

No. _____

IN THE
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

CARLTON BUTLER,

Petitioner,

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Respondent.

On Petition for Writ of Certiorari to the
United States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit

APPENDIX B TO PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI

Respectfully submitted,

Kenneth Ronald Smith
CJA Panel Attorney
The Law Offices of Ken Smith, LLC
Counsel of Record for Petitioner

544 Mulberry Street, Suite 209
Macon, Georgia 31201
Tel: (478) 787-0258
Fax: (478) 254-4601
ken@kenrsmithlaw.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>United States v. Carlton Butler</i> , No. 5:16-CR-16-1(MTT), Document 66 (M.D. Ga. Mar. 30, 2017).....	1
<i>United States v. Carlton Butler</i> , No. 5:16-CR-16-1(MTT), Document 67 (M.D. Ga. Mar. 31, 2017).....	4

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
MACON DIVISION**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

V.

CARLTON M. BUTLER,

Defendant.

CASE NO. 5:16-CR-16-1(MTT)

ORDER

Defendant Carlton Butler has moved the Court to reinstate its judgment and, pursuant to Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 35(a), correct clear error in the judgment. The motion is **GRANTED in part** and **DENIED in part**.

The relevant facts are undisputed. Butler pled guilty to Counts 1 and 2 of a 17-count indictment. Count 1 charged that Butler distributed cocaine base in violation of 21 U.S.C. §§ 841(a)(1) and (b)(1)(C). Count 2 alleged Butler carried a firearm during a drug trafficking crime in violation of 18 U.S.C. § 924(c)(1)(A). Butler is a career offender and his guideline range of 360 months to life for the two offenses was calculated pursuant to USSG §4B1.1(c)(3). Pursuant to USSG §5G1.2(e), his sentence was to be apportioned between the two counts of conviction. Thus, to achieve a minimum guideline range sentence of 360 months for the two counts, the Court would sentence Butler to 240 months imprisonment for Count 1 and 120 months for Count 2. The parties agree that the Court's intention was to impose a minimum guideline sentence and to correctly apportion the sentence between the counts of conviction. However, in the event, the Court mistakenly sentenced Butler to 300 months imprisonment for Count 1 and 60 months imprisonment for Count 2. Thus, the Court imposed a sentence on

Count 1 that was 60 months in excess of the statutory maximum and, as a consequence of that mistake, mistakenly sentenced Butler to a term for Count 2 that was 60 months shorter than it should have. Although no one caught the mistakes at the sentencing hearing, the parties agree that the mistaken sentence for Count 1 was clear error.

Butler, however, maintains that the Court cannot alter its mistaken sentence for Count 2. Thus, Butler contends that as a result of the Court's mistakes, he should receive a sentence of 300 months. Butler is clearly wrong.

The Court's sentence was "holistic." See *United States v. Yost*, 185 F.3d 1178, 1181 (11th Cir. 1999) (citation omitted). To reach the minimum guideline sentence of 360 months, the Court had to properly apportion the sentence between the two counts. The sentence on Count 2 would be determined by the sentence on Count 1. Thus, just as the sentence on Count 1 was clear error, the sentence on Count 2 was clear error. Almost any sentencing judgment is a "package of sanctions that the district court utilizes to effectuate its sentencing intent consistent with the Sentencing Guidelines." *United States v. Stinson*, 97 F.3d 466, 469 (11th Cir. 1996) (citation omitted). But Butler's sentence is more holistic and more a packet of sanctions than most. The sentence for Count 2 is necessarily dependent on Count 1. The only way the Court could impose the sentence that Butler acknowledges it had the authority and intent to impose was to apportion the sentence appropriately between the two counts. The Court made two mistakes and both were mistakes of the nature that clearly can be corrected under Rule 35(a).

Accordingly, the Court's judgment (Doc. 59) is **REINSTATED**. Pursuant to Rule 35(a), the judgment will be correctly apportioned between the two counts.

SO ORDERED, this 30th day of March, 2017.

S/ Marc T. Treadwell
MARC T. TREADWELL, JUDGE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

Middle District of Georgia

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

V.

CARLTON M. BUTLER

AMENDED JUDGMENT IN A CRIMINAL CASE

Case Number: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

USM Number: 99605-020

Date of Original Judgment: March 17, 2017

(Or Date of Last Amended Judgment)

Reason for Amendment:

- ☐ Correction of Sentence on Remand (18 U.S.C. 3742(f)(1) and (2))
- ☐ Reduction of Sentence for Changed Circumstances (Fed. R. Crim. P. 35(b))
- ☒ Correction of Sentence by Sentencing Court (Fed. R. Crim. P. 35(a))
- ☐ Correction of Sentence for Clerical Mistake (Fed. R. Crim. P. 36)

KENNETH RONALD SMITH

Defendant's Attorney

- ☐ Modification of Supervision Conditions (18 U.S.C. §§ 3563(c) or 3583(e))
- ☐ Modification of Imposed Term of Imprisonment for Extraordinary and Compelling Reasons (18 U.S.C. § 3582(c)(1))
- ☐ Modification of Imposed Term of Imprisonment for Retroactive Amendment(s) to the Sentencing Guidelines (18 U.S.C. § 3582(c)(2))
- ☐ Direct Motion to District Court Pursuant ☐ 28 U.S.C. § 2255 or ☐ 18 U.S.C. § 3559(c)(7)
- ☐ Modification of Restitution Order (18 U.S.C. § 3664)

THE DEFENDANT:

☒ pleaded guilty to count(s) 1 and 2☐ pleaded nolo contendere to count(s)

which was accepted by the court.

☐ was found guilty on count(s)

after a plea of not guilty.

The defendant is adjudicated guilty of these offenses:

Title & Section	Nature of Offense	Offense Ended	Count
21:841(a)(1) and (b)(1)(C)	Distribution of Cocaine Base	5/28/2014	1
18:924(c)(1)(A)	Carrying A Firearm During and In Relation To A Drug Trafficking Crime	5/28/2014	2

The defendant is sentenced as provided in pages 2 7 of this judgment. The sentence is imposed pursuant to the Sentencing Reform Act of 1984.

☐ The defendant has been found not guilty on count(s)☒ Count(s) 3-17 ☐ is ☒ are dismissed on the motion of the United States.

It is ordered that the defendant must notify the United States Attorney for this district within 30 days of any change of name, residence, or mailing address until all fines, restitution, costs, and special assessments imposed by this judgment are fully paid. If ordered to pay restitution, the defendant must notify the court and United States attorney of material changes in economic circumstances.

March 17, 2017

Date of Imposition of Judgment

s/ Marc T. Treadwell

Signature of Judge

MARC T. TREADWELL, UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Name and Title of Judge

03/31/2017

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

IMPRISONMENT

The defendant is hereby committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a total term of: ***two hundred forty (240) months as to count 1; one hundred twenty (120) months as to count 2; terms to run consecutive for a total imprisonment of 360 months.**

- ☐ The court makes the following recommendations to the Bureau of Prisons:
- ☒ The defendant is remanded to the custody of the United States Marshal.
- ☐ The defendant shall surrender to the United States Marshal for this district:
- ☐ at _____ ☐ a.m. ☐ p.m. on _____.
- ☐ as notified by the United States Marshal.
- ☐ The defendant shall surrender for service of sentence at the institution designated by the Bureau of Prisons:
- ☐ before 2 p.m. on _____.
- ☐ as notified by the United States Marshal.
- ☐ as notified by the Probation or Pretrial Services Office.

RETURN

I have executed this judgment as follows:

Defendant delivered on _____ to _____
at _____, with a certified copy of this judgment.

UNITED STATES MARSHAL

By _____
DEPUTY UNITED STATES MARSHAL

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

SUPERVISED RELEASE

Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall be on supervised release for a term of: three (3) years terms to run concurrent.

MANDATORY CONDITIONS

1. You must not commit another federal, state or local crime.
2. You must not unlawfully possess a controlled substance.
3. You must refrain from any unlawful use of a controlled substance. You must submit to one drug test within 15 days of release from imprisonment and at least two periodic drug tests thereafter, as determined by the court.
☐ The above drug testing condition is suspended, based on the court's determination that you pose a low risk of future substance abuse. (*check if applicable*)
4. ☒ You must cooperate in the collection of DNA as directed by the probation officer. (*check if applicable*)
5. ☐ You must comply with the requirements of the Sex Offender Registration and Notification Act (42 U.S.C. § 16901, et seq.) as directed by the probation officer, the Bureau of Prisons, or any state sex offender registration agency in which you reside, work, are a student, or were convicted of a qualifying offense. (*check if applicable*)
6. ☐ You must participate in an approved program for domestic violence. (*check if applicable*)

You must comply with the standard conditions that have been adopted by this court as well as with any other conditions on the attached page.

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

STANDARD CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

As part of your supervised release, you must comply with the following standard conditions of supervision. These conditions are imposed because they establish the basic expectations for your behavior while on supervision and identify the minimum tools needed by probation officers to keep informed, report to the court about, and bring about improvements in your conduct and condition.

1. You must report to the probation office in the federal judicial district where you are authorized to reside within 72 hours of your release from imprisonment, unless the probation officer instructs you to report to a different probation office or within a different time frame.
2. After initially reporting to the probation office, you will receive instructions from the court or the probation officer about how and when you must report to the probation officer, and you must report to the probation officer as instructed.
3. You must not knowingly leave the federal judicial district where you are authorized to reside without first getting permission from the court or the probation officer.
4. You must answer truthfully the questions asked by your probation officer.
5. You must live at a place approved by the probation officer. If you plan to change where you live or anything about your living arrangements (such as the people you live with), you must notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
6. You must allow the probation officer to visit you at any time at your home or elsewhere, and you must permit the probation officer to take any items prohibited by the conditions of your supervision that he or she observes in plain view.
7. You must work full time (at least 30 hours per week) at a lawful type of employment, unless the probation officer excuses you from doing so. If you do not have full-time employment you must try to find full-time employment, unless the probation officer excuses you from doing so. If you plan to change where you work or anything about your work (such as your position or your job responsibilities), you must notify the probation officer at least 10 days before the change. If notifying the probation officer at least 10 days in advance is not possible due to unanticipated circumstances, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours of becoming aware of a change or expected change.
8. You must not communicate or interact with someone you know is engaged in criminal activity. If you know someone has been convicted of a felony, you must not knowingly communicate or interact with that person without first getting the permission of the probation officer.
9. If you are arrested or questioned by a law enforcement officer, you must notify the probation officer within 72 hours.
10. You must not own, possess, or have access to a firearm, ammunition, destructive device, or dangerous weapon (i.e., anything that was designed, or was modified for, the specific purpose of causing bodily injury or death to another person such as nunchakus or tasers).
11. You must not act or make any agreement with a law enforcement agency to act as a confidential human source or informant without first getting the permission of the court.
12. If the probation officer determines that you pose a risk to another person (including an organization), the probation officer may require you to notify the person about the risk and you must comply with that instruction. The probation officer may contact the person and confirm that you have notified the person about the risk.
13. You must follow the instructions of the probation officer related to the conditions of supervision.

U.S. Probation Office Use Only

A U.S. probation officer has instructed me on the conditions specified by the court and has provided me with a written copy of this judgment containing these conditions. I understand additional information regarding these conditions is available at the www.uscourts.gov.

Defendant's Signature _____

Date _____

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

You shall participate in a program of drug and alcohol testing and treatment. The U.S. Probation Office shall administratively supervise your participation in the program by approving the program, administering the testing, and supervising the treatment. You shall contribute to the costs of such treatment not to exceed an amount determined reasonable by the court approved "U.S. Probation Office's Sliding Scale for Services", and shall cooperate in securing any applicable third-party payment, such as insurance or Medicaid.

You shall submit your person, property, house, residence, vehicle, papers, computers (as defined by 18 U.S.C. § 1030(e)(1)), other electronic communications or data storage devices or media, or office, to a search conducted by a United States Probation Officer. Failure to submit to a search may be grounds for revocation of release. The Defendant shall warn any other occupants that the premises may be subject to searches pursuant to this condition.

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

CRIMINAL MONETARY PENALTIES

The defendant must pay the total criminal monetary penalties under the schedule of payments on Sheet 6.

	<u>Assessment</u>	<u>JVTA</u> <u>Assessment*</u>	<u>Fine</u>	<u>Restitution</u>
TOTALS	\$200.00		\$0.00	\$0.00

- ☐ The determination of restitution is deferred until *An Amended Judgment in a Criminal Case (AO245C)* will be entered after such determination.
- ☐ The defendant must make restitution (including community restitution) to the following payees in the amount listed below.

If the defendant makes a partial payment, each payee shall receive an approximately proportioned payment. However, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3664(i), all nonfederal victims must be paid before the United States is paid.

<u>Name of Payee</u>	<u>Total Loss*</u>	<u>Restitution Ordered</u>	<u>Priority or Percentage</u>
----------------------	--------------------	----------------------------	-------------------------------

TOTALS	\$ _____	\$ _____
---------------	----------	----------

- ☐ Restitution amount ordered pursuant to plea agreement \$ _____
- ☐ The defendant must pay interest on restitution and a fine of more than \$2,500, unless the restitution or fine is paid in full before the fifteenth day after the date of the judgment, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3612(f). All of the payment options on Sheet 6 may be subject to penalties for delinquency and default, pursuant to 18 U.S.C. § 3612(g).
- ☐ The court determined that the defendant does not have the ability to pay interest and it is ordered that:
- | | | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> the interest requirement is waived for the | <input type="checkbox"/> fine | <input type="checkbox"/> restitution |
| <input type="checkbox"/> the interest requirement for the | <input type="checkbox"/> fine | <input type="checkbox"/> restitution is modified as follows: |

* Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act of 2015, Pub. L. No. 114-22

** Findings for the total amount of losses are required under Chapters 109A, 110, 110A, and 113A of Title 18 for offenses committed on or after September 13, 1994, but before April 23, 1996.

DEFENDANT: CARLTON M BUTLER
CASE NUMBER: 5:16-CR-00016-MTT-CHW(1)

SCHEDULE OF PAYMENTS

Having assessed the defendant's ability to pay, payment of the total criminal monetary penalties is due as follows:

- A** ☐ Lump sum payment of \$ _____ due immediately, balance due
- ☐ not later than _____, or
- ☐ in accordance ☐ C, ☐ D ☐ E, or ☐ F below; or
- B** ☒ Payment to begin immediately (may be combined with ☐ C, ☐ D, or ☒ F below); or
- C** ☐ Payment in equal _____ (e.g., weekly, monthly, quarterly) installments of \$ _____ over a period of _____ (e.g., months or years), to commence _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after the date of this judgment; or
- D** ☐ Payment in equal _____ (e.g., weekly, monthly, quarterly) installments of \$ _____ over a period of _____ (e.g., months or years), to commence _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after release from imprisonment to a term of supervision; or
- E** ☐ Payment during the term of supervised release will commence within _____ (e.g., 30 or 60 days) after release from imprisonment. The court will set the payment plan based on an assessment of the defendant's ability to pay at that time; or
- F** ☒ Special instructions regarding the payment of criminal monetary penalties:

Any criminal monetary penalty ordered by the court shall be due and payable in full immediately. Present and future Assets are subject to enforcement and may be included in the treasury offset program allowing qualified federal benefits to be applied to the balance of criminal monetary penalties.

Payment during the term of supervised release will commence within 60 days after release from imprisonment. The court will set the payment plan based on an assessment of the defendant's ability to pay at that time. (fine/restitution) payment shall be due during the period of imprisonment at the rate of not less than \$25 per quarter and pursuant to the bureau of prisons' financial responsibility program. The value of any future assets may be applied to offset the balance of criminal monetary penalties. The defendant may be included in the treasury offset program, allowing qualified benefits to be applied to offset the balance of any criminal monetary penalties.

Unless the court has expressly ordered otherwise, if this judgment imposes imprisonment, payment of criminal monetary penalties is due during imprisonment. All criminal monetary penalties, except those payments made through the Federal Bureau of Prisons' Inmate Financial Responsibility Program, are made to the clerk of the court.

The defendant shall receive credit for all payments previously made toward any criminal monetary penalties imposed.

- ☐ Joint and Several

Defendant and Co-Defendant Names and Case Numbers (including defendant number), Total Amount, Joint and Several Amount, and corresponding payee, if appropriate.

- ☐ The defendant shall pay the cost of prosecution.
- ☐ The defendant shall pay the following court cost(s):
- ☐ The defendant shall forfeit the defendant's interest in the following property to the United States:

Payments shall be applied in the following order: (1) assessment, (2) restitution principal, (3) restitution interest, (4) fine principal, (5) fine interest, (6) community restitution, (7) penalties, and (8) costs, including cost of prosecution and court costs.