## No. 19-<u>1392</u>

#### IN THE

# Supreme Court of the United States

THOMAS E. DOBBS, M.D., M.P.H., STATE HEALTH OFFICER OF THE MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, ET AL., Petitioners, v.

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, ET AL., Respondents.

### On Writ of Certiorari to the **United States Court of Appeals** for the Fifth Circuit

#### JOINT APPENDIX

LYNN FITCH Attorney General WHITNEY H. LIPSCOMB Deputy Attorney General SCOTT G. STEWART Solicitor General <i>Counsel of Record</i> JUSTIN L. MATHENY Deputy Solicitor General WILSON MINOR Special Assistant Attorney General MISSISSIPPI ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE P.O. Box 220 Jackson, MS 39205-0220 scott.stewart@ago.ms.gov (601) 359-3680 Counsel for Petitioners	HILLARY SCHNELLER <i>Counsel of Record</i> JULIE RIKELMAN CENTER FOR REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS 199 Water Street New York, NY 10038 (917) 637-3777 hschneller@reprorights.org CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN ALEXIA D. KORBERG AARON S. DELANEY PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON, LLP 1285 Ave of the Americas New York, NY 10019 (212) 373-3000 ROBERT B. MCDUFF MISSISSIPPI CENTER FOR JUSTICE 767 North Congress Street Jackson, MS 39202 (601) 969-0802 <i>Counsel for Respondents</i>
--	--

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI FILED JUNE 15, 2020 **CERTIORARI GRANTED MAY 17, 2021** 

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

# Page

Relevant Docket Entries – District Court for the Southern District of Mississippi	1
Relevant Docket Entries – U.S. Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit	10
Declaration of Sacheen Carr-Ellis, M.D., M.P.H., in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment (Phase I)	16
Declaration of Martina Badell, M.D., in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment (Phase I)	30
Dr. Mary Currier's Responses to Plaintiffs' First Set of Requests for Admission to Defendants	55
Order Granting Petition for a Writ of Certiorari Limited to Question 1	60

#### NOTICE

The following opinions, decisions, orders, and judgments have been omitted in printing this joint appendix because they appear on the following pages in the appendix to the petition for a writ of certiorari:

**APPENDIX A: OPINION, Fifth Circuit** Court of Appeals (December 13, 2019) ......1a APPENDIX B: ON PETITION FOR REHEARING EN BANC, Fifth Circuit APPENDIX C: ORDER GRANTING PERMANENT INJUNCTION, District Court, Southern District of Mississippi (November 20, 2018) ......40a APPENDIX D: ORDER, District Court, Southern District of Mississippi (August APPENDIX E: ORDER ON DISCOVERY. District Court, Southern District of Mississippi (May 15, 2018)......58a APPENDIX F: TEMPORARY RESTRAIN-ING ORDER, District Court, Southern District of Mississippi (March 20, 2018) .....62a APPENDIX G: Miss. Code Ann. § 41-41-191 Gestational Age Act.....65a APPENDIX H: DECLARATION OF MAUREEN L. CONDIC, Ph.D., District Court, Southern District of Mississippi (August 3, 2018) ......75a

## 1 DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI

#### No. 3:18-cv-00171

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, et al.,

v.

THOMAS E. DOBBS, M.D., M.P.H., et al.

## **RELEVANT DOCKET ENTRIES**

DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
03/19/2018	1	COMPLAINT against Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier, Mississippi State Board of Medical Licensure (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 34643049387), filed by Jackson Women's Health Organization, Sacheen Carr-Ellis. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit House Bill No. 1510 (As Sent to Governor), # 2 Civil Cover Sheet)(LAT) (Entered: 03/19/2018)
03/19/2018	5	MOTION for Temporary Restrain- ing Order by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (Attachments: #1 Affidavit Declaration of Dr. Carr-Ellis) (McDuff, Robert) (Entered: 03/19/ 2018)

		2
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
03/19/2018	6	***ERROR***DISREGARD THIS ENTRY. MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order Memorandum in Support by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (McDuff, Robert) Modified on 3/20/2018 (cwl). (Entered: 03/19/ 2018)
03/20/2018	7	MEMORANDUM in Support re 5 MOTION for Temporary Restrain- ing Order filed by Sacheen Carr- Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (McDuff, Robert) (Entered: 03/20/2018)
03/20/2018	8	DEFENDANTS' Exhibit List for Motion hearing held on 3/20/2018 before Judge Reeves. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit D-1 House Bill 1510, # 2 Errata D-2 Article)(JS) (Entered: 03/20/2018)
03/20/2018	9	ORDER granting 5 Motion for TRO. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 3/20/2018. (AC) (Entered: 03/20/2018)
03/26/2018	16	MOTION to Adopt Plaintiffs' Pro- posed Schedule and Limit Discov- ery to Exclude Legally Immaterial Issues by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (McDuff, Robert) (Entered: 03/26/2018)

		3
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
03/28/2018		TEXT-ONLY ORDER extending the temporary restraining order at Docket No. 9 by 14 days to Friday, April 13, 2018, pursuant to a show- ing of good cause as required under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 3/28/2018. NO FUR- THER WRITTEN ORDER SHALL ISSUE. (cr) (Entered: 03/28/2018)
04/09/2018	23	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants, filed by Jackson Women's Health Organization, Sacheen Carr-Ellis.(Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 04/09/2018)
04/11/2018	25	ORDER extending TRO and sepa- rating claims in this case. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 4/11/2018. (cr) (Entered: 04/11/2018)
04/16/2018	26	MOTION for Reconsideration re 25 Order by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 04/16/2018)
04/16/2018	27	MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT re 26 MOTION for Reconsideration re 25 Order filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 04/16/2018)

		4
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
04/27/2018	32	AMENDED ANSWER to 23 Amend- ed Complaint by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 04/27/2018)
04/27/2018	33	Response in Opposition re 16 MOTION to Adopt Plaintiffs' Pro- posed Schedule and Limit Discov- ery to Exclude Legally Immaterial Issues by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (McDuff, Robert) filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit H.B. 1510) (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 04/27/2018)
04/27/2018	34	MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION re 16 MOTION to Adopt Plaintiffs' Proposed Schedule and Limit Discov- ery to Exclude Legally Immaterial Issues filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 04/27/2018)
04/30/2018	35	RESPONSE in Opposition re 26 MOTION for Reconsideration re 25 Order filed by Sacheen Carr- Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Delaney - PHV, Aaron) (Entered: 04/30/2018)

		5
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
04/30/3018	36	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re 26 MOTION for Reconsideration re 25 Order filed by Sacheen Carr- Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Delaney - PHV, Aaron) (Entered: 04/30/2018)
05/04/2018	38	REPLY to Response to Motion re 16 MOTION to Adopt Plaintiffs' Proposed Schedule and Limit Dis- covery to Exclude Legally Immate- rial Issues, 33 Response in Opposi- tion, filed by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 05/04/2018)
05/08/2018	39	Rebuttal re 26 MOTION for Recon- sideration re 25 Order filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 05/07/2018)
05/15/2018	41	ORDER granting 16 Motion to Lim- it Discovery and Adopt Discovery Schedule. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 5/15/2018. (cr) (Entered: 05/15/2018)
05/15/2018	42	ORDER denying 26 Motion for Reconsideration. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 5/15/2018. (cr) (Entered: 05/15/2018)

DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS

- 07/26/2018 65 MOTION in Limine to Preclude Irrelevant Opinion and Testimony of Defendants' Expert Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D. by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - State Defendants' Designation of Experts for Phase I & Decl. of Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D.)(Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 07/26/2018)
- 07/26/2018 66 MEMORANDUM in Support re 65 MOTION in Limine to Preclude Irrelevant Opinion and Testimony of Defendants' Expert Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D. filed by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 07/26/2018)
- 08/03/2018 74Response in Opposition re 65 MOTION in Limine to Preclude Irrelevant Opinion and Testimony of Defendants' Expert Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D. by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Attachments: #1 Exhibit A - State Defendants' Designation of Experts for Phase I & Decl. of Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D.) (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Attachments: #1 Exhibit A -**Defendants' Designation of Experts**

		7
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
		with all attachments) (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 08/03/2018)
08/03/2018	75	MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION re 65 MOTION in Limine to Pre- clude Irrelevant Opinion and Testimony of Defendants' Expert Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D. filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 08/03/2018)
08/07/2018	76	REPLY to Response to Motion re 74 Response in Opposition,, 65 MOTION in Limine to Preclude Irrelevant Opinion and Testimony of Defendants' Expert Maureen L. Condic, Ph.D. filed by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 08/07/2018)
08/15/2018	77	ORDER granting in part and denying in part 65 Motion in Limine. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 8/15/2018. (AC) (Entered: 08/15/2018)
08/24/2018	81	MOTION for Summary Judgment (Phase I) by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (Attachments: #1 Affidavit Exhibit 1 - Declaration of Sacheen Carr-Ellis, M.D., M.P.H., in Sup- port of Plaintiffs' Motion for Sum- mary Judgment (Phase I), #2

DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS	

- Affidavit Exhibit 2 Declaration of Martina Badell, M.D., in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment (Phase I), # 3 Exhibit Exhibit 3 - Dr. Mary Currier's Responses to Plaintiffs' First Set of Requests for Admission to Defendants)(Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 08/24/2018)
- 08/24/2018 82 MEMORANDUM in Support re 81 MOTION for Summary Judgment (Phase I) filed by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organization (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 08/24/2018)
- 09/07/2018 MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION 85 re 81 MOTION for Summary Judgment (Phase I) filed by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - HB 1510, # 2 Exhibit 2 - Declaration of Maureen Condic, # 3 Exhibit 3 - Excerpts from Depo of Dr. Carr-Ellis, # 4 Exhibit 4 - 2014 Miss. Laws ch. 506 (H.B. 1400), # 5 Exhibit 5 - (Redacted) Plaintiffs' responses to first set of interrogatories, # 6 Exhibit 6 -Bartlett article)(Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 09/07/2018)

		<b>č</b>
DATE	NO.	PROCEEDINGS
09/14/2018	86	REPLY to Response to Motion re 81 MOTION for Summary Judgment (Phase I), 85 Memorandum in Oppo- sition, filed by Sacheen Carr-Ellis, Jackson Women's Health Organiza- tion (Schneller - PHV, Hillary) (Entered: 09/14/2018)
10/18/2018	87	ORDER extending Temporary Restraining Order. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 10/18/2018. (CL) (Entered: 10/18/2018)
11/20/2018	89	ORDER granting 81 Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment. Signed by District Judge Carlton W. Reeves on 11/20/2018. (CL) (Entered: 11/20/2018)
12/17/2018	93	NOTICE OF APPEAL (18-60868) as to 89 Order on Motion for Summary Judgment by Kenneth Cleveland, Mary Currier. Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number 0538- 3877848. Appeal Record due by 1/2/2019 (Barnes-State Gov, Paul) (Entered: 12/17/2018)

# U.S. COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

#### No. 18-60868

#### **RELEVANT DOCKET ENTRIES**

#### DATE PROCEEDINGS CIVIL RIGHTS CASE docketed. NOA 12/17/2018 filed by Appellants Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs [18-60868] (RLL) [Entered: 12/18/2018 09:35 AM] APPELLANT'S BRIEF FILED # of 03/06/2019 Copies Provided: 0 A/Pet's Brief deadline satisfied. Appellee's Brief due on 04/05/2019 for Appellees Sacheen Carr-Ellis and Jackson Women's Health Organization. Paper Copies of Brief due on 03/12/2019 for Appellants Kenneth Cleveland and Thomas E. Dobbs. [18-60868] **REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The** original text prior to review appeared as follows: APPELLANT'S BRIEF FILED by Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs. Date of service: 03/06/2019 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Barnes, Minor; Attorney for Appellees: Delaney, McDuff, Orlansky, Rikelman, Schneller [18-60868] (Paul Eldridge Barnes ) [Entered: 03/06/2019

05:26 PM]

|--|

## PROCEEDINGS

- 04/05/2019 APPELLEES' BRIEF FILED. # of Copies Provided: 0. E/Res's Brief deadline satisfied. Reply Brief due on 04/26/2019 for Appellants Kenneth Cleveland and Thomas E. Dobbs. Paper Copies of Brief due on 04/10/2019 for Appellees Sacheen Carr-Ellis and Jackson Women's Health Organization. [18-60868] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: APPEL-LEE'S BRIEF FILED by Ms. Sacheen Carr-Ellis and Jackson Women's Health Organization. Date of service: 04/05/2019 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Barnes, Minor; Attorney for Amici Curiae: Bursch, Carmody, Hawkins, Strickland; Attorney for Appellees: Delaney, McDuff, Orlansky, Rikelman, Schneller [18-60868] (Hillary Schneller) [Entered: 04/05/2019 02:04 PM]
- 04/26/2019 APPELLANT'S REPLY BRIEF FILED # of Copies Provided: 0 Reply Brief deadline satisfied. Paper Copies of Brief due on 05/06/2019 for Appellants Kenneth Cleveland and Thomas E. Dobbs. [18-60868] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: APPEL-LANT'S REPLY BRIEF FILED by Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs. Date of service: 04/26/2019 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Barnes, Minor; Attorney for Amici Curiae:

DATE

PROCEEDINGS

Casamassima, Bursch, Carmody, Eisenberg, Fallon, Hawkins, Mac Avoy, Sarnoff, Smith, Strickland, Szyfer; Appellees: Delanev. Attornev for McDuff, Orlansky, Rikelman, Schneller (Paul Eldridge Barnes) [18-60868] [Entered: 04/26/2019 04:30 PM]

- 10/07/2019 ORAL ARGUMENT HEARD before Judges Higginbotham, Dennis, Ho. Arguing Person Information Updated for: Paul Eldridge Barnes arguing for Appellants Thomas E. Dobbs, Et Al; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Beth Ellen Klusmann arguing for Amicus Curiae State of Louisiana; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Hillary Schneller arguing for Appellees Jackson Women's Health Organization, Et Al. [18-60868] (PFT) [Entered: 10/07/2019 01:27 PM]
- 12/13/2019 PUBLISHED OPINION FILED. [18-60868 Affirmed ] Judge: PEH , Judge: JLD , Judge: JCH. Mandate issue date is 01/06/2020 (This opinion includes URL material that is archived by the Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals Library, and made available at http://www.lb5. uscourts.gov/ArchivedURLS/.) [18-60868] (NFD) [Entered: 12/13/2019 05:05 PM]

DATE	PROCEEDINGS
12/13/2019	JUDGMENT ENTERED AND FILED. Costs Taxed Against: Each Party to Bear Its Own Costs on Appeal. [18- 60868] (NFD) [Entered: 12/16/2019 10:55 AM]
12/27/2019	SUFFICIENT PETITION for rehearing en banc filed by appellants. [9218308-2] Mandate issue date canceled. Sufficient Rehearing due on 01/06/2020 for Appel- lants Kenneth Cleveland and Thomas E. Dobbs. Document is insufficient for the following reasons: The Statement of the facts is missing [18-60868]
	REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: PETITION filed by Appellants Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs for rehearing en banc [9218308- 2]. Date of Service: 12/27/2019 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Barnes, Minor; Attorney for Appellants: Barnes, Minor; Attorney for Amici Curiae: Bursch, Carmody, Casamassima, Eisenberg, Fallon, Hawkins, Klusmann, Mac Avoy, Sarnoff, Smith, Strickland, Szyfer; Attorney for Appellees: Delaney, Geise, Grusauskas, Hammerman, Korberg, McDuff, Orlansky, Rikelman, Schneller [18-60868] (Paul Eldridge Barnes ) [Entered: 12/27/2019 02:43 PM]
12/30/2019	REHEARING MADE SUFFICIENT filed by Appellants Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs and Mr. Kenneth Cleveland in 18-60868 [9218308-2]. Sufficient Rehearing due

DATE	PROCEEDINGS			
	deadline satisfied. Paper Copies of Rehearing due on 01/06/2020 for Appel- lants Kenneth Cleveland and Thomas E. Dobbs. [18-60868] (MAS) [Entered: 12/30/2019 03:41 PM]			
01/17/2020	COURT ORDER denying Petition for rehearing en banc filed by Appellants Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs and Mr. Kenneth Cleveland [9218 308-2] Without Poll. Mandate issue date is 01/27/2020 [9232413-1] [18-60868] (MAS) [Entered: 01/17/2020 10:44 AM]			
01/27/2020	MANDATE ISSUED. Mandate issue date satisfied. [18-60868] (MAS) [Entered: 01/27/2020 08:01 AM]			
03/24/2020	SUPREME COURT ORDER received extending time to file petition for writ of certiorari to 06/15/2020. Extension request filed by Appellants Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs. Application No. 19A1027. [9278878-1] [18-60868] (SMC) [Entered: 03/24/2020 03:27 PM]			
06/19/2020	SUPREME COURT NOTICE that peti- tion for writ of certiorari [9338165-2] was filed by Appellants Mr. Kenneth Cleveland and Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs on 06/15/2020. Supreme Court Number: 19-1392. [18-60868] (SMC) [Entered: 06/19/2020 04:18 PM]			

DATE	PROCEEDINGS
05/18/2021	SUPREME COURT ORDER received granting petition for writ of certiorari filed by Appellants Mr. Thomas E. Dobbs and Mr. Kenneth Cleveland in 18-60868 on 05/17/2021. [9576731-1] [18-60868] (SMC) [Entered: 05/18/2021 11:03 AM]

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI NORTHERN DIVISION

Case No. 3:18cv171-CWR-FKB

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, on behalf of itself and its patients,

and

SACHEEN CARR-ELLIS, M.D., M.P.H., on behalf of herself and her patients,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MARY CURRIER, M.D., M.P.H., in her official capacity as State Health Officer of the Mississippi Department of Health, *et al*.

Defendants.

#### DECLARATION OF SACHEEN CARR-ELLIS, M.D., M.P.H., IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT (PHASE I)

Sacheen Carr-Ellis, M.D., M.P.H., declares and states as follows:

1. I submit this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment (Phase I). I am a board-certified obstetrician/gynecologist (ob/gyn) licensed to practice medicine in Mississippi. I received my M.D. from Albany Medical College in 1999. After my residency in obstetrics and gynecology, I completed a fellowship in family planning at Boston University Medical Center in Boston, Massachusetts, which included training in abortion. I also hold a master's degree in public health from Boston University. My curriculum vitae, which sets forth my expertise and credentials in greater detail, is attached as Exhibit A.

2. The opinions in this declaration are my expert opinions, based on my education, clinical experience, attendance at conferences, and familiarity with the relevant medical literature.

#### Background

3. I have been providing abortion services since 1999. Over the course of my medical career, I have regularly provided both first trimester and second trimester abortions, including abortions after 15 weeks.

4. I joined Jackson Women's Health Organization ("the Clinic") in 2014 and became Medical Director in April 2015. To the best of my knowledge, the Clinic is the only regular provider of legal abortion in Mississippi.

5. As Medical Director, I oversee the Clinic's medical practice, including reviewing and establishing medical policies and protocols.

6. I am also one of the Clinic's clinicians and provide contraceptive and abortion services to the Clinic's patients. At the Clinic, I provide medication abortion up to 10 weeks from a patient's last menstrual period (LMP), consistent with current evidencebased medical practice, and aspiration (surgical) abortions up to 16 weeks 0 days LMP. 7. Over the last several years, the Clinic has provided more than 2,000 abortions per year.

8. The Clinic is open six days per week, but abortion procedures are typically offered on only two to three days per week. In general, each week, the Clinic provides abortion to at least one woman after 14 weeks 6 days LMP.

#### H.B. 1510 Bans Abortion Prior to Viability

9. I have reviewed Mississippi House Bill 1510, which bans abortion after 15 weeks LMP. As a ban on abortion after 15 weeks LMP, H.B. 1510 prohibits abortions months before the time in pregnancy when a fetus may be viable, by which I mean that in the judgment of the attending clinician on the particular facts of the case before him or her, there is a reasonable likelihood of the fetus's sustained survival outside the womb, with or without artificial support.

10. If the ban takes effect, the Clinic will have to stop providing abortions after 14 weeks 6 days LMP because neither I nor the Clinic's other clinicians can risk the civil and other penalties that the ban imposes. Patients seeking abortion in Mississippi after 14 weeks 6 days will either be forced to carry their pregnancy to term against their will or have to leave the state to obtain care.

11. Viability is medically impossible at 15 weeks LMP. Based on my education, training, and decades as a practicing ob-gyn, it is my medical opinion that viability does not occur in a normally developing pregnancy until at least 23 weeks LMP, and that some fetuses are never viable.

12. Several factors determine whether a particular fetus is viable, including the gestational age of the

fetus; the size of the fetus; the sex of the fetus; whether the fetus has any abnormalities; and whether it is a singleton or a multiple. Whether a particular fetus is viable also depends on whether the pregnant woman has been administered antenatal corticosteroids.<sup>1</sup>

13. The American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (ACOG) and the Society for Maternal-Fetal Medicine define "periviable birth" as delivery between 20.0 and 25.6 weeks LMP. Periviable infants do not survive without life-sustaining intervention immediately after birth.<sup>2</sup>

14. Recent studies, including from studies about infants born at several academic medical centers and reported to the National Institute for Child Health and Human Development Neonatal Research Network inform a recent consensus paper on periviable birth published in the American Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology.<sup>3</sup> The consensus paper lists survival to hospital discharge of 5-6% between 22 and 23 weeks LMP for infants born at Level III or Level IV neonatal intensive care units (NICUs).<sup>4</sup> That low survival rate does not indicate a reasonable likelihood of sustained

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Am. Coll. of Obstetricians & Gynecologists & Soc'y for Maternal-Fetal Med., *Obstetric Care Consensus No. 6: Periviable Birth*, 130 Obstetrics & Gynecology e187 (Oct. 2017) (Interim Update) ("ACOG"), https://www.acog.org/-/media/Obstetric-Care-Consensus-Series/occ006.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ACOG, at e187 & 191.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ACOG, at e188; *see also* Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development, NICHD Neonatal Research Network (NRN): Extremely Preterm Birth Outcome Data, https://www1.nichd.nih.gov/epbo-calculator/Pages/ epbo\_case.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> ACOG, at e188.

survival outside the womb, with or without artificial aid.<sup>5</sup>

15. Accordingly, guidance from the ACOG and the Society for Maternal-Fetal Medicine provides that only for infants at or greater than 24 weeks LMP is neonatal assessment for resuscitation recommended. For infants born at 22 weeks and before 24 weeks, neonatal assessment for resuscitation can be considered. Neonatal assessment for resuscitation is "not recommended" for periviable infants born prior to 22 weeks LMP.<sup>6</sup>

16. The ban presents me with an impossible choice: to face potential civil penalties and loss of my Mississippi medical license for continuing to safely provide abortion care or to stop providing my patients the care they seek and deserve.

 $<sup>^5</sup>$  Studies that report survival across the population have found lower rates between 22-23 weeks. See ACOG, e197, n.20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> ACOG, at e194.

# <u>Exhibit A</u>

### Curriculum Vitae Sacheen Nathan, MD, MPH



## **ACADEMIC TRAINING:**

5/1995 BS		College, ology and C	Schenectady,
5/1999 MD	Albany Medical College, Albany, NY		
12/2005 MPH		Univers Biostatistic	

## **POSTDOCTORAL TRAINING:**

7/1999-6/2003	Residency in Obstetrics and		
	Gynecology, New York Medical		
	College, New York, NY		
7/2003-6/2005	Fellowship in Family Planning		
	and Public Health, Boston		
	Medical Center, Boston, MA		

### ACADEMIC APPOINTMENTS:

2/2010-4/2014	Assistant Professor of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Boston Univer- sity School of Medicine, Boston, MA		
7/2005-2/2010	Instructor of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Boston University School of Medicine, Boston, MA		

## **HOSPITAL APPOINTMENTS:**

7/2005-4/2014	Attending Gynecologist, Boston		
	Medical Center, Boston, MA		

21

## **HOSPITAL AFFILIATION:**

4/2014-Present	Refer and follow privilege, Boston
	Medical Center, Boston, MA

## **OTHER PROFESSIONAL AND VOLUNTEER EXPERIENCE:**

6/1997-8/1997	Internship, New York State Department of Health, Bureau of Women's Health, New York, NY
11/2003-2008	Quincy Teen Mothers, Quincy High School, Quincy, MA
9/2004-Present	Healing Our Community Collaborative, Asylum Network, Boston, MA
7/2005-Present	Clinician, Planned Parenthood League of Massachusetts, Boston MA
2/2005	Clinical Workshops and Health Clinics, Marie Stopes Kenya, Nairobi Kenya
4/2005	Clinician Training in abortion and miscarriage management. Mexico City, Mexico
5/2013-12/2015	Clinician, Four Women Health Services, Attleboro MA
7/2014-4/2017	Clinician, Planned Parenthood South East, Atlanta GA
9/2014-Present	Clinician, Whole Women's Health, Baltimore MD
9/2015-Present	Clinician, Reproductive Health Services, Montgomery AL
1/2016-Present	Clinician, West Alabama Women's Center, Tuscaloosa AL

	23
10/2014-Present	Medical Director, Jackson Women's Health, Jackson MS
HONORS:	
1999	Dr. George C. Carter Award for growth and development of the Minority Affairs department, Albany Medical College, Albany, NY
2003	Resident Humanism Award, New York Medical College
2003	3rd Prize, Resident Research Award, New York Medical College
2003	Wyeth Pharmaceuticals New Leaders Award
2004	Wyeth Pharmaceuticals New Leaders Award
2008	CREOG Faculty Award for Excellence in Resident Teach- ing, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Boston Univer- sity School of Medicine, Boston, MA
I ICENSES AND CED	TELCATION

## LICENSES AND CERTIFICATION:

5/2003	Massachusetts License #216743
4/2014	New York License # 274959-1
4/2014	Georgia License #72378
5/2014	Maryland License #D77891
6/2014	Alabama License #MD.33448
9/2014	Mississippi License #23483

23

## 1/2007 American Board of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Diplomate #9007221

#### **DEPARTMENTAL AND UNIVERSITY COMMITTEES:**

11/2005-4/2014			Committee,
	MA Boston M	edical Cei	nter, Boston,
3/2013-4/2014	Board Me	ember, Bo	ston Univer-
	sity O	B/GYN	Foundation,

# Boston, MA

#### **TEACHING EXPERIENCE AND RESPONSIBILITIES:**

7/2005-4/2014	Core Faculty in Family Plan-
	ning Fellowship, Boston Medical
	Center, Boston, MA
7/2005-4/2014	Resident Teaching in Family

- 7/2005-4/2014 Resident Teaching in Family Planning and General Gynecology, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
- 7/2005-4/2014 Medical Student Teaching in Family Planning and General Gynecology, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA

#### MAJOR ADMINISTRATIVE RESPONSIBILITIES:

7/2005-4/2014	Director for 1st and 2nd year Medical Students in Medical Student for Choice-Sponsored Summer Rotation in Family Planning, Boston Medical Cen- ter, Boston, MA
7/2007-4/2014	Clinical Director of Family Plan-

ning, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA

	25
7/2008-4/2014	Director, 4th Year Boston Uni- versity Medical Student Elective in Family Planning, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2009-6/2013	Faculty Advisor for Ob/Gyn Residency Class of 2013
7/2008-7/2010	Faculty Advisor for OB/Gyn Pre- operative conference, Boston University Obstetrics and Gyne- cology. Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2009-4/2014	Director, Ryan Program in Resident Teaching in Family Planning, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2009-4/2014	Co Director, Fellowship in Fam- ily Planning, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
4/2015-present	Medical Director Jackson

## 4/2015-present Medical Director Jackson Women's Health Organization, Jackson MS

## MAJOR ADMINISTRATIVE PROJECTS:

7/2005	Development of the outpatient sterilization program. Boston University Obstetrics and Gyne- cology. Boston Medical Center
<b>7/</b> 2006	Planning Committee for Gyne- cologic Procedure Unit. Boston University Obstetrics and Gyne- cology. Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2009-4/2014	Scheduling for Family Planning Clinics. Boston University Ob-

	stetrics and Gynecology. Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2009-4/2014	Family Planning Billing Project, Boston University Obstetrics and Gynecology, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
7/2011-4/2014	Family Planning Protocol Updates, Boston University

- 7/2011-4/2014 Family Planning Protocol Updates, Boston University Obstetrics and Gynecology, Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA
- 5/2013-5/2014 Family Planning Project with homeless women in Boston, MHSA Scattered Sites, Dorchester, MA

#### **OTHER PROFESSIONAL ACTIVITIES:**

# **PROFESSIONAL SOCIETIES: MEMBERSHIPS, OFFICES, AND COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS**

1999-2008	Junior Fellow, American Con- gress of Obstetricians and Gynecologists
2003-Present	Association of Reproductive Health Providers
2006-Present	Massachusetts Medical Society
2009-Present	Fellow, American Congress of Obstetricians and Gynecologists
2013-Present	Affiliate Fellow, Society of Family Planning

## MAJOR COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS:

# **Private/Foundation**

1 IIvate/I bundation		
9/2005-6/2009		Executive Board Member, Abor- tion Access Project, Cambridge, MA
1/2011-8/2	2014	Board Member, Black Women's Health Imperative, Washington, DC
2/2014-pr	esent	Board Member, Population Con- nection, Washington DC
<b>Invited Lectures and Presentations:</b>		
1999		Sexual Function. Grand Rounds. olitan Hospital, New York, NY.
2000	Only E	ent Pregnancy and Abstinence ducation. Grand Rounds. Metro- Hospital, New York, NY.
2002	the Pu	ted Pregnancy and Title X of blic Health Service Act. Grand . Westchester Medical Center, a, NY.
2003	-	ts and Injectables. Avances es en Anticoncepcion. Bogotá, ia.
2003		Methods. Avances Recientes en cepcion. Bogotá, Colombia.
2003		awal, A good alternative? Avances es en Anticoncepcion. Bogotá, ia.
2003	England	l Abortion. 7h Annual New d Regional Conference Health ion Students for Choice. Boston,

	28
2004	Mifepristone Training for Primary Care Practitioners. Boston University Depart- ment of Family Medicine and the Abortion Access Project. Boston, MA.
2004	Why Emergency Contraception is Important to Your Practice: Key Facts for Providers. The New Hampshire Reproductive Health Association and Dartmouth-Hitchcock Medical Center. Laconia, NH.
2004	Intrauterine Contraception. East Boston Neighborhood Health Center. Boston MA.
2008	Long Acting Reversible Contraception. Family Planning Fellowship Meeting. New Orleans, LA.
2008	Overcoming Cultural Barriers in Contra- ceptive Care. Grand Rounds. Boston Medical Center, Boston, MA.
2009	Update on Long Acting Reversible Contraception. Grand Rounds. Tufts Medical Center, Boston, MA.
2010	Medication Abortion: Clinical Evidence and Managing Complications. Webinar. Ryan Training Program
2010	Clinical Conundrums: Contraception and the complicated Patient. Grand Rounds. Washington Hospital Center, Washington DC.
2010	Values Clarification Workshop. Washington Hospital Center, Washington DC
2010	The Modern IUD. Grand Rounds. Beverly Hospital, Beverly Massachusetts

#### **Bibliography:**

#### **TEXTBOOK CHAPTERS:**

 Stubblefield P, <u>Carr-Ellis S</u>, Kapp N. Family Planning. In *Berek & Novak's Gynecology 14th ed*. Lippincott Williams and Wilkins, Philadelphia, PA, 2007.

#### **ORIGINAL, PEER REVIEWED ARTICLES:**

- 1. <u>Carr-Ellis S</u>, Kapp N, Vragovic O, Borgatta L Randomized trial of buccal vs. vaginal misoprostol for induction of second trimester abortion. Contraception 2010;81(5):441-445
- Stubblefield P, <u>Carr-Ellis S</u>, Borgatta L. Methods for induced abortion. Obstet Gynecol. 2004;104 (1):174-185.
- 3. Kapp N, Borgatta L, <u>Carr-Ellis S</u>, Stubblefield P. Simultaneous very low dose mifepristone and vaginal misoprostol for medical abortion. Contraception 2006;73(5):525-7.
- 4. Green J, Borgatta L, Sia M, Kapp N, Saia K, <u>Carr-Ellis S</u>, Vragovic O. Intervention rates for placental removal following induction abortion with miso-prostol. Contraception 2007;76(4):310-3.

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI NORTHERN DIVISION

Case No. 3:18cv171-CWR-FKB

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, on behalf of itself and its patients,

and

SACHEEN CARR-ELLIS, M.D., M.P.H., on behalf of herself and her patients,

Plaintiffs,

MARY CURRIER, M.D., M.P.H., in her official capacity as State Health Officer of the Mississippi Department of Health, *et al.* 

v.

Defendants.

#### DECLARATION OF MARTINA BADELL, M.D., IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT (PHASE I)

Martina Badell, M.D., declares and states the following:

1. I submit this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment (Phase I). I am a board-certified obstetrician/gynecologist (OB/GYN) and a board-certified maternal-fetal medicine specialist, with years of experience in obstetrics, high risk pregnancies, ultrasound and prenatal diagnosis. Maternal-fetal medicine (also called perinatology) is an area of obstetrics that focuses on the medical management of high-risk pregnancy. My background and qualifications are set out in further detail below, as well as in my curriculum vitae, which is attached as Exhibit A.

2. The opinions in this declaration are my expert opinions, based on my education, research, clinical experience, attendance at conferences, and familiarity with the medical literature that is recognized as reliable in the medical profession. I offer the following opinions in my individual capacity and not as a representative of the institution at which I practice.

#### H.B. 1510 Bans Abortion Prior to Viability

3. I am familiar with Mississippi's ban on abortion after 15 weeks of pregnancy (the "ban"). The ban prohibits abortion before the point in pregnancy when a fetus is viable.

4. It is my medical opinion that a fetus is not viable after only 15 weeks of pregnancy, as measured from the last day of a woman's last menstrual period (LMP). It is also my opinion that, in a normally progressing pregnancy, a fetus does not have a reasonable likelihood of sustained survival outside the womb, with or without assistance, until at least 23 weeks, and that some fetuses are never viable.

5. Viability means there is a reasonable likelihood that a fetus will be able to survive for a sustained period of time outside the womb, either on its own or with assistance. The determination of viability is made in the judgment of the attending physician, based on the particular facts of the case before him or her. 6. Many factors determine whether a particular fetus is viable. These include the gestational age of the fetus; the weight of the fetus, and if there are any structural or genetic abnormalities. In addition, when a pregnant woman at risk for a pre-term delivery is administered antenatal corticosteroids prior to delivery, the fetus may be more likely to survive than if the pregnant woman is not provided antenatal corticosteroids.

7. Some fetuses are never viable because of certain abnormalities, such as an encephaly, osteogenesis imperfecta (perinatal lethal form), and short-rib polydactyly syndrome. As a result of these conditions, a fetus typically dies in utero or very soon after birth.

8. Even were all these factors aligned and in optimal circumstances—if, for example, the fetus has no abnormalities, and is normally grown—no fetus is viable at 15 weeks LMP.

9. Reported survival rates for periviable infants help inform physicians about when a fetus is typically viable, and what factors influence whether a particular fetus is viable. A consensus paper from the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (ACOG) and the Society for Maternal-Fetal Medicine (SMFM) defines the periviable period as delivery between 20.0 and 25.6 weeks LMP. A variety of factors influence whether a periviable fetus is able to survive, including whether the pregnant woman has been administered antenatal corticosteroids before delivery, and the type of equipment and medical care available to care for the infant after delivery. A periviable infant cannot survive without life-sustaining intervention immediately after birth.

10. The ACOG/Society for Maternal-Fetal Medicine consensus paper on periviable birth reports survival to discharge from the hospital at rates of 5-6% for fetuses between 22-23 weeks LMP. A recent large NICHD NRN study by Younge, et al., aimed to evaluate the changes over time in survival and neurodevelopmental outcomes among infants born at 22-24 weeks. That study found the rate of survival without neurodevelopmental impairment showed a small increase between 2000-2011. However, between 2008 and 2011, the study showed a 1% rate of survival for infants at 22 weeks without neurodevelopmental impairment; the survival rate for infants at 22 weeks with neurodevelopmental impairment was 2%. Such low rates of survival do not reflect a reasonable likelihood that a fetus will be able to survive outside the womb. Even with extraordinary medical intervention and under optimal circumstances, a fetus between 22-23 weeks LMP has an extremely small chance of survival.

11. Extraordinary, life-sustaining intervention is not generally possible before 22 weeks LMP. Before 22 weeks, for example, the lungs are not developed enough to allow for successful oxygenation even with the use of highly specialized ventilators, the arteries and veins are too small and fragile to support required access, and the skin is too fragile to protect the baby and maintain body temperature. Extracorporeal membrane oxygenation machines, which can support the heart and lungs in event of cardiopulmonary failure, cannot be utilized in deliveries prior to 34 weeks given requirement for full anticoagulation which cannot be safely done in very premature infants. In addition, the estimated fetal weight at 16 weeks is only 200 grams.

12.The National Institute for Child Health and Human Development (NICHD) Neonatal Research Network (NRN) created a tool to estimate outcomes for periviable births based on information collected from births at 22 to 25 weeks LMP in several academic Level III or Level IV neonatal intensive care units (NICU) centers. Level III or Level IV NICUs are high level facilities with specialized physicians, nurses, and equipment to care for preterm or critically ill infants. The NICHD Neonatal Research Network endorsed calculator can be used to assess extremely preterm birth outcomes using 5 factors (gestational age, birth weight, sex, singleton or twin pregnancy and administration of corticosteroids) which researchers determined to predict neonatal outcomes. The lowest gestational age for which outcomes can be predicted is 22 weeks as prior to that gestational age survival is not currently possible.

13. In light of these low survival rates, current recommendations, as endorsed by ACOG and SMFM, state that neonatal assessment for resuscitation is "recommended" for infants at or beyond 24 weeks LMP, and can be "considered" for infants between 22 and 24 weeks. Prior to 22 weeks, neonatal assessment for resuscitation is "not recommended."

14. Consistent with these recommendations, medical centers typically do not require resuscitation for infants less than 23 weeks LMP. For instance, where I practice, resuscitation is indicated for infants born at or after 24 weeks. Between 22-24 weeks, the decision whether to resuscitate is shared between the parents and the attending physicians, and physicians will not consider resuscitation unless the parents wish them to. Families are counseled about the likelihood of sustained survival at these gestational ages, including the low chance of survival at 22 weeks. Further, the decision whether to resuscitate is based on circumstances that vary with each case, taking into account the likelihood of survival of a particular infant.

15. My opinions are based on my education, experience, research, and expertise in obstetrics, gynecology, and maternal-fetal medicine. The sources I have considered in forming my opinions include, but are not limited to:

- Am. Coll. of Obstetricians & Gynecologists & Soc'y for Maternal-Fetal Med., Obstetric Care Consensus No. 6: Periviable Birth, 130 Obstetrics & Gynecology e187 (Oct. 2017) (Interim Update), https://www.acog. org/-/media/Obstetric-Care-Consensus-Se ries/occ006.pdf;
- National Institute of Child Health and Development, NICHD Neonatal Research Network (NRN): Extremely Preterm Birth Outcome Data, https://www1.nichd.nih.go v/epbo-calculator/Pages/epbo\_case.aspx;
- National Institute of Child Health and Development, NICHD Neonatal Research Network (NRN): Extremely Preterm Birth Outcome Data, https://www.nichd.nih.gov/ about/org/der/branches/ppb/programs/epb o/dataShow;
- Noelle Younge, et al., Survival and Neurodevelopmental Outcomes Among Periviabile Infants, 376 N. Eng. J. Med. 617 (2017);
- Matthew A. Rysavy, et al., *Between-Hospi*tal Variation in Treatment and Outcomes

*in Extremely Preterm Infants*, 372 N. Eng. J. Med. 1801 (2015);

- Pierre-Yves Ancel, et al., Survival and Morbidity of Preterm Children Born at 22 Through 34 Weeks' Gestation in France in 2011 Results of the EPIPAGE-2 Cohort Study, 169 JAMA Pediatrics 230 (2015);
- Jon E. Tyson, Intensive Care for Extreme Prematurity — Moving beyond Gestational Age, 358 N. Eng. J. Med. 1672 (2008);
- Lillian R. Blackmon, *The Biologic Limits* of *Viability*, 4 NeoReviews e140 (2003);
- Keith Moore, et al., The Developing Human: Clinically Oriented Embryology (10th edition)

16. I am an Assistant Professor in the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology at the Emory University School of Medicine, where I provide care to patients as a Maternal-Fetal Medicine specialist. My medical practice focuses women whose pregnancies are high risk, whether because the woman has an underlying maternal condition that is exacerbated by pregnancy, a pregnancy-related condition that puts the pregnancy at risk, or the pregnancy is affected by a fetal abnormality. I am also the Director of the Emory University Hospital Midtown Perinatal Center. In that capacity, I supervise a busy perinatal center with multiple perinatal sonographers, genetic counselors, and highrisk nurses. We perform detailed fetal ultrasounds, offer prenatal genetic testing, and perform inpatient and outpatient high risk pregnancy consultations. Additionally, I train maternal fetal medicine fellows and obstetrics and gynecology residents. As part of my medical practice it is my responsibility to counsel patients with complicated pregnancies requiring very early delivery about the expected perinatal outcomes. I work closely with my neonatology colleagues at Emory and collaborate with them in counseling and developing management plan for periviable fetuses.

17. I do not ordinarily provide abortion care and refer patients to abortion providers if an abortion is indicated based on maternal risk with pregnancy or fetal abnormalities diagnosed during prenatal care. I do perform selective reductions if a woman who is carrying higher-order multiple fetuses desires reduction in an attempt to improve the perinatal outcomes of the remaining fetuses.

18. I received my medical degree in 2006 from the University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry. I completed my residency in Obstetrics and Gynecology at the Emory University School of Medicine and then held a three-year fellowship in Maternal-Fetal Medicine at Emory. In 2015, I became the Assistant Director of the Maternal-Fetal Medicine Fellowship and have trained many medical students, residents, and fellows to be OB/GYNs and Maternal-Fetal Medicine physicians.

19. My research focuses on high-risk pregnancy, including HIV and pregnancy, and congenital heart defects in pregnancy. I have authored dozens of articles in peer-reviewed journals on diagnosis and pregnancy care for women with various medical conditions.

20. I am a member of several professional organizations, including ACOG, the Society for Maternal-Fetal Medicine, the American Institute of Ultrasound Medicine, and the Georgia Obstetrical and Gynecological Society. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct

<u>/s/ Martina Badell</u> Martina Badell, M.D.

Excecuted on August <u>20</u>, 2018 at <u>2:15 pm Atlanta,</u> <u>Georgia</u>

## 39

## Exhibit A

## CURRICULUM VITAE

Name:	Martina L. Badell, M.D.	
Address:	8th floor Medical Office Tower, Perinatal Center Emory University Hospital Midtown Atlanta, GA 30308	
<b>Telephone:</b>		
Fax:		
E-mail Address:		
Birthplace:	Glasgow, Scotland	
<b>Citizenship:</b>	United States of America	
Licensures:	Georgia Composite State Board of Medical Examiners, 2010	
Boards:	American Board of Obstetrics and Gynecology, 2011	
	Subspecialty board certified, American Board of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Maternal Fetal Medicine, 2015	
Current Title and Affiliation:		

**Primary:** Assistant Professor of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Division of Maternal-fetal Medicine, Emory University School of Medicine, 2013

## Joint and Secondary Appointments:

Guest Researcher, Center for Disease Control and Prevention, 2016

## **Clinical Appointments:**

Director, Emory University Hospital Midtown Perinatal Center, 2014

# Other Administrative Appointments:

Assistant Fellowship Director, Maternal-fetal Medicine Fellowship, 2015

## **Education:**

1997 - 2001	B.A. in Biochemistry with Honors,
	University of Texas, Austin, TX
1999 - 2000	Biochemistry Certificate, Queen
	Mary, University of London School
	of Biological Sciences, London,
	England
2001 - 2006	M.D. with Distinction in Commu-
	nity Service, University of Rochester
	School of Medicine and Dentistry,
	Rochester, NY

## **Postgraduate Training:**

2004 - 2005	Clinical Research Fellowship in
	Obstetrics and Gynecology Baylor
	College of Medicine, Houston, TX
	Mentor: Laura Goetzl, M.D.,
	M.P.H.
	The University of Texas Health
	Science Center at Houston, TX
	Mentor: Susan M. Ramin, M.D.

40

2006 - 2010	Internship/Residency in Gynecol- ogy and Obstetrics Emory University School of Medi- cine, Atlanta, GA
2010 - 2013	Fellowship in Maternal Fetal Medicine Emory University School of Medi- cine, Atlanta, GA

41

## **Honors and Awards:**

University of Texas at Austin

Top Graduate from a Texas High School Valedictorian Scholarship, 1997

Alpha Epsilon Delta, Premedical Honor Society, 1998

Du Pont Enrichment Scholarship in Biochemistry, 1998-1999

University of Texas College Scholar, 1998-2000 Phi Beta Kappa, 2001

University of Rochester School of Medicine and Dentistry

Office of Medical Education International Research Grant (Quito, Ecuador), 2002 Hoffman Day Group Volunteer Award, 2003

URSMD Class of 1996 Community Service Award, 2004

Gold Humanism Honor Society, 2004

Office of Medical Education Fellowship Award in Clinical Research, 2004-2005 Alpha Omega Alpha, 2005

Emory University School of Medicine Residency "Best Intern" Award, 2007 Golden Apple Award, 2007-2009 Bayer Healthcare Pharmaceutical Best Teaching Resident, 2008 John D. Thompson 42nd Resident Research Day, 2nd Place Research Proposal, 2008 CREOG Highest Score Award, 2008 Emory Gyn/Ob Class Representative, 2008-2009 Association of Professors of Gynecology and Obstetrics Resident Scholar, 2009 CREOG Honor Roll, 2009 John D. Thompson 43rd Resident Research Day, 2nd Place Research Project, 2009 Chief Administrative Resident, 2009-2010 Outstanding Clinician Award in Maternal-Fetal Medicine, 2010

Emory University School of Medicine Fellowship

Outstanding Clinical Research Proposal by a Fellow, 2011 Annual NICHD Aspen Conference on Maternal-Fetal-Reproductive Medicine Participant, 2011 Excellence in Teaching Residents Award 2012, 2013

Emory University School of Medicine Faculty

Excellence in Teaching, Maternal-Fetal Medicine Award, 2015 Council on Resident Education in Obstetrics and Gynecology National Faculty Award, 2015 Faculty Recognition Award, "Hidden Gem", 2015 Excellence in Teaching, Maternal-Fetal Medicine Award, 2016 Doctors Day, Featured Doctor, 2017

#### **Committee:**

#### **Regional:**

Georgia Fetal and Infant Mortality Review for HIV, Member, 2015-present Perinatal HIV Services Coordination Committee, Member, 2015-present

## Institutional:

Clinical Competency Committee, Emory University Department of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Member, 2013- present

Gynecology and Obstetrics Residency Selection Committee, 2013

Emory University Hospital Midtown Quality Enhancement Committee, Member 2014present

Program Evaluation Committee, Emory University Department of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Member, 2013- present

Program Evaluation Committee, Emory University Department of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Member, Maternal-fetal Medicine fellowship 2017-present

Clinical Competency Committee, Emory University Department of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Member, Maternal-fetal medicine fellowship 2016- present

#### **Society Memberships:**

Fellow of the American Congress of Obstetricians and Gynecologists Society for Maternal Fetal Medicine Georgia Obstetrical and Gynecological Society American Institute of Ultrasound Medicine, 2016present

### **Grant Support:**

Federally Funded:

Co-Primary Investigator, HHSN27520130003C NICHD International and Domestic Pediatric and Maternal HIV Studies 09/01/14-current, Pediatric and Adolescent HIV/AIDS research program at Emory University School of Medicine Co-Investigator, Agency Award ID: 2UG1HD027851-26 Eunice Kennedy Shriver NICHD Cooperative Multicenter Neonatal Research Network Award PI: Carlton, David 04/01/2016-03/31/2021

**Private Foundation Funded:** 

Co-Investigator, Katz Foundation, Decoding Preeclampsia, 09/01/2014-current

## **Bibliography:**

# Published and Accepted Articles in Refereed Journals:

- Badell ML, Ramin SM, Smith JA. Treatment options for nausea and vomiting during pregnancy. *Pharmacotherapy*. 2006 Sep;26(9):1273-87.
- Goetzl L, Zighelboim I, Badell M, Rivers J, Mastrangelo MA, Tweardy D, Suresh MS. Maternal corticosteroids to prevent intrauterine exposure to hyperthermia and inflammation: a randomized, double-blind, placebocontrolled trial. Am J Obstet Gynecol. 2006 Oct;195(4):1031-7.
- 3) Navo M, Kunthur A, **Badell ML**, Coffer LW, 2nd, Markman M, Brown J, Smith JA. Evaluation of the incidence of carboplatin

hypersensitivity reactions in cancer patients. *Gynecol Oncol.* 2006 Nov;103(2):608-13.

- Goetzl L, Rivers J, Zighelboim I, Wali A, Badell M, Suresh MS. Intrapartum epidural analgesia and maternal temperature regulation. *Obstet Gynecol.* 2007 Mar;109(3):687-90.
- 5) Badell ML, Lathrop E, Haddad LB, Goedken P, Nguyen M, Cwiak C. Reproductive healthcare needs and desires in a cohort of HIV positive women. *Infect Dis Obstet Gynecol* 2012;2012: 107878
- 6) **Badell ML**, Lindsay M. Thirty years later: Pregnancies in females pernatally infected with human immunodeficiency virus-1. *AIDS Res Treat.* 2012;2012:418630.
- 7) Smith JA, Badell ML, Kunther A, Palmer JL, Tang, J, Dalrymple JL, Ramin SM. Utilization of Complementary and Alternative Medication in Obstetrics and Gynecology Clinics. J Reprod Med. 2012 57(9-10)390-6
- 8) Badell ML, Kachikis A, Haddad LB, Nguyen ML, Lindsay M. Comparison of Pregnancies between Perinatally and Sexually HIV-Infected Women: An Observational Study at an Urban Hospital. *Infect Dis Obstet Gynecol* 2013 Sept: 301763
- 9) Rahangdale L, Stewart A, Stewart RD, Badell M, Levison J, Ellis P, Cohn SE, Kempf MC, Lazenby GB, Tandon R, Rana A, Nguyen ML, Sturdevant MS, Cohan D; HOPES (HIV and OB Pregnancy Education Study). Pregnancy Intentions Among Women Living With HIV in the United States. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2014 Mar 1;65(3):306-11

- 10) Martin A, Krishna I, Martina B, Samuel A. Can the quantity of cell-free fetal DNA predict preeclampsia: a systematic review. *Prenat Diagn*. 2014 Jul;34(7):685-91
- 11) Martin A, Krishna I, Ellis J, Paccione R, Badell M. Super obesity in pregnancy: difficulties in clinical management. *Journal of perinatology* 2014;34(7):495-502. PMID: 24503915
- 12) Meaney-Delman D, Zotti ME, Creanga AA, Misegades LK, Wako E, Treadwell TA, Messonnier NE, Jamieson DJ; Workgroup on Anthrax in Pregnant and Postpartum Women. Emerg Infect Dis. 2014 Feb;20(2).
- 13) Rachel Shulman, Jane Ellis, Eileen Shore, Frederick S. Kaplan, Martina L. Badell Maternal Genetic Skeletal Disorders: Lessons Learned From Cases of Maternal Osteogenesis Imperfecta and Fibrodysplasia Ossificans Progressiva. J Clin Gynecol Obstet. 2015;4(1):184-187
- 14) **Badell ML**, Meaney-Delman D, Tuuli MG, Rasmussen SA, Petersen BW, Sheffield JS, Beigi RH, Damon IK, Jamieson DJ. Risks associated with smallpox vaccination in pregnancy: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Obstet Gynecol.* 2015 Jun;125(6):1439- 51.
- 15) Rimawi BH, Krishna I, Sahu A, **Badell ML**. Pregnancy in a Previously Conjoined Thoracopagus Twin with a Crisscross Heart. Case Rep Obstet Gynecol. 2015; Epub 2015 Jul 27.
- 16) Rahangdale L, Cates J, Potter J, Badell ML, Seidman D, Miller ES, Coleman JS, Lazenby GB, Levison J, Short WR, Yawetz S, Ciaranello A, Livingston E, Duthely L, Rimawi BH, Anderson JR, Stringer EM; HOPES (HIV OB Pregnancy Education Study) Group. Integrase

inhibitors in late pregnancy and rapid HIV viral load reduction. Am J Obstet Gynecol. 2016 Mar;214(3):385

- 17) Krishna I, Badell M, Loucks TL, Lindsay M, Samuel A. Adverse perinatal outcomes are more frequent in pregnancies with a low fetal fraction result on noninvasive prenatal testing. *Prenat Diagn.* 2016 Mar;36(3):210-5
- 18) Badell ML, Lindsay M, Loucks T, Arluck J, Book W. Perinatal outcomes among women with congenital heart disease. J Rep Med 2016 Accepted
- 19) Rahangdale L, Cates J, Potter J, Badell ML, Seidman D, Miller ES, Coleman JS, Lazenby GB, Levison J, Short WR, Yawetz S, Ciaranello A, Livingston E, Duthely L, Rimawi BH, Anderson JR, Stringer EM; HOPES (HIV OB Pregnancy Education Study) Group. Integrase inhibitors in late pregnancy and rapid HIV viral load reduction. Am J Obstet Gynecol. 2016 Mar;214(3):385.e1-7
- 20) Rimawi BH, Haddad L, Badell ML, Chakraborty R. Management of HIV Infection during Pregnancy in the United States: Updated Evidence-Based Recommendations and Future Potential Practices. Infect Dis Obstet Gynecol. 2016; Epub 2016 Jul 18
- 21) Rimawi BH, Smith S, **Badell ML**, Zahedi-Sprung L, Sheth A, Haddad L, Chakraborty R. HIV and reproductive healthcare in pregnant and postpartum HIV infected women: adapting successful strategies. *Future Virology*; Epub 2016 Sept
- 22) Rimawi BH, Johnson E, Rajakumar A, Tao S, Jiang Y, Gillespie S, Schinazi RF, Mirochnick M, Badell ML, Chakraborty R. Pharmacoki-

netics and Placental Transfer of Elvitegravir, Dolutegravir, and Other Antiretrovirals during Pregnancy. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*. 2017 May 24;61(6)

- 23) Blackwell CO, Sheth AN, Nguyen ML, Badell ML. Successful Treatment of Azole-Resistant Candida Esophagitis in an Immunocompromised Pregnant Woman Using Anidulafungin. Ann Pharmacother. 2017 Jun 1 Epub
- 24) Parra-Saavedra M, Reefhuis J, Piraquive JP, Gilboa SM, Badell ML, Moore CA, Mercado M, Valencia D, Jamieson DJ, Beltran M, Sanz-Cortes M, Rivera-Casas AM, Yepez M, Parra G, Ospina Martinez M, Honein MA. Serial Head and Brain Imaging of 17 Fetuses With Confirmed Zika Virus Infection in Colombia, South America. Obstet Gynecol. 2017 Jul;130(1):207-212
- 25) Adebanjo T, Godfred-Cato S, Viens L, Fischer M, Staples JE, Kuhnert-Tallman W, Walke H, Oduyebo T, Polen K, Peacock G, Meaney-Delman D, Honein MA, Rasmussen SA, Moore CA; Contributors.Update: Interim Guidance for the Diagnosis, Evaluation, and Management of Infants with Possible Congenital Zika Virus Infection - United States, October 2017. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2017 Oct 20;66(41): 1089-1099.
- 26) Rao AK, Lin NH, Griese SE, Chatham-Stephens K, Badell ML, Sobel J. Clinical Criteria to Trigger Suspicion for Botulism: An Evidence-Based Tool to Facilitate Timely Recognition of Suspected Cases During Sporadic Events and Outbreaks. Clin Infect Dis. 2017 Dec 27;66(suppl\_1):S38-S42.

- 27) Badell ML, Rimawi BH, Rao AK, Jamieson DJ, Rasmussen S, Meaney-Delman D. Botulism During Pregnancy and the Postpartum Period: A Systematic Review. Clin Infect Dis. 2017 Dec 27;66(suppl\_1):S30-S37
- 28) Gibbs Pickens CM, Kramer MR, Howards PP, Badell ML, Caughey AB, Hogue CJ. Term Elective Induction of Labor and Pregnancy Outcomes Among Obese Women and Their Offspring. Obstet Gynecol. 2018 Jan;131(1):12-22
- 29) Meade CM, Hussen SA, Momplaisir F, Badell M, Hackett S, Sheth AN. Long term engagement in HIV care among postpartum women with perinatal HIV infection in the United States.. AIDS Care. 2018 Apr;30(4):488-492
- 30) Gonzales SK, Badell M, Cottrell H, Rimawi B, Deepak V, Sidell N, Rajakumar A. Villous explants from preeclamptic placentas induce sFlt1 in PBMCs: An ex vivo co-culture study. Pregnancy Hypertens. 2018 Apr;12:40-46. doi: 10.1016/j.preghy.2018.02.006. Epub 2018 Feb 25.
- 31) Zahedi-Spung L, Badell ML. Current Strategies to Prevent Maternal-to-Child Transmission of Human Immunodeficiency Virus. Clin Perinatol. 2018 Jun;45(2):325-337.

## Non peer-reviewed publications:

- 1. **Badell M**, Raynor BD. Herpes Simplex Virus and Pregnancy. *Postgraduate Obstetrics and Gynecology*. 2011 Mar; 31(6)
- Martin, A. Badell M. Umbilical Cord Blood Banking. *Postgraduate Obstetrics and Gynecol*ogy. August 15, 2014;34(15).

## **Book Chapters:**

- 1. Badell M. Acute heavy bleeding should be treated with estrogen or dilation and curettage. In: Roberts CP, Broomfield DP, eds. Avoiding Common Obstetrics and Gynecology Errors, Section VII: Abnormal Bleeding. Philadelphia PA: Lippincott Williams and Wilkins; 2010:132-133.
- 2. Badell M. All postmenopausal bleeding is cancer until proven otherwise. In: Roberts CP. Broomfiled DP, eds. Avoiding Common Obstetrics and Gynecology Errors, Section XVII: Menopause. Philadelphia PA: Lippincott Williams and Wilkins; 2010:360-1
- **3. Badell M**, Taylor RN. Chapter 16: The Endocrinology of Pregnancy. In: Gardner DG, Shoback D, eds. *Greenspan's Basic and Clinical Endocrinology*, 9<sup>th</sup> Edition. The McGraw-Hill Companies; 2011:553-572.

## **Oral Presentations:**

 Rahangdale L, Cates J, Potter J, Badell ML, Seidman D, Miller ES, Coleman JS, Lazenby GB, Levison J, Short WR, Yawetz S, Ciaranello A, Livingston E, Duthely L, Rimawi BH, Anderson JR, Stringer EM; HOPES (HIV OB Pregnancy Education Study) Group. Integrase inhibitors in late pregnancy and rapid HIV viral load reduction. Society for Maternal Fetal Medicine, Atlanta, GA, Feb 2016.

## **Poster Presentations:**

 Badell M, Jones S, Williams G. Smoking perceptions in Quito, Ecuador, Univ. of Rochester Graduate Student Poster Day, Rochester, NY. May 2003

- 2. **Badell M**, Kunther A, Boyd M, Smith JA. Preliminary Analysis of Complementary and Alternative Medication Usage in Ob/Gyn Outpatient Clinics. Univ. of Rochester Graduate Student Poster Day, Rochester NY. May 2003
- 3. **Badell M,** Lathrop E, Goedken P, Nash S, Nguyen M, Cwiak C. Reproductive needs and desires in a cohort of HIV positive women. Association of Reproductive Health Professionals Annual Meeting, Atlanta, GA. Sept 2010
- 4. **Badell M,** Lathrop E, Haddad L, Goedken P, Nguyen M, Cwiak C. Contraception and STI protection among HIV positive women. National HIV Prevention Conference, Atlanta, GA. Aug 2011
- 5. **Badell M,** Kappa D, Horowtiz A, Veldar E, Book W. Risk of preterm birth and low birth weight in women with congenital heart disease. Society for Maternal Fetal Medicine, Dallas, Tx. Feb 2012.
- 6. Thomason, L, Veledar E, **Badell ML**, Book W. Predicting Cardiac Complications during Pregnancy in Women with Congenital Heart Disease. American Heart Association Scientific Session 2012. Hot Topics in Adult Congenital Heart Disease Los Angeles, Ca. Dec 2012
- 7. Nair N, **Badell ML**, Tepper N. Intermittent Airway Obstruction in an Obstetrical Patient Requiring Emergency Surgery. South Atlantic Association of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (SAAOG) Meeting, West Virginia, Jan 2013.
- 8. **Badell ML** and Lindsay M. Differential Characteristics of HIV-Infected Pregnant Women by Mode of HIV Acquisition – An Observational Study at an Urban Hospital. 20th Conference

on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections, Atlanta, GA, Mar 2013

- Rahangdale L, Badell ML et al. Predictors of Unplanned Pregnancies among Women Living with HIV in the United States. 20<sup>th</sup> Conference on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections, Atlanta, GA, Mar 2013
- 10. Link H, Shulman R, **Badell ML.** Physician practice patterns based on *Hypertension in Pregnancy: Report of the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists' Task Force on Hypertension in Pregnancy.* Society for Maternal Fetal Medicine, Atlanta, GA. Feb 2016
- 11. Hackett S, Camacho A, Ford J, **Badell ML**, Blue J, Sheth A. Optimizing HIV Care Engagement among Postpartum HIV-infected Women in Atlanta: A Multidisciplinary Approach. *Accepted:* the HIV/AIDS Bureau and the 2016 National Ryan White Conference on HIV Care
- 12. Gonzales SK, Rajakumar A, Badell, M, Rimawi B, Sidell N. Maternal PBMCs: a Novel source of sFlt-1 in Preeclampsia. Presented at the Society of Maternal Fetal Medicine, the Pregnancy Meeting, Las Vegas, NV, Feb 2017
- 13. Rimawi B, Gonzales SK, Badell, M, Rajakumar A. Differential expression of sFlt1 induced by cAMP in preeclamptic versus normal placentas. Presented at the Society of Maternal Fetal Medicine, the Pregnancy Meeting, Dallas, Texas, Feb 2018
- 14. Gonzales SK, **Badell M**, Venkataraman,D, Sidell N, Rajakumar A. Villous Explants from Preeclamptic Placentas Induce sFlt1 in PBMCs of Normotensive Pregnancies: A Co-Culture Study. Society for Reproductive Investigation's

65th Annual Scientific Meeting, San Diego, CA March 2018

- 15. Venkataraman D, Smith AK, Badell ML, Neil S, Rajakumar A. Decidual Stromal Cells of Preeclamptic Placenta Exhibit Inadequate Decidualization and Increased sFlt1 Expression. Society for Reproductive Investigation's 65th Annual Scientific Meeting, San Diego, CA March 2018
- 16. Rajakumar A, Badell ML, Kane M, Qu1 H, Taylor RN, Sidell N. Reduced Retinoic Acid in Preeclamptic Decidua. Society for Reproductive Investigation's 65th Annual Scientific Meeting, San Diego, CA March 2018
- 17. Venkataraman D, Ross M, Sahu M, **Badell M**, Sidell N, Rajakumar A. Retinoic Acid Modulates sFlt1 Production in Placental Decidual Stromal Cells. Society for Reproductive Investigation's 65th Annual Scientific Meeting, San Diego, CA March 2018
- 18. Sheth A, Hackett S, Meade C, Davis J, Ford J, Blue J, Curtin L, Camacho-Gonzalez A, Chahroudi A, Chakraborty R, Palmore A, Badell ML. Improved Postpartum HIV Outcomes after Care Coordination Team Intervention. 2018 Conference on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections (CROI) Boston, MA March 2018

### Work Groups

1. Delman DM, Jamieson D, **Badell ML** et al. Workgroup for Anthrax in Pregnant and Postpartum Women at Special Considerations for Pregnant and Postpartum Women meeting, Atlanta, GA. Aug 2013

- 2. Botulism Antitoxin Use and the Clinical Management of Botulism Workshop, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA June 2016
- 3. Forum on the Diagnosis, Evaluation, and Management of Zika Virus Infection in Pregnant Women and Infants, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA Aug 2017

## **Oral Presentations:**

2018 National Birth Defects Prevention Network Meeting Annual Meeting March 2018 Atlanta GA. Prenatal Diagnosis: Disorders of sex development

2017 National Birth Defects Prevention Network Meeting Virtual Annual Meeting, October 2017 Congenital Infections: Imaging

#### **Panel Discussion**

Beyond the Rheumatologist and Gastroenterologist: Understanding the entire Management of Pregnant Woman Suffering from Severe Immunological Diseases, UCB. September, 2016

Forum on the Diagnosis, Evaluation, and Management of Zika Virus Infection Among Infants on August 30-31, 2017

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI NORTHERN DIVISION

### Civil Action No. 3:18-CV-171—CWR-FKB

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, et al.

## **Plaintiffs**

vs.

MARY CURRIER, M.D., M.P.H., in her official capacity as State Health Officer of the Mississippi Department of Health, *et al.* 

**Defendants** 

## DR. MARY CURRIER'S RESPONSES TO PLAINTIFFS' FIRST SET OF REQUESTS FOR ADMISSION TO DEFENDANTS

COMES NOW Defendant, Mary Currier, M.D., M.P.H., in her official capacity as State Health Officer of the Mississippi Department of Health, by and through counsel, pursuant to Rules 26, 36, and other applicable provisions of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and respond to the First Set of Requests for Admission propounded by Plaintiffs, as follows, to-wit:

### **GENERAL OBJECTIONS AND LIMITATIONS**

The following General Objections and Limitations apply to and are incorporated in each individual Response, whether or not expressly incorporated by reference in such Response: 1. Defendant objects to each Definition and Request to the extent that it purports to impose obligations that exceed or differ from those imposed by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Local Uniform Civil Rules of the United States District Court for the Southern District of Mississippi, or other applicable law or rules.

2. Defendant objects to the Requests to the extent that they seek information that is not relevant to or proportional to the needs of Phase I of the case, considering the importance of the issues at stake in Phase I, the parties' relative access to relevant information, the parties' resources, and the importance of the discovery in resolving Phase I of the case.

3. Defendant objects to the Requests to the extent they seek information protected by the attorney/client privilege, the work product doctrine, or other applicable privilege. Defendant further objects to the extent answering the Requests would require disclosure of the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions of defense counsel, and/or prematurely disclose the trial strategies of defense counsel. Defendant will make required disclosures at the time and in the manner provided by the Local Rules, other relevant rules, or as directed by the Court.

4. Defendant objects to each Request to the extent that it is overly broad, unduly burdensome, vague, and/or ambiguous.

5. Defendant incorporates all other documents, objections and/or limitations asserted in all other filings and discovery responses in this action. The fact that such contentions, objections and/or limitations may not be repeated here shall not be deemed a waiver of any kind.

6. No Objection or Limitation, or lack thereof, made in these Responses and Objections shall be deemed (i) an admission by Defendant as to the existence or non-existence of the information sought; or (ii) a waiver of Defendant's right to assert such Objection or Limitation at any future time in connection with the Requests or otherwise. In responding to these Requests, Defendant neither waives nor intends to waive, and expressly reserves any and all objections to the relevance, competence, susceptibility to discovery, materiality or admissibility of any information provided.

7. Defendant reserves the right to supplement or modify these Responses and Objections to the Requests if she discovers any additional responsive information, and as other facts emerge from the discovery process, or if otherwise appropriate under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

8. All of these General Objections and Limitations shall be deemed to be incorporated within the Responses and Objections to specific Requests that follow, even where not further referred to in such Responses. The failure to include any General Objection or Limitation in any specific Response does not waive any General Objection or Limitation to that Request.

## RESPONSES TO FIRST SET OF REQUESTS FOR ADMISSION

**<u>REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 1</u>**: Admit that the Department posted a new version of its Informed Consent Information booklet on its website on March 19, 2018.

## **RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 1:** Admitted.

**REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 2:** Admit every version of the Department's Informed Consent Information booklet available between 1996 and prior to March 2018 stated that between 14-16 weeks LMP a fetus has "no chance of survival outside the womb."

**RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 2:** Admitted.

**REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 3:** Admit that the Department eliminated the statement that at 14-16 weeks as measured from a woman's last menstrual period (imp), a fetus has "no chance of survival outside the womb" from the Informed Consent Information booklet posted in March 2018.

**RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 3:** Defendant objects to the term "eliminated," as argumentative.

Without waiving, and limited by that objection, Defendant admits only that the language "no chance of survival outside the womb," in connection with a gestational age of 14-16 weeks LMP, was included in the previous version of the Informed Consent Information booklet, but does not appear in the current version of the booklet published in March 2018.

**REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 4:** Admit that, prior to March 2018, information in the Department's Informed Consent Information booklet about the ability of a fetus to survive outside the womb had not changed since 1996.

**RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 4:** Admitted.

**REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 5:** Admit that, based on public health and vital statistics data col-

lected and maintained by the Department, there is no data indicating that any baby born in Mississippi before 22 weeks as dated from a woman's last menstrual period (lmp) has survived to hospital discharge.

**RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR ADMISSION No. 5:** Admitted. However, there is data indicating that one baby born in Mississippi at exactly 22 weeks LMP has survived to hospital discharge.

This, the 20th day of July, 2018.

MARY CURRIER, in her official capacity as State Health Officer of the Mississippi Department of Health

## **AS TO OBJECTIONS ONLY:**

By: <u>/s/ Wilson Minor</u> PAULE. BARNES, MSB No. 99107 WILSON MINOR, MSB No. 102663 Special Assistant Attorneys General

STATE OF MISSISSIPPI OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL Post Office Box 220 Jackson, MS 39205 Telephone No. (601)359-4072 Facsimile: (601)359-2003 <u>pbarn@ago.state.ms.us</u> <u>wmino@.ago.state.ms.us</u>

## SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

#### No. 19-1392

THOMAS E. DOBBS, STATE HEALTH OFFICER OF THE MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, *et al.* 

Petitioners

v.

JACKSON WOMEN'S HEALTH ORGANIZATION, et al.,

Respondents

ON PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit, No. 18-60868

The petition for a writ of certiorari is granted limited to Question 1 presented by the petition.

May 17, 2021 Scott S. Harris, Clerk 60