

No. 18-1195

---

---

**In The  
Supreme Court of the United States**

---

---

KENDRA ESPINOZA, JERI ANDERSON,  
and JAIME SCHAEFER,

*Petitioners,*

v.

MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, and  
GENE WALBORN, in his official capacity as DIRECTOR  
of the MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE,

*Respondents.*

---

---

**On Writ Of Certiorari To  
The Montana Supreme Court**

---

---

**JOINT APPENDIX**

---

---

DANIEL J. WHYTE  
Special Assistant  
Attorney General  
MONTANA DEPARTMENT  
OF REVENUE  
125 North Roberts Street  
P.O. Box 7701  
Helena, MT 59604  
(406) 444-3340  
DWhyte@mt.gov

*Counsel for Respondents*

ERICA J. SMITH  
RICHARD D. KOMER\*  
INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE  
901 North Glebe Road  
Suite 900  
Arlington, VA 22203  
(703) 682-9320  
dkomer@ij.org  
*\*Counsel of Record*

*Counsel for Petitioners*

---

---

**Petition For Certiorari Filed March 12, 2019  
Certiorari Granted June 28, 2019**

---

---

MICHAEL BINDAS  
INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE  
600 University Street  
Suite 1730  
Seattle, WA 98101  
(206) 957-1300  
mbindas@ij.org

TIMOTHY D. KELLER  
INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE  
398 South Mill Avenue  
Suite 301  
Tempe, AZ 85281  
(480) 557-8300  
tkeller@ij.org

WILLIAM W. MERCER  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
401 North 31st Street  
Suite 1500  
P.O. Box 639  
Billings, MT 59103  
(406) 252-2166

*Counsel for Petitioners*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Relevant Docket Entries, <i>Espinoza, et al. v. Montana Department of Revenue, et al.</i> , Case No. DA-17-0492 (Montana Supreme Court) .....	1
Relevant Docket Entries, <i>Espinoza, et al. v. Montana Department of Revenue, et al.</i> , Cause No. DV-15-1152C (Montana Eleventh Judicial District Court, Flathead County) .....	2
 MATERIALS FROM DISTRICT COURT PROCEEDING	
Affidavit of Erica Smith in Support of Plaintiffs’ Motion for Summary Judgment, in the Montana Eleventh Judicial District Court, Flathead County (Sworn to on May 10, 2016) .....	4
 MATERIALS PRODUCED IN APPENDIX TO THE WRIT OF CERTIORARI	
Order Granting Motion to Stay of Judgment, in the Montana Supreme Court (January 24, 2019) .....	App. 1
Opinion, in the Montana Supreme Court (December 12, 2018) .....	App. 4
Order Granting Plaintiffs’ Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying Defendants’ Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment, District Court of the Eleventh Judicial District of the State of Montana, County of Flathead (May 26, 2017) .....	App. 86

TABLE OF CONTENTS – Continued

	Page
Order Granting Plaintiffs’ Motion for Preliminary Injunction and Denying Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs’ Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief for Lack of Standing, District Court of the Eleventh Judicial District of the State of Montana, County of Flathead (March 31, 2016).....	App. 96

## RELEVANT DOCKET ENTRIES

*Espinoza, et al. v.*  
*Montana Department of Revenue, et al.*  
Case No. DA-17-04920  
Montana Supreme Court

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>Document Description</b>
8/17/2017	Notice – Incoming – Notice of Appeal Filed (DG)
09/21/2017	Record – Transcript Filed – electronically transmitted transcripts of 3/7/16 and 3/7/17 hearings. (DG)
11/22/2017	Brief – Appellant’s Opening (DA)
01/19/2018	Brief – Appellees’ Response (DA)
02/12/2018	Brief – Appellant Reply (JS)
12/12/2018	Opinion – Published- Justice McKinnon, reversed. (DG)
12/24/2018	Appellees’ Motion – Stay Judgment pending US Supreme Court Review (held for response) (JS)
01/11/2019	Appellant’s Response/Objection – Response to Motion to Stay Judgment pending US Supreme Court Review (DA)
01/24/2019	Order – Stay Proceeding to allow Department to administer the Tax Credit Program through tax year 2018. (DA)

---

## RELEVANT DOCKET ENTRIES

*Espinoza, et al. v.*  
*Montana Department of Revenue, et al.*  
Cause No. DA-15-1152C  
Montana Eleventh Judicial District Court,  
Flathead County

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>Document Text</b>
12/16/2015	Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief/Exhibits Not Scanned
12/24/2015	Plaintiffs' Notice of Constitutional Challenge to a Statute
01/29/2016	Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction
01/29/2016	Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction (exhibits not scanned)
02/02/2016	Defendant's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief for Lack of Standing
02/02/2016	Defendant's Brief in Support of its Motion to Dismiss
02/19/2016	Plaintiffs' Response to Defendant's Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Standing
02/23/2016	Defendant Montana Department of Revenue's Brief in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction
03/04/2016	Plaintiffs' Reply Brief in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction

03/31/2016 Order on Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction and Defendant's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief for Lack of Standing

05/12/2016 Montana Department of Revenue's Answer to Plaintiffs' Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief

05/16/2016 Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment

05/16/2016 Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of MSJ/ Attached Affidavits not scanned

07/08/2016 Defendant Montana Department of Revenue's Cross MSJ

07/08/2016 Defendant Montana Department of Revenue's Brief in Opposition to Plaintiffs' MSJ & Brief in Support of DOR's Cross MSJ

05/23/2017 Order Granting Plaintiffs' MSJ and Denying Defendant's Cross-Mtn for SJ

06/12/2017 Order\_ Plaintiffs' Motion is GRANTED. Defendants' cross motion DENIED. Defendants are perm enjoined from applying or enforcing Rule 1, judgment is entered in favor of Plaintiffs

06/20/2017 Plaintiffs' Notice of entry of judgment

08/17/2017 SC Notice of Filing \_ Appeal

---

William W. Mercer  
Holland & Hart LLP  
401 North 31st Street, Suite 1500  
P.O. Box 639  
Billings, Montana 59103-0639  
Telephone: (406) 252-2166  
Facsimile: (406) 252-1669  
Email: wwmercercer@hollandhart.com

Richard D. Komer (*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*)  
Erica Smith (*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*)  
Institute for Justice  
901 North Glebe Road, Suite 900  
Arlington, Virginia 22203  
Telephone: (703) 682-9320  
Facsimile: (703) 682-9321  
Email: dkomer@ij.org  
esmith@ij.org

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

MONTANA ELEVENTH JUDICIAL  
DISTRICT COURT, FLATHEAD COUNTY

KENDRA ESPINOZA,	) Cause No. DV 15-1152A
JERI ELLEN ANDERSON,	) Judge David M. Ortley
and JAIME SCHAEFER,	)
Plaintiffs,	) <b>AFFIDAVIT OF ERICA</b>
v.	) <b>SMITH IN SUPPORT</b>
MONTANA DEPARTMENT	) <b>OF PLAINTIFFS'</b>
OF REVENUE, and MIKE	) <b>MOTION FOR</b>
KADAS, in his official	) <b>SUMMARY JUDGMENT</b>
capacity as DIRECTOR of the	)
MONTANA DEPARTMENT	)
OF REVENUE,	)
Defendants.	)

---



4. Attached as Exhibit 2 to my affidavit is a true and correct copy of the Department of Revenue's Notice of Public Hearing on Proposed Adoption of "Rule 1," which I obtained in the course of my representation of Plaintiffs in this matter.

5. Attached as Exhibit 3 to my affidavit is a true and correct copy of the Department of Revenue's Notice of Adoption regarding "Rule 1," which I obtained in the course of my representation of Plaintiffs in this matter.

6. Attached as Exhibit 4 to my affidavit is a true and correct copy of the Results of the Poll of the Montana Legislature, released on December 1, 2015, which I obtained in the course of my representation of Plaintiffs in this matter.

7. Attached as Exhibit 5 to my affidavit is a true and correct copy of the legal memorandum, "Legal Analysis of Tuition Tax Credit," submitted to the Montana Legislature on September 30, 1992 and drafted by then Director of Legal Services to the Legislature Gregory J. Petesch. I obtained this memorandum in the course of my representation of Plaintiffs in this matter.

8. Attached as Exhibit 6 to my affidavit is a true and correct copy of the Comments from Dale Schowengerdt, the Solicitor General at the Montana Department of Justice, submitted to the Department of Revenue on November 17, 2015. I obtained these comments in the course of my representation of Plaintiffs in this matter.

9. Attached as Exhibit 7 are copies of decisions cited in Plaintiffs' Brief in Support of Summary Judgment not found in the Federal, Pacific or Montana reporting services available in the Flathead County Law Library.

/s/ Erica Smith  
Erica Smith

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO  
before me this 10th day of May 2016, by Erica Smith.

/s/ Gretchen Embrey  
Notary Signature

360350  
Notary Number

GRETCHEN EMBREY  
NOTARY PUBLIC  
REG. #360350  
COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA  
MY COMMISSION EXPIRES  
AUG. 31, 2017

---