

# **EXHIBIT A**

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**SMARTFLASH LLC,**  
*Appellant*

v.

**SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.,  
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., APPLE INC,  
GOOGLE LLC,**  
*Appellees*

**ANDREI IANCU, UNDER SECRETARY OF  
COMMERCE FOR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY  
AND DIRECTOR OF THE UNITED STATES  
PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE,**  
*Intervenor*

---

**SMARTFLASH LLC,**  
*Appellant*

v.

**APPLE INC**  
*Appellee*

**ANDREI IANCU, UNDER SECRETARY OF  
COMMERCE FOR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY  
AND DIRECTOR OF THE UNITED STATES  
PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE,**

*Intervenor*

---

**SMARTFLASH LLC,**  
*Appellant*

**v.**

**APPLE INC, GOOGLE LLC,**  
*Appellees*

**ANDREI IANCU, UNDER SECRETARY OF  
COMMERCE FOR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY  
AND DIRECTOR OF THE UNITED STATES  
PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE,**  
*Intervenor*

---

2016-2451, 2016-2452, 2016-2455, 2016-2457, 2016-2458,  
2017-1056, 2017-1102, 2017-1104, 2017-1109, 2017-1110,  
2017-1111, 2017-1833, 2017-1834, 2017-1835, 2017-1836,  
2017-1837, 2017-1846, 2017-1847

---

Appeals from the United States Patent and Trade-  
mark Office, Patent Trial and Appeal Board in Nos.  
CBM2014-00190,   CBM2014-00192,   CBM2014-00193,  
CBM2014-00194,   CBM2015-00016,   CBM2015-00017,  
CBM2015-00028,   CBM2015-00029,   CBM2015-00031,  
CBM2015-00032,   CBM2015-00033,   CBM2015-00059,  
CBM2015-00117,   CBM2015-00118,   CBM2015-00119,  
CBM2015-00120,   CBM2015-00121,   CBM2015-00123,  
CBM2015-00124,   CBM2015-00125,   CBM2015-00126,  
CBM2015-00127,   CBM2015-00130,   CBM2015-00131,  
CBM2015-00132,   CBM2015-00133.

---

## JUDGMENT

---

AARON MARTIN PANNER, Kellogg, Huber, Hansen, Todd, Evans & Figel, PLLC, Washington, DC, argued for appellant. Also represented by NICHOLAS O. HUNTER; MICHAEL CASEY, GREGORY A. KRAUSS, Davidson Berquist Jackson & Gowdey, LLP, McLean, VA.

MARK ANDREW PERRY, Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP, Washington, DC, argued for all appellees. Appellee Apple Inc. also represented by BRIAN BUROKER; BLAINE H. EVANSON, BRADLEY JOSEPH HAMBURGER, JENNIFER RHO, Los Angeles, CA; HERVEY MARK LYON, Palo Alto, CA; BRETT ROSENTHAL, Dallas, TX; JON STEVEN BAUGHMAN, Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison LLP, Washington, DC; DOUGLAS HALLWARD-DRIEMEIER, Ropes & Gray LLP, Washington, DC; JAMES RICHARD BATCHELDER, East Palo Alto, CA.

MICHAEL J. MCKEON, Fish & Richardson, PC, Washington, DC, for appellees Samsung Electronics America, Inc., Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. Also represented by WALTER KARL RENNER; CRAIG E. COUNTRYMAN, San Diego, CA.

CHARLES KRAMER VERHOEVEN, Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP, San Francisco, CA, for appellee Google LLC. Also represented by MELISSA J. BAILY.

WILLIAM LAMARCA, Office of the Solicitor, United States Patent and Trademark Office, Alexandria, VA, argued for intervenor. Also represented by NATHAN K. KELLEY, THOMAS W. KRAUSE, FARHEENA YASMEEN RASHEED.

---

THIS CAUSE having been heard and considered, it is

ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

PER CURIAM (LOURIE, DYK, and TARANTO, *Circuit Judges*).

**AFFIRMED. See Fed. Cir. R. 36.**

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT

April 11, 2018  
Date

/s/ Peter R. Marksteiner  
Peter R. Marksteiner  
Clerk of Court