

No. 18-_____

IN THE
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR,
Petitioner
v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
Respondent

APPENDIX

INDEX TO APPENDICES

Appendix A Judgment and Opinion of Fifth Circuit

Appendix B Judgment and Sentence of the United States District Court for the Northern District of Texas

APPENDIX A

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT**

No. 17-11004
Summary Calendar

United States Court of Appeals
Fifth Circuit

FILED

June 15, 2018

Lyle W. Cayce
Clerk

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff-Appellee

v.

GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR,

Defendant-Appellant

Appeals from the United States District Court
for the Northern District of Texas
USDC No. 3:16-CR-103-1

Before JOLLY, OWEN, and HAYNES, Circuit Judges.

PER CURIAM:*

Gerson Gonzalez Tovar appeals his conviction for production of child pornography in violation of 18 U.S.C. § 2251(a). In the factual basis for his guilty plea, Tovar admitted that he produced a visual depiction and that it “was produced using materials that have been mailed, shipped, or transported in interstate or foreign commerce.”

* Pursuant to 5TH CIR. R. 47.5, the court has determined that this opinion should not be published and is not precedent except under the limited circumstances set forth in 5TH CIR. R. 47.5.4.

Tovar asserts that the factual basis for his guilty plea is insufficient under Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 11 because he did not admit that the offense caused the materials to move interstate in the recent past. Relying on the Supreme Court's decision in *Bond v. United States*, 134 S. Ct. 2077 (2014), Tovar contends that a conviction in the absence of such proof impermissibly intrudes upon the police power of the States.

We review Tovar's forfeited objection to the factual basis for plain error. *See United States v. Trejo*, 610 F.3d 308, 313 (5th Cir. 2010) (footnote omitted). To establish plain error, Tovar must show a forfeited error that is clear or obvious and that affects his substantial rights. *See Puckett v. United States*, 556 U.S. 129, 135 (2009). If he makes such a showing, this court has the discretion to correct the error but only if it seriously affects the fairness, integrity, or public reputation of judicial proceedings. *See id.*

We have rejected similar challenges. *See, e.g., United States v. Looney*, 606 F. App'x 744, 746-47 (5th Cir. 2015). Given the current state of the law, as Tovar concedes, the district court's finding that there was a sufficient factual basis for his guilty plea was not a clear or obvious error. *See Puckett*, 556 U.S. at 135. He raises the issue to preserve it for further review.

The judgment of the district court is AFFIRMED. The Government's motions for summary affirmance and, alternatively, for an extension of time to file an appellate brief, are DENIED.

APPENDIX B

United States District Court
Northern District of Texas Dallas Division

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

v.

GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR

§ JUDGMENT IN A CRIMINAL CASE

§

§

§ Case Number: **3:16-CR-00103-K (01)**

§ USM Number: **71710-380**

§

§ **Gabriel Reyes**

§ Defendant's Attorney

THE DEFENDANT:

<input type="checkbox"/>	pleaded guilty to count(s)	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	pleaded guilty to count(s) before a U.S. Magistrate Judge, which was accepted by the court.	To Count 1 of the Indictment, filed on March 22, 2016.
<input type="checkbox"/>	pleaded nolo contendere to count(s) which was accepted by the court	
<input type="checkbox"/>	was found guilty on count(s) after a plea of not guilty	

The defendant is adjudicated guilty of these offenses:

<u>Title & Section / Nature of Offense</u>	<u>Offense Ended</u>	<u>Count</u>
18-USC § 2251(a) and (e) - Production of Child Pornography	10/11/2015	1

The defendant is sentenced as provided in pages 2 through 8 of this judgment. The sentence is imposed pursuant to the Sentencing Reform Act of 1984.

The defendant has been found not guilty on count(s)
 Counts 2 through 4 of the Indictment filed on March 22, 2017, are dismissed on the motion of the United States.

It is ordered that the defendant must notify the United States attorney for this district within 30 days of any change of name, residence, or mailing address until all fines, restitution, costs, and special assessments imposed by this judgment are fully paid. If ordered to pay restitution, the defendant must notify the court and United States attorney of material changes in economic circumstances.

August 23, 2017

Date of Imposition of Judgment


Signature of Judge

Ed Kinkeade, United States District Judge
Name and Title of Judge

August 24, 2017

Date

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

IMPRISONMENT

The defendant is hereby committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a total term of:

TWO HUNDRED-FOUR (204) Months. This sentence shall run concurrent with any sentence imposed in Case Nos. F-1559146 and F-1572049 pending in Dallas County Criminal District Court 3 in Dallas, Texas.

The defendant shall receive credit for time served in federal custody prior to sentencing.

The court makes the following recommendations to the Bureau of Prisons:

The Court recommends that the defendant be allowed to serve his sentence at FCI Seagoville, Seagoville, Texas.

The defendant is remanded to the custody of the United States Marshal.

The defendant shall surrender to the United States Marshal for this district:

at a.m. p.m. on

as notified by the United States Marshal.

The defendant shall surrender for service of sentence at the institution designated by the Bureau of Prisons:

before 2 p.m. on
 as notified by the United States Marshal.
 as notified by the Probation or Pretrial Services Office.

RETURN

I have executed this judgment as follows:

Defendant delivered on _____ to

at _____, with a certified copy of this judgment.

UNITED STATES MARSHAL

By
DEPUTY UNITED STATES MARSHAL

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

SUPERVISED RELEASE

Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall be on supervised release for a term of: **TEN (10) years.**

MANDATORY CONDITIONS

1. You must not commit another federal, state or local crime.
2. You must not unlawfully possess a controlled substance.
3. You must refrain from any unlawful use of a controlled substance. You must submit to one drug test within 15 days of release from imprisonment and at least two periodic drug tests thereafter, as determined by the court.
 The above drug testing condition is suspended, based on the court's determination that you pose a low risk of future substance abuse. (*check if applicable*)
4. You must cooperate in the collection of DNA as directed by the probation officer. (*check if applicable*)
5. You must comply with the requirements of the Sex Offender Registration and Notification Act (42 U.S.C. § 16901, et seq.) as directed by the probation officer, the Bureau of Prisons, or any state sex offender registration agency in which you reside, work, are a student, or were convicted of a qualifying offense. (*check if applicable*)
6. You must participate in an approved program for domestic violence. (*check if applicable*)

The defendant must comply with the standard conditions that have been adopted by this court as well as with any additional conditions on the attached page.

If this judgment imposes a fine or restitution, it is a condition of supervised release that the defendant pay in accordance with the Schedule of Payments sheet of this judgment.

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

STANDARD CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

As part of your supervised release, you must comply with the following standard conditions of supervision. These conditions are imposed because they establish the basic expectations for your behavior while on supervision and identify the minimum tools needed by probation officers to keep informed, report to the court about, and bring about improvements in your conduct and condition.

1. You must report to the probation office in the federal judicial district where you are authorized to reside within 72 hours of your release from imprisonment, unless the probation officer instructs you to report to a different probation office or within a different time frame.
2. After initially reporting to the probation office, you will receive instructions from the court or the probation officer about how and when you must report to the probation officer, and you must report to the probation officer as instructed.
3. You must not knowingly leave the federal judicial district where you are authorized to reside without first getting permission from the court or the probation officer.
4. You must answer truthfully the questions asked by your probation officer.
5. You must live at a place approved by the probation officer. If you plan to change where you live or anything about your living arrangements (such as the people you live with), you must notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
6. You must allow the probation officer to visit you at any time at your home or elsewhere, and you must permit the probation officer to take any items prohibited by the conditions of your supervision that he or she observes in plain view.
7. You must work full time (at least 30 hours per week) at a lawful type of employment, unless the probation officer excuses you from doing so. If you do not have full-time employment you must try to find full-time employment, unless the probation officer excuses you from doing so. If you plan to change where you work or anything about your work (such as your position or your job responsibilities), you must notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer at least 10 days in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
8. You must not communicate or interact with someone you know is engaged in criminal activity. If you know someone has been convicted of a felony, you must not knowingly communicate or interact with that person without first getting the permission of the probation officer.
9. If you are arrested or questioned by a law enforcement officer, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours.
10. You must not own, possess, or have access to a firearm, ammunition, destructive device, or dangerous weapon (i.e., anything that was designed, or was modified for, the specific purpose of causing bodily injury or death to another person such as nunchakus or tasers).
11. You must not act or make any agreement with a law enforcement agency to act as a confidential human source or informant without first getting the permission of the court.
12. If the probation officer determines that you pose a risk to another person (including an organization), the probation officer may require you to notify the person about the risk and you must comply with that instruction. The probation officer may contact the person and confirm that you have notified the person about the risk.
13. You must follow the instructions of the probation officer related to the conditions of supervision.

U.S. Probation Office Use Only

A U.S. probation officer has instructed me on the conditions specified by the court and has provided me with a written copy of this judgment containing these conditions. I understand additional information regarding these conditions is available at www.txnp.uscourts.gov.

Defendant's Signature _____ Date _____

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

As a condition of supervised release, upon the completion of the sentence of imprisonment, the defendant shall be surrendered to a duly-authorized immigration official for deportation in accordance with the established procedures provided by the Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1101 et seq. As a further condition of supervised release, if ordered deported or removed, the defendant shall remain outside the United States.

In the event the defendant is not deported upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall comply with the standard conditions contained in this Judgment and shall comply with the mandatory and special conditions stated herein.

The defendant must comply with the requirements of the Sex Offender Registration and Notification Act (42 U.S.C. § 16901, et seq.) as directed by the probation officer, the Bureau of Prisons, or any state sex offender registration agency in which the defendant resides, works, is a student, or was convicted of a qualifying offense.

The defendant shall participate in sex offender treatment services as directed by the probation officer until successfully discharged. These services may include psycho-physiological testing (i.e., clinical polygraph, plethysmograph, and the ABEL screen) to monitor the defendant's compliance, treatment progress, and risk to the community. The defendant shall contribute to the costs of services rendered (copayment) at a rate of at least \$20 per month.

Without prior permission of the probation officer, the defendant shall have no contact with persons under the age of 18, including by correspondence, telephone, Internet, electronic communication, or through third parties. The defendant shall not have access to or loiter near school grounds, parks, arcades, playgrounds, amusement parks, or other places where children may frequently congregate. The defendant shall neither seek nor maintain employment or volunteer work at any location and/or activity where persons under the age of 18 congregate, without prior permission of the probation officer. Furthermore, the defendant shall not date or befriend anyone who has children under the age of 18, without prior permission of the probation officer.

The defendant shall neither possess nor have under his control any sexually oriented, or sexually stimulating materials of adults or children. This includes visual, auditory, telephonic, electronic media, email, chat communications, instant messaging, or computer programs. The defendant shall not patronize any place where such material or entertainment is available. The defendant shall not use any sex-related telephone numbers.

The defendant shall have no contact with any victim of this offense, including by correspondence, telephone, or communication through third parties, except under circumstances approved in advance by the probation officer. The defendant shall not enter onto the premises, travel past, or loiter near any victim's residence, place of employment, or other places frequented by the victim.

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION CONTINUED

The defendant shall participate and comply with the requirements of the Computer and Internet Monitoring Program, contributing to the cost of the monitoring in an amount not to exceed \$40 per month. The defendant shall consent to the probation officer's conducting ongoing monitoring of his computer/computers. The monitoring may include the installation of hardware and/or software systems that allow evaluation of computer use. The defendant shall not remove, tamper with, reverse engineer, or circumvent the software in any way. The defendant shall only use authorized computer systems that are compatible with the software and/or hardware used by the Computer and Internet Monitoring Program. The defendant shall permit the probation officer to conduct a preliminary computer search prior to the installation of software. At the discretion of the probation officer, the monitoring software may be disabled or removed at any time during the term of supervision.

The defendant shall submit to periodic, unannounced examinations of his computer/computers, storage media, and/or other electronic or Internet-capable devices, performed by the probation officer at reasonable times and in a reasonable manner based on reasonable suspicion of contraband evidence of a violation of supervision. This may include the retrieval and copying of any prohibited data and/or the removal of such system for the purpose of conducting a more thorough inspection. The defendant shall provide written authorization for release of information from the defendant's Internet service provider.

The defendant shall not use any computer other than the one the defendant is authorized to use without prior approval from the probation officer.

The defendant shall not use any software program or device designed to hide, alter, or delete records and/or logs of the defendant's computer use, Internet activities, or files stored on the defendant's computer.

The defendant shall not use any computer or computer-related equipment owned by his employer except for the strict benefit of his employer in the performance of his job-related duties.

The defendant shall not maintain or create a user account on any social networking site (i.e., MySpace.com, Facebook.com, Adultfriendfinder.com, etc.) that allows access to persons under the age of 18, or allows for the exchange of sexually-explicit material, chat conversations, or instant messaging. The defendant shall neither view nor access any web profile of users under the age of 18.

The defendant shall not use or possess any gaming consoles (including, but not limited to, Xbox, PlayStation, Nintendo), or devices without prior permission from the probation officer.

The defendant shall not use or possess a web cam or any other hardware that allows for the exchange of video or photographs online.

The defendant shall not use or own any device that allows Internet access other than authorized by the probation officer. This includes, but is not limited to, PDA's, electronic games, and cellular/digital telephones.

The defendant shall not access any Internet Service Provider account or other online service using someone else's account, name, designation, or alias.

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

CRIMINAL MONETARY PENALTIES

The defendant must pay the total criminal monetary penalties under the schedule of payments on Sheet 6.

	<u>Assessment</u>	<u>JVTA Assessment*</u>	<u>Fine</u>	<u>Restitution</u>
TOTALS	\$100.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00

The determination of restitution is deferred until *An Amended Judgment in a Criminal Case (AO245C)* will be entered after such determination.

The defendant must make restitution (including community restitution) to the following payees in the amount listed below.

If the defendant makes a partial payment, each payee shall receive an approximately proportioned payment. However, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3664(i), all nonfederal victims must be paid before the United States is paid.

Restitution amount ordered pursuant to plea agreement \$

The defendant must pay interest on restitution and a fine of more than \$2,500, unless the restitution or fine is paid in full before the fifteenth day after the date of the judgment, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3612(f). All of the payment options on Sheet 6 may be subject to penalties for delinquency and default, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3612(g).

The court determined that the defendant does not have the ability to pay interest and it is ordered that:

the interest requirement is waived for the fine restitution

the interest requirement for the fine restitution is modified as follows:

* Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act of 2015, Pub. L. No. 114-22

** Findings for the total amount of losses are required under Chapters 109A, 110, 110A, and 113A of Title 18 for offenses committed on or after September 13, 1994, but before April 23, 1996.

DEFENDANT: GERSON GONZALEZ TOVAR
CASE NUMBER: 3:16-CR-00103-K (01)

SCHEDULE OF PAYMENTS

Having assessed the defendant's ability to pay, payment of the total criminal monetary penalties is due as follows:

- A Lump sum payments of \$ _____ due immediately, balance due
 - not later than _____, or
 - in accordance C, D, E, or F below; or
- B Payment to begin immediately (may be combined with C, D, or F below); or
- C Payment in equal _____ (e.g., weekly, monthly, quarterly) installments of \$ _____ over a period of _____ (e.g., months or years), to commence _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after the date of this judgment; or
- D Payment in equal 20 (e.g., weekly, monthly, quarterly) installments of \$ _____ over a period of _____ (e.g., months or years), to commence _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after release from imprisonment to a term of supervision; or
- E Payment during the term of supervised release will commence within _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after release from imprisonment. The court will set the payment plan based on an assessment of the defendant's ability to pay at that time; or
- F Special instructions regarding the payment of criminal monetary penalties:
It is ordered that the Defendant shall pay to the United States a special assessment of \$100.00 for Count 1 which shall be due immediately. Said special assessment shall be paid to the Clerk, U.S. District Court.

Unless the court has expressly ordered otherwise, if this judgment imposes imprisonment, payment of criminal monetary penalties is due during imprisonment. All criminal monetary penalties, except those payments made through the Federal Bureau of Prisons' Inmate Financial Responsibility Program, are made to the clerk of the court.

The defendant shall receive credit for all payments previously made toward any criminal monetary penalties imposed.

- Joint and Several
See above for Defendant and Co-Defendant Names and Case Numbers (*including defendant number*), Total Amount, Joint and Several Amount, and corresponding payee, if appropriate.
 - Defendant shall receive credit on his restitution obligation for recovery from other defendants who contributed to the same loss that gave rise to defendant's restitution obligation.
 - The defendant shall pay the cost of prosecution.
 - The defendant shall pay the following court cost(s):
 - The defendant shall forfeit the defendant's interest in the following property to the United States:
The defendant shall forfeit a Samsung Galaxy SIII, bearing Serial No. R21C63F6NLD, and containing a 64GB SanDisk Ultra Plus Micro SD Card.

Payments shall be applied in the following order: (1) assessment, (2) restitution principal, (3) restitution interest, (4) fine principal, (5) fine interest, (6) community restitution, (7) JVTA Assessment, (8) penalties, and (9) costs, including cost of prosecution and court costs.