 1014:6, 1014:7, 1016:4, 1019:3, 1021:16,

1024:24 seeing [4] - 954:13, 978:14, 978:21,

seek [1] - 826:23 sees [1] - 933:11 select [1] - 995:25

1000:18

selected [1] - 992:3 selective [1] - 968:21 **self** [1] - 876:16

self-explanatory [1] -876:16

sell [1] - 822:13 semi [1] - 896:4 semi-random [1] -

896:4 send [1] - 853:8

sense [5] - 876:7, 901:11, 916:14, 970:14, 1019:15

sent [3] - 822:18, 859:5, 930:21 sentence [36] -

817:24, 820:13, 820:18, 824:15, 827:1, 827:4, 828:9,

829:6, 830:10, 832:1, 833:4, 836:9, 843:12, 844:4,

846:21, 848:17, 848:18, 863:8, 871:4, 938:16,

REPORTING GROUP 7, 993:19,

997:2, 999:7, 999:17, 1002:7, 1002:12, 1002:13, 1002:24, 1004:17, 1007:5. 1007:13 **sentences** [5] - 823:4, 832:16, 925:9, 950:13, 1029:10 September [33] -846:24, 847:3, 847:9, 848:11, 849:3, 856:20, 857:10, 858:9, 867:3, 867:6, 867:20, 868:7, 868:18, 868:25,

993:23, 993:25,

994:14, 994:20,

870:18, 871:18, 871:20, 871:21, 877:5, 877:20, 930:4, 930:8, 930:11, 930:20, 933:24, 934:21, 935:8, 968:15, 970:23, 978:1, 1006:10, 1006:13, 1016:20 sequence [1] - 888:18

859:8 serious [6] - 842:4, 868:1, 875:16, 938:18, 1004:18, 1006:5

series [2] - 850:11,

**Services** [1] - 931:13 sessile [7] - 825:10, 826:4, 826:6, 826:22, 1026:2, 1026:4, 1026:6

set [20] - 818:13, 820:17, 825:12, 826:14, 846:20, 852:15, 859:9, 893:14, 902:23,

908:1, 908:4, 915:9, 915:18, 916:7, 916:13, 916:15, 924:4, 932:13, 968:2, 1026:12 sets [1] - 954:23

setting [2] - 825:16, 968:6

**settle** [3] - 825:5, 825:6, 887:12 settlement [7] -823:12, 824:9, 824:17, 868:2, 868:14, 919:11 settles [1] - 896:2

Mason & Lockhart.

sampling [18] - 817:2,

	ı		I	
settling [1] - 825:9	916:23, 918:23,	908:5, 908:7	848:17	886:7, 886:8,
seven [2] - 852:17,	919:3, 925:19	simpler [1] - 862:8	<b>slide</b> [10] - 874:20,	895:16, 896:9,
912:12	shoot [1] - 916:6	simply [2] - 980:25,	875:4, 880:4, 900:1,	897:25, 900:9,
seven-year [1] -	short [1] - 855:24	997:21	934:11, 935:17,	906:1, 910:3,
912:12	shorter [1] - 889:11	single [7] - 893:16,	936:19, 937:18,	919:22, 921:13,
several [3] - 894:2,	shortly [1] - 914:21	904:6, 904:7,	938:4, 1020:25	923:4, 923:16,
974:3, 1028:17	shot [1] - 960:16	904:18, 904:22,	slides [6] - 898:4,	927:5, 939:15,
severe [2] - 821:19,	<b>show</b> [15] - 842:6,	905:22, 1018:4	919:15, 930:17,	947:7, 947:8, 948:8,
988:16	885:11, 919:9,	site [9] - 915:12,	934:3, 969:2, 969:17	948:14, 948:20,
severely [3] - 817:7,	919:18, 924:22,	916:24, 917:12,	<b>slow</b> [1] - 816:4	954:15, 960:14,
938:2, 1000:16	971:17, 971:19,	926:15, 926:20,	slowly [1] - 856:3	995:17, 1003:22,
severity [2] - 929:10,	987:17, 990:2,	927:1, 932:14,	<b>small</b> [20] - 819:5,	1004:3, 1010:21
929:25	993:16, 993:17,	932:18, 1027:21	819:6, 834:22,	<b>sort</b> [2] - 964:12,
shallow [1] - 1000:1	1001:2, 1021:14,	<b>Site</b> [3] - 926:13,	835:18, 836:6,	984:8
<b>shape</b> [5] - 909:7,	1021:24, 1021:25	931:23, 932:3	836:22, 836:25,	<b>Sound</b> [13] - 928:25,
928:18, 929:2,	<b>showed</b> [7] - 960:3,	sites [4] - 915:24,	838:22, 839:12,	929:3, 972:22,
929:5, 929:9	968:17, 968:21,	919:5, 921:11,	839:25, 843:19,	973:3, 975:14,
<b>shared</b> [1] - 911:1	991:23, 993:14,	932:12	856:7, 860:25,	980:3, 991:18,
<b>shell</b> [46] - 819:6,	1006:12, 1009:8	<b>situation</b> [22] - 833:9,	865:21, 871:11,	999:3, 1000:5,
819:8, 824:3, 825:7,	showing [8] - 892:2,	836:15, 838:18,	910:19, 934:24,	1000:12, 1000:14,
825:12, 863:16,	949:14, 957:16,	840:11, 840:19,	934:25, 984:23,	1000:22, 1001:23 <b>sound</b> [3] - 885:2,
865:17, 866:17,	988:16, 993:16,	841:20, 842:8,	985:11 <b>smaller</b> [11] - 818:15,	910:10, 1017:4
867:25, 881:25,	1000:16, 1003:1, 1018:24	850:16, 856:9, 861:2, 882:22,	835:5, 837:8,	sounds [2] - 959:1,
884:9, 887:7, 893:2,	shown [7] - 905:7,	893:21, 897:12,	837:25, 876:18,	959:8
893:3, 893:4, 893:8, 893:9, 893:11,	928:16, 928:17,	898:12, 899:9,	876:23, 881:1,	<b>source</b> [4] - 955:7,
893:15, 893:18,	957:15, 989:5,	899:18, 900:9,	938:15, 975:7,	973:14, 975:21,
893:25, 894:9,	992:2, 995:25	929:25, 933:16,	983:10, 983:20	1008:16
894:12, 894:13,	shows [5] - 869:4,	979:18, 979:21,	Smith [1] - 892:6	south [1] - 973:6
894:14, 894:18,	901:2, 920:20,	1019:14	<b>snail</b> [3] - 940:21,	southeastern [1] -
898:14, 898:19,	992:14, 1022:6	situations [1] - 857:17	979:25, 1005:16	1013:18
899:22, 900:10,	<b>shrimp</b> [1] - 827:18	<b>six</b> [1] - 953:24	<b>snails</b> [8] - 999:13,	southern [3] - 928:25,
908:2, 908:12,	<b>shucked</b> [1] - 908:13	<b>size</b> [57] - 819:13,	1005:7, 1005:10,	974:7, 981:20
920:21, 921:5,	<b>side</b> [6] - 833:15,	825:19, 825:20,	1005:20, 1005:22,	southward [1] -
921:6, 927:24,	855:7, 855:8,	834:16, 834:20,	1005:23, 1006:4,	997:25
936:11, 937:12,	885:20, 943:24,	835:1, 836:13,	1007:18	southwestern [1] -
981:4, 981:22,	971:25	836:19, 837:2,	<b>snippet</b> [2] - 969:10,	925:24
987:5, 989:14,	sideways [1] - 883:15	837:4, 837:22,	969:25	sovereignty [1] -
1009:7	sign [2] - 926:22,	838:1, 838:5,	soft [1] - 980:9	989:11
shelled [3] - 910:9,	927:19	839:20, 840:6,	sold [1] - 941:24	<b>spat</b> [33] - 823:12,
935:25, 938:1	significant [5] -	840:7, 840:8, 840:12, 841:17,	solution [1] - 998:10 sometimes [3] -	824:8, 824:9, 824:17, 825:10,
shellfish [1] - 990:9 shelling [10] - 907:16,	878:25, 909:24,	843:6, 843:14,	907:19, 923:10,	825:11, 825:13,
908:1, 910:15,	924:17, 925:12, 1022:6	843:18, 844:17,	928:5	825:14, 825:18,
910:19, 911:4,	significantly [1] -	844:19, 845:3,	somewhat [7] -	825:21, 825:23,
912:3, 913:5, 913:9,	966:12	848:2, 848:5, 856:6,	835:11, 868:22,	825:25, 826:2,
913:15, 1009:10	signs [1] - 1000:16	856:15, 856:23,	879:15, 885:18,	839:12, 868:2,
shells [7] - 826:1,	silt [6] - 882:8, 882:11,	860:24, 861:7,	933:11, 1026:23,	868:14, 881:2,
883:7, 883:10,	882:24, 883:1,	863:14, 866:15,	1029:13	887:11, 887:12,
883:16, 894:20,	883:3, 887:14	870:11, 871:5,	somewhere [1] -	915:18, 916:7,
908:11, 982:1	similar [8] - 849:9,	871:9, 903:25,	910:8	919:11, 920:24,
shellstock [2] -	855:25, 868:22,	904:20, 921:1,	<b>sooner</b> [1] - 984:7	920:25, 921:2,
863:16, 866:17	868:23, 885:1,	926:23, 935:11,	<b>sorry</b> [41] - 824:12,	921:7, 924:4,
<b>Shields</b> [6] - 879:9,	895:18, 907:10,	947:1, 947:4, 979:8,	832:11, 846:17,	932:13, 935:12,
888:25, 889:3,	992:19	982:11, 982:12,	847:4, 847:5,	937:13, 979:9
896:11, 914:6,	<b>similarly</b> [6] - 865:14,	983:21, 984:14,	858:13, 859:17,	<b>spawned</b> [2] - 902:20,
950:12	922:23, 942:1,	985:5, 985:7, 1023:8, 1023:11,	862:7, 863:1,	902:22
<b>shields</b> [9] - 883:13,	952:24, 953:10,	1023:16	867:11, 872:18,	<b>spawning</b> [2] - 840:21, 840:24
889:24, 890:3, 890:25, 892:16,	961:12		874:13, 881:16,	speaking [2] - 855:2,
J UJU.ZU, UJZ. IU,	cimple to: OOF-16			
	<b>simple</b> [3] - 905:16 THI	E REPORTING GI	ROUP 13, 003.21,	<b>opening</b> [2] occ.2,

	ı			1
971:15	973:15, 974:4,	814:17, 814:20,	steps [2] - 860:16,	838:17, 988:21,
SPECIAL [46] -	974:6, 975:14,	862:4, 862:15,	946:16	998:3, 998:15,
814:11, 816:2,	980:3, 981:20,	875:19, 909:23,	<b>Steve</b> [4] - 945:20,	1003:6
819:23, 820:4,	982:17, 982:19,	910:3, 910:14,	945:24, 949:2,	stressed [6] - 817:7,
859:24, 878:5,	991:18, 996:15,	911:11, 911:22,	949:11	821:20, 821:21,
878:11, 886:7,	996:19, 997:8,	946:16, 946:19,	still [39] - 819:22,	831:2, 849:17,
887:1, 892:4,	997:11, 997:24,	966:9, 967:10,	820:5, 840:16,	1000:16
905:12, 906:1,	998:3, 999:3,	967:15, 989:11,	844:1, 844:17,	strike [2] - 942:22,
906:5, 913:20,	1000:5, 1000:12,	1008:4, 1015:7,	868:17, 881:5,	1021:4
913:23, 939:7,	1000:13, 1000:22,	1031:3	881:25, 885:16,	string [2] - 948:25,
939:13, 939:22,	1001:22, 1009:4	state-wide [1] -	901:10, 912:24,	950:3
939:24, 940:5,	stable [5] - 849:11,	1021:9	922:17, 923:22,	stroke [1] - 965:5
955:10, 968:4,	849:14, 849:19,	statement [25] -	927:24, 929:22,	strong [1] - 999:20
969:19, 972:1,	956:15, 1026:21	831:17, 831:18,	931:16, 932:17,	strongly [2] - 967:2,
972:7, 972:14,	stack [1] - 954:25	835:20, 849:9,	933:18, 943:22,	1001:17
978:19, 990:6,	staff [5] - 914:6,	870:23, 873:10,	947:20, 962:4,	
990:8, 1010:9,	922:25, 931:8,	873:24, 874:2,	965:14, 966:22,	<b>structure</b> [8] - 867:24,
1010:19, 1011:2,	931:10, 995:15	886:16, 902:10,	966:23, 968:24,	868:10, 875:14,
1010:19, 1011:2,	stage [2] - 825:4,	903:24, 904:20,	970:6, 975:2, 975:7,	895:3, 908:16,
1025:19, 1025:23,	825:10	925:15, 925:16,	975:8, 982:9,	908:18, 934:23, 938:17
1026:5, 1026:15,	stages [7] - 824:3,	925:18, 926:3,	975.6, 982.9, 982:10, 991:24,	
1027:5, 1028:3,	825:3, 825:5, 826:9,	936:1, 958:1, 959:2,	992:17, 1004:3,	structures [1] - 907:3 students [1] - 900:5
1028:13, 1028:19,	826:10, 894:21	959:9, 970:11,	1013:6, 1024:7,	
1028:23, 1029:4,	Stakeholders [1] -	994:6, 994:7, 995:3,	1015:4, 1027:23	studies [1] - 827:16
1029:16, 1029:23	1028:20	1006:20	stimulation [1] -	study [1] - 1021:14
Special [8] - 837:5,		statements [6] -	916:13	stuff [1] - 974:25
971:16, 972:6,	stand [2] - 920:15,	821:25, 870:3,		<b>style</b> [1] - 899:13
977:18, 990:2,	1001:14	875:9, 960:17,	stock [5] - 827:15,	<b>sub</b> [31] - 827:8,
991:15, 991:17,	standing [17] - 827:7,	996:5, 1029:14	828:2, 831:8, 840:5,	831:6, 834:18,
1001:2	827:14, 827:15,		840:6	835:4, 835:9,
specific [1] - 955:2	827:18, 827:25,	<b>States</b> [1] - 1013:18 <b>states</b> [16] - 823:17,	stocks [19] - 827:7,	835:12, 836:10,
specifically [3] -	828:1, 830:24,	824:8, 824:9,	827:14, 827:17,	836:13, 836:17,
941:3, 975:20,	831:8, 831:9, 840:5,	830:11, 832:2,	827:18, 827:25,	838:16, 839:17,
1022:10	845:22, 854:10,	844:6, 844:25,	830:24, 831:9, 844:14, 845:2,	839:19, 842:14,
spill [18] - 829:24,	870:8, 870:10,	846:21, 848:22,	845:23, 854:10,	844:14, 845:2,
832:5, 832:23,	977:10, 992:15	849:14, 856:4,	857:25, 870:8,	845:15, 848:1,
832:24, 834:23,	<b>start</b> [11] - 828:8,	870:7, 910:25,	870:10, 977:1,	848:6, 850:21,
835:19, 842:17,	888:19, 919:20,	923:5, 977:6, 1025:3	977:10, 992:15,	870:10, 870:16,
843:11, 856:8,	919:24, 920:4,	<b>STATES</b> [1] - 814:1	1019:5, 1019:11	871:7, 876:23,
858:10, 858:14,	965:12, 965:16,	stating [2] - 845:13,	stone [18] - 890:11,	900:22, 960:23,
861:1, 871:12,	968:15, 978:23, 1025:15	866:19	891:3, 891:5, 891:9,	961:1, 961:4,
928:22, 962:18,			891:13, 891:22,	984:24, 985:14,
1023:3, 1024:21,	started [8] - 889:20,	<b>station</b> [2] - 945:22, 946:24	892:11, 892:18,	1005:19, 1023:14
1023:3, 1024:21,	929:9, 929:24,	stations [10] - 946:1,	893:24, 893:25,	sub-adult [2] - 827:8,
<b>split</b> [1] - 930:3	938:6, 949:5, 964:19, 983:24,	946:2, 946:20,	894:3, 894:7,	1005:19
sponges [1] - 980:8	1027:13	946.2, 946.20, 946:22, 947:9,	894:10, 894:22,	sub-legal [28] - 831:6,
spot [1] - 976:15		946:22, 947:9, 947:10, 947:21,	940:10, 940:25,	834:18, 835:4,
spread [1] - 1005:9	starting [3] - 823:5,		980:2, 1007:17	835:9, 835:12,
spring [1] - 918:4	903:11, 983:7	974:5, 974:11, 997:10	stopped [2] - 910:15,	836:10, 836:13,
Spur [10] - 926:12,	starts [9] - 817:1,		911:11	836:17, 838:16,
	863:6, 863:9,	statistical [1] - 945:6	stopping [1] - 1019:8	839:17, 839:19,
926:20, 974:21,	867:19, 888:24,	<b>statistics</b> [4] - 943:2,	Storm [1] - 890:21	842:14, 844:14,
975:3, 998:21,	913:24, 921:4,	1017:21, 1018:17,		845:2, 845:15,
999:1, 1000:23,	993:21, 998:20	1020:24	storm [1] - 890:23	848:1, 848:6,
1001:4, 1009:4, 1027:11	<b>STATE</b> [2] - 814:3,	status [1] - 930:19	storms [1] - 885:13	870:10, 870:16,
	814:6	stay [4] - 849:9, 882:4,	story [1] - 833:15	871:7, 876:23,
<b>square</b> [3] - 895:24,	<b>state</b> [7] - 828:20,	953:25, 1006:5	strange [1] - 916:2	900:22, 960:23,
896:19, 896:22	835:24, 848:14,	stayed [1] - 976:17	strategies [1] - 860:7	961:1, 961:4,
squared [1] - 894:23	850:2, 912:18,	stenographic [1] -	Street [1] - 814:12	984:24, 985:14,
<b>St</b> [26] - 928:25, 929:3,	912:21, 1021:9	1031:5	street [1] - 961:7	1023:14
972:22, 973:3,	<b>State</b> [20] - 814:15 TH]	E REPORTING G	ROUP [6] - <b>827</b> :4,	sub-legals [1] -
	N	Jason & Lockha	rt	

850:21 821:1 survive [2] - 935:11, table [4] - 941:17, texture [1] - 924:6 subject [11] - 823:6. suggesting [1] -1018:23 941:19. 951:15. Thais [1] - 979:25 878:3, 878:7, 881:7, 933:12 1025:17 survived [2] - 935:5, **THE** [17] - 814:1, 900:11, 900:21, suggests [1] - 849:21 935:7 tables [1] - 831:3 972:2, 972:17, 939:18, 982:20, suitable [5] - 825:6, tabletop [1] - 885:2 990:4, 990:7, 990:9, **surviving** [1] - 817:6 990:23, 998:12, 825:7, 826:16, talks [2] - 974:3, 1011:7, 1026:4, suspect [2] - 946:3, 999:13 887:8, 982:22 996:18 1026:7, 1026:18, 947:17 submerged [2] summarizes [1] sustain [4] - 844:11, tap [1] - 882:23 1027:10, 1028:6, 989:12, 989:18 846:22 848:24, 959:23, temperatures [1] -1028:15, 1028:22, submitted [3] -1029:3, 1029:9, summarizing [1] -987:2 924:8 835:23, 846:14, 1030:13 932:1 Sustainable [1] tend [1] - 894:3 865:1 **Summary** [1] - 867:4 1028:21 themselves [3] tenure [1] - 911:6 subscribe [1] -826:21, 1026:8, summary [8] - 816:21, sustainable [2] term [15] - 817:12, 1031:10 1026:9 820:7, 867:20, 987:4, 1008:16 819:18, 826:5, subsequently [1] theory [1] - 978:15 871:20, 949:14, sustained [3] - 892:4, 827:15, 829:19, 860:12 955:14, 1003:12, therefore [2] - 821:20, 978:19, 1017:2 867:22, 867:24, substantial [5] -1006:17 951:24 sustaining [2] -868:12, 876:2, 943:12, 943:16, thinking [4] - 874:13, summer [10] - 832:5, 849:22, 850:4 887:16, 887:19, 944:18, 945:9, 879:19, 912:6, 832:22, 833:15, swept [2] - 973:21, 893:18, 908:15, 959:11 860:11, 877:7, 925:21 973:22 928:8, 981:7 substantially [2] -915:5, 915:20, third [2] - 820:6, swim [1] - 1026:11 terminology [7] -870:13, 953:7 972:25, 976:16, 1024:10 825:13, 864:24, swimming [1] substrate [22] -1009:1 893:6, 902:7, thoughts [1] - 890:12 826:10 823:11, 823:17, summers [1] -903:21, 921:7, thousands [1] switched [1] - 911:7 823:18, 823:23, 1016:18 925:21 885:12 sworn [3] - 866:4, 824:5, 824:16, summertime [1] -905:10, 965:24 terms [10] - 823:16, threat [5] - 842:18, 824:21, 825:12, 833:12 824:23, 826:2, 843:5, 843:11, synopsis [1] - 931:7 826:21, 868:1, 835:11, 835:15, 856:13, 860:17 supervisor [2] - 889:6, synthesize [1] -868:12, 870:12, 949:6 840:3, 855:5, 884:6, three [6] - 833:12, 1006:15 880:9, 884:16, 991:9, 1001:25 833:13, 845:16, supply [1] - 1005:12 system [8] - 869:4, 887:10, 887:15, support [3] - 844:20, terrible [1] - 918:18 849:10, 880:7, 925:2, 972:19, 893:10, 893:12, 845:4, 988:11 terrific [1] - 816:2 912:10 972:22, 973:7, 901:16, 916:25, thriving [1] - 1008:18 test [2] - 927:11, **suppose** [1] - 928:4 985:18, 1016:19 1026:10 supposed [9] - 837:7, 1009:13 throughout [23] systems [2] - 985:18, substrates [1] testified [7] - 860:15, 821:10, 821:23, 837:14, 837:16, 985:19 1026:8 843:20, 843:22, 876:22, 895:25, 826:9, 843:4, subtidal [2] - 879:4, 844:11, 844:20, 913:4, 924:21, 857:3, 883:25, Т 880:11 845:4, 846:2, 849:8, 943:3, 997:17 948:4, 948:11 tab [47] - 819:20, succeeded [1] -**SUPREME** [1] - 814:1 testifying [2] - 967:13, 856:12, 912:11, 819:25, 846:13, 884:13 surely [1] - 875:23 1015:12 925:1, 932:14, 859:12, 859:23, success [3] - 826:17, 971:12, 975:25, surface [9] - 825:6, testimony [37] -866:10, 867:3, 964:13, 1027:6 977:16, 983:25, 825:7, 878:22, 822:15, 834:7, 867:14, 867:17, successful [7] -989:17, 991:21, 838:20, 841:16, 885:1. 896:16. 868:17, 868:19, 825:14, 825:15, 1001:22, 1006:1, 897:15, 897:19, 852:19, 855:6, 888:7, 888:11, 825:24, 908:6, 1012:11, 1027:15 857:5, 864:25, 908:1, 908:3 888:13, 913:18, 912:2, 921:24, 865:3, 865:5, 865:8, throw [3] - 818:16, surfaces [1] - 897:15 913:24, 914:3, 921:25 896:1, 926:3 surge [1] - 884:7 865:14, 866:5, 922:6, 922:11, successor [2] - 966:6, throwing [1] - 900:25 874:3. 882:2. surprise [2] - 1014:2, 930:25, 931:2, thumbnail [1] - 982:11 885:24, 886:1, 1014:4 931:4, 941:10, suffering [2] - 878:25, 886:5, 886:9, surprising [2] ticket [1] - 947:24 945:11, 948:18, 1025:4 886:13, 886:22, tickets [3] - 947:25, 1014:5, 1014:7 948:22, 949:18, sufficient [4] - 838:5, 892:9, 892:11, 1018:18 surrounded [1] -958:7, 987:8, 844:18, 845:3, 903:18, 905:10, tidal [5] - 884:7, 894:7 991:25, 992:20, 851:25 940:14, 940:19, 973:18, 975:22, survey [1] - 895:5 993:11, 995:20, suggest [10] - 817:22, 944:22, 965:24, 981:25, 1000:1 surveys [4] - 846:22, 1004:2, 1004:3, 829:8, 848:2, 852:3, 966:21, 966:23, tide [1] - 973:22 883:12, 889:15, 1004:6, 1006:8, 865:19, 932:12, 967:14, 967:17, time-set [1] - 846:20 957:11 1017:10, 1017:11, 956:18, 1004:23, 967:21, 967:23, timetables [1] survival [5] - 826:20, 1017:13, 1024:7, 1022:5, 1030:2 968:8, 968:10 965:10 831:6, 916:15, 1007:14, 1027:1 THE REPORTING GROUP 3[1] - 1009:15 suggested [2] - 818:6, titled [1] - 1024:9

944:21, 945:8,

today [8] - 875:13, 890:10. 938:6. 967:13, 970:6, 973:4, 1010:25, 1025:16 together [10] - 819:1, 852:22, 859:4, 859:9, 861:11, 863:21, 876:8, 881:6, 916:23, 1012:8 tolerance [1] - 835:2 tolerances [1] -843:19 Tommy [1] - 989:21 tong [2] - 915:15, 976:5 tonger [1] - 819:10 tonging [14] - 864:23, 865:19, 866:20, 883:6, 883:7, 890:8, 914:10, 915:17, 917:17, 920:16, 979:7, 981:12, 986:3, 987:15 tongs [13] - 818:22, 818:25, 819:3, 837:7, 863:15, 864:22, 866:16, 885:4, 914:14, 917:20, 927:12, 927:14, 981:14 took [13] - 860:16, 900:6, 903:1, 909:23, 910:1, 936:5, 944:7, 966:25, 967:9, 969:14, 977:13, 986:5, 1018:1 tool [1] - 908:20 **Top** [1] - 1009:5 **top** [17] - 841:5, 847:8, 847:20, 856:1, 859:18, 880:19, 899:10, 914:23, 917:3, 922:15, 923:5, 926:10, 926:12, 931:4, 941:14, 941:16, 945:15 **topic** [2] - 907:11, 941:5 topics [2] - 862:11, 941:5 topographic [1] -885:5 topography [1] -885:16 tops [1] - 885:17 torture [1] - 943:21

total [1] - 949:16 845:25, 846:2, totally [3] - 855:13, 851:12, 916:7, 878:13, 883:15 touched [4] - 818:10, 828:24, 829:1, 829:23 tough [1] - 996:23 toward [5] - 842:20, 843:6, 843:13, 856:15, 962:13 towards [1] - 912:19 track [1] - 916:18 traditionally [2] -1008:4, 1008:15 tragedy [1] - 846:9 TRANSCRIPT [1] -814:9 transcript [4] - 873:23, 874:13, 965:21, 1031:5 transcription [1] -969:15 transcripts [1] -873:15 transferred [1] - 949:8 trash [7] - 864:23, 865:19, 866:20, 986:3, 986:20, 987:1, 987:4 Trends [1] - 992:8 trends [1] - 836:14 tributaries [1] - 973:17 tried [7] - 943:14, 983:5, 985:9, 1001:10, 1013:25, 1023:1, 1028:18 trip [9] - 828:15, 849:23, 849:24, 850:5, 942:13, 947:23, 947:25, 1018:18 trips [9] - 828:17, 828:25, 849:21, 942:6, 950:17, 950:21, 951:3, 951:19, 952:16 trochophore [1] -826:14 Tropical [1] - 890:21 trouble [4] - 842:5, 851:18, 864:4, 885:8 true [14] - 828:19, 835:20, 870:3, 870:23, 873:10, 874:12, 875:9, 1023:6, 1023:12, 937:22, 962:20,

945:7, 992:1, 1016:6, 1028:17, 1030:3 trying [22] - 826:15, 832:10, 851:15, 857:18, 858:2, 876:3, 885:22, 887:20, 902:3, 903:3, 903:20, 907:24, 961:20, 986:13, 986:14, 997:19, 997:23, 1002:1, 1008:6, 1009:13, 1009:14, 1018:11 **TS** [1] - 890:16 turn [21] - 816:19, 822:22, 828:3, 834:11, 867:1, 869:11, 917:1, 922:6, 926:9, 930:24, 987:8, 991:25, 992:7, 993:11, 994:10, 995:19, 996:8, 998:16, 1002:3, 1006:8, 1006:18 turning [3] - 945:10, 948:18, 1018:19 twice [4] - 952:16, 952:17, 952:19, 952:20 two [45] - 822:1, 822:16, 832:16, 835:11, 836:3, 836:4, 836:23, 845:15, 848:4, 849:10, 849:15, 855:5, 857:5, 870:13, 888:16, 891:3, 910:2, 910:10, 917:1, 925:9, 927:21, 928:11, 928:12, 950:13, 956:8, 957:10, 957:12, 959:19, 960:21, 965:9, 967:6, 975:5, 977:11, 979:24, 991:12, 1003:4, 1004:21, 1016:17, 1021:15, 1021:22, 1021:25, 1022:19,

1021:15, 1023:6 type [15] - 830:4, 853:3, 853:6, 864:3, 865:21, 876:5, 882:7, 888:3, 894:24, 895:18, 897:1, 898:11, 899:14, 899:15, 914:9 types [7] - 835:25, 876:2, 895:2, 907:2, 914:5, 979:22, 980:9 typical [4] - 825:10, 881:3, 894:1, 1021:16 typically [28] - 817:12, 818:21, 819:7, 819:10, 823:22, 825:5, 825:7, 853:1, 853:2, 864:1, 864:3, 882:9, 885:4, 885:10, 897:3, 908:9, 908:10, 916:6, 922:2, 928:8, 972:20, 973:18, 979:15, 980:7, 980:11, 1016:17, 1021:22

#### U

**U.S** [1] - 877:23 unabated [2] - 844:13, 845:1 uncertain [1] - 848:22 uncertainties [2] -856:11, 861:4 uncommon [1] -865:20 unculled [1] - 865:16 under [18] - 820:6, 822:14, 857:23, 876:12, 879:6, 879:9, 932:2, 946:7, 948:11, 979:16, 980:7, 989:19, 1007:3, 1009:21, 1009:25, 1011:14, 1011:17, 1015:21 underneath [2] -816:21, 846:19 underproducing [1] -932:5 underreport [1] -946:9 underreported [3] -943:8, 943:10, 961:6 underreporting [12] -943:13, 943:17, GROUP 5, 944:18, 12:19, 943:20,

945:9, 948:6, 948:12, 948:17 undertaken [1] - 923:6 unfair [2] - 905:4, 905:11 unfortunately [2] -843:9, 917:2 unharvested [1] -878:25 unhealthy [1] - 841:19 unit [1] - 819:15 United [1] - 1013:18 **UNITED** [1] - 814:1 unless [1] - 977:18 unlikely [1] - 978:12 unlimited [1] - 851:16 unpredictable [2] -843:5. 856:13 unprudent [1] -857:24 unskilled [1] - 865:21 unusual [3] - 948:1, 948:5, 981:23 unwieldy [1] - 954:24 up [72] - 816:3, 816:11, 823:21, 823:22, 823:25, 832:25, 837:1, 837:6, 847:20, 864:23, 865:4, 879:21, 880:4, 881:13, 881:18, 883:7, 883:10, 885:12, 886:19, 888:20, 890:8, 892:8, 894:4, 894:9, 894:16, 896:14, 896:19, 897:16, 898:6, 898:13, 898:18, 899:19, 910:2, 914:7, 916:25, 924:22, 931:1, 938:4, 943:23, 947:10, 950:3, 957:3, 960:3, 960:17, 968:2, 968:6. 968:7. 972:15, 977:3, 981:12, 981:13, 982:1, 982:2, 982:11, 986:20, 987:20, 1001:14, 1014:17, 1016:10, 1017:8, 1020:8, 1021:1, 1021:8, 1021:24, 1021:25, 1022:11, 1023:1, 1023:5, 1024:1, 1027:7

1023:18

888:16

two-pages [1] -

THE REPORTING

964:25, 966:20,

trust [1] - 906:22

try [10] - 841:13,

985:21, 993:8, 993:9

upcoming [2] -844:20. 845:5 useful [1] - 997:22 uses [1] - 852:9 utilized [1] - 932:20

# V

value [3] - 839:24, 839:25, 977:4 values [1] - 945:9 variation [1] - 955:23 variations [1] - 982:20 various [8] - 825:3, 831:4, 858:21, 908:17, 913:1, 971:22, 980:9, 1025:5 vastly [1] - 865:22 versus [3] - 909:6, 934:9, 940:11 vessel [1] - 832:15 Veteran's [1] - 1030:8 viable [1] - 1005:14 video [20] - 872:24, 873:2, 873:8, 873:16, 873:23, 874:5, 874:6, 875:1, 900:6, 934:13, 935:19, 936:21, 937:20, 968:18, 970:4, 970:20, 971:8, 977:21, 978:3, 992:2 videoed [1] - 872:25 videotaped [1] -968:22 view [21] - 843:7, 856:16, 857:9, 874:11, 876:4, 880:24, 920:5, 920:10, 965:3, 966:18, 970:6, 988:5, 988:25, 990:23, 993:6, 995:5, 995:8, 995:11, 1007:9, 1007:22, 1011:20 viewed [3] - 873:10, 873:18, 874:4 Vincent [23] - 928:25, 929:3, 958:24, 959:10, 972:22, 974:4, 974:6, 975:14, 981:20, 982:17, 991:18, 996:15, 996:19, 997:8, 997:24, 998:3, 999:3, 1000:5, 1000:12,

1000:13, 1000:22, 1001:22, 1014:22 Vincent's [3] - 982:19, 997:11, 1009:4 vine [1] - 858:5 violent [2] - 885:13, 885:15 visit [1] - 991:1 vitality [2] - 839:3, 840:1 voice [1] - 972:15 **VOLUME** [1] - 814:5 volume [3] - 915:13, 917:9, 1029:1 vulnerable [1] -985:23

# W

walk [2] - 996:5, 1026:11 walked [1] - 975:22 walkway [1] - 920:14 Walton [11] - 970:2, 970:18, 971:6, 978:2, 987:19, 993:22, 994:18, 996:22, 997:4, 999:8, 1024:14 wants [1] - 895:22 Ward [1] - 989:21 ward [1] - 990:12 warned [3] - 854:9, 959:22, 1023:7 warning [6] - 844:24, 849:2, 851:24, 852:2, 855:15, 959:20 warnings [1] - 853:14 watch [1] - 840:24 Water [1] - 1028:21 water [33] - 819:2, 819:16, 824:25, 826:11, 826:14, 836:25, 843:21, 879:6, 879:9, 882:6, 897:6, 902:20, 943:4, 970:8, 971:1, 973:14, 973:17, 973:20, 973:21, 973:25, 975:9, 977:23, 986:21, 989:2, 994:8, 999:20, 1001:12, 1001:20, 1007:5, 1010:3, 1012:15, 1012:16, 1028:2 waters [1] - 1005:17

Waterway [5] -

973:10, 976:7,

976:9, 1000:7, 1028:1 wave [3] - 826:13, 882:23, 981:25 ways [2] - 907:15, 953:22 weak [2] - 988:1, 993:1 weather [1] - 1016:3 week [4] - 851:13, 853:11, 932:8, 932:20 weekend [4] -1010:15, 1029:24, 1030:6, 1030:9 weighed [1] - 946:25 weight [1] - 947:3 weighted [1] - 896:1 welcome [1] - 1025:19 west [1] - 973:19 Western [1] - 922:16 western [12] - 923:8, 924:2, 925:1, 925:13, 925:22, 926:7, 929:3, 973:1, 973:2, 980:1, 999:1, 1009:2 westernmost [2] -

991:19, 1000:11 westward [1] -1001:20 whatsoever [1] -884:9 whereas [2] - 834:3, 956:3

866:14 WHEREOF [1] -1031:10 whichever [2] - 919:8, 919:13 white [4] - 904:17,

wherein [2] - 863:13,

914:20, 918:18, 926:11

whole [9] - 826:18, 841:2, 846:2, 846:6, 917:20, 961:19, 976:11, 979:7, 1018:25

wide [5] - 821:13, 821:14, 901:23, 903:13, 1021:9

wider [1] - 835:14

widespread [2] -986:23

Wildlife [17] - 829:25, 830:7, 832:25, 843:16, 852:9,

941:22. 945:1. THE REPORTING GROUP Sed [2] -

955:14, 1015:10, 1015:15, 1015:18, 1018:2, 1018:6, 1018:8, 1023:8 Wilson [1] - 905:5 wind [2] - 826:13, 973:18 WINE [54] - 814:17, 881:10, 885:21, 886:20, 892:1, 904:23, 905:23, 906:2, 921:13, 933:15, 939:11, 954:12, 955:5, 967:25, 968:5, 968:12, 969:13, 969:20, 969:22, 970:2, 970:5, 970:18, 970:21,

971:6, 971:9, 972:5, 978:2, 978:4, 978:20, 987:19, 987:21, 993:22, 993:24, 994:18, 994:22, 996:22, 997:1, 997:3, 997:5, 999:7, 999:11,

1010:5, 1010:16, 1010:21, 1010:23, 1011:4, 1011:11, 1023:25, 1024:3, 1024:6, 1024:13, 1024:16, 1025:12,

1029:22 wine's [1] - 1014:10 winter [11] - 829:22,

833:11, 842:17, 844:11, 848:7, 848:25, 850:8, 853:11, 860:13,

959:24, 974:8 wipe [1] - 961:22

wise [1] - 916:19 WITNESS [17] - 972:2,

972:17, 990:4,

990:7, 990:9, 1011:7, 1026:4, 1026:7, 1026:18, 1027:10, 1028:6,

1028:15, 1028:22, 1029:3, 1029:9, 1030:13, 1031:10

witness [13] - 885:25, 886:23, 904:25, 905:2, 905:24,

906:3, 906:4, 939:10, 968:2, 971:15, 978:18

Witness [1] - 815:2

885:15, 894:25 word [6] - 877:25, 895:12, 901:9, 902:3, 961:7, 976:2 words [3] - 818:19, 821:11. 864:12 Workers [2] - 860:8, 860:18 works [1] - 889:5

workshop [1] - 853:3 worried [1] - 1008:21 worse [1] - 975:13

worth [1] - 955:16 write [7] - 822:17, 834:15, 864:2, 864:5, 867:20, 933:4, 1029:7

writing [5] - 855:12, 863:4, 864:15, 864:21, 866:18

written [12] - 835:22, 865:8, 865:14, 866:4, 872:2, 872:21, 873:4. 873:9, 874:3, 878:21, 972:11,

987:9 wrote [12] - 842:23, 844:22, 846:11, 857:10, 864:10, 864:16, 870:18, 871:14, 929:17,

946:12, 985:6, 1022:22

Υ

yards [2] - 915:14, 918:17 year [35] - 840:22, 840:23, 845:8, 845:21, 848:11,

849:24, 852:17, 858:4, 910:10,

912:12, 912:23, 929:14, 948:10, 952:5, 953:3,

953:21, 953:24, 955:22, 955:23,

957:17, 974:24, 975:1, 1015:3,

1016:23, 1020:3, 1020:4, 1020:9, 1020:14, 1020:21,

1021:15, 1023:6, 1024:20 years [46] - 836:3,

836:4, 836:23, 848:4, 849:15, 849:25, 855:11, 857:6, 858:18,

858:19, 870:13, 885:12, 885:13, 889:7, 889:10, 889:20, 894:2, 905:9, 910:2, 912:2, 912:4, 912:6, 912:7, 913:17, 935:2, 955:16, 956:9, 957:10, 957:12, 959:15, 959:19, 960:21, 974:18, 977:12, 1003:4, 1004:21, 1009:13, 1012:6, 1012:9, 1012:10, 1021:22, 1021:25, 1022:19, 1023:12, 1023:18, 1023:21 yesterday [9] -816:12, 818:10, 819:22, 828:24, 829:24, 852:12, 876:22, 924:21, 1013:25 yield [1] - 918:8 yielding [2] - 843:7, 856:15 yourself [2] - 861:10, 863:20 YouTube [1] - 874:24

# Ζ

**zero** [5] - 887:7, 915:19, 917:10, 939:22, 939:23

THE REPORTING GROUP