

APPENDIX A

United States Court of Appeals
for the Fifth Circuit

No. 25-50100
Summary Calendar

United States Court of Appeals
Fifth Circuit

FILED

November 17, 2025

Lyle W. Cayce
Clerk

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff—Appellee,

versus

DENNIS LENIN CARRANZA-CLAVEL,

Defendant—Appellant.

Appeal from the United States District Court
for the Western District of Texas
USDC No. 2:24-CR-1952-1

Before BARKSDALE, OLDHAM, and DOUGLAS, *Circuit Judges.*

PER CURIAM:*

Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel pleaded guilty to illegal reentry of the United States, in violation of 8 U.S.C. § 1326. He challenges his within-Guidelines three-year term of supervised release. He asserts for the first time on appeal that, his being a deportable defendant, the district court erred by imposing supervised release on him without providing an individualized

* This opinion is not designated for publication. *See* 5TH CIR. R. 47.5.

No. 25-50100

justification, as required by Sentencing Guidelines § 5D1.1(c); and such imposition violates the principles of due process, the separation of powers doctrine, and the Eighth Amendment’s prohibition on excessive punishment.

Because Carranza did not preserve these issues in district court, review is only for plain error. *E.g., United States v. Broussard*, 669 F.3d 537, 546 (5th Cir. 2012). Under that standard, Carranza must show a forfeited plain error (clear-or-obvious error, rather than one subject to reasonable dispute) that affected his substantial rights. *Puckett v. United States*, 556 U.S. 129, 135 (2009). If he makes that showing, we have the discretion to correct the reversible plain error, but generally should do so only if it “seriously affect[s] the fairness, integrity or public reputation of judicial proceedings”. *Id.* (citation omitted). Both of his assertions fail under this demanding standard of review. He fails to satisfy plain-error review.

Concerning imposing supervised release on Carranza—again, a deportable defendant—without providing an individualized justification, the above-cited Guideline § 5D1.1(c) provides: “The court ordinarily should not impose a term of supervised release in a case in which supervised release is not required by statute and the defendant is a deportable alien who likely will be deported after imprisonment”. Along that line, “supervised release should not be imposed [on a deportable defendant] absent a determination that supervised release would provide an added measure of deterrence and protection based on the facts and circumstances of a particular case”. *United States v. Dominguez-Alvarado*, 695 F.3d 324, 329 (5th Cir. 2012). The court considered Carranza’s criminal history and likelihood of recidivism, showing the court likely imposed the supervised release term as “an added measure of deterrence”. *Id.*; *E.g., United States v. Cancino-Trinidad*, 710 F.3d 601, 606–07 (5th Cir. 2013) (holding deportable defendant’s “criminal record

No. 25-50100

support[ed] a finding that the imposition of [supervised release] would provide an added measure of deterrence . . .” (citation omitted). Accordingly, even assuming a clear or obvious error, he fails to show the imposition of supervised release without an individualized justification affects his substantial rights. *See id.* at 606 (“A sentencing error affects a defendant’s substantial rights if he can show a reasonable probability that, but for the district court’s misapplication of the Guidelines, he would have received a lesser sentence.” (citation omitted)); *Dominguez-Alvarado*, 695 F.3d at 327–28.

As for the claim that supervised release on deportable defendants violating due process principles, the separation of powers doctrine, and the Eighth Amendment, Carranza does not “show error in the straightforward applications of existing cases”; he therefore fails to show the requisite clear-or-obvious error. *See United States v. Jones*, 88 F.4th 571, 574 (5th Cir. 2023), *cert. denied*, 144 S. Ct. 1081 (2024) (citation omitted).

AFFIRMED.

United States Court of Appeals

FIFTH CIRCUIT
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

LYLE W. CAYCE
CLERK

TEL. 504-310-7700
600 S. MAESTRI PLACE,
Suite 115
NEW ORLEANS, LA 70130

November 17, 2025

MEMORANDUM TO COUNSEL OR PARTIES LISTED BELOW

Regarding: Fifth Circuit Statement on Petitions for Rehearing
or Rehearing En Banc

No. 25-50100 USA v. Carranza-Clavel
USDC No. 2:24-CR-1952-1

Enclosed is a copy of the court's decision. The court has entered judgment under Fed. R. App. P. 36. (However, the opinion may yet contain typographical or printing errors which are subject to correction.)

Fed. R. App. P. 39 through 41, and Fed. R. App. P. 39, 40, and 41 govern costs, rehearings, and mandates. **Fed. R. App. P. 40 require you to attach to your petition for panel rehearing or rehearing en banc an unmarked copy of the court's opinion or order.** Please read carefully the Internal Operating Procedures (IOP's) following Fed. R. App. P. 40 for a discussion of when a rehearing may be appropriate, the legal standards applied and sanctions which may be imposed if you make a nonmeritorious petition for rehearing en banc.

Direct Criminal Appeals. Fed. R. App. P. 41 provides that a motion for a stay of mandate under Fed. R. App. P. 41 will not be granted simply upon request. The petition must set forth good cause for a stay or clearly demonstrate that a substantial question will be presented to the Supreme Court. Otherwise, this court may deny the motion and issue the mandate immediately.

Pro Se Cases. If you were unsuccessful in the district court and/or on appeal, and are considering filing a petition for certiorari in the United States Supreme Court, you do not need to file a motion for stay of mandate under Fed. R. App. P. 41. The issuance of the mandate does not affect the time, or your right, to file with the Supreme Court.

Court Appointed Counsel. Court appointed counsel is responsible for filing petition(s) for rehearing(s) (panel and/or en banc) and writ(s) of certiorari to the U.S. Supreme Court, unless relieved of your obligation by court order. If it is your intention to file a motion to withdraw as counsel, you should notify your client promptly, **and advise them of the time limits for filing for rehearing and certiorari.** Additionally, you MUST confirm that this information was given to your client, within the body of your motion to withdraw as counsel.

Sincerely,

LYLE W. CAYCE, Clerk



By: _____
Casey A. Sullivan, Deputy Clerk

Enclosure(s)

Ms. Laura Elena Durbin
Mr. Joseph Ostini
Mr. Zachary Carl Richter

APPENDIX B

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
Western District of Texas
DEL RIO DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

v.

Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952(1)-EG
USM Number: 24143-511

(1) Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
Defendant

JUDGMENT IN A CRIMINAL CASE
(For Offenses Committed On or After November 1, 1987)

The defendant, (1) Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel, was represented by Jackson L. Lindsey (Appointed).

The defendant pled guilty to Count(s) One of the Indictment on November 1, 2024. Accordingly, the defendant is adjudged guilty of such Count(s), involving the following offense(s)

| <u>Title and Section</u> | <u>Nature of Offense</u> | <u>Offense Ended</u> | <u>Count(s)</u> |
|---------------------------|---|----------------------|-----------------|
| 8 U.S.C. § 1326(a)&(b)(2) | Illegal Re-Entry into the United States | July 6, 2024 | One |

As pronounced on February 6, 2025, the defendant is sentenced as provided in pages 2 through 6 of the judgment. The sentence is imposed pursuant to the Sentencing Reform Act of 1984.

It is further ordered that the defendant shall notify the United States Attorney for the district within 30 days of any change of name, residence, or mailing address until all fines, restitution, costs, and special assessments imposed by the Judgment are fully paid. If ordered to pay restitution, the defendant shall notify the Court and United States Attorney of any material change in the defendant's economic circumstances.

Signed this the 6th day of February 2025.



ERNEST GONZALEZ
United States District Judge

Arresting Agency: United States Border Patrol

Defendant: Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952 (1)-EG

IMPRISONMENT

The defendant is hereby committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a term of **THIRTY-SIX (36) MONTHS** as to count One with credit for time served, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3584(a).

The defendant shall remain in custody pending service of sentence.

RETURN

I have executed this judgment as follows:

Defendant delivered on _____ to _____
At _____ with a certified copy of the Judgment.

United States Marshal

By _____
Deputy Marshal

Defendant: Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952 (1)-EG

SUPERVISED RELEASE

Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall be on supervised release for a term of **THREE (3) YEARS**.

While on supervised release, the defendant shall comply with the mandatory, standard, and if applicable, the special conditions that have been adopted by the court.

Defendant: Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952 (1)-EG

MANDATORY CONDITIONS

- 1) The defendant shall not commit another federal, state, or local crime during the term of supervision.
- 2) The defendant shall not unlawfully possess a controlled substance.
- 3) The defendant shall refrain from any unlawful use of a controlled substance. The defendant shall submit to one drug test within 15 days of release on probation or supervised release and at least two periodic drug test thereafter (as determined by the court) but the condition stated in this paragraph may be ameliorated or suspended by the court if the defendant’s presentence report or other reliable sentencing information indicates low risk of future substance abuse by the defendant.
- 4) The defendant shall cooperate in the collection of DNA as instructed by the probation officer, if the collection of such a sample is authorized pursuant to section 3 of the DNA Analysis Backlog Elimination Act of 2000 (42 U.S.C. § 14135a).
- 5) If applicable, the defendant shall comply with the requirements of the Sex Offender Registration and Notification Act (34 U.S.C. § 20901, *et seq* (formally 42 U.S.C. § 16901, *et seq*)) as instructed by the probation officer, the Bureau of Prisons, or any state sex offender registration agency in which the defendant resides, works, is a student, or was convicted of a qualifying offense.
- 6) If convicted of a domestic violence crime as defined in 18 U.S.C. §3561(b), the defendant shall participate in an approved program for domestic violence.
- 7) If the judgment imposes a fine or restitution, it is a condition of supervision that the defendant pay in accordance with the Schedule of Payments sheet of the judgment.
- 8) The defendant shall pay the assessment imposed in accordance with 18 U.S.C. § 3013.
- 9) The defendant shall notify the court of any material change in the defendant’s economic circumstances that might affect the defendant’s ability to pay restitution, fines or special assessments.

Defendant: Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952 (1)-EG

STANDARD CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

- 1) The defendant shall report to the probation office in the federal judicial district where he or she is authorized to reside within 72 hours of release from imprisonment, unless the probation officer instructs the defendant to report to a different probation office or within a different time-frame.
- 2) After initially reporting to the probation office, the defendant will receive instructions from the court or the probation officer about how and when to report to the probation officer, and the defendant shall report to the probation officer as instructed.
- 3) The defendant shall not knowingly leave the federal judicial district where he or she is authorized to reside without first getting permission from the court or the probation officer.
- 4) The defendant shall answer truthfully the questions asked by the probation officer.
- 5) The defendant shall live at a place approved by the probation officer. If the defendant plans to change where he or she lives or anything about his or her living arrangements (such as the people the defendant lives with), the defendant shall notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, the defendant shall notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
- 6) The defendant shall allow the probation officer to visit the defendant at any time at his or her home or elsewhere, and the defendant shall permit the probation officer to take any items prohibited by the conditions of the defendant's supervision that are observed in plain view.
- 7) The defendant shall work full-time (at least 30 hours per week) at a lawful type of employment, unless the probation officer excuses the defendant excused from doing so. If the defendant does not have full time employment, he or she shall try to find full-time employment, unless the probation officer excuses the defendant from doing so. If the defendant plans to change where the defendant works or anything about his or her work (such as the position or job responsibilities), the defendant shall notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer at least 10 days in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, the defendant shall notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
- 8) The defendant shall not communicate or interact with someone the defendant knows is engaged in criminal activity. If the defendant knows someone has been convicted of a felony, the defendant shall not knowingly communicate or interact with that person without first getting the permission of the probation officer.
- 9) If the defendant is arrested or questioned by a law enforcement officer, the defendant shall notify the probation officer within 72 hours.
- 10) The defendant shall not own, possess, or have access to a firearm, ammunition, destructive device, or dangerous weapon (i.e., anything that was designed, or was modified, for the specific purpose of causing bodily injury or death to another person such as nunchakus or tasers).
- 11) The defendant shall not act or make any agreement with a law enforcement agency to act as a confidential human source or informant without first getting the permission of the court.
- 12) If the probation officer determines that the defendant poses a risk to another person (including an organization), the probation officer may require the defendant to notify the person about the risk and the defendant shall comply with that instruction. The probation officer may contact the person and confirm that the defendant has notified the person about the risk.
- 13) The defendant shall follow the instructions of the probation officer related to the conditions of supervision.
- 14) If the judgment imposes other criminal monetary penalties, it is a condition of supervision that the defendant pay such penalties in accordance with the Schedule of Payments sheet of the judgment.
- 15) If the judgment imposes a fine, special assessment, restitution, or other criminal monetary penalties, it is a condition of supervision that the defendant shall provide the probation officer access to any requested financial information.
- 16) If the judgment imposes a fine, special assessment, restitution, or other criminal monetary penalties, it is a condition of supervision that the defendant shall not incur any new credit charges or open additional lines of credit without the approval of the probation officer, unless the defendant is in compliance with the payment schedule.
- 17) If the defendant is excluded, deported, or removed upon release on probation or supervised release, the term of supervision shall be a non-reporting term of probation or supervised release. The defendant shall not illegally re-enter the United States. If the defendant is released from confinement or not deported, or lawfully re-enters the United States during the term of probation or supervised release, the defendant shall immediately report in person to the nearest U.S. Probation Office.

Defendant: Dennis Lenin Carranza-Clavel
 Case Number: 2:24-CR-01952 (1)-EG

CRIMINAL MONETARY PENALTIES/SCHEDULE

The defendant shall pay the following total criminal monetary penalties in accordance with the schedule of payments set forth. Unless the Court has expressly ordered otherwise, if this judgment imposes imprisonment, payment of criminal monetary penalties is due during the period of imprisonment. Criminal Monetary Penalties, except those payments made through Federal Bureau of Prisons’ Inmate Financial Responsibility Program shall be paid through the Clerk, United States District Court, Attn: Mail Log, 111 E. Broadway Ste. 100, Del Rio, Texas 78840, or online by Debit (credit cards not accepted) or ACH payment (direct from Checking or Savings Account) through pay.gov (link accessible on the landing page of the [U.S.District Court’s Website](#)). **Your mail-in or online payment must include your case number in the exact format of DTXW224CR001952-001 to ensure proper application to your criminal monetary penalty.**

The defendant shall receive credit for all payments previously made toward any criminal monetary penalties imposed.

| | <u>Assessment</u> | <u>Fine</u> | <u>Restitution</u> | <u>AVAA Assessment*</u> | <u>JVTA Assessment**</u> |
|--------|-------------------|-------------|--------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| TOTAL: | \$100.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |

Special Assessment

It is ordered that the defendant shall pay to the United States a special assessment of \$100.00. The debt is incurred immediately.

Fine

The fine is waived because of the defendant’s inability to pay.

If the defendant makes a partial payment, each payee shall receive an approximately proportioned payment, unless specified otherwise in the priority order or percentage payment column above. However, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3664(i), all non-federal victims must be paid before the United States is paid.

If the fine is not paid, the court may sentence the defendant to any sentence which might have been originally imposed. See 18 U.S.C. §3614.

The defendant shall pay interest on any fine or restitution of more than \$2,500.00, unless the fine or restitution is paid in full before the fifteenth day after the date of the judgment, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. §3612(f). All payment options may be subject to penalties for delinquency and default, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. §3612(g).

Payments shall be applied in the following order: (1) assessment, (2) restitution principal, (3) restitution interest, (4) AVAA assessment, (5) fine principal, (6) fine interest, (7) community restitution, (8) JVTA Assessment, (9) penalties, and (10) costs, including cost of prosecution and court costs.

Findings for the total amount of losses are required under Chapters 109A, 110, 110A, and 113A of Title 18 for offenses committed on or after September 13, 1994, but before April 23, 1996.

* Amy, Vicky, and Andy Child Pornography Victim Assistance Act of 2018, Pub. L. No. 115-299.

**Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act of 2015, Pub. L. No. 114-22